

NO MAGIC BULLET HERE: HIV/AIDS AND PRIMARY EDUCATION

NO MAGIC BULLET HERE:
AN ANALYSIS OF THE IMPACT OF HIV/AIDS ON PRIMARY EDUCATION IN
BOTSWANA AND MALAWI

By

TRICIA R. JOHNSON

B.A. (University of British Columbia)

B.S.W. (University of Calgary)

A Thesis

Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements

for the Degree

Master of Social Work

McMaster University

© Copyright by Tricia R. Johnson, August 2007

MASTER OF SOCIAL WORK
(2007)

McMaster University
Hamilton, Ontario

TITLE: No Magic Bullet Here: An Analysis of the Impact of HIV/AIDS on Primary
Education in Botswana and Malawi

AUTHOR: Tricia R. Johnson, B.A. (University of British Columbia), B.S.W. (University
of Calgary)

SUPERVISOR: Dr. Susan Watt

NUMBER OF PAGES: vi, 86

Abstract

Reaching the second Millennium Development Goal may not be achievable by the 2015 deadline for either Botswana or Malawi, but both countries have made great strides towards this goal. An analysis, using Gil's framework (1973), of their respective educational policies reveals the successes and challenges faced by each country in this area. The analysis indicates that HIV/AIDS does impact the country's ability to achieve universal primary education; however, it is not the only issue of concern. The policy analysis also shows the incredible complexity of the issues that are encountered in education such as concerns about suitable and accessible infrastructure, the provision of quality education that is relevant to national goals and regional realities, teacher training and attrition rates, financial concerns and donor expectations. This project concludes by investigating some emerging issues of the provision of primary education, such as policy development, statistical reliability, and the role of international donors as well as drawing the connection between this policy analysis and the profession of social work.

Acknowledgments

This process of preparing the thesis has been a wonderful learning experience and I would like to thank Dr. Watt for her support and encouragement throughout. Thank-you for making sure that I never took myself too seriously.

I would also like to thank some of the amazing women in my life. To Grandma Goltz thank you for teaching me that I should strive to learn throughout my life and for showing me the value of family and faith. Even though you don't always understand my choices your support has meant the world to me. To my mother thank you for your unwavering support and uncountable consultations (the cheque is in the mail). Sometimes I don't think you've understood my choices anymore than Grandma but you have always been there. Thanks for instilling in me a desire to learn, the dedication to persevere, and the value of love. To my aunts, cousins, sister-in-law, and good friends, thank-you for showing me the many diverse ways in which strength and knowledge are manifest. You are each inspirations in your own way and I thank you for allowing me to witness and share your lives. Aunt Doreen Grey thanks for sharing your passion for and knowledge of education (you inspired me), for sharing your home and letting me be part of your family. And to Aunt Linda, who unknowingly has planted a seed to continue this journey of knowledge.

Table of Contents

Abstract	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
List of Tables	vi
Sections	
1. Education: A Magic Bullet for the Developing World?	1
2. Examining Education in the Developing World	12
3. Evaluating the Policies of Botswana	16
4. Evaluating the Policies of Malawi	37
5. Exploring What We Know	57
6. Emerging Issues and Insights	70
References	78
Appendix A: Millennium Development Goals	87
Appendix B: Internet Search for Policies	88
Appendix C: Abstracted from Gil's Framework for Policy Analysis	90
Appendix D: MDG Statistics – Primary Education Enrolment	92

List of Tables

Table 5.1: Socio-demographic Information	59
Table 5.2: Educational Achievements	62
Table 5.3: HIV/AIDS Information	64

Education: A Magic Bullet for the Developing World?

Education in the Developing World

At the turn of the millennium the United Nations (UN) announced a new platform to address world poverty. As a response to what many perceived as a failure of globalization (Lewis, 2005), this new declaration was an attempt to deal with poverty in a meaningful manner and from many different directions (Economic Commission, 2005). The areas of poverty alleviation found in the Millennium Declaration were determined based on many conventions that were held during the 1990s and extensive consultations with governments, agencies, international institutions and civil society across the world (Ahderom, 1999; Wheeler, 1999). Within the declaration are eight Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), these are the measurable benchmarks of this declaration (UN Millennium Declaration, 2000) (Appendix A). The MDG of interest in this project is the one pertaining to education. Specifically the second MDG states “To ensure that, by the same date [2015], children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling and that girls and boys will have equal access to all levels of education” (UN Millennium Declaration, 2000).

Primary education is a topic that has been under discussion in the international arena for many years. It originally came under international scrutiny when it was declared

a human right in 1948 (Universal Declaration, 1948). Since that time it has been reaffirmed as a human right, a right of children, and a concern of the international world in over 29 different international conventions, agreements, and ratifications (Lewis, 2005). Despite the recognition of the importance of education, little has been done to ensure that all countries can achieve the goal of universal access to education.

Education is a powerful tool; it is directly linked to poverty reduction, economic growth, social wellbeing, and the transmission or enrichment of cultural and moral values (Bornshier, Herkenrath, & Konig, 2005; Cohen, Bloom, & Malin, 2006; UNESCO, 1990; UNICEF 2006). Education is inexorably linked to a range of issues such as the economy (Rasheed, 2000; UNESCO, 1990), societal stability and gender equality (Bornschier, et al., 2005; Economic Commission, 2005), health care (Rasheed, 2000; UNICEF, 2006), and employment (Lokshin, Glinskaya, Garcia, 2004) among others that must also be addressed if poverty reduction is to be achieved.

Education is reported to benefit economic development in numerous ways (Cohen, et al., 2006; UNESCO, 1990). Bornschier, et al. (2005) showed that in addition to directly supporting the economy through developing human capital, it also has the effect of indirectly supporting the economy through the reproduction and legitimization of social structures. Furthermore, a populace that is competent in basic skills in math, reading, and writing are enabled to participate effectively in the economy (Cohen, et al., 2006).

Socially, the attainment of education is important for individuals to learn fundamental social and cultural norms which allow them to function reasonably in society (Bornschieer, et al., 2005; Economic Commission, 2005). This is particularly true in community or private schools where students learn an alternative curriculum that can focus on the specific needs of the community in which the students live (Hoppers, 2005). Alternate curricula serve to provide specialized skills that are necessary to many rural communities to assist individuals to be productive and more economically self-sufficient, but the curricula are also developed to support social harmony. This supports the notion that cultural and moral values can be transferred through formal education. This in turn has positive effects on health and social stability. Nonetheless, it is concerning as social inequalities can also be transferred through the educational system in ways that do not support poverty reduction (Bornschieer, et al., 2005). For example, gender equality, which is known to promote poverty reduction and overall well-being of societies, is not likely to be supported if existing social structures are legitimized (UNICEF, 2006).

However, evidence shows that cultural norms regarding education change as more individuals are educated (UNESCO, 1990). This is particularly true as women become educated, even if only at a primary level. Educated mothers are twice as likely to ensure that their children attend primary education when compared with mothers who do not have primary education (Cohen, et al., 2006; UNICEF, 2006). In addition, educated mothers tend to ensure that their family accesses health care and other social services that are needed. So education has a dual role of both supporting and transferring cultural norms and challenging those same norms.

Women and men who attend school are shown to have a higher level of factual knowledge, self-confidence, and social status, thus increasing their income earning potential (Lokshin, et al., 2004; Shabaya, Konadu-Agyemang, 2004; UNICEF, 2006). This outcome leads to a generally healthier life style as increased economic well-being raises other aspects of quality of life such as health and social participation (Cohen, et al., 2005; UNICEF, 2006).

Education also has numerous health benefits. A great deal of research indicates that lower maternal and infant mortality rates, lower disease rates, and better nutrition are positively associated with higher levels of education, particularly if those being educated are women (Cohen, et al., 2005; Mbugua, 2007; UNICEF, 2006). Even the acquisition of medical care is improved with higher levels of female education as the decisions made for children are often made by women (UNICEF, 2006). School is also a place to pass on potentially lifesaving information about various diseases as well as transferring information about prevention (Cohen, et al., 2005; Kombe, Fieno, Bhatt, & Smith, 2005; Loewenson, 2007; UNICEF, 2006).

In a more immediate time frame the benefits to education can be debated. There is evidence to show that attending school provides children who are infected or affected by HIV a place of caring and inclusion (Lewis, 2005). Bennell (2006a) found that orphans were more likely to attend school than non-orphans due to the fact that school provided normalcy, regular meals and a more attractive environment than home. Contrarily there are also reports of children, particularly females, who experience elevated levels of abuse

while at school (Poulsen, 2006). There is also a general environment of discrimination and stigma for children infected or affected by HIV/AIDS (Bennell, 2006a; Bicego, Rutstein, & Johnson, 2003).

HIV/AIDS and Education

HIV/AIDS is linked to education in a number of ways. First is the impact on the children themselves, as previously discussed. Children affected by HIV/AIDS can be grouped in three ways: infected children, children who live in a household with infected family members (vulnerable children) and orphans (Bennell, 2006a). Orphanhood is a complex phenomenon as the definitions of orphan and AIDS orphan are constantly changing (Meintjes & Giese, 2006). For the purposes of this project orphan refers to a child who has lost one parent, double orphan refers to a child who has lost both parents, and AIDS orphan refers to a child who has lost one or both parents to an AIDS related illness.

It is very difficult to determine the impact of HIV/AIDS on the education of HIV positive children as many do not reveal their HIV status due to the stigma and discrimination that is associated with a positive status (Bennell, 2006a; Kinghorn & Kelly, 2006). It is somewhat easier to determine the impact of HIV/AIDS on the education of AIDS orphans and vulnerable children, as these children and their situations are more identifiable. Evidence suggests that, ironically, the education of orphans and double orphans is less impacted than previously suggested (Bennell, 2006a). This can be explained by the above mentioned reasons, in addition to the fact that orphaned children

are sometimes not required to perform household tasks if they reside with family members, though that often depends on the family member that heads the household. Households that are headed by older individuals are more likely to ensure that children are enrolled in the educational system (Oleke, Blystad, Fylkesnes, & Tumwine, 2007).

Bicego, et al (2003) suggest that the impact of the AIDS pandemic on education begins before children are orphaned. The situation of vulnerable children is less clear. Vulnerable children may be forced out of school when their HIV status is discovered due to stigma and discrimination (AVERT, 2007b; Bicego, et al., 2003) so many do not reveal their status. Some are required to repeat standards or drop out due to their circumstances. Some research indicates that children take on care-giving roles due to the impact of AIDS (Bicego, et al., 2003) and some suggest that care-giving roles may be adopted by children due to other reasons (Bennell, 2006a). Regardless, it is not uncommon for a child, often a female child, to miss school when a parent experiences an AIDS related illness to provide care-taking duties (Bicego, et al., 2003; Craddock, 2004; Guest, 2004). In cases where both parents have died, a female child will often withdraw from school to care for younger siblings (Bicego, et al., 2003; Guest, 2004). Research has also shown that HIV/AIDS impacts a child's education through either a delayed or disrupted entry in the educational system (Bennell, 2006a; Bicego et al., 2003).

There are also financial constraints to children attending school which may be directly or indirectly related to AIDS. Regardless of whether or not a country has tuition fees there are usually additional fees for uniforms, books, or materials among other items

and services that a family may not be able to afford (AVERT, 2007b; Lewis, 2005).

Bennell's (2006a) research showed that student absenteeism is often due to being sent home due to non-payment of fees and lack of materials. While this may not be directly linked to HIV/AIDS, indirect links can be made to the fact that families affected by HIV/AIDS often subsist on lower incomes due to lack of employment or underemployment and what money is available is commonly used for health care (AVERT, 2007b; Bicego, et al., 2003; Guest, 2004; Oleke, et al., 2007).

Another impact of HIV/AIDS on education comes from the provision of education. There is a large concern about the number of teachers that will be able to teach in the educational system as a result of AIDS related reasons (Kombe, et al., 2005; UNESCO Institute, 2006). The impact of HIV/AIDS is multifaceted as teachers may be impacted by their own HIV status or the need to care for ill family members (Bedi, et al., 2004; Bennell, 2006b). Bennell (2006b) showed that there are many ways in which teachers can be impacted by HIV/AIDS in the workplace with mortality and morbidity being the most studied, but also through absenteeism, morale and motivation, and discrimination (Kombe, et al., 2005). It is important to note that attrition rates of teachers are much higher than mortality rates, which indicates that there are many other factors that influence teacher supply issues in sub-Saharan Africa (Bennell, 2006b; Kinghorn & Kelly, 2006; UNESCO Institute, 2006). Likewise not all of the issues are directly related to HIV/AIDS such as morale issues. These may be linked to HIV/AIDS indirectly though through poor working conditions, low pay and stresses due to personal experiences (Bennell, 2006b).

The MDG on primary education is measured by enrolment rates of children in school, the literacy rates of 15 – 24 year olds and the completion of a full course of primary school (UN Millennium Declaration, 2000). Universal primary education is most commonly articulated through the enrolment rates of children. While enrolment is the most common measure cited there are some problems with reliability as enrolment data does not translate accurately into attendance rates (Cohen, et al, 2006). Furthermore, many students drop out of school. School dropout can be precipitated by financial hardship, a change in family structure, or HIV/AIDS related reasons such as the need to provide care (AVERT, 2007b; Bicego, et al., 2003; Poulsen, 2006).

Finally, the statistics indicate that there are 100 million children not in school (Birdsall, Levine, & Ibrahim, 2005). Further investigation indicates that sub-Saharan Africa has the lowest rates of educational enrolment in the world with 64.2% of eligible children enrolled in educational institutions, 56.4% of children complete a full course of primary education and it has the second lowest rate of literacy among 15-24 year olds (73.1%) (United Nations, 2006). For these reasons the regional focus of this project is on sub-Saharan Africa. As a result of the connections between HIV/AIDS and education it is of interest to determine whether the fact that sub-Saharan Africa is poised to fall short of meeting the MDG concerning universal primary education is influenced by HIV/AIDS.

