RESEARCH SHOP

"know what's out there!"

Review and scan of core municipal public engagement principles

Prepared for

City of Hamilton, Government and Community Relations

In

May 2022

By

Shaila Jamal
Rachel Warren
Pierce Razzaque
Victoria MacBeath

Table of Contents

Executive Summary

The City of Hamilton's Public Engagement Charter specifies eight Core Principles of Public Engagement that set the tone and direction for successful City-led engagement practices. This charter was co-developed with community stakeholders in 2014. Given that a significant amount of time has expired since the creation of the charter, the purpose of this project was to conduct an environmental scan to identify the core principles of public engagement commonly adopted by comparative municipalities across Canada and, using this information, recommend opportunities for Hamilton to inform the update of their charter. This report provides findings from the environmental scan, including an analysis of the relevancy and comprehensiveness of the City of Hamilton's existing public engagement charter.

Sixteen comparative municipalities were selected based on having a similar population to Hamilton. Three municipalities (Kingston, Guelph and St John's) were added at the request of the community partner due to their comprehensive public engagement charters. For each municipality, the Research Shop team reviewed publicly available municipal documents and extracted information relating to their public engagement principles, engagement frameworks, and engagement spectrum, as well as equity, diversity, and inclusion statements. Tables for each municipality summarizing this information constitutes the bulk of the report.

Based on an analysis of the findings, this report found five municipal engagement principles commonly adopted by other municipalities, and which are not present in Hamilton's engagement charter: respect, continuous improvement, shared responsibility, responsiveness/ timely communication, and adaptability. Adding these principles, or finding ways to integrate them with existing principles, may strengthen the scope of Hamilton's engagement charter. The report also recommends including an engagement framework to complement/implement Hamilton's Public Engagement Charter. Finally, the report includes specific suggestions to improve the existing public engagement spectrum and further incorporation of diversity principles in Hamilton's Public Engagement Charter.

Key Terms/Definitions

Community Engagement: "The process of actively involving the community in decision-making processes" (Adopted from the City of Kitchener) (Community Engagement Consultant, 2010)

Engagement Spectrum: An engagement spectrum is intended to split public roles in the engagement process into levels and define the goal or promise the municipality is to fulfill (Stuart, 2017). Most cities in this report follow the public participatory spectrum established by the International Association of Public Participation (IAP2).

Engagement Framework: There are a variety of definitions for an engagement framework. According to the City of Oshawa, an engagement framework acts as a resource that outlines responsibilities and tools when implementing community engagement projects (Oshawa, 2015). Other municipalities state an engagement framework serves as a guide to how community engagement will be facilitated in relevant municipal processes, policies and activities. For this project, we consider engagement frameworks as providing a structure for community engagement by highlighting and elaborating on the parts of the process (e.g., inform, consult, implement, evaluate).

Introduction

Overview

The City of Hamilton is the ninth largest regional economy in Canada and the fifth largest municipality in Ontario. Hamilton is known for its strong sense of community, emerging and traditional industries, and emphasizing protection of natural areas. The City's vision is "To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully." The community's vision, "Our Future Hamilton," was developed in consultation with over 55,000 Hamilton residents and features six community priorities:

- Community engagement
- Economic prosperity,
- Public health and safety,
- Environmental responsibility,
- Built infrastructure, and
- Culture and social diversity.

Community engagement is a key pillar of the City of Hamilton's 10-year Strategic Plan and current Term of Council Priorities to build transparency, trust, and confidence in City government through increased public access to City information and participation in decision-making processes that impact residents and their community.

This report through the McMaster Research Shop builds upon existing public engagement achievements such as the City's Public Engagement Charter, which specifies eight (8) Core Principles of Public Engagement that set the tone and direction for successful City-led engagement practices. This charter was co-developed with community stakeholders in 2014. Given that a significant amount of time has expired since the creation of the charter, and enhanced knowledge of what resident experience with engagement has been, this report assesses the relevancy and comprehensiveness of the 8 Core Principles by comparing them to public engagement principles adopted by comparative municipalities.

Goal

The project's overall goal is to conduct an environmental scan and identify core principles of public engagement commonly adopted by comparative municipalities across Canada and analyze the relevancy and comprehensiveness of the City's existing public engagement charter.

Specifically, the report:

- Identifies the common core principles of public engagement adopted by various municipalities[1].
- Conducts a comparative analysis of municipal core principles of public engagement in comparison to the City of Hamilton's 8 Core Principles.
- Provides recommendations of potential core principles that the City of Hamilton should consider adopting or changing.

The guiding research questions include:

- Are the City of Hamilton's core principles of public engagement relevant to the current context?
- How do the City of Hamilton's core principles compare to those adopted by other municipalities?
- Which core principles are common among the municipalities that were reviewed?
- What core principle(s) should the City of Hamilton consider adding?
- Are there any core principles that the City of Hamilton should consider revising?

Methods

The main data collection activity for the environmental scan involved locating and summarizing the community engagement principles, policies, and frameworks of similar Canadian municipalities to the City of Hamilton. Similar municipalities were selected based on their population size. At first, Canadian municipalities were ranked based on their 2021 Census population. 16 municipalities were selected where eight of the municipalities have a higher population, and eight of the municipalities have a lower population than the City of Hamilton (Table 1). Three additional municipalities (Kingston, Guelph and St John's) were added to the environmental scan list at the request of the community partner (Ms. Cindy Mutch) as their engagement principles, policies, and frameworks are, content-wise, very rich.

Table 1: Municipalities considered for the environmental scan (ascending order).

Municipality	2021 Census population
Saskatoon	317,480
Victoria	397,237

---

[1] note: some may use different language but represent the same values

Oshawa	415,311
Windsor***	422,630
St. Catharines - Niagara	433,604
Halifax	465,703
London	543,551
Kitchener - Cambridge - Waterloo*	575,847
Hamilton	**785,184**
Winnipeg	834,678
Québec City****	839,311
Edmonton	1,418,118
Calgary	1,481,806
Ottawa - Gatineau**	1,488,307
Vancouver	2,642,825
Montréal****	4,291,732
Toronto***	6,202,225
Additional Municipalities	
St. John's	214,674
Kingston	176,467
Guelph	169,674

* Although the Census considered them as an entire area, each of them has separate municipal engagement policies
** The report only discusses the community engagement principles of Ottawa.
***These municipalities have a public engagement strategy that is project-specific or lack a public engagement policy or charter.
**** We were unable to find anything on overall municipal public engagement principles on Montreal and Québec City. Therefore they were not included in the environmental scan.

The focus for the environmental scan was how each municipality defined public engagement, what their core engagement principles are, and how they defined their core engagement principles. Other attributes of the policy we identified included their engagement frameworks, engagement spectrum, and their equity, diversity, and inclusion statements as part of their community engagement process. We gleaned these from publicly available municipal documents. Municipalities that lacked a distinct engagement policy or framework were placed in a sub-category to compare differences

to other comparator municipalities with a distinct community engagement policy to the City of Hamilton's Public Engagement Charter.

Following the presentation of our findings, we made recommendations based on our comparison of Hamilton's community engagement policy to the contents of comparative municipalities' policies. We placed emphasis on core principles that are defined in comparator municipalities but not included in the City of Hamilton Charter.

Environmental Scan of Municipal Engagement Principles

Note: Principles similar to the City of Hamilton in other municipalities are marked blue.

