

MUSIC, EMOTIONS  
AND  
THE ROLE OF THE BODY

MUSIC, EMOTIONS  
AND  
THE ROLE OF THE BODY

By

MELISSA WEST, B.A.

A Thesis

Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies

in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirments

for the Degree

Master of Arts

McMaster University

Copyright by Melissa West, September 1998

MASTER OF ARTS (1998)  
(Music Criticism)

McMaster University  
Hamilton, Ontario

TITLE: Music, Emotions and the Role of the Body

AUTHOR: Melissa West, B.A. (Wilfrid Laurier University)

SUPERVISOR: Dr. Susan Fast

NUMBER OF PAGES: 145

## Abstract

Until recently, musicology has overlooked the role of the body in musical understanding, preferring to think of music as a matter of the mind. However, musicologists such as David Lidov, Robert Walser, Susan McClary, and Suzanne Cusick have discussed the mind/body split which exists in musicology at great length and have suggested several solutions to the problem. And Peter Kivy, however, has invoked the body by suggesting that the shape of the musical line is the same as the shape of a human body when expressing an emotion. I was intrigued by Kivy's ideas and started searching for a general theory of understanding which involved the role of the body. This search led me to the theories of George Lakoff and Mark Johnson. Lakoff and Johnson suggest that the body is the essence of human understanding. They propose that we understand our world through metaphorical projections of our physical relationship to it. After an indepth look at music and emotions as separate entities, it will be shown that music is not a metaphor for emotions, in the traditional sense, but that both music and emotions are understood through the same recurring physical body-patterns. Using the theories of Lakoff and Johnson as a model, an analysis of the music of the film *Glory* will be undertaken. This analysis is designed to demonstrate how music can be expressive of several emotions including sadness, happiness, love, and pride.

## Acknowledgments

Without a doubt this thesis is not the work of one author, but of many. I would like to take this opportunity to thank the numerous people involved in both my scholastic and personal life who have helped to make this document what it is today.

It was Dr. Renwick, my proposal advisor who initially helped me get my ideas off the ground by guiding and refining my interests during many hours of discussion. Thanks to his patience and understanding I was able to create a topic with which I was happy to work.

My thesis advisor, Dr. Fast, whose exceptional editorial skills and constant challenging of my ideas continuously helped develop this paper and made my arguments stronger in the process. Her wisdom, time and expertise have contributed a great deal to this paper.

I would like to thank my classmates in the music criticism program without whose support and intellectual interaction, many of the ideas in this thesis would not have been formulated or as clearly expressed.

My family has provided an incredible emotional outlet during the challenging process of writing a thesis. My Mother could always be counted on to provide a listening ear on the other side of the phone across the miles between us. My husband's family was continually available for advice, support and of course an automobile at the drop of a hat. Finally and most of all I would like to thank my husband Tim whose hard work has allowed me to lead the privileged and relaxed lifestyle of a student while he slaves away at work to support my endeavor. I am infinitely grateful for the sacrifices he has made in order for me to pursue my dreams.



Conclusion.....137

Bibliography.....142

## Introduction

During my first year as a graduate student at McMaster University I was required to create a reading course for myself. The task, at that time, seemed daunting to say the least. I was unsure what I wanted to study, let alone able to come up with a list of related books that I wanted to read. In my desperation to find a topic area and a list of books to read, I recalled an author that I had come in contact with during my undergraduate degree: Peter Kivy. Kivy, a philosopher of music, had written a number of books concerning musical aesthetics. His books created a unified topic--the philosophy of music--as well as a ready-made reading list that would be interesting to study. Kivy's books cover many facets of music, including performance practice, music and representation, the value of music, the aesthetics of opera, and the expression of emotion in music. During the reading course I read all of Kivy's writings. Of all his works I found his discussions on music and emotions to be the most interesting. Kivy's approach to music and emotions was unlike any other writings on music that I had read to that date. He used the physicality of the human body to explain how music is expressive of emotions. My previous readings had explained music as a matter of the mind. I was enamoured with Kivy's idea of how music expressed emotions and decided that I would work on expanding and applying his model. For my final paper of the writing course I engaged in a critical review of his theory of emotions and music and undertook an analysis using the criteria he had set out in his writings on emotions and music. It was through this paper that I saw the potential to expand Kivy's theory beyond his initial premise to a theory that focussed even more on the role of the body in the expression of emotions in music. More research on the role of the body in understanding music would be necessary.

As I began reviewing other theories of emotion and music it became clear to me that Kivy's approach was unique. Other philosophers and theorists of music did not want to understand music and emotions through the body. To me this was the most fascinating aspect of Kivy's theory, and I began to search for the role of the body in other writings of music theory and musicology.

An article I read in Vol. 2 of *Music Theory Online* entitled, "Theorists and 'The Music Itself'"<sup>1</sup> by Scott Burnham led me to Lawrence Zibkowski and Janna Saslaw, "theorists who are interested in conceptual models of music that metaphorically invoke the body."<sup>2</sup> The work that Zibkowski and Saslaw were undertaking sounded very similar to the work that Kivy had started. I contacted Zibkowski and Saslaw via e-mail expressing my interest in their work and telling them about my idea. They both replied immediately stating that I should read the works of Mark Johnson and George Lakoff. The theories of Lakoff and Johnson completely changed the way I perceived human reasoning. Lakoff and Johnson had taken a radical departure from the theories of meaning which located understanding in the mind. Instead they explained understanding as a matter of the body. I was taken with the theory and saw various possibilities for applying it to and expanding Kivy's theory of emotion and music. With the help of Lakoff and Johnson, I believed I would be able to take Kivy's theory of emotion and music to the next level. A general theory of understanding through the body would definitely aid in an embodied explanation emotions and music.

Since the mind/body split is at the "head" of our (mis)conception of understanding, including musical understanding, I have begun Chapter One by outlining how this problem has affected musicology. Several authors, including David Lidov, Robert Walser, Susan McClary, Suzanne Cusick, and Roland Barthes, have located the problem of the mind/body

---

<sup>1</sup> (<http://smt.ucsb.edu/mto/issues/mto96.2.2.burnham.html>)

<sup>2</sup> *ibid.*

split in our understanding of music and have suggested ways to rectify the problem. The study of music and emotions, a smaller division of musicology, has not been free of the mind/body split. I have reviewed a wide, but by no means comprehensive group of writings on music and emotions. I hope that by examining these theories I will be able to display the mind/body split that exists in the writings. It is interesting to note that even those authors who deny the role of the body in their writings can not help slipping it in from time to time. Overall, by investigating several theories of emotion and music, I hope to show that those authors who have brought the role of the body to the forefront in their writings deal with the topic in a much more illuminating manner than those who do not. I hope also to be able to show the potential of Kivy's theory, not only through his own writings but also through the writings of those who have since adopted his ideas.

Kivy's theory, as excellent as it is, is only a starting point. What is needed is a more general theory of understanding which incorporates the body and that can explain meaning in a comprehensive sense. Later, this general theory of meaning may be applied to our understanding of music and emotions as separate entities. After reviewing our understanding of music and emotions separately, we may then begin to understand how music is heard as emotional. Chapter Two begins with the general theory of embodied understanding (explanation of meaning) as theorized by Lakoff and Johnson. Following this introduction to The theories of Lakoff and Johnson, I show how it can and has been applied to our understanding of music in a very general sense. In order to comprehend music as emotional it is important to understand emotions. Once again, applying the principles of Lakoff and Johnson, I review an embodied understanding of emotions. Finally by combining our understandings of both music and emotions, I explain how music can be heard as emotional.

Chapter Three is an application of the theories of Lakoff and Johnson to the film music of *Glory*. By applying the principles of Lakoff and Johnson to James Horner's music I provide a concrete example of how music can be heard as expressing emotions.

## Chapter One

### **The Role of Human Expression in Music and Emotions**

#### Introduction

Musicology, like other disciplines throughout history, has been affected by what is termed the mind/body split. This split assumes that the mind understands and apprehends music, but that the body does not play a role in musical understanding. Perhaps because instrumental music can be viewed as nonrepresentational, musicologists have preferred to think of it as an abstract entity, totally detached from anything as tangible as the body. The labels that have been attached to instrumental music, including 'absolute' and 'pure,' not only suggest the domain of the mind, but also a value-laden hierarchy at the heart of the mind/body split in musicology.

Composers and interpreters of music have neither wholly acknowledged the role of the body in music nor denied it: it would seem that they prefer not to deal with the issue of the body in music.

Controversy about musical meaning...has tended to bypass somatic reference, suggesting a paradox: Stravinsky who claimed that music can mean nothing outside itself, was the century's greatest composer of ballet. Similarly, Chopin, who did not share the taste of some of his contemporaries for explicitly descriptive programs and titles, wrote many more dances. (In some measure this also holds true for Schubert and even for Brahms.) On the other side, if we examine records of the interests of composers more fully committed to descriptive music, we find relatively little that bears directly on the body or its behavior as a subject. In the titles and texts of works by Schumann, Berlioz, Liszt, Wagner, and Debussy there are of course references to dancing and entrancement, sometimes to floating or flying, but relatively few. Where the body or its actions appear, they tend either to be reduced to symbols of something else or to form a contextual background. 'Les Waltzes' and 'A Walk in the County' are not primarily intended to represent dancing or walking. It might seem that somatic reference in music is on the one hand too obvious to command the

interest of descriptive musicians, and on the other hand too innocuous to earn the proscription of the 'absolute' musicians.<sup>1</sup>

It seems that the body in music is too obvious for comment or too subjective to be considered a matter for intellectual inquiry. In the above quote, David Lidov has explained that the body does exist in music, surprisingly even in the music of those composers who would prefer to think of music as an abstract entity. If we know instinctually that the body is continually invoked in music, why then do musicologists ignore its presence? Robert Walser suggests that it is,

on the one hand, the often very satisfying intuitions we gain from ethnography, listening to music, and performing it; and on the other hand the understanding of all meanings as abstract and propositional that we inherit from the dominant philosophical tradition of the West. Philosophers since Descartes have worked to justify and naturalize an essential split between the mind and body, reason and sensation, with incalculable consequences for the history of the world.<sup>2</sup>

It would seem that those writing about music have followed the dominant philosophical tradition of the West, which places authority of mind over body and reason over sensation.

Susan McClary, on the other hand, situates the mind/body split in musicology at the heart of the masculine/feminine polarity. According to McClary, music has been labeled as feminine in many historical periods in part because of its association with the body.<sup>3</sup> The result of this feminine labeling has caused men to counteract by placing more emphasis on the mind. Keeping the mind as a dominant force over that body has taken many forms:

...by defining music as the most ideal (that is, the least physical) of the arts, by insisting emphatically on its 'rational' dimension, by laying claim to such presumably masculine virtues as objectivity, universality, and transcendence by prohibiting actual female participation altogether.<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> David Lidov, "Mind and Body in Music," *Semiotica* 66-1/3 (1987): 70.

<sup>2</sup> Robert Walser, "The Body in the Music: Epistemology and Musical Semiotics," *College Music Symposium* 31 (1991): 121.

<sup>3</sup> Susan McClary, *Feminine Endings: Music, Gender, ad Sexuality* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1991), 17.

<sup>4</sup> *ibid.*

McClary suggests that at the heart of this retaliation is the fear of the body.<sup>5</sup>

Performing musicians are well aware of the role their bodies play in the making of music.

‘If you don’t live it, it won’t come out of your horn,’ Charlie Parker claimed, and ‘It don’t mean a thing if it ain’t got that swing,’ according to Duke Ellington. These statements are quite different from European aesthetic mystifications, for they locate hard-to-define meanings not in some imaginary transcendent realm, but in a social (lived) experience and in the human body (swing).<sup>6</sup>

This quote not only shows the performers’ awareness of their bodies’ role in producing music, but also a split within music, i.e. classical music as a matter of the mind and popular music is a matter of the body. Suzanne Cusick has also become aware of the mind/body split in her surprisingly conflicting roles as performer and musicologist. “As a performer, I act on and with what we ordinarily call music with my body; as a musicologist I have been formed to act on (and with?) what we ordinarily call music with my mind and only with my mind.”<sup>7</sup> In focusing on the intentions of the composer and on the notated score, both musicology and music theory have negated the presence of the body in music.<sup>8</sup> Instead, musicologists have preferred to think of music as a matter solely of the mind. Cusick points out that even though music requires a body to create it and hear it (ears), it is still thought of as a “mind-mind game.”<sup>9</sup> That is, from the mind of the composer to the mind of the listener.

Thus, when we think analytically about music, what we ordinarily do is describe practices of the mind (the composer’s choices) for the sake of informing the practices of other minds (who will assign meaning to the resulting sounds). We locate musical meaning in the audible communication of one creating mind to a co-creator, one whose highly attentive listening is in effect a shared tendency of the composer’s subject position. We end by ignoring the fact that these practices of the mind are

---

<sup>5</sup> *ibid.*, 4.

<sup>6</sup> Walser, 121.

<sup>7</sup> Suzanne Cusick, “Feminist Theory, Music Theory and the Mind/body Split,” *Perspectives of New Music* 32:1 (Winter 1994): 9.

<sup>8</sup> *ibid.*, 15.

<sup>9</sup> *ibid.*, 16.

non-practices without the bodily practices they call for – about which it has become unthinkable to think.<sup>10</sup>

Cusick, then, seems to believe that in order for musicologists to liberate themselves from the mind/body split which has preoccupied most of Western philosophy they must consult those who are intimately aware of the role of the body in music, the performer. Her reasoning for attending to the performer is that it is precisely the performers who are ignored when considering music as a mind-mind game.<sup>11</sup> The performers are particularly important to Cusick because they understand the music differently than listeners. Performers understand the music as something you do, the motor skills involved in making the (score) music.<sup>12</sup> Musicologists have not traditionally called on performers to help interpret musical works. In fact, unlike other areas of research, musicology is one of the only disciplines in which the researchers and practitioners do not have a two-way street. In medical science for example, researchers of cancer are working to provide information to those working directly with cancer patients. Those same researchers also approach practicing doctors for physical data to support their research. The discipline of music does not share this transference of ideas between researcher and practitioner nearly as much as other fields of study. Performers do not often go to musicologists to find out how to play a piece and musicologists do not often go to performers for help in interpreting a piece of music. Although many theorists such as Tovey, Schachter, Lester, and Schenker either are or were performers, it is often because they use technical language that a free flow of information between theorists and performers do not occur. For example, a set theory analysis may not be that informative to a performer, however if the theorist were to explain the relations between sets it may be beneficial. It seems that theorists and musicologists

---

<sup>10</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>11</sup> *ibid.*, 18.

<sup>12</sup> *ibid.*

must work on “translating” their terminology into a more descriptive discourse that performers will be able to utilize. The role of the performer remains important.

To deny musical meaning to things only the performers of a work will know implicitly denies that performers are knowers, knowers whose knowledge comes from their bodies and their minds (knowers whose pleasures come from their bodies and their minds). To deny musical meaning to purely physical, performative things is in effect to transform human performers into machines for the transmission of mind-mind messages between members of a metaphorically disembodied class, and because disembodied, elite.<sup>13</sup>

Both Walser and Cusick emphasize the role of the performer in interpreting music. They have located a problem, and their solution is to find ways of analyzing the body’s role in music making. Although I find their approach to musical understanding interesting, I believe it is a limited viewpoint and only the beginning of an understanding of musical meaning. Even Cusick points out that performers understand music as something you do. I am not suggesting that we deny the role of the performer; however I do not believe understanding music as something you do will offer much to the average listener. Unfortunately there are many more listeners than performers of music. I do not think it is wise to dismiss the listener in determining the body’s role in music. The role of the performer’s body is only one very small portion of the body’s undertakings and interpretations in a given day. i.e. A performer undertakes many bodily actions in a day besides playing his/her instrument. By turning to the performer we continue to perpetuate the notion that music can only be about itself. The body is at the root of so much more than music making in daily activities. This is something that everybody, including the performers have experience with. As we will see in the next chapter, the body is present and helps to interpret endless experiences in a given day. Why then not include all bodily experiences including those of the musical performance when determining the meaning of

---

<sup>13</sup> *ibid.*, 19-20.

music? By doing this we have an opportunity to locate musical meaning outside the music itself.

McClary is one musicologist who has allowed for a more open-ended approach to the role of the body in music. One does not have to be a performer to interpret the role of the body in music.

...when sound waves are assembled in such a way to resemble physical gestures, we as listeners are able to read or to make sense of them, largely by means of our lifelong experiences as embodied creatures.<sup>14</sup>

McClary is suggesting that we are able to interpret the music because it is essentially about us and our social lives. Therefore introducing the bodily element into the interpretation of music is essential to our understanding of it. McClary's explanation of why listeners hear the *Tristan* prelude as expressive of longing shows how this is possible.

...to say one hears sexual longing in the *Tristan* prelude is not to introduce irrelevant 'subjective' data into the discussion...In part Wagner's music draws heavily on his own (excessively documented) experiences in the sexual realm, and we as listeners perceive longing in his music because we are human beings with bodies who have experienced similar feelings firsthand.<sup>15</sup>

In 1977 Roland Barthes suggested that it was time to change the way we interpret music.<sup>16</sup> Barthes' answer to the mind/body split in our interpretation of music is his concept of the "grain of the voice." To Barthes, "The grain of the voice is the body in the voice as it sings, the hand as it writes, the limb as it performs."<sup>17</sup> Clearly to Barthes there is a bodily presence in music which can help us to interpret it. I think Barthes' "grain of the voice" is an important aspect of the role of the body in music. In Barthes' definition of the "grain" he invokes the body three times. It is not necessarily the "grain of the voice" with which I am concerned, but the body that lies behind the "grain." What is at the same

---

<sup>14</sup> McClary, 23.

<sup>15</sup> McClary, 24.

<sup>16</sup> Roland Barthes, "The Grain of the Voice," chap. in *Image - Music - Text*, trans. Stephen Heath (New York: Hill and Want, 1977), 179-189.

time useful and frustrating about Barthes is that he does not define the physical or bodily presence, but leaves it up to the interpreter to decide what role the body plays in the music.

The role of the body in music is not a simple matter to disclose: it is very complex. However if it is ignored, so is the relevance of music to us as people with bodies.

By far the most difficult aspect of music to explain is its uncanny ability to make us experience our bodies in accordance with its gestures and rhythms. Yet this aspect is also what makes music so compelling.<sup>18</sup>

Instinctively we understand the role of the body in music; however we stand to know it more personally if we disregard the mind/body split so prevalent in musicological studies.

We as listeners and critics can hear much of what musical bodies do, and in so hearing we more fully know the Mind/body resolution which music promises – even if we know it only with our minds. We escape the limitations of the mind-mind game by acknowledging our descriptions (analyses, hearings) the mediations and meanings of bodies. Thus, we stand to know music more intimately if we know it as a complex conversation of (situated) minds and (situated) bodies.<sup>19</sup>

Having reviewed the mind/body split in musicology, we are now able to turn to the issue of emotions and music.

The study of emotions and music, a division of the overall study of musicology, has not been exempt from the problem of the mind/body split. Basically there are three theories of emotion and music. Firstly that music is expressive of emotions, secondly that music arouses emotions and thirdly that music neither expresses nor arouses emotions. I find that it is those theories which engage the role of the body in music that provide the most convincing answers to the questions of music and emotions, whether that question asks whether music arouses emotions or whether music is expressive of emotions. The theories that ignore the role of the body do not, (in my opinion), address the most interesting matters concerning music and emotion.

---

<sup>17</sup> *ibid.*, 188.

<sup>18</sup> McClary, 23.

<sup>19</sup> Cusick, 21.

Looking for the answer to the question of music and emotions solely in the formal structure of the music does not address the issue adequately. Several authors whose ideas I will outline in this chapter, including Eduard Hanslick, Leonard Meyer, Jenefer Robinson and Deryck Cooke, have used this approach, ignoring the role of the body in formulating their own theories of emotion and music. By ignoring the role of the body in music's expression or arousal of emotions they have ignored an enormously important facet of human emotions. However, despite their emphasis on formalist, abstract, intellectual readings of music, it is interesting to note how often the role of the body emerges in their writings. These authors do their best to suppress the bodily function of music by emphasizing the importance of the formal structure of the music, yet they cannot escape the presence of the body.

On the other hand, those theorists who include the role of the body in their theories of emotion and music argue more successfully for the idea that music expresses or arouses emotions. Peter Kivy, Stephen Davies, and Aaron Ridley, whose theories I will also examine here, have included the role of the body in music by likening the "timbre, dynamics, movement, phrase shape, harmony and rhythm of music"<sup>20</sup> to the vocal and physical expressive behaviors of emotions.<sup>21</sup> By bringing the role of the body into their theories of emotion and music, these authors are able to construct more convincing arguments.

### **Issues Surrounding the Question of Music and Emotions**

The question of music and emotions is one which philosophers have considered in great detail. In the philosophical arguments surrounding the question of music and

---

<sup>20</sup> Aaron Ridley, "Musical Sympathies: The Experience of Expressive Music," *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 47/1 (Winter 1989): 49

emotions there are many issues that have been debated. First of all, discussing the philosopher's music of choice--instrumental and non-programmatic--in terms of emotions is difficult because this music has no object. As Aaron Ridley suggests, even if music is expressive of emotions,

...music can show us no objects; music can never show us what an emotion is about; and hence music cannot resemble behavior which is expressive of any emotion whose prime distinguishing features include its object. All music can do is to resemble pieces of expressive behavior in isolation from the contexts in which what they express is fully distinctive....without some indication of what an emotion is about, what remains is unspecific.<sup>22</sup>

This argument suggests that a person requires an object with which to identify or experience an emotion, that we are incapable of experiencing an emotion unless something has caused it. Ridley uses the emotion fear to explain why an object is so important in determining a precise emotion. "Any attempt to distinguish between a fear-of-the-dentist emotion for instance, and a fear-of-Satanism emotion will be incomplete without some sort of reference to the differences between dentists and Satanism."<sup>23</sup> This sort of argument does not leave much room for the role of the imagination. Surely we are able to recognize music as similar to personal emotional experiences and differentiate between them.

Alan Goldman, who has researched the question of how music arouses emotions, continues to query music's lack of object: "Music is not the object of sadness – we are not sad about the music."<sup>24</sup> Goldman is suggesting that "we do not ascribe emotion terms to all causes and effects of emotions, but only to their objects and expressions."<sup>25</sup> Once again it is possible that as listeners we could identify with something in the music reminding us of a personal experience for an emotion to be aroused. What I am addressing here is beyond

---

<sup>21</sup> Ridley, "Musical Sympathies," Stephen Davies, *Musical Meaning and Expression* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1994). Peter Kivy, *The Corded Shell: Reflections on Musical Expression* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1980).

<sup>22</sup> Ridley., 50.

<sup>23</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>24</sup> Alan Goldman, "Emotions in Music (A Postscript)," *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 53:1 (Winter 1995): 59.

personal associations; for example, always hearing Pachelbel's Canon in D as sad because they played it at your Grandma's funeral. Beyond those types of associations there are gestures in the music which several people would be able to recognize as sad, for example, a slow descending melodic minor line. I will show in the next chapter that this goes beyond conventional associations or musical gestures that have come to mean certain things through use. I will show how it is through everyday bodily experiences of sadness that we understand the descending line as sad.

The lack of object raises yet another question when dealing specifically with the arousal of emotions when listening to music. Normally emotions are aroused through an object. Goldman asks the question: *how* then can music arouse emotions?<sup>26</sup> Goldman's answer is unsatisfactory. His conclusion to this question is that the music creates an "imaginary art world."<sup>27</sup> Within this imaginary world we are able to react emotionally.

[We] experience the feelings, as I have maintained, but that these result from our recognition that we are to imagine the contents of the beliefs that would ordinarily give rise to the full-blown emotions...we react emotionally to the imaginary worlds of the artworks. We do not imagine that we are sad, but we have feelings of sadness in the contexts of the works' worlds.<sup>28</sup>

Goldman is suggesting we imagine a situation where we would normally experience an emotion. Once we have imagined this situation of emotion we experience the emotion in an imaginary way. I do not believe that this philosophically convoluted imaginary art world is necessary. It is simply a clever way to dodge an issue. Most importantly though, he is suggesting that within this imaginary art world sad music is going to make us sad. I think that arousal theories of emotions go beyond this simple and disputable idea.

Finally, Davies shows another point of view relating to the lack of an object: "Emotions are felt and necessarily involve thoughts, but music is nonsentient, it feels and

---

<sup>25</sup> *ibid.*, 59.

<sup>26</sup> *ibid.*, 61.

<sup>27</sup> *ibid.*, 65.

<sup>28</sup> *ibid.*, 65, 66.

thinks nothing”<sup>29</sup> This argument is probably inconsequential since I am concerned primarily with the effect emotion has on the human listening subject. However, Davies’ feels that the answer to this question is important. He suggests that the emotions found in music are of a *distinctive type* as they are not felt and they lack emotional objects.<sup>30</sup> They may not be different from “everyday” emotions but Goldman suggests they are “distinct.” Once again, Davies has us entering a fairy tale land where emotions in music are a distinctive type. If we are to identify them as a certain type of emotion, they obviously cannot be that distinctive from everyday emotions.

Another major problem with the expression of emotions in music is that it seems to work only in broad categories.<sup>31</sup>

... experiments that indicate consistent connotations of emotion, with major and minor modes for examples show that this consistency applies only within the broadest categories such as happy and sad, demonstrated in a bipolar, forced choice kind of condition.<sup>32</sup>

The participants in the experiment were played a musical example in a major mode and were asked whether the example expressed happiness or sadness. In situations such as this the results were consistent, however if participants were asked to agree on whether the music was blissful the results were less agreeable in most cases. As will be seen in the next chapter, this problem can be solved by introducing the concept of polysemy, which suggests that one signifier can mean many things.

Goldman suggests that there are specific musical gestures which sound sad, happy, or angry; however, when one inspects emotions such as melancholy and anguish there are more musical gestures which correspond to these emotions and less agreement on them.

With such broadly specified mood properties as sadness or anger, the relation may well be one-many, because qualified listeners may well agree

---

<sup>29</sup> Stephen Davies, *Musical Meaning and Expression* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1994), 201.

<sup>30</sup> *ibid.*, 202.

<sup>31</sup> Joseph P. Swain, “The Range of Musical Semantics,” *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 54:2 (Spring 1996): 135.

<sup>32</sup> *ibid.*, 135.

on their presence in various musical passages. But if instead we think of melancholic versus funereal versus anguished, or furious versus stormy versus sullen then such agreements may vanish and the relations of bases to subjective reactions and full-blown expressive properties becomes more complex.<sup>33</sup>

In relation to the previous point regarding music's lack of object, Goldman makes an interesting observation pertaining to the general nature of musical expression as well.

The noteworthy fact here is that those emotions that can be differentiated without having objects or beliefs about them are precisely the ones that music is ordinarily said to express such as sadness or anger, but not jealousy or contempt.<sup>34</sup>

Davies suggests that music's ability to express only general emotions results from the fact that not all emotions have natural primary expressions. He uses the examples: hope, embarrassment, puzzlement and envy, what he calls "Platonic attitudes" to back up his point.<sup>35</sup> Essentially Davies believes these "higher emotions" are thoughts and feelings without corresponding "emotion characteristics in appearance."<sup>36</sup> Davies provides a good explanation for why music seems only to express general emotions. If we can only recognize certain emotions in humans then it follows that we would only be able to recognize those emotions in music. However, consider the examples that Davies uses. Is it really true that we cannot recognize hope, embarrassment, puzzlement, annoyance and envy in others? With the exception of hope and envy I believe we could probably recognize embarrassment with blushing and retracting posture, puzzlement as a sort of questioning frown, and annoyance with something like tapping of the feet or hands on the waist. I believe with enough research into these higher emotions one could probably determine what somebody looks like when expressing them.

---

<sup>33</sup> Goldman, 61.

<sup>34</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>35</sup> Davies, 226.

<sup>36</sup> *ibid.*

I have outlined several problems that arise when discussing music and emotions as a background an examination of some of the prevalent theories that have been espoused on the subject. It is important to keep these in mind as we now turn to these theories.

### **Some Theories of Music and Emotion**

My goal in discussing some of the theories of music and emotions is to illustrate the wide range of opinions that pervade this field and hopefully in so doing show why those which acknowledge the role of the body are so useful. It is not my task to provide a comprehensive survey here; within this section, I have chosen to explore the music and emotions theories of Eduard Hanslick, Leonard Meyer, Deryck Cooke, Peter Kivy, Stephen Davies, Aaron Ridley and Jenefer Robinson. Hanslick, Meyer, Cooke and Kivy are clearly authorities on the matter and as such cannot be ignored. However, beyond that it was important to discuss Hanslick and Meyer in order to show traditional and formal accounts of music and emotions. Two formalist view points were chosen because they stand on either side of the issue. Hanslick does not believe that music can either express or arouse emotions, whereas Meyer believes that music does arouse emotions. Robinson was included to show that Meyer's thoughts are not dated and that many theorists are still very much in line with this thinking. Cooke was chosen to show how the issue of music and emotions has moved away from the formalist tendencies of Hanslick and Meyer. Kivy's theory of the expression of emotion in music is included because he has shown the importance of the role of the body to musical expression. Finally I have included Davies and Ridley to show the widespread influence of Kivy's ideas and how they have been expanded.