Analytic Framework

Different frameworks of policy analysis can be broadly separated into the process model, the purpose model and a combination between the two (Moroney & Krysik,

1998). Briefly, process analysis focuses on the policy after a goal has been articulated. It is assumed that the goal is based upon a rational decision that is grounded in the necessary information. The role of the analyst is to evaluate the way in which alternatives were decided upon and how to apply the pre-determined criteria to those alternatives. The ultimate goal of such an analysis is to provide the decision maker with the information that is needed to determine the appropriate alternative. The criticism of the process model rests on the necessary neutrality of the analyst and the reluctance of analysts to consider the values involved in policy creation.

On the other hand, purpose analysis involves the examination of policy ends, not simply the means (Moroney & Krysik, 1998). As such, it is an analysis that investigates the interaction between values, principles and outcomes. The analyst's role is much more complicated as they must identify and understand the values of multiple professions and disciplines and be able to synthesize that information into a coherent whole. They must also identify the values, indicate how value choices may affect society and examine the assumptions that underlie policy creation. Criticism of this model suggests that it does not acknowledge the process that is used in determining which values are pursued.

The combination of the two models is an attempt to deal with the criticism of both individual models by focusing on both the process and the outcome (values) of a policy. Gil (1973) developed a framework that recognizes the importance of values in the analysis process. Gil states that the values and beliefs of a society are integral to the types of policies that developed. These values underlie decisions which determine how a

country allocates its resources, statuses and rights which ultimately affect the social relationships that exist in society (Madison, 1980). Therefore, while his framework focuses on the process of policy development, it consistently evaluates the values that underlie the process.

This project will work from Gil's framework (1973) of policy analysis to analyze the relationship between HIV/AIDS prevalence and the achievement of the MDG concerning primary education in Malawi and Botswana.¹ Gil suggests that multiple policies operate together to maintain the societies in which we live but those policies may not be consistent with each other. It is the inconsistencies that require policies to be analyzed and altered in order to assist society to deal with inequalities and changing circumstances. Because multiple policies are interdependent, they must be examined together so that the interconnections are taken into consideration alongside the primary policy. As it pertains to this project the national policies regarding primary education are of concern but additional policies concerning health, international aid and other social concerns are important as they help to shape the goals and outcomes of the national educational policies.

Finally, in his discussion of social policy Gil (1973) indicates that the conceptual separation of economic and social policies results in economic policy being developed for its own purposes disconnecting it from social policy. Therefore, this project includes

¹The 1973 version of Gil's framework is used in this project despite the fact that there are newer versions of this framework available. This choice was made due to the structural-functional approach of this version of the framework.

policies or documents that discuss economic or strategic plans in an attempt to re-establish a link between the economy and the social situation.

This comprehensive examination of educational policy will not only serve to illuminate the beliefs surrounding education but also how these are related and influenced by economic and other social policies. Ultimately, this analysis will provide a more comprehensive understanding of how the policies are helping or hindering the achievement of universal primary education.

Examining Education in the Developing World

This research relies exclusively on secondary sources related to education, HIV/AIDS and the country of study. It is a case study of two countries in sub-Saharan Africa, Botswana and Malawi, through policy analysis. The intent is to explore the impact of HIV/AIDS on the ability of these countries to achieve the MDG of universal primary education. This project relies on Gil's structural-functional framework of policy analysis (Gil, 1973).

The primary form of information used in this project is the policies related to education, HIV/AIDS, and other social issues as they exist in each country. Other sources that contribute to the investigation include basic country histories and related information, MDG reports and statistics, international and national reports on education and HIV/AIDS, and national strategic plans.

Document Retrieval

The documents were found through two main methods: Internet searches and library searches. Internet searches were done in a methodical manner starting with an investigation of the government home pages for each country. A second search was performed by searching organisational websites including UN agencies, the World Bank, and MDG sites. The search was continued using issue websites (e. g. AVERT, USAIDS,

Education for All). Final searches for policies were done as a Google search of the country and specific policy name in order to locate a copy of the policy. Any policies or documents concerning education or HIV/AIDS were downloaded and examined for relevance to policy or national strategic plans (Appendix B).

If the policies were not accessible via the Internet another search was done using library databases. These searches were carried out using the McMaster library and various other university libraries in Canada and the United States that were known to have strong African Studies or Law programs. McMaster library was also used to locate general information and histories of the two countries of interest.

Gil's Policy Analysis Framework (1973)

Once all of the appropriate policies were located they were analyzed using Gil's framework (1973). Based on a structural-functional perspective, Gil examines social policy by first defining what social policy is and then providing a systematic method for its analysis. Gil's definition of social policy is that it is a series of principles or courses of action that are intended to affect the quality of life, circumstances of living for either individuals or groups, and the nature of intra-societal relationships within society.

Using this definition Gil (1973) has built a comprehensive framework to analyze social policies. The framework has five basic steps, each covering a different area: the focus of the policy, the substantive nature of the policy, how the policy affects society, the policy creation process and the influence of the policy on other social policies (see Appendix C for details). The first three steps involve the analysis of the policy itself

while the last two steps look at the influences in the policy development and how the policy interacts with other policies of the nation.

The main focus of this project concerns the implications of the policy. It is through the implications that the existing educational situation can best be understood. The four areas that are examined are resources, status allocation, rights distribution, and the consequences of the policy (Gil, 1973). When considering resources, the policy analyst looks for the development of or changes to resources, goods or services. Identification of status allocations requires an inspection of the creation of status, elimination of status, or changes in the criteria or procedures used to assign status. Rights distribution refers to possible changes in entitlements, rewards or constraints. In addition a policy analyst studies the ratio of rights as entitlements to rights as rewards due to the allocation of status and the ratio of rights that are distributed directly as opposed to indirectly. This investigation also includes acknowledging how the changes reflect the rights that are guaranteed to citizens and the degree of equality in the distribution of rights. Finally, the consequences of the policy on overall quality of life and the circumstances of living must be scrutinized. This examination considers eight domains: ecological, demographic, biologic, psychological, social, economic, political, and cultural.

For each country there will be a general overview of the **history of the nation** followed by a description of the **educational system**. The **educational policies** will be analyzed according to the aforementioned framework. This will be followed by the

examination of any **policies concerning the effect of HIV/AIDS**. Finally, any **other policies affecting education** will be investigated.

Evaluating the Policies of Botswana

History of the Nation

Botswana is a unique country in Africa. A former British protectorate, Botswana gained independence in a peaceful manner in 1966 (CIA, 2007a). What followed was a stable civilian leadership that focused on social issues while enjoying a relatively robust economy. Unlike so many other countries in Africa it has not been plagued by civil unrest, a depressed economy or political strife. The constitution of Botswana was enacted in 1966 by the actions of a parliamentary democracy. Botswana does not have significant international loans; as a result it is relatively independent of international interference. However, Botswana also has one of the highest HIV/AIDS rates in the world, almost half of its citizens live under the poverty line, and there is currently a decrease in enrolment of children in primary education (WHO, 2005a; UNESCO, 2003a).

The incidence of HIV/AIDS in the adult population is reportedly between 35.5% and 39.1% (WHO, 2005a). While there is evidence of a small decline in the number of new infections since the late 1990s the percentage is still extremely high. The reduction of new infections may be due to the aggressive and comprehensive national policy on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS, 2007).

Not unlike other African countries, women have a higher rate of infection than men with 49% of women aged 30 – 35 infected, 18% of women aged 15 – 19 and 31% of women aged 20 – 25 (WHO, 2005a). The rates for young people (15 – 24) in both genders are quite high. Some of the factors cited for this epidemic include: stigma, the vulnerability of women, the high incidence of unprotected sex and sexually transmitted diseases, poverty, high rates of mobility, and urbanization (Botswana National, 2001; WHO, 2005a). Antiretroviral therapy (ART) is accessible to all Botswana and is provided free to those who work in the public service (Botswana National, 2001; WHO, 2005a). This is possible because of the proactive response of government to the AIDS epidemic, Botswana's economic stability and the existence of an effective health care system (Botswana National, 2001; UNAIDS, 2007).

Educational System

A nine year course of basic education is laid out by the government of Botswana. Children enter this system at the age of six for public school and five for private school (RNPE, 1994). A course of basic education currently involves seven years of primary education and two years of junior secondary school. An additional three years of senior secondary education are available for those who qualify and can afford it. Since 1977, basic education in Botswana is free (UNESCO, 2003a). The government provides teachers, infrastructure, learning materials, boarding (if needed), co-curricular activities, and meals. The only cost to parents is that of the meal preparation at the school.

Student learning is assessed a number of times during the course of primary education (RNPE, 1994). The first assessment occurs at the end of Standard IV and monitors numeracy and literary skills. Literary skills are assessed for both Setswana and English. After Standard IV the language of instruction changes to English, which is the official language of Botswana; therefore, this first assessment is strategically located in the educational experience. The other major assessment is the Primary School Leaving Examination which is given at the end of Standard VII.

Educational Policies

Constitution and Laws of Botswana (1965)

The *Constitution of Botswana* (1965) does not address education or the right to education. There is a mention of education in regard to religious communities which entitles a religious community to provide education to their children on the condition that they assume all of the costs (Constitution, 1965). However in the Laws of Botswana there is an *Education Act* (1967) that was implemented. This Act lays out the roles and responsibilities of various levels of administration, the registration and running of schools, fees, curriculum, and other regulations. The section concerning curriculum is short, only indicating that the Minister must approve the curriculum that is taught at the schools. It does not specify what that curriculum must be, nor does it indicate that the curriculum must be consistent across all schools. This has the benefit of ensuring that the curriculum is relevant to the local region. On the other hand, it does not ensure that the students across Botswana receive the same quality or type of education.

National Policy on Education (1977)

The *National Policy on Education* (NPE) was developed in 1977 with the purpose of providing a framework for the planning and provision of education in Botswana (UNESCO, 2003a). This policy signified a change in attitude from colonial days wherein education was considered the privilege of only a select number of children. The principles underlying the NPE were democracy, development, self-reliance, unity and *Kagisano*, or the philosophy of social harmony. The purpose of education was to assist in the building of a productive, democratic society.

The primary goals of the NPE were to increase access to education, in particular primary education, for all Batswana; develop an educated populace to meet the demands of society; and increase the budgetary allotment to primary education (UNESCO, 2003a). Recommendations included a nine year course of basic education available to all students by the year 1990; the development of teachers; an increased emphasis on part-time learning, out-of-school education and learning while working; and the elimination of some of the major inconsistencies in the educational system. The NPE also instituted the policy of free primary education. Free primary education enabled Botswana to come close to attaining universal access to education.

From the outset of the NPE to the year 2003, enrolment in primary education increased by 91% (RNPE, 1994). Despite this increased enrolment the level of academic achievement has decreased, which is not uncommon for a vast and speedy expansion, though it is problematic for the educational system over time. The decrease in

achievement may also have been exacerbated by the government's decision to introduce a national service scheme wherein educated individuals were appointed to teach, with little training, to meet the demand for teachers. Other problems that have resulted from the NPE include the inadequate coordination of between the Ministry of Local Government, Lands and Housing and the Ministry of Education, which are jointly responsible for the provision of primary education; insufficient resource provision and allocation; and the lack of policies to attenuate the problems associated with large class sizes, double shifts and automatic promotion.

Although alterations in policy have been made over time to meet some of the limitations faced by the educational system, the government was concerned that the economic reality of Botswana had changed. The change in economy meant that the educational system no longer met the needs of the country (RNPE, 1994; UNESCO, 2003a). Consequently, the government appointed the National Commission on Education in 1992 to revise the NPE (RNPE, 1994). The National Commission held a series of national consultations, institutional visits, a review of research and policy studies, and external study tours. Key stakeholders, such as educators, the private sector, enterprises, and the general public, were invited to participate in consultations either through oral or written presentations (RNPE, 1994; UNESCO, 2003a). The information gathered at these meetings was further discussed, at times with specialists, in subcommittee or plenary meetings in which recommendations were drawn up and presented as the Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE) in 1994. It is this policy that is the primary focus of this project.

Revised National Policy on Education (1994)

The *Revised National Policy on Education* (RNPE) set out new goals for Botswana wherein education is to prepare the populace for the transition from an agro-based culture to an industrialized economy (RNPE, 1994). It is also with this policy that education became a fundamental human right in Botswana. Interestingly, while the goal of education has shifted to focusing on the economy, the purposes of developing moral and social values, cultural identity, self-esteem, good citizenship and desirable work ethics remained intact.

The objectives of this policy are divided into two areas: national and local or school level (RNPE, 1994). The national objectives are broad and include raising educational standards, emphasizing science and technology in the classroom, making education more accessible to all people, improving partnerships between the schools and communities, improving the examination system, and increasing the efficiency of the school system. At the local level the goals are to improve school administration such that higher learning is achieved, improve the quality of instruction, implement a broader and balanced curriculum in order to prepare students adequately to enter the workplace, emphasize pre-vocational studies to strengthen post-school vocational and technical studies, and improve the response of schools for ethnic minority students.