	Hamilton
Document	Public Engagement Charter by Hamilton's Engagement Committee (2015)
What is community engagement?	"Engaging Hamilton's residents: ● allows for responsible decision-making through a range of perspectives, experience, and knowledge ● involves sharing ideas in ways that support learning and the creation of sustainable solutions"
Principles	1. Transparency and Trust, 2. Accountability and Action, 3. Inclusion and Diversity, 4. Create Opportunities for Active Participation, 5. Collaboration, Co-operation and Shared Purpose, 6. Ongoing Engagement and Open Communication, 7. Learning, Reflection and Evaluation, 8. Capacity for Engagement
Engagement Framework	N/A

Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	As described under the core principles, inclusion and diversity is supported and strengthened by: ● creating opportunities for residents from different backgrounds to work together through the use of appropriate engagement methods and tools ● recognizing and eliminating barriers to ensure participation is inclusive, diverse and balanced
Public Engagement Spectrum	Follows IAP2 Spectrum 1. Inform 2. Consult 3. Involve 4. Collaborate 5. Empower
Public Engagement Policy	N/A
Additional	N/A

Calgary	
Document	[City of Calgary Engage Policy](#) (2013) Note: Their Engagement Policy document contains the engagement principles
What is community engagement?	"Engagement" at The City of Calgary is defined as: purposeful dialogue between The City and citizens and stakeholders to gather information to influence decision making." "Stakeholders" for the purpose of this policy are defined as anyone (person or group of people) who can impact or can be impacted by the results of a decision made by The City, and may include: citizens, the public, customers, businesses, community organizations and partners, other government agencies and any other body interacting with The City." (pg. 1-2)
Principles	Noted as Engage Guiding Principles (pg. 2-4): 1. Accountability 2. Inclusiveness 3. Transparency 4. Commitment 5. Responsiveness
Engagement Framework	[Engage Framework and Tools](#) contains the detailed application and administering procedures of the engagement policy. 1. Engage assessment 2. Develop a plan 3. Tell the story 4. Raise awareness 5. Connect 6. Report back and evaluate
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	N/A

Public Engagement Spectrum	This policy includes a spectrum of four strategies and associated promises related to reaching and involving citizens and stakeholders in specific engagement initiatives (Engage Policy, pg. 5): 1. Listen and learn 2. Consult 3. Collaborate 4. Empower
Public Engagement Policy	The policy document itself contains the engagement principles and engagement spectrum. In addition, the document outlines the procedures for applying and administering the engagement policies and principles.
Additional	The process document outlines the needs assessment and initiation of the public engagement policies within The City of Calgary.
Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	Compared to Hamilton, the City of Calgary has more details on how to approach to the public and procedures for engaging the public. Their engagement framework and process document outlined a step by step process to administering the public engagement process.

	Cambridge
Document	Citizen Engagement Policy (2019)
What is community engagement?	"The process of working collaboratively with people to create a better community. It includes information sharing, consultation, and active involvement in decisions that affect the community. The citizen engagement process shall be transparent, responsive, inclusive, and based on realistic expectations, mutual respect and trust." (Pg. 2)
Principles	Guiding Principles 1. Mutual respect & Inclusion 2. Accessibility 3. Shared Responsibility 4. Transparency 5. Expectations 6. Responsiveness 7. Citizen's Engagement Framework 8. Evaluation Outcomes (Pg. 2 - 4).
Engagement Framework	Called the Citizen's Engagement Framework: 1. **Inform**: To provide detailed information to the public and raise public awareness. 2. **Consult**: To obtain feedback on alternatives and/or decisions in order to inform decision making 3. **Collaborate**: To partner with stakeholders in all steps of the process, including the development of strategies and recommendations and the identification of preferred solutions. 4. **Empower**: To allow citizens to initiate and develop projects and make final decisions and/or implement the decisions (ie. Development of neighbourhood parks) (pg. 3).
Public Engagement	N/A

Spectrum	
Public Engagement Policy	The purpose of the Citizen Engagement (Pg. 1)
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	Statement on Inclusiveness: ● "Citizen Engagement brings together people from different cultures and different backgrounds to explore their community. We strive to be inclusive in all of our activities. We want to reflect the whole community without regard to their age, disability, gender, gender identity, sexual orientation, religion or belief, ethnicity or national origin and we undertake not to discriminate against them on any of those grounds. We treat all people with respect and undertake not to discriminate against them on grounds of their age, disability, gender, gender identity, sexual orientation, religion or belief, ethnicity or national origin. We value and celebrate diversity." (Pg. 2) There is no mention of equity, but the statement of inclusiveness does mention that they value diversity.
Additional	[Cambridge Connected Strategic Plan 2020-2023](link) (2020 [Stakeholder and Community Engagement Summary](link) (2015)
Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	Cambridge shares only two principles with the City of Hamilton. Cambridge also includes an engagement framework, and does not have a public engagement spectrum.

	Edmonton
Document	1. Public Engagement Framework (2017), & 2. Public Engagement Policy (2017)
What is community engagement?	"Public engagement creates opportunities for people to contribute to decision making by the City Council and Administration about the City's policies, programs, projects, and services, and communicates how public input is collected and used." (Public Engagement Framework,2017)
Principles	1. Shared responsibility- Engagement in authentic ways to encourage solutions to challenge issues while supporting participation that promote democratic decision-making. 2. Relationship-building and perspective-seeking-Valuing various local perspectives and community experiences; recognition of respect and equitable processes to foster trust and stronger relationships. 3. Proactive, timely, and transparent - Provide enough time and notice to engage early in the process. Clearly communicate how input will be used, assessed and reported on afterwards. 4. Inclusive and accessible - Encouraging two-way conversations and strategies to reach diverse communities and 5. Innovative and continuously improving- Aspire to co-create and embrace new and better engagement processes, tools and tactics. (pg 3,2021)
Engagement Framework	8 parts to this framework ,each part detailing different elements of the framework 1. Public Engagement Policy 2. Public Engagement Procedure 3. Engagement Learning and Training 4. Planning and Design 5. Public Engagement Communications 6. Public Engagement Reporting 7. Public Engagement Evaluation 8. Public Engagement Recognition (Public Engagement Framework pg 6-7, 2017)
Public Engagement Spectrum	4 parts to the spectrum each representing a role that has increasing public influence and commitment from the City of Edmonton.

	Advise: Public can share feedback or perspectives that are consider for public engagement activities Refine: Through the City the public is involved in adapting and adjusting approaches to policies, programs, projects &/or services Create: Develop and build solutions regarding policies, projects, programs or services in collaboration with the City. Decide (empower): Public has power to make decisions directly or on behalf of City about policies, programs, projects or services (pg 3, 2017)
Equity Diversity, Inclusion	Diversity and inclusion is considered in what public engagement activities will reflect the City's diversity and inclusion commitments as well as use of Gender Based Analysis Plus (GBA+) (pg 3, 2017)
Additional	The policy defines diversity and inclusion as how public engagement will accommodate diverse needs, reduce barriers, and encourage participation. Policy includes 4 requirements of what is considered public engagement by City administration. These requirements are as follows: 1. Designing or implementing a new policy, program, project or service that has an impact on the public; 2. Evaluating, changing or ending an existing policy, program, project or service that has an impact on the public; 3. Fulfilling a legislated or regulated requirement; or 4. Responding to a community-initiated request. (pg 3, 2021)
Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	Edmonton policy looks more like a government document and is less detailed than the City of Hamilton's Public Engagement Charter. The City of Edmonton has a 4 part engagement spectrum (Advise, Refine, Create and Decide) consisting of an increasing level of public influence and commitment from the City of Edmonton. Shared responsibility, perspective-seeking, and continuously improving are not core principles included in the City of Hamilton's Engagement Charter.