#### **Eduard Hanslick**

Eduard Hanslick wrote *Vom Musikalisch-Schönen* in 1854. "*The Beautiful in Music* deals with the major problems of musical aesthetics: the aim of music, its intrinsic

nature, the relation between music and reality, and the role of the listener.”<sup>37</sup> Hanslick does not believe that music is capable of expressing emotions or feelings. To him, music is simply organized sound which means nothing and therefore cannot be *about* anything. With these ideas in mind Hanslick suggests, “The essence of music is sound in motion.”<sup>38</sup> Even if music were capable of expressing emotions, Hanslick does not believe this is the most valuable component of music, aesthetically speaking.

Hanslick begins by differentiating between how musical aesthetics have historically viewed the question of emotion and his preferred idea of musical aesthetics. Historically, the aesthetics of music had been primarily concerned with the beauty of music being in direct relation to the sensations aroused. Hanslick, on the other hand, suggests that musical form itself is beautiful, an idea which he believed had not previously been subject to aesthetic negotiations.

The task of clearly realizing music as a self-subsistent form of the beautiful has hitherto presented insurmountable difficulties to musical aesthetics and dictates of ‘emotion’ still haunt their domain in broad daylight.<sup>39</sup>

To Hanslick, it is the music itself that makes music beautiful. Morris Weitz, the editor of the English translation of *The Beautiful in Music*, concludes that Hanslick believed that “Music is essentially certain tones in their harmonic and rhythmic relations. The art, the beauty of music consists in these sounds and not their representational values.”<sup>40</sup>

Hanslick believes that both premises of musical expression--the idea that music arouses emotion and the idea that emotions are the subject matter of music--are false. He is not denying that the beauty of musical form may arouse feeling; however this feeling does not affect the formal object in question. “Art aims, above all, at producing something beautiful which affects not our feelings but the organ of pure contemplation, our

---

<sup>37</sup> Hanslick, ix.

<sup>38</sup> *ibid.*, x.

<sup>39</sup> *ibid.*, 9.

<sup>40</sup> *ibid.*, xi.

imagination.”<sup>41</sup> He suggests that if music is to be treated as art, it is our imagination, not our feelings which should judge it aesthetically.<sup>42</sup> He is very mistrustful of emotional explanations of music. Hanslick suggests that because music is incapable of specific concrete representations it cannot be about anything. There is no vocabulary of fixed items where a specific sound means a specific thing.<sup>43</sup> He believes that we continue to falsely ascribe the character of the music itself because of our mental constitution, words, titles, and other conventional associations.<sup>44</sup> Further, because the arousal of emotions in music is not inevitable, exclusive or uniform, Hanslick does not believe that it can be valid.

Hanslick argues that music cannot be expressive of emotion because definite feelings and emotions are incapable of being embodied in music.

The beautiful melody and the skillful harmony as such do not charm us, but only what they imply: the whispering of love, or the clamor of ardent combatants.

In order to escape from such vague notions we must, first of all, sever from their habitual associations metaphors of the above description. The whispering may be expressed, true, but not the whispering of love; the clamor may be reproduced undoubtedly, but not the clamor of ardent combatants. Music may reproduce phenomena such as whispering, storming, roaring, but the feeling of love or anger have only a subjective existence.<sup>45</sup>

Hanslick concludes his argument against the expression of emotion in music by stating that the composer does not intend for the melodies s/he writes to be anything more than purely musical. That is, “the melody aims at nothing beyond itself.”<sup>46</sup> Hanslick also argues against various keys, chords, and timbres having a character of their own due to the inconsistency in emotive association.<sup>47</sup> He would suggest that the idea that the key of G

---

<sup>41</sup> *ibid.*, 11.

<sup>42</sup> *ibid.*, 12.

<sup>43</sup> *ibid.*, x.

<sup>44</sup> *ibid.*, 14.

<sup>45</sup> *ibid.*, 21.

<sup>46</sup> *ibid.*, 23.

<sup>47</sup> *ibid.*, 25.

major expresses gaiety a “psychophysiological relation.”<sup>48</sup> These ideas are not related to our emotions, but only the meanings we ourselves attach to them. Hanslick is suggesting that an isolated musical example cannot represent something because it has meaning only in its place within a particular piece of music.<sup>49</sup> Hanslick believes that “a formal reading destroys all false constructions,”<sup>50</sup> the false constructions being that music is expressive of emotions

Clearly, then, Hanslick is arguing that the beautiful in music does not depend on representing feelings. However, a closer inspection of his text does show that he allows some instances of emotional expression in music. Because of musical characteristics, Hanslick admits that there are certain aesthetic qualities present in music which listeners call “graceful, gentle, violent, vigorous, elegant and fresh.”<sup>51</sup> Although he would allow the gracefulness to be present in the sounds, he does not believe that gracefulness can be represented by them.<sup>52</sup> In other words, it is not that the music, “symbolizes anything graceful or even any feeling of gracefulness.”<sup>53</sup> Instead Hanslick believes that its lingering character as sound is graceful. “The gracefulness is presented in the sounds, it is not represented by them.”<sup>54</sup> Hanslick does believe that music could represent certain prominent features of our emotions. This occurs through what he calls emotion’s dynamic properties:

What part of the feelings, then, can music represent, if not the subject involved in them? Only their dynamic properties. It may reproduce the motion accompanying psychical action, according to its momentum: speed, slowness, strength, weakness, increasing and decreasing intensity.<sup>55</sup>

But, according to Hanslick, because motion is only one element of emotions, music cannot represent emotions.

---

<sup>48</sup> *ibid.*, 26.

<sup>49</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>50</sup> *ibid.*, 28.

<sup>51</sup> *ibid.*, xi.

<sup>52</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>53</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>54</sup> *ibid.*

it [music] may reproduce the motion accompanying the physical action, according to its momentum; speed, slowness, strength, weakness, increasing and decreasing intensity. But motion is only one of the concomitants of feeling, not the feeling itself.<sup>56</sup>

Take Hanslick's example of love: "Music cannot represent love, for example, but it can represent its dynamic element of movement, its waxing or waning character, which it has in common with all emotional states."<sup>57</sup> Although music is capable of representing the dynamic qualities of emotion, Hanslick maintains that this has no part in the beauty of music which is based only on the relationship between sounds.<sup>58</sup> In the introduction to *The Beautiful in Music*, Morris Weitz suggests,

Hanslick, consequently, is a heteronomist in this limited sense: music is the language of the dynamic properties of emotions and can be said to mean, i.e. represent or to denote these properties. But, he adds, this linguistic feature is no part of the beauty of music, which consists entirely of the tones in their musical relationships.<sup>59</sup>

Hanslick believes that listening to music should be a

painstaking attending to the unfolding of the tonal combinations, much more an intellectual and imaginative procedure than an emotional one. The enjoyment or disappointment derived from understanding the progression of sounds are the only legitimate emotional accompaniments of proper musical response.<sup>60</sup>

### Leonard Meyer

Leonard Meyer's study of emotion and meaning in music poses the question: what constitutes musical meaning and by what process is it communicated?<sup>61</sup> His book, *Emotion and Meaning in Music* was written in 1956 at a time when the subjective responses of listeners were not trusted. This belief that listeners were not to be trusted was initiated by Hanslick and had been magnified by the mid-twentieth century. Scholars of

---

<sup>55</sup> *ibid.*, 24.

<sup>56</sup> *ibid.*, xi.

<sup>57</sup> *ibid.*, xii.

<sup>58</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>59</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>60</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>61</sup> Leonard Meyer, *Emotion and Meaning in Music*, (Chicago: U of Chicago Press, 1956), 34.

music became increasingly interested in the formal design of music relying completely on “the music itself” for answers. Meyer’s study determines how music can be objectively determined as emotional without involving the listener. He does not believe that music is able to convey referential meaning, that is meaning outside itself, for two reasons. Firstly he does not believe that music is capable of referential meaning because referential meanings are not “natural or universal.”<sup>62</sup> The referential meanings are simply a product of learning experience according to Meyer: they do not exist objectively in the world. Meyer is suggesting that once we have learned the stylistic norms of the particular music in question, everyone’s reactions to the music should be the same.<sup>63</sup> Secondly, referential meanings are not specific to their denotation.<sup>64</sup> Meyer, like Hanslick, is more interested in “the understanding of and response to relationships inherent in the musical progress rather than with any relationships between the musical organization and the extra-musical world of concepts, actions, characters and situations.”<sup>65</sup> He has found a way to explain how the sound patterns heard by listeners become experienced as emotions.

...the customary or expected progression of sounds can be considered as a norm, which from a stylistic point of view it is; and alteration in the expected progression can be considered a deviation. Hence deviations can be regarded as emotional or affective stimuli. The importance of this ‘objective’ point of view of musical experience is clear. It means that once the norms of a style have been ascertained, the study and analysis of the affective content of a particular work in that style can be made without continual and explicit reference to the responses of the listener or critic. That is, subjective content can be discussed objectively.<sup>66</sup>

Meyer’s idea of musical meaning is problematic for many reasons. It allows only one way of reading a piece of music. By doing so Meyer hoped his theory of emotions and meaning in music would supply the natural or universal meanings that others have been unable to prove. It also allows only a small population of musically educated people to understand

---

<sup>62</sup> *ibid.*, 2.

<sup>63</sup> *ibid.*, 6.

<sup>64</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>65</sup> *ibid.*, 3.

music. Since the meaning is found in the music alone, it denies that music is a social construction. Finally, it explains only our *reaction* to the music and not the content of it or its meaning.

Meyer doesn't trust the descriptions of listeners as he believes them to be doubtful and misleading. According to Meyer, the answers are in the music itself. In this way an abstract, non-referential succession of tones become meaningful. Basically, Meyer believes that the question of a single tone or series of tones is pointless because they are only meaningful if they point to something beyond themselves.<sup>67</sup> The idea of "something beyond themselves" occurs only in the context of an entire piece. In the spirit of the nineteenth century notion of organicism and holism, Meyer is asking us to look further in the music as it occurs in time to what the single tone or succession of tones means in the context of the entire piece.

... the relationships existing between tones themselves or those existing between the tones and the things they designated or connote, though a product of cultural experience, are real connections existing objectively in culture. They are not arbitrary connections imposed by the capricious mind of the particular listener.<sup>68</sup>

In this case, the cultural experience Meyer is referring to is that of correctly listening to the piece once the stylistic norms have been ascertained.

Meyer believes that the disagreement over what music communicates results from a misunderstanding of the definition of meaning.<sup>69</sup> The definition of meaning which he uses is as follows, "...anything acquires meaning if it is connected with or indicates or refers to, something beyond itself so that its full nature points to and is revealed in that connection."<sup>70</sup> Through this general definition, Meyer is stressing the importance of context to the meaning of a stimulus. We must hear the complete piece before we can determine the

---

<sup>66</sup> *ibid.*, 31.

<sup>67</sup> *ibid.*, 34.

<sup>68</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>69</sup> *ibid.*, 32.

meaning of the minor third ascending melody line in bar two. We therefore can misunderstand or misinterpret the meaning of the minor third if we do not understand the style of music in question. I am the first to agree that context is extremely important to meaning; however his definition of meaning is very interesting for another reason. The ideas that “anything acquires meaning if it is connected to or refers to something beyond itself” seems to work against his belief that music can only be about itself. His own definition of meaning would seem to imply that music can mean something outside of itself as long as a connection is made. Meyer is referring to later events in the piece when he says “beyond itself.” However, it would seem from this definition that music could be about a waterfall as long as a connection is made between the music and the waterfall. For example the sound of the music could take the shape of a waterfall.

Meyer’s theory states that “emotion is evoked when a tendency to respond is inhibited.”<sup>71</sup> The idea of “tendency to respond is inhibited” is what was referred to earlier as a stimulus. A deviation from a stylistic norm in the course of the piece of music in question would cause a tendency to respond. However, musical experience does differ from regular experiences in three ways. Firstly, Meyer realizes that with an affective experience one is usually aware and knowledgeable of the affective stimulus. He goes on to state that the stimuli for music are non-referential,<sup>72</sup> they do not refer to things outside the musical work. Secondly, Meyer’s “inhibition of tendencies,”<sup>73</sup> or emotions as we understand them, go unresolved and eventually dissipate. With music the “inhibition of tendencies” is resolved.<sup>74</sup> What Meyer is trying to say here is that in real life emotions tend to dissipate more than they are resolved, however in art tendencies are resolved and thus

---

<sup>70</sup> *ibid.*, 34.

<sup>71</sup> *ibid.*, 22. I take inhibition of tendencies to be equal to an emotional reaction because Meyer states, “emotion is evoked when a tendency to respond is inhibited.”

<sup>72</sup> *ibid.*, 23.

<sup>73</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>74</sup> *ibid.*

concluded. Finally, Meyer points out that in real life the stimulus which keeps a tendency from resolving may be different from the activating stimulus. For example a psychic need may be resolved physically. With music the stimulus (the music itself) activates, inhibits, and resolves tendencies.<sup>75</sup> This may be true, but would it not follow that a *different* kind of musical stimulus would be doing the activation, from the inhibition, and resolution? By this I mean that it is going to be a different kind or style of music within a given piece depending on whether it activates, inhibits or resolves emotions in the listener. Put quite simply, the music will be different depending on whether it is activating or resolving. For example the antecedent part of a phrase would likely activate emotions in the listener, whereas the consequent would resolve emotions.

Meyer goes on to answer the question, how do musical stimuli arouse and inhibit tendencies thereby giving rise to emotions?<sup>76</sup> A tendency is a patterned reaction that operates when stimulated.

A pattern reaction consists of a set or series of regularly coincident mental or motor responses which, once brought into play as part of the response to a given stimulus, follow a previously ordered course, unless inhibited or blocked in some way. The order established by a pattern reaction is both temporal and structural, that is, the series involves not only the relation of parts of the total pattern to each other but also their timing.

All tendencies then are simply expectations which can be conscious or unconscious.<sup>77</sup>

Tendency leads the listener through various possible situations to a consequence.

However, the consequence is always implied in the tendency.<sup>78</sup> The expectation, then, is a rather general thing because we are essentially unaware of the outcome of future events.<sup>79</sup>

At other times expectation is more general; that is, though our expectations may be definite, in the sense of being marked, they are non-specific, in that we are not sure precisely how they will be fulfilled. The antecedent

---

<sup>75</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>76</sup> *ibid.*, 24.

<sup>77</sup> *ibid.*, 24-25.

<sup>78</sup> *ibid.*, 25.

<sup>79</sup> *ibid.*, 27.

stimulus situation may be such that several consequents may be almost equally probable.<sup>80</sup>

Meyer suggests that it is the ignorance of future events which arouses emotions in the listener.<sup>81</sup> The emotion may be one of apprehension or of optimism, because if you do not know what is coming, the outcome may still be good.<sup>82</sup> These feelings of anxiety and optimism are tendencies which focus on the resolution of the unpleasant situation.<sup>83</sup> Meyer states that the greater the build up of suspense, the greater the emotional release upon resolution.<sup>84</sup> With music our expectations are based on probabilities of the particular type or style of composition in question.<sup>85</sup>

Most expectation is unconscious; it only becomes conscious when a tendency has been inhibited.<sup>86</sup> This leads to the central thesis of Meyer's study: "Affect or emotion felt is aroused when an expectation – a tendency to respond – activated by the musical stimulus situation, is temporarily inhibited or permanently blocked."<sup>87</sup> Essentially, deviations from the norm are the emotional or affective stimuli.<sup>88</sup> When a stimulus makes the listener expect a consequent, it has meaning, if it does not arouse expectation, it does not have meaning.<sup>89</sup>

Clearly Meyer is denying any role that the body may contribute to musical meaning besides its reactions to formal elements and even these reactions are considered to be a matter of the mind. I find Meyer's theory unsatisfactory because it ignores so much of human emotion. It does not take into consideration emotions such as grief, joy, anger, and

---

<sup>80</sup> *ibid.*, 47.

<sup>81</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>82</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>83</sup> *ibid.*, 28.

<sup>84</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>85</sup> *ibid.*, 29.

<sup>86</sup> *ibid.*, 31.

<sup>87</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>88</sup> *ibid.*, 32.

<sup>89</sup> *ibid.*, 35.

other feelings which we would normally conceive of as emotions. Meyer completely ignores this type of emotion in favour of reactions to formal elements.

### **Jenefer Robinson**

Jenefer Robinson, like Meyer, believes that music both expresses emotions and affects us emotionally.<sup>90</sup> Robinson is interested in the link between the expression and affect of the emotion. She is asking the question: “Are the grounds on which we attribute the expression of emotion to music ever to be identified with the arousal of that same emotion in listeners?”<sup>91</sup> Robinson suggests that the feelings evoked in the listener by the music are not necessarily the same as those exposed in the music.<sup>92</sup> Unlike other supporters of the arousal theory who show that music affects our emotions through cognitive mediation, Robinson is interested in how music *directly* affects our feelings.<sup>93</sup> Like Meyer, Robinson believes that the emotions aroused by the music are a result of the formal and structural developments in a piece.

There are, after all, moments in music which make us jump or startle us. Similarly, the perception of certain rhythms may be enough – without further cognitive mediation – to evoke tension or relaxation, excitement or calm.<sup>94</sup>

Robinson calls this affective response to music which does not require much cognitive mediation the more “primitive” emotions aroused by music.<sup>95</sup> She goes on to explain:

If the melodic and harmonic elements in a piece of music affect our emotions, this would seem to require familiarity with the stylistic norms of the piece, but no further cognitions need be required in order for us to feel soothed, unsettled, surprised, or excited by developments in the music.<sup>96</sup>

---

<sup>90</sup> Jenefer Robinson, “The Expression and Arousal of Emotion in Music,” *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 52:1 (Winter 1994): 13.

<sup>91</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>92</sup> *ibid.*, 18.

<sup>93</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>94</sup> *ibid.*, 18 - 19.

<sup>95</sup> *ibid.*, 18.

<sup>96</sup> *ibid.*, 19.

Robinson believes that the direct arousal of simple emotions in the listener leads to the understanding of the formal and expressive properties of the music.

...the expressiveness of the piece as a whole can only be grasped if the listener's feelings are aroused in such a way that they provide a clue to both the formal and expressive structure of the piece as it develops through time.<sup>97</sup>

From Robinson's analysis we can conclude that complex emotional states such as "stabs of pain or unrequited passion"<sup>98</sup> are not normally aroused in the listener but only expressed by the music.<sup>99</sup> Robinson does not get into how stabs of pain are expressed by the music because she is suggesting that any analysis of the emotions expressed in the music should begin with the identification of the emotions aroused by the listener and nothing else.<sup>100</sup> It seems to me that Robinson is relying on a listener who is familiar with the style in question, one who is aware when they should be soothed, unsettled, surprised, or excited by things happening in the music. Her theory explains the passing reactions we have to music as it develops through time, however it does not get at the complex emotions which music is said to express. Instead, Robinson's theory can only point to where these emotions occur in the formal structure of the music. By explaining the emotional reaction to the music, Robinson successfully avoids placing the meaning of music outside the realm of the music itself. She brings in the body since she acknowledges the reaction it has to the music. I do not think there are many people that would deny that we experience the simple emotions such as surprise, tension and relief, that she has outlined, however I question whether fleeting emotional reactions as the piece occurs through time are the emotions we are really interested in exploring when we talk about emotions and music. I believe we are interested in everyday emotions such as joy, sorrow, anger, fear.

---

<sup>97</sup> *ibid.*, 21.

<sup>98</sup> *ibid.*, 19.

<sup>99</sup> *ibid.*, 21.

<sup>100</sup> *ibid.*

## Deryck Cooke

At the time Cooke wrote *The Language of Music*, music was considered a “pure, inexpressive art.”<sup>101</sup> Most scholars of music at this time were solely concerned with musical form as the answer to the meaning of music. Rather than explore the subjective, referential meanings of music, writers clung to objective data. Cooke departs from this environment in trying to explain how music expresses emotion. He remains in the objective realm, however, by feeling the need to provide definite dictionary-style definitions of the elements of music to emotion. He strives to define the precise emotional meaning of the elements of music. For example if you look up a rising major third in his book, Cooke defines it as “settled pleasure.”<sup>102</sup> Cooke attempts to show how musical form, including pitch, rhythm and dynamics, produce the expression of emotion in music. He assumes that the reason music has been regarded as a pure and inexpressive art is due to the perceived imprecision of the emotion expressed. He considers music a language which music critics can expound upon and interpret. In order to understand music as the expression of emotion Cooke believes that we need to decipher the musical language by translating it; that once we understand the language of music, listeners will be able to agree upon what a given piece expresses.

It (the book) attempts to show that the conception of music as a language capable of expressing certain very definite things is not a romantic aberration, but has been the common unconscious assumption of composers for the past five and a half centuries at least. It attempts to isolate the various means of expression available to the composer – the various procedures in the dimension of pitch, time, and volume – and to discover what emotional effects these procedures can produce; but more specifically, it tries to pinpoint the inherent emotional characters of the various notes of the major, minor, and chromatic scales, and of certain basic melodic patterns which have been used persistently throughout our musical history.<sup>103</sup>

---

<sup>101</sup> Deryck Cooke, *The Language of Music* (London: Oxford University Press, 1959), ix.

<sup>102</sup> *ibid.*, 51.

<sup>103</sup> *ibid.*, xi-xii.

Cooke attempts to systematize the relationship between musical gestures and the emotional qualities he believes them to represent, creating a list of gestures and the emotions to which they correspond. This objectification of emotion in music rigidly prescribes what musical gestures must mean. Because Cooke believes musical works are built on tensions between notes, he decides to break the tensions down into the three dimensions of pitch, time and volume, looking at both harmony and melody separately. The “characterizing agents” of these elements are tone colour and texture.

Cooke regards the pitch tensions in two different ways, firstly tonal tensions and secondly, intervallic tensions. Both tensions can occur either harmonically or melodically.<sup>104</sup> Cooke finds the pitch relationships of tonality extremely important to the expressive language of music.<sup>105</sup> The elements of time which Cooke explores are measured time (the rhythmic accent), tempo, type of movement (for example, equal or jerky), and phrasing (staccato or legato).<sup>106</sup> Cooke’s idea of volume simply refers to whether a note is louder or softer. The characterizing agents then modify the tensions set up by pitch, tempo and dynamics.<sup>107</sup>

Cooke begins his definitions by exploring the tonal tensions which investigate what the notes of the scale are and what tensions exist between them.<sup>108</sup> From there he interprets the meaning of the major and minor scales. Cooke states what we have intuitively known for a long time, that the positive emotions (joy, confidence, love, serenity and triumph) are associated with the major scale, whereas the negative emotions (fear, hate, disgust and despair) are associated with the minor scale.<sup>109</sup> Cooke offers several examples from musical literature in both the major and minor modes to back up his point. Beyond that,

---

<sup>104</sup> *ibid.*, 34-35.

<sup>105</sup> *ibid.*, 38.

<sup>106</sup> *ibid.*, 37.

<sup>107</sup> *ibid.*, 38.

<sup>108</sup> *ibid.*, 40.

<sup>109</sup> *ibid.*, 50-51.

Cooke finds it an, “undeniable fact that composers throughout the centuries...have expressed painful emotion by bringing the minor third into prominence melodically or harmonically.”<sup>110</sup> The only further proof that Cooke provides is that “the strong contrast between the ‘natural’ pleasurable major third and the ‘unnatural’ painful minor third has been exploited throughout our musical history.”<sup>111</sup>

After discussing basic tonal tensions and major and minor modes, Cooke begins to interpret all the major and minor intervals. He offers definitions such as the major third expresses pleasure whereas the minor third has a depressed sound.<sup>112</sup> The major sixth represents an unsatisfied, longing for pleasure, and the minor seventh expresses melancholy.<sup>113</sup>

More relevant to my study is the manner in which Cooke discusses the “vitalizing agents” such as volume, time, and pitch. Despite writing at a very formalistic and mind-oriented time in musical studies, he discusses these elements in relation to the body. Cooke begins by noting the connection between human experience and volume.

The vitalizing agents, however, also function in another field – that of speech; and we can get a broad idea of their effect by briefly considering their behaviour in this field. If we think of a group of people talking, it is obvious that, the more excited they become, the louder, quicker, and higher their voices will get; the more relaxed they become, the softer, slower, and lower they will speak. And the effects of the three different elements can be roughly isolated as follows. The louder a person speaks, the more emphasis he gives to what he is saying; the quieter he speaks the more animated he is becoming; the higher his voice rises, the more he is asserting himself.<sup>114</sup>

Cooke also discusses pitch in terms of physical experience.

Pitch is felt by everyone to be an ‘up-and-down’ dimension. I say everyone, though there are those who hold that this is an illusion; that there is no reason for calling notes with more vibrations per second ‘higher’, except in so far as they have always been written higher on the staff. In

---

<sup>110</sup> *ibid.*, 58.

<sup>111</sup> *ibid.*, 60.

<sup>112</sup> *ibid.*, 51, 57.

<sup>113</sup> *ibid.*, ?

<sup>114</sup> *ibid.*, 94.

answer to this, it should hardly be necessary to point out the connection between the following facts: (1) By the law of gravity, 'up' is an effort for man, 'down' is a relaxation; (2) To sing 'high' notes, or play them on wind, brass, or string instruments, demands a considerable effort; (3) To tune a string 'upwards', one screws 'up' its tension; (4) Scientists, talking of 'high' notes, speak of a 'high' number of vibrations per second<sup>115</sup>

He also relates his ideas on time to physical experience.

The reason why even and dotted rhythms function as they do is clearly connected with the human activities of walking and running (smooth motion, slow and quick); limping and skipping (jerky motion, slow and quick); and slow marching (jerky motion, ceremonial); and the antithesis needs no further elaboration.<sup>116</sup>

Finally, Cooke puts all the vitalizing agents together in their relation to the body.

The same correspondences exist in the field of physical action: compare the high state of excitement inherent in running uphill, quickly and noisily, with the state of relaxation inherent in walking downhill, slowly and quietly. Again, upwards = more assertion; faster = more animation; louder = more emphasis. Hence it is that the high, rising, loud, swift scales at the climax of Beethoven's Overture Leonora No. 3 are about the most invigorating sound in all music, representing life at its most vital; whereas the deep, falling, soft, slow phrases that end Tchaikovsky's Pathétique symphony about the most dispiriting, representing life at its lowest ebb.<sup>117</sup>

Cooke was writing about these exciting relations between the body and music over twenty years before the theories of Lakoff and Johnson even surfaced. Cooke's ideas here are very much in line with the ideas of Lakoff and Johnson and the similarities will be shown in Chapter Two. Beyond these interesting relations between music and body, Cooke does not really develop these ideas any further. The rest of his book consists of cut and dried interpretations of basic musical components.

Cooke turns to interpreting what he calls, "some basic terms of musical vocabulary."<sup>118</sup> By this he means melodic phrases which are prevalent in tonal music. For example the descending 5, 4, 3, 2, 1, pattern of the major scale is said to express, "a sense

---

<sup>115</sup> *ibid.*, 102.

<sup>116</sup> *ibid.*, 101.

<sup>117</sup> *ibid.*, 95.

<sup>118</sup> *ibid.*, 113.

of experiencing joy passively, i.e. accepting or welcoming blessings, relief, consolation, reassurance or fulfillment.”<sup>119</sup>

Cooke believes that the large scale functioning of musical language contributes to the expressions of emotion in music. He suggests that for a work to have formal unity, it must have expressive unity. Therefore “to trace all the main elements in form back to the initial theme would be in fact to trace all the main elements of expression back to the original inspiration.”<sup>120</sup> Cooke then applies this as a method of analysis by pulling out the basic terms of music vocabulary he has outlined in the course of the book which recur throughout a piece.<sup>121</sup> By doing this he is able to reveal the formal and expressive unity of a work.

Although Cooke brings the role of the body into music, he fails to develop these ideas very much in determining the emotional meaning of music. Cooke does however explain music as expressive of emotions that we would expect including melancholy, joy, and fear among others. Cooke, then, brings the human, social element into the understanding of music as emotional.

### **Peter Kivy**

Kivy’s theory of emotional expression in music relies on three basic propositions: speech theory, contour and convention. Kivy strongly disagrees with the arousal theories of musical expressiveness, preferring a theory of musical expression which states that music is expressive *of* a certain emotion. It is not that the music is sad, but that we recognize it as being sad.

Kivy begins his speech theory of musical expression with the vocal music of the early seventeenth century, specifically *stile rappresentativo*. The *Camerata* recommended

---

<sup>119</sup> *ibid.*, 130.

