

Two-Cents Worth?
*The Role of the Courts and the Administrative Decision-Making Process in the
Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada*

By

David Said, B.A. (Hon)

A Thesis

Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree

Master of Arts

MCMASTER UNIVERSITY

August 2015

Acknowledgements

There are a number of people to whom I am very thankful for and would like to express my appreciation to for their contribution and assistance to my work. These individuals have made this work possible with their persistent motivation, invaluable knowledge and endless patience.

I would like to express my most sincere appreciation and deepest gratitude to Dr. Greg Flynn for without him, this project would not have been made possible. As Aristotle once said, “For the things we have to learn before we can do them, we learn by doing them”. Dr. Flynn’s confidence in my work provided me with a priceless opportunity to discover skills that can only be exposed by practicing them. His ongoing support of my research and my future career goals has created many opportunities for me to which I will always be grateful for. Aside from his considerable skill, treasured advice and excellent proficiency in relation to this study, he provided me with all the required resources I needed to complete my work. He always made himself available and responded to my many questions in a very timely fashion. His positive motivation, assistance and patience have contributed a great deal to this work and my overall academic development. Truly, he has gone above and beyond his role as a supervisor and is all that one could ask for as a mentor.

The members of my committee, Dr. Karen Bird and Dr. Peter Nyers, provided me with valuable assistance with their challenging input and different perspectives on my work. Dr. Bird for her remarkable assistance and guidance with the quantitative aspects of the work and Dr. Nyers for his invaluable insight and intriguing discussions. They have always kept their door opened to me and responded to my requests with little or no notice in advance at all. Their individual expertise, insightful advice and personal support have played a significant role in shaping the overall framework of this study. Their guidance and support has undoubtedly contributed a great amount to this work and more generally my overall learning process.

Dr. Christina Gabriel also provided valuable guidance through her feedback and comments on sections and chapters of the research. She has also provided me with significant information by directing me to explore other sources.

I would also like to thank Dr. Todd Alway, who through his life chats, witty remarks and enthusiasm about statistical analysis provided the much-needed emotional support to complete this project. His time, effort and guidance have allowed me to get through many difficult moments. I also would like to express my appreciation to Dr. Peter Graefe and Dr. Shafiqul Huque for their words of encouragement, positive reinforcement and thoughtfulness when crossing paths both on and off campus.

I am also very thankful to the administrative staff in the Department of Political Science. Kathleen Hannan for her kindness and generosity and Manuela Dozzi for her limitless patience and persistent motivation. I cannot thank them enough for putting up with my tedious requests and the mischief I have caused in their office.

Throughout my graduate studies, I have met a number of colleagues who I have come to respect and rely on for their support and friendship at McMaster University and the Hamilton Community. Although there are far too many to name, there are a few who have been supportive since the beginning. I would specifically like to thank Marcel Goguen and Samantha Jackson in the Department of Political Science for their guidance and helpful advice. To the many others, I would like to extend my gratitude for their friendship and affection that they have shown me.

The Department of Political Science at McMaster University has provided the ideal site to begin my academic endeavors due to its strong tradition of interdisciplinary research, expertise in comparative politics and public policy, and the presence and influence of esteemed faculty members. I am very glad to have had the opportunity to be a part of it.

Finally, and most certainly not the least, I wish to extend my most sincerest appreciation to both my Mother and Grandmother who have been my support system and motivation since the very beginning. To them, I owe them everything.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1 – An Introduction to the Study of Judicialization	01
Chapter 2 – The Politics of Public Administration	15
Chapter 3 – Methodology	31
Chapter 4 – The Capacity of Unanimous Judicial Decisions	53
Chapter 5 – The Capacity of Non-Unanimous Judicial Decisions	75
Chapter 6 – Conclusion	89
Bibliography	96
Appendix A – Declining Acceptance Rates and Inconsistent Trends	102
Appendix B – Democratic Ranking of Asylum Claimant’s Country of Origin	105
Appendix C – Grant Rate Variations Within Country of Origin	107
Appendix D – Precedent Treatment Table (Ward)	110
Appendix E – Precedent Treatment Table (Chan)	113