



McMASTER

• U N I V E R S I T Y •

MICHAEL G. DeGROOTE
SCHOOL OF BUSINESS

NON-CIRCULATING

INNIS LIBRARY

RESEARCH AND
WORKING PAPER
SERIES

**RECRUITMENT, SELECTION AND PROMOTION
OF VISIBLE MINORITIES AND ABORIGINALS
IN SELECTED CANADIAN POLICE SERVICES**

By

Harish C. Jain, Parbudyal Singh and Carol Agocs

Michael G. DeGroote School of Business
McMaster University
Hamilton, Ontario

Working Paper # 435

April, 1999

Innis



HB

74.5

.R47

no.435

McMASTER UNIVERSITY

1200 Street West

Hamilton, Ontario, Canada L8S 4M4

(905) 525-9140

**RECRUITMENT, SELECTION AND PROMOTION
OF VISIBLE MINORITIES AND ABORIGINALS
IN SELECTED CANADIAN POLICE SERVICES**

By

Harish C. Jain, Parbudyal Singh and Carol Agocs

Michael G. DeGroote School of Business
McMaster University
Hamilton, Ontario

Working Paper # 435

April, 1999



**RECRUITMENT, SELECTION AND PROMOTION
OF VISIBLE MINORITIES AND ABORIGINALS
IN SELECTED CANADIAN POLICE SERVICES**

Harish C. Jain, Ph.D.
Professor of Human Resources and Labour Relations
MGD School of Business
McMaster University

Parbudyal Singh, Ph.D.
Lecturer, MGD School of Business
McMaster University

and

Carol Agocs, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
Department of Political Science
University of Western Ontario

April 1999

Prepared for the Canadian Centre on Police Race Relations.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	(i)
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	1
I. BACKGROUND AND FINDINGS 1985 TO 1996-98	2
II. INTRODUCTION	5
The Importance of Visible Minority and Aboriginal Recruitment, Selection and Promotion	5
Government and Police Services' Initiatives	7
Commissions and Reports	12
Aboriginal Police Officers	17
Previous Theoretical and Empirical Studies on Police Recruitment, Selection and Promotion of Visible Minorities and Aboriginals	20
Legal Issues	22
Gender Discrimination	24
Racial Harassment	25
Pregnancy and Duty to Accommodate	25
Marital and Family Status	26
Disability	26
Age-related Cases	28
III. METHODOLOGY	30
IV. RESULTS	31
Overall Representation of Visible Minority Officers	31
Recent Hiring of Designated Group Police Officers by Individual Police Services	31
Representation by Rank	36

Recruitment Strategies	40
Effectiveness of Recruitment Strategies	43
Barriers to Recruitment	44
Focus Groups' Perceptions	45
Resources Devoted to Recruitment	48
Selection Procedures and Strategies	54
Selection Instruments and Hiring Criteria	54
Issues in Selection Systems	61
Adverse Impact	61
Lack of Validation	62
Job Interviews	62
Administrative Issues in Decision-Making	63
Promotion Criteria	64
Lateral or Direct Entry Opportunities, Accelerated Promotions	69
Rate of Promotions of Designated Groups in Selected Police Services	69
Promotional Processes in Selected Police Organizations	72
Issues Contributing to Promotional Barriers	73
Eliminating Promotional Barriers	75
 V. RECOMMENDATIONS	 88
1. <i>Representation</i>	88
2. <i>Recruitment Barriers</i>	88
3. <i>Recruitment Measures</i>	89
4. <i>Selection Methods and Removal of Adverse Impact</i>	89
5. <i>Promotion Measures</i>	89
 REFERENCES	 91
 APPENDIX I	 96

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Representation

Visible minority (VM) representation in police organizations in this study has increased substantially from 1985 to 1996-98, especially in the last five years. This result is based on three previous studies of the same police organizations in 1985, 1987, 1990 and the present study – 1996-98. The previous studies examined the recruitment and selection of VM police officers and policies and practices in this regard of 14 police organizations across Canada. However, VM representation rates in most police services in this study are still below the percentage of VMs in the respective local labour markets.

This study, 1996-98, has expanded the scope to include aboriginal police officers, in addition to VM officers, recruitment, selection and promotion policies of the same police organizations as in the previous studies. Aboriginals are relatively well represented in police organizations in 1996-98. A part of the reason for the high representation of aboriginals is the recent trend towards self-administered First Nations Police Services (Swol, 1998; Murphy and Clairmont, 1996).

Female police officers continued to be under-represented in police services.

Several police services such as the RCMP, Montreal, Regina, Vancouver, and Ottawa-Carleton are hiring VM officers in excess of the 1991 labour market availability rates while the RCMP, Montreal, Regina, Edmonton and Winnipeg are doing the same for aboriginal officers relative to their 1991 labour market availability rates. However, with few exceptions, most police organizations are hiring in relatively small numbers, which will not significantly impact on increasing minority police officers overall representation in police services.

The ranks achieved by VM and aboriginal officers ranged from a constable to an inspector or staff inspector with the exception of an aboriginal chief of police in Edmonton and a (white) female police chief each at the Ontario Provincial Police and the Calgary Police service. While there are a total of 38,353 police officers in the 13 police agencies in this survey, only 9 females hold senior positions and only 13 VMs and aboriginals have positions at the inspector level.

Recruitment

Proactive recruitment of VMs has increased over the years, especially in the last five years. For instance, police recruiting visits to community colleges and minority organizations have increased. Seminars/outreach programs for minority students, job fairs, the use of minority officers as role models and the use of ethnic media has been increasing in frequency as recruitment strategies. For instance, VM and aboriginal role models and community outreach, including newspapers, are ranked by police agencies in the survey as the most effective means of recruiting and are being used more extensively than before.

Perceptions of Barriers to Minority Officer Recruitment

Perceived barriers in attracting VM candidates for police officer jobs, as identified by Police Services, showed a significant decline, especially in the last five years, with respect to distrust of police; policing not being an “honourable profession”; VMs not being welcomed in police organizations; and policing as being dangerous.

Focus groups were held with potential members of applicant pools involving racial minority and/or First Nations men and women, who are young adults, in Montreal, Toronto, and London,

Ontario as well as serving officers in the Royal Canadian Mounted Police, the Ontario Provincial Police, two municipal police services, and a First Nations service in Ontario.

The nine focus groups of members of potential applicant pools for police jobs reported many negative experiences with police that have created significant barriers to their recruitment in policing. They believe that police services must change so that discriminatory and exclusionary practices are eliminated if policing is to become an attractive career to racial minority and First Nation youth.

The serving officers indicated that their choice of becoming a police officer had been strongly influenced by relatives or friends and some of the attractive features of a career in policing such as job security, the pay, and most importantly, to be of service to one's community. Barriers to promotion and lack of career development opportunity were major sources of dissatisfaction to serving officers of minority or First Nation's background.

Selection

The minimum requirements for most police agencies in this study are: age 18 or older, grade 12 education or equivalent, Canadian citizenship, valid driver's licence with good standing, medically and physically fit, fluency in English or French, good vision and hearing, satisfactory background investigation, and no criminal record.

If the basic requirements are met, the selection process requires that applicants go through a multiple hurdles process such as a series of tests, which may include aptitude and other psychological tests, written communication, medical, physical, and driving tests. Applicants failing one hurdle are allowed to re-do the tests/hurdles.

Police organizations have improved their selection procedures over the years. For instance, in the 1985 and 1987 studies, three of the 14 police organizations in this study specified male and female height and weight standards and age limits. These requirements have been modified to a great extent.

The two most popular selection instruments used are interviews and psychological tests (including the general aptitude test). In general, the police services in this study are doing a credible job of recruiting and selecting the VM and aboriginal persons. There are, however, issues relating to the selection systems used by some of the police agencies which need to be re-examined by them. These concerns are related to adverse impact, lack of validation and job interviews.