Guelph	
Document	[City of Guelph Community Engagement Framework](#) (2015) Note: Their Community Engagement Framework document contains the engagement principles.
What is community engagement?	"The process of involving individuals in the decision-making processes of issues that affect them. This includes activities that facilitate an informed dialogue amongst participants and encourages them to share ideas and opinions for decision-making." (pg. 4).
Principles	Guiding Principles for Community Engagement (pg. 9) 1. Inclusive 2. Early involvement 3. Access to decision-making 4. Coordinated approach 5. Transparent and accountable 6. Open and timely communication 7. Mutual trust and respect 8. Evaluation and continuous improvement
Engagement Framework	Under the City of Guelph Community Engagement Framework, they are defined as "Four Pillars Supporting the Practice of Community Engagement" (pg. 6). 1. Performance: Continuous improvement through learning and evaluation 2. Practice: Embed community engagement into the corporate culture of the City of Guelph 3. People: Increase employee capability to design and deliver community engagement 4. Policy: Confirm commitment to engage our community
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	They don't have a separate detailed policy. Only under the principle 'Inclusive' (pg. 9), it is mentioned as "The City designs engagement processes that allow all community members a reasonable opportunity to contribute and to develop a balanced perspective. The City builds relationships with stakeholders by using a range of activities to engage diverse participants."

Public Engagement Spectrum	Adopted from the International Association for Public Participation's (IAP2) spectrum (pg. 11): 1. Consult 2. Involve 3. Collaborate 4. Empower
Public Engagement Policy	N/A
Additional	N/A
Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	Their guiding principles are a bit different than the City of Hamilton which is outlined above. In addition, Guelph has a detailed engagement decision-making process, and responsibilities of the parties involved such as the community engagement team, project team, participants or community stakeholders and council. Additionally, it directed relevant Acts and policies to consult while taking any engagement initiatives.

	Halifax
Document	Community Engagement Strategy (2008) & Community Engagement Renewed (2016)
What is community engagement?	"Community engagement is the process of working collaboratively with and through groups of people to enact positive action. It includes information sharing, consultation and active involvement in decision making" (pg. 3, 2008).
Principles	1. Citizen **participation** is recognized as an asset, is valued and encouraged 2. The purpose and the process are **clear** to all participants 3. Everyone potentially affected by the process has an opportunity to become **involved** 4. Barriers to access are recognized and overcome to ensure **diverse, inclusive** and balanced participation 5. The process is **respectful, fair, effective and transparent** 6. Communication is **clear, timely and effective** 7. Public involvement is **adequately resourced** 8. Participants are **informed** of outcomes of community engagement 9. The public has an opportunity to provide **feedback** at the various stages of the process 10.Community engagement will be **evaluated and improved** [emphasis added for clarity] (2008)
Engagement Framework	Four-part framework, each detailing different elements: 1. Defining community engagement 2. Continuum of community engagement 3. The 10 principles of community engagement (listed above) 4. Community engagement checklist.
Public Engagement Spectrum	(On pg. 11 of 2008 document) called the community engagement continuum. 1. Information sharing 2. Consultation 3. Active participation
Public Engagement Policy	Engagement strategy (2008) includes several policies: 1. HRM will adopt a Community Engagement Framework which will guide all of its public involvement, including initiatives led by Council, staff, external consultants and Community 2. HRM will adopt a common definition of community engagement,

	including definitions contained in the Community Engagement Dictionary accompanying the Strategy.
	3. HRM will adopt the Continuum of Community Engagement in developing, implementing and communicating public involvement initiatives.
	4. HRM will adopt the Ten Principles of Community Engagement and use them to guide the development and implementation of all HRM community engagement processes.
	5. HRM will adopt the Community Engagement Checklist in the development and implementation of its community engagement initiatives.
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	On page 20 (in the 2008 document) they write that they wanted to develop a community engagement inclusion guide & workshop, but in the 2016 document it is not explicitly stated anywhere that they completed this, although they did create a community engagement "toolbox".
Additional	Document outlined the difference between long-term, short-term, and mid-term focus'. They also have a community engagement steering committee. They also have a very thorough checklist for community engagement (which is included in the 2008 document linked above).
Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	Halifax doesn't have key words in their principles. They just have short sentences (as listed above). Halifax does not include spectrums, but does have an "Engagement Readiness Test" and a checklist for ensuring that community engagement has been conducted and planned according to the framework.

	Kingston
Document	[Kingston Public Engagement Framework](#) (2017)
What is community engagement?	"The process by which residents are informed on, or given the opportunity to be involved in, City decisions that impact all or part of the community." (Pg. 1, 2017)
Principles	1. **Inclusivity**: Organizers will try to ensure an accurate representation of the community is reflected by using a range of techniques to engage residents 2. **Early involvement and timely communication**: Accurate information will be communicated as early as possible in the public engagement process to assist residents in their planning, preparation and participation. 3. **Respect**: All participants must be respectful of diverse views, values and interests. The process must also respect decision-making protocols and jurisdictions at the municipal and provincial levels. 4. **Transparent and accountable**: The process will demonstrate a commitment to efficient and effective use of taxpayer dollars and ensure both the process and its outcome are transparent. 5. **Clear and coordinated approach**: Throughout the engagement process, plain language and a variety of communication channels will be used to optimize residents' input, because people learn and engage in different ways. Public engagement activities will be coordinated and/or combined where possible to help find efficiencies. 6. **Continuous improvement**: Public engagement activities will be regularly evaluated and improved. (Pg. 4, 2017)
Engagement Framework	1. Define the initiative/project, goals, participants, timelines, and resources/budget 2. Determine the level of public engagement and techniques 3. Implementation 4. Make recommendations and/or decision and share results 5. Evaluation (Pg. 9 and 10, 2017).
Public	The Public Engagement Spectrum is based on the IAP2 participation

Engagement Spectrum	spectrum: 1. Inform 2. Consult 3. Involve 4. Collaborate 5. Empower (Pg. 6, 2017)
Public Engagement Policy	N/A
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	**Inclusivity**: "The fact or policy of not excluding participants on the grounds of age, creed, gender, sexual orientation, family status, marital status, ability, raced, ancestry, record, or offences." (pg. 1). Equity is not mentioned.
Additional	● [Appendix: Kingston's Public Engagement Charter](#) ● [Public Engagement During Covid-19](#) ● [Executive Summary](#) of the public engagement framework ● In 2019, Kingston received the [Public Engagement National Award](#) ● Kingston annual updates on public engagement in the Community: **2021**: [Public Engagement Annual Update and Updated Implementation Plan 2021](#) **2020**: [Public Engagement Annual Update and Updated Implementation Plan 2020](#) Kingston's "early involvement and timely communication" principle is similar to Hamilton's "Ongoing Engagement and Open Communication" principles. Additionally, Kingston's "clear and coordinated approach" principle resembles Hamilton's "Capacity for Engagement" principle.
Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	Kingston includes a "respect" principle, as well as a "continuous improvement" principle.