The actions for the RNPE (1994) are broken into short, medium, and long-term plans. In the short-term the structure of education is altered such that junior secondary school changed from two years in length to three years. This change provides an extra

year for children to prepare for learning at a junior secondary level. With the concerns surrounding the quality of education, adding a year to the course of primary education provides the teachers with an opportunity to solidify the skills that children have either not yet acquired or need to improve. The medium-term goal pertaining to primary education involves the training of teachers. The goal is to elevate all teachers to diploma level training and to provide additional supports to teachers who are entering the field through mentorship. In the long-term, the goals include legislation to make education compulsory, initiating the automatic progression of children who are gifted and reducing the primary course of education to six years from the current seven years. A final goal involves incrementally reducing the class size from 45 students to 30 students over the course of the RNPE.

Gil (1973) encourages the policy analyst to investigate the stage of development of the country that is developing the policy. Botswana is a country that is considered middle-income. This implies that they are in transition from a developing to a developed country (Government Botswana, 2002). They have had a solid economy and strong social policies and laws since the time of their independence (CIA, 2007a). Within this stage of development the original policies surrounding education, which were developed in 1977, valued universal primary education and the equality of gender and regional location (UNESCO, 2003a). Botswana's current stage of development was a major factor in the revision of the educational policy. The RNPE continues to uphold these values despite their transition. While the RNPE continues to uphold the former values the transition in developmental stage has resulted in the introduction of new values.

Using Gil's framework (1973) of analysis for policy, examining the changes to resources, goods and services shows that there are a number of changes to resources. Quantitatively, changes include the addition of school buildings and teacher's accommodations, particularly in rural areas (RNPE, 1994). The focus on rural areas will serve to increase the ability of children in these regions to achieve the full course of primary education as they will have adequate access to teachers and schools that are close enough to encourage their attendance.

The policy also has a number of resource modifications such as those concerning the curriculum. Curriculum policies lay out a number of changes for integrating new subjects including the following: developing courses in arts, crafts, home economics, music and physical education; providing training in Setswana; focusing on science and technology; and ensuring that there is continuity between the curriculum of primary education and junior secondary education. The policies surrounding curriculum contribute to the national goals of moral and social values, cultural identity, self-esteem, and good citizenship in the efforts to sustain traditional values through the courses that are developed. The focus on science and technology enables the goal of preparing for an industrialized economy to be realized. Finally, the policy of developing continuity between primary and junior secondary levels leads to an improved quality of education, another goal of the national government.

Status allocations are few but specific at this stage of development. The status of special needs children is raised with the policies of the RNPE (1994). Special schools and

curricula are to be developed to ensure that these children receive a complete education. At the same time, the policy indicates a goal of integrating special needs students, as much as possible, with their peers through attendance in non-specialized schools. This not only raises their status but serves to reduce stigma and reinforces the national goal of social harmony and good citizenship. There is also a shift in status for ethnic populations in Botswana as the policy specifies that the differences between ethnic groups be respected in the educational system through the training of teachers. Finally out-of-school youth and adults are also addressed. This goal pertains to primary education in that youth and adults should be able to acquire the skills and knowledge provided in primary educational settings through alternative programs. Ultimately this will raise their status through increased abilities and subsequent productivity. These policies will serve to make future society more inclusive and increase the strength of the economy through fortifying the work force.

The status of the role of the Ministry and other educational officials is clarified and thus perpetuated along with the status of teachers. One of the concerns of education in Botswana at the time of the revision was that the role of teachers is somehow inferior to other professions. The policies around improving teacher training, both in-service and diploma programs, to raise qualifications; providing suitable accommodations; fostering recognition of teachers; and increasing their wages are aimed at rectifying this perception and improving the status of teachers.

Another policy in the RNPE (1994) that has an impact on status allocation concerns the progression of students through the educational system. Prior to the RNPE the policy was to not allow any student to repeat a grade until after the Standard IV assessment. The RNPE policy changes that practice to one where progression is continuously assessed. It also institutes a policy that allows for children who are gifted to progress faster through the educational system, with the permission of their parents. These policies raise the status of children through acknowledging that their learning is important and must be individualized. The goal of raising the quality of learning is also supported by this policy in the sense that children will progress through the system at the rate best suited to their learning. Learning at a rate that is appropriate to the abilities and skills of the student may contribute to lowering the dropout rate as students experience higher levels of achievement.

An interesting policy in regard to private schools is that English language private schools receive no funding from the government while Setswana language private schools may receive funding from the government (RNPE, 1994). There is a status allocation in this policy that places an importance on retaining the Batswana culture and traditions; however, this policy may be in contrast to the policy encouraging ethnic diversity. Setswana language schools are arguably for the majority children whereas English language schools would be for all majority and minority children. The fact that only the Setswana language schools are eligible for government funding, while respectful of the culture, could be divisive.

Similar to status allocations there are few changes in entitlement with this revision. The primary change is the recognition of education as a fundamental human right (RNPE, 1994). This is a significant alteration that impacts both the importance of education for Batswana and supports the policies for equality of special needs children, out-of-school citizens, and ethnic minorities. There are some additional modifications in entitlements as indicated by the policies about the distribution of teaching materials. This policy is aimed at equalizing the existing differences between rural and urban areas. Another entitlement that is offered in the policy supports equality in that the age of entry is flexible. This policy means that children who have not accessed education for any number of reasons can return at any time. These policies support the national goal of universal access.

The consequences of the RNPE are to be examined along the eight areas outlined in Gil's framework (1973). Ecologically these policies may have an effect on housing, particularly in rural areas as the government intends to construct accommodations for teachers as well as schools. As schools become more locally situated the reasons to migrate are reduced, this is particular salient as compulsive enrolment legislation is in the near future.

Demographically the impacts of the RNPE include government attempts to encourage teachers to live and work in rural areas. The redistribution of teachers to rural areas will change demographics as the population will be slightly more diversified with increased numbers of professionals living in rural areas. Also the building of schools in

rural areas will both contribute to, and potentially reduce, demographic changes. Similar to ecological changes, with the onset of compulsive enrolment legislation, local schools will enable children to remain close to home.

There are multiple social impacts in the RNPE (1994). The inclusion of special needs children in the educational system will change their ability to participate in society, the economy and democracy. As this group of children gain skills and knowledge they will be able to contribute as members of society. Furthermore, there is a decrease in social alienation as some of the children with special needs will be able to contribute in a meaningful way in society. Likewise, supporting out-of-school youth to gain literary and other skills will decrease social deviance as they can engage in gainful employment as opposed to other alternatives (UNESCO, 2003a). Finally, the RNPE (1994) contains many policies that refer to improving the quality of education. As the quality increases so do the skills and abilities of students along with opportunities to find meaningful and beneficial employment. This in turn increases the likelihood of positive social participation.

One of the primary goals of the RNPE (1994) is to support the transition that is occurring economically in Botswana. As a result there are many economic impacts with the RNPE. In regard to the curriculum, the policy encouraging the inclusion of science and technology classes in primary education sets the stage for both further education and a highly skilled populace that can carry out many different types of skilled labour. A similar policy concerns the preparation of students for vocational and technological

training opportunities following a full or partial course of primary education. Both of these policies contribute to a well prepared education work force. Other economic benefits of this policy are obvious and multiple. The construction of schools and teacher's accommodations provides present employment and the economic benefits that come with construction and increased employment levels. Likewise, strengthening the curriculum and an increased emphasis on developing new curriculum provide an additional group of people with increased work opportunities. All of these outcomes contribute to positive economic growth and social participation.

Politically many of these policies encourage increased democratic involvement as literacy rates are maximized and young people are taught to be critical members of society. Citizen participation will also increase through such avenues as community support groups for schools and Parent Teacher Associations.

Finally, these policies, for example the emphasis placed on teaching Setswana, features the traditions and cultures of the Batswana. The curriculum changes that are called for are bold and respectful of the Batswana past. Some of these changes include courses in arts and crafts, music, and physical education (wherein students can learn local games while staying healthy). These policies together uphold the goal of developing moral and social values, cultural identity, and self-esteem.

There are a number of other policies which also must be considered in the analysis of the RNPE to determine the full impact of these policies. The policies that will be examined are: the *Botswana National Policy on HIV/AIDS* (1998), the *National Policy*

for Non-Governmental Organizations (2001), *A Long Term Vision for Botswana: Towards Prosperity for All* (1998), and the ninth *National Development Plan* (Government Botswana, 2002).

Policies Concerning the Effect of HIV/AIDS

Botswana National Policy on HIV/AIDS (1998)

The *Botswana National Policy on HIV/AIDS* (1998) is a revision of an earlier policy by the same name. Botswana quickly recognized the potential impact of HIV/AIDS when it experienced an explosion of infections in 1985, five years immediately following the identification of the first case of HIV. The first national policy on HIV/AIDS was developed in 1993 to deal with the immediate effects of the epidemic and plan for the potential long term effects which could be devastating. The goal of this national policy is to provide a multi-sectoral response to the epidemic; a guide for all ministries and groups, including international organisations, in all prevention and care actions; a mechanism for the allocation and mobilization of resources, monitoring HIV/AIDS prevention and care; and a basis for the National Strategic Plan. The principles guiding this policy include a respect for human rights, privacy and self-determination among others.

As a multi-sectoral response this policy has an impact on education, particularly the preventative programs administered by schools. All ministries, education included, are required to develop prevention activities (Botswana National, 1998). In the

educational system these may include activities and information for both students and teachers.

One of the goals of the preventative education is to change the social and sexual norms, values, and behaviours of all Batswana (Botswana National, 1998). The policy becomes even more specific as it articulates that the efficient spread of condoms and promotion of gender equality are two particular areas of social and sexual norms that the nation wants to address. In regard to the educational system this provides some distinct guidelines about the information to be included in prevention curricula concerning HIV/AIDS and potentially, with respect to gender equality, many other subjects.

There are also concerns articulated about illness-related absences and premature death and the impact that this has on productivity which, in the educational system, translates to the availability of teachers and the quality of teaching (Botswana National, 1998). Illness-related absences for teachers manifest in two ways; illness experienced by the teacher which requires time off and absence to provide care-taking duties to affected family members. Similarly, the quality of teaching can be affected in two ways; inconsistencies in instruction due to teacher absenteeism and the possibility of poorly or untrained teachers being recruited to meet the teaching demand due to teacher attrition.

The policy also outlines some specific points about the role of the Ministry of Education (Botswana National, 1998). These include the integration of AIDS and sexually transmitted disease information at all levels of education, the involvement of parents in HIV/AIDS education through the Parent-Teacher Advisory councils, and

ensuring that other services regarding HIV/AIDS are available to students and, potentially, their families. The one thing that is unclear with these specifications is in regards to parental involvement, it is not indicated whether that refers to the development of curriculum or additional activities provided by the school.

The other ministry involved with primary education is the Ministry of Local Government, Lands, and Housing. The specific instructions to this ministry may also have an impact on the educational system in that this ministry is responsible to ensure that families that provide for orphans are suitably supported, the needs of AIDS orphans are met and that specific target groups have available HIV prevention programs. This requires that this ministry be involved in schools to ensure that the needs of AIDS orphans are met as well as ensuring that groups such as out-of-school youth are receiving preventative information.

Other Policies Affecting Education

National Policy for Non-Governmental Organisations (2001)

This particular policy on NGOs is quite interesting. NGOs in Botswana have traditionally been reliant on donor funding (National Policy for NGOs, 2001). Recently, funding was reduced when major funders exited Botswana or reduced their support. This has created the potential for a conflict of interest between the donors and the nation as requirements for funding become increasingly specific to the desires of the donor. These desires may or may not be in line with those of Botswana. The policy was developed to ensure that NGOs participate in the national development plans set out by Botswana,

thereby alleviating the potential for a discrepancy of goals and purposes. It is also intended to make certain that NGO activities are in line with national objectives of democracy, social justice, good governance, and political wisdom, as well as the objectives of the Ministry with which they are involved.

The impact on education becomes evident in the knowledge that religious groups are considered NGOs by this policy (National Policy on NGOs, 2001). Many religious groups provide private institutions of education. This policy therefore interacts with educational policies that welcome religious schools but do not provide any guidelines as to whether or not they must adhere to national curricula or follow national norms for education. While this policy does not indicate that they must follow national curricula it does indicate that the curricula must adhere to national goals and objectives as well as those held by the Ministries with which they are involved.

In addition, this policy would ensure that any groups involved with HIV/AIDS prevention efforts that wish to work with schools would be required to provide programs that are consistent with national objectives of both the Ministry of Education and the National Policy on HIV/AIDS.

A Long Term Vision for Botswana: Towards Prosperity for All (1998)

This document, also referred to as “Vision 2016”, is not a policy in and of itself; it does however guide many of the national policies and programs that are developed. The document was created after a year of consultations with civil society to determine the long term vision held by Botswana for their country and their progress. Interestingly the

results of these consultations were very similar to the Millennium Development Goals that were articulated by the UN two years later. It is not surprising then to find that education holds a key role in the Vision 2016 document.

In all, there are seven pillars of the national vision, education is the first. This is how Vision 2016 impacts educational policies (Vision, 1998). The education pillar of Vision 2016 lays out numerous desired outcomes ranging from social to economic goals. Primarily, education is desirable because it empowers citizens to make reasoned choices for their future in multiple areas of their lives. It is hoped that education will create an innovative, entrepreneurial, productive society that is acutely aware of multiple life skills. There is also an impetus towards continued education, whether it be technical, vocational, or academic, to be carried out in partnership with both public and private sectors. Finally, education is considered a place where different languages and cultures can be recognized, supported, and strengthened.

It is not expected that all of these goals will be carried out only within the confines of the formal educational system (Vision, 1998). However, the pillar regarding education has unmistakable impacts on the educational system. It highlights the fact that universal primary education is almost attained in Botswana in the sense that it no longer focuses solely on primary education rather it has expanded its purview to include continuing educational opportunities. That said, it also does not diminish the importance of primary education. Vision 2016 continues to apply pressure to the government to build local schools and improve the quality of instruction and the curriculum so that the

possibility of meaningful continuing education can be achieved. Life skills education also plays a critical role in the primary educational system as that is the time that students are most apt to attend educational facilities. Furthermore, acceptance and tolerance are skills best imparted at the primary level then continually reinforced throughout further levels of education.