Currently only four police services validate psychological tests, while two are conducting validation studies. At least three of the police agencies (Toronto, Calgary, and Winnipeg) have adverse impact on VMs and/or aboriginal candidates on psychological tests relative to others.

Slightly more than one half of the police agencies in this study structure their job interview formats. Some of them included aboriginal and VM and/or female interviewers, but none of them were included in the team that does the scoring of job interviews. Considering that job interviews count for 30 to 100 percent weight in selection, depending on the individual police department in this study, a serious problem exists. Without structure, interviews tend to be low in reliability and validity and can have adverse impact on minorities and women.

Accommodation and Employment Equity Policies

In order to encourage minorities and women to apply, most of the police services have formal and/or informal accommodation policies. In 1985, only one police department (Edmonton)

allowed Sikhs to wear turbans at work; now nine police agencies do so and three have special accommodation policies for VM women.

A majority of police services, as in the 1990 study, have employment equity policies and programs; six of them have recruiting goals and timetables for VM and aboriginals; ten have VM and aboriginal liaison officers as well as advisory committees with VM and aboriginal members; and seven have VM/AB community involvement in recruiting VM/AB candidates.

Promotion Criteria

Promotion examinations, seniority, promotional board review and performance appraisal are the topmost criteria for promotion to the sergeant and/or staff sergeant position. For inspector and/or staff inspector position, promotional board review, promotional examination, and performance appraisal are used as the topmost criteria by several police organizations in the study. In some cases, the criteria for promotion is negotiated through collective agreements between a police association and the police service.

Barriers to promotion of minorities and women include, but are not limited to: a) seniority as specified in collective agreements; b) fixed number of applicants per available position; c) composition of interview panels and other type of decision-making boards; and d) absence of special measures to promote under-represented minorities and women.

The RCMP, Metropolitan Toronto, and Calgary Police organizations are attempting to remove barriers for minorities and women from their promotional systems. Some of the initiatives undertaken by these agencies include the recognition that seniority creates a barrier to advancement for these groups and therefore the concept of merit has been built into their programs, thereby

recognizing individual accomplishments and abilities. Employees are also well informed about all new promotion programs, and many of the programs are developed in consultation with employees. The RCMP has eliminated the pass/fail mark, recognizing the adverse impact that test scores may have on under-represented minority groups and women.

Lateral or Direct Entry Opportunities and Accelerated Promotions

Despite recommendations from the various aboriginal and other inquiries and commissions, there are no mechanisms in place for lateral or direct entry to management positions for VM and aboriginal persons for anything other than entry level positions. The only exception is at the senior levels such as the Chief of Police as in the case of Calgary and Vancouver Police Services. Collective agreements continue to hamper the inclusion of such measures as well as concerning accelerated promotions of qualified minorities and women.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to thank Ms. Deborah Zinni, a doctoral student at McMaster University; Ms. Meryl Hodnett, former MBA student at McMaster; Mr. Allan Pelletier; Mr. C. Lloyd Stanford, President of the Le Groupe Stanford Inc. in Ottawa; Professor Donald Clairmont, Dalhousie University; Mr. Michael Foster in assisting us with focus groups; visible minority, aboriginal and serving police officers from the RCMP, the OPP and several Police Services in Ontario who volunteered their time and energy to participate in the focus groups held in Toronto, Montreal and London, Ontario; several police officers also assisted us with pilot testing of our questionnaire.

I. BACKGROUND AND FINDINGS 1985 TO 1996-98

The present study is part of a longitudinal study of the same police organizations that began in 1985. The previous studies in 1985, 1987 and 1990 dealt with the recruitment and selection of visible minorities (VMs) in selected police agencies. This is the first study that extends the coverage to a) aboriginal police officers and b) from recruitment and selection to promotion as well. The police organizations remain the same since 1985.

Since the previous studies were related to VM police officers only, it will be useful to examine the changes that have taken place over the years (1985 to 1996/98) in the recruitment and selection of VMs as police officers in these agencies. Since 1985, the police agencies in the study have been: RCMP, Metropolitan Toronto, Ontario Provincial Police (OPP), Ottawa-Carleton, Quebec Provincial Police (Surte Quebec), Montreal, St. Hubert, Halifax, Moncton, Winnipeg, Regina, Edmonton, Calgary, and Vancouver. The present study covers 13 police organizations (since Moncton is part of the RCMP at present). The 1985 and the 1987 studies were sponsored by the Canadian Association of Chiefs of Police and funded by the Multicultural Directorate of the Federal Department of the Secretary of State at the time. The 1990 study was sponsored by the Canadian Association of Chiefs of Police and funded by the Solicitor General Canada. The present study is sponsored and funded by the Canadian Centre of Police-Race Relations.

The findings of the present study, relative to the previous studies, on the recruitment and selection of VM police officers reveal the following:

1. VM representation in the police organizations has increased substantially from 1985 to 1996/97, especially in the last five years. In addition, several police organizations are hiring VM officers in excess of the 1991 labour market availability rates. However, the overall VM representation is still below the percentage of VMs in the respective local labour markets in

most police services; additional hirings by some police services are relatively small in number. Hence the representation of VM officers will continue to be low. Female VM police officers remain under-represented in police services.

2. Proactive recruitment of VMs has increased over the years. For instance, especially in the last five years, police recruiting visits to community colleges and minority organizations have increased. Seminars/outreach programs for minority students, job fairs, the use of minority officers as role models and the use of ethnic media has been increasing in frequency as recruitment strategies.
3. Perceived barriers in attracting VM candidates for police officer jobs, as identified by Police Services, showed a significant decline, especially in the last five years, with respect to distrust of police, policing not being an "honourable profession", VMs not being welcomed in police organizations, and policing as being dangerous. This indicates that as police recruiters become more proactive, the stereotypes associated with VM recruitment tend to disappear or decline.

However, the focus groups with potential members of applicant pools involving racial minorities men and women and others in Toronto, Montreal, and London reported many negative experiences with police that seem to have created significant barriers to recruitment. Police services have their work cut out for them in attempting to eliminate VM and other perceptions of discriminatory and exclusionary policies.

4. Police organizations have improved their selection procedures over the years. For instance, in the 1985 and 1987 studies (Jain, 1988), three of the 14 police organizations in the study specified male and female height and weight standards and age limits. The requirements have been modified a great deal (e.g., for instance, height commensurate with weight).
5. The dress code regulations have also changed drastically since 1985 in order to accommodate VM Sikhs. For instance, in 1985 only one police service (Edmonton) could accommodate baptized Sikhs as police officers (Jain, 1987); in 1987, three police organizations allowed the

wearing of turbans by Sikhs (Jain, 1988); in 1990, eight police agencies had done so (Jain, 1994); and at present, at least nine of the 13 police agencies allow Sikhs to wear turbans and three have special accommodation policies for VM women.

6. The most popular selection instrument continued to be job interviews throughout the four studies. One of the promising developments is that police services are not giving as much weight to the interviews as before. For instance in 1990, almost one-half of the agencies assigned 100% weight to interviews while in the present study only one police service did so. Another eight assigned between 32 to 60% weight to job interviews. Almost all police organizations had structured interviews and 11, relative to eight in 1990, scored the interviews.

The significance of structured interviews is that they diminish the risk of subjectivity on the part of the interviewers (Wiesner & Cronshaw, 1988) and thereby reduce the risk of a legal challenge. In order to enhance objectivity, structured interviews should be scored. This study indicates that the use of scoring is growing as 11 of the 13 police agencies responded in the present study that they did so, compared to eight in 1990. One of the recommendations made by the Quebec Human Rights Commission's inquiry into relations between the police and VMs was that interview selection boards should comprise a VM (Normandeau, 1990; Investigation, Nov. 1988). In this study, seven of the 13 police agencies, relative to six in 1990, reported having a member of VM and/or female as a part of the selection board.