	Kitchener
Document	Community Engagement Policy (2010) & Community Engagement Review (n.d.)
What is community engagement?	"The process of involving the community in decision-making processes". (pg. 1, 2010)
Principles	1. Inclusive 2. Accountable & Transparent 3. Built on Partnerships 4. Timely Communication 5. Supported & Resourced 6. Evaluate & Improve Community Engagement Review, pg 7
Engagement Framework	See below.
Public Engagement Spectrum	Kitchener calls this their "community engagement framework", but it is identical to the IAP2 spectrum. 1. Inform. 2. Consult. 3. Collaborate. 4. Entrust. (Community Engagement Policy Pg. 4 - 5, 2010).
Public Engagement Policy	Community Engagement Policy The purpose of this policy is to outline the City of Kitchener's commitment to principles of participatory democracy. The policy applies city employees, city council and local advisory boards and is intended to promote ongoing and meaningful public engagement to solve problems and build community (Community Engagement Consultant, pg 1).
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	Inclusive participation statement: "The City will strive for participation that is inclusive of all stakeholder groups by seeking out and facilitating the involvement of those potentially affected. [...] Decisions that involve community engagement will take into account the relative impact of the matter on various stakeholder groups and the degree to

	which their voices are represented in the outcome of the engagement process. Before making a decision, Council may also have to consider carefully whether the aspirations and needs of future generations [...] might differ significantly from those of today's population. [...] The City will strive for inclusive participation, giving voice to the broadest range of interests and perspectives within the context on the issue, taking into account the relative impact of the matter on various stakeholder groups. Special interest participants must be balanced with broad-based community involvement. Techniques must be considered to address barriers to participation for members of the community whose voices are rarely heard, including vulnerable populations." (Community Engagement Policy pg 10-11,2010).
Additional	Community Engagement Strategy Development (2008)

Update on Community Engagement Initiatives |
| Difference(s) from City of Hamilton | Kitchener includes three principles that are separate from the City of Hamilton: Built on Partnerships; timely communication; and supported & resourced. |

	London
Document	[Community Engagement Policy](#) (2017- Reviewed 2021)
What is community engagement?	"Community engagement is the process of meaningful two-way dialogue and participation in forming decisions that affect the community. The community engagement process is transparent, responsive, inclusive and empowering and is based on realistic expectations, mutual respect and trust." (Community Engagement Policy, 2017)

Principles	6 principles called "key success factors"
	    1. Mutual Respect and Inclusion
	    2. Accessibility
	    3. Shared Responsibility
	    4. Transparency
	    5. Realistic Expectations
	    6. Responsiveness
	    (Community Engagement Policy,2017)

Engagement Framework	No distinct framework.

Public Engagement Spectrum	5 purpose spectrum for community communication and engagement (IAP2 participation spectrum)
	    1. Inform
	    2. Consult
	    3. Involve
	    4. Collaborate
	    5. Empower

Public Engagement Policy	The purpose of the policy as follows: "Outlines the City's commitment to inclusive community engagement processes to ensure quality communication, citizen involvement and community participation for a variety of purposes – inform, consult, involve, collaborate and empower" (2017)
Equity Diversity and Inclusion	The City's engagement policy has no distinct EDI section however the City's strategic plan led to the development of a Community Diversity and Inclusion Strategy in 2019.- [Community Diversity and Inclusion Strategy (CDIS)](#) (2021)
Additional	

Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	The policy is less thorough than the City of Hamilton charter. The policy is a 1 page document under the municipal council policies of the City of London. Within the engagement framework each part of the spectrum has recommended guideposts to use in measuring implementation at each level of engagement. For example, at the "Involve" level, a measure is the public being invited to provide input at the beginning of the process and be given multiple opportunities to provide input throughout the decision making process.

	Niagara
Document	[Niagara Community Engagement Framework](#) (2015)
What is community engagement?	"The purpose of community engagement is to gather perspectives for decision makers, not to make decisions. It means that the City of Niagara Falls talks to our communities before making decisions. It means that if you have concerns or ideas about improving the quality of life and services in Niagara Falls, we want to talk to you about them." (pg. 5, 2015).
Principles	Called "Corporate Values" 1. Accountability 2. Leadership 3. Respect 4. Teamwork
Engagement Framework	While there is much reference to the framework and the aims of the framework, the City of Niagara does not explicitly outline their community engagement framework.
Public Engagement Spectrum	The Public Engagement Spectrum is based on the IAP2 participation spectrum: 1. Inform 2. Consult 3. Involve 4. Collaborate 5. Empower (pg. 9, 2015)
Public Engagement Policy	N/A
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	N/A
Additional	The Framework identifies 5 KPIs, and also outlines their core values for public participation and best practices.

Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	This document is significantly less thorough than Hamilton's public engagement charter. Niagara does not provide a detailed explanation of their principles and refers to them as their "corporate values". They also do not provide an outline of their engagement framework, nor do they include any mention of EDI.

	Oshawa
Document	Oshawa Community Engagement Initiative (2015)
What is community engagement?	"Community engagement refers to a range of activities that facilitate and support the contribution of ideas and insights from the public on initiatives that affect them." (pg. 1 , 2015).
Principles	1. Respectful 2. Transparent 3. Accountable 4. Inclusive 5. Timely 6. Continuous Improvement (Pg. 4 and 5, 2015)
Engagement Framework	1. Define the initiative and objectives 2. Identify stakeholders 3. Determine the participation levels and tools 4. Develop the communication plan 5. Implement 6. Evaluate and measure (Pg. 3, 2015)
Public Engagement Spectrum	The City of Oshawa follows the IAP2 Framework, which includes five levels of public engagement: 1. Inform 2. Consult 3. Involve 4. Collaborate 5. Empower (Pg. 5, 2015)
Public Engagement Policy	N/A
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	They have a Diversity and Inclusion Plan: City of Oshawa Diversity and Inclusion Plan (2017) They have a separate Equity and Inclusion Lens handbook:

	Equity and Inclusion Lens and Handbook (2021)
Additional	The Oshawa Community Engagement Initiative does not address KPIs within the document, but addresses it in their 2020-2023 Strategic Plan. Oshawa Strategic Plan 2020-2023
Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	Oshawa includes three different principles: Respectful, timely, and continuous improvement. While their document is relatively thorough, it is much less engaging than the City of Hamilton's.

	Ottawa
Document	[Public Engagement Strategy: Guidelines and Toolkit](#) (2015) Note: Their Public Engagement Strategy document contains the engagement principles.
What is community engagement?	"Public engagement involves any two-way communication to inform and/or involve the public in problem solving or decision-making. There are different types of engagement (providing information, consultation, and collaboration) and various engagement activities or techniques (e.g. information kit, in-person meetings, online surveys, advisory groups, etc.)." (pg. 5)
Principles	Guiding principles (pg. 4-5): 1. Accountable 2. Inclusive 3. Open, Informative and Transparent 4. Timely 5. Adaptive 6. Continuously improving 7. Co-operative
Engagement Framework	Defined as Public Engagement Cycle (pg. 9): 1. Prepare 2. Design 3. Implement 4. Analyze 5. Report back 6. Evaluate 7. Share learning
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	No direct statement. However, to ensure equity and inclusion in the engagement process, City of Ottawa's [Handbook on Equity and Inclusion](#) is recommended.

Public Engagement Spectrum	As noted in the document, this public engagement spectrum is "based on International Association for Public Participation's Public Participation Spectrum, Halton Region's, A Model for Public Engagement at Halton Region, and City of Edmonton's Continuum of Public Involvement" (pg. 18). 1. Inform or educate 2. Consult 3. Involve 4. Collaborate/ partner 5. Delegate
Public Engagement Policy	The City of Ottawa doesn't have any direct public engagement policy. Instead, throughout the document, their Engagement Strategy: Guidelines and Toolkit document referred to different policy documents to consult before applying the engagement principles and framework.
Additional	This document contains very detailed instructions and guidelines on the application of engagement principles while initiating a project.
Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	In addition to detailed guidelines and instructions on the application engagement principles, Ottawa has specific principles regarding timeliness, adaptability, continuous improvement and cooperativeness. Although these four principles are covered to some extent under the overarching themes of the Hamilton's engagement charter, Ottawa has them in more specific format as principles with detailed guidelines on implementations.