<sup>120</sup> *ibid.*, 230.

<sup>121</sup> *ibid.*, 239.

that the composer ‘represent’ an emotionally charged voice in the vocal line.<sup>122</sup> By following the rise and fall of the speaking voice, *stile rappresentativo* expresses the emotions of the speaker. Kivy’s speech theory suggests that music resembles the passionate speaking voice and the listener recognizes the resemblance.<sup>123</sup> More specifically, the music is sad, for example, by virtue of its representing the expressive tones and other characteristics of the human voice when sad. The listener in turn recognizes and identifies these musical gestures.<sup>124</sup> Kivy suggests that:

we hear sadness in the opening phrase of the *Lamento d’Arianna* [by Monteverdi] to be the expression of sadness (in part) because we hear them as human utterances, and perceive the feature of these utterances as structurally similar to our own voice when we express our own sadness in speech.<sup>125</sup>

However, Kivy proposes that music does not only coincide with the speaking voice when experiencing an emotion. He suggests that music resembles other expressive behaviors such as movement, posture and gesture. This aspect of his theory of emotional expression in music is called the contour theory. Kivy draws this portion of his theory from Johann Mattheson’s *Der Volkommene Capellmeister* (1789). Mattheson states that “music, in its structure, bears resemblance to the ‘emotive life’; and the primary aesthetic response is a cognitive response: a recognition of the emotive content present in it.”<sup>126</sup> Mattheson believes that the structure of music resembles the motion and structure of the Cartesian vital or animal spirits.<sup>127</sup> Kivy suggests that the vital spirits in Mattheson’s version are not only the way we describe the feeling of our emotions, but also the way we describe the feeling of our emotions under their influence.<sup>128</sup> Kivy believes Mattheson is making a formal

---

<sup>122</sup> Peter Kivy, *The Corded Shell: Reflections on Musical Expression* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1980), 64.

<sup>123</sup> *ibid.*, 23.

<sup>124</sup> *ibid.*, 24.

<sup>125</sup> *ibid.*, 51.

<sup>126</sup> Mattheson quoted in Kivy, 39.

<sup>127</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>128</sup> *ibid.*, 40.

analogy between emotive life and the intervallic (harmonic and melodic) structure of music.

The following excerpts from Mattheson prove his point:

Those who are learned in the natural sciences know physically, as it were, how our emotions function. It would be advantageous to the composer to have a little knowledge of this subject.

Since, for example, joy is the result of an expansion of our vital spirits, it follows sensibly and naturally that this affect is best expressed by large and expanded intervals.

Sadness, on the other hand, is caused by contraction of those same subtle parts of our bodies. It is, therefore, easy to see that the narrowest intervals are the most suitable.

Love results from a diffusion of the spirits. Thus, to realize this passion in musical composition, it is best to use intervals of that nature...

Hope is caused by an elevation of the spirits; despair on the other hand, a casting down of the same. These are subjects that can well be represented by sound especially when other circumstances (tempo in particular) contribute their share. In such a manner one can form a concrete picture of all the emotions and try to compose accordingly.<sup>129</sup>

Kivy expands on Mattheson's theory stating that emotive life is more than a private feeling experienced inside of our body – it is also the way we express emotions in gesture, facial configuration, and posture.<sup>130</sup> To Kivy it is *all of* the behavior with which emotions are associated that help to define them.<sup>131</sup> Kivy suggests that we hear music as expressive of sadness because we hear it as a musical resemblance of the gesture and carriage appropriate to the expression of our experience of sadness. "It [the musical line] is a 'sound map' of the human body under the influence of a particular emotion"<sup>132</sup> The musical line becomes a kind of metaphor as it resembles the bodily manifestations of human emotions.<sup>133</sup>

Kivy finds that the most obvious analogue to bodily movement in music is rhythm.<sup>134</sup> He believes that the movement of the human body in all kinds of emotive expression is mirrored by and recognized in music.

---

<sup>129</sup> *ibid.*, 39-40.

<sup>130</sup> *ibid.*, 40.

<sup>131</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>132</sup> *ibid.*, 53.

<sup>133</sup> *ibid.*, 54.

<sup>134</sup> *ibid.*, 55.

To state the most common of commonplaces: of course funeral marches are slow and measured, as sadness slows and measures our expression of it; of course rapid rhythmic pulses in music are suggestive of rapid behaviour under the influence of the lighter emotions; of course jagged and halting rhythms have their direct analogue in human expressive behavior.<sup>135</sup>

This quotation only resolves that slow music is sad. It does not explain what specific emotions are being referred to when stating ‘rapid behavior under the influence of the lighter emotions’, nor does Kivy give any indication of what jagged and halting rhythms express in terms of emotions. Kivy also points out that music is continually described in terms of motion, particularly rising and falling.<sup>136</sup> The rise in pitch has a bodily basis beyond metaphor.

The ‘rise’ in pitch, like the raising of a physical body against gravity, requires, at least in a great many of the most familiar cases, increased energy. And the rise of pitch, both in natural organisms and machines, betokens a rise in energy level. The faster the wings beat, the shriller the sound; likewise, the more energy expended, the higher the engines whine. The rise and fall, the ebb and flow of the musical line is by no means simply a function of its position on the printed or written page, to be seen and not heard.<sup>137</sup>

This physicality is felt by many of the emotions, two of which Kivy points out.

Joy is commonly described as an expansive feeling; and thus the expansion of the vital spirits is postulated as its cause, the assumption apparently being that the cause must have a structural similarity to its effect ... Again, we talk about being buoyed up or uplifted by hope; and hope is said to be caused by an elevation of the vital spirits.<sup>138</sup>

Kivy calls the resemblance between our expressive behavior and music the contour theory of musical expressiveness.<sup>139</sup>

Finally, Kivy draws on the convention theory of musical expressiveness to tie all three ideas together. The convention theory “explains the expressiveness of music as a function of the customary associations of certain musical features with certain emotive

---

<sup>135</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>136</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>137</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>138</sup> *ibid.*, 41.

<sup>139</sup> *ibid.*, 77.

ones, apart from any structural analogy between them.”<sup>140</sup> Three conventions that Kivy points out through the course of his book are that major tonalities are associated with happiness, minor tonalities are associated with sadness, and the diminished triad is heard as restless. “All expressiveness by convention was originally expressiveness by contour.”<sup>141</sup> It may be that they are no longer heard as resembling the expressive behavior. Over time the expressiveness has become a conventional association.

The reason I find Kivy’s theory so satisfying is that he brings the role of the human body when experiencing an emotion into his explanation of music’s emotional qualities. To me this supplies the most satisfactory reason that music is expressive of emotions for if we are to believe that music is expressive of emotions then we must study what is similar between music and emotions. *Emotion* is suggestive of motion. It is in the motion of emotions and music that we are able to find the similarities and (I think that) Kivy has made this connection most emphatically.

### **Stephen Davies**

Stephen Davies basically repeats Kivy in a more philosophically clever and cautious way. He believes that even if music does have a dynamic character resembling human action, music can best present movement, not behavior.<sup>142</sup> Davies builds his thesis around “emotion characteristics in appearances.”<sup>143</sup> This thesis suggests that the emotion characteristics attributed to appearances people present may not be true of emotions they are experiencing. For example faces can be sad looking even though they are nonsentient.<sup>144</sup> Davies considers emotion characteristics in appearances the important facet of his theory because emotion characteristics in appearances do not take on emotional objects or involve

---

<sup>140</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>141</sup> *ibid.*, 83.

<sup>142</sup> Davies, 201-202.

<sup>143</sup> *ibid.*, 222.

<sup>144</sup> *ibid.*, 223.

beliefs, desires, and attitudes - much like music.<sup>145</sup> According to Davies, it is the motion heard in music that presents emotion characteristics in appearances.<sup>146</sup> Davies' theory does involve interest in bodily movement. I believe this is crucial to the link between music and emotions. He agrees that music is heard and described spatially, especially in terms of motion. Davies links this to human bodily experience:

Our experience of musical works and, in particular, of motion in music is like our experience of the kinds of behavior which, in human beings, gives rise to emotion characteristics in appearances. The analogy resides in the manner in which these things are experienced rather than being based on some inference attempting to establish a symbolic relation between particular parts of the music and particular bits of human behavior. Emotions are heard in music as belonging to it, just as appearances of emotions are present in the bearing, gait, or deportment of our fellow humans and other creatures.

Clearly Davies' theory links emotion and music to human experience, however in a much more cautious way than Kivy. As a writer who comes after Kivy, Davies basically takes all of Kivy's good ideas and polishes them with his "emotion characteristics in appearances."

### **Aaron Ridley**

It is Aaron Ridley who is able to put together Kivy's theory with an arousal theory of emotions. He suggests that we apprehend emotion in music through "melisma" and then respond to it sympathetically.<sup>147</sup> According to Ridley, the "melismatic gesture" is expressive of emotions because it contains both vocal and physical resemblances to emotion through the quality of timbre and quality of motion of the music.<sup>148</sup> Ridley defines "melismatic gesture" as the basic unit of musical expressiveness.<sup>149</sup> Ridley does not use the idea of "melisma" in the conventional sense of many notes to one syllable of text. Ridley defines "melisma" as being the same as Kivy's idea of contour, however he believes

---

<sup>145</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>146</sup> *ibid.*, 229.

<sup>147</sup> Ridley, 53.

<sup>148</sup> *ibid.*

the word melisma allows for timbral and rhythmic similarities between music and human emotions that the word contour does not seem to include.<sup>150</sup> Due to its imprecision, the “melismatic gesture” only partially contributes to a theory of musical expressiveness.<sup>151</sup> “Music is poor at representing persons, things, ideas or states of affairs; and so the melismatic gesture is unable to resemble behavior expressive of responses to persons, things, ideas or states of affairs.”<sup>152</sup> Ridley suggests that it is the object of the emotion which clearly distinguishes the emotion. Since music has no object, “all that music can do is to resemble pieces of expressive behavior in isolation from the contexts in which what they express is fully distinctive.”<sup>153</sup> Ridley is simply suggesting that because music gives no indication of what the emotion expressed is about, it can only express emotions in a very general way and as a result “melismatic gestures” are not able to resemble detailed behavioral expressions.<sup>154</sup> The idea of the “melismatic gesture” only partially contributes to Ridley’s theory of emotion and music because the melisma itself isn’t expressive, it only resembles something which is expressive. Ridley aptly points out that “melisma” does not explain what the music means to us, it only explains how music is expressive of emotions.<sup>155</sup> “The experience of music as expressive is an experience having perceptual qualities which are not qualities of melisma or of the perception of it, but of the expressiveness which melisma makes it possible for one to experience.”<sup>156</sup> His approach to music arousing emotions in the listener is separate from the association model which suggests that if one first hears a piece of music at a particularly happy point in one’s life, they will always hear it as happy. Ridley suggests that his response to the music is not due

---

<sup>149</sup> *ibid.*, 57.

<sup>150</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>151</sup> *ibid.*, 49-50.

<sup>152</sup> *ibid.*, 50.

<sup>153</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>154</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>155</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>156</sup> *ibid.*

to association but as a result of the quality of the “melisma.”<sup>157</sup> Also, by suggesting that music arouses emotions, Ridley does not ignore the *cause* of the arousal.<sup>158</sup> What Ridley is suggesting is that we apprehend the emotions through the “melisma” and respond to it sympathetically. Ridley proposes that the sympathetic response arises from our experience:

...the recognition of expressiveness (and not merely of one kind of sign among others) is conceptually related to our capacity to feel. If I judge someone’s behavior to be expressive of, say, melancholy, then I am saying at the same time that I know something of what his melancholy is like, what it would be like to be in the state which his gestures reflect; my judgment is partly felt. Which means that in order properly – and in the fullest sense – to attribute expressive predicates to a person, my judgment must *always* involve an element of feeling or of affective response.<sup>159</sup>

Ridley suggests that it is when we are “engaged” with the “melismatic gesture” that we are able to have an affective response.<sup>160</sup>

...I am claiming that unless some or even most of us had responded affectively to musical melisma, music would never have become a context into which the application of expressive predicates had been (even elliptically) extended; and I am claiming that with unfamiliar music, unfamiliar melismatic gestures, affective response is a crucial part of our coming to recognize those gestures in their full particularity – what those gestures are *like*, what states such gestures might reflect.

Ridley believes that his arousal theory, based on “sympathetic response,” is effective because it goes beyond the resemblance of the “melismatic gesture” to emotions to the “expressiveness proper.”<sup>161</sup> The question remains, “how can the affective response to the music go beyond the general states of emotions to more precise ones?”<sup>162</sup> Ridley’s question is important, however his answer is somewhat unsatisfactory. He suggests that because the expressiveness of gestures is linked to the way in which we apprehend them, it is on that basis of our personal experiences that we are able to define precise emotions in the music. “The expressive qualities of the music may be described in as precise a manner

---

<sup>157</sup> *ibid.*, 51.

<sup>158</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>159</sup> Ridley, 53.

<sup>160</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>161</sup> *ibid.*, 54.

as the nature of those states and possibilities of the listener's language permit."<sup>163</sup> Therefore, as our experience and language capabilities permit, we can be in sympathy with and describe any emotion. Ridley's idea of sympathetically responding to the emotions in music gains my support; however his explanation of how these emotions go from general to more specific is somewhat weak. Key to his idea of how emotions expressed in music go from being general to more specific is the sympathetic reaction of the listener based on *their own private experiences*. He does not allow room for the community to be an interpreter and codifier of specific emotions, only general ones.

To me it is Peter Kivy and those who have attached themselves to his ideas who have said the most interesting things about music and emotion. Common to the theories of Kivy, Davies and Ridley are a commitment to the role of the human body in expressing emotions in music, whether it be physically or vocally. By moving away from objective approaches we are able to get at the bodily role surrounding music and emotions. In order to explore the role of the body in expressing emotions in music we need a theory of meaning that relies heavily on bodily understanding. Mark Johnson and George Lakoff have researched the role of the body in human understanding and it is to their theory which we now turn.

---

<sup>162</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>163</sup> *ibid.*, 55.

## Chapter Two

### **Lakoff and Johnson:**

#### **The Importance of Embodied Understanding**

##### **Introduction**

Mark Johnson and George Lakoff have suggested that meaning is constructed through our daily experience. Their proposed theory of meaning takes into consideration that “our reality is shaped by the patterns of our bodily movement, the contours of our spatial and temporal orientation, and the forms of our interaction with objects.”<sup>1</sup> We understand the world through metaphorical projection of these. Since music is a social text, created by human beings who are physically grounded, it too can be understood--can be meaningful--through the application of the theories of Lakoff and Johnson. This chapter opens with an explanation of Lakoff’s and Johnson’s embodied theory of meaning and contrasts it with the “abstract and propositional meaning”<sup>2</sup> that has been so widely accepted by Western thought. Following an explanation of the theories of Lakoff and Johnson, a detailed study of how music is generally understood through our embodied experience is undertaken. Finally, I will outline the way we understand emotions specifically as being in line with the theories of Lakoff and Johnson.

---

<sup>1</sup> Mark Johnson, *The Body in the Mind: The Bodily Basis of Meaning, Imagination, and Reason*. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987), xix.

<sup>2</sup> One of Johnson’s explanations of objective meaning

### An Embodied Theory of Understanding

Throughout history, “objective theories”<sup>3</sup> of meaning have been favoured. By objective, Lakoff and Johnson are referring to a rationality that is thought to be independent of the being doing the understanding.<sup>4</sup> The traditional view of meaning assumes that reasoning takes place independently of the body and that there is an objective true or false answer to everything. The meaning is regarded as objective because it exists between abstract symbols (such as language) and things in the world, independently of humans. Objectivists consider this the only way in which something can have meaning. Johnson further elaborates on the objective theory of meaning and rationality. He suggests that symbols obtain their meaning by corresponding to other things, properties and relations which exist objectively in the world. These symbols would still exist and have the same meaning regardless of whether or not there were humans to interpret them. In the objectivist theory of meaning a chair would still be an object to sit on regardless of whether there were people to sit on it or not. Logic is at the centre of this objectivist account of meaning. There is thought to be a correct reasoning and an answer which is rightly deducible. Along the lines of logic, there is a correct chain of reasoning that explains connections among symbols. However, things are as they are independent of any interpreter, they exist external to the mind. Objectivists believe in outward things and facts uncoloured by feelings or opinions. As a result there is a correct “answer” or way of seeing things independent of human understanding. Objectivists believe that human perception and imagination are wild and unruly and therefore true meaning and rationality must be disassociated from them. The objectivists believe that categories such as “dog, as opposed to Fido,”<sup>5</sup> exist objectively in the world, the world as it actually is, without the aid of human interpretation. In *Women, Fire, and Dangerous Things: What Categories Reveal*

<sup>3</sup> Johnson, *The Body in the Mind*, xix.

<sup>4</sup> The entire discussion of objectivism is taken from Johnson, ix-xi, xxi-xxxviii.

*about the Mind*, Lakoff suggests that it is the role of human reasoning that creates categories. They could not exist without an interpreter. Clearly what is missing from the objective theory of meaning is the actual person doing the understanding. Because meaning is regarded as objective it exists only in relationship between abstract symbols and things in the world, not the person trying to determine meaning. The objective theory of meaning has no place for the embodiment of understanding because rationality is thought to transcend human interpretation and hence, bodily experience.

This objectivist view of understanding has pervaded musical thought as well. As Robert Walser points out, “Eighteenth and nineteenth century European theorists of aesthetics such as Kant and Schopenhauer had maintained that music transcended verbal communication, that it lifted the listener up out of the mundane plane of language toward a mystical experience of the Sublime or the Beautiful.”<sup>6</sup> Kivy’s impetus for writing *The Corded Shell: Reflections on Musical Expression*, arose from his dissatisfaction with objective descriptions of music such as the following:

The rhythm of the theme of the last movement of Haydn’s ‘Surprise’ Symphony ... has a much more patently iambic shape. In this case, the initial groups, through both amphibrachs, are different melodically and temporally, are in close proximity to each other, and are held together by a strong chord progression (I-V-I). Hence these two units tend to form a trochaic group on the second rhythmic level and constitute a single, unified anacrusis on the third rhythmic level.<sup>7</sup>

Kivy describes the above account as, “a no-nonsense, objective, scientific description of the music, without a taint of subjectivity of Romantic excess.”<sup>8</sup> The problem, as Kivy points out, is that this objective account of music says nothing of music’s meaning to anybody but the musically learned.

---

<sup>5</sup> Lakoff, 370.

<sup>6</sup> Walser, “The Body in Music,” 118.

<sup>7</sup> Kivy, 7.

<sup>8</sup> *ibid.*, 8.

In place of the objectivist theory of meaning, Lakoff and Johnson are proposing an embodied theory of meaning in which human logic grows out of bodily experience.<sup>9</sup> Human understanding is grounded in perception, body movement and experiences of a physical and social nature which Lakoff calls *experiential realism* or *experientialism*.

‘Experience’ includes everything that goes to make up the actual or potential experiences of either individual organisms or communities of organisms – not merely perception, motor movement, etc., but *especially* the internal genetically acquired makeup of the organism and the nature of its interactions in both its physical and its social environments.”<sup>10</sup>

These embodied patterns do not remain private and independent for each particular person experiencing them. Through social interaction our community helps to interpret and determine our perception and motor movements. As a result they become shared experiences and help to make up a unified understanding of our world.

It is not that experiential realism does not reach an objective theory of meaning. Human experience is still constrained by things as they exist in the world, however the role of a human body interpreting is added to reach the final result of a stable knowledge in the world. Therefore experiential realism shares a commitment to things as they exist in the world and stable knowledge with objectivism. Understanding, imagination and embodiment are paramount to this theory which relies on an experiential account of meaning. Objectivists prefer to avoid understanding, imagination and embodiment as they are regarded as subjective and bring in the mediating role of humans. To objectivists, embodiment is inappropriate because meaning is universal, independent and transcendent of the body. Lakoff and Johnson could not disagree more.

Human reason is not an instantiation of transcendental reason, it grows out of the nature of an organism and all that contributes to its individual and collective experience: its genetic inheritance, the nature of the environment it lives in, the way it functions in that environment, the nature of its social functioning, and the like.<sup>11</sup>

<sup>9</sup> See: Lakoff and Johnson (1980), Lakoff (1987), and Johnson (1980).

<sup>10</sup> Lakoff, xv.

<sup>11</sup> *ibid.*

Our bodies are connected to the world through their bodily orientations and interactions in and with our environment. Our consciousness and rationality depend on these bodily orientations and interactions with the world. Johnson believes that our bodily orientations and interactions with the world, or human embodiment as he refers to it, “directly influences: what and how things can be meaningful to us, ways these meanings can be developed and articulated, and the ways we are able to comprehend and reason about our experience and the actions we take.”<sup>12</sup> Lakoff suggests that meaning is not construed by manipulating abstract symbols that apparently have meaning only through corresponding to things in the world. On the contrary, Johnson shows that things are meaningful to us through “patterns of bodily movement, contours of our spatial and temporal orientation and forms of our interaction with objects.”<sup>13</sup> Meaningful thought, although beginning with the individual, does not remain private.

...this is not merely a matter of how some individual might happen to understand something but rather about how an individual as embedded in a (linguistic) community, a culture, and a historical context understands. In other words, we are concerned with public shared meaning.<sup>14</sup>

It is through human imagination that bodily orientations and interactions with the world become meaningful.

Recent interest in the body and its importance is a result of trends in contemporary culture. As Bryan Turner points out:

A number of major sociological changes including the growth of consumer culture in the postwar period, the development of postmodern themes in art, the feminist movement, and finally what Foucault has called ‘bio-politics’ (within which we will include demographic changes in the structure of human populations with the graying of industrial societies, the AIDS crisis and the politics of pollution) - have brought the body back into focus.<sup>15</sup>

<sup>12</sup> Johnson, xix.

<sup>13</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>14</sup> *ibid.*, 190.

<sup>15</sup> Bryan S. Turner, “Recent Development in the Theory of Body,” in *The Body: Social Process and Cultural Theory*, ed. Mike Featherstone (London: Sage Publications), 18.

The attention given to our bodies is continually increasing, consider our acute awareness in body image which has manifested itself in physical fitness and fashion frenzies. Also, in an age of sexual pleasures, not to mention the sexual consequences <sup>i</sup>focus on the body is rising. At the same time our health care systems are not prepared to deal with the degenerating condition of the aging baby boomer population.<sup>16</sup> These combined changes in our society have put an emphasis on the body that has made its way into theories of understanding, including those of Lakoff and Johnson.

According to the latter, the structure of imagination and understanding that emerges from our embodied experience are image schemata and metaphor.<sup>17</sup> Johnson finds that it is “image-schematic experiential structures and their figurative elaborations and projections onto abstract domains of understanding [which are] the basis for an enriched account of human meaning and rationality.”<sup>18</sup>

As humans “we structure our concepts internally and relative to one another.”<sup>19</sup> By doing this we are able to “reason, comprehend, acquire knowledge and communicate.”<sup>20</sup> The structure of our concepts are “meaningful” because they are “embodied,” that is they come from our “bodily experience.”<sup>21</sup> There are two types of preconceptual bodily experience. First there is what Lakoff calls a basic level structure which is a combination of our perception, bodily movement and our ability to form rich mental images.<sup>22</sup> Secondly there is “kinesthetic image-schematic structure.”<sup>23</sup> So what exactly are image schemata? “Image schemata are recurring, dynamic patterns of our perceptual interactions and motor

<sup>16</sup> Turner, 19.

<sup>17</sup> Johnson, xiii.

<sup>18</sup> *ibid.*, xxxviii.

<sup>19</sup> Lakoff, 267.

<sup>20</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>21</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>22</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>23</sup> *ibid.*

programs that give coherence and structure to our experience.”<sup>24</sup> To expand, image schemata are the continual physical actions that occur throughout a given day. We then transfer these concrete motions onto abstract concepts. Image schemata are incredibly flexible and are able to change to fit many different but similar situations which have a similar underlying structure. This flexibility is referred to by Johnson as polysemy.

Polysemy is the phenomenon whereby a single word has many meanings that are systematically related (e.g. *newspaper* in “The ad’s in the *newspaper*” and “He worked for the *newspaper*”). Polysemy is contrasted with homonymy, which involves completely different words that happen to sound or be written the same way (e.g. *bank* in “My money’s in the *bank*” and *bank* in “Let’s go sit by the *bank* of the river”). The traditional account of meaning has never come to grips with the full range of cases of polysemy. Recent studies indicate why this is so: Polysemy involves the extension of a central sense of a word to other sense by devices of human imagination, such as metaphor and metonymy.<sup>25</sup>

Some examples of image schemata that constantly recur in our everyday bodily experience include the following: “CONTAINERS, PATHS, LINKS, FORCES, BALANCE, and various orientations and relations UP-DOWN, FRONT-BACK, PART-WHOLE, CENTRE-PERIPHERY.”<sup>26</sup> These structures are meaningful because they are direct, bodily experiences that recur when functioning in our environment.<sup>27</sup> In his explanation of the CONTAINER SCHEMA,<sup>28</sup> Johnson suggests that the bodily experience of the CONTAINER schema arises from the fact that our bodies are containers and also things in containers. This gives rise to the structural elements of interior, boundary, and exterior. From the CONTAINER schema we can deduce the basic logic that things are either inside or outside of the container. The directly understood structures that arise from image schemata are used metaphorically to structure other concepts. For example, personal relationships are understood as a metaphorical projection of the CONTAINER schema.

<sup>24</sup> Johnson, xiv.

<sup>25</sup> *ibid.*, xii.

<sup>26</sup> Lakoff, 267.

<sup>27</sup> *ibid.*, 268.

<sup>28</sup> *ibid.*, 272.

“One can be *trapped in a marriage* and *get out of it*.”<sup>29</sup> Our visual field is also a metaphorical projection of the CONTAINER schema as “*things come in and go out of sight*.”<sup>30</sup>

An example of an orientational image schema is the VERTICALITY schema.

“The VERTICALITY schema, for instance, emerges from our tendency to employ an UP-DOWN orientation in picking out meaningful structures of our experience. We grasp this structure of verticality repeatedly in thousands of perceptions and activities we experience every day, such as perceiving a tree, our felt sense of standing upright, the activity of climbing stairs, forming a mental image of a flagpole, measuring a child’s height, and experiencing the level of water rising in the bathtub. The VERTICALITY schema is the abstract structure of these vertical experiences, images, and perceptions.”<sup>31</sup>

With orientational image schemata, whether they be spatial or temporal, there is a perspective from which the orientation is viewed. Which perspective depends on the context.

Our ability to assume proper perspective is a consequence of recurrent perspectival patterns that emerge in ordinary experiences and spatial events, because we come to understand relevant perspectives in cases of spatial organization we have clues to proper intellectual or epistemic perspectives.<sup>32</sup>

Image schemata are more comprehensive, hypothetical, and flexible than mental pictures which allows them to explain many experiences, perceptions, and objects or events that have similar structures relevant to the image schemata at hand.<sup>33</sup> Image schemata are then metaphorically elaborated to further enhance our system of understanding.

Metaphor is a process of human understanding by which we use an easily understood meaningful experience to understand and structure an abstract experience of a different kind.<sup>34</sup> This is called metaphorical projection. Another way to explain metaphorical projection is what Lakoff calls metonymic reasoning. With metonymic

<sup>29</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>30</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>31</sup> Johnson, xiv.

<sup>32</sup> *ibid.*, 29-30.

<sup>33</sup> *ibid.*, 26-28.

reasoning a part of a category stands for the whole category. Basically you take one well-understood aspect of something to stand for the less well-understood thing or part of it. “Each metaphor has a source domain (the thing that is easily understood), a target domain (the thing that is more abstract) and a source to target mapping.”<sup>35</sup> The use of the pervasive metaphor, metaphor MORE IS UP; LESS IS DOWN<sup>36</sup> in our everyday language is evident from the following statements: “*The crime rate keeps rising. The number of books published each year keeps going up. That stock has fallen again. Our sales dropped last year. You’ll get a higher interest rate with them. Our financial reserves couldn’t be any lower.*”<sup>37</sup> In this metaphor the source domain is VERTICALITY, the target domain is quantity. Source domains of metaphors must be understood independently of the metaphor. VERTICALITY is directly understood since the UP-DOWN schema structures all of our functioning relative to gravity. The structural correlation in our daily experience motivates the details of mapping VERTICALITY onto quantity. Whenever more objects are added to a pile the level of the pile rises, remove objects from the pile and the level goes down. “VERTICALITY serves as an appropriate source domain for understanding QUANTITY because of the regular correlation in our experience between VERTICALITY and QUANTITY, the details of the mapping are motivated by our physical functioning.”<sup>38</sup> It is bodily experience that dictates the metaphorical projection of one type of easily understood experience onto another experience which is more difficult to understand. It is through metaphors that Johnson and Lakoff are suggesting that our experience and understanding are structured. The objectivists believe that metaphors can be reduced to literal truths. Since objectivists believe in a world that has its own structure, our ideas must correspond to things as they exist in the world to be correct. Metaphors deny this simple

---

<sup>34</sup> *ibid.*, 15.