7. There are, however, issues relating to the selection systems used by some of the police agencies which need careful re-examination by them. These concerns are related to adverse impact, lack of validation (that is, relating scores on tests, interviews etc. to job performance), and job interviews. Currently, only four police organizations validate psychological tests, while only two are conducting validation studies. At least three police agencies have disproportionate impact on VM and aboriginal candidates on psychological tests relative to others.

In a landmark decision, the Supreme Court of Canada affirmed, in the case of Canadian National (CN) Railways in 1987, the decision of the human rights tribunal requiring the CN to

abandon certain psychological tests and other selection standards since the CN had no evidence of validity of these tests and the tribunal had found widespread systemic discrimination against women in the employer's hiring practices. The purpose of adverse impact analysis is to ensure not only that selection standards are applied uniformly to all applicants, both minorities and non-minorities, but also that the net result of these standards is not to produce differences in the selection of various groups (Jain, 1994).

II. INTRODUCTION

The Importance of Visible Minority and Aboriginal Recruitment, Selection and Promotion

In Canada, and other liberal democracies, police services have become integrally associated with roles and values important for the functioning of society. Apart from the traditional function of maintaining law and order necessary in a civilized community, police services have become more diverse to suit the needs of evolving democracies, including "social services" and "non-crime" related matters such as domestic disputes and counselling.

While peace maintenance services, as opposed to law enforcement, are on the increase, they are not totally new. In fact, Sir Robert Peel's "Bill for improving Police in and near the Metropolis" presented to the British Parliament in 1829, emphasized the need for police to maintain public order and peace (Dutton, 1986). In today's society, the service function comprises a large proportion of a police officer's time. In fact, Hill (1984) estimates that approximately 80 per cent of calls for police service are of non-crime related activities such as family upheaval, racial discord and youth unemployment; Dutton (1986) reports that order maintenance and service functions comprise over 80 per cent of a police officer's time, while law enforcement duties take up only about 10-15 percent. Similar figures have also been reported by Wycoff, Susmilch and Eisenbart (1980). Thus, the police represent a major governmental institution with which the public interacts; this is

especially so in the case of racial minorities (e.g. aboriginals and visible minorities), including recent third world immigrants (Jain, 1994). Given the changing nature of the Canadian “public”, it is pertinent that the composition of the police be reflective of, or at least be sensitive to, the wider community it serves. This is especially true in the case of the changing nature of policing.

Police officers are usually “solitary actors” and spend most of their time at work without supervision (Coulton and Feild, 1995; Skolnick, 1967; McLaughlin and Bing, 1987). The nature of their job usually requires them to work alone or with a partner. For this and other reasons, police have been given “extra” powers in Canada and other countries, involving a wide latitude of discretion (McLaughlin and Bing, 1987; Coulton and Feild, 1995). Thus, police officers must have high ethical standards, “free” of racial and other bigotries. Further, since most departmental promotions are usually within the police organization, all ranks within the police hierarchy come from largely the same pool recruited. As such, it is important that high quality candidates are recruited and selected. Finally, civil liability claims against the police are on the increase (McLaughlin and Bing, 1987); such legal challenges usually emanate as a result of “normal police duties”, as well as administrative procedures, including personnel selection and promotion. Police agencies that are negligent in hiring, training, or retraining officers have been successfully sued in courts.

As such, the recruitment, selection, appraisal and promotion of police officers is of vital importance in achieving better community relations, as well as protecting the integrity and image of an institution vital to democracy. Recognizing such importance, governments and the police services have introduced a number of initiatives to foster better relationships and enhance the utility of police services.

Government and Police Services' Initiatives

In Canada, police initiatives with regard to visible minority (VM) and aboriginal employment and career development have to be examined within the federal, provincial and municipal policy contexts¹.

At the federal level, the government initiated a national multicultural policy in 1971. However, the program was widely criticized for its “song and dance” approach (Breton, 1986) and for not dealing effectively with racism. In 1981, partly as a result of increasing levels of racism and discrimination against racial minorities, the federal government established a race relations unit in the Multiculturalism Directorate of the Department of the Secretary of State, with increased funding. In 1982, multiculturalism became enshrined in the 1982 Constitution Act as part of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms.² Further, the Charter enshrined the principles of equality

¹ In Canada, there are several main types of police organizations: the federal police (the RCMP), the First Nations stand alone police agencies, the provincial police and the municipal police organizations. Aboriginal policing is somewhat recent. More than 800 police officers are involved in such policing. Most of them are aboriginal (Murphy et al., 1996). The municipal and provincial organizations enforce municipal by-laws and provincial laws respectively. The RCMP enforces federal laws in all ten provinces and the two territories. Ontario and Quebec are the only two provinces that have provincial organizations. In all other provinces, the RCMP acts as the provincial police under federal-provincial contracts, and also as the police of some major urban areas under federal-provincial and federal-provincial-municipal contracts (Jain, 1988; Juliani, Talbot and Jayewardene, 1984).

According to Mr. Dieter Schachhuber, senior advisor, Diversity Management Branch of the RCMP, the RCMP has 700 detachments. It does not have a big presence in Ontario and Quebec; it is confined to federal policing and like the FBI in the US, it is a domestic criminal agency in these two Provinces. It has approximately 1400 RCMP officers in Ontario and 1000 in Quebec, whereas it has 2500 in Alberta and almost 5,000 in B.C.

² According to Section 27 of the Charter “This Charter shall be interpreted in a manner consistent with the preservation and enhancement of the multicultural heritage of Canadians”.

rights and employment equity in Section 15 (1) and (2) respectively.³ The federal government also introduced the Employment Equity Act⁴ and the Federal Contractors Program in 1986. The Act requires federally regulated employers with 100 or more employees to provide improved access to employment opportunities to four target groups: women, visible minorities, the disabled and aboriginal peoples.⁵ The Federal Contractors Program also covers the same target groups and affects employers with 100 or more employees who bid on federal contracts for goods and services worth more than \$200,000 or more.⁶

Further, legislation in most Canadian jurisdictions allows for the development of special programs to reduce the disadvantages experienced by women, aboriginals, visible minorities, and persons with disabilities (Jain and Hackett, 1989). Section 16(1) of the Canadian Human Rights Act

³ Section 15(1) of the Charter states that “every individual is equal before and under the law and has the right to the equal protection and equal benefit of the law without discrimination and, in particular, without discrimination based on race, national or ethnic origin, colour, religion, sex age or mental or physical disability.” Section 15(2) states that the equality rights guaranteed in section 15 (1) “ [do] not preclude any law, program or activity that has its object the amelioration of conditions of disadvantaged individuals or groups”.

The Charter’s provisions apply to government agencies across Canada.

⁴ This Act was amended in 1996. Coverage is now expanded to the federal public service; the Canadian armed forces and the RCMP will be covered upon order of the Governor in Council. Quebec, British Columbia, Saskatchewan and Manitoba also have employment equity measures that cover the public sector in these provinces.

⁵ The law requires that employers prepare annual reports for submission to the Canada Human Resources Department (HRDC). In addition to the annual report, employers are also required to develop an employment equity plan with goals and timetables.

⁶ The program requires that the contractors sign a Certificate of Commitment to design and carry out an employment equity program which meets specified criteria. Failure to implement employment equity does not result in the cancellation of the contract but excludes the contractor from future government business.

permits the implementation of special program that will prevent or reduce disadvantages to minority groups or remedy the effects of past discrimination against those groups.

An additional initiative is the launching of the Canadian Race Relations Foundation in 1997 with a mandate to carry out policy research in the area of racism and to promote better race relations.