	Saskatoon
Document	[Public Engagement Policy](#) (2019) (Only has policy. No framework).
What is community engagement?	""Public Engagement" refers to a variety of formal and informal interactions ranging from information sharing to more active consultation through to collaboration in the decision-making processes" (Pg. 1).
Principles	1. Inclusivity 2. Early involvement 3. Decision-making 4. Transparency and accountability 5. Open and timely communication 6. Relationship building 7. Evaluation.
Engagement Framework	Their policy does not explicitly state an engagement framework They do however say: "The City of Saskatoon recognizes that its policy, project, program, and service decisions are improved by engaging citizens and other stakeholder groups where appropriate. Where possible, the City commits to conducting transparent and inclusive public engagement activities and processes that help support City Council and Administration in their decision-making processes" (pg. 1).
Public Engagement Spectrum	N/A
Public Engagement Policy	N/A
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	N/A
Additional	Public engagement in Saskatoon is directed to the City Manager.
Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	Saskatoon's document is much less thorough and looks more like a typical government policy compared to Hamilton. There are no "community engagement framework" documents available online for Saskatoon.

	St. Johns
Document	Engage! Policy (2014) and City of St Johns Engage! Policy: Evaluation (2017)
What is community engagement?	"Public engagement is a process – one that facilitates dialogue with the right people, using the right tools, at the right time on subject areas of mutual interest. Additionally, public engagement allows the City to gather input that will be taken into consideration in decision-making processes." (Engage! Policy, 2014)
Principles	1. Commitment- City projects and plans will incorporate appropriate engagement strategies that take into consideration how best to engage stakeholders in a manner that respects their time and their input." 2. Accountability- City council, the city manager and mayor are accountable for the development, implementation and evaluation of the engagement framework. 3. Clear and Timely Communication- communication must be accessible, timely, complete, accurate, free of jargon, making it clear how stakeholders are being engaged and how the input will be used. 4. Inclusiveness-Due to St John's variety of stakeholders, the City will employ a variety of methods and tools that connect those affected and remove barriers to participation. (Engage! Policy, 2014)
Engagement Framework	Core values of IAP2 are the foundation of the Engagement Framework which inform the core engagement principles. (Engage! Policy 2014)
Public Engagement Spectrum	CIty of St John's Toolkit for engagement guides the strategies and methods of engagement and is informed by the IAP2 Spectrum of Participation. This model helps staff determine the level of engagement necessary. ("Process"Engage! Policy,2014) 3 Levels of engagement include: 1. Sharing Information, 2. Consultation 3. Active Participation (empower) (2014)
Public Engagement Policy	Policy is applied to all opportunities and activities where public input is collected or information is shared. The 2014 Engage Policy established the following goals that were evaluated later in 2017 1. Improve and inform decision making and programming

	2. Create space for everyone to feel involved and listened to 3. Share information effectively and welcome different viewpoints 4. Generate new ideas and solutions 5. Build trust 6. Understand community needs and priorities (pg. 12, 2017)
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	N/A
Additional	Toolkit for engagement is reviewed annually by the Office of Strategy and Engagement (OSE) to see if adjustments to strategies or methods of engagement are necessary (Engage! Policy,2014) Examples of activities on the engagement spectrum include: ● Sharing information-Informing a decision or direction ● Consultation-Seeking feedback on a facility or service ● Active Participation-Establishing a structure for involvement (2014) No KPIs included in public engagement policy. Strategic plan discusses ten-year goals and directions for the City. This plan is reviewed annually:2019-2029 Strategic Plan
Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	Policy has no distinct EDI section. Toolkit for engagement is useful for city officials to assess the appropriate level, methods, and strategies for engagement.

	Toronto***
Document	General website on community engagement: https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/planning-development/outreach-engagement/
What is community engagement?	N/A
Principles	Each community engagement page has different principles based on the project.
Engagement Framework	N/A
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	N/A
Public Engagement Spectrum	N/A
Public Engagement Policy	N/A
Additional	**Different Community Engagement Strategies:** Growing Conversations: https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/planning-development/outreach-engagement/growing-conversations-making-engagement-work/ Planners in Public Spaces: https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/planning-development/outreach-engagement/planners-in-public-spaces/ Youth Engagement Strategy: https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/planning-development/outreach-engagement/youth-engagement-strategy/

	Toronto Corporate Strategic Plan: https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/9886-DS-19-0438-Corporate-Strategic-Plan-V4-MG1.pdf
Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	Toronto does not have a defined community engagement framework, principles, EDI, public engagement spectrum or policy. The City of Toronto differs from Hamilton in that their website is project specific.

The City of Toronto does not have one defined community engagement charter. Rather, they have project specific frameworks, including "Growing Conversations", "Youth Engagement Strategy", and "Planners in Public Spaces". Each project has their own guiding principles based on the population and type of project. Toronto also does not include public engagement policies or spectrums, or engagement framework.

	Vancouver***
Document	A website on How we do community engagement
What is community engagement?	"Community engagement gives you opportunities to participate in making City decisions that affect or interest you. Involving you helps us make better decisions, plans, or projects that: ● Maximize benefits ● Minimize negative impacts ● Satisfy a wide range of stakeholders ● Are easier to carry out"
Principles	Their principles are different from the other municipalities. It mostly involves the guiding principles for the following processes: 1. Mandating the process 2. Resourcing the process 3. Process participants 4. Communication strategies 5. Involvement strategies 6. Closure
Engagement Framework	N/A
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	N/A
Public Engagement Spectrum	Follows IAP2 Spectrum: 1. Listen and learn 2. Consult 3. Involve 4. Collaborate 5. Empower
Public Engagement Policy	N/A

Additional	
Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	Vancouver is completely different than the City of Hamilton. Their engagement policies are more focused on the administration related process of the engagement along with description of the strategies to be followed.

	Victoria
Document	Engagement Framework (2017)
What is community engagement?	"Public participation creates opportunities for individuals with diverse perspectives to come together and share their ideas with staff and elected officials. It's also an opportunity to listen and learn from others and to assist decision-makers as they explore ways to improve plans, programs and services. Done well, public participation, increases trust between citizens and City Hall" (pg. 3).
Principles	1. Transparency 2. Inclusiveness 3. Welcoming 4. Clear information 5. Commitment 6. Accessibility.
Engagement Framework	1. Create the strategy 2. Tell the story 3. Raise awareness 4. Connect 5. Close the loop 6. Evaluate. They also have a planning worksheet which asks questions about context, telling the story, timeline, and budget (this is included in the the Engagement Framework document linked above).
Public Engagement Spectrum	1. Inform 2. Consult 3. Involve 4. Collaborate 5. Empower
Public Engagement Policy	N/A
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	No concrete EDI plans are listed, but inclusiveness is one of their principles which states: "Where possible, the community will be involved in the design of the engagement process through neighbourhood working groups and

	stakeholder meetings. Opportunities are created to involve people who are impacted by changes being considered. A range of tools and techniques are used to engage a variety of stakeholders and ensure accurate representation of the community is reflected."
Additional	Includes spectrum of participation, and outlines the roles of different actors (city council, first nations, city staff, and community). Their engagement framework is guided by the IAP2 Principles.
Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	The City of Victoria outlines the role of different city actors in community engagement. Their key principle of accessibility is tied into EDI.