<sup>35</sup> Lakoff, 276.

<sup>36</sup> The following example and explanation is taken from Lakoff, 276-77.

<sup>37</sup> Lakoff, 276.

correspondence because they cross so many categorical boundaries. As such they do not properly map onto the correct structures and boundaries which the objectivists believe exist in the world.

Johnson's theory of knowledge rests on the criticism of the gap thought to exist between "our cognitive, conceptual, formal or rational side, in contrast with our bodily perceptual, material, emotional side."<sup>39</sup> Because of this split presented throughout the history of philosophy, logic, rationality, and reasoning have been aligned with the mind. Perception, imagination and feeling on the other hand are aligned with the bodily dimension.<sup>40</sup> Johnson explains the mind/body split by drawing on Cartesian and Kantian philosophies. Descartes believed that in order to refute skepticism, knowledge must rest on something which is certain. The only thing we know for certain according to Descartes is that we exist as thinking beings and therefore must know the structure of our mind more than that of our bodies.<sup>41</sup> Although Kant rejects the notion that one can prove the existence of the mind independent of the body, he divides the cognitive faculties into two different components consisting of the "formal (conceptual and intellectual) and the material (perceptual and sensible)."<sup>42</sup> Although Johnson draws from Kant's idea that we cannot know things as they are unto themselves but only as they appear to us, he disagrees with the fact that empirical knowledge is subject to universal structuring activity of human consciousness. Even though, with Kant, there is no commitment to the Cartesian mind, there is still the tension between the ontologically different sides of our nature: bodily and rational.<sup>43</sup> Mark Johnson's *Body in the Mind* is linked with empirical thought which attempts to tie knowledge to experience. Empiricism denies *a priori* knowledge and gives

---

<sup>38</sup> *ibid.*, 277.

<sup>39</sup> Johnson, xxv.

<sup>40</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>41</sup> *ibid.*, xxvi.

<sup>42</sup> *ibid.*, xxvii.

<sup>43</sup> *ibid.*.

an account of our concepts as depending on experience, i.e. there is nothing in the intellect that was not previously in the senses. As Mark Turner has pointed out, this empirical philosophy of knowledge dates back to the fifth century B.C. with Protagoras and his famous quote, “Man is the measure of all things; of what is, that it is; of what is not, that it is not.”<sup>44</sup> By “man” Protagoras is referring to the individual person and by “measure of all things” he is referring to the standard of truth of all things. Although earlier Greek philosophers had made the distinction between sense and thought, perception and reason, and believed truth to be found not by sense but by reason, Protagoras denied these distinctions. He believed that there could be no truth except sensations and impressions and that each person is the standard of what is true to themselves. Protagoras’ refusal to differentiate between sense and reason meant a denial of objective knowledge.

My study of the embodiment metaphors of Lakoff and Johnson show that their theories do not account for everything. In their books thus far there is a gaping hole when it comes to an explanation of speed.<sup>45</sup> Documentation of our understanding of rate of movement would have deeply enriched my discussion of music and emotions. I hope that I will be able to adequately discuss speed by applying my own metaphor of MORE MOVEMENT and its relation to the MORE IS UP metaphor.<sup>46</sup>

By uniting the body and the mind, Lakoff and Johnson have shown how our bodily experiences structure our understanding. This system of understanding will be used in the next section to help explain how we understand the abstract world of music.

<sup>44</sup> Mark Turner, “Design for a Theory of Meaning.” In *The Nature of Ontogenesis of Meaning*, eds. W. Overton and D. Palermo (Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 1994), 91.

Although not one of Protagoras’ works have survived his views are presented in the Platonic dialogues which bear his name.

<sup>45</sup> My recent e-mail correspondence with Mark Johnson indeed acknowledged this fact. Lakoff and Johnson have a new book (due Winter 1998/99) entitled *Philosophy in the Flesh* which works on image schemata tied up with our concept of time and therefore notions like speed. Unfortunately he was not willing to disclose this information prior to publication.

<sup>46</sup> I am grateful for my conversations with Simon Wood as well as e mail correspondence with Arnie Cox which helped me reach this metaphor.

### Understanding Music as Embodied Experience

The way in which we find music to be meaningful is a very difficult thing to understand. If it is true that we understand our world through our bodily experience, image schemata and metaphorical projection as Lakoff and Johnson have suggested, then we must be able to understand music in this way. By looking at some basic level image-schemata I hope to show through metaphorical elaboration how they apply to our understanding of music.

One of the most prevalent image schemata in our daily experience is the SCALE schema. “Our world is experienced partly in terms of “more” or “less” and “the same,” the “more” and “less” aspect of the human experience is the basis of the scale schema.”<sup>47</sup> The SCALE schema explains both the quantitative and qualitative aspects of our experience.<sup>48</sup> Recall in the previous section how the metaphor MORE IS UP was embedded in our everyday language. The MORE IS UP metaphor is derived from the quantitative aspects of our physical experiences.<sup>49</sup> Take, for example, our experience of a glass of water. When we add water to an empty glass the level of water rises. When we drink some of the water the level of water in the glass falls. From everyday experiences such as this one we are able to understand a lot of information in our world in terms of quantitative amounts or qualitative degree. From our experience of a glass of water the MORE IS UP metaphor helps us understand more abstract facts such as the rise or fall in temperature. “The SCALE schema has a more or less fixed directionality; the further along the scale one moves, the greater the intensity.”<sup>50</sup> In our culture we impose numerical gradients along a

<sup>47</sup> Johnson, 122.

<sup>48</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>49</sup> *ibid.*, 122.

<sup>50</sup> *ibid.*

scale.<sup>51</sup> Consider the various numerical gradients of measurement in the metric system alone. “As one of the most experientially basic, value laden, structures of our grasp of both concrete and abstract entities, the SCALE schema is one of the most pervasive image-schematic structures in our understanding.”<sup>52</sup>

How then do we understand music in terms of the SCALE image schema? Consider first dynamics. When we want the volume of music to be more or less we say, *turn up the stereo* or *turn down the stereo*. Dynamics in Western art music are a perfect example of imposing numerical gradients along a scale. Consider the following gradient from *pp*, *p*, *mp*, *mf*, *f*, *ff*, to *fff*. Other signs such as *crescendo* and *diminuendo* further employ the use of the SCALE schema. It is not only in Western art music that dynamics are related to the SCALE schema where more is understood as up. Many dance tune lyrics focus on the scalar nature of dynamics as well, “Pump up the volume, dance, dance!”<sup>53</sup> The bodily experience that contributes to our understanding of MORE VOLUME IS UP and LESS VOLUME IS DOWN arises from our practice of singing or speaking in which more effort is required to sing/speak louder and less effort is required to sing/speak more softly.

The idea of dynamics can also be understood as a FORCE. Johnson reminds us that force is always experienced through interaction.<sup>54</sup> In the case of volume it is the interaction between the listener and the sound. Johnson’s explanation of the image schemata FORCE shows that it “usually involves the movement of some object through space in a particular direction.”<sup>55</sup> With dynamics, the musical sound which is being directed at the listener could be thought of as a type of FORCE. As Johnson explains,

<sup>51</sup> *ibid.*, 123.

<sup>52</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>53</sup> Eric B. and Rakim, “I Know I Got Soul.”

<sup>54</sup> Johnson, 43.

<sup>55</sup> *ibid.*

“forces have degrees of power and intensity.”<sup>56</sup> The Italian term, *forte*, directly translated as “strong,”<sup>57</sup> for example, implies the idea of FORCE.

Drawing on the same metaphors and bodily experience used above, volume can be understood in terms of a special kind of force which Johnson refers to as enablement.<sup>58</sup> As you sing or speak louder you become aware of your sense of power to make more noise. On the other hand when you sing more quietly you are using less power to produce the sound. Volume can also act as another kind of force on us. This type of force refers to compulsion, the act of being moved by external forces.<sup>59</sup> In this situation “the force comes from somewhere, has a given magnitude, moves along a path, and has direction.”<sup>60</sup> Therefore, something which is at a loud volume would have a compulsive effect on us, whereas softer volumes do not exert nearly as much force on our bodies.

Tempo is another concept which has been quantified in our culture. The statements “speed up” and “slow down” indicate that an INCREASE IN TEMPO IS UP and a DECREASE IN TEMPO IS DOWN, drawing of course from Lakoff’s metaphors MORE IS UP and LESS IS DOWN. This image schemata grows out of our bodily experience which requires more effort to move faster and less effort to move slowly. Once again, in Western art music we have imposed numerical gradients along the tempo scale. Metronome markings range from M.M. = 40 to M.M. = 208 on the average metronome. Some of the tempo markings in Western art music make a direct link to our bodily experience. The tempo marking *andante*, for example, indicates a very moderate walking speed. By drawing directly on our embodied experience of walking we can determine the tempo of the music. Although other tempo markings such as *lento* (slow), *moderato*

<sup>56</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>57</sup> Michael Kennedy, ed. *The Oxford Dictionary of Music*. 2nd ed., (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994), s.v. “forte.”

<sup>58</sup> *ibid.*, 47.

<sup>59</sup> *ibid.*, 45.

<sup>60</sup> *ibid.*

(moderate), and *presto* (very fast) do not have direct links to definite physical acts, they must be understood through our felt sense and bodily experience of these tempos.

Lawrence Zibkowski has explained the cross domain mapping of the VERTICALITY schema onto musical pitches as follows

One example of this process (cross domain mapping) is our characterization of musical pitches in terms of 'high' and 'low' on the piano: how can D4 be 'above' C4 on the piano when they are both on the same horizontal plane? Think of playing the two notes on the 'cello- to play the 'higher' D4 we have to move our left hand *down*, so that it is closer to the ground. 'High' and 'low' as applied to music are actually metaphors that result from mapping the spatial orientation of UP-DOWN onto pitch. There actually isn't any necessity for characterizing pitch in this way: Greek music theorists of antiquity spoke not of 'high' and 'low' but of 'sharpness' and 'heaviness' (Barker 1989, 134 n. 43); in Bali and Java pitches are not 'high' and 'low' but 'small' and 'large.'<sup>61</sup>

Zibkowski explains how our embodied experience of musical pitch supports the mapping of the VERTICALITY schema onto pitch.

When we make low sounds our chest resonates; when we make high sounds, our chest no longer resonates in the same way, and the source of the sound seems located nearer our head. The 'up' and 'down' of musical pitch thus correlate with the spatial 'up' and 'down' -- the vertical orientation of our bodies.<sup>62</sup>

Pitches also impose numerical gradients along a scale.

Both space and the frequency spectrum are continua which can be divided into discontinuous elements. In the spatial domain, division of the continuum results in points; in the acoustic domain, it results in pitches. These correspondences represent structural invariants between two domains which are exploited by the mapping.<sup>63</sup>

Our system of notation grows out of our embodied experience of pitch as mapped onto the VERTICALITY schema

Cross-domain mappings of the sort exemplified by the application of UP-DOWN spatial orientation to music often give rise to interrelated systems of mappings. We can see this systematicity in traditional musical notation: notes which are the result of more rapid vibrations of the sounding medium are placed higher on the page than notes which result from less rapid

<sup>61</sup> Lawrence Zibkowski, "Conceptual Blending and Song" unpublished paper, 8.

<sup>62</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>63</sup> *ibid.*, 9.

Containers do not only exist for pieces of music, but also for the instruments which play them. Vocal range is understood in terms of the CONTAINER schema as we talk of moving in and out of our vocal range. There are a certain range of notes that each singer is capable of singing which are included in the CONTAINER of vocal range. The notes outside of the CONTAINER are considered outside of the vocal range.

The CONTAINER schema is deeply rooted in our bodily experience. It emerges from our experience of physical containment.<sup>67</sup> We are aware of our bodies as three-dimensional containers into which we put certain things (food, water, air) and out of which other things emerge (waste, water, air, blood, etc.) We move in and out of rooms, clothes, vehicles and many bounded spaces and we manipulate objects by placing them in containers.

Johnson states that the basis for our in-out orientation is that of spatial boundedness. The physical in-out orientation involves separation, differentiation, and enclosure which implies restriction and limitation. Also important to the concept of CONTAINMENT is its transitivity. "If I am in my bed, and my bed is in my room, then I am in my room."<sup>68</sup>

Johnson has suggested that the IN-OUT orientation effects us from the moment we wake up in the morning.

You wake *out* of a deep sleep and peer *out* from beneath the covers *into* your room. You gradually emerge *out* of your stupor, pull yourself *out* from under the covers, climb *into* your robe, stretch *out* your limbs and walk *in* a daze *out* of the bedroom and *into* the bathroom. You look *in* the mirror and see your face staring *out* at you. You reach *into* the medicine cabinet, take *out* the toothpaste, squeeze *out* some toothpaste, put the toothbrush *into* your mouth, brush your teeth *in* a hurry, and rinse *out* your mouth. At breakfast you perform a host of further *in-out* moves – pouring *out* the coffee, setting *out* the dishes, putting toast *in* the toaster, spreading *out* the jam on the toast, and on and on. Once you are more awake you

<sup>67</sup> The entire explanation of the CONTAINER schema is taken from Johnson, 21.

<sup>68</sup> Johnson, 22.

might even get lost *in* the newspaper, might enter *into* a conversation, which leads to your speaking *out* on some topic.<sup>69</sup>

In this example we can see that the body is both the thing being contained as well the agent in a lot of in-out bodily movements and experiences. We metaphorically extend image schemata from the physical to the non-physical. "Consider the non-spatial sense of out, 'Tell me your story again, but leave out the minor details,' where the story is the container."<sup>70</sup> Because of the recurring in-out activities and orientations in our daily activity, we are able to extend the CONTAINER image schemata to abstract metaphorical elaborations such as speaking *out* on some topic.

Janna Saslaw explains the way in which theorist Hugo Riemann has used the CONTAINER schema metaphorically to explain cadence and key areas in his own writings. She explains why she has paired the container schema with cadence and key as opposed to other image schemata when studying Riemann's writings.

Both cadences and keys are conceived of as collections of constituent entities of functions. Some chords and pitches are considered to belong to the collection, or to have a certain function; others do not; they are either in or out of the container. The fact that we understand tones as objects, which we then categorize by grouping with other tone-objects, set up the correlation between containers and chords and pitches.<sup>71</sup>

Saslaw continues by explaining what it is for Riemann that determines the details of the container to cadence and container to key mappings.

For Riemann, the tonic has a boundary function. The container of a cadence is bounded by the tonic, so to speak on all sides. Whether he points out the circular aspect of cadence (starting from and returning to the same tonic chord) or the source-path-goal aspect of starting at one place and ending at another (after all, the two tonics are not the same; one occurs after the other in time), the boundedness of the cadence is always clear.<sup>72</sup>

<sup>69</sup> *ibid.*, 30.

<sup>70</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>71</sup> Janna Saslaw, "Forces, Containers, Paths: The Role of Body-Derived Image Schemas in the Conceptualization of Music," *Journal of Music Theory* 40:2 (1996): 227.

<sup>72</sup> *ibid.*

The CONTAINER schema also works in a larger scale manner when explaining music. Let us return to the example of Beethoven's Symphony No. 5 in C minor. The Symphony is a big container in which Beethoven placed four movements: *Allegro con brio*, *Andante con moto*, *Scherzo*, and *Allegro*. Within each of these movements there is a form which acts as a container for the movement, whether it be sonata-allegro, theme and variation, or scherzo. Within the containers of the forms there are smaller containers which hold the various themes. The theme is then a container for certain notes and rhythms which make up the theme. Notes are containers for certain pitches and rhythms.

The CONTAINER image schema not only explains in-out orientations but also verticality and swelling. In the case of explaining verticality, the CONTAINER is a fixed entity such as a glass. As you add liquid to the glass the glass can fill up and overflow. However, in the case of swelling, the CONTAINER can be more like a balloon which expands its shape as it fills up. Later, I will explain love as the CONTAINER of the heart swelling in this way. Once again the concept of polysemy is important when considering the extensive applications of the CONTAINER schema.

The PATH schema represents another recurrent pattern in our ongoing ordering of activities.<sup>73</sup> It consists of three elements: source point A, location B and the direction outlining the path between them. This image schemata relates to our everyday bodily experience of "walking from one place to another, throwing a baseball to your sister, punching your brother, and giving your Mother a present."<sup>74</sup>

The PATH schema is extremely prevalent in tonal music. Consider a melody which starts at the source, travels along the path and ends at the goal. Chord progressions are another example of the PATH schema. They often start on the tonic (SOURCE) move along some sort of path (IV, V) and end at the GOAL (I). This particular example can also

<sup>73</sup> The entire explanation of the PATH schema is taken from Johnson, pp. 28, 113-117.

<sup>74</sup> *ibid.*

be understood as a CYCLE schema since we both start and end on I, hence Johnson's notion of polysemy with respect to the metaphorical projections of the image schemata.

Johnson's theory may be able to account for the prevalence of goal-directedness in tonal music of the Western, Classical tradition. It may also explain Classical concert-going audiences' aversion to post-tonal art music of the Western world. The traditional goal directedness in tonal music gave way in the early Twentieth Century to incessant chromatic wandering creating an unstable environment. Since the PATH schema is not prevalent in post-tonal Western art music, it may be that it is more difficult for audiences to understand in terms of bodily experience and thus not as enjoyable. Not only was the PATH schema negated in post-tonal music, but so was the CONTAINER schema as musical structure began to be built on motives and textural contrasts rather than reference to a key center. The idea of the key as a CONTAINER for a piece is now lost. Rhythms, tonality, and form also lost their traditional sense of CONTAINER and PATH.

The strongest, most daring forces in *Le Sacre* are its rhythms – asymmetrical, jagged, and unsettling and the use of 'primitive' pitch patterns drawn from folk music. Debussy's experiments in the use of free-floating sonority (relatively lacking in dissonant, chromatic tension), non-developmental form, and unusual scales ...<sup>75</sup>

The rhythms in *Le Sacre* were described as jagged, asymmetrical and unsettling because they did not fit into traditional rhythmic CONTAINERS such as a 2/4 CONTAINER where there are two beats in the CONTAINER, the first being strong and the second weak. The pitch patterns of *Le Sacre* were drawn from folk music rather from the traditional major/minor tonality CONTAINERS. Debussy's free floating sonority lacked the traditional tonal PATHS (e.g. I, V, I) that we had become accustomed to. The non-developmental form also did not follow the PATH schema that we knew and loved in tonal music. Finally, the unusual scales in Debussy's music once again reference the

<sup>75</sup> Elliot Schwartz and Daniel Godfrey, *Music Since 1945* (New York: Schirmer Books, 1993), 10.

CONTAINER schema, as the notes he was using were outside of the major/minor CONTAINERS. Composers also turned to music of other cultures for ideas. Indeed it was Debussy's encounter with Indonesian music in 1889 that brought the new flavour to the music just discussed.<sup>76</sup> This opens an unexplored territory in terms of culturally understood image schemata. "European composers (Debussy and Mahler in particular), profoundly moved by the sounds of the Indonesian gamelan ensemble, began rethinking their concepts of sonority, texture and musical time as a result."<sup>77</sup> This would require a different understanding of music through different image schemata than we were perhaps used to in the Western tradition. For example, it was partly from the subtle tempo changes in Balinese gamelan music that Elliot Carter "devised a way of controlling and articulating gradual changes within rhythmic continuities; this technique is called *metric modulation*."<sup>78</sup> This sort of introduction into Western art music would definitely require a shift in the types of image schemata used for metaphorical projections in order to understand the music. Another example may be John Cage's interest in Oriental music and philosophy. As he infused these ideas into his music, image schemata such PATH were less likely to apply than to that of Western Art music. Finally, "Steve Reich has adapted non-European thinking to standard instruments of the West with special enthusiasm; his love for African drumming, the Indonesian gamelon, and Hebrew cantillation grow out of a natural propensity for repetitive patterns and subtle, slowly unfolding transformations."<sup>79</sup> Music such as Steve Reich's would use the CYCLE schema more and the PATH schema less than Western art music, perhaps because African, Indonesian, and Hebrew cultures may have more repetitive actions and CYCLES in their daily experiences than Westerners. As a

<sup>76</sup> *ibid.*, 194.

<sup>77</sup> *ibid.*, 9.

<sup>78</sup> *ibid.*, 60.

<sup>79</sup> *ibid.*, 200.

result this music requires a shift in the Westerner's thinking to different types of culturally specific image schemata.

The BALANCE schema is another which affects music as a result of our daily experience with our bodies. Balancing is an activity we learn with our bodies, it is something we do. For example, "a baby stands, wobbles, and drops to the floor."<sup>80</sup>

We come to know balance through related experience of bodily equilibrium, for example, there is too much acid in our stomach, the hands are cold, the sinuses are swollen and the mouth is dry. These things are felt as 'out of balance'. There is 'too much' or 'not enough' so that the normal, healthy organization of forces, processes and elements is upset. We respond to such felt imbalance and disequilibrium by adding heat to the hands, giving moisture to the mouth, draining the bladder, and so forth until the balance is set right again.<sup>81</sup>

Balance is something that is learned in first year music theory with the terms antecedent and consequent. The terms are usually applied to melodic phrases that stand in relationship of question and answer or statement and confirmation.<sup>82</sup> To make up a period requires an antecedent and a consequent phrase. The question and answer nature of the antecedent and consequent imply an understanding of BALANCE to exist between the two. The balance is achieved through goal-directedness again, by moving from I to V in the antecedent and returning to I in the consequent. Clearly, then, idea of balance is related to the CYCLE schema which is also understood as balanced.

FORCE schema is another schema that figures into our understanding of music.

The concept of force arises out of many kinds of bodily experience. We have bodies that are acted upon by many kinds of forces: gravity, wind, and the impingement of external objects and other living beings, as well as the forces we experience internally, as the body maintains its dynamic equilibrium: pulse, respiration, burping. Such interaction, constitute our first encounters with force, and they reveal patterned recurring relations between ourselves and our environment. Such patterns develop as meaning

<sup>80</sup> Johnson, 74.

<sup>81</sup> *ibid.*, 75.

<sup>82</sup> *Harvard Concise Dictionary of Music*, 1978 ed., s.v. "antecedent and consequent"

structures through which our world begins to exhibit a measure of coherence, regularity, and intelligibility.<sup>83</sup>

Force involves “motion, a directedness of action and degree of intensity.”<sup>84</sup> Wind and gravity are both examples of force, walking up a hill we feel force as if we are being pulled back. In his article, “The Body in Music: Epistemology and Musical Semiotics,”<sup>85</sup> Robert Walser examines the manifestation of the FORCE schema in musical timbre, in the distortion used by electric guitarists in rock music, especially in the genre of heavy metal. Walser explains how the phenomenon of distortion rose to popularity.

The bodily basis for understanding distortion extends to many areas, for we experience the phenomenon of distortion in many situations. For people who use audio equipment, the relationship of distortion to extreme power is familiar: a small radio turned on full blast, a portable cassette player booming cacophonously, a malfunctioning stereo system. This electronic distortion results when components are overdriven – required to amplify or otherwise modify a signal beyond their capacities to do so ‘cleanly’. Historically, such distortion has been regarded as undesirable, and generations of audio engineers have joined in the quest for perfect audio fidelity, laboring to eliminate all types of distortion while increasing power-handling capabilities. To their horror, engineers in the mid 1960s began to receive requests from guitar players to produce devices that would deliberately add electronic distortion. Despite its previous status as undesirable noise, at this historical moment such distortion was now becoming a desirable sign in an emerging musical discourse.<sup>86</sup>

How do our everyday experiences of distortion grow out of our bodily experience?

The human body can produce aural distortion through excessive power. Human screams and shouts are usually accompanied by vocal distortion, as the capacities of the vocal chords are exceeded. Heavy metal vocalists distort their voices deliberately for the same reasons that guitar players distort their guitars. Vocalists project energy and power by overdriving their voices. Thus, distortion functions as a sign of extreme power and intense expression by overflowing its channels and materializing the exceptional effort that produces it.<sup>87</sup>

<sup>83</sup> Johnson, 13.

<sup>84</sup> Johnson, 41.

<sup>85</sup> Robert Walser, “The Body in the Music: Epistemology and Musical Semiotics,” *College Music Symposium* 31 (1991): 117-126.

<sup>86</sup> Walser, 123.

<sup>87</sup> *ibid.*

The FORCE schema is invoked here due to the huge amount of energy it takes to scream or shout. Walser suggests, “since sustain of anything in material terms always requires effort, the distorted guitar sound signifies power not only through its distorted timbre, but also through this display of unflagging capacity for emission.”<sup>88</sup>

Candace Brower has shown how FORCE figures into the idea of tonality in combination with the PATH and BALANCE schemata.

Johnson’s theory suggests that our experience of forces in music originates in those forces that we experience directly with our bodies. In the physical world, we feel ourselves to be maximally stable when we are balanced with respect to our center of gravity, and we feel the need to restore that balance following a shift in our body’s position. Likewise, in listening to a tonal melody, we feel maximally stable when centered on the tonic, and having moved away from it, we feel a need to move back. This suggests that we map our own body’s center of gravity onto the tonic.<sup>89</sup>

Brower explains the link between the FORCE schema and tonality.

In tonal music, pitch stability is conditioned by the opposition between consonance and dissonance, causing us to hear consonant intervals as more stable than dissonant ones. The tonic occupies the lowest position in tonal pitch-space, analogous to the fundamental, above which the other pitches of the tonic triad sound in the order in which they are heard as stable. Thus, in a tonal setting the downward pull of gravitation reinforces our downward orientation towards the tonic pitch.<sup>90</sup>

She explains the FORCE schema in action, specifically as it relates to the major scale. “Thus in a major key we feel the fourth and seventh degrees pulled strongly to third and eighth, while we feel second and sixth degrees pulled weakly to the first (or third) and fifth.”<sup>91</sup> Through Brower’s explanation of FORCE and BALANCE at work in tonality it becomes clear that the concepts of FORCE and BALANCE are closely related and often used together.

<sup>88</sup> *ibid.*, 124.

<sup>89</sup> Candace Brower, “Pathway, Blockage and Containment in Density 21.5,” unpublished paper provided by author, 4.

<sup>90</sup> Brower, 11.

<sup>91</sup> Brower, 4.

Another image schema which is used often in music is the CYCLE. Many of our own bodily functions are regularly recurring cycles such as our “heartbeat, breathing, digestion, menstruation, walking, sleeping, circulation, emotional buildup followed by release, etc.”<sup>92</sup> Our experience of the world we live in is made up of cycles, consider: “day and night, the seasons, the course of life, stages of development in plants and animals.”<sup>93</sup> A cycle is simply something that starts at a specific point, travels through a series of connected and related events only to reach the initial location, at which point it starts all over again. The way we create order in our world occurs through cycles. “We impose time in the form of minutes, hours, days, weeks, months, and years in the name of business, politics, religion, and social welfare.”<sup>94</sup> Cycles are also very prevalent in music. Consider any music which repeats. The typical pop song uses the CYCLE schema with its recurring pattern of verse - chorus - verse - chorus. Also within the pop song the groove is a cycle that continually repeats throughout the song. Sonata form is cyclic in terms of the exposition coming back in the form of the recapitulation to round out the movement, giving it BALANCE.

Johnson’s image schemata are an extremely powerful presence in the explanation of music. One only has to turn to Joseph Machlis’ explanation of sonata-form in *The Enjoyment of Music* to see how prevalent various image schemata are in the general discourse on music:<sup>95</sup>

A movement in sonata-allegro form is based on two assumptions. The first is that a musical movement takes on direction and goal [PATH schema] if, after establishing the home key [SOURCE], it modulates to another area [PATH] and ultimately returns to the home key. [GOAL or CYCLE] We may therefore regard sonata form as a drama between two contrasting key areas. [BALANCE or FORCE] The ‘plot’ – that is, the action and tension [BALANCE or FORCE] – derives from this contrast,

<sup>92</sup> Johnson, 119.

<sup>93</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>94</sup> *ibid.*, 120.

<sup>95</sup> Joseph Machlis, *The Enjoyment of Music*, 6th ed., (New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1990): 201-202.

thus providing the framework for statement, a departure and a return. [PATH or CYCLE]

Second is the assumption that a theme may have its latent energies [FORCE] released through the development of its constituent motives. [PATH] Most useful for this purpose is a brief, incisive theme, one that has momentum and tension, [FORCE] and that promises more than it reveals at first sight. [PATH] The themes will be stated or 'exposed' in the first section; developed in the second, and restated or 'recapitulated' in the third. [PATH or CYCLE]

The opening section of sonata-allegro form, the Exposition or Statement [SOURCE] generally sets forth two opposing keys [BALANCE] and their respective themes. The first theme and its expansion establish the home key or tonic. [SOURCE] A transition or bridge [LINK] leads [PATH] into a contrasting [BALANCE] key; in other words the function of the bridge is to modulate [PATH and FORCE] The second theme and its expansion establish the contrasting key. [BALANCE] A closing section or codetta rounds off the exposition in the contrasting key. [GOAL] In the Classical sonata form, the Exposition is repeated. [CYCLE] The adventurous quality of the Exposition [CONTAINER] derives in no small measure from the fact that it brings us from the home key [SOURCE] to the contrasting key. [GOAL]

The Development [CONTAINER] wanders [PATH] further through a series of foreign keys, building up tension [FORCE] against the inevitable return home. [GOAL] Temperature is kept at fever pitch through frequent modulations [PATH and FORCE], resulting in a sense of breathless activity and excitement [FORCE].