Like the federal government, all the provinces and territorial governments have human rights legislations which prohibit discrimination in employment on the basis of race, colour, religion, sex, origin, etc. Many provinces and municipalities have also initiated formal multicultural policies and committees and other initiatives to provide for equality of opportunities for racial minorities.⁷ In 1990, Ontario passed the *Police Services Act*, which called for increased representation of the target groups in its police organizations; the employment equity regulations issued by the province's Solicitor General in 1991 also supported increased representation. However, these initiatives were repealed in 1995 by the Progressive Conservative government in Ontario.

A number of cities have formed race relations or multiculturalism advisory committees to the mayor or city councils (Mastai, 1986). Some of these include Hamilton, Halifax, Toronto and Vancouver.⁸ The Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM) also initiated several activities and programs on race relations, multiculturalism and improved employment opportunities for visible minorities and aboriginals, including a formal policy (1986) and a National Action Committee (1987) on Race Relations (NACRR). The status of the NACRR has recently (June 1998) been

⁷ Saskatchewan has a Multiculturalism Act (1974) and four other provinces have legislation that relate to multiculturalism.

⁸ There are 30 such committees (Dabydeen, 1999). The cities of Vancouver, Regina, Winnipeg, Saskatoon, Edmonton, Calgary and Halifax have employment equity policies as well.

changed to a Standing Committee on Race Relations (SCRR) “in keeping with race relations as a strategic priority of the Federation towards giving it a higher profile” (June 1998).⁹

It is within this wider policy framework (at the national, provincial and municipal levels) that initiatives by police organizations can best be analyzed. The first major initiative was launched by the federal Multiculturalism Directorate in 1984 in the form of a national symposium, attended by police chiefs, visible minority representatives and government officials, on policing in multiracial/multicultural urban communities in Vancouver. In 1986, a National Police Multiculturalism Liaison Standing Committee¹⁰ consisting of visible minority leaders and selected police chiefs was established under the auspices of the Canadian Association of Chiefs of Police (CACP) and funded by the government. A primary role of this committee was to work with the CACP membership to implement major recommendations from the 1984 symposium aimed at increasing the number of minorities in police forces, improving cross-cultural training for police, and promoting liaison between minority communities and the police (Jain, 1988).

In 1992, the Canadian Centre for Police Race Relations (CCPRR) was established by the joint efforts of the Solicitor General Canada and Multiculturalism Canada. It had 11 representatives from visible minority and aboriginal communities and 10 from police and justice bodies including the Canadian Association of Chiefs of Police, government agencies, police colleges and police

⁹ See, Federation of Canadian Municipalities, Standing Committee on Race Relations, Year in Review, 1997-98, June 1998. The SCRR as a part of the FCM in partnership with the Department of Canadian Heritage is engaged in five strategic projects: an Awards project; a Regional Impact project; a Best Practices Project; a Marketing and Partnership Project; and an Aboriginal seminar. The Standing Committee meets three times a year after the Annual Conference of the FCM.

¹⁰ A similar committee was also established separately to deal with the Aboriginal issues. However, these committees exist no longer.

associations on its Board of Governors. Recently¹¹ (1996), the structure has changed to have only 11 members of the Board of Governors including six from visible minority and aboriginal communities and five from CACP, police boards, police associations, police colleges etc.

At the level of individual police organization, the RCMP has a Commissioner's Advisory Committee on Visible Minorities; Metropolitan Toronto Police has several ethnic committees such as the South Asian Consultative Committee to Chief Boothby. Similarly, several other police organizations have police advisory committees with community representatives. One of the aims of these committees is to assist the police organizations in recruiting women, visible minorities and aboriginals and to improve community police race relations by undertaking proactive community liaison programs. In 1996, the Ministry of the Attorney General in British Columbia launched a Provincial Committee on Diversity and Policing. Representatives of this committee include visible minorities, police and government agencies, and is co-chaired by a government and a community representative.

Although there has been some improvement as a result of programs and activities initiated by various governments and police organizations, the police services have not been able to attain their employment and promotional objectives in relation to racial minorities and aboriginal peoples. This is evident from the conclusions reached by various investigative commissions and inquiries resulting from allegations of racism and discrimination in the police services.

¹¹ In April 1996, the CCPRR was incorporated as a non-government not-for-profit organization at the request of its core funding partners, Solicitor General of Canada and Canadian Heritage/Multiculturalism.

Commissions and Reports

It is apparent that racial unrest simmers under a seemingly placid surface of Canadian society. As the former RCMP Commissioner Norman Inkster stated, "Canada will face violence and social unrest unless it learns to accept an increasingly multiracial society... If we are incapable of preparing the way for a better understanding and mutual respect... whatever the colour of one's skin - then violence in some form is inevitable" (Inkster, 1991). Such "understanding and mutual respect" is very much applicable to police behaviours in the communities they serve. However, as a number of relatively recent public inquiries have revealed, police services have a long way to go in achieving equal opportunities and fair treatment of all of Canada's peoples.

The 1989 and 1992 Ontario Race Relations and Policing Task Force Reports (Lewis, 1989, 1990, 1992); the 1988 Quebec Human Rights Commission Report (Bellemare, 1988), and the 1993 Task Force (Corbo) Report (Oziewicz, 1993) all dealt with problems in relations between visible minorities and the police. Testimony from provincial justice inquiries in Nova Scotia (Hickman, 1989), Manitoba (Hamilton and Sinclair, 1991), and Alberta (Rolf, 1991; Cawsey, 1991) highlight the strained relations between aboriginals and the police. The Commission of Inquiry into Policing in British Columbia dealt with problems in the relationship between the police and both visible minorities and aboriginals (Oppal, 1994). Despite the differing initial reasons for these inquiries, a remarkable similarity is observed with regards to the findings and recommendations relating to the recruitment, selection and promotion of racial minorities in the police services. *All* the reports stress the importance of proactive hiring and promotional policies for aboriginals, visible minorities and women and in improving the relationship between the police and the diverse communities they serve.

Based on the testimony at the Quebec Human Rights Commission inquiry into relations between the police and ethnic and visible minorities, Normandeau (1990) suggested, in regard to the Montreal police department, that (i) some citizens viewed the police as unwelcoming to minorities, thereby having a chilling effect; (ii) low representation of visible and other minorities helped perpetuate white police officers' prejudices against minorities, created a climate of harassment for the few "ethnic" police officers, and hindered the professional mobility of minority police officers; and (iii) the low representation failed to provide young people from minority groups with "role models" with whom they could identify. Normandeau (1990) further noted that an inquiry committee's study of the Montreal police department's selection process revealed that the success rate of visible minorities applicants was three times lower than for the majority group. The Ontario and British Columbia inquiries also reported that recruitment, selection and promotion policies and procedures were skewed in favour of white males (Lewis, 1989; Oppal, 1994). As the Oppal (British Columbia Inquiry) Report (1994, p. E-14) notes,

"the potential conflicts and inequities that can result from a system of policing that draws recruits from only one segment of the population have been highlighted in many jurisdictions and reports...Unless some meaningful steps are taken to make our police agencies more representative, a sense of alienation and antagonism will almost certainly develop between police and minorities. This has already occurred in the United States and, to a lesser extent, in some Canadian cities (most notably Toronto and Montreal). A police chief from a major American city warned the inquiry not to 'make the same mistakes we made.' He went on to say that in the inner cities, which are largely populated by African- and Hispanic-Americans, 'we are the enemy. Nobody gives us any information'."

With regard to *promotional issues*, the inquiries/task forces also found barriers to the promotion of minority officers and generally recommended "non-traditional" methods aimed at enhancing the upward career mobility of such officers. For instance, Lewis (1990, p.208) notes that:

“[t]he police have traditionally insisted on promotion through the ranks, usually out of the same police force. The Task Force finds such adherence to tradition is without merit and foreign to all other institutions including the military. It is recommended that mechanisms be developed by which lateral entry by members of other forces or direct entry by qualified civilians will be accomplished, thereby allowing entry at ranks above constable.”¹²

Similarly Justice Oppal found that with the “exception of executive levels, where officers from one agency can compete for positions in another, officers transferring to another agency assume the rank of constable no matter what rank they originally held. This practice of lateral entry is restricted to sworn police officers” (Oppal, 1994, E-29).