National Development Plan 9 (2002)

Similar to Vision 2016, the ninth *National Development Plan* (NDP) (Government Botswana, 2002) is a strategic plan for the country's development over a 6 year period from 2003 to 2009. As such it does not create new policies; rather it indicates how the various policies will be carried out in the time period covered by the plan. The overall principles of the NDP are those of the nation: rapid economic growth; attaining social justice, economic independence, and sustained development; and *Botho* or the state of being "human, courteous and highly disciplined" (Government Botswana, 2002, p. xxvii). In relation to education the NDP goals are to provide quality education.

The NDP follows the policies set out by the RNPE (1994), though it qualifies the policies on which the focus is to be placed (Government Botswana, 2002). This emphasis does not preclude all of the educational policies set forth by the RNPE; rather it highlights the policies deemed to be important at this particular juncture of national development. The focus then of the ninth NDP pertaining to primary education is on lifelong learning, provision of education to special needs children, attenuating the impact

of HIV/AIDS, and ensuring the quality of education in all educational facilities – public and private.

These foci will secure the continued improvement of quality of primary education. To ensure lifelong learning, the nation must make certain that primary education adequately prepares students for further education, whether that be vocational or academic routes. Additionally providing lifelong learning means that curricula suitable for out-of-school citizens to acquire basic skills in math and literacy will be developed. In the area of special needs education, access is the primary concern for this development plan. Though there is also a stated need for appropriate resources to be available which would increase the quality of education to this population.

Attenuating the impact of HIV/AIDS has multiple consequences on the educational system. In terms of quality, this focus supports multiple policies influencing education in regards to the development of curriculum about HIV and AIDS. The NDP serves to shift the focus of curriculum from awareness to behavioural change and prevention. Some of the other effects on education include the creation of workplace support programs for teachers and staff, collaboration with other agencies providing HIV/AIDS prevention efforts, and developing a monitoring system to track the impact of HIV/AIDS specifically on the educational system. This final strategy will hopefully allow the nation to track trends in the educational system and make projections that will enable proactive policies and strategies to be developed in regards to the effect of HIV/AIDS.

Finally, the quality of education will become more uniform as private schools are monitored to ensure they follow the guidelines for achievement set out by the Ministry of Education. The NDP also specifies the actions that will be taken if private schools are not meeting the standards articulated for primary educational achievement.

Examining the educational policy of Botswana and other policies that interact with it through Gil's framework (1973) shows a comprehensive plan to achieve quality education.

Evaluating the Policies of Malawi

History of the Nation

Malawi is a small country in the south of Africa that gained independence from Britain in 1964 (CIA, 2007b). After 30 years of being a one party state, Malawians were able to hold multiparty elections. In 1994, the first year in power, the newly elected democratic government put forth a strategy to fight poverty. Malawi faces a number of challenges in its efforts to deal with poverty. They have had repeated financial crises resulting from drought in the late 1980s and early 1990s, compounded by smaller droughts since that time. Consequently their food security has been threatened (CIA, 2007b; National Policy, 2003). They also lost foreign aid in the early 1990s which reduced their capacity to support their economy (CIA, 2007b).

As a result, Malawi is a country that has very high poverty levels; 65% of the rural population and 55% of the urban population live in poverty (National HIV/AIDS, 2003). Poverty is compounded by high rates of HIV/AIDS in Malawi. While it is estimated that only approximately 3% of people know their HIV status, adult prevalence of HIV/AIDS is estimated to be between 11.3% and 17.7% (WHO, 2005b). As of December 2005, 28,000 people were receiving ART, though 169,000 are thought to need such interventions.

A further impact of HIV/AIDS is the number of children who are orphaned or made vulnerable as a result of the pandemic. In Malawi the cumulative number of children in this position is approximately 550,000 (WHO, 2005b). Gender and age analyses of HIV/AIDS cases indicate that there is an uneven distribution wherein young women show the highest rates of infection. This distribution is thought to reflect the inequality of women and children in society. Urban areas show much higher rates of infection (25%) than do rural areas (13%).

Educational System

The educational system in Malawi is arranged such that children enter the primary system at the age of 6 and a full course of primary school spans 8 years culminating with the Primary School Leaving Certificate Exam (UNESCO, 2003b). Since 1994 primary education has been free. While the constitution of Malawi states that primary education is to be compulsory, this provision has not yet been instituted (Constitution, 1994). To improve the enrolment and attendance rates of children, particularly rural children, the government changed the school year to correspond with agricultural needs (UNESCO, 2003b). In order to improve rates of retention, the language of instruction in Standards I-IV is the vernacular language of the region and starting in Standard V the language of instruction is the official language, Chichewa, or English. Finally, the subject of religion was also expanded from Christianity to include Islam and traditional African religions in order to encourage parents from other belief systems to send their children.

Educational Policies

The Constitution (1994)

In 1994 the new *Constitution of the Republic of Malawi* was enacted and it identified education in a couple of areas. Foremost, education was identified as a fundamental principle of the Constitution (Constitution, 1994). The goals of education were acknowledged by the government as eliminating illiteracy, making primary education free and compulsory to all citizens, offering greater access to higher learning and continuing education, promoting the national goals of unity, and eliminating political, religious, racial, and ethnic intolerance. Furthermore, education was upheld in the constitution as a human right such that all citizens are entitled to education of at least five years in either public or private schools provided that private schools meet official standards.

Policy and Investment Framework (1994)

In the same year, the *Policy and Investment Framework* (PIF) (1994) was created to provide a comprehensive plan of education for the country. PIF was developed in collaboration with the national government, local communities, NGOs, the private sector and the donor community, all recognized partners in education provision. The national government provided the overarching direction and purpose for the framework. Essentially PIF is a series of policies that are required for the full education of the citizens in Malawi for the next ten years.

One of the most important policies of PIF was the one concerning free primary education (PIF, 1994). The goal of that policy was simple; all children aged six or older would receive a full course of primary education without having to pay tuition fees. The resulting effect was positive as enrolment increased from 2 million to 3 million children (PIF, 2000). A study of primary education in Malawi indicates that 81% of children attend primary school, with males and females attending equally (Malawi DHS, 2002). The overall impression from these statistics is that changes are occurring in society such that education is beginning to be seen as important and necessary.

All the same, providing free primary education came at a cost to Malawi. The increase in enrolment necessitated the hiring of new teachers, an excess of which did not exist in Malawi. So individuals were hired by the government to become teachers and received 3 days training prior to starting their careers (UNESCO, 2003b). Schools were overcrowded, teacher student ratios were high (1:85), education was poorly delivered and materials were scarce (e. g. textbook ratios were 1:4) (PIF, 1994).

However there are regional differences in attendance with the north showing higher rates of attendance than the south (Malawi DHS, 2002). Also 40% of children who are enrolled in education are over the official start age of six years. While it is positive to see children return to school despite the age difference, older children are more likely to dropout. The dropout rates are in fact high, but it is the timing of dropout that is particularly striking. Of students who have dropped out of school, 60% left in the first or second year of school, making the average age of leaving school 9 years old. Some of the

reasons given for children dropping out of school included a lack of interest, the need of labour within the household, and the cost of schooling.

Other policies concerning primary education in PIF deal with issues of access, equity, quality and internal efficiency or the retention and repetition of students (PIF, 1994). The PIF is considered a living document by the Malawian government and is constantly being revised and built upon as needs change. This is evidenced by the new policies and practices that were put into place ad hoc to deal with the challenges provided by the FPE (PIF, 1994; 2000). The latest revision of PIF occurred in 2000 and is the focus of this analysis.

Policy and Investment Framework (2000)

The consultation for the changes in PIF occurred throughout 1999 with the multiple partners involved in the provision of education, including religious organisations (PIF, 2000). Overall the changes in the revised PIF include an expansion of the original goals and principles of education in Malawi. Many of the changes in the policies concerning primary education are much more comprehensive and specific and are in response to the aforementioned problems stemming from the policy of FPE. However, the original goals of PIF, to sustain a well-planned strategy of education and to use education as a means of alleviating poverty, remain unchanged.

The guiding principles of this revision are consistent with the Constitution and the original PIF in regard to the desire to increase the accessibility to education and ensure that currently existing inequalities in educational provision are not made worse (both

social and regional inequalities) (PIF, 2000). However, the revised PIF broadens the principles to include an improvement of educational quality and relevance, the provision of institutional and financial frameworks, and the creation of partnerships with communities and the private sector to support schools. The underlying purpose of the educational system also appears to have changed in this version of PIF to a desire to have an educated populace who can exploit the natural resources of the country, be more involved in democratic society, be aware of their cultural heritage, further develop their culture and participate in the African and global communities.

The purpose of primary education, now referred to as basic education, is seen specifically to provide basic knowledge and skills that allow citizens to participate fully in society (PIF, 2000). This purpose specifically addresses the concern of poverty alleviation. The new primary educational policies are broken down into the previous areas of access, equity, quality, management, and finance; in addition to two new areas of relevance and planning. The target of this particular group of policies has not changed and still involves children who are of the age to begin a course of primary education (six years old) and those who are of the age to attend primary education but for various reasons have not yet enrolled.

This particular version of the PIF (2000) lays out a plan for the next twelve years wherein the key changes for primary education include an expanded definition of basic education, the decentralization of responsibility for the provision of education, an increase in funding within the national budget, changes in advocacy and structure to

ensure lower dropout and repetition, the establishment of minimum learning requirements and their assessment, and the inclusion and support of children with special needs. Basic education was expanded to include pre-school, adult education, literacy, and health and nutrition.

Each of these changes results in short-term and long-term effects. For example, expanding the definition of basic education has short term effects such as a positive educational environment where families can leave their youngest children so that they are able to work thereby contributing to the national economy without having to withdraw older children from school to fulfill child minding roles. At the same time the youngest children are given the opportunity to gain a solid base from which to enter a course of primary education. The provision for health and nutrition allows for a range of activities from providing preventative health information about diseases such as tuberculosis or HIV/AIDS to providing lunch or breakfast programs ensuring the children receive at least one full meal a day. This same policy allows for adults who were not able to attain literacy or further their education for whatever reasons to gain or improve their skills making them more efficient.

This policy upholds many of the guiding principles of education set out as important by the government of Malawi (PIF, 2000). It also works cooperatively with many of the other changes in policy. For example, decentralization enables communities to tailor education to meet their needs such that rural areas are able to provide different educational information than urban areas as is required by the needs of the region.

However, the policy of minimum learning requirements ensures that all citizens gain the same basic education which means that in the long term, citizen equity and mobility are protected.

Gil's framework (1973) requires that an analyst pay attention to the implications of the policy in terms of changes and the consequences of these changes. Specifically, he encourages analysts to investigate changes to resources, goods and services, allocations to individuals, the distribution of rights in society, and the consequences of the policies. An examination of the most recent version of PIF provides some interesting perspectives.

In regard to the changes in resources, goods and services, the policy changes concerning basic education are numerous. The primary change is a modification to current services. This modification includes the expansion of service to pre-primary aged children, children with special needs, and adult education and literacy. There is also a specific focus on AIDS orphans and out-of-school youth. Another area of service modification is referred to as a 'double shift' wherein the physical structures are used in shifts to expand access to education. The policy also sets out to increase the number of qualified teachers as well as increasing the ability of existing teachers. In addition, there is a commitment to providing adequate resources for teachers and students, with a number of policies referring to increasing the number of textbooks and teaching materials, providing more funding to purchase materials, and developing appropriate curricula. A new policy also encourages the creation of two skill-focused subjects that are

oriented towards the local community needs by allowing the community to develop the new courses.

Another major group of policies concerns management provision. The Malawi government has made a commitment to decentralization (PIF, 2000). This results in a change in the type of services, from national to local governmental management wherein local communities take an increased role in curriculum development, teacher recruitment, and the management of schools. These policies will fundamentally alter how education is provided in various regions across the country. It is hoped that this will increase the relevance of education in each region as well as increase community involvement. This group of policies indicates that the government will provide guidelines as to how the community is to be involved however, this is very unclear.

Community involvement in education is very interesting in that it may result in very positive outcomes. For example, increased local applicability of schooling may encourage families to send their children to school as it will be viewed as relevant and useful. This localization of education may also increase the skills and abilities needed to create productive citizens thereby creating a strong economy overall. However, if the overarching goal of education is to create national unity and eliminate political, religious, racial, and ethnic intolerance then regionalizing education through decentralization may be counterproductive. Decentralized education has been shown to increase intolerance in certain situations where the population is segregated by ethnicity and/or religion (Geo-Jaja, 2004).

Status allocation is another area of interest when analyzing policies. The educational policies put forth in the revised PIF (2000) have one or two important changes in status. Primarily the expectation that children are to attend school has the impact of raising the status of children. There are a number of policies in PIF that indicate that the reasons why children are not enrolled or are chronically absent will be investigated by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology and solutions will be developed to ensure that children are enrolled and able to attend school in a consistent manner. In addition, female children and orphans, particularly AIDS orphans, are populations that receive special attention in this group of policies. The impact this can have on status is enormous. For example, it ensures that female children receive equal educational opportunities resulting in women that are educated and able to participate in society as full citizens. This can have a long term change by ultimately raising the status of women. Including AIDS orphans as a special population is a new status allocation in the sense that these children will receive formal programs and incentives to attend school. Another policy raising the status of children is the recognition of the needs of these special populations in that every five years the needs of various groups of children will be evaluated in order to ensure that the educational system is meeting their needs.