	Waterloo
Document	[Guidelines for Public Engagement at the Region of Waterloo](#) (2016)
What is community engagement?	"Providing opportunities for the public to have an informed say on the issues and decisions that affect their lives through a dialogue of mutual respect between government and the public" (pg. 1).
Principles	1. Accountability 2. Transparency 3. Respect 4. Inclusivity 5. Responsiveness
Engagement Framework	1. Assess. 2. Select Project Scope. 3. Plan the Public Engagement Process. 4. Implement the Initiative. 5. Report Back to Stakeholders. 6. Evaluate Public Engagement. (Pg. 3 - 5)
Public Engagement Spectrum	N/A
Public Engagement Policy	N/A
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	N/A
Additional	Public engagement processes built on these principles can: ● Include early identification of public issues and concerns ● Increase the involvement of the public in decision-making processes ● Increase civic pride

	● Decrease barriers to participation ● Increase understanding about how Regional government works ● Ensure neighbourhood level influence reflects region-wide benefits/interests ● Create better, more informed decisions Strategic Focus plan: [Region of Waterloo Strategic Focus 2019-2023](#)
Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	Waterloo shares three of the same principles with Hamilton, and has two different ones: Respect and Responsiveness. Waterloo has an engagement framework but does not have a public engagement spectrum.

	Windsor***
Document	[Municipal Cultural Master Plan](#) (2010) [People Based Community Strategic Plan](#) (2010)
What is community engagement?	The City of Windsor has no standard definition of community engagement. The Cultural Affairs Office however lays out how the four pillars of the City's Community Strategic plan along with a public consultation process to be met in its municipal cultural master plan.Under the "Our Government" pillar they prioritize frequent and open public engagement in decisions that affect their lives(The City of Windsor pg 34-35, 2010).
Principles	N/A
Engagement Framework	N/A
Public Engagement Spectrum	N/A
Public Engagement Policy	N/A
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion	The City of Windsor has a [Diversity and Inclusion Initiative](#) (2021) which takes a seven aspect holistic approach to ensure diversity is recognized in the community and cooperation (pg 7) These 7 aspects include: 1. Detailed Management and Staff consultations 2. Department Action Item committee 3. Enhanced Diversity Training 4. Corporation and community based Approach 5. Expansion of inclusion 6. Department Specific action items 7. Community Input (pg 8,2021)
Additional	The municipal cultural master plan is not a formal public engagement document but has a similar purpose to inform a public engagement strategy.For example the "Our Government"

	pillar of the strategic plan states the city should encourage open and frequent public engagement (pg 39, 2010) 4 pillars to the community strategic plan: City of Windsor Pillars 　1. Our Economy 　2. Our Society 　3. Our Environment 　4. Our Government Get Involved Windsor - City of Windsor webpage that explains how residents can provide feedback about the Official Plan that will shape the City's future development, environment, and services. Public Consultation/Engagement Projects
Difference(s) from City of Hamilton	Windsor lacks a defined public engagement policy, framework, principles, and spectrum. Public engagement is replaced by the City's strategic plan and is very project-specific.

The City of Windsor lacks a distinct public engagement charter, policy or framework and instead develops a unique public consultation process for each project. For example the City of Windsor launched a targeted public engagement campaign about Transit services in 2019. Through two rounds of public engagement using social media, a project website and a variety of engagement techniques key themes of public feedback were made into project recommendations (Transit Windsor Service Review, 2019). This demonstrates how the engagement process was designed specifically for this project opposed to following general core principles in a public engagement policy or charter.

	Winnipeg
Document	[Engage Winnipeg Policy](#) (2019)
What is community engagement?	Public: "all persons who may be interested in a decision made by the City." Engagement: "A process whereby the City facilitates dialogue with and between the public and stakeholders to collect input which supports better decision making by the City." (Pg. 2, 2019)
Principles	1. Accountability 2. Knowledge & Partnership Seeking 3. Communication 4. Evaluation 5. Inclusivity 6. Representation 7. Timeliness 8. Transparency 9. Trust (Pg. 3)
Engagement Framework	While there is much reference to the framework and the aims of the framework, Winnipeg does not explicitly outline their community engagement framework.
Public Engagement Spectrum	Follows the IAP2 spectrum for participation 1. Consult. 2. Involve. 3. Collaborate. 4. Empower. (pg. 6)
Public Engagement Policy	Engage Winnipeg Policy *. The purpose of the policy is "to guide engagement processes between the City of Winnipeg, the public, and stakeholders in order to offer consistent and meaningful engagement opportunities which support better informed decision

	making."

(Pg. 1) |
| Equity, Diversity, Inclusion | Representation principle states that particular attention should be paid to ensuring involvement of those who experience barriers to participation, while the inclusivity principle states that where barriers to inclusive engagement exist, barriers are reduced to the greatest degree possible.

(P. 3)

Engage Winnipeg lists interventions to reduce barriers to participating in public engagement opportunities:
● Providing written descriptions of images and offering captions on videos, and adhering to clear print guidelines to maximize readability.
● Using a variety of ways to communicate (email, web notification, print, etc.) to ensure accessibility of invitations to participate.
● Hosting engagement events in accessible venues, paying attention to accessibility of entrances, doorways, washrooms, and width/surface of travel paths, as well as lighting and acoustics.
● Accommodating service animals and personal care attendants.
● Considering transportation options, including availability and proximity of accessible parking and accessibility by Winnipeg Transit.
● Considering time of day and providing different event date options when possible.
● Providing documents and materials ahead of events. |
| Additional | |
| Difference(s) from City of Hamilton | The City of Winnipeg has only 3 principles in common with the City of Hamilton (Evaluation, Inclusivity and Transparency). The representation principle as well as their engagement website |

	provides more detail on how barriers to participation can be reduced by suggesting interventions that address challenges in the engagement process.

Recommendations

Principles

Based on the environmental scan of comparative municipalities, the research team has identified five principles that do not appear in the City of Hamilton's engagement charter. We identify and elaborate on the five principles below.

1. **Respect:** Respect is a key principle in seven of the municipalities consulted: Kingston, Oshawa, London, Cambridge, Guelph, Waterloo, and Niagara. It is sometimes framed as "mutual respect," which encompasses staying on topic and engaging in focused conversations to create a respectful and productive environment (3 Kingston 2017). Further, it emphasizes the importance of valuing diverse views, backgrounds, and interests (3 Kingston, 2017; 7 Oshawa, 2015; London, 2017; 2 Cambridge, 2019; 9 Guelph, 2015). Respect includes both respecting the public's time and opinions (3 Niagara, 2015; 7 Oshawa, 2015). We acknowledge that the City of Hamilton (2015) includes a similar definition of respect in their glossary, but as the City of Waterloo notes, fostering respect can decrease barriers to participation, increase involvement in decision-making, and increase civic pride (2, 2016).

   Recommendation: For this reason – as well as the fact that respect is essential to maintaining a productive and healthy engagement with the public – we believe that it should be added as a key principle to the City of Hamilton's public engagement framework to emphasize the importance of valuing diverse opinions in the process.

2. **Continuous Improvement**: Continuous improvement is a key principle in six of the municipalities consulted in this study: Edmonton, Oshawa, Halifax, Kingston, Guelph, and Ottawa. This principle acknowledges that as cities evolve and grow, their community engagement frameworks must continuously do the same (8 Oshawa 2015; 4 Kingston 2017; 2 Edmonton 2017; 11 Halifax 2008; 9 Guelph 2015; 5 Ottawa 2015). This improvement should be done in consultation with participants about the process to improve the quality of engagement over time (5 Ottawa 2015).