Both the Lewis (1989 & 1992)¹³ and the Oppal (1994) reports recommended that processes be developed for lateral entry and direct entry into police forces, and for civilianization of sworn peace officer positions. It was determined that adoption of these special measures would permit rapid and meaningful entry of qualified individuals, including racial minorities, into policing.

The Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (Dussault and Erasmus, 1996) and the provincial inquiries (Hamilton and Sinclair, 1991; Rolf, 1991; Cawsey, 1991) that focussed on aboriginals also come to essentially the same conclusions. The 1996 Royal Commission (Dussault and Erasmus, 1996) did not investigate issues related to the police services *per se*; rather, it investigated the general relationship among aboriginal peoples, the Canadian government, and the

¹² However, as the Oppal (1994) Inquiry found, many officers were concerned that lateral and civilian entry may hold back promotion of officers within an agency, thus leading to morale problems and severe backlash against minorities and women. This is an issue that should be addressed in future efforts aimed at improving VM and Aboriginal representation in all ranks in the police services.

¹³ VMs face glass ceiling in promotion to higher ranks (Lewis, 1989). The Lewis Task Force (1989) found that, with the exception of one police organization, effective ceiling existed for VM promotions at the rank of staff sergeant. This finding was based on a survey of 99 police organizations in Ontario from 1984-1988.

Canadian society as a whole. However, aspects of the report did refer to employment equity barriers in government institutions, including the police. As the Report (p.936) notes, “[t]he level of Aboriginal representation in provincial government workforces is usually far below what it should be, and, at the municipal level, one is hard pressed to find any Aboriginal employees in such departments as police, firefighting and public works.”

The report (pp.938-939) also found evidence of systemic and other barriers facing Aboriginals who seek employment:

“[r]acism and culturally alien environments have a chilling effect when reports of bad experiences circulate within the Aboriginal community, discouraging others from seeking employment in these workplaces. Added to these barriers are systemic barriers, such as artificial job requirements, lack of knowledge of how the recruitment and hiring systems work, and lack of personal networks to assist in finding job opportunities. Logistical barriers include distance from job site, lack of work clothing, penalizing welfare regulations and, for reserve residents, the prospect of paying income tax...because these kinds of barriers persist, it is vital to develop an effective employment equity program for Aboriginal people.”

In a paper prepared for the *Royal Commission* (1996), George and Kuhn (1993) reviewed the research, including their own, on employment and wage issues affecting Aboriginals. They found that the economic returns to education are significant, and recommended that:

“...Commissioners should assign high priority to increasing Aboriginal participation in the completion of education and training programs...given the decision to participate in the labour market, more education and training will help Aboriginal people (and non-Aboriginal people for that matter) to adjust better to displacement in the shrinking sectors of the Canadian economy and to capitalize on expanding employment opportunities in the growing sectors...[t]he empirical studies reported here also deny the implicit assumption that parity in earnings and employment would follow on greater integration into the labour market...even when restricting our analysis to those Aboriginal people who are off-reserve, full-time, full-year wage earners, there is still a large, unexplained residual after differences in human capital endowments are accounted for...*Commissioners will need to give close consideration to equity and affirmative action policies to eradicate persistent differentials that can be laid to discrimination*” [p. 163; emphasis added].

In her Discussion Paper to the Commission, Renee Dupuis (Commissioner, Canadian Human Rights Commission) also noted that Aboriginal people are under-represented throughout the Canadian work force. She further pointed out that Aboriginals are generally not recruited at the same levels as non-Aboriginals, are paid less, and quit their jobs faster, despite employment equity initiatives. Dupuis (1993) recommended that the employment equity programs be integrated into human resources management, since this is more theory than practice.... “moreover, *a great deal of importance must be placed on the analysis of organizations’ employment systems, recruiting systems, recruiting practices, selection and assessment methods, not to mention training and development programs*” (p.170, emphasis added). She also argued for, among other initiatives: special support mechanisms to help Aboriginal employees adjust to their new environment; better documentation and management of Aboriginals’ uniquely high quitting rate; and, government’s support for Aboriginal educational programs and training.

More specifically related to the police-aboriginal relationship were the provincial justice inquiries in Nova Scotia, Manitoba and Alberta (Hickman, 1989; Hamilton and Sinclair, 1991; Rolf, 1991; Cawsey, 1991); the findings in most of the inquiries were very similar to the general race relations reports (e.g., Lewis, 1989, 1992; Oppal.; 1994). For instance, the Manitoba report (Hamilton and Sinclair, 1991, p. 601) states that:

“[a]boriginal people are not represented on Manitoba police forces in proportion to their representation in the population, to say nothing of the proportion of persons of Aboriginal descent dealt with by the police. Neither the RCMP, nor municipal forces such as those in Winnipeg and Brandon, has sufficient numbers of Aboriginal members, or of any visible minority for that matter.”

The authors of the report argued that:

“...we believe that any police force will be more effective if its members are representative of the community it serves. If the community is multicultural, the

police force should have a similar mix of personnel. It is obvious that a force will be more effective if at least some of its members speak the language or languages of those with whom they have to deal...one way in which the police may begin to convince Aboriginal people of the sincerity of their efforts to improve relations with them is to ensure that Aboriginal people are substantially represented among the members of the force” (p.601).

The report also notes that apart from supporting the rights of minority group members, employment equity programs are also practically sound, in that, among other reasons:

- 1) Aboriginal people will have more confidence that the police are interested in their participation as officers;
- 2) Aboriginal officers will be able to assist other officers in a better understanding of Aboriginal culture and behaviour;
- 3) Aboriginal officers will be able to do preventative policing more effectively among Aboriginal community members; and,
- 4) Aboriginal officers will have a better understanding of Aboriginal culture and thus will be better able to determine alternative approaches to law enforcement that are appropriate to the context.

Noting that in no case does an Aboriginal community have full control over policing, and for some of the same reasons as those cited above, the report went further to recommend that “Aboriginal police forces take over from the RCMP the responsibility for providing all police services in Aboriginal communities” and that, “the RCMP support the establishment of Aboriginal police forces and develop a policy of cooperation with such forces” (p.609).

Aboriginal Police Officers

It should be noted that recently (Murphy & Clairmont, 1996) there have been significant changes in the policing of aboriginal people in Canada. These changes have taken place through the gradual indigenization of aboriginal policing by increasing the number of First Nations police officers

in existing police organizations such as the RCMP, and through the creation of autonomous First Nations police forces in aboriginal communities.¹⁴ According to Murphy and Clairmont (1996), the progress from being policed by non-aboriginal police officers and police organizations to being policed by aboriginal police officers and/or police forces has been rapid and has taken place in a fairly short time period. This has resulted in a dramatic increase in the number of First Nations police officers as well as police organizations in Canada. Approximately 800 First Nations police officers and band constables constitute a distinctive police population, located primarily in a variety of rural communities (Murphy & Clairmont, 1996). For instance, the RCMP employs both aboriginal and non-aboriginal officers in aboriginal communities subject to its local jurisdiction; increasingly, these local RCMP officers are of aboriginal background. A number of aboriginal communities in Ontario and Quebec, according to Murphy and Clairmont (1996), are policed under First Nations contracts by band-based systems which are affiliated with the respective provincial policing system.¹⁵ However, the representation of aboriginal police officers in most of the police organizations in this study, especially in higher level positions, continues to be either absent or very low.

¹⁴ While it is true that no aboriginal community exercises full control of policing, the First Nations policing services have autonomy to different degrees and are the fastest growing police service in Canada. Correspondence with Professor Donald Clairmont of Dalhousie University.