Policies affect the rights of individuals in society, sometimes increasing rights, at other times limiting them. The revised PIF (2000) involves some changes in the entitlements given to students in Malawi. Specifically, entitlements to education are entrenched for female children, orphans (specifically AIDS orphans), children with special needs and out-of-school youth. These are groups of children that are often

excluded from entitlements. These changes in entitlements, along with changes in status, will have many positive long term consequences for these groups of children.

Examining the overall ratio between the level of rights and entitlements indicates that these policies change the ratio in favour of entitlements ensuring that society, at least in terms of the provision of education, is more equitable. These rights and entitlements are provided directly to all citizens rather than as rights equivalents that can be exchanged. This has the effect of guaranteeing that education is provided in a consistent manner to all special populations who are entitled to receive these rights.

The consequences of these policies are far-reaching in the long term but there are also some salient short term consequences as well. Gil (1973) encourages the evaluation of consequences to take into consider eight different areas: ecological, demographic, biologic, psychological, social, economic, political, and cultural. These areas are not mutually exclusive however the following discussion will deal with each of the areas in turn, noting the multiple areas of consequence when necessary.

Ecologically, there are few direct impacts of this policy in either the short or the long term, there is a possibility that the construction of schools may contribute to settlement patterns by providing increased services in a community such that the subsequent patterns of settlement may have ecological impacts. Similarly, another effect of the policies in terms of demographic consequences may be reduced in-country migration as locally situated schools and locally relevant education may decrease the likelihood that families or family members need to leave the region to find employment.

A long term demographic effect suggests that birth rates decrease with increased education (WHO, 2005b).

Other closely related effects are biologic in nature and concern, in the short term, there is a potential decrease in morbidity. This comes in response to the policies concerning the provision of health information, the increase in sanitation measures, and encouragement of healthy diets (PIF, 2000). In the longer term there is a possibility of both decreased infant mortality and general mortality rates due to the policy to increase preventative health information (WHO, 2005b).

There are multiple potential consequences socially. Long term results include increased societal and citizen participation due to policies ensuring increased access to education for females, individuals with special needs, orphans, and out-of-school youth (PIF, 2000). Similar short term results exist for adults who enrich their education and gain literacy. Another result that has potential benefits in both the short and long term is the ability of out-of-school youth to acquire basic skills which will enable them to procure meaningful employment thereby decreasing social deviance.

Likewise there are multiple economic benefits to these policies. In the short term there is an increase of goods and services needed for the construction of new schools, for curriculum development, and for lower student - teacher ratios (e. g. more teachers). In the long term there could be an increase in employment opportunities and the provision of a competent work force through policies such as: the localized development of curriculum, the focus on out-of-school youth and adult literacy, and the creation of

guidelines to monitor educational outcomes ensuring increased quality. Each of these policies serves to increase employability, entrepreneurship and possibly production.

Political consequences echo social consequences in the sense that there will be an increase in citizen participation which ultimately serves the goal of the Malawian government to increase citizen involvement in democracy. Also targeting special groups such as AIDS orphans, out-of-school youth and female children increases the chances that these groups will be active, contributing citizens in society. Similarly cultural consequences include the possibility of a more equitable society through the education of all groups in society. Another long term consequence is the increase in knowledge of heritage and culture and the possibility of promoting tolerance. However, as aforementioned, there is a concern that regionalization may increase tolerance by educating children about various ethnicities and religions or it may decrease tolerance by isolating various groups and creating rifts in the population based on regional differences. Overall the changes created by these policies appear to have a positive effect on society, culture, the economy and health.

The final area of investigation in Gil's framework (1973) is the interaction between the policy and the various forces surrounding the creation and implementation of the policy. In this case, the creation of the educational policies in Malawi is quite inclusive (PIF, 2000). In 1994, when the initial PIF was created, the government consulted with multiple partners. Twice during the development of PIF all of the key stakeholders were brought together to examine and comment on the draft (PIF, 1994).

This is in addition to each draft being distributed to all of the key stakeholders for their study and comments. Key stakeholders at that time included the government, local communities, NGOs, the private sector and the donor community. In 1999, the revision process of PIF started. The established key stakeholders were invited to participate in the revision process via consultations throughout the year; however, religious organisations were now explicitly recognized as educational providers and were included in the consultations (PIF, 2000). Further input was requested as various drafts were developed and distributed to the stakeholders for their feedback.

In regard to other social policies that interact with the educational policy there are three that are of particular interest. These are the *National Policy on Orphans and Other Vulnerable Children* (2003), the *National HIV/AIDS Policy* (2003), and the *Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper* (Malawi Government, 2002) that is required by the World Bank.

Policies Concerning the Effect of HIV/AIDS

National HIV/AIDS Policy (2003)

The *National HIV/AIDS Policy* (2003) has the overall goal of both preventing and mitigating the impact of the spread of AIDS by improving the provision and delivery of prevention, treatment, and care to people living with AIDS; reducing individual and societal vulnerabilities, and strengthening multi-sectoral and multi-disciplinary frameworks.

There are a number of policies that may interact or influence PIF. Most of these policies involve the provision of information and education concerning HIV and AIDS (National HIV/AIDS, 2003). Specifically, the *National HIV/AIDS Policy* sets out to reduce illiteracy in order to combat the disease. It can only be assumed that this will be done in collaboration with the educational policy however that is not made explicit. There are also a number of policies that deal with discrimination and stigmas related to HIV/AIDS status.

It is stated in the policy that no child should be denied education or health care due to their HIV status or to the fact that they have been orphaned as a result of AIDS (National HIV/AIDS, 2003). This policy states that all vulnerable children should have access to primary education; in particular child-headed households must be supported. In cases where vulnerable children cannot attend primary education for any variety of reasons they are to be provided with life skills education out of school. This is an interesting policy in alignment with PIF in the sense that out-of-school children are a target population. It is possible that these two policies can work together to encourage communities to develop alternative programs, possibly through the adult education avenue that will meet the needs of this specific population. Given that the *National HIV/AIDS Policy* states that 2% of all ministry and community budgets must be set aside for HIV/AIDS activities, some of the funds for developing some of these programs may be completely accessible. In addition, the donors that support orphans and vulnerable children may be encouraged to provide assistance for this particular group of children

such that educational, HIV/AIDS, and economic concerns are dealt with in an innovative and collaborative fashion.

One policy contained in the *National HIV/AIDS Policy* (2003) has a great impact on education and that is the provision of ART for those in the public service that are living with HIV. The impact on education of this policy is a reduction of the loss of teachers due to death. The resultant stability of the infrastructure is critical to moving other aspects of the educational policy forward.

Other policies contained in the *National HIV/AIDS Policy* (2003) concern education and are not specifically mentioned in PIF. These are policies that reflect the vulnerability of children, particularly female children, in the educational system. This policy lays out expectations that the schools and communities protect the safety of children from exploitation and abuse by peers and employees in the educational system. Because a climate of fear is not conducive to the achievement of universal primary education it is imperative that a female friendly, non-exploitive learning environment exists. This will not only encourage enrolment but will also discourage dropouts. Interestingly this issue is not addressed in PIF, with the possible exception of a section of PIF's primary educational policies that indicate that human rights are to be upheld.

Finally, the *National HIV/AIDS Policy* sets out guidelines that promote the use of youth friendly information about HIV, AIDS, prevention, and other sexual and reproductive health issues. The effect of this policy is to ensure that students remain

healthy and alive not only long enough to learn but to also become productive members of society. This is in line with PIF in regards to curricula development guidelines.

National Policy on Orphans and Other Vulnerable Children (2003)

The *National Policy on Orphans and Other Vulnerable Children* (2003) was written with the goal of facilitating support for the care of orphaned and vulnerable children. As such, it was written to complement existing policies that deal with children. The principles underlying this policy echo many of the sentiments in PIF, particularly in the case of the community being responsible for providing for the needs of orphaned and vulnerable children. This particular policy states that the family is the first line of care but that the community provides the structure for support. For example the first set of policies address the provision of assistance stating that the community is to enhance the teaching of basic and technical life skills. This is in line with PIF in that the community is encouraged to assist in the development of local curricula.

Another area for which this policy is responsible is the coordination of services supporting these children. It has been observed that due to the problem of HIV/AIDS some children have received duplicated services while other children receive none because there are multiple organisations providing service with little monitoring. Some of the responsibilities of this policy are to coordinate the efforts of all groups: extended families, communities, foster care, child sponsorship, and institutional care. This influences PIF in that they provide services to orphaned and vulnerable children, a targeted population that receives special programs when needed. The Ministry of

Education, Sports and Culture will need to work in accordance with the Ministry of Gender and Community Services to provide transparent and accountable service in this area as well as in monitoring and evaluating the services provided by NGOs and other external donors.

Other Policies Affecting Education

Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (2002)

The *Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper* (PRSP) (2002) is a document that outlines the development strategies of a country that is receiving debt relief from either the World Bank or the International Monetary Fund (IMF). This document is intended to be owned by the country, in other words, it is to be developed by the country's government in consultation with its civil society, specifically the poor (Cheru, 2006; World Bank Group, 2000). "The transformation [out of poverty] must enjoy broad support from the true experts on poverty: the poor themselves" (World Bank Group, 2000, p3). However poignant that sentiment is, the reality is much less idealistic. To truly involve the poor in such a massive task as developing the strategies of a country to fight poverty there is a basic assumption of literacy and good lines of community between the government and its people (Cheru, 2006).

Furthermore, the guidelines for creating PRSPs indicate that it is not solely the country and its citizens who develop the strategy (Cheru, 2006; World Bank Group, 2000). Various donor and multilateral organisations must be included in the process, to ensure that these organisations provide up-front commitments of support. However, how

'country owned' can the document be when the very groups that are providing essential money are involved in the creation of the strategy? Most development workers would question the imbalance of power posed by that situation. Moreover, all PRSPs are reviewed and advised by a Joint Staff Assessment (JSA), which is made up of World Bank and IMF staff, before being accepted. While the purpose of the JSA is to provide transparency again, one can question the power imbalance of the funder providing input on the final document that will determine whether or not funding is provided. Malawi does receive funding from the Heavily Indebted Poor Countries Initiative and has developed a PRSP. What follows is an investigation of how this document influences PIF.

The PRSP (Malawi Government, 2002) does not actually create any new policies. It does, however, highlight the objectives and strategies of the government in various areas. One of these areas is education. The educational objectives of the PRSP follow those of the revised PIF, which is not surprising given that PIF had been revised two years prior to the creation of the PRSP. What is interesting is that the focus is somewhat altered between the PIF and the PRSP, despite the fact that all of the areas are covered in both documents. The PRSP focuses on the teachers, training, and development of curricula to improve quality and mobilization campaigns and better use of physical structures to increase access. While all of these are mentioned in PIF there are many other measures and strategies used to ensure the provision of the best education possible. One noteworthy addition to the PRSP is the discussion around the effect of HIV/AIDS on teachers in Malawi. In the time between the creation of PIF and the creation of the PRSP

it became clear that the number of teachers lost due to AIDS was going to out-pace the rate at which new teachers could be trained. As such, the PRSP highlights the necessity and importance of the new policy (the *National HIV/AIDS Policy* discussed earlier) that was being developed to address the issues related to HIV/AIDS.

The focus on the concrete deliverables such as teacher training and facility construction may have more to do with the need for measurable outcomes than an actual change in philosophy (Malawi Government, 2002). As this is a document that guides donor and multilateral organisations, specific projects may be more desirable than general changes in ideology that may take many generations to fully realize. Nevertheless, there is still a concern that the PRSP simplifies the issue for international donor agencies to a point wherein the complexities of providing physical structures appears to be the most suitable solution. It is possible to read through the PRSP and choose a project that suits the current mood or interest of the organisation, fund that particular project in isolation and create an expectation that the ‘problem’ of vulnerable children or teachers or material provision will be ‘solved’. In this manner, the PRSP, while remaining true to the wishes of the country may be misleading.

Exploring What We Know

Comparisons and Contrasts

The countries

In many ways Botswana and Malawi are similar countries. They are both landlocked and have a relatively small land mass (CIA, 2007a; 2007b). Both former British protectorates, they gained their independence in the mid 1960s. Each is a democracy that has an elected National Assembly; however, Botswana is a parliamentary republic and Malawi is a multi-party democracy. As such, the president of Botswana is voted on by the National Assembly whereas the president of Malawi is directly elected by the people. Botswana is rich with resources and has tapped many of them to advance their economy (see Table 1). Likewise, Malawi has many natural resources, however most remain untapped.

An interesting similarity between these two countries is the distribution of age in their populations (CIA, 2007a; 2007b). This distribution can be understood to reflect the impact of the AIDS pandemic. Also reflecting this pandemic is life expectancy. These figures are very similar, however, Botswana's life expectancy has dropped by almost 25 years since the early 1990s (AVERT, 2007a).

There are also many differences between these two countries. Botswana, the larger land mass, has a smaller population than Malawi (CIA, 2007a; 2007b). One of the impacts of this size and population differential is that Malawi must sustain a much larger number of people with fewer resources. As discussed previously, repeated drought has left Malawi, a traditionally agricultural society, with a poor economy and high levels of poverty. Because of their poor economy and high debt, they are supported by various international agencies such as the International Monetary Fund (IMF), World Bank and various other donor agencies throughout the world as part of the Heavily Indebted Poor Countries Initiative (HICP) (Europa, 2006b). While the IMF and World Bank provide loans to support the country as a whole, other donor agencies tend to support specific projects, programs, or causes (Garrett, 2007; Sachs, 2005). One of the impacts of this support is that the policies of Malawi are heavily influenced by external forces.