   Recommendation: Continuously evaluating the efficiency and efficacy of public engagement ensures that participants will continue to want to engage with the process. Therefore, we recommend that it is included as a principle in the City of Hamilton's public engagement framework.

3. **Shared Responsibility:** Shared responsibility is a key principle in three of the _ municipalities consulted in this study: Cambridge, Edmonton and London. This principle entails how the City and residents recognize the value of engagement and understand obligations or responsibilities to meet, to ensure engagement policy implementation is successful (6 London,2017; 4 Cambridge,2019). This principle also emphasizes authentic engagement to generate solutions and participation that supports democratic decision-making (1 Edmonton,2017). While similar to principle five: cooperation, collaboration and shared purpose of the City of Hamilton Charter, shared responsibility describes steps and reasons for a public engagement objective, thus complementing the existing principle of shared purpose.

   Recommendation: Shared responsibility should be added to principle five so that it ensures all stakeholders understand their expected roles or obligations in meeting a particular community engagement goal or objective.

4. **Responsiveness/Timely Communication:** Responsiveness is a key principle included in four of the cities consulted in this study: Calgary, Waterloo, Cambridge, and London. Responsiveness is defined as, "...participants will listen and respond to concerns in a timely manner, ensuring that outcomes and next steps are communicated" (6, London 2017), and that concerns with public engagement processes will be addressed proactively, and that they will be flexible in response to changing needs (2 Waterloo, 2015). This principle distinctly emphasizes the importance of addressing resident concerns in a timely manner and highlights the necessity of communicating next steps. Timely communication is a key principle included in nine of the cities consulted in this study. Timely communication is defined as, "...provid[ing] information that is timely, accurate, balanced, easily understood and accessible and… involv[ing]… citizens early in the process so that they have time to learn about the issue and actively participate (7 Kitchener, 2018). This principle highlights the importance of conveying information to residents in a quick manner.

   Recommendation: While the City of Hamilton addresses these two concepts of "responsiveness" and "timely communication" in their sixth principle, the research team recommends that they be divided into two separate principles for greater emphasis and/or provide a clearer understanding of the differences between responsiveness (responding to resident concerns) and timely communication (conveying information).

5. **Adaptability/Adaptive**: This principle is included in the City of Ottawa's public engagement strategy as a guiding principle. Adaptive as a principle ensures the

engagement plan is fit to the nature of the topic being discussed and also flexible enough so the plan can be modified during the engagement process, as necessary (5 Ottawa, 2015).

Recommendation: The addition of this principle will ensure that the engagement charter can be applied to a variety of public engagement goals, objectives and projects. The City of Hamilton's new engagement charter would benefit from this principle as it ensures the engagement charter can be adapted at the start to different types of projects and also, when necessary, adjust its approach once the process of community engagement has begun. Therefore, we recommend the City of Hamilton include adaptability/adaptive as one of its core principles in its new Engagement Charter.

Engagement Framework

Of the 18 cities included in the environmental scan, 11 of them included engagement frameworks in their community engagement documents. While each City has outlined different steps in their engagement framework, they each generally include the following approaches: (1) Defining the project or initiative, which involves outlining what the project is, any timelines or deadlines, the target audience, and necessary resources. (2) Determining which level of public engagement is necessary based on the scope of the project and who is involved. (3) Developing a communication plan to effectively involve the public and share with them how they can engage with the project, either through online or in-person meetings, or otherwise indicated. Some cities, including Oshawa, Halifax, and Niagara Falls, all have online engagement platforms that allow residents to share their feedback. (4) Implementing the project; (5) Finally, many cities include a step to evaluate the process. This final step is to determine if the public engagement was effective and if there are any areas for improvement. This can be measured using interviews, surveys, or informal discussions.

Recommendation: Given that most cities in our scan have an engagement framework, the research team recommends that the City of Hamilton include an engagement framework to complement the current Engagement Charter to ensure that community engagement projects are developed appropriately.

Public Engagement Spectrum

A majority of the cities in the environmental scan based their public engagement spectrum on the "International Association for Public Participation" spectrum (IAP2), which includes: inform; consult; involve; collaborate; empower. Some cities adopted

forms of the IAP2 spectrum, such as Ottawa, whose steps include: inform/evaluate; consult; involve; collaborate/partner; and delegate. The City of Halifax and St. John's outlined three steps in their public engagement spectrum: information sharing; consultation; and active participation. Edmonton outlined a four-step public engagement spectrum: Advise; refine; create; and decide. Waterloo and Saskatoon did not include a public engagement spectrum.

The City of Hamilton's engagement spectrum, the "public participatory spectrum" adapted from the International Association of Public Participation, is detailed and well organized in that each level includes a participation goal, a promise to the public, and example techniques.

Recommendation: To make the spectrum more informative, additional links could be included in the example techniques section of an engagement level. For example, under the consult level of the spectrum, a technique listed is public meetings in which the City could provide links for members of the public to learn about previous and upcoming public meetings related to public participation.

Equity, Diversity, & Inclusion

Of the cities included in the environmental scan, 15 of them have an "inclusion" principle, while only three cities have separate statements on inclusion in their community engagement frameworks. Only two cities mention diversity in their community engagement frameworks, and only Edmonton defines what diversity means and how it will be addressed in community engagement projects.

Furthermore, [London](#), [Ottawa](#), and [Windsor](#) all have separate documents that outline equity, diversity, and inclusion strategies. The city of Oshawa has two separate documents, one for [Inclusion and Diversity](#), and one for [Equity and Inclusion](#). These documents help to define and outline the importance of these terms, while also ensuring that all perspectives are considered in community engagement projects.

Recommendation: Given that the City of Hamilton has a principle for inclusion and diversity, the research team suggests they consider incorporating "equity." This will ensure the city's approach to public engagement includes breaking down systemic barriers for community members to participate. Clear definitions of these terms should be provided in this principle to build awareness of the concepts and how they will be operationalized in the City's public engagement framework.

Conclusion

Through an environmental scan of 21 municipalities, this report provides recommendations for revising the City of Hamilton's Public Engagement Charter. Our findings include core principles of engagement, an engagement framework, a public engagement spectrum, and equity, diversity, and inclusion statements. After comparing other municipalities' public engagement principles to Hamilton's, we recommend:

Revisions to the Public Engagement Charter:
A. Addition of three principles:
      1. Respect
      2. Continuous improvement
      5. Adaptability/Adaptive.
B. Incorporation of "shared responsibility" into principle 5.
C. Splitting "responsiveness" and "timely communication" into two principles or incorporating language that clearly distinguishes between the two concepts.

Engagement Framework
Develop an Engagement Framework that clearly outlines the steps in Hamilton's public engagement process and that ensures consistency between projects.

Equity, Diversity and Inclusion
Incorporate "equity" into the "inclusion and diversity" principle on the existing public engagement charter and provide clear definitions of these terms and how they will be operationalized. This will strengthen the charter by stating a commitment to breaking down systemic barriers to public participation and supports diversity and inclusion.