¹⁵ A recent report by Conservative MLA Mike Cardinal (prepared at the request of Alberta's Justice Minister) criticizes Albert's aboriginal police forces (Cheney & Mahoney, Dec.3, 1998). Mr. Cardinal spent a year investigating reserve police and spoke with RCMP police officers, native chiefs and community leaders. According to the report, selection standards are too low and a number of officers are personally unsuitable and poorly trained. However, aboriginal leaders consider native policing a key step toward a native-run justice system, and ultimately, self government. Mr. Cardinal did not condemn race-based policing in principle and recommended improvements (Koch, Dec. 3, 1998). Alberta has 67 officers policing 10 reserves with 21,782 natives. Nationally, there are 760 native officers policing 224,000 reserve residents (Koch, Dec. 3, 1998).

With regard to *promotion*, the aboriginal inquiries also called for special mechanisms to facilitate faster upward career mobility of Aboriginals. For instance, the Manitoba report (Hamilton and Sinclair, 1991) noted that mechanisms, such as “fast-tracking”, should be put in place so as to accelerate or promote capable individuals:

“[w]e believe that it is not sufficient merely to increase the number of Aboriginal recruits in the department. Those recruits must also have the opportunity to advance to senior positions. There must also be a commitment to a system of early promotion of those who are qualified but who lack seniority” (p.108).

As the above review suggests, the commissions and task forces have been unanimous in recommending some sort of employment equity/affirmative action and “new” promotional mechanisms to secure better representation for both visible minorities and aboriginals within the police services. It has been argued that such representation would help in correcting police biases towards these groups by providing a link between the police and minority communities; further, members of the minority public will feel more at ease in dealing with the police (Lewis, 1992; Oppal, 1996; Jayewardene and Talbot, 1990).

In general, some typical recommendations include:

- (i) the streamlining and shortening of the recruitment processes for VMs and Aboriginals;
- (ii) the adoption of an affirmative action/employment equity plan designed to increase the rate of VM and Aboriginal recruitment and selection;
- (iii) the adoption of “realistic” minimum uniform standards for all police officers at the recruitment level;
- (iv) the dedication of staff and resources to VM and Aboriginal recruitment efforts, including initiatives that target the minority population in their communities;
- (v) the use of “bias-free” selection and promotional instruments;

- (vi) increased use of direct and lateral entries into the police services as well as civiliaztion of sworn officer positions;
- (vii) fast tracking of qualified racial minorities via establishment of early or “new” promotional systems; and
- (viii) the need to have programs to support the above mentioned changes by altering the culture of police organizations in order to make them receptive to minority members and special measures for minority members entry and promotion.

Thus in order to avert the risk of racial tensions, to meet the demands of a changing population, to improve police-minority relations, to provide role models for minority youths, and to reflect the ethno-cultural make-up of the communities they serve, it is critical that the police services increase their representation of visible minorities and aboriginal officers (Jain, 1994), especially in higher level police officer positions.

Previous Theoretical and Empirical Studies on Police Recruitment, Selection and Promotion of Visible Minorities and Aboriginals

Previous studies on police recruitment, selection and promotion of minorities have focussed on three main issues: affirmative action/employment equity, the general determinants of police selection, and legal cases and issues arising from related police personnel practices. A majority of these studies focus on visible minorities, with aboriginals covered only minimally or not at all.

The role of, or need for, affirmative action/employment equity policies and programs has dominated the research on employment and promotion policies and programs in police services in both Canada and the United States. In the U.S., since the passage of civil rights legislation in the 1960s, several studies have reported findings suggesting that the presence of affirmative action programs and court-imposed quotas are the most important factors in explaining increases in the

representation of minorities in police organizations and local governments (Hochstedler, 1984; Steel and Lovrich, 1986; Lewis, 1989; Martin, 1994; Riccucci, 1986; Stein, 1986; Walker, 1985).

Hochstedler (1984), in a study of 15 U.S. police agencies, reported that the study's single most important finding is the positive relationship between hiring and affirmative action goals of police hiring of minorities.

In Canada, in a series of studies of 14 police agencies, Jain (1987, 1988, 1994) reports that while minority representation on police services is on a gradual increase, it is still far below the proportion of these groups within the relevant labour markets. For instance, in 1987 VMs in Metropolitan Toronto comprised 16.5 per cent of the city's workforce but only 3.4 per cent of the police service; in 1990, this latter figure rose to 4.7 per cent. In Vancouver, in 1987 and 1990, minorities (VMs) comprised 2.6 and 3.8 per cent respectively, while VMs in the relevant labour market were approximately 16.2 per cent (1986 Census) of the labour force. Based on these studies the author recommended, among other things, that police organizations, especially the larger ones in Toronto, Vancouver and Montreal, needed to monitor their recruitment and selection procedures to ensure that no systemic discrimination exists, and that some form of employment equity programs be instituted so as to ensure that police organizations reflect the multi-racial nature of society.

Using census data, Suriya (1993) also found that visible minorities and aboriginals were under-represented in Canadian police agencies when compared to their population levels. Further, as Suriya (1993, p.51) points out:

“one of the fundamental ideals of employment equity is the representation of visible minorities not only in numeric terms but also in qualitative terms. The data of both the Metropolitan Toronto Police...and the RCMP...indicate that visible minorities are at the bottom of the police rank hierarchy in addition to their numerical under-representation.”

Similar findings were also reported for aboriginals.

In relation to the *general determinants*, Warner, Steel and Lovrich (1990) investigated the influence of various economic, political, institutional and environmental factors on the employment of blacks and Hispanics in 281 U.S. cities. Based on surveys conducted in 1984 and 1989, they concluded that “although a variety of factors play a significant role in predicting the utilization of minorities as municipal police officers, minority presence in the city via population and representation in public roles [including the presence of a minority police chief], and court-enforced affirmative programs play the most crucial roles” (p.54).

The importance of a “critical mass” of minority residents for representative bureaucracies is also noted in other studies (Eisenger, 1982a, 1982b; Riccucci, 1986; Stein, 1985, 1986). As Stein (1986) argues, a significant concentration of minority population translates into an important potential labour pool and the need for elected officials to recognize their minority constituents. Other studies have also reported a positive relationship between the presence of minority municipal officials and the presence of minorities in municipal and police jobs (Dye and Renick, 1981; Lewis, 1989; Stein, 1986). It is suggested that the sheer symbolism of a minority official serves as a motivating force for minorities in a municipal labour pool (Riccucci, 1986).

Legal Issues

Other studies have investigated *legal issues* arising from challenges to the employment and promotion policies and procedures of police organizations. A striking element in the drive for equal rights for traditionally “disadvantaged” groups is a substantial body of law dealing with non-discrimination on the basis of sex, race, ethnicity, etc. In both Canada and the United States, police

departments have been brought under this legal edifice through legislation related to equality in employment opportunities and human rights¹⁶

In a review of court cases related to physical ability tests, Hogan and Quigley (1986), Hoover (1992), and Arvey, Nutting and Landon (1992) found, among other reasons, that challenges are frequently made that the job analysis failed to adequately tap the relevant duties and performance requirements and that the relationship between test events and the job is questionable. Winters (1989, 1992) reviewed some of the court cases related to psychological tests used in selection, especially for minority applicants. He argues that the only way police agencies can use such tests is to make them job-related or have corroborating data, and use these tests in conjunction with other selection procedures. In fact, in *Grizzell v. Jackson Police Department* case, the court ruled that the Jackson police should no longer rely exclusively on the MMPI (one of the psychological tests used by the police) for psychological evaluation and “that no one will be denied employment as a sworn police officer or refused promotion based solely and exclusively on their MMPI score without a psychological interview and other corroborating data” (Winters, 1989, pp. 28-29).