Botswana on the other hand is a country that is self-sufficient; most of its Gross Domestic Product comes from the export of diamonds. They are classified as a middle-income country and as such do not qualify for development aid (Government Botswana, 2002). While they receive some development assistance, it is small in comparison to Malawi and almost exclusively in the form of grants and programs (Europa, 2006a; AVERT, 2007a). Unlike Malawi, this means that the development initiatives and policy analysis undertaken in Botswana are relatively free from external influences.

Governmentally, Botswana has had a political history of peace with democratic elections occurring since independence (Europa, 2006a). Interestingly, the original ruling

party has consistently been elected to power and has virtually no allegations of corruption against it. Botswana has shown a history of steady economic growth and a commitment to social policies. Malawi on the other hand has had a problematic political history with one party rule for 30 years that was fraught with corruption (Europa, 2006b). In 1994, a multiparty system was introduced and democratic elections have occurred. The people of Malawi have currently elected a president who is actively attempting to fight corruption.

Table 1: Socio-demographic Information

	Botswana	Malawi
Land mass ¹	581 730 sq km	118 484 sq km
Population ¹	1 769 000	13 603 181
Population distribution ²		
0-14 years	35.8%	46.1%
15-64 years	60.3%	51.2%
64 + years	3.9%	2.7%
Life Expectancy ³	40 years	42 years
GDP ² (US\$)	\$17.94 billion	\$8.04 million
GDP (per capita) ² (US\$)	\$10 900	\$600
Natural Resources ¹	Diamonds, Copper-nickel matte, Soda Ash, Coal, Gold, Colbalt, Salt	Limestone, Coal, Gemstones Untapped: Bauxite, Marble, Graphite, Uranium

1 - Europa, 2006a; 2006b 2 - CIA, 2007a; 2007b 3 - WHO, 2005a; 2005b

Education

In terms of primary education there are a number of similarities between Botswana and Malawi. Both countries have a course of primary education that is provided free to all children. Education is a priority for both countries, ostensibly to alleviate poverty, but also to guide their countries through an economic transition from an

agricultural to an industrialized economy (UNESCO, 2003a; 2003b). Each country has comprehensive plans for providing education that were developed in consultation with experts in education, ministry officials, teachers and civil society. In addition, both countries face similar challenges with infrastructure, and the availability of resources and teachers. There are also similar concerns surrounding high rates of dropout and repetition. Finally, the principles underlying the policies of both countries highlight a commitment to improving societal involvement and maintaining or preserving the traditions and culture of the country.

Despite the similarities in educational goals and challenges, there are some distinct differences between Botswana and Malawi. Botswana has been focusing explicit policies on education since 1977 (UNESCO, 2003a). It was with this policy that free primary education was instituted, albeit 3 years after the policy was enacted. In comparison, Malawi's focus on education is relatively recent, the first national policy on education was developed in 1994 when the new constitution was enacted (UNESCO, 2003b). Like Botswana though, it was with this first national policy that free primary education was established.

Botswana has almost achieved universal primary education and their policies concerning education have existed for some time. The current version of educational policies focuses more on achieving better accessibility for secondary and tertiary education than on primary education (RNPE, 1994; UNESCO, 2003a). Still, there are policies dealing with issues of quality, high repetition and dropout rates, but they are

based in an established educational system. By way of contrast, the policies developed by Malawi are focused on achieving universal primary education and dealing with basic issues such as ensuring equality between males and females, including special populations and providing money for the construction of schools and teacher training. While they indicate concerns with quality, the focus remains with establishing a strong and equitable educational system. Some of the basic differences between Botswana and Malawi's educational achievements are outlined in Table 2.

HIV/AIDS

Both Botswana and Malawi have serious problems with HIV/AIDS. Both countries have high rates of infection, large numbers of people living with AIDS, and a high estimated percentage of AIDS orphans (see Table 3). Both Botswana and Malawi participate in the World Health Organization's (WHO) 3 by 5 campaign to provide ART to 3 million people living with AIDS by the year 2005. As such both Botswana and Malawi offer ART to their citizens (WHO, 2003).

There are also stark differences. The problem in Botswana is a great deal larger than that in Malawi as Botswana has the second highest HIV/AIDS rate in the world, second only to Swaziland (AVERT, 2007a). Respectively much higher portions of the population are living with AIDS in Botswana than Malawi, due to population differences though the actual number of those living with the disease is higher in Malawi.

Table 2: Educational Achievements

	Botswana	Malawi
Net Enrolment Rate ^{1,a}		
1990/1991	83.4%	48.4%
2004	82.1%	95.3%
Net change	-1.3%	46.9%
Net Enrolment Rate (2004) ¹		
Males	83.3%	97.6%
Females	80.9%	93.1%
Primary School Completion (2004) ^{1,b}	92.0%	58.5%
Males	89.9%	59.8%
Females	94.1%	57.2%
Literacy Rates (15-24yr olds) (2004) ^{1,c}	94.0%	76.0%
Males	95.6%	70.7%
Females	92.1%	82.1%
Attendance (2005) ³		
Males	86%	84%
Females	83%	80%
Dropout rates ²	14.8% (2004)	67.2% (2001)
Males	17.3%	65.4%
Females	12.3%	69.1%
Primary Repetition (2004) ²	5%	18%
Males	6%	18%
Females	4%	18%
School-life Expectancy (2004) ²	11.9 years	9.6 years
Males	11.6 years	9.8 years
Females	12.2 years	9.5 years
Orphan Attendance (2005) ^{3,d}	99%	93%
Teacher: Student Ratio (2004) ²	26:1	70:1
Fees Abolished ⁴	1980	1994

1 - UN, 2006 2 - UNESCO Institute, 2004 3 - UNICEF, 2005 4 - UNESCO, 2003a; 2003b

Notes:

- Percentage of children of official school age (as defined by national system) who are enrolled in primary school.
- Percentage of the children of official graduation age who successfully completing the last year of primary school in the given school year.
- Percentage of 15-24 year olds who can both read and write, with understanding, a short simple statement on everyday life.
- Percentage of orphaned students (aged 10-14) who have lost both parents and currently attend school.

The percentage of orphans that are suspected to be AIDS orphans is much higher in Botswana than in Malawi (AVERT, 2007a). This would be expected due to the higher rates of HIV infections, people living with AIDS and AIDS deaths. However making an accurate determination of the number of AIDS orphans is difficult as there are many issues related to the identification of AIDS orphans. First, as previously discussed, there are issues concerning the definition of orphans (Meintjes & Giese, 2006). Second, it is often difficult to determine if a child is orphaned as a result of AIDS. This comes about as there can be financial benefits to labelling a child an AIDS orphans such as programs that cover the cost of schooling or additional funds provided to families who are caring for an AIDS orphan (AVERT, 2007b). Furthermore there are cultural differences in the understanding of the word 'orphan' which may include children who are destitute and those who do not receive familial care despite the fact that they have living parents (Andrews, Skinner, Zuma, 2006). In light of these problems, the number of AIDS orphans is an estimate.

There are also differences in the provision of ART. Botswana has sufficient infrastructure and personnel to provide this program. They have both met and exceeded the goal set forth by WHO. Malawi has not met their 3 by 5 goal, which may have something to do with the fact that the health system infrastructure is inadequate to meet the needs of all people in Malawi, particularly those in rural areas (WHO, 2005b). Malawi does offer ART free to those in public service but they use a revolving fund to purchase ART drugs for other members of the public. Botswana, on the other hand, is

able to provide ART for free to large segments of the public, the public service and the military (WHO, 2005a).

Table 3: HIV/AIDS Information

	Botswana	Malawi
Adult HIV prevalence (2003 est.) ¹	35.5% - 39.1% (2003)	11.3% - 17.7% (2003)
People living with AIDS (2005 est.) ²		
Percentage of population	24.1%	14.1%
AIDS related deaths (2005 est.) ²	180 000	78 000
AIDS orphans (2005 est.) ^{2a}	76% of all orphans 120 000	57% of all orphans 550 000
People receiving ART: People needing ART (2005) ^{1,b}	55,829: 84,000	28,110: 169,000

1 - WHO, 2005a; 2005b 2 - United Nations, 2006

Notes:

a – includes both single and double orphans

b – these numbers refer to the goals set by the WHO 3 by 5 campaign

Impacts of Educational Policies

For both countries the purpose of educational policies is to move each country forward in order to support the growth and development of their respective societies and economies (PIF, 2000; RNPE, 1994). This purpose is grounded in a great deal of prior research that espouses the many benefits to society and the economy that education provides. In order to achieve this purpose, the policy of free primary education has been pursued, with varying degrees of success, in each of these countries.

In the case of Botswana, free primary education has been provided for 27 years and primary enrolment rates were around 82% in 2004 (United Nations, 2006). Shortly after the onset of free primary education the enrolment rates jumped and Botswana was

well on its way to achieving universal primary education. An investigation of the NPE (RNPE, 1994; UNESCO, 2003a) shows that free primary education was not a policy in isolation. It was accompanied by other policies that supported gender equity, the inclusion of special populations and reduced intolerance. Additional policies supported the creation of basic infrastructures and the provision of teachers to deal with the influx of new students. External to, but supportive of the NPE was a society that was prepared to encourage a child's access to education and an economy that could support the hiring of multiple new teachers and the building of new schools (UNESCO, 2003a). Still, full universal access to education is not yet realized despite the support of the country to achieve that goal.

Comparatively, Malawi is a relative new-comer to the policy of free primary education. They have provided free primary education for 13 years. Initially, educational policies focused principally on ensuring children could enroll in and attend school without school fees (PIF, 1994). Similar to Botswana, this policy of free primary education was accompanied by policies for gender equity, quality, and access. However the economic situation of the country was not as strong and that impaired the ability of Malawi to provide the supports needed to deal with the influx of new students such as teachers, materials, and infrastructure. These problems were dealt with by the creation of ad hoc policies but it was another six years before the policy was revised to be comprehensive. Despite the problems, the enrolment rate of children in Malawi was 95% in 2004 (United Nations, 2006).

The abolishment of school fees appears to be the single biggest factor in the enrolment of a child for primary education at the outset. Both Botswana and Malawi showed large increases in enrolment the years immediately following the policy implementation (PIF, 2000; RNPE, 1994). However in both countries the rate of enrolment stagnates or declines slightly over time which suggests that other issues begin to take precedence. This speaks to the complexity of achieving universal access to education. It is not reliant solely on good educational policies or sound economic situations. New problems now face Botswana, such as the questions surrounding the quality of primary education and its current decline (RNPE, 1994), and the impact of the AIDS pandemic (Kinghorn, Coombe, McKay, Johnson, 2002). In Malawi there are similar concerns around the quality of primary education (PIF, 2000) and there are increasing concerns as to whether or not the AIDS pandemic will have an impact.

As the quality of education is perceived to decline or be inadequate, families become skeptical as to the value of education and may withdraw children if they are needed for other endeavours deemed more necessary, for example, helping to support the family (Bedi, et al., 2004). The quality of education can be affected by the curriculum, the infrastructure, the materials available or the level of teaching (PIF, 2000; RNPE, 1994). Both Botswana and Malawi are attempting to deal with issues of quality as can be seen through educational policies in the focus on curriculum development. Particularly in Malawi where the focus is on ensuring that the curriculum is locally relevant (PIF, 2000).

Both countries are also focused on ensuring that suitable infrastructures exist. Botswana is in the process of constructing new schools and upgrading others while using alternate arrangements at current structures in the meantime to accommodate as many students as possible. Malawi on the other hand is building new schools but is more focused on finding alternate arrangements to maximize the use of existing structures (PIF, 2000; RNPE, 1994).

Teacher quality is another issue in both countries. In both countries on-going education and training for teachers has been questionable or lacking entirely. Malawi currently has a great number of untrained teachers at the primary level (PIF, 2000). This leads to a perceived and, possibly real, decline in education quality. Both Botswana and Malawi are attempting to rectify this problem. In the case of Botswana they are increasing the educational requirements to become a primary school teacher while providing upgrading and training to existing teachers to bring them in line with the new educational requirements (RNPE, 1994). Malawi has a bigger concern in this area as they have hired a number of individuals that have no teaching education. The educational system is committed to providing on-the-job training, supporting new teachers and establishing and enforcing entry requirements for new teachers (PIF, 2000).

Impact of HIV/AIDS on the Education MDG

There is an impact of HIV/AIDS on education. Concerns about teachers intersect with the concerns surrounding the impact of HIV/AIDS. Qualified teachers are valuable to the educational system and the loss of such teachers is problematic at best. The AIDS

pandemic has left both countries with increasing rates of teacher absenteeism and death (Kinghorn, et al., 2002; Mambo, 2002; UNESCO Institute, 2006). The impact of the loss of teachers is a decrease in the quality of education as teachers are either not able to teach or they cannot teach effectively due to stress. Another impact of the pandemic is a simple reduction in the number of qualified teachers. This is of particular concern given both countries already experience a dearth of qualified teachers.

Currently this seems to be more of a concern in Botswana as the rates of infection and death are higher. It is estimated that approximately 25% of the teaching profession are infected (Kinghorn, et al., 2002). At this point in time, effects are seen more in rural areas and in pragmatic issues like staff allocation and management. One of the ways Botswana is attempting to deal with this problem is through the policy of ART provision to public service employees (Botswana National, 1998). At the very least, this will have the effect of ensuring that teachers remain healthy and productive for a longer period of time. Similarly, Malawi, has instituted policies around ART for public service employees for the same reasons as Botswana (National HIV/AIDS, 2003).