References

Stuart G. (2017) What is the Spectrum of Public Participation?. Sustaining Community. Retrieved from:https://sustainingcommunity.wordpress.com/2017/02/14/spectrum-of-public-participation/

Municipality Profile References (Cities in alphabetical order)

Calgary

City of Calgary. (n.d.). Engage Meaningful dialogue. Informed decisions. https://engage.calgary.ca/

City of Calgary (2013). Engage Policy. https://www.calgary.ca/content/dam/www/ca/city-clerks/documents/council-policy-library/cs009-engage.pdf

City of Calgary (n.d.). Engage Frameworks and Tools. https://hdp-ca-prod-app-cgy-engage-files.s3.ca-central-1.amazonaws.com/1314/6376/8116/Engage_Framework.pdf

City of Calgary (n.d.). Engagement at the City: How it works. https://www.calgary.ca/content/dam/www/engage/documents/engage-how-it-works-5ws.pdf

Cambridge

Cambridge Corporate Services (2019). Citizen Engagement. Cambridge, Ontario. https://www.cambridge.ca/en/learn-about/resources/Accessible-PDFs/Citizen-Engagement.pdf

Edmonton

The Council Initiative on Public Engagement (2017). Public Engagement Framework. Edmonton, AB. https://www.edmonton.ca/public-files/assets/document?path=PublicEngagementFramework.pdf

City of Edmonton Council (2017) Public Engagement Policy. Edmonton, AB. https://www.edmonton.ca/sites/default/files/public-files/assets/PoliciesDirectives/C593A.pdf

Guelph

City of Guelph (n.d.). Guiding principles for community engagement. https://guelph.ca/city-hall/communicate/community-engagement/

Halifax

Halifax (n.d). *Shape Your City.* Retrieved May 27th, 2022. https://www.halifax.ca/about-halifax/regional-community-planning/shape-your-city

Halifax Regional Council (2008). Halifax Regional Municipality Community Engagement Strategy. Halifax, NS. https://legacycontent.halifax.ca/boardscom/documents/CommunityEngagementStrategy.pdf

Halifax Regional Council (2016). Public Engagement Renewed (Item no. 9.1.1). Halifax, NS. https://cdn.halifax.ca/sites/default/files/documents/city-hall/regional-council/160223rc911pres.pdf

Kingston

City of Kingston (2017). Public Engagement Framework. Kingston, ON. https://www.cityofkingston.ca/documents/10180/17772359/Projects_PublicEngagmentFramework_Final.pdf/6ac0149e-e928-4074-9827-1d7db30c0013?t=1610977952727

Kitchener

Community Engagement Consultant (2010). Community Engagement Policy (GOV-COU-2010). Kitchener ON. https://www.engagewr.ca/25671/widgets/104012/documents/66730

City of Kitchener (n.d.). Community Engagement Review Kitchener ON. https://www.engagewr.ca/25671/widgets/104012/documents/66732

London

City of London Council (2017). Community Engagement Policy. London, ON. https://london.ca/council-policies/community-engagement-policy

City of London (2021). Community Diversity and Inclusion. London, ON. https://london.ca/CDIS#:~:text=Council%27s%202015%2D2019%20Strategic%20Plan,and%20involved%20in%20our%20community".

Niagara

City of Niagara Falls (2015). Niagara Community Engagement Framework. Niagara Falls, ON. https://niagarafalls.ca/pdf/community-engagement/nfall-17-0005-engagement-strategy-final-final-s.pdf

Let's Talk Niagara Falls (n.d.). *Let's Talk Niagara Falls.* Retrieved May 27th, 2022. https://letstalk.niagarafalls.ca

Oshawa

City of Oshawa (2015). Community Engagement Initiative. Oshawa, ON. http://app.oshawa.ca/agendas/corporate_services/2015/10-26/final_corp-15-161_community_engagement_initiative.pdf

City of Oshawa (2017). Diversity and Inclusion Plan. Oshawa, ON. https://www.oshawa.ca/residents/resources/Diversity-and-Inclusion/research-report--diversity-and-inclusion-plan-final-accessible-format.pdf

City of Oshawa (2021). Equity and Inclusion Lens and Handbook. Oshawa, ON. https://www.oshawa.ca/business-and-investment/resources/Equity-and-Inclusion-Lens-FINAL-FINAL-May72021.pdf

Connect Oshawa. (n.d.) *Connect Oshawa.* Retrieved May 27th, 2022. https://connectoshawa.ca

Ottawa – Gatineau

City of Ottawa (n.d.). Engage Ottawa. https://engage.ottawa.ca/

City of Ottawa (2015). Public Engagement Strategy: Guidelines and Toolkit. http://ottwatch.ca/meetings/file/273915/Document_2_EN_Public_Engagement_Guidelines_and_Toolkit_pdf_Item_COMMUNITY_AND_SOCIAL_SERVICES_DEPARTMENT_IMPLEMENTATION_OF_PUBLIC_ENGAGEMENT_STRATEGY_Meeting_Community_and_Protective_Services_Committee_Date_2015_02_19_09_30_00

City of Ottawa and City for All Women Initiative (2022). Equity & Inclusion Lens Handbook. May 27). Ottawa, ON. https://documents.ottawa.ca/sites/documents/files/ei_lens_hb_en.pdf

Saskatoon

City of Saskatoon Council (2019). Public Engagement Policy (Item no. C02-046). Saskatoon, SK. https://www.saskatoon.ca/sites/default/files/documents/city-clerk/council-policies/c02-046.pdf

St. John's

> City of St. John's Council (2014).Engage! Policy Corporate and Operational Manual.
> St. John's NL.
>
> Division of Organizational Performance & Strategy. (2017). Public Engagement At the City of St. John's. St John's, NL. https://www.engagestjohns.ca/9679/widgets/38239/documents/17799

Toronto

> City of Toronto (n.d.) Corporate Strategic Plan. Toronto, ON. https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/9886-DS-19-0438-Corporate-Strategic-Plan-V4-MG1.pdf
>
> Outreach and Engagement. (n.d.). *Outreach and Engagement.* Retrieved May 27th, 2022. https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/planning-development/outreach-engagement/

Vancouver

> City of Vancouver (n.d.). How we do community engagement. https://vancouver.ca/your-government/how-we-do-community-engagement.aspx

Victoria

> City of Victoria (2017). Engagement Framework, Victoria, BC. https://www.victoria.ca/assets/Departments/Communications/Documents/Engagement~Framework/Engagement%20Framework%20July%202017.pdf#search=%22public%20engagement%22

Waterloo

> Region of Waterloo (2016). Guidelines for Public Engagement at the Region of Waterloo. Waterloo, ON. https://www.regionofwaterloo.ca/en/regional-government/resources/Documents/DOCS_ADMIN-1973998-v1-Revised_Guidelines_for_Public_Engagement_at_the_RoW.pdf

Windsor

> Corporation of the City of Windsor (2010). Municipal Cultural Master Plan. Windsor, ON. https://www.citywindsor.ca/residents/Recreation/Documents/Municipal%20Cultural%20Master%20Plan.pdf

The City of Windsor (n.d). Diversity and Inclusion Initiative. Windsor, ON. https://www.citywindsor.ca/cityhall/committeesofcouncil/Advisory-Committees/Diversity-Committee/Documents/City%20of%20Windsor%20Diversity%20and%20Inclusion%20Initiative%20(Diversity%20Committee).pdf

The City of Windsor (2010). Our People-based Community Strategic Plan. Windsor, ON. https://www.citywindsor.ca/residents/planning/plans-and-community-information/documents/public%20notices%20informative%20flyer.pdf

Transit Service Review (2019). More Than Transit Round 1 Public Engagement Windsor, ON. https://www.citywindsor.ca/residents/transitwindsor/About-Transit/Documents/More%20Than%20Transit_Round%201_Public%20Engagement%20Results.pdf

Winnipeg

City of Winnipeg (2019). Engage Winnipeg Policy. Winnipeg, MB. https://clkapps.winnipeg.ca/DMIS/ViewPdf.asp?SectionId=537531

City of Winnipeg (2019i). How Can We Help? Winnipeg, MB. https://engage.winnipeg.ca/help