In Canada, legal cases have also resulted from similar challenges. In 1978, in Ontario, a Board of Inquiry hearing the complaint of *Mr. Ishar Singh v. Security Investigation Services Ltd.* ruled in favour of Mr. Singh. He was refused a job as a security guard because he wore the turban and beard required in the Sikh faith. The Board of Inquiry found that while the employer had no intention to insult or act with malice, the effect of the employer’s policy which required their security guards be clean shaven and wear caps, was to deny employment to Sikhs. It ruled that intention was not necessary to establish a contravention of human rights legislation (Jain, 1981).

¹⁶ For a comprehensive review of equal employment opportunity and female employment in U.S. police agencies, see Potts (1983).

In *ATF v. CN* (1984), a Canadian Human Rights Tribunal struck down the use of the Bennet Mechanical Comprehension Test for selection into several entry-level positions because the test had a discriminatory impact on women (Jain, 1988). The Supreme court upheld the tribunal's decision in 1987.

Gender Discrimination

In *Ann Colfer v. Ottawa Police Commission* (1979) the Human Rights tribunal ruled that any requirement that has a disproportionately negative effect on female applicants is illegal unless it is related to job success or business necessity (Jain, 1987). Also, the Prince Edward Board of Inquiry found that the City of Charlottetown discriminated against Gladys Kickham because of her sex when it failed to hire her as a police officer [*Kickham v. City of Charlottetown*, 1986), 7 C.H.R.R. D/3339 (PEIBd. Inq.)]. The board found that a committee appointed by the Charlottetown City Council changed the rating method when it realized that Gladys Kickham had achieved the highest score, thereby dropping her to the lowest of the top three candidates. The council also voted in favour of a male candidate who was tied in votes with Ms. Kickham, a decision found by the board to be influenced by discriminatory objections to the hiring of a woman as a police officer by police officials on the selection committee. Apart from monetary compensation, the Board also recommended that Ms. Kickham be offered the next available police officer position in the city [*Gladys Kickham v. City of Charlottetown*, (1986), 7 C.H.R.R. D/3481 (Bd. of Inq.)]. Similarly, in *Kathy Harding v. Timmins Board of Police Officers* (1987) and *Forsyth v. Matsqui Police Service* (1988), it was held that the applicants were not hired because of their sex and Tribunal thus ruled that the police should cease and desist discriminating in the hiring of police officers.

Racial Harassment

In an early case, Mr. Ahluwalia claimed that the Metropolitan Toronto Board of Commissioners of Police, in dismissing him, discriminated based on his race [*Hargit S. Ahluwalia v. Metropolitan Board of Commissioners of Police and Inspector William Dickson*, (1983), 4 C.H.R.R. D/1757 (Ont. Bd. Inq.)]. Mr. Ahluwalia alleged that he was unable to get along with his fellow officers because they held discriminatory attitudes towards him because of his race (Sikh) and constantly called him a “Paki”. His complaint was dismissed by the Board of Inquiry.

Nevertheless, the Board ordered the police to take the necessary steps to eliminate racial name-calling between police officers and to establish a race relations sensitization program in cooperation with the Ontario Human Rights Commission.

Pregnancy and Duty to Accommodate

A case involving pregnancy of an officer (Kathleen Pattison) while actively employed was heard at a number of judicial and semi-judicial fora [see *Ontario (Human Rights Commission) v. Fort Frances (Town) Commissioners of Police*, (1988), 10 C.H.R.R., D/5831, (OCS); *Ontario (Human Rights Commission) v. Fort Frances (Town) Commissioners of Police* (No. 2), (1989), 11 C.H.R.R. D/345 (Ont. Div. Ct.); *Pattison v. Fort Frances (Town) Commissioners of Police*, (1987) 8 C.H.R.R. D/3884 (Ont. Bd. Inq.); *Pattison v. Fort Frances (Town) Commissioners of Police*, (1989) 11 C.H.R.R. D/347, (Ont. Bd. Inq.)]. In the final analysis, the Board of Inquiry and the Court found that Ms. Pattison, a police officer in Fort Frances, was not discriminated against because of her sex when she was refused restricted duties and required to wear her gun belt during her pregnancy. It was ruled that Ms. Pattison’s pregnancy did not prevent her from wearing a police

uniform and gun belt and from doing patrol duty since these were bona fide occupational requirements. However, it was held that she was discriminated against when she was refused clerk-typist's duties which would have been available to a male officer who was on a leave of absence as she was at that time.

Marital and Family Status

In a case that involved both marital and family status (as well as age), [*Lannin v. Ontario (Ministry of the Solicitor General)*, (1993), 26 C.H.R.R. D/58 (Ont. Bd. Inq.)], the Board of Inquiry found that the Ontario Provincial Police (OPP) discriminated against Carol Lannin when it asked her questions during a job interview regarding her marital status, age, and family status. However, the Board concluded that, though the job competition was unfair, the decision not to hire Ms. Lannin as a stenographer for the Blind River OPP detachment was not discriminatory since other applicants were found to be more suitably qualified for the job.

Disability

In a case related to disability, a Quebec Tribunal found that the Montreal Urban Community had discriminated against Jean-Marc Hamon [*Quebec (Comm. des droits de la personne) et Hamon c. Montreal (Communaute Urbane*, (1996), 26 C.H.R.R. D/466 (Que. Trib.)] on the basis of a handicap when it refused his application as a police officer. The Tribunal found that in his personal case, the medical condition (spondylolisthesis) could not prevent him from satisfactorily performing his job. It also ordered that in the future, the professional clinical history of candidates be assessed.

Other cases involve police officers and other employees who were already in active employment. In *Barnard v. Fort Frances Board of Police Commissioners*, (1986), 7 C.H.R.R. D/3167, (Ont. Bd. Inq.), the Ontario Board of Inquiry dismissed a preliminary motion made by the Board of Commissioners of Police that the hearing into the complaint by Denis Barnard should not proceed because the Board did not have the jurisdiction to hear the complaint. The complainant, a diabetic, alleged that because of his disability he was placed on restricted duties indefinitely. After the hearing, the Board ruled that Mr. Barnard was not discriminated against because his diabetes condition affected the performance of his job. Mr. Barnard was returned to normal duties when his diabetic condition was stabilized.

In *Friesen v. Regina (City) Commissioners of Police*, (1990), 13 C.H.R.R. D/11, (Sask. Bd. Inq.), the Board of Inquiry found that the Regina Board of Police Commissioners discriminated against Gregory Friesen because of a disability. Mr. Friesen lost his left index finger in an accident and suffered some loss of flexibility in the other fingers of his left hand. As part of the pre-employment testing, Mr. Friesen was asked to hold a gun by the barrel only by using his left hand. He fumbled and was judged unable to fulfill the duties as a police officer. The Board found that this test was unfair and did not accurately reflect Mr. Friesen's ability to handle a gun and perform his police duties; compensation was ordered for humiliation. However, the Board found that during settlement attempts, Mr. Friesen was given an interview at the same time and in the same manner as others who were going through the final stages of the recruitment process. He was not selected and the Board concluded that he would not have been hired even if the discrimination had not occurred; no compensation was ordered for loss of opportunity.

Age-related Cases

The cases involving officers and other relevant employees can be put into two categories: complaints at the pre-employment stage, and complaints at the post-employment (complainants previously employed) stage. Issues related to age of applicants have been the focus of several cases. In an early case, Saskatchewan Human Rights Commission refused to grant the Saskatchewan Police Commission an exemption in order that age may be asked on application forms for police officers [*Saskatchewan Human Rights Commission and Saskatchewan Police Commission*, (1984), 5 C.H.R.R. D/2317, (Sask. H.R. Com. Decision)]. The Police Commission argued that the date of birth was required in order that checks on criminal record could have been done through the Canadian Police Information Centre. The Human Rights Commission agreed that the date of birth was required for such checks but held that a conditional job offer should first be made and then the records checked. Noting that age has been used in the past by employers of police to discriminate, the Commission held that the request for exemption did not occur in a neutral environment. A similar ruling was also issued in this case with regards to medical testing.