There is also the impact of the AIDS pandemic on the children themselves and their ability to attend school. There is some evidence to suggest that there is a negative effect; however, so far it appears to be restricted to high levels of anxiety and stress which affect a child's ability to do well in school (Government Botswana, 2002; Kinghorn, et al., 2002). As the rates of orphans compared to non-orphans in both countries can attest, orphans do not yet seem to be negatively impacted in terms of school

enrolment (see Table 2). However, there is a concern that dropout rates are increasing among vulnerable children who are affected by HIV/AIDS as children take on new roles within the household or face increased economic concerns (AVERT, 2007b; Poulsen, 2006). This may be a contributing factor to the decrease in enrolment in Botswana.

Emerging Issues and Insights

Emerging Issues

The current policy analysis has raised some additional issues beyond the impact of HIV/AIDS on education. These include concerns about who is involved in the development of policy, concerns about statistics, and the role of international donors.

Policy development

Gil's framework (1973) encourages the examination of who is involved in policy development and who is not. This type of investigation can provide insight into the gaps in policy. In both countries policies concerning education were developed in cooperation with multiple partners in the field of education (PIF, 2000; RNPE, 1994). Malawi consulted with experts in education but also included local communities. This is evidenced in their policy by the attention to providing curriculum that is locally relevant (PIF, 2000). Likewise Botswana engaged in a comprehensive consultation process but also relied on statistical evidence to ground the changes in policy. Reliance on statistics can be problematic as will be discussed shortly.

The process of consultation in each country is admirable and has no doubt enhanced the effectiveness of the revised policies. However, there are some areas that seem to be neglected. These consist of the interactions between the realm of education

and other social concerns that impact education, such as HIV/AIDS. It does not appear that consultations with people beyond educational providers, experts in the field, and communities were carried out (PIF, 2000; RNPE, 1994). Given the interconnectedness of social concerns such as health and education or even programs related to poverty alleviation or economic development, it is curious that people from these areas would not be involved in policy revision consultations.

Once policies related to education are developed they are somewhat integrated with other policies through the country's strategic plans. In the case of Botswana the strategic plan comes in the form of the *National Development Plan* and Vision 2016 and in Malawi it seems to take the form of the PRSP (Malawi Government, 2002). Interestingly, Malawi does seem to integrate concerns surrounding HIV/AIDS and education through their educational policy of tolerance and its attention to special populations, particularly AIDS orphans, even in the absence of consultations with health experts (PIF, 2000).

Statistics

Statistics are one way of determining the effectiveness of education, achievement of universal access to primary education and attendance. The problem is that educational assessment is not completely reliable in both of these countries (Cohen, et al., 2006). It is an area that is addressed in both countries' educational policies as needing improvement (PIF, 2000; RNPE, 1994). Statistics are influential; they are frequently used by potential

donors to determine where their money is best spent and by current donors to determine if their money was well spent.

The issue becomes more complicated when various international organisations are also involved in collecting statistics but do so using different criteria or estimate missing information. For example, in determining the MDG enrolment rates of countries in sub-Saharan Africa there are three potential places to find the information. The relevant locations to find this data include the UN Statistics Division which monitors the MDGs, UNESCO Institute for Statistics which is responsible for education, and the World Bank. Each of these organisations has different statistics for the same phenomenon (see Appendix D). These differ from the statistics provided by the countries themselves. While there may be very good statistical reasons for the difference (e. g. different statistical manipulations to equalize data across countries) the results are confusing. When monitoring the effectiveness of education, which statistics is an international donor supposed to rely on as accurate?

The other problem presented by varying statistics is that it becomes increasingly difficult to anticipate and adequately plan for changes in education. Statistics serve the purpose of establishing trends; if current statistics are unreliable or inaccurate, a country will have a much more difficult time in anticipating what problems may be encountered in the future. In addition, donors become skeptical about the effectiveness of their programs and may choose to discontinue their support.

International donors

This leads directly to the role of international donors. While there may be serious concerns about statistics and the conclusions one can draw about program effectiveness, donors play an important role in education. In Malawi, the role of international donors was recognized as vital to education provision in as much as they were included in the policy revision process (PIF, 2000). The role that international donors play in educational provision or consultation is sensitive. As they often possess the money that will encourage development, there is a distinct power imbalance between the donors and the recipient country (Booyesen & Van der Berg, 2005). In many cases there is a dearth of understanding among international donors about the complexities involved with the provision of education or other development initiatives. As Jeffery Sachs explains “one of the weaknesses of development thinking is the relentless drive for a magic bullet, the one decisive investment that will turn the tide.” (Sachs, 2005, p. 255). This search for a magic bullet contributes to the thinking that solving the problem of education will lead, through a domino effect, to the solving of all other problems. Without understanding the complexities and intricacies of providing education, donor aid could be rendered useless.

This is not to say that individual programs are not effective, rather that they cannot exist in a vacuum. Botswana seems to recognize this fact as they have specific guidelines on the roles of NGOs in their country (National Policy NGO, 2001). However, Botswana is in a unique position as they are not dependent on development aid to provide basic services in their country. The resulting equalization of power between the donor

agencies and the host country means, in relation to education, that goals, approaches, programs, and outcome measures can be negotiated with the best interests of the country in mind.

Malawi on the other hand, does not share this privilege. They are heavily dependent on official development assistance to provide basic services and as a result experience reduced power in decision making as was discussed previously in regards to the PRSP (CIA, 2007b). For education, this means that the donor is able to impose outside values, goals, and evaluation criteria in relation to educational policies and initiatives. These values may or may not reflect those of the country.

Insights

The analysis of educational and HIV/AIDS policies in addition to other policies that may impact education reveals the stark reality that education is not a magic bullet. Education is incredibly important to the development of a nation but it cannot be pursued in the absence of other issues. HIV/AIDS does have an impact on the ability of countries such as Botswana and Malawi to achieve the MDG of universal primary education. Each of these countries has recognized the problems associated with the pandemic. They have sought to attenuate the existing and potential problems in every way possible and, to a degree, have succeeded in this attempt. These solutions have been guided by both HIV/AIDS and educational policies.

The role of international organisations in achieving the goal of universal primary education is complex and must be dealt with carefully. While the role of international

organisations differs significantly in each of these countries some general commonalities must be considered. International organisations hold considerable power because they purport to be experts in the field and because they control the money that is needed to provide quality education. Whether well intended or simply ignorant, international organisations must be aware of how they wield power and the impact that may have on developing countries. They must also be aware of how they understand and use statistical information to ensure they do not abuse their position of power.

Implications for Social Work

Social workers have the potential to play a unique role in policy development through their involvement in international donor agencies. Social workers are trained to consider the multiple factors involved in social phenomena. Furthermore, social workers adhere to a code of ethics that values self-determination (CASW, 2005). Between the training and ethics of social workers, the role of the social worker includes taking measures to ensure that potential or existing power imbalances between donors and recipients are attenuated. In addition, the social worker is required to be sensitive and inquisitive about education and its relationship to other societal concerns and goals. This attention should serve to create policies and programming for international agencies that enable the donor to work with and be respectful of the society.

Further research

There are a number of directions in which further research could proceed. The role of the donor is particularly intriguing. As Malawi shows, there is a distinct power

differential between international bodies providing loans and donations of aid and the country itself. The formulation of the PRSP is evidence of how the power imbalance is manifested and how it can influence the course of policy and direction of a country. Part of what is so interesting is the attitudes of the donor, the ideas of ownership, charity and knowledge. Underlying these attitudes is the current reliance on achieving the best value for money spent and how blame is attributed in programs that are not as effective as initially anticipated.

Another area of further research involves the relationship between education and HIV/AIDS and the involvement or role of faith based organisations (FBOs). FBOs contribute to the provision of education in both of the countries examined in this project in addition to working in various capacities with HIV/AIDS issues and programs. What role is played by these organisations and in what ways can they contribute positively to the achievement of country goals and objectives concerning education?

Achieving the MDGs to alleviate the extreme poverty experienced by so many people in this world is a laudable goal. It is one that many people throughout the world, and many social workers in particular, would agree is important. Focusing our efforts on education is touted as being the way to achieve all other MDGs by some development experts. It cannot be denied that the influences of education on the development of a nation's economy, health, and society in general are numerous and real but it is not the only answer to a nation's difficulties in development. It is admirable and necessary to focus on achieving universal primary education but only if the many intricate connections

between it and other issues are conceded. If we truly want to achieve universal primary education we must always remember that “this [is] about the lives of children, not commodities or consumer products” (Cohen, et al., 2006, p. xvi).

References

- Ahderom, T. (2000). The Millennium Forum: A global consultation by civil society. *United Nations Chronicle*, 37(1), 9-10.
- Andrews, G., Skinner, D., & Zuma, K. (2006). Epidemiology of health and vulnerability among children orphaned and made vulnerable by HIV/AIDS in sub-Saharan Africa. *AIDS Care*, 18(3), 269-276.
- AVERT. (2007a). *HIV and AIDS in Botswana*. Retrieved June 9, 2007, from <http://www.avert.org/aidsbotswana.htm>
- AVERT. (2007b). *AIDS orphans*. Retrieved June 9, 2007, from <http://www.avert.org/aidsorphans.htm>
- Bedi, A. S., Kimalu, P. K., Manda, D. K., & Nafula, N. (2004). The decline in primary school enrolment in Kenya. *Journal of Africa Economies*, 13(1), 1-43.
- Bennell, P. (2006a). The impact of the AIDS epidemic on the schooling of orphans and other directly affected children in sub-Saharan Africa. *The Journal of Development Studies*, 41(3), 467-488.
- Bennell, P. (2006b). The impact of the AIDS epidemic on teachers in sub-Saharan Africa. *The Journal of Development Studies*, 41(3), 440-466.

- Bicego, G., Rutstein, S., & Johnson, K. (2003). Dimensions of the emerging orphan crisis in sub-Saharan Africa. *Social Science & Medicine*, 56, 1235-1247.
- Birdsall, N. Levine, R., & Ibrahim, A. (2005). *Toward universal primary education: Investments, incentives, and institutions*. London: Earthscan.
- Booyesen, F. & Van der Berg, S. (2005). The role of social grants in mitigating the socio-economic impact of HIV/AIDS in two free state communities. *South African Journal of Economics*, 73, 545-563.
- Bornschieer, V., Herkenrath, M., & Konig, C. (2005). The double dividend of expanding education for development. *International Sociology*, 20(4), 506-529.
- Botswana National Policy on HIV/AIDS. (1998). Retrieved May 24, 2007, from http://hivaidsclearinghouse.unesco.org/ev_en.php?ID=3473_201&ID2=DO_TOP
- IC
- Canadian Association of Social Workers (CASW). (2005). *Code of Ethics*. Ottawa, Canada: CASW.
- Cheru, F. (2006). Building and supporting PRSPs in Africa: What has worked well so far? What needs changing? *Third World Quarterly*, 27(2), 353-376.
- CIA. (2007a, June 19). *The World Factbook: Botswana*. Retrieved April 19, 2007, from <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/bc.html>
- CIA. (2007b, April 17). *The World Factbook: Malawi*. Retrieved April 19, 2007, from <https://www.cia.gov/cia/publications/factbook/geos/mi.html>

Cohen, J. E., Bloom, D. E., & Malin, M. B. (2006). *Educating all children: A global agenda*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Constitution of the Republic of Botswana (1965). Retrieved April 26, 2007, from <http://www.botswanaembassy.org/pdf/constitution.pdf>

Constitution of the Republic of Malawi, Act 20 (1994). Retrieved April 26, 2007, from http://www.africa.upenn.edu/Govern_Political/miwi_const.html

Craddock, S. (2004). Introduction: Beyond Epidemiology: Locating AIDS in Africa. In E. Kalipeni, S. Craddock, J. R. Oponng, and J. Ghosh (Eds.) *HIV and AIDS in Africa: Beyond epidemiology* (1-10). Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Economic Commission for Africa. (2005). *The Millennium Development Goals in Africa: Progress and challenges*. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: Economic Commission for Africa.

Education Act, Act 40. (1967). Laws of Botswana.

Europa world year book. (2006a). Botswana. (Vol. 1, pp. 885-898). London: Routledge.

Europa world year book. (2006b). Malawi. (Vol. 2, pp. 2836-2851). London: Routledge.

Garrett, L. (2007). The challenge of global health. *Foreign Affairs*, 86(1), 14-38

Geo-Jaja, M. A. (2004). Decentralisation and privatization of education in Africa: Which option for Nigeria? *International Review of Education*, 50, 307-323.

Gil, D.G. (1973). *Unravelling social policy: Theory, analysis, and political action towards social equality*. Cambridge, MA: Schenkman Publishing Company.

Government of Botswana. (2002). *Botswana: National Development Plan 9*. Gaborone,

Botswana. Retrieved May 9, 2007, from

<http://www.sparn.org.za/documents/d0001172/index.php>

Guest, E. (2004). Excerpt from *Children of AIDS: Africa's orphan crisis: A mother to her*

brothers: A child-headed household's story, Johannesburg, South Africa. In E.

Kalipeni, S. Craddock, J.R. Oppong, and J. Ghosh (Eds.). *HIV and AIDS in Africa:*

Beyond epidemiology (pp. 316-322). Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Hoppers, W. (2005). Community schools as an educational alternative in Africa: A

critique. *International Review of Education*, 51, 115-127.

Kinghorn, A., Coombe, C., McKay, E., & Johnson, S. (2002). *The impact of HIV/AIDS*

on education in Botswana. Abt Associates South Africa Inc.

Kinghorn, A. & Kelly, M. J. (2006). 'The impact of the AIDS epidemic' articles by Paul

Bennell: Some comments. *The Journal of Development Studies*, 41(3), 489-499.

Kombe, G., Fieno, J., Bhatt, P., & Smith, J. (2005). Highly active anti-retroviral

treatment as a bridge towards education for all in sub-Saharan Africa.

International Social Sciences Journal, 186, 609-620.

Lewis, S. (2005). *A race against time*. Toronto, ON: House of Anansi Press.

Loewenson, R. (2007). Exploring equity and inclusion in the responses to AIDS. *AIDS*

Care, 19, S2-S11.

- Lokshin, M. M., Glinskaya, E., & Garcia, M. (2004). The effect of early childhood development programmes on women's labour force participation and older children's schooling in Kenya. *Journal of African Economies*, 13(2), 240-276.
- Madison, B. Q. (1980). *The meaning of social policy: The comparative dimension in social welfare*. London: Croom Helm Ltd.
- Malawi DHS EdData Survey. (2002). Introduction and Summary of Findings. Retrieved May 17, 2007, from <http://www.nso.malawi.net/>
- Malawi Government. (2002). Malawi Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper. Lilongwe, Malawi. Retrieved April 30, 2007, from http://povlibrary.worldbank.org/files/Malawi_PRSP.pdf
- Mambo, M. (2002). *Address HIV/AIDS related problems in the educational system: Concept note for the Ministry of Education, Science & Technology in Malawi*. Retrieved June 9, 2007, from http://www.iiep.tomoye.com/ev_en.php?ID+1533_201&ID2=DO-TOPIC
- Mbugua, N. (2007). Factors inhibiting educated mothers in Kenya from giving meaningful sex-education to their daughters. *Social Science & Medicine*, 64, 1079-1089.
- Meintjes, H. & Giese, S. (2006). Spinning the epidemic: The making of mythologies of orphanhood in the context of AIDS. *Childhood*, 13(3), 407-430.
- Moroney, R. M., & Krysik, J. (1998). *Social policy and social work: Critical essays on the welfare state* (2nd Ed.). New York: Aldine de Gruyter, Inc.

National HIV/AIDS Policy. (2003). Republic of Malawi. Retrieved May 9, 2007, from

<http://www.aidsmalawi.org.mw/resources/Malawi%20National%20HIVAIDS%20Policy.pdf>

National Policy for Non-Governmental Organisations. (2001). Retrieved May 9, 2007,

from <http://www.icnl.org/JOURNAL/vol3iss3/2-01.pdf>

National Policy on Orphans and Other Vulnerable Children. (2003). Republic of Malawi.

Retrieved May 9, 2007, from

<http://www.malawi.gov.mw/Gender/newcontents/REPUBLIC%20OF%20MALAWI%20National%20Policy%20on%20Orphans%20and%20other%20Vuln.pdf>

Oleke, C., Blystad, A., Fylkesnes, K., & Tumwine, J. K. (2007). Constraints to educational opportunities of orphans: A community-based study from northern Uganda. *AIDS Care, 19*(3), 361-368.

Policy and Investment Framework (1994). Republic of Malawi. Executive Summary.

Retrieved April 26, 2007, from <http://www.sdn.org.mw/edu/new/policy-direction.html.html>

Policy and Investment Framework (2000). Republic of Malawi. Retrieved April 26, 2007,

from <http://www.sdn.org.mw/-phindu/min-education/whole.htm>

Poulsen, H. (2006). The gendered impact of HIV/AIDS on education in South Africa and Swaziland: Save the Children's experiences. *Gender & Development, 14*(1), 47-56.

Rasheed, S. (2000). Children: What future in the new millennium? *Development* 43(1), 7-13.

Revised National Policy on Education. (1994). Republic of Botswana. Retrieved May 24, 2007, from

http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/skills/hrdr/init/bot_6.htm

Sachs, J. D. (2005). *The end of poverty: Economic possibilities for our time*. London, The Penguin Press.

Shabaya, J. & Konadu-Agyemang, K. (2004). Unequal address, unequal participation:

Some spatial and socio-economic dimensions of the gender gap in education in

Africa with special reference to Ghana, Zimbabwe, and Kenya. *Compare*, 34(4),

395-424.

UN Millennium Declaration, A/RES/55/2, 2000. Retrieved October 12, 2006, from

<http://www.un.org/millennium/declaration/ares552e.pdf>

UNAIDS. (2007). *UNAIDS: Botswana*. Retrieved June 9, 2007, from

http://www.unaids.org/en/Regions_Countries/Countries/malawi.asp

UNESCO. (1990). The World declaration on education for all: Meeting basic learning needs. Retrieved November 28, 2006, from

http://www.unesco.org/education/efa/ed_for_all/background/jomtien_declaration.shtml

UNESCO. (2003a). World data on Education: Botswana. Retrieved April 30, 2007,

http://nt5.scbbs.com/cgi-bin/om_isapi.dll?clientID=414789619&COUNTRY=botswana&FREETEXT=&KEYWORD=®ION=&THEME=&WCount=4&advquery=%5bHeadings%20Country%2c%20botswana%5d&depth=3&headingswithhits=on&hitsperheading=on&infobase=iwde.nfo&record={7D958120}&softpage=PL_frame

UNESCO. (2003b). World data on Education: Malawi. Retrieved April 30, 2007, from

http://nt5.scbbs.com/cgi-bin/om_isapi.dll?clientID=104499998&COUNTRY=malawi&FREETEXT=&KEYWORD=®ION=&THEME=&WCount=4&advquery=%5bHeadings%20Country%2c%20malawi%5d&depth=3&headingswithhits=on&hitsperheading=on&infobase=iwde.nfo&record={7D958419}&softpage=PL_frame

UNESCO Institute for Statistics. (2006). Teacher supply and demand in sub-Saharan Africa: Regional Profile.

UNICEF. (2006). *The state of the world's children 2007*. UNICEF House: New York.

UNICEF. (2005). *Information by Country*. Retrieved June 9, 2007, from

<http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/index.html>

Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Resolution 217 A (III), 1948.

United Nations Development Group. (2003). *Indicator for monitoring the Millennium Development Goals: Definitions, rationale, concept and sources*. New York: United Nations Publications.

United Nations Statistics Division. (2006). *Millennium Development Goal Indicators*.

Retrieved March 26, 2007, from <http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Data.aspx>

Vision 2016: Towards Prosperity for All. (1998). Retrieved May 24, 2007, from

<http://www.vision2016.co.bw/PDF%27s/Pubs/Framework%20of%20vision%20-%20Summary.pdf>

Wheeler, R. (1999). Assessing progress in fulfilling commitments. *United Nations Chronicle* 36(1), 72.

WHO. (2003). *Treating 3 million by 2005: Making it happen: The WHO Strategy*. France.

WHO. (2005a). *Summary country profile for HIV/AIDS treatment scale up: Botswana*. Retrieved May 9, 2007, from http://www.who.int/hiv/HIVCP_BWA.pdf

WHO. (2005b). *Summary country profile for HIV/AIDS treatment scale up: Malawi*. Retrieved May 9, 2007, from http://www.who.int/hiv/HIVCP_MWI.pdf

World Bank Group. (2000, March). *Partners in transforming development: New approaches to developing country-owned Poverty Reduction Strategies*. Retrieved April 30, 2007, from <http://www.imf.org/external/np/prsp/pdf/prspbroc.pdf>

Appendix A

Millennium Development Goals

1. Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger.
2. Achieve universal primary education.
3. Promote gender equality and empower women.
4. Reduce child mortality.
5. Improve maternal health.
6. Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria, and other diseases.
7. Ensure environmental sustainability.
8. Develop a global partnership for development.

Source:

United Nations. (2005). UN Millennium Development Goals. Retrieved October 20, 2006, from <http://www.un.org/millenniumgoals/>

Appendix B

Internet Search for Policies

Google search term: Government of Botswana

Google search term: Government of Malawi

National Policies

- Policies retrieved:
 - National Policy on Orphans and Vulnerable Children
 - National Policy on Gender

Google search term: Education - UNESCO

World Data on Education

- Information retrieved:
 - Botswana: national educational system profile
 - Malawi: national educational system profile

UNESCO Institute for Statistics

- Information retrieved:
 - MDG statistics

Google search term: World Bank - PRSP

- Documents retrieved:
 - Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (2002)
 - Joint Staff Assessment (2002)

Google search terms:

Botswana Constitution

- Document retrieved:
 - Constitution of the Republic of Botswana

Botswana National Development Plan 9

- Document retrieved:
 - National Development Plan 9

Botswana National Policy

- Policies retrieved:
 - National Policy for NGOs
 - National Policy on HIV/AIDS
 - Revised National Policy on Education (1994)

Botswana Vision 2016

- Document retrieved:
 - Vision 2016: Towards Prosperity for All

Malawi Constitution

- Document retrieved:
 - Constitution of the Republic of Malawi

Malawi Educational policy

- Policies retrieved:
 - National Policy on HIV/AIDS
 - Policy and Investment Framework (1994)
 - Policy and Investment Framework (2000)

Appendix C

Abstracted from Gil's Framework for Policy Analysis

Focus of the Policy

- Nature, scope and distribution of the issues
- Causal theories or hypothesis concerning the issues

Substantive Nature of the Policy

- Policy objectives
- Value premises and ideological orientations
- Theories or hypothesis underlying the strategy
- Target segments of society
- Short and long term effects of the policy on target segments of society

The Policy Effects on Society

- Development of resources, goods and services
 - Qualitative changes
 - Quantitative changes
 - Priority changes
- Status allocation
 - Establish new status, roles, prerogatives
 - Strengthen or protect existing status, roles, prerogatives
 - Eliminate existing status, roles, prerogatives
 - Change criteria or procedures used to assign individuals/groups to status

- Rights distributions
 - Changes in entitlements, rewards, constraints
 - Changes in ratio of rights distributed as entitlements to rights distributed as rewards due to changes in status allocation
 - Change in ratio of rights distributed directly to rights distributed indirectly
 - Changes in the extent of coverage of rights for all members in society
 - Changes in the degree of inequality in the distribution of rights to individuals/groups in society
- Consequences of the changes in resource development, status allocation, and rights distribution for
 - Overall quality of life in society
 - Circumstances of living for individuals and groups in society
 - Intra-societal relationships

Policy Creation Process

- History of policy development
- Political forces involved
- Societal environment
- Other relevant social policies (national and international)
- Societal stage of development
- Societal beliefs, values, ideology, customs, traditions
- Conclusions and predictions

Source:

Gil, D.G. (1973). *Unravelling social policy: Theory, analysis, and political action towards social equality*. Cambridge, MA: Schenkman Publishing Company.

Appendix D

MDG Statistics – Primary Education Enrolment

	World Bank ¹			UNIS ²			UNSD ³		
	1990	2004	change	1990	2001	change	1990	2004	change
Botswana	101	105	4	85	81	-4	83.4	82.1	-1.3
Nigeria	87	99	12	60			57.8	60.1	2.3
Mauritius	109	103	-6	95	93	-2	91.3	95.1	3.8
Djibouti				31	34	3	28.7	32.8	4.1
Ghana	74	81	7	52	60	8	53.7	57.9	4.2
Rwanda	70	119	49	67	84	17	66.0	73.2	7.2
Lesotho	109	131	22	73	84	11	71.5	85.9	14.4
Togo	94	101	7	75	95	20	64.0	78.8	14.8
Niger	26	45	19	24	34	10	22.3	39.2	16.9
Cameroon	109	117	8	74			73.6	91.8	18.2
Senegal	53	76	23	47	60	13	43.5	66.1	22.6
Ethiopia	30	77	47	23	46	23	22.0	46.4	24.4
Madagascar	93	134	41	65	69	4	64.2	88.8	24.6
Mali	26	64	38	20			20.9	46.5	25.6
Gambia	61	81	20	48	73	25	48.0	75.2	27.2
Burkina Faso	36	53	17	26	35	9	29.2	57.0	27.8
Mozambique	61	95	34	45	60	15	42.8	71.0	28.2
Angola	80			58			50.3	82.6	32.3
Eritrea	21	66	45	16	43	27	15.5	47.8	32.3
Tanzania	68	101	33	50	54	4	49.4	85.9	36.5
Guinea	36	79	43	26	62	36	27.2	63.8	36.6
Mauritania				35	67	32	35.3	74.3	39
Benin	54	99	45	45			41.0	82.1	41.1
Malawi	66	125	59	50	81	31	48.4	95.3	46.9
Burundi	71	80	9	53	53	0	52.9		
Cape Verde	111	111	0	94	101	7	91.1		

	World Bank			UNIS			UNSD		
	1990	2004	change	1990	2004	change	1990	2004	change
Central African Rep.	64	64	0	54			51.9		
Chad	52	71	19	37	58	21	34.7		
Comoros	75	85	10	57			56.7		
Congo	17	89	72	79			79.4		
Dem. Rep. Congo	70			55			54.1		
Equatorial Guinea	63			91	85	-6	90.6		
Gabon	141	130	-11	86			85.5		
Guinea-Bissau	60			38			38.1		
Namibia	32			83	78	-5			
Sao Tome		133			99			98.2	
Seychelles		110			99			96.4	
Sierra Leone	53	145	92	41			43.3		
Swaziland	97			77	77	0	77.1		
Uganda	70	125	55	53					
Zambia	93	99	6	76	66	-10		79.8	
Zimbabwe	107			86	83	-3			

Sources:

1. World Bank. (n.d.). *EdStats*. Retrieved March 26, 2007, from <http://www1.worldbank.org/education/edstats/>
2. UNESCO Institute for Statistics. (2006) *Public Reports: Education*. Retrieved March 26, 2007, from <http://stats.uis.unesco.org/unesco/ReportFolders/ReportFolders.aspx>
3. United Nations Statistics Division. (2006). *Millennium Development Goal Indicators*. Retrieved March 26, 2007, from <http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Data.aspx>