At the same time the composer proceeds [PATH] to reveal the potentialities of the themes by breaking them into their component motives [PART-WHOLE], recombining them into fresh patterns, and releasing their latent energies, their explosive force. [FORCE] In the Development [CONTAINER] the conflict erupts [FORCE], the action reaches maximum intensity. The protagonists of the drama are hurled one against another; their worlds collide. [FORCE] Emotion is transformed into motion. [PATH or COMPULSION] The theme may be modified or varied, expanded or contracted [PART-WHOLE], combined with other motives or with new material. [SUPERIMPOSITION]

When the development surge [FORCE] has run its course [PATH], the tension abates [BALANCE]. The beginning of the third section, [CONTAINER] the Recapitulation or Restatement [CYCLE], is in a sense the psychological climax of sonata form [FORCE], just as the peak of many a journey [PATH] is the return [CYCLE] home [SOURCE]. The first theme appears as we first heard it, [CYCLE] in the tonic [SOURCE], proclaiming the victory of unity [BALANCE] over variety [FORCE], of continuity [BALANCE] over change. [overall CYCLE].<sup>96</sup>

This short explanation of sonata allegro form in the Machlis text book is testament to the use of image schemata for the understanding of music. It is clear that we use image

<sup>96</sup> *ibid.*

schemata from our everyday bodily experiences and map them directly onto the abstract world of music. Our discourse on music reveals that the cross domain mapping and image schemata are embedded right in the language we use to talk about music. As a result music could be seen as a metaphor for human experience, or at least that is the way we perceive and understand it.

Several image schemata can be used at once through metaphor. Consider the CONDUIT metaphor by Michael Reddy as outlined in Johnson's *Body in the Mind*.<sup>97</sup> This metaphor includes the CONTAINER, PATH and FORCE schemata.

Ideas or thoughts are objects.  
Works and sentences are containers for these objects.  
Communication consists in finding the right word-container for your idea object, sending this filled container along a conduit or through space to the hearer, who must take the idea-object out of the word container.<sup>98</sup>

It is simple to see how the CONDUIT metaphor translates to music. Composers have ideas or thoughts which are objects. Music and notes are containers for these objects. Communication consists in finding the right music-container for your idea object, sending this filled container along a conduit or through space to the hearer, who must take the idea-object out of the musical container. Johnson points out that there are four kinds of force at work here.

1. The force that acts on the utterance [music-container] with its idea-object. To change the form of the expression this force determines the shape of the music.
2. The force that acts on the hearer to determine how the hearer determines the utterance [music].
3. Force with which the utterance [music] container is sent through the conduit or through the space between the performer and hearer will have a certain magnitude. Different degrees of force in various utterance [music] acts.
4. Result of illocutionary force of the utterance [music].<sup>99</sup>

<sup>97</sup> Johnson, 59.

<sup>98</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>99</sup> *ibid.*

In the above example I have shown how Johnson's utterance can be replaced with music. By simply changing Johnson's utterance to music the CONDUIT metaphor explains how music can have meaning.

The above examples of how the SCALE, CONTAINER, PATH, BALANCE, FORCE, and CYCLE schemata contribute to our understanding of music are testimony to the importance of Johnson's theory. The meaning of music can be revealed through metaphorical projection.

### **Understanding Emotions as Embodied Experience**

In order to understand how music can be heard as expressing emotions, I believe it is crucial to take an in-depth look at the study of emotions. I have chosen to explore two particular approaches to the study of emotions for reasons which will become obvious. I will begin by reviewing the writings of Zoltán Kövecses. His studies of emotions use the image schemata and metaphors of Lakoff and Johnson. Following that, I will attempt to reveal the image schemata and metaphorical elaborations associated with happiness, sadness, anger, and fear through the study of nonverbal communication.

#### **Zoltán Kövecses**

One approach to the understanding of emotions is through the language we use to discuss emotions. Kövecses, an English professor at the Eötvös Loránd University in Budapest Hungary, uses the theories of Lakoff and Johnson in order to explain our understanding of emotions. His research centres around how people understand their emotions through the study of language.

The basic idea here is that the conventionalized language we use to talk about the emotions can be an important tool in discovering the structure and concepts of our emotion concepts and that, furthermore, the emotion concepts we have can reveal a great deal about our experience of emotion.<sup>100</sup>

<sup>100</sup> Kövecses, *Emotion Concepts*, 3.

His goal has been “to find out what the necessary and sufficient features are for each emotion concept.”<sup>101</sup> Emotion concepts “are seen as having a simple structure (a small set of features) and minimal conceptual content.”<sup>102</sup> Although Kövecses’ interest is in a folk understanding of emotions he believes they are related to expert theories since “folk conceptualizations of emotions affect or at least motivate scientific thinking.”<sup>103</sup> By folk understanding of emotions, Kövecses is referring to the language used in popular culture to explain emotions as opposed to scientific accounts. Kövecses, like Lakoff and Johnson, relies on figures of speech such as metaphors and metonymies.

The cognitive models produced by the metaphors, metonymies, and inherent concepts suggest a broad, rich and detailed view of emotion in which the antecedents, cognitions, subjective feelings, physiological and behavioral responses, control mechanisms, and so forth associated with emotion all find their natural place within the same model. These comprehensive (cognitive) models can thus point up the often one-sided attempt in our theorizing about emotion.<sup>104</sup>

Kövecses uses the discourse of emotion to probe the nature of emotion concepts in the community of English speakers.<sup>105</sup> “The conceptual content of metaphors, metonymies and inherent concepts converge on and hence produce certain prototypical cognitive models associated with particular emotions.”<sup>106</sup> Kövecses has explored anger, fear, pride, respect, and love in his writings.<sup>107</sup> Of these, I will review anger, pride, fear and love, as I believe these are the emotions from his studies which music most prevalently expresses.

### Anger

Kövecses has found that many metaphors about anger, including ANGER IS HEAT, which he relates to the central metaphor ANGER IS THE HEAT OF FLUID IN A

<sup>101</sup> *ibid.*, 1.

<sup>102</sup> *ibid.*, 2.

<sup>103</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>104</sup> *ibid.*, 4-5.

<sup>105</sup> *ibid.*, 3.

<sup>106</sup> *ibid.*, 4.

<sup>107</sup> See: Kövecses (1986) and (1989)

CONTAINER.<sup>108</sup> These metaphors imply that heat, internal pressure, and agitation are concepts related to anger.<sup>109</sup> Our everyday sayings to explain the emotion anger include statements such as: “*Billy is a hothead and Don’t have a hernia.*”<sup>110</sup> *Billy is a hothead* implies heat and *Don’t have a hernia* implies internal pressure. Each of these expressions indicates the presence of anger via their supposed physiological effects which include: “increased body heat, increased internal pressure (blood pressure, muscle pressure) agitation, and interference with acute perception.”<sup>111</sup> Other expressions such as “*I’m just steaming, I’m so angry! or I’m going to blow my top!*” arise from the idea that an increase in anger produces steam as well as pressure on a container again arising from the metaphors ANGER IS HEAT and ANGER IS THE HEAT OF FLUID IN A CONTAINER. (our bodies being the container for emotions)<sup>112</sup> The physical basis for this in our everyday world comes from the fact that when hot fluids boil, the fluid goes upwards, which leads to the conclusion that when the intensity of anger increases the fluid increases.<sup>113</sup> Therefore when a person becomes angry s/he explodes and when a person explodes stuff comes out. “The central metaphor focuses on the fact that anger can be intense, lead to a loss of control and loss of control can be dangerous.”<sup>114</sup> In the above situation the pressure of the anger in the container is internal pressure in the body and the limit of the container’s capacity to withstand pressure caused by heat is the limit on the anger scale.<sup>115</sup> The explosion is the loss of control due to anger.<sup>116</sup> Clearly then, anger also relates to the FORCE schema.

<sup>108</sup> Kövecses, *Emotion Concepts*, 53.

<sup>109</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>110</sup> *ibid.*, 52.

<sup>111</sup> *ibid.*, 51-52.

<sup>112</sup> *ibid.*, 54.

<sup>113</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>114</sup> *ibid.*, 55-56.

<sup>115</sup> *ibid.*, 57.

<sup>116</sup> *ibid.*

The central metaphor, ANGER IS FIRE, “highlights the cause of anger (*kindle, inflame*), the intensity and duration of anger (*smoldering, slow burn, burned up*), danger to others (*breathing fire*) and damage to a person (*consumed by anger*).”<sup>117</sup> Metaphors such as ANGER IS FIRE focus on a number of aspects and contribute a lot of information to the emotional concept anger.

### **Pride**

According to Kövecses the idea of enhancement is central to our understanding of pride.<sup>118</sup> Human behavioral reactions to pride include “erect posture, chest out...and head held high.”<sup>119</sup> The following metaphors illustrate how pride is associated with upwardness, if you will, or behavior that is high on the verticality scale. “*After winning the race, he walked to the rostrum with his head held high. He stood tall as he received his prize.*”<sup>120</sup> “*After winning the race, he swelled with pride.*”<sup>121</sup> is a metaphor for the chest out behavioral reaction to pride. According to Kövecses:

Pride also has its version of THE EMOTIONS ARE FLUIDS IN A CONTAINER metaphor. The PRIDE IS A FLUID IN A CONTAINER metaphor is partially motivated by THE BODY IS A CONTAINER FOR THE EMOTIONS metaphor. The experiential basis for the metaphor PRIDE IS A FLUID IN A CONTAINER seems to be provided by the physiological effects INCREASED HEART RATE (involving the heart as a container with blood in it) and the behavioral reaction CHEST OUT (involving the chest as a container)<sup>122</sup>

Kövecses is suggesting that the chest is a container; however I would argue that it is the whole body that is the container and that it moves out of its normal position when filled with pride. “The expression swell with pride is both a metonymy (as a result of those

<sup>117</sup> *ibid.*, 58.

<sup>118</sup> *ibid.*, 88.

<sup>119</sup> *ibid.*, 90.

<sup>120</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>121</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>122</sup> *ibid.*

behavioral reactions) and a metaphor (as a result of the above epistemic correspondence).”<sup>123</sup>

According to the following metaphors the more pride a person experiences the more pride fills the container. “*Pride welled up inside him at the sight of his garden. Her pride rose as she watched her children perform.*”<sup>124</sup> These metaphors, although referring to the filling of the container and therefore the container schema, also refer to the UP schema and the metaphor MORE IS UP as the fluid **rises** in the container.

The FLUID IN A CONTAINER metaphors are constituted by the following ontological correspondences:

- the container is the body
- the fluid in the container is pride
- for the container to be full of fluid is for pride to be intense (MORE IS UP)
- for the fluid to appear is for pride to begin to exist<sup>125</sup>

Clearly, both the CONTAINER and VERTICALITY image schemata service our understanding of pride.

### Fear

“Fear is often defined as a dangerous situation accompanied by a set of physiological and behavioral reactions.”<sup>126</sup> Bodily reactions of fear include physical agitation and increase in heart rate.<sup>127</sup> Metaphors relating to physical agitation include, “*He was shaking with fear. She was trembling like a leaf. Our enemies must be trembling in their shoes.*”<sup>128</sup> Metaphors which refer to an increase in heart rate are: “*His heart pounded with fear. My heart began to race when I saw the animal.*”<sup>129</sup> According to

<sup>123</sup> *ibid.*, 93.

<sup>124</sup> *ibid.*, 92.

<sup>125</sup> Zoltán Kövecses, *Metaphors of Anger, Pride, and Love: A Lexical Approach to the Structures of Concepts* (Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing 1978), 44.

<sup>126</sup> Kövecses, *Emotion Concepts*, 69.

<sup>127</sup> *ibid.*, 70.

<sup>128</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>129</sup> *ibid.*

Kövecses, a metonymy-based model of fear would look something like this: due to danger fear exists, with fear, subjects experience certain physiological effects and exhibit certain behavioral reactions, the subject then flees the danger.<sup>130</sup> Based on the metonymic model we can infer that the physiological reaction of increased heart rate and the behavioral reaction of physical agitation both refer to increased amount of energy. Perhaps then, fear, like happiness could result in the metaphor FEAR IS MORE MOTION.

Metaphorical explanations of fear reveal more information about the emotion. Kövecses has shown that the FEAR IS A VICIOUS ENEMY metaphor portrays fear as an enemy or opponent that presents a threat to one's survival.<sup>131</sup> The following metaphors: *There was fear lurking in her heart that she wouldn't succeed* and *Fear slowly crept up on him*, show that fear is conceptualized as an entity that can threaten lives, cause physical and mental suffering; it is viewed as an opponent that we have to defeat.<sup>132</sup> The metaphor FEAR IS A VICIOUS ENEMY clearly relates to the FORCE image schemata. Kövecses has also shown the FEAR IS AN OPPONENT metaphor where the opponent is fear.<sup>133</sup> "The physical struggle between the self and the opponent corresponds to the psychological struggle for emotional control."<sup>134</sup> The metaphors: *He was wrestling with his fear* and *Her fear overcame her* reveal a loss of control when experiencing the emotion of fear. This loss of control could be related to the BALANCE schema and thus a loss of balance when experiencing fear.

According to Johnson our bodily experience of BALANCE emerges from three separate cases.

1. Our pervasive experience of standing upright, or walking, without falling over
2. Situations when we carry an equal load in each of our hands

<sup>130</sup> *ibid.*, 74.

<sup>131</sup> *ibid.*, 75.

<sup>132</sup> *ibid.*, 75-76.

<sup>133</sup> *ibid.*, 77.

<sup>134</sup> *ibid.*

3. The experience of homeostasis within our bodily organs - when we have too much gas in our stomach we feel discomfort and attendant sensations of imbalance.<sup>135</sup>

“The BALANCE schema consists of force vectors and some point or axis or plane in relation to which those forces are distributed.”<sup>136</sup> Johnson himself shows how the metaphorical projection of BALANCE moves from a bodily sense to the emotional domain.

When I am emotionally worked-up, I feel myself to be out of balance. My world takes on a different character than it normally has. When I feel emotionally “out of balance” I am not reflecting conceptually on that imbalance; I am merely experiencing a sense of psychological distress - I am feeling something I cannot quite articulate propositionally.<sup>137</sup>

From this explanation we can see how the experience of fear could be explained as a loss of balance.

As alluded to before, fear is also understood as a natural force, Kövecses has shown how one is emotionally passive while undergoing the effects of fear.<sup>138</sup> The FEAR IS A NATURAL FORCE metaphor results in sayings such as: “*There was a surge of fear. He was flooded with fear and Fear swept over him.*”<sup>139</sup> Unlike anger where the emotion already exists inside the container, with fear the emotion comes from outside of the container and gets inside as the result of some force. In this case the force being acted upon our bodies is fear. I am suggesting that with the FORCE of fear there could be a loss of balance.

### Love

Through the detailed examination of the conventionalized language about love, Kövecses has uncovered many of the constituents that go into the structure of the concept of romantic love.<sup>140</sup> The central metaphor that makes up the concept of love is: LOVE IS

<sup>135</sup> Johnson, 79-85.

<sup>136</sup> *ibid.*, 85.

<sup>137</sup> *ibid.*, 89.

<sup>138</sup> Kövecses, *Emotion Concepts*, 78.

<sup>139</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>140</sup> Kövecses, *Metaphors of Anger, Pride and Love*, 61.

A UNITY (OF TWO COMPLEMENTARY PARTS).<sup>141</sup> Consider the following metaphors: “*We were made for each other. We are one. She is my better half. There is a perfect match. We function as a unit. They are inseparable.*”<sup>142</sup>

The UNITY metaphor suggests perfect harmony, an idyllic state. What gives rise to this is that by virtue of their perfect fit, or match, the two parts form an ideal unity in which the two parts maximally complement each other. In the biological version of unity, the two parts live in symbiosis, one part being dependent upon the other. One part is incomplete and cannot really function without the other part. In a love relationship this is experienced as the lover being only a half, the other half being made up by the beloved.<sup>143</sup>

This could be linked to the following image schemata by Mark Johnson: PART-WHOLE, BALANCE, LINK, ATTRACTION, MERGING, MATCHING,

Kövecses suggests that “once we conceive of love as two parts we can then conceive of love as a bond or attachment between two parts.”<sup>144</sup> With the idea of UNITY the two parts can dissolve, “*Sally and John broke up*”, or form a physical unity, “*They got together last year.*”<sup>145</sup> The experiential basis for the metaphor LOVE IS A UNITY results from the behavioral reaction of physical closeness.<sup>146</sup> Two people that are in love are often seen together.

Love is also an emotion whose intensity is very high. This intensity is often expressed by the amount of substance in a container. Therefore the metaphor, LOVE IS A FLUID IN A CONTAINER is supported by the following sayings: “*She was filled with love. Warmer feelings welled up inside him. She overflowed with love. He poured out his affections to her. She couldn’t hold in her love for him any longer.*”<sup>147</sup> With

<sup>141</sup> *ibid.*, 62.

<sup>142</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>143</sup> *ibid.*, 63.

<sup>144</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>145</sup> *ibid.*, 64.

<sup>146</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>147</sup> *ibid.*, 82.

love, the heart can also serve as a container for emotions: *She filled my heart with love. I love you with all my heart.*<sup>148</sup>

Love is also understood through the FORCE schema. Love can be understood as a physical or natural force.<sup>149</sup> Natural force metaphors include: *“She swept me off my feet. It was a whirlwind romance. Waves of passion came over him. She was carried away by love.”*<sup>150</sup> Kövecses has also suggested “that a person in love is like a physical object that obeys a larger physical force.”<sup>151</sup> LOVE IS A PHYSICAL FORCE (MAGNETIC, CHEMICAL, GRAVITATIONAL, etc.) is supported by the metaphors: *“I was magnetically drawn to her, They gravitated to each other immediately. I could feel the electricity between us.”*<sup>152</sup>

In summary, we can say that LOVE is conceptualized as a FORCE which takes control over the person. The FORCE can either be physical (MAGNETIC, CHEMICAL, etc.) or psychological (MAGIC). In the ideal case there is ATTRACTION at the very beginning of the relationship (love at first sight), which quickly reaches the point on the intensity scale, and goes beyond this point, leading to the state of lack of control (I was spellbound, She had me hypnotized).

### **Nonverbal Communication**

Following Kövecses’ model, I have attempted to determine the basic level image schemata and metaphorical projections used to understand emotions. Since image schemata are based on recurring bodily patterns, I felt it was necessary to research the motion or movement of emotions. In order to do this I have explored the findings of social psychologists in the field of nonverbal communication. The studies of emotion from the nonverbal point of view reveal the image schemata associated with particular emotions. By analyzing the discourse that social psychologists have used to discuss nonverbal communication, a number of image schemata and their metaphorical projections were

<sup>148</sup>ibid., 83.

<sup>149</sup> ibid., 88, 90.

<sup>150</sup> ibid., 88.

<sup>151</sup> ibid., 90.

revealed. I will begin with a brief explanation of what nonverbal communication is as well as some of the history of emotion studies which has informed it. From the field of nonverbal communication I have decided to focus on facial expressions, bodily communication (posture and gesture), and vocalization. Once again, an explanation and review of the studies conducted concerning the above will be undertaken. During my review of each of these areas, I will refer to specific experiments and studies which will hopefully reveal our understanding of happiness, sadness, fear and anger.

Non-verbal communication goes a long way in explaining the physical manifestations of emotions and plays a central role in human social behavior. The study of movement which communicates meaning is called kinesics, the “study of observable, isolated and meaningful movement in interpersonal communication.”<sup>153</sup> Non-verbal signals include “facial expression, gaze, gesture, bodily movement, posture, bodily contact, spatial behavior, clothes and appearance, non-verbal vocalizations and smell.”<sup>154</sup> Psychologist R. L. Birdwhistell identifies eight sources of potentially significant body movement: 1. total head, 2. face, 3. neck, 4. trunk, 5. shoulder, arm and wrist, 6. hand, 7. hip joint, leg and ankle, 8. foot.<sup>155</sup> Of these facial, gesture and postural movements are considered to communicate the most information.<sup>156</sup>

The construction of non-verbal communication is very much like image schemata: these gestures are considered partly innate and partly as a result of the socialization experience.<sup>157</sup> Image schemata are also partly innate (based on recurring patterns in our daily life) and cultural as their meaning is codified by society at large.

---

<sup>152</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>153</sup> Dale G. Leathers, *Nonverbal Communication Systems* (Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1976), 20.

<sup>154</sup> Michael Argyle, *Bodily Communication*, 2nd ed. (London: Rutledge, 1988), 1.

<sup>155</sup> Leathers, 20.

<sup>156</sup> *ibid.*, 21.

<sup>157</sup> Argyle, 85.

In order to determine the image schemata associated with emotions I have examined several of those theories of emotion which involve bodily expression. Darwin, for example, focuses on the physical expression of emotions in *The Expression of Emotions in Man and Animals* (1872). He concluded that the way in which both man and animals express different emotions evolved from non-verbal acts.<sup>158</sup> Darwin viewed expressive behavior as a “vestige of biologically useful movements” such as eating or fighting, “which later became innately linked with emotional experience.”<sup>159</sup> Argyle states,

[He] maintained that emotional expressions were essential to the welfare of animals living in groups, and who needed to co-operate and reproduce. He mentioned a number of ways in which emotional expression is important - enabling young infants to communicate with their mothers and obtain help from them, maintaining social interaction between mothers and infants, and others, increasing social bonds, and eliciting empathetic responses and help.<sup>160</sup>

Darwin suggested that “expressive behaviors had survival value to the species and are dropped or maintained in the same way as physical attributes.”<sup>161</sup> To Darwin, emotion was inextricably bound to the body.

Following closely after Darwin’s theory of emotion emerged the James-Lange theory (1884) which was also centered around physicality. James and Lange proposed that the experience of emotion was based on muscle awareness of bodily states, including skeletal muscle activity, muscles involved in facial and visceral activity, heart-rate, and blood pressure. This theory suggests that “we feel as we do in virtue of the bodily expression and behaviour that we are prompted towards.”<sup>162</sup> To them, emotion is the experience of bodily change. For example our posture droops which signals that we are sad.

<sup>158</sup> *ibid.*, 73.

<sup>159</sup> Shirley Weitz, *Nonverbal Communication: Reading with Commentary* 2nd ed. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1979), 19.

<sup>160</sup> Argyle, 73.

<sup>161</sup> Weitz, 19.

The association of emotions with body movement has a long history. Today researchers have continued to study how emotions are communicated by the body. Argyle suggests that emotions are transmitted through five different bodily venues:

face:	mouth, eyebrows, skin colour, facial movement
eyes:	amount of opening, pupil dilation, amount of gaze
gesture:	hand shape, hand movement, hands together, hands to face
posture:	tense or relaxed, erectness of posture, style of bodily movement
tone of voice:	pitch, speech, volume, rhythm, speech disturbance. <sup>163</sup>

The movements associated with expressions can be more thoroughly explained through “essentic forms,” elemental units of expression which suggest that each expression is determined before it begins. The nervous system is programmed to produce and recognize essentic forms which are manifested in bodily functions such as: “the electric activity of the brain, neuro-hormones, the hormonal system, the cardiovascular system.”<sup>164</sup> These output modalities are recognized from the dynamic contour or their motion rather than the part of the body used. The motivational and emotional centres in the brain occur in the hypothalamus and limbic systems which are located “immediately above the mid-brain and the brain-stem but below the cerebral cortex.”<sup>165</sup> When either the hypothalamus or limbic system is aroused it sends neural messages via the mid-brain to affect areas of emotional expression discussed above.<sup>166</sup> “Through the autonomic nervous system” the hypothalamus and limbic systems “influence the endocrine glands which release hormones into the bloodstream.”<sup>167</sup> “It is these central bodily processes which are responsible for the

---

<sup>162</sup> Simon Blackburn, ed. *Dictionary of Philosophy* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994), s.v. “emotion”

<sup>163</sup> Argyle, 73.

<sup>164</sup> Manfred Clynes, “Sentic: Communication and Generation of Emotion Through Dynamic Expression,” in *Nonverbal Communication: Readings with Commentary*, 2nd ed., ed. Shirley Weitz (New York: Oxford University Press, 1979), 387.

<sup>165</sup> Argyle, 75.

<sup>166</sup> *ibid.*, 76.

<sup>167</sup> *ibid.*

subjective sensations of emotion, as first suggested by James and Lange.”<sup>168</sup> Emotional states include three primary components: a physiological state (as explained through the hypothalamus and limbic systems), a subjective experience and a pattern of non-verbal signals.<sup>169</sup>

The face is considered the central location on the body for the expression of emotion for many reasons. Primarily it is the face that is considered the most dominant in terms of emotions because of its “visibility”, nakedness and “omnipresence.”<sup>170</sup> However this may have more to do with the mind/body dichotomy than any practical reasons.<sup>171</sup>

LaFrance and Mayo suggest that,

the face and voice have been the most extensively investigated channels of emotional expression. This may be an accurate reflection of where in fact most emotional expression takes place, but it may also reflect a bias of Western philosophical tradition, which locates important matters in the head. The body then is implicitly regarded primarily as a platform on which the head sits.<sup>172</sup>

Ekman and Frieson have shown that people make greater use of the face than the body in judgments of emotions.<sup>173</sup> However, this outlines one of the problems with decoding: subjects pay more attention to whichever feature carries the most information and this seems to be the face in most situations.<sup>174</sup> “Component parts of the face are used to: open and close channels of communication, complement or qualify verbal and/or non-verbal responses, and replace speech.”<sup>175</sup> “Although the face is capable of making hundreds of distinct movements and communicating many emotional states, those uncovered by virtually every researcher since 1940 are: surprise, anger, fear, disgust, happiness and

<sup>168</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>169</sup> *ibid.*, 71,

<sup>170</sup> Leathers, 21.

<sup>171</sup> Marianne LaFrance and Clara Mayo, *Moving Bodies: Nonverbal Communication in Social Relationships* (California: Brooks/Coles, 1986), 29.

<sup>172</sup> LaFrance, 23.

<sup>173</sup> Peter E. Bull, *Posture and Gesture* (Oxford: Pergamon Press, 1987), 22.

<sup>174</sup> Bull, 22.

sadness.”<sup>176</sup> Of these five standard emotions, I have chosen to focus on fear, sadness, happiness and anger. These four emotions surface continually in my analysis of music. Emotions other than surprise, fear, anger, disgust, happiness, and sadness may also be expressed in music but have not been studied as extensively in terms of nonverbal communication.

There are many experimental procedures used to determine what emotions are being expressed including EMG and FAST. “EMG is the electromyographic study of the facial muscles of expression during periods of self-generated emotion imagery and emotion experience.”<sup>177</sup> The experimenter requests a group of subjects to imagine a situation that makes them feel sad for example. The subjects are then “encouraged to recall or imagine a sad situation and to visualize it as clearly as possible.”<sup>178</sup> “Using surface electrodes” the experimenters “recorded the EMG activity of the frontal, corrugator, depressor anguli oris and masseter muscles of the face.”<sup>179</sup> “Of the four muscle regions monitored, the zygomatic muscle was found particularly sensitive to happy imagery while the corrugator muscle was found sensitive to sad imagery.”<sup>180</sup> Interestingly enough, it is the zygomatic muscle which is engaged in the production of a smile by generating the upward curve of the mouth.<sup>181</sup> Given this information we can see one reason why happy emotions are mapped onto the VERTICALITY schemata. Happiness is understood in terms of the HAPPY IS UP metaphor partly because when people are experiencing happy emotions the zygomatic muscle is engaged in pulling the corners of the mouth upwards. Various metaphors from our language support this finding. *I’m feeling up, My spirits rose, I was floating on air,*

---

<sup>175</sup> Mark L. Knapp, *Essentials of Nonverbal Communication* (New York: Hold Rinehart, and Winston, 1980), 162.

<sup>176</sup> *ibid.*, 167.

<sup>177</sup> Aaron Wolfgang, *Nonverbal Behavior: Applications and Cultural Implication* (New York: Academic Press, 1979), 33.

<sup>178</sup> Wolfgang, 33.

<sup>179</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>180</sup> Weitz., 61.

*Flying like a kite, Flying high, Walking two feet above the ground, In seventh heaven, and On top of the world.*

With Ekman's Facial Affect Score Techniques (FAST) coding is broken down into three areas of the face: 1. brows/forehead, 2. eyes/eye lids, bridge, 3. the lower face including cheek, nose, mouth, chin and jaw.<sup>182</sup> For each component part of the face the experimenter records "an acceptable range of movements or positions which are enacted" in order to communicate emotion.<sup>183</sup> Happiness is best decoded from the cheeks, mouth, brows and forehead.<sup>184</sup>

With happiness the corners of the lips are drawn back and up. The mouth may or may not be parted with teeth exposed or not. A wrinkle (the nasolabial) runs down from the nose to the outer edge beyond the lip corners. The cheeks are raised. The lower eyelid shows wrinkles below it, and may be raised but not tense. Crow's-feet wrinkles go outward from the outer corners of the eyes.<sup>185</sup>

In terms of the facial expression of happiness the movement can be generally interpreted as upward and expansive. The upward movement comes from the raising of the corners of the mouth, the raising of the cheeks and the raising of the lower eye lids. The expansive movement comes again from the smile as the lips are drawn back. Expansive movements could be understood in terms of the CONTAINER image schemata. If we have a particular mold in which we normally hold our face, the manifestation of happiness could be understood as moving out of that mold, especially if you contrast it to sadness. With a sad face the movement is contained and moves inward within the container. With happiness, the face moves out of the normal range of motion.

---

<sup>181</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>182</sup> Knapp, 167.

<sup>183</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>184</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>185</sup> *ibid.*, 174.

Sadness is best decoded from the eyebrow and forehead region, the eyes and eyelids as well as the mouth.<sup>186</sup>

The inner corners of the eyebrows are drawn up. The skin below the eyebrows is triangulated, with the inner corners up. The upper eyelid inner corner is raised. The corners of the lips are down or the lip is trembling.<sup>187</sup>

This explanation seems to go against my hypothesis that SAD IS DOWN. However, it could be that we are not as likely to communicate sadness as happiness. People are generally more likely to share their happy emotions with others more than sad emotions. Generally speaking, I believe that we want other people to think we are happy and thus sadness is probably not as commonly communicated. Secondly, the above example shows that the movement involved in the expression of sadness is not expansive but moves inwards. This could relate to the CONTAINER image schemata. If the things in the CONTAINER are moving inward, then the container is less full and less expansive. Although most of the above explanation would seem to focus on upward gestures the average person perceives the sad face as the opposite of a happy face, the mouth points down and all other changes are directed inwards. Ask anybody to draw a sad face and the most prominent feature of the drawn picture will be the downward facing mouth. This being argued, we can see how the idea of sadness is understood through the VERTICALITY schema and more specifically through the metaphor SAD IS DOWN. Various metaphors from our language also support my hypothesis. Consider: *I'm feeling down, I fell into a depression, My spirits sank, In a slump, Down in the dumps*. Finally, happiness is generally thought of as a positive emotion, whereas its opposite, sadness is thought of as a negative emotion. Recall the metaphor discussed earlier: MORE IS UP, LESS IS DOWN. Clearly then, positive emotion is thought of as up and the negative emotion is thought of as DOWN.

<sup>186</sup> *ibid.*, 167.

<sup>187</sup> *ibid.*, 175.

The third emotion which I will discuss in terms of facial expressions is anger. Next to happiness, anger is the easiest facial expression to determine.<sup>188</sup> This could be due to the fact that unlike happiness and sadness which can be determined by decoding, two of the three major areas of the face (1. brows/forehead, 2. eyes/eyelids, 3. lower face/mouth) the decoding of anger requires a view of all three areas.<sup>189</sup> Because it is expressed by the entire face it is the easiest emotion to decode. The facial expression of anger involves:

The brows being lowered and drawn together. Vertical lines to appear between the brows. The lower lid is tensed and may or may not be raised. The upper lid is tensed and may or may not be lowered by the action of the brow. The eyes have a hard stare and may have a bulging appearance. The lips are in either of two basic positions: pressed together, with the corners straight or down; or open, tensed in a squarish shape as if shouting. The nostrils may be dilated, but this is not essential to the anger facial expression and may also occur in sadness.<sup>190</sup>

The two key things here are that movement involves lowering parts of the face as well as a great deal of tension. Obviously anger is understood in terms of the same VERTICALITY schema as happiness and sadness, however it may be that anger is thought of as low on the VERTICALITY scale rather than down. Therefore the metaphor may be a little different, ANGER IS LOW. The tension in the face when experiencing anger can be related to the FORCE schema. The force involved with anger relates to pressure,<sup>191</sup> in this case the tension in the face. The metaphor, "He was blue in the face,"<sup>192</sup> assumes a FORCE in action on the face, in this case pressure or tension.

The body also supplies vital information concerning the expression of emotions. As mentioned before, more attention has been given to facial expression than bodily expression. However, as author Peter Bull suggests, "We speak of jumping for joy, clenching our fists in anger and covering fear so there may well be body movement

<sup>188</sup> Argyle, 83.

<sup>189</sup> *ibid.*, 131.

<sup>190</sup> Knapp, 173.

<sup>191</sup> Zoltán Kövecses, *Emotion Concepts* (New York: Springer-Verlag, 1990), 54.

<sup>192</sup> Kövecses, *Emotion Concepts*, 55.

associated with particular emotions.”<sup>193</sup> Also the communication of emotions offered by the body is very important because unlike the face which is able to conceal the emotion being experienced by the person, the body is not as likely to conceal this information.

There are easier ways to tell when a smiling person is not in fact happy. Look to the body. The body often offers different information about the feelings a person is trying to conceal, people don't try as hard to manage their bodies as they do their faces.<sup>194</sup>

Although the face is the most expressive channel for specific emotions, the body is a channel for expressing general emotions such as tense versus relaxed and degree of arousal. The body is highly involved in emotion, for example in psychiatric interviews patients have been found to move more when discussing emotionally loaded topics.<sup>195</sup> As mentioned before, according to the James-Lange theory of emotion, “bodies react to situations and people take note of their own bodily reaction to decide what emotions they are experiencing.”<sup>196</sup> This alone speaks to the importance of the body and emotional expression. Bodily communication of emotion is expressed through gesture and posture. “Posture plays an important role for many animals in signaling dominance, threat, submission and other interpersonal attitudes.”<sup>197</sup> There are a number of elements used to decode the communication expressed by posture.

lean: forwards, backwards, sideways  
 arms: open, closed, on hips  
 head: lowered, raised, tilted sideways  
 legs: stretched, open, crossed<sup>198</sup>

Other elements such as body orientation and body openness are also important in understanding emotions.<sup>199</sup> Positive attitude and meaning are taken from a forward lean or

<sup>193</sup> Bull, 22.

<sup>194</sup> LaFrance, 32. This was an experiment conducted by Ekman and Fricson in 1964.

<sup>195</sup> Argyle, 29.

<sup>196</sup> LaFrance, 33.

<sup>197</sup> Argyle, 203.

<sup>198</sup> *ibid.*, 206.

<sup>199</sup> Bull, 23.

a decrease in backward lean as well as body openness.<sup>200</sup> Clearly, details of posture can be related to the CONTAINER schema. Expansive posture can be understood as moving out of the container, whereas drooping posture can be understood as moving inward.

Gesture generally refers to “voluntary bodily actions by the hands, head or other parts of the body.”<sup>201</sup> “There is a great deal of bodily movement during social interaction although the hands are considered the most informative.”<sup>202</sup> Hand gestures generally communicate very specific things such as the hand gestures for “come here” or “go away”. We can show joy or pleasure or displeasure with a thumbs up or thumbs down. This relates once again to the positive being UP on the VERTICALITY scale and the negative being DOWN on the VERTICALITY scale. When decoding the messages hand gestures communicate, three components based on sign language are considered. Firstly the area in which the hand directs attention, secondly the shape of the hand and finally the type of movement whether it be up or down, towards or away, in or out. It is clear especially from the last example how image schemata could relate to gesture.

The study of sadness as an emotion has been investigated through depressed patients under psychiatric observation. With depression the movement is slow, gestures are few and hesitant, non-emphatic and there is the use of hiding gestures (hiding face and other modes of communication).<sup>203</sup> From this information we can conclude that sadness is understood as less movement. Sadness can also be understood through the VERTICALITY schemata. Depressives have drooping, listless posture and sit brooding, looking at the floor.<sup>204</sup> “Depressed people have literally downcast eyes. When we ask whether someone is down we are apparently posing a literal as well as a psychological question. It has been

<sup>200</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>201</sup> Argyle, 188.

<sup>202</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>203</sup> *ibid.*, 197.

<sup>204</sup> *ibid.*, 210.

found that depressed people droop their heads and mouths in addition to their eyes.”<sup>205</sup>

Body language also supports the metaphor SAD IS DOWN.

Wolff’s studies of patients in 1945 showed that hand movements associated with elation are “fast, expansive, rhythmical, spontaneous, emphatic, self-assertive, and affected.”<sup>206</sup> From this physiological information we can deduce the metaphor HAPPY IS MORE MOTION. Because psychiatrists are not generally as concerned with happy people as they are depressed patients it is difficult to find clinical information to back up this metaphor. However one only has to look to their own experiences of happiness to know that when they are in a happy mood their bodily movements are accelerated, lively, and more extravagant. Also, HAPPY IS MORE MOTION can be supported by the metaphors: *She walked with a spring in her step, She jumped for joy, Up beat, and Perky.*

Both HAPPY IS MORE MOTION and SAD IS LESS MOTION also refer to the amount of FORCE being exerted by the body. In the case of happiness, more effort is exerted from the body and with sadness there is less force involved.

The last venue of non-verbal communication to be explored is the voice. The voice is very effective for communicating sadness, fear and anger.<sup>207</sup> In 1964 Davitz “reported that emotions rated as active, such as anger, were expressed by fast rates of speech, high volumes of loudness, and high pitch levels in contrast to passive emotions such as sadness which were expressed in slower and lower speech.”<sup>208</sup> Other experiments have also shown the speech of sad people to be linked with slow tempo and low pitch and anger associated with a fast tempo and high pitch.<sup>209</sup> Again, the connections between music and emotions can be characterized through pitch and tempo.

<sup>205</sup> LaFrance, 53. Experiment conducted by Waxler in 1974.

<sup>206</sup> Argyle, 197.

<sup>207</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>208</sup> LaFrance, 29.

<sup>209</sup> *ibid.*

The experiments for anger have come out of research on Type A (TABP) personalities. TABP is defined as an action-emotion complex consisting of hard-driving, job involvement, competitiveness, time urgency, hostility, and low threshold for anger.<sup>210</sup> Findings which result from experiments on anger consistently show that anger is associated with increased speech rate, loudness and pitch.<sup>211</sup> To test anger, TABP's are placed in challenging and provocative interviews. The males with potential hostility and anger spoke more loudly, more quickly and interrupted the interviewer more often than did low-anger scorers.<sup>212</sup> As mentioned before it is widely assumed that although it is relatively easy to control one's facial expressions, other expressive behaviors (including vocal) are difficult to control.<sup>213</sup> There is some evidence that other nonverbal behaviors such as gesture and body movements may also be affected by anger but so far most of this evidence is clinical and anecdotal. These nonverbal indicators of anger and hostility include excessively forceful use of hands and fingers and use of clenched fists.<sup>214</sup>

Social psychologist Michael Argyle brings up music in his discussion of non-verbal signals stating art and music also consist of non-verbal expression due to the fact that they cannot be translated into words.<sup>215</sup> It is interesting to note that both emotions and traditional Nineteenth Century accounts of music were thought to transcend verbal communication. The literature on both music and emotions talks about the transcending quality of both. This could be because the power of communication of emotion and music take place on a more physical level. This link between the verbal transcendence of music and emotion could prove to be quite revealing because as Argyle states later that "nonverbal signals have a much greater impact than equivalent verbal signals in communicating

<sup>210</sup> Aron W. Siegman and Stanley Feldstein eds. *Multichannel Integrations of Nonverbal Behavior* (New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 1985), 53.

<sup>211</sup> Siegman, 53.

<sup>212</sup> *ibid.*, 54.

<sup>213</sup> *ibid.*, 57.

<sup>214</sup> *ibid.*, 57-58.

expression to others,”<sup>216</sup> perhaps explaining the power of music. The study of non-verbal communication has revealed some overlapping similarities between music and emotions. Clynes has suggested that expressive movement is an entity in time as the expression of joy, anger, and sadness, for example, are a temporal and physical process.<sup>217</sup> This explanation is very similar to many explanations of music as it is often described as a temporal process. Music is not like a painting, one can not stand in front of it and take the whole thing in. Listening to a piece of music occurs over time and can not be taken in all at once. Likewise, emotions occur over time. Something happens, an emotion is triggered and the emotion lasts until feelings are resolved or dissipate. From the wealth of information pertaining to bodily movement as a temporal process comparisons between the movement involved with music and the movement used by the body can begin to be drawn. LaFrance has used theater as proof that bodily movement is communicative, “body movement is used to communicate feeling in Japanese theater, Indian dance, and French mime; it may be that motor movement plays a greater part in the expression of emotion than we know.”<sup>218</sup>

### **“Cross Domain Mapping”<sup>219</sup>: Music and Emotions**

Having shown the bodily experiences related to emotions as well as our metaphorical understanding of them it is possible to see the similarities between the metaphors of emotions and the metaphors of music. By showing the similarities between the metaphors of emotions and music it is possible to see how people hear music as emotional.

---

<sup>215</sup> Argyle, 8.

<sup>216</sup> *ibid.*, 85.

<sup>217</sup> Clynes, 386.

<sup>218</sup> LaFrance, 29.

<sup>219</sup> This term is borrowed from Lawrence Zibkowski.

Let us begin with the metaphor HAPPY IS UP which was supported by the evidence of the happy face as well as some metaphors from our everyday language. Music can be heard as happy not only if it has upward moving gestures in its melody line but also if the music is high in orchestral or instrumental range, or if it is sounding at a high volume. The metaphor HAPPY IS MORE MOTION supported by everyday discourse such as, *jumping for joy*, suggests that music which is faster or has very active melody and harmony lines which move around a lot will be heard as happy. Finally the happy face being understood as an expansive movement out of the CONTAINER suggests that expansive music will be heard as happy. What do I mean by expansive? Depending on the context, increased orchestration, slower melody with a lot of vibrato for example will sound expansive and in some situations expressive of happiness.

Turning to the emotion sadness and the metaphors SAD IS DOWN, SAD IS MOVEMENT WITHIN A CONTAINER and SAD IS LESS MOTION it is clear that sadness is understood as the opposite of happiness. The SAD IS DOWN metaphor is supported by depressed patients who spoke at a low pitch and had drooping postures, not to mention the corners of the mouth which are drawn down in a sad face. Music is heard as sad when metaphors which suggest downward movement or are low on the VERTICALITY scale occur. This may take the form of falling melody lines, low range of instrument or orchestration, and low dynamic levels. The metaphor SAD IS MOVEMENT WITHIN A CONTAINER clearly depends on the context of the music. It may mean that a musical theme may be changed from full orchestration to much less instrumentation. With less instrumentation there is movement within the container. Also a decreased volume level would indicate the presence of the same metaphor thus expressing sadness in the music. Finally the metaphor SAD IS LESS MOTION supported by observations of depressed patients moving and talking more slowly than non-depressed patients also manifests itself

in music not only by music which is slower but also that has less active melody and harmony parts.

With anger the metaphors discussed by Kövecses including ANGER IS THE HEAT OF A FLUID IN A CONTAINER and ANGER IS FIRE, suggest that anger is understood as a FORCE. This is supported by the evidence that angry people display fast rates of speech, high volumes of loudness and high pitch levels. This bodily evidence suggests that anger in music would also be heard as a FORCE. This force would probably take the same forms as the bodily manifestations of anger including fast tempo, high volume and high pitch levels. The music may also be heard as forceful through powerful orchestration or percussive melodies which have a forceful impact on the listener. The evidence of an angry face showed that all facial parts moved downwards when angry. From this is derived the metaphor ANGRY IS LOW. I believe that music orchestrated in the low register would also add to the expression of anger.

Pride is both understood through the VERTICALITY and CONTAINER schemata. Kövecses' metaphor PRIDE IS A FLUID IN A CONTAINER results from the physical behavior of expansive gestures and upright posture when proud. Music is heard as proud when these expansive metaphors occur as well. They may take the form of lush orchestration and slower more expansive melody lines as suggested before. The metaphor PRIDE IS UP is heard in music as upward moving melodies, high range, and high dynamic levels.

Fear, like anger is also understood primarily as a FORCE. One can be so flooded with fear that one can lose ones BALANCE. The psychological distress of fear can literally cause a loss of balance. Fear, however is also understood as MORE MOTION, this being supported by the racing heart when experiencing fear. From this we can understand why fast music is heard as of expressive of fear. Film music uses the BALANCE metaphor to excess when producing music which is expressive of fear. In film, music which is heard

as expressive of fear lacks a tonal center and even a sense of gravity as it moves all over sporadically in a haphazard way. The FORCE image schemata is heard rather directly in music expressive of fear through sharp attacks and percussive accentuation in the music.

Finally, Kövecses showed how love is understood through the metaphors, LOVE IS A UNITY and LOVE IS THE FLUID IN A CONTAINER. The unity metaphor is supported by the fact that people in love are often seen together. In music this could be represented by melody lines which come together. The LOVE IS A FLUID IN A CONTAINER metaphor is very similar to the expansiveness of pride, however this time the heart is the container swelling. Like pride, love is expressed in music through expansive melody lines and orchestration.

From the above explanation it can be seen that several emotions are understood through the same image schemata of more or less motion, up or down, force, and container. Once again the concept of polysemy is important. This flexibility allows us to understand many different things in the same way. It is as interpreting human beings that we are able to take the most meaningful perspective and understand which emotion is being expressed.

In my analysis of both music and emotions I have found that music may be expressive of the emotions discussed in this chapter, specifically: anger, pride, fear, happiness, sadness, and love. As will be seen in the analysis in the next chapter with the expression of emotions of music many emotions occur along a scale of sad to happy. On this scale subtle emotions can be understood as variations on these basic states. For example the elegiac quality of the music in *Glory* is likened to a type of sadness. Pride and love are also basic emotions which are understood through a full, swelling, or overflowing container. Once again, variations on these emotions such as dignity can be understood through pride. Love can be understood as a scale, moving from platonic to passionate. However, all love will be understood through the swelling container metaphor.

To conclude, I believe music is capable of expressing anger, pride, fear, happiness, sadness, love, and variations on these basic emotions. I will discuss how these emotions and variations on them are expressed in the music using the theory of understanding as created by Lakoff and Johnson. Through the use of the image schemata and metaphors discussed above it will be shown how music is expressive of emotions. Of course a deeper penetration of music and emotions would require the theories' of Lakoff and Johnson as well as musical rhetoric, direct association and personal context. I have tried not to use these methods of analysis in the following chapter, however they often creep in, enhancing the expression of emotion as explained through the theories of Lakoff and Johnson.

## Chapter Three

### **Applying the Theories of Lakoff and Johnson**

Having outlined the image schemata that form our perception of music and emotions, I would like to offer an application of the theories of Lakoff and Johnson. My application shows that because both music and emotions are understood using the same image schemata, we hear music as expressing emotions. Of all the genres of music available, I have chosen to explore film music in order to investigate the role that the expression of emotion plays in music. As a genre of music which is often used to deepen emotional situations, film music serves my purpose well. Unlike pure instrumental music, film music offers an object of the emotion, thus making a much clearer association between emotions and music.

I have chosen to investigate the 1989 film *Glory* directed by Edward Zwick, with music composed by James Horner. After watching many films and paying close attention to their music, the choice of *Glory* became obvious because of its range of emotional expression. *Glory* is set during the American civil war. It tells the sometimes exhilarating, sometimes tragic story of the first all-black regiment to enlist in the United States Army.

The film opens with a brief background explanation of the main character: “Robert Gould Shaw, the son of a wealthy Boston abolitionist, was twenty-three years old when he enlisted to fight in the war between the States.”<sup>1</sup> The music which accompanies this caption is played alone by the trumpet.

---

<sup>1</sup> Kevin Jarre, *Glory*, produced by Freddie Fields, directed by Edward Zwick, 2 hours., Tristar Pictures, 1989. videocassette.

## Ex. 1

C trumpet

It is an ascending G-major triad with the top D held, falling by a step to descend on an F-major triad, holding the bottom F. The F major triad then rises, held on the C and follows with a final major-third descent from B to G. The trumpet music is slow and sounds as if it is far away. Following the trumpet solo, the snare drum enters with a rhythm that consists of two eighth notes, four sixteenths and one quarter. The snare drum also plays slowly but at a much louder dynamic level and crescendos into the following vocal section.

Although, some would argue that this music is used merely for its military associations, however I believe it expresses much more. All the audience knows about the film so far is that a very young Robert Gould Shaw is fighting in the war between the States. This simple trumpet melody expresses a lot about the emotions surrounding the fighting of a war. I believe it expresses the joy of victory, the “agony” of defeat, and the pride of fighting for your own beliefs. The trumpet melody is able to express all these things through its dynamics, tempo, melody and timbre. The initial ascent of the melody has its association with the VERTICALITY schema. As we learned in the previous chapter, the emotions associated with upward movement and thus the UP image schemata are happiness and pride. This initial ascent on the G major triad and later the ascent of the F major triad express the joy of victory and pride in fighting that come when fighting

in a war. The openness of the initial ascent of the G major triad suggests a breaking out of the CONTAINER and thus is expressive of pride. The container here is the melodic range of the melody. Because the melody ascends by a major third and then ascends again by a minor third it sounds as though it is breaking out of a CONTAINER in terms of range. The openness is also felt because of this double ascent in addition to the fact that the top note of the triad is held, giving it an open sound. Clearly war is not generally thought of as a joyful and gratifying event: it is also a very tragic time when battles end in defeat and lives are lost. It is through the juxtaposition of the UP/DOWN image schemata that both the joy and misfortune of war is asserted. The tragedy of war is being expressed in this trumpet melody. The two descending triads which follow the ascending ones have their association with the VERTICALITY schema as well, however this time with the DOWN schema. As was argued in the previous chapter, sadness is associated with the DOWN image schemata because of our understanding of a sad person being one who has a slumped posture and is often looking downward. The shape of the melody line is not the only component of this musical excerpt which makes it sad. Both the ascending and descending parts of the melody are played very slowly relating to the SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT metaphor. We often associate sadness with a loss of energy and movement. The melody is played very quietly by the trumpet and sounds as though it is coming from a distance. This low dynamic level also has its associations with the SAD IS DOWN metaphor. When the snare drum enters (with its rhythm) the dynamic level is much louder, contrasting with the quiet level of the initial trumpet melody.

As we enter the world of the film, it is dawn and the camera pans across a field where the soldiers have set up camp. The sun rises against the background of white tents.

The camera shows a row of canons and then turns back to the tents. The focus then changes to the men in the camp, some of them carrying guns, others sitting by the fire, cooking and smoking, reading the newspaper. A man is handing out mail and a few men are enjoying a game of baseball. From this scene it is apparent that the camp is full, the men have been there for quite some time and they are heavily involved in war.

The music that accompanies this opening scene is the same as the trumpet music that was played with the opening caption. **Ex. #2**

Boys Choir

The trumpet continues to play the melody line this time with the Boys Choir of Harlem. The snare drum continues to accompany the melody with the same rhythm. The music as a whole is much louder than the initial trumpet statement of the melody. Throughout this melody the strings play a constant tremolo accompaniment. At the beginning of each statement of the melody, there is an extremely low orchestral drone note played by the

timpani, lower strings, and low brass. The third time this melody is repeated by the boys choir the melody rises out of its original range. The melody rises on its original G major triad, then falls from d to c, down to a, and up to f and ends with another rising statement of the F major triad and then makes a final major third descent from b to g. It both moves higher and out of the original range.

The music here continues to express the same emotions as discussed before, however this time pride is expressed in a much more overt way. The second occurrence of the trumpet melody is much different from the original statement. In many ways it calls to one's attention the CONTAINER image schemata. The second statement of the trumpet melody is enhanced by the addition of the boys choir. Not only does the boys choir join in the melody, but there is an addition of an accompaniment that was essentially absent from the original trumpet melody. The accompaniment to the melody and low string and timpani lines includes a string tremolo which enhances and adds depth to the snare drum rhythm. Also, the use of string tremolo on a single pitch creates tension. Both the addition of the boys choir and accompaniment seem to imply the swelling of the contents of the container. In this case the container is the orchestration used for the melody. In the previous instance it was the trumpet alone that played the melody. This time the orchestration has swelled to include the boys choir and orchestra. The expression of pride was discussed in terms of a swelling container in the previous chapter. The high range and lightness of the boys' voices suggests breaking out of the container. In this instance the container refers to vocal range. In terms of a soprano, alto, tenor, bass vocal range, the boys choir is very high in range and thus breaking out of the container. The sad part of the melody is still present, but it is diminished by the many

associations with the UP metaphors. Pride is not only expressed in the timbre of the musical excerpt, but also in its melody line. The second statement of the trumpet theme is different from the first in that it rises above the previous range from the high point of a D to the high point of a F. This rising of the melody line out of the original container also has its association with PRIDE AS A FLUID IN A CONTAINER. With pride the container is always quite full or swelling. Also because the melody line rises higher than the original there is the association with the PRIDE IS UP metaphor. Although the melody is made louder by the addition of instruments, it is also clearly being presented at an increased dynamic level, even as the previous statement in the trumpet was made to sound far away. This increase in the dynamic level also contributes to the swelling of the container and thus the expression of pride. Although this second statement of the trumpet melody is made to sound as though it is a lot more positive, the element of tragedy is also expressed in more depth. The addition of the low strings' and the timpani's ominous, resounding note to the downbeat of the snare drum line help to express the tragedy of war. It is because the timpani note is so low in the range of the orchestra as well as the instrumentation surrounding it in this context that it is associated with the SAD IS DOWN metaphor.

The scene changes once again to show the soldiers armed with guns lining a path in the forest. As soldiers on horses ride through the lined path, the soldiers on foot fall in behind and begin to march forward. The music that accompanies this scene is the snare drum rhythm with low orchestral accompaniment on the downbeat.

The lack of melody and the low register of the only pitched note being played here express the ominous and foreboding aspects associated with war. There is no motion of a

melody line and also the trumpet continues to play its rhythm very slowly and methodically. There is not necessarily an emotion being expressed here, at least in the sense that they were discussed in the previous chapter, however, it is interesting to see how Lakoff and Johnson's theory still applies. The ominous sound tells us that all is not well and foreshadows the negative outcome of the battle that the soldiers are marching into. The low register is the opposite of the MORE IS UP metaphor and implies a negative connotation through the LESS IS DOWN metaphor. This is not to say that rhetoric and direct association are not playing a role in the ominous and foreboding expression of this section. The snare drum with its military associations as well as the rhetorical use of the rising semitone to express foreboding contribute to the emotions expressed in this scene along with the expression of emotions through image schemata and metaphor.

From this point we get a close up of the troops, marching forward with their guns. Heard above this is Robert, narrating a letter which he has written home to his Mother. The camera pans back to show the huge number of men that have congregated to fight. From this scene we can tell that many men have gathered and a large camp has been set up. In his letter, Robert tells his Mother that there is no need to worry because such large troops are being assembled that an attack would be unlikely.

The scene changes once again as the soldiers march along a dirt trail, following a soldier carrying the American flag. The soldiers pass groups of black people who move aside in order to let them through. Robert tells his Mother how grand it is to meet the men from all the states ready to fight for their country. Robert goes on to say that this time they must make it a whole country for all who live here so that all can speak. He tells his

Mother that many men in his regiment had not even seen a black man before the war. He goes on to state that there are many blacks who are dispossessed. It is clear from his letter that Robert believes in equal rights for black citizens and that he believes the time for equality has come and that he is optimistic.

It is during a close-up of Robert writing his letter home that we first hear the main theme music for the movie. **Ex. 3**

Boys Choir *rubato*

The music is much slower than anything that has preceded it. It is introduced by the boys choir who sing only the vowel sound ooh. The boys choir sing the melody in two parts. The top line sings the main theme-music while the second vocal line runs underneath it in counterpoint stressing the SAD IS DOWN metaphor. The SAD IS DOWN metaphor is stressed here because the counterpoint of the second vocal line is below the melody line. The counterpoint follows very much the shape and rhythm of the melody line. During the descending sixths of the main melody, the voices accompany with long held notes underneath. There is no orchestral accompaniment besides the

occasional snare drum roll which is always accompanied by a rising semitone played by the lower strings in the orchestra on the down beat.

The main theme music which accompanies the reading of Robert's letter invokes the sadness that is associated with the homesickness that Robert must feel as he writes. The music is heard as sad for several reasons. The slow tempo and the long held notes of the main theme elicit the metaphor SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT. Not only is Robert's sadness expressed here, but also the sadness surrounding the inequality of blacks in the country as well as their status as dispossessed. This sadness is particularly well expressed by the descending pattern of sixths. Not only is the metaphor SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT suggested, but also the metaphor, SAD IS DOWN. The quiet dynamic level also invokes the metaphor SAD IS DOWN because quiet dynamics are thought of as being low on the VERTICALITY scale. Within this sadness the pride of joining men from all over the states to make a whole country is being expressed, the pride of trying to make right out of wrong. The pride is expressed through the metaphors PRIDE IS UP and PRIDE IS THE SWELLING OF A CONTAINER. The ascending lines in the main theme are quarter notes as opposed to the longer notes which are used for descending lines. Therefore the ascending lines are played faster than the descending lines emphasizing their positive message. The swelling occurs near the beginning of the phrase as the dotted half note C grows out of the eighth note B and returns to B. The swelling in and out of B suggests the swelling associated with pride.

The main theme music continues; however it is now played by the upper strings. The sound is slower and more lush. Only the strings play here with harmony and melody. The main theme has also modulated a step down. In his letter Robert tells his

Mother that the men fight for men and women whose poetry is not yet written but which is presently as renowned and enviable as any. Robert's pride for the soldiers is expressed in the change of orchestration. By changing from a quiet soprano vocal line to a full, lush string sound the container has been filled out. Therefore, the PRIDE IS A SWELLING CONTAINER is invoked and pride is expressed in the music.

The scene changes to the soldiers marching home at dark and then to Robert in his tent writing the letter to his Mother. He sits by the candle light while smoking a cigar. He tells his Mother of a defeat he heard of the previous night. He also informs her that he has been made captain of one hundred men, most of them older than he. The camera then pans the whole camp at dusk. The main theme music continues in the strings.

The scene changes to dawn and the troops march out of camp once again. Robert heads up his regiment, but it is clear that his regiment comprises only a few in a sea of soldiers. It is at this point that the text on the screen informs us that they are assembling for the battle at Atietam Creek in Maryland on September 17, 1862.

An ascending line raises the main theme higher. The main-theme-music continues but this time it has modulated up to begin on D. In addition, the trumpet plays its rhythmic rising and falling variation on the major triads much faster than before. At Robert's words, "love can overcome all odds," bells toll in the accompaniment suggesting a greater swelling. Like the boys' voices before, the strings are breaking out of the container by playing high in their register. It is much more heightened and majestic. This music leads Robert's march into battle.

The ascending line moves the main theme to what sounds like a higher level and helps to express the pride and courage of the men as they head into battle. The metaphor

PRIDE IS UP is invoked by the rising line and the modulation to a higher key. The increase in orchestration in this section provided both by the tolling bells and trumpet melody also cause the containers to be fuller than previously. The containers here once again refer to the orchestration. Because there is an addition to the orchestration, the orchestration container is more full. This also expresses the emotion of pride as the men head into battle at Atietam.

Robert heads his troops into battle. They are met with strident opposition and his troop suffers many casualties. Despite the many casualties they continue to advance until their superior officer is hit. At the same time Robert goes down and the troops retreat. Robert lies on the ground with his hands over his head, trying to block out the sounds of war.

The scene changes and it is morning. Robert remains in the same submissive position on the ground as during his fall in battle. The black slaves are gathering up all the dead bodies for the graves they have dug. One of the slaves kicks Robert to see if he is alive. As Robert rises, the music begins. There is a shot of black smoke drifting across an orange sun. Robert stands and looks across the field, observing the devastating effect of what has happened. There are dead men strewn across the ground and others that have obviously been seriously injured. He walks away slowly from this scene of devastation against the soundscape of guns and canons going off. Robert touches the small wound on his neck he got from a gun breezing him. As he continues to walk away others continue to fight and Robert stops to stare in disbelief at what has happened. The scene then changes to the infirmary where the screams of pain tell us that most men are much worse off than Robert. In the infirmary the doctor attending to Robert tells him that Lincoln is

going to issue an emancipation proclamation. He plans to free the slaves. Despite the casualties Robert's troops suffered, the battle was won.

When Robert is woken in the fields, the violins play a long sustained note out of which grows the main theme music sung by the boys choir once again. The theme is sung very slowly. While the repeated melody is being sung, the trumpet interjects some dissonant ascending triads and single pitches accompanied by timpani and snare drum rolls, as the main theme is repeated in a fuller version. This time it includes harmonies in the lower voices as opposed to the single soprano melody. The scene ends with a string melody rising a fourth from d to g, then rising another fourth to c, and finally falling in stepwise motion down to a.

#### Ex. 4



The first statement of the main theme music is sung quietly and slowly by the boys choir. The slow movement of the melody implies the metaphor SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT and thus contributes to the music's sadness. The sopranos singing the melody line produce a much smaller sound than what preceded and are accompanied by single held harmonies underneath, sung by the altos. The counterpoint movement in the accompanying voices is in the same shape and rhythm as the melody line and as such has the same slow movement--at times even slower--than the melody line. This also reflects the SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT metaphor. The low dynamic level of this music is linked to the VERTICALITY schema. Because quiet volumes are thought of as being low on the VERTICALITY scale the metaphor SAD IS DOWN is in fact invoked by the quiet singing. The trumpet enters to play its melody but the triads are much more dissonant and compressed this time. The trumpet triads are smaller, more dissonant than before and

therefore more within the container. The trumpet does not always play triads, it also plays a flat repeated dissonant note implying SADNESS IS LESS MOVEMENT. The timpani and snare drum play a rhythm low in range due to the dominating timpani timbre. This invokes the SAD IS DOWN metaphor. In this statement of the main theme, the pride aspect of the theme is overshadowed by the continual associations with the SAD IS DOWN and SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT metaphors which are more strongly present than the PRIDE IS UP and PRIDE IS THE SWELLING OF A CONTAINER metaphors.

The second statement of the theme music is fuller because of the increased number of voices used. The increase in vocals seems to provide an accentuation on the descending sixth and octave intervals of the main theme, thus emphasizing the SAD IS DOWN metaphor. This part of the melody is made up of very slow, long held notes: a d rising by a fourth to g, rising by another fourth to c and then falling in stepwise motion from c to b to a. This invokes the SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT metaphor and expresses the sadness of the music. Also the final c, b, a descent in the string melody expresses the SAD IS DOWN metaphor.

The scene changes to a party at Robert's parents' home in Boston. The scene begins with Robert overlooking the party. There is an emphasis on the richness (both in terms of wealth and colours) of the scene: a stained glass window in the ceiling; brightly coloured fruits and vegetables being served. The music takes place in the world of the film and thus is diegetic. There is a woman playing a Classical piano sonata. This music expresses restraint and control. It is perhaps expressive of a more content version of happiness due to the orderly nature and qualities of clarity and balance that are evoked with Classical piano music. The emphasis on formal beauty suggest a more controlled version of happiness. Its moderate tempo and active melody and accompaniment full of both rising and falling gestures suggests the metaphor HAPPY IS MORE MOVEMENT.

In addition, this piano piece provides a direct contrast from the legato lines of the slow theme music which preceded it, thus showing the enormous contrast between the setting of war and the home of a wealthy Boston family. It is clear in this situation how rhetoric as well as the theories of Lakoff and Johnson contribute to the content expression of happiness in this scene.

As Robert walks amongst the company gathered at the party the vocal music starts again. Robert looks very troubled as he watches a man in a wheel chair pushed through a doorway. The vocal music that accompanies Robert's sadness is a soprano, alto, tenor choir melody with the soprano line slowly ascending in a stepwise manner through a descending minor second sequence. The other voices descend in counterpoint to the soprano line. The vocal music is quite quiet, but it crescendos and the line ascends as the man in the wheel chair is brought through the doorway, emphasizing Robert's quiet reflection on the war. His sadness over lives ruined and lost and questioning of why he survived is reflected in the sad music.

The movement in the vocal melody line which accompanies Robert's quiet reflection moves along quite lazily with little energy due to its legato smoothness. These characteristics suggest the SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT metaphor. The rising sequence of minor descending seconds first in the soprano line, immediately followed by the lower alto line expresses the SAD IS DOWN metaphor. The bass players also emphasize this metaphor with their descending fifth intervals in the accompaniment. It is hard to ignore the fact that the melody line is in fact ascending while presenting a descending minor second in sequence. This ascending line contributes to the tension in this scene. It could be thought of as filling the pitch range container as the melody rises higher and higher,

suggesting the overflowing of emotion. The laughter of a lady at the party within the world of the film emphasizes the contrast between the feelings of the people at the party and Robert's downhearted reflections.

Shortly afterwards at the party, Robert is taken by his Mother to meet two of his Father's friends, Governor Andrew and Frederick Douglas (who is, importantly, black). As the Governor expresses his sympathies for Robert's being at Atietam, the trumpet music begins once again in the background. The Governor and Frederick Douglas tell Robert that they are going to start a coloured regiment and that they want Robert to be the colonel. Robert, surprised and not exactly thrilled to be returning so quickly to the military, thanks the men and excuses himself.

The trumpet music, like that at the beginning of the film, expresses both pride and sadness. This time it is the pride of Governor Andrew and Mr. Douglas for forming an all black regiment and the sadness of Robert for having to return to the tragedies of war so soon. The distant sound of the trumpet melody makes for a low dynamic level thus suggesting the metaphor SAD IS DOWN. Also, the brevity of the trumpet melody reflects Robert's brief time away from war.

As Robert makes his way outside, several people at the party cheer him on for his participation at Atietam. The music which accompanies his walk outside is a lush upper string descending melody line. Through its descending melody line it is clearly making reference to the SAD IS DOWN metaphor, however the lushness of orchestration suggests pride here as well. It expresses Robert's feelings about war and returning to it so soon. He was traumatized by his last experience and now he is being asked to return and with even more unwanted responsibility this time. The legato articulation of the

descending lines suggest the SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT metaphor as legato lines requires less effort than articulated lines for instrumentalists. The melody continues to descend until Robert's friend Forbes comes out to ask Robert what is wrong. Robert replies half heartedly that he has had too much punch. Forbes suggests that he knows how much Robert wants to be colonel, but he laughs at the thought of how unpopular it would be to give coloured people guns. Robert tells Forbes that he does indeed plan to be colonel of the first all-black regiment and that he want Forbes to come with him to be a general. Thomas, their childhood friend, runs out to find out if it is true that there is to be a coloured regiment and offers himself as the first volunteer.

The scene is accompanied by the main theme music in the upper woodwinds with harmonies provided by the strings. The melody is played very quietly the first time. The second time the melody is played by a number of strings and the dynamic level rises. Here the main theme music expresses the platonic love and friendship between Robert and Forbes. In this situation, the swelling of love is distinguished from the swelling of pride due to the context. In the film the scene is used to introduced the friendship between Robert and Forbes and thus we know platonic love is being expressed. The swelling of the b, c, b is similar to the swelling of a heart when in love. In addition to the actions in the film, the music expresses the friendship between Robert and Forbes. As the melody reaches its ascending line at the end of the theme one statement, Robert states that he is going to do it. As the line ascends the strings take over the main theme in a higher key. Both these things invoke the HAPPY IS UP metaphor. Robert's platonic love for Forbes is displayed once again when Robert asks Forbes to come with him. Forbes is known for his irresponsibility so Robert's trust in him is indeed a sign of

friendship. The high notes of the descending sixth intervals swell as they are held before the lower note is stated. This swelling once again is reminiscent of a swelling heart when in love. As the main theme reaches the end, the stepwise ascending line is repeated, this time in the strings. Thomas runs out to find out if there really is to be a coloured regiment and offers himself as the first volunteer. The upward moving line invokes the metaphor PRIDE IS UP. At this point the fife and drum military music begins.

The scene changes and Robert is now in charge of the 54th Massachusetts regiment. He looks over all those who have volunteered as he rides his horse to the front of the crowd. Among the men he sees in the crowd are his friend Thomas and the black slave who had found him in the field after the battle at Atietam. The music that accompanies this scene is played by fifes and snare drums, it is clearly used for its military association. However, it also signifies the pride and joy both Robert and those in the crowd feel in being joined together. The music is very bouncy, upbeat, high in register, articulated and rhythmic. These characteristics invoke the HAPPY IS UP and HAPPY IS MORE MOTION metaphors. Throughout the film this music is not only used for its military association but also for its emotional expressions of happiness and in this case pride.

The scene proceeds as they march the black soldiers into Readville camp, Massachusetts. The same fife and drum music continues, but it is contradicted by what is happening in the scene. The black soldiers are in very bad shape; some of them do not even have shoes. They are obviously poverty stricken and carrying everything they own with them while they are being ridiculed by the white men at the side of the street. In this case the fife and drum military music obviously contradicts what is being expressed. A

time that should be full of pride for the black soldiers is actually bittersweet because of the ridicule of the whites they pass by. Using music that denies the emotions being expressed in the film gives the situation an increased emotional impact through its contradiction.

A little later in the movie the expression of the fife and drum music once again contradicts the events in the scene. The soldiers are being trained to march. The fife and drum music accompany the soldiers while the Irish officer in charge is yelling at them to march through huge puddles. Robert watches with his friend Forbes and Forbes comments that “the Irish are not known for their fondness of coloured people.” Here the proud and happy music is being contradicted by the emotionally and physically compromising conditions that the black soldiers are being forced to endure.

Robert writes a letter home to his Mother and the main theme music is played once again by the strings. Robert tells his Mother how well the troops are learning. He comments that they learn faster than white soldiers and are brave and sedate under drill. Here, the ascending and swelling part of the opening main theme accompanies his letter. The upward movement, the lush full sounds of the strings and the swelling b, c, b all express Robert’s pride as he tells his Mother of his regiment’s quick progress. He adds that when they are released they are very relaxed and able to forget about how hard the day was. Robert believes they have learned this from the hours of cruel labour they have suffered. The scene that accompanies the reading of Robert’s letter shows the troops still without uniforms marching under drill. Following the drill they are relaxing, socializing, singing and practicing their marching. Subsequent to the statement of the main theme in the strings, the secondary theme is played by the oboe.

## Ex. #5

(in concert pitch) *ad lib.*

The music reflects the hardship and sadness for what the soldiers suffered in the past and are still suffering in the present. It is clear that the blacks have been mistreated as slaves and continue to be mistreated as soldiers.

He continues to explain in his letter that the men are almost grave and sedate under instruction and that they restrain themselves. The slowness of the theme (SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT) as well as the descending lines (SAD IS DOWN) reflect the sadness we feel for the blacks' demeanor under instruction and the meaningless labour they have had to endure. The secondary theme in the oboe has an almost crying quality due to its timbre. The oboe has traditionally been used as a rhetorical symbol for poignancy thus causing sympathy to be aroused. It is difficult to relate a rhetorical symbol such as this to the body metaphors of Lakoff and Johnson, thus they have not played a large role in my analysis. However, it is important to realize that rhetorical symbols also contribute to the expression of emotion. The string accompaniment of the oboe line with long held harmony lines that descend in a stepwise manner express sadness through the SAD IS LESS MOTION and SAD IS DOWN metaphors. At the end of Robert's letter the theme is brought to a final cadence. This suggests that Robert is happy with the progress of the

men and is confident that the men will leave Massachusetts as “fine a regiment as any that has marched.” He believes that all is going well, but as we will see in the scene that follows this is not true.

Following what we presume is weeks of intensive training Robert calls his troops together in the middle of the night to read them a proclamation issued by the confederate congress. Under President Lincoln’s wishes, “Any Negro taking arms against the confederacy will immediately be returned to a state of slavery. Any Negro taken in uniform will be summarily put to death. Any white officer taken in command of Negro troops will be deemed as inciting servile insurrection and will likewise be put to death.” Robert offers full discharges to be granted in the morning to all those who apply. As the men turn to leave, Robert tells Forbes that if he is not here in the morning he would understand.

At this point the music begins. It is the secondary theme, played very slowly in the oboe with accompaniment by the lower strings. The bass and violins play a tremolo.

The secondary theme played in the oboe is once again very mournful. The melody is very slow (SADNESS IS LESS MOVEMENT) and the timpani provides an accompaniment that is low in register (SAD IS DOWN) These same metaphors are also invoked as the lower strings accompany with long held notes. The descending sixth intervals also express the SAD IS DOWN metaphor. Again, the oboe has a sorrowful almost crying quality expressed through its timbre.

The scene changes to Forbes, Robert and the soldiers who are each lying awake all night long. When Robert rises in the morning he asks how many soldiers are left. Robert looks and finds they are all there and quietly proclaims, “Glory hallelujah!” There is a

huge swell in the music when Robert realizes all the troops remain. The secondary theme is played again, but at a much higher elevated level, this time in the strings.

### Ex. 6

*molto espressivo - legato*

Violin I

Here the same secondary theme music that was immediately heard before as sad is now transformed so that it is heard as expressive of joy, a variation on the emotion of happiness. When Robert realizes that none of the men have left, an oscillating string melody crescendos and rises to modulate the entire secondary theme upwards. It is played at a much higher dynamic level now. Because the melody is being played by all the upper strings as opposed to a single oboe, the melody has swollen from its previous state. The accompaniment is also bigger with the addition of lower strings and brass. This also adds to the swelling aspect of the theme. Through this music the HAPPY IS MORE MOVEMENT metaphor is invoked. This statement of the secondary theme does not fall down to the b, c, g, f; it remains only at the b, c, g, c level and thus the HAPPY IS UP metaphor is invoked. Through this music the HAPPY IS UP and HAPPY IS MORE MOVEMENT metaphors are invoked. The increase in dynamics, orchestration and pitch all contribute to the HAPPY IS UP metaphor, while the faster tempo from half notes to all quarter notes in this statement of the theme invokes the HAPPY IS MORE MOVEMENT metaphor.

Despite Robert's successes with his regiment later in the film, he does struggle as



the melody unsure. This melody represents the conflicting feelings between homesickness and the platonic love they are both experiencing. This is a rising, hopeful melody line. The penultimate note of the ascent is held for a considerable time until Thomas wishes Robert a merry Christmas. The long hold on the penultimate note of the ascent also makes the melody unsure. The resolution and final note occurs when Thomas does wish Robert merry Christmas. With the rising melody line the heart's container is filled and thus love is expressed. The container here is the range of the melody. As the melody rises to a high point in the range, the container is metaphorically heard as full. After Thomas wishes Robert a merry Christmas, the secondary theme is played by the upper strings and finally by the violas swelling at a higher level than previously.

Later the outspoken soldier, Trip, played by Denzil Washington, deserts camp to find himself a proper pair of shoes. He is caught before he returns and is brought forward to be flogged in front of the entire company. Robert's friend Forbes begs Robert not to allow a whipping, however Robert is caught between a civil rights movement which demands human decency and standard army punishment. Robert instructs the major in charge of Trip's group to begin the whipping. When Trip's shirt is removed, the scars on his back show evidence of many whippings during his days as a slave. As the whipping begins, Trip only flinches slightly each time he is struck. It continues and a single tear rolls down his cheek as he stares at Robert, lips quivering. Later that evening, Robert sits alone, discomforted by the events of the day. He goes to one of the soldiers, Mr. Rolands--a father figure amongst the group--and begins by almost bringing up the whipping, but instead decides to ask if he can talk to Mr. Rolands about the men from time to time. Mr. Rolands initially does not grace Robert with an answer. As Robert

walks away Mr. Rolands explains that the men need shoes and Trip had only gone to try to get some.

The music that accompanies the whipping has not been heard before. The trumpet plays a slow, mournful line which rises by two perfect fourths and ends with a major second dissent. This invokes both the SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT and SAD IS DOWN metaphors. The music is very slow and accompanied only by the slow tolling of the timpani and lower strings again making reference to the SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT metaphor. The repeated quarter-note nature of this accompaniment is very powerful because of the melodic tension being created above it and the fact that it crescendos. Following the trumpet's statement of the melody the cellos enter playing a descending sequence which falls by a minor third and then rises a major second invoking the SAD IS DOWN metaphor. The oboe then plays a melody based on the opening of the secondary theme. The oboe's melody rises higher each time, however each time the initial note of the sequence drops a step lower invoking the SAD IS DOWN metaphor. The violins accompany with descending seconds in a rising sequence, the rising sequence creating tension while the descending seconds conjure the SAD IS DOWN metaphor. The oboe goes on to play a rising three not stepwise pattern. Both the string and horn accompaniment descend. (SAD IS DOWN) The tension increases as the oboe's short repeated melody continues to ascend with a crescendo and the addition of more instruments. When the melody reaches its height, the oboe plays a single sustained note while the strings accompany it with a descending line. (SAD IS DOWN) The second statement rises higher but is followed by the same descending cello line. A slow tolling of timpani and lower underlies this entire section. (SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT)

The music is expressive of pain and thus sadness. The timbre of the single oboe cries out while the image schemata and metaphors of SAD IS DOWN and SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT expound the tragedy of the situation. The enormous tension created in the music adds to the poignancy of the situation and makes the impact more forceful for the listener. Coupled with the rhetorical expression of the tension and the oboe's poignancy, the metaphors of Lakoff and Johnson contribute to the sadness being expressed.

The scene changes to Robert sitting alone and the main theme music of the movie is played once, followed by the secondary theme in the oboe. The music stops when Robert approaches Mr. Rolands.

After speaking to Mr. Rolands, Robert decides to take his request for shoes more seriously and less through the proper channels. Robert demands shoes and finally uses his authority and rank as colonel to get them. He is at last successful and a wagon of shoes and socks show up at camp for the men. The music that accompanies this scene is the fife and drum music. Mr. Rolands rides in the back of a horse drawn wagon full of shoes. He throws the shoes triumphantly out to the men. The men gather around the wagon jumping up and down, throwing their arms in the air, overjoyed to be receiving proper shoes. The fife and snare drum music is fast with a lot of snare drum accompaniment. The music makes frequent leaps and is very active with lots of embellishments and flourishes up to the main melody notes. It is fast and staccato. The characteristics of this music invoke the metaphor HAPPY IS MORE MOVEMENT. The wide leaps, articulation, and fast tempo all contribute to this. Embellishments and flourishes upwards to the main notes of the melody suggest the HAPPY IS UP metaphor.

Robert quietly watches in the background as the men receive their shoes. He then

proceeds to the infirmary to check in on Trip, the man he had ordered whipped earlier. The lacerations on Trip's back are being dressed. His shoes are removed to show the horrible condition of his feet due to improper foot ware. Dressing is also being applied to his feet. Robert asks the soldier attending to Trip to inform him if there is anything Trip needs.

It is the secondary theme music which accompanies Robert's visit to the infirmary, played by the oboe and accompanied by the lower strings with timpani. The music is very slow, especially in contrast to the previous music. The timpani and low strings conclude the section by playing one final low note. The SAD IS DOWN and SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT metaphors are invoked in this section.

It has come time for the men's first pay-day. Robert receives a telegram informing him that black soldiers will only receive a wage of ten dollars a month, compared to the regular white man's wage of thirteen dollars a month. At first it seems that the soldiers will accept the wage decrease, however, spurred on by Trip they decide to rebel against the decision by accepting no pay. Robert supports the decision by saying that he will also go without pay. Following the cheer that Robert receives he goes to get the uniforms. The first officer he hands a wrapped uniform to is Jupiter, a young soldier who from the first day has been anticipating wearing a blue suit. As Robert hands Jupiter the uniform the military snare drum music begins. It expresses happiness and excitement. The rhythmic rolling of the snare drum rhythms and fast tempo invokes the metaphor HAPPY IS MORE MOVEMENT.

The scene immediately changes to a parade through the main street of a town with a band playing Sousa like marching music. For the first time we see the soldiers in their

uniforms marching through the streets lined with cheering people of all colours. The camera pans up to a balcony where Governor Andrew and Frederick Douglas--the founders of the black regiment--stand watching on with pride. In the crowds on the street we see several black women who are presumably the wives and girlfriends of the men watching proudly, yet weeping. Robert leads the troops on horse. He looks up to see his parents looking fondly down from another balcony.

The music that first accompanies this scene is marching, military, band music that the men march to in the film. It has not yet been heard in the film. It is much fuller than the previous fife and snare drum military music as it is now being played by a full band with brass, woodwinds and percussion. The march is an upbeat, articulated band melody. Beyond its functional purpose, this music expresses both pride and happiness. The pride is expressed through the orchestration. This is the only situation in the entire film in which a full band is used. I think this is not only important to the diegetic world of the film but from this we can assume that the CONTAINER is full. In this case, the container is once again referring to the orchestration. Because Horner is using a full band the orchestration container is full. As discussed in the previous chapter a full container is characteristic of pride. The happiness is expressed through the upbeat tempo and energetic melody line. Both these characteristics suggest the HAPPY IS MORE MOVEMENT metaphor. This music expresses the pride and joy the soldiers must be feeling as they make their first public appearance in full uniforms.

When Robert looks up to his parents and his Mother looks down lovingly and his Father watches proudly the music changes. The strings play a very lush full version of the theme music of the movie. It is different because the strings play a melody in

counterpoint to the theme music. Because there are so many more instruments involved it is fuller, swelling. The lush full sound of the strings with the additional counterpoint make this melody swell out of the CONTAINER and thus express pride. An overflowing container can also suggest overflowing emotion other than pride and in this case I think it can also express the love, especially in terms of a swelling heart, felt between Robert and his family and the soldiers and their families.

Later the troops are sent to South Carolina by boat. On the boat Mr. Rolands is made Sergeant Major, one of the first blacks to be assigned leadership in the military. The music that accompanies this scene is the happy fife and snare drum music. It expresses the pride and happiness they all feel as Mr. Rolands is made Sergeant Major.

In South Carolina the troops proudly march along a dirt road. They are met by children who stare with fascination. Mr. Rolands says to the children, "That's right, ain't no dream, we left slaves and came back fighting men, go tell your parents." It is the main theme music of the movie that accompanies this scene. The main theme music played by full orchestra is at first superimposed on the fife and snare drum marching music. The pride of the soldiers is expressed here through the swelling of the melody and the full orchestration. The rhythmic pulsing of the snare drum accompaniment keeps the melody moving, expressing happiness through MORE MOVEMENT. The second statement of the theme music is played with the strings and vocals. Because the orchestration here makes for a fuller container, pride is expressed. It changes to the secondary theme music played more slowly than the main theme music by the flute as the local black people approach the marching troops. Mr. Rolands tells Thomas that they are "contrabands" out of the fields. The "contrabands" are impressed that these black soldiers can march

and talk like white soldiers. They are also in the army in South Carolina and they love it because as they say, it is like Christmas every day. This scene shows the poverty of the blacks in South Carolina. The music changes from the pride of the main theme music to the sadness of the secondary theme. It reflects the pity we feel for the South Carolina black soldiers. The music is able to do this mostly by contrasting the previous music. The secondary-theme melody is played only by the flute as opposed to the entire string orchestra. This means the secondary-theme music is a lot quieter than what preceded it. The decreased volume level has its association with the lower end of the VERTICALITY schema and thus invokes the metaphor SAD IS DOWN. The flute melody is accompanied by long held harmony notes on the French horn. The low register of the instrument as well as the slow accompaniment expresses sadness with the SAD IS DOWN and SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT metaphors. Finally the slow tempo of the secondary theme is emphasized by the snare drum accompaniment. Because each note of the secondary theme takes place over several snare drum rolls the slowness of the theme is emphasized. This slow tempo invokes the SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT metaphor. Through all these sad associations it is clear that we are to feel pity for the Southern black soldiers who clearly have not been treated with the respect that the Fifty-Fourth Massachusetts Regiment has. Pity being a sympathetic response and variation on the emotion of sadness.

While Robert's regiment is in South Carolina, Colonel Montgomery (a red-necked, bigoted man who also has an all-black regiment) asks Robert and his men to join him in action. As the troops march into the small town of Darien in Georgia, Colonel Montgomery compliments Robert on how well his soldiers march. Montgomery is also

surprised how well Robert handles the men considering they do not have slaves in Boston. From this and other incidents, it is clear that Montgomery has a total lack of respect for his soldiers and worse, treats them like slaves. When they reach Darien, Robert's soldiers inspect the town. They report back that the town is clear except for a few women. Montgomery then instructs his boys to clear out the town. At his request, Montgomery's soldiers begin to loot the town. Montgomery also allows the men to shoot unnecessarily at an ornament hung on the second floor on the front of a house. Montgomery's soldiers shoot recklessly at this ornament and a man runs out of the house, begging them to stop shooting. They proceed to shoot the man because as Montgomery puts it he is "Secession." Robert questions Montgomery's actions but Montgomery ignores him. Instead Montgomery says that they are never going to let these "monkey children" into battle, claiming that you have to know how to handle them. At this point we see a black soldier of Montgomery's struggling with a black woman, slapping her and then slapping a white woman who struggles to free him from the black woman. Montgomery proceeds to shoot the black soldier saying he would not have had to do it if the Secession woman hadn't started it. Montgomery states that, "Secessions have to be cleaned of this country like the Jews of old" Montgomery then instructs Robert to have his men set torches and burn the town. Robert refuses but Colonel Montgomery says it is an order. Robert refuses again stating that it is an immoral order and he is not bound to do it. Montgomery says when it comes in front of the court martial he will take over Robert's troops. Instead of giving this horrible man his regiment, Robert instructs his men to torch the town.

As Robert's men begin torching the town the music begins. The music is a

stepwise descending line which rises in sequence played by the strings. The tension mounts and the first theme is played slowly in a much smaller range than previously. The accompaniment is played by the lower strings and is also in a smaller range. The theme music lacks the initial ascending part of the theme. (The music is extremely sad.) With this music's emphasis on descending lines and compressed patterns, the SAD IS DOWN metaphor is evoked. In fact the absence of the initial stepwise ascent on the main theme emphasizes a lack of upward gestures in the music. The swelling part of the melody is de-emphasized by viola which accompanies the swelling with lower notes, detracting from the upper notes. Between partial statements of the compressed theme music, descending stepwise lines move downward into other partial statements of the theme.

Robert writes home to his Father for help while we observe the men performing grinding manual labour in the fields. Robert tells his Father that despite his many requests otherwise, it has become clear that his regiment is only to be used for manual labour. Robert explains that the morale of the troops is low and that he has written to Governor Andrew and the general staff in Washington to no avail. Robert believes that only a letter from his father to Lincoln himself will do any good. After they are shown clearing forests, another scene of the black soldiers sitting idle around the camp is shown.

As Robert writes his letter home, an incomplete version of the main theme of the movie is played briefly in the distance by the French horn with no accompaniment. Immediately following, the oboe plays part of the secondary theme once with timpani tolling out the low notes before the voices enter. The first theme continues and the voices quietly and discreetly enter, singing ooh with the French horn on the main theme, with

very quiet string counterpoint. The fact that only the French horn is playing the main theme, with the quiet string counterpoint accompaniment on the initial statement, makes this music quite quiet. The low dynamic level invokes the metaphor SAD IS DOWN. The secondary theme is also only played on the oboe. The low VERTICALITY here is also emphasized by the timpani accompaniment which precedes the partial statement of the secondary theme. Even when the voices enter indiscreetly the dynamic level is kept low. The SAD IS DOWN metaphor is also emphasized in the section with the ascending intervals that occur in both the primary and secondary theme music.

Finally the men are granted their first real fighting experience and have a successful battle. As they return to camp the white soldiers are assembled together playing a sprightly little tune on the fife, guitar, accordion and tambourine which suggests folk music devoid of military association and the heaviness of war for the first time. The soldiers at camp are celebrating a victory at Guestesburg on the fourth of July, however, this music still reflects the happiness of the 54th regiment not only for their first fighting experience, but also their success. The jumping melody, staccato articulation and upbeat tempo all invoke the HAPPINESS IS MORE MOTION metaphor. The fife plays the melody line. Its high register also conjures the metaphor HAPPY IS UP.

Next there is a gathering of the high ranking officials in the war on a beach amidst the background noise of canons, guns, and sounds of war. General Strong, the man in charge, informs the group that they are planning a direct frontal assault on Fort Wagner. He explains that over the last four days the navy has weakened Fort Wagner with a constant barrage. To approach Fort Wagner, there is only a narrow strip of sand between the ocean and the marsh. The military has planned to send in one regiment at a time in

hopes that the leading regiment could keep the reds occupied long enough for reinforcements to exploit the beach. General Strong suggests that the casualties in the leading regiment would be extreme. Despite all this, Robert requests the honour of the 54th Massachusetts to lead the attack. General Strong is concerned, considering the men have not slept in two days. Robert replies that there is more to fighting than rest; his group has character and strength of heart and would be ready.

The day has passed and dusk has settled in. Robert is standing inside his tent as a soldier attends to him. The soldier helps Robert dress for a battle at which most of the men will lose their lives. A resonant octave tolls in the lower strings and timpani. As Robert is being dressed, the secondary theme begins playing quietly in the French horn at what seems like half speed. The double basses accompany the secondary theme with a descending line, while the timpani gently tolls a triplet pattern. However, the expression here may be more ominous than sad due to the rhetoric of the tolling. In this scene the metaphors of Lakoff and Johnson can still show how the music is used to express the extreme sadness of the situation. It is ironic that the men have finally been trusted to fight in such an important battle and yet it is inevitable that they will lose their lives. The music expresses the tragedy of the situation at hand through the SAD IS DOWN and SAD IS LESS MOVEMENT metaphors. The initial resonant octave tolling in lower strings and timpani immediately conjures the SAD IS DOWN metaphor before the melody even begins. The SAD IS LESS MOTION metaphor is summoned by the French horn's slow statement of the secondary theme. The SAD IS DOWN metaphor is once again evoked as the low-ranged double basses play a descending line to accompany the French horn. The low register of the timpani's triplet pattern also invokes the SAD IS

DOWN metaphor.

Outside, the 54th Massachusetts Regiment is called to attention. Colonel Shaw looks over the men proudly as they prepare to head into what will be their last battle. The upper strings and upper woodwinds enter with the main theme music much higher in range than the previous French horn and bass music. When the melody of the main theme swells an upward harp glissando is heard, expressing the pride that Robert must be feeling. The upper strings also accompany the melody with a pianissimo tremolo. The upper note of the melody - the swelling note - is held for an extended length of time. Robert pauses as he approaches Jupiter, the soldier who so proudly received the first uniform earlier. Jupiter stutters, "We ready Colonel." The second part of the main theme plays as Robert stops in front of Jupiter. It is the descending sixths which are emphasized here followed by a descending stepwise line in the strings. In this scene the music expresses a combination of pride and sadness. Robert's pride is expressed as he looks over his regiment before they head off to battle with the ascending lines and swelling, however the tragedy of the situation is also expressed as Robert approaches Jupiter and the emphasis in the music is more on descending intervals and lines.

It is the initial part of the theme that expresses Robert's pride as he looks over his regiment. The initial change in range of the instrumentation from the lower French horn and bass to the upper strings and woodwinds invokes the PRIDE IS UP metaphor. The ascending harp-glissando also emphasizes the upward gestures. The expansive gestures associated with pride are especially expressed by the swelling note of the main melody. In the second part of the main theme, sadness is expressed. The descending-sixth intervals and the stepwise descending line which moves quite low in range conjure the

SAD IS DOWN metaphor. The sadness is expressed because the men who have finally won the respect to fight in an important battle will no doubt lose their lives in this dangerous endeavor.

The scene changes to the same beach where Robert was informed of the assault on Fort Wagner. The perspective changes from the single soldier to the entire regiment. As the men assemble to go into battle, the all black 54th regiment march past all the white soldiers to head to the front of the line. The main theme music is now being played by the entire orchestra with much more harmony and a lush sound. It is played lower in the range of the violins and also by the violas. There is more emphasis on the cello and bass accompaniment. Because it is a little slower, there is more emphasis on the intervals being played; each note is allowed to swell. As the fifty-fourth pass all the white soldiers, their commanding officer yells out, "Give 'em hell 54!" There is an ascending modulating line which allows the secondary theme to be played at a raised level. The soldiers cheer the men on as they march into battle. The exploding canons provide musical emphasis.

Kövecses suggests that pride is a result of achievement, belonging to a group, social position, and physical capabilities. The fifty-fourth Massachusetts regiment has clearly fulfilled all of these criteria as they march off into battle in front of the white soldiers who are now their peers. The pride is expressed in the music first through orchestration. The previous statement of the main theme was played only by the upper woodwinds and strings. Now the entire orchestra plays the theme with much more harmony. This increase in instrumentation makes the container fuller and thus expresses pride. The swelling of each note played by the strings also reflects the expansive

gestures associated with pride. The rising stepwise line which leads up to the heightened version of the secondary theme has its association with the PRIDE IS UP metaphor. Of course the raised level of the secondary theme also expresses pride. The secondary theme has a swelling quality that was absent previously. The long upper held notes of the descending sixth intervals express the swelling associated with pride.

Robert leaves the 54th for a moment to approach his friend Pierce. The music for this scene is much different from the music which preceded it. The instrumentation has dropped down considerably to only strings, timpani, and snare drums at a decreased dynamic level. When Robert asks Pierce to take some letters and personal things the instrumentation decreases again to only the upper strings which play descending lines and harmonies. There are no lower strings or percussion when Robert speaks to Pierce. Before he leaves Pierce, Robert asks, "If I should fall, remember what you see here." The music that accompanies this is a descending line with descending register and instrumentation. Robert then rides off to the front of the troops.

Robert's sadness is expressed here because it is clear from his interaction with Pierce that he does not expect to live through this battle. The music helps to enhance the sadness of the scene mostly through its association with the SAD IS DOWN metaphor. Firstly, the instrumentation has been reduced considerably at the beginning to strings, timpani and snare drum and then further to only the upper strings. The descending melody lines and accompaniment also express sadness through their association with the SAD IS DOWN metaphor.

The 54th Massachusetts officer in charge releases the drummers to fall out. Timpani drum rolls accompany the trumpet military music which is sounded off in the

background. They fall behind, but the mute boy whom Rawlins had taken responsibility for throughout the film stops and looks up at Rawlins. Mr. Rawlins looks down at the boy and says, "You go on now, we be back directly." The secondary theme in the lower strings accompanies Rawlins as he addresses the mute child. The secondary theme concludes with a descending melodic phrase in the strings. Thomas, who is also on the front line, falls over in exhaustion but Frit reaches forward to help him stand. (Thomas is in a weakened state due to a gun shot wound he received in the shoulder at the battle they fought only two days before.) This music is expressive of sadness particularly through its orchestration. The secondary theme is being played in a much lower register than previously and as such it expresses sadness through the SAD IS DOWN metaphor. Adding to the expression of sadness is the melody in the lower strings that accompanies the secondary theme in counterpoint. This adds to the lushness of sound here and implies the swelling of the container and thus of sadness.

We are taken from the scene of the soldiers to Robert who has ridden off on his own on his horse. He looks out to the water watching the waves roll in and the seagulls fly across the water. The opening of the secondary theme repeated several times while rising upwards is played by the upper strings, creating tension, worry, and fear. This may be more rhetoric than the use of body metaphors, however, tension could be viewed as being created through the filling of the container as the repetition of the secondary theme melody rises upwards. Theme one enters reminding us that the fear is infused with pride. Robert dismounts his horse and sends it back. He then makes his way on foot through the troops as they cheer for him. During his walk through the troops an ascending line leads into the vocal version of the first theme infused by an alteration of the

secondary theme in the strings. The pride the regiment feels as they head off into battle is expressed through the PRIDE IS UP metaphor. The rising line leading into the statement of the main theme music of the movie. The theme music is expressive of pride melodically for reasons discussed in detail previously, however, also because of the increase in orchestration due to the inclusion of both the strings and boys choir. The full range provided by the high vocal parts in combination with the low strings and timpani also make the container full.

Robert reaches the front of the 54th regiment and asks, "If this man should fall, who will lift the flag and carry on." Thomas steps forward to claim the responsibility and all the men cheer him on. At this point the flute plays the secondary theme, accompanied by timpani. Robert replies by saying, "I will see you in the fort Thomas." By acknowledging that men will fall and they may need a replacement man to carry the flag the men are admitting that harm may come to them as they head into battle. The music expresses sadness through the secondary theme in the flute and horn. Both the quiet dynamics and the descending intervals of the secondary theme express sadness through the SAD IS DOWN metaphor.

It is finally time for the men to go into battle. Robert commands the men to ready their bayonets and prepare to charge, commanding them to march forward at the quick step. A rising line moves the main theme to a heightened level created by the addition of all the strings. The rising lines and theme music in the strings expresses pride. As Robert commands the men to run double quick time, bells chime and the music quickens. The trumpet plays a single note in a quick pattern of four sixteenth notes followed by a quarter. The men run towards the fort. This music expresses the fear of heading into

battle. I believe the music expresses fear and not excitement due to the context. The men know the casualties are going to be high and that they will probably die, therefore I believe that they have more to fear than to be excited about. The quick tempo of the melody invokes the metaphor FEAR IS MORE MOTION. Fear is also thought of as a natural force. The force of the chiming bells, repeated trumpet notes and snare drum roll at a fast tempo also express fear.

Inside the fort the opposition is armed with many men and they begin firing out their canons. Colonel Shaw (Robert) commands his men to charge as the canon balls are erupting around them. All around the fifty-fourth regiment men are falling and screaming out in pain. There are innumerable casualties, however Shaw commands his men to continue running. The men take cover in a sand dune and continue to crawl forward on their stomachs. The fighting continues for a long time until darkness finally surrounds them. Colonel Shaw is still commanding his men to move forward even though most of his regiment has been killed. They make it to the walls of the fort surrounded by water and begin climbing the walls. Robert leads the men into the bullets of the shooting opposition and is shot. As Robert is shot, a bell chimes out accompanied by a single low note in the double bass and timpani. Immediately the huge force of a soprano choir and strings is heard singing in their upper register creating an abrupt dissonance. Forbes yells out for his friend and Trip responds in anger yelling for the troops to continue. The choral music changes to a staccato melody spaced by the breath of the performers. With the force of the repeated short bursts of melody, it almost sounds like a religious chant. It is much faster than the previous music. The music is now accompanied by percussion and trumpet. The range is much lower, sung by tenors and basses and later joined by

sopranos. When the soprano voices enter again the pride of the men is revealed for their valiant fighting effort. The staccato music seems to express their anger and rage. The remaining soldiers make their way to fight inside the fort. As they approach, the opposition a huge canon explodes and the screen is filled with smoke. The music that accompanies Robert's death and the fighting that ensues is expressive of the anger the soldiers feel over their colonel's death and sudden need for revenge. In the previous chapter anger was discussed in relation to Type A personalities (TABP). These people, who were predisposed to anger, showed an increase in the tempo, loudness and pitch of their speech when angry. Anger is also understood as a force. When Robert is killed and the vocal music enters with full force, rising higher and higher in the soprano voices it clearly expresses anger. The second, more polyphonic section is made up of short forceful articulated staccato vocal entries also expressive of anger. The pride of making it into the fort and putting forth such a valiant effort is in the end expressed by a rising melody sung by the vocals which rests proudly on the high note. The association with the PRIDE IS UP metaphor makes this final ascent expressive of pride.

The following morning the sun shines over the water and the seagulls soar across it. The waves roll in and then we are shown the thousands of casualties strewn across the beach. The dead soldiers are lined up on the beach and then thrown haphazardly into a huge ditch that has been dug out for them. Quietly the main theme of the movie is sung by the boys choir alone with no instrumental accompaniment. The first time through it is mostly the main melody in high register, the second time the main melody moves lower in range and has more vocal accompaniment.

The final statement of the main theme music in the movie is dominated by triadic

movement, expressing the loss of almost the entire fifty-fourth Massachusetts regiment. The music is sung at a very low dynamic level without much accompaniment expressing the SAD IS DOWN metaphor. The descending-sixth intervals are particularly tragic this time through because they are sung at a low dynamic level without much accompaniment. The second statement of the main theme music is still very sad. However because of the increase in vocals of the melody the small amount of pride that these men must have achieved in fighting for their country, and their lives is infused.

Overall, the music of Glory is very similar to Sir Edward Elgar's Enigma Variations. The main theme of both Glory and the Enigma Variations share the same dignified, elegiac character. The sadness and pride expressed through the melody, tempo, dynamics and orchestration of both these pieces express a mournful dignity common to both.

From the above analysis it would seem that music is only able to express happiness, sadness, pride and love; however, this is not the case. The music of Glory provided many opportunities to discuss how music can express happiness, sadness, pride, and love and not many opportunities to discuss how music can express anger and fear. This is not to say that music is not capable of expressing these emotions, only that they were not as prevalent in the music of Glory. For example in the movie Pelican Brief practically all the music which accompanied it was expressive of fear. I was able to explain the music as expressive of fear through the BALANCE and FORCE schemata. I was able to explain fear as a loss of balance. This loss of balance was reflected in the music through melodies which jumped in a haphazard way between an extreme pitch ranges. The FORCE schema was rather literal as dissonant chords would strike

powerfully at a fortissimo level. As well, the metaphor of the heart racing or pounding with fear was useful in explaining why music which was expressive of fear was often had a fast tempo.

Again, although not discussed in the film *Glory*, I believe music is capable of expressing anger. I was able to discuss anger in terms of image schemata, metaphor, and nonverbal communication, however, I had difficulty locating an example in music.

## Conclusion

My intention has been to show how the embodiment theories' of Lakoff and Johnson can contribute to our understanding of music as expressive of emotions. A complete theory of emotions and music would require a deeper music analysis, looking at issues such as rhetoric, direct association (known works with identifiable emotional context), as well as personal associations of the listener. My hypothesis was that an embodied understanding of music could contribute to, and enhance our understanding of music as emotional. In combination with traditional modes of expressive analysis, (Cooke, Meyer, et. al.) the theories of Lakoff and Johnson provides an illuminating method for looking at how music is expressive of emotions.

It is important to remember that Lakoff and Johnson's theory of understanding explains how humans use everyday image schemata and metaphor to understand concepts which are difficult to comprehend. In the case of this thesis, both music and emotions are abstract entities onto which we apply bodily metaphors and image schemata to help us understand them. It is because we apply the same metaphors and image schemata to both music and emotions that we hear music as expressive of emotions. Consider my example of music being heard as expressive of happiness. This understanding occurs for a number of reasons. Our perceived sense of feeling "up" when we are happy, which has made its way into our language through various metaphors, has resulted in our understanding of happy through the VERTICALITY image schemata. We take the abstract emotion of happiness and ground it in bodily actions, thus understanding happiness through the metaphor, HAPPY IS UP. Music is another domain which is not easily understood. However, we ground a rising melody line in our bodily action of rising. The abstract musical gesture of the rising melody line, in this case faster vibrations of a tone, are

grounded in concrete bodily motion. In this way we are able to establish concrete analogies between abstract entities such as music and emotions and ground them in bodily movements. Because music and emotions are grounded in the same image schemata, the music is heard as emotional. The use of polysemy allows us to take these image schemata and metaphors to a number of levels.

The theories of Lakoff and Johnson works particularly well in terms of *emotion*. The metaphors in common with music and emotion rely on the kinetics of both. Therefore the theory works well for emotions which have some sort of nonverbal communication (as discussed in Chapter Two) accompanying them. For example, an emotion such as jealousy which does not have clear nonverbal communication associated with it is a lot more difficult to locate in music than is happiness. This is not to say that it is impossible but that it does not work well within this theory. Stephen Davies was correct in stressing the importance of emotion characteristics in appearance. I believe the theory adequately explains how music is expressive of emotions, but relies heavily—though not exclusively—on the gestures of both.

This theory, in common with much analytical systems of music, also does not take into account issues such as orchestration and timbre. The image schemata of Lakoff and Johnson provide a good starting point for dealing with orchestration and timbre in a much different way from previous analysis.

The lack of accountability of the theories of Lakoff and Johnson to musical rhetoric or Kivy's idea of "convention" are problematic. When listening to music it is commonly understood that music in a major key expresses happiness while music in a minor key expresses sadness. Another example would be the traditional use of oboe for poignancy. I did not find Lakoff and Johnson's theories applied suitably to rhetoric such as this and as a result lost something in my analysis of the music as expressive of emotions. However, in some situations, obviously a combination of rhetoric and the image schemata of Lakoff and

Johnson are at work to make the music expressive of an emotion, for example, the trumpet call in the opening of the film *Glory*. I was able to explain through the theories' of Lakoff and Johnson how that melody was expressive of the joy of victory, the sadness of defeat, and the pride of fighting for one's own beliefs. However, the rhetorical associations with a trumpet call such as the military charge, last post, and solitude because the sound of the single trumpet coming from afar, are culturally relevant and convey direct associations that can conjure emotive content. For example the reveille and the call to arms expresses excitement and pride in fighting for ones' beliefs, while the last post which has a mournful quality. These powerful impressions and associations are continually being felt in the film *Glory* and remain whether they follow the body metaphors of Lakoff and Johnson or not. However, Lakoff and Johnson can enhance these direct associations by explaining the expression of emotions in music on a deeper level than direct association. It is indeed this network of metaphorical relationships that allows the kinds of subtlety of expression that we find in human communication. It is both the rhetorical associations and the bodily metaphors that contribute to the expression of emotions in music. Because of the number and complexity of levels of interpretation it is difficult to disentangle and provide an unambiguous path that traces bodily gesture through a complex and multi-leveled rhetorical gesture in its social and personal context. I have done my best to separate the two but admit that the rhetorical gestures and all their associations have at times enhanced my bodily analysis of the music of *Glory* as emotionally expressive.

The theories of Lakoff and Johnson did not satisfy the problem of lack of specificity of emotional expression in music as outlined in chapter one. I was able to discuss the expression of emotion in music as happy, sad, love, anger, pride, and fear. I basically found that many emotions occurred somewhere along this scale. Many emotions could be explained as variations on these basic six emotions. With the expression of emotions in music, I found it difficult to get more specific than this. It was suggested to

me that the music of *Glory* expressed dignity and elegy. This is indeed true, however within the parameters I had set up it was easier to consider dignity in the broad category of pride and elegy in the broad category of sadness. As discussed at the conclusion of Chapter Two, subtle emotions had to be considered as variations of the basic emotions: anger, love, pride, fear, happiness, and sadness.

The expression of emotions in music is only one facet of a truly expressive art form. There are many other things which are important as well. This analysis is only one facet of a complete analysis. In the film *Glory* there were other important points concerning the music which did not fall within the scope of music as expressive of emotions, for example, the fife and drum music which occurred repeatedly throughout the film *Glory*. This music clearly evokes British folk music which also suggests the domination of British culture especially when accompanying the scenes with the black soldiers.<sup>1</sup> These elements are crucial to an analysis of the film's music, but fall however outside of the parameters set up by this theory.

Another important facet of film music is source studies. Examining the military and folk music of the film from an ethnomusicological point of view would have been useful. Looking for the source of the piano music during the party at Robert's parents house may also have proved illuminating. It is interesting to note, however, that the theories of Lakoff and Johnson proved quite illustrative in explaining why the Classical piano music evoked restrained control. As well, the music Horner composes for *Glory* and its similarity to Elgar's *Enigma Variations* is something which could be explored in great detail.

To conclude, my application of the theories of Lakoff and Johnson to our understanding of music as emotional is only one of many possibilities. Several authors have applied the theory in a much different way than myself.<sup>2</sup> As musicologists and

---

<sup>1</sup> I thank Dr. Fast for pointing this out to me.

<sup>2</sup> See: Brower, Saslaw, Walsler, and Zibkowski in the Understanding Music section of the bibliography.

music theorists continue to explore the applications of the theories of Lakoff and Johnson in an imaginative way I believe what has been previously referred to as fanciful understandings of music will be explored openly and with revelation.

## Bibliography

- Argyle, Michael. *Bodily Communication*. 2nd ed. London: Rutledge, 1988.
- Barthes, Roland. "The Grain of the Voice" Chap. in *Image - Music - Text*. Translated by Stephen Heath. New York: Hill and Wang, 1977.
- Brower, Candace. "A Cognitive Theory of Musical Meaning." unpublished paper provided by author.
- , "Pathway, Blockage and Containment in Density 21.5" unpublished paper provided by author.
- Budd, Malcolm. "Music and the Communication of Emotion" *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 47:2 (Spring 1989): 129-138.
- Bull, Peter E. *Posture and Gesture*. Oxford: Pergamon Press, 1987.
- Clynes, Manfred. "Santics: Communication and Generation of Emotion Through Dynamic Expression." In *Nonverbal Communication: Readings with Commentary*. 2nd ed., ed. Shirley Weitz, 386-388. New York: Oxford University Press, 1979.
- Cooke, Deryck. *The Language of Music*. London: Oxford University Press, 1959.
- Cusick, Suzanne. "Feminist Theory, Music Theory, and the Mind/Body Split" *Perspectives of New Music* 32:1 (Winter 1994): 8-27.
- Davies, Stephen. *Musical Meaning and Expression*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1994.
- , and Kivy, Peter. "Discussion: Kivy on Auditor's Emotions and Armistice, But No Surrender: Davies on Kivy." *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 52:2 (Spring 1994): 235-237.
- Fiske, Harold E. *Music and Mind: Philosophical Essays on the Cognition and Meaning of Music*. New York: Edwin Mellen Press, 1990.
- Goldman, Alan. "Emotions in Music (A Postscript)." *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 53:1 (Winter 1995): 56-69.
- Hanslick, Eduard. *The Beautiful in Music*. Translated by Gustav Cohen, With a Foreword by Morris Weitz. Indianapolis: The Bobbs-Merrill Co. Inc., 1957.
- Jarre, Kevin. *Glory*. Produced by Freddie Fields and Directed by Edward Zwick, 2 hours. Tristar Pictures, 1989. Videocassette.

- Johnson, Mark. *Body in the Mind: The Bodily Basis of Meaning, Imagination, and Reason*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987.
- Kivy, Peter. "Auditors Emotions: Contention, Concession and Compromise." *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*. 51:1 (Winter 1993): 2-12.
- . *Sound Sentiment: An Essay on the Musical Emotions*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1989.
- . *The Corded Shell: Reflections on Musical Expression*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1980.
- Knapp, Mark L. *Essentials of Nonverbal Communication*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1980.
- Kövecses, Zoltán. *Emotion Concepts*. New York: Springer-Verlag, 1990.
- . *Metaphors of Anger, Pride, and Love: A Lexical Approach to the Structures of Concepts*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing, 1986.
- Lakoff, George and Mark Johnson. *Metaphors we live by*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980.
- Lakoff, George. *Women, Fire, and Dangerous Things: What Categories Reveal about the Mind*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987.
- Leathers, Dale G. *Nonverbal Communication Systems*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon Inc., 1976.
- LeFrance, Marianne and Clara Mayo. *Moving Bodies: Nonverbal Communication in Social Relationships*. California: Brooks/Cole Publishing, 1978.
- Lidov, David. "Mind and Body in Music." *Semiotica* 66-1/3 (1987): 69-97.
- Machlis, Joseph. *The Enjoyment of Music*. 6th ed. New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1990.
- McClary, Susan. "Introduction: A Material Girl in Bluebeard's Castle." Chap. in *Feminine Endings: Music, Gender, and Sexuality*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1991.
- Meyer, Leonard B. *Emotion and Meaning in Music*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1956.
- . *Music the Arts and Ideas: Patterns and Predictions in Twentieth-Century Culture*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994.
- Pratt, Carroll C. *Meaning of Music: A Study in Psychological Aesthetics*. New York: McGraw Hill Book Co., 1931.

- Radford, Colin. "Emotions and Music: A Reply to the Cognitivists" *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 47:1 (Winter 1989): 69-75.
- Ridley, Aaron. "Musical Sympathies: The Experience of Expressive Music." *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 53:1 (Winter 1995): 49-57.
- Robinson, Jenefer. "The Expression and Arousal of Emotion" *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 52:1 (Winter 1994): 13-22.
- Saslaw, Janna. "Forces, Containers, and Paths: The Role of Body-Derived Image Schemas in the Conceptualization of Music" *Journal of Music Theory* 40/2(1996): 217-243.
- Schwartz, Eliot and Daniel Godfrey. *Music Since 1945*. New York: Schirmer Books, 1993.
- Siegmán, Aron W. and Stanley Feldstein eds. *Multichannel Integrations of Nonverbal Behavior*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 1985.
- Sonolair, Stephen W. Review of *The Language of Music*, by Deryck Cooke. In *Computer Music Journal* 18/2 (Summer 1994): 101-105.
- Sparshott, Francis. "Music and Feeling." *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 52:1 (Winter 1994): 24-35.
- Swain, Joseph P. "The Range of Musical Semantics." *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 54:2 (Spring 1996): 135-152.
- Turner, Bryan S. "Recent Developments in the Theory of Body" In *The Body: Social Process and Cultural Theory*, ed. Mike Featherstone, 1-35. London: Sage Publications, 1991.
- Turner, Mark. "Design for a Theory of Meaning." In *The Nature of Ontogenesis of Meaning*, eds. W. Overton and D. Palermo, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 1994.
- . *The Literary Mind*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1996.
- Walser, Robert. "The Body in Music: Epistemology and Musical Semiotics" *College Music Symposium* 31 (1991): 117-126.
- Weitz, Shirley. ed. *Nonverbal Communication: reading with commentary*. 2nd ed. New York: Oxford University Press, 1979.
- Wolfgang, Aaron. ed. *Nonverbal Behavior: Applications and Cultural Implications*. New York: Academic Press, 1979.
- Zibkowski, Lawrence. "Conceptual Blending and Song." unpublished paper made available through author.

- . "Conceptual models and cross-domain mapping: new perspectives on theories of music and hierarchy." *Journal of Music Theory* 41 (1997).
- . "Metaphor and Music Theory: Reflections from Cognitive Science," *Music Theory Online* 4.1 (Jan. 1998)