In *Underwood v. Board of Commissioners of Police of Smith Falls*, (1985), 7 C.H.R.R. D/3176, (Ont. Bd. Inq.), the Ontario Board of Inquiry found that the Board of Police Commissioners for the Town of Smith Falls intentionally and wilfully discriminated against John Underwood because of his age (40) when it rejected his application for a police officer position. The application was rejected at the first screening by the Police Commissioner. The Board also ordered the Board of Police Commissioners to review their application forms and procedures for recruitment and to comply with the provisions of the Ontario Human Rights Code.

In the second category (post-employment), there have been many cases, primarily involving issues related to the age of retirement. In an early case, Mr. Finlayson alleged discrimination on the basis of age when he was forced to retire from the Winnipeg Police Department [*Finlayson v. The City of Winnipeg et al.*, (1981)]. The Manitoba Board of Inquiry found that the compulsory retirement of Mr. Finlayson, a Staff Inspector, did not constitute a violation of the Manitoba Human Rights Act because it was justified by a reasonable occupational requirement. The Board noted that Staff Inspectors are required to attend dangerous and stressful events in the course of their duties (issue of public safety) and found that there were no reliable tests to determine an individual's ability to deal with stressful events at an older age. This decision was subsequently upheld by a Court of Queen's Bench and a Court of Appeal.

In another case [*Large v. Stratford (City) Police Dept.*, (1990), 14 C.H.R.R. D/138, (Ont. Bd. Inq.)], the Board of Inquiry found that the mandatory retirement of Albert Large at age 60 violated the age discrimination protections in the Ontario Human Rights Code. The Board held that the respondents did not satisfy the subjective nor objective branch of the test for a bona fide occupational qualification which was set out by the Supreme Court of Canada in the *Etoibicoke* case. Subjectively, the Board did not find sufficient evidence that the policy (mandatory retirement at age 60) was introduced for the purpose of addressing work-related conditions. Objectively, it was also found that police work was not as physically strenuous as fire fighting and that police officers could have performed at a satisfactory level at age 60 and over. The Board concluded that the increased risk of inability to perform for police officers over age 60 was not sufficient to justify retiring police officers mandatorily at age 60. This decision was upheld by both the Ontario Divisional Court and the Ontario Court of Appeal [*Large v. Stratford (City)*, (1995), 24 C.H.R.R. D/1, (SCC)].

As this literature review suggests, some of the problems in the police-VM and aboriginal peoples relationship can be addressed through increased representation of VMs and aboriginals in police services/organizations. One method emphasized in the various reports and literature is the use of innovative strategies in recruiting and selecting minority police officers. Thus, the main objectives of this paper are:

- (i) to examine all methods of police staffing in selected police organizations;
- (ii) to assess the effectiveness of new and innovative recruitment, selection and promotion strategies implemented by these organizations; and,
- (iii) to make recommendations on increasing VM and aboriginal representation in Canadian police services, thereby enhancing harmonious race relations.

III. METHODOLOGY

Thirteen of the larger police organizations across Canada were surveyed to assess current and ongoing recruitment, selection, appraisal and career development strategies and their effectiveness (viz., Vancouver, Edmonton, Calgary, Regina, Winnipeg, Toronto, Ottawa-Hull, the OPP, Montreal, SQ, Halifax, St. Hubert, and the RCMP).¹⁷ The questionnaire was pre-tested using a selected sample of respondents and appropriate adjustments were made before the surveys were mailed to the respective organizations. Contacts were established in each of these organizations with administrators responsible for staffing and selected police officials were interviewed. These contacts completed the questionnaires and provided supplemental information through follow-up telephone interviews and/or visits to locations. The data were analysed using descriptive statistics.

¹⁷ This study builds on previous work by Jain (1987, 1994) in which 14 police organizations were surveyed; in this study, there are 13 organizations as a result of the amalgamation of the Moncton Police Service with the RCMP.

In addition, focus groups of VMs and aboriginals were conducted in Montreal, Toronto and London (ON).

IV. RESULTS

Overall Representation of Visible Minority Officers

As Table 1 shows, representation of visible minority officers has increased over the past decade, especially over the last five years. However, the representation rates are still below the percentage of VMs in the labour market. This situation is especially noticeable in Vancouver and Toronto, two of Canada's cities with the highest proportions of visible minority residents. However, Halifax, Regina and Ottawa/Hull are gradually approaching representation rates that reflect the VMs in the labour market, with the latter two recording relatively dramatic increases over the last five years.

In the case of aboriginal officers (in Table 1A) Winnipeg, Regina and the RCMP exceed the 1991 labour force representation rates while Edmonton approximates the aboriginal workforce representation rates in the city. Other police organizations have some catching up with the representation in the workforce. These representation figures seem to indicate impressive gains in aboriginal representation, especially given the few years since the Aboriginal Inquiries and also given the growth in the First Nations Policing Services.

Recent Hiring of Designated Group Police Officers by Individual Police Services

As is evident from Table 1B, several police agencies such as the RCMP, Montreal, Regina, Vancouver and Ottawa-Carleton are hiring VM officers in excess of the 1991 labour market availability rates.

RCMP, Montreal, Regina, Edmonton and Winnipeg are hiring aboriginal officers in excess of 1991 labour market availability rates.

With the exception of the RCMP, OPP and Metropolitan Toronto, all other forces are hiring in relatively small numbers, which will not significantly impact on increasing their overall representations in these groups.

Table 1: Visible-minority representation in police organizations (1985, 1987, 1990, 1996/97) and availability of visible minorities in labour market (aged 15 years and over).

Visible Minorities	1985			1987			1990			1996/97			Area	VM % in Labour market (1991 Census)
	% Men	% Women	% Total	% Men	% Women	% Total	% Men	% Women	% Total	% Men	% Women	% Total		
Police Organization														
RCMP	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	0.8	N/A	0.8	2.5	0.4	2.9	Canada	9.1
Vancouver	1.9	0.3	2.2	2.3	0.3	2.6	3.1	0.7	3.8	4.7	0.8	5.5	Vancouver	22.4
Edmonton	N/A	N/A	N/A	0.7	N/A	0.7	1.6	0.4	2	4.8	0.5	5.3	Edmonton	11.5
Calgary	0.7	0.1	0.8	0.4	0.2	0.6	Men & Women		1.5	3.5	0.3	3.8	Calgary	12.5
Regina	N/A	N/A	N/A	0.6	N/A	0.6	0.6	0	0.6	3.6	0	3.6	Regina	4.8
Winnipeg	1.3	0	1.3	1.8	0.1	1.9	3	0.2	3.2	3.1	0.3	3.4	Winnipeg	10.3
Toronto	Men & Women		2.7	3	0.4	3.4	4.3	0.4	4.7	7	0.7	7.7*	Toronto	24.6
Ottawa-Carleton	0.3	0	0.3	0.3	0	0.3	2.3	0	2.3	N/A	N/A	8.3**	Ottawa/Hull	9.4
OPP	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	1.4	0.02	1.4	N/A	N/A	N/A	Ontario	12.7
Montreal	0.1	0	0.1	0.3	N/A	0.3	0.5	0.02	0.5	N/A	N/A	N/A	Montreal	9.9
QPP	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	0	0.02	0	1.3	0.3	1.6	Quebec	5.1
Halifax	1.9	0	1.9	1.9	0	1.9	Men & Women		4.5	3.6	0.2	3.8***	Halifax	5.6
St. Hubert	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	St. Hubert	N/A

* January 1998

** Estimates only

*** November 1998

Table 1A: Aboriginal representation in police organizations, 1996/97 and availability of aboriginals in labour market (aged 15 years and over).

Aboriginals	1996/97			Area	AB % in labour market (1991 Census)
Police Organization	% Men	% Women	% Total		
RCMP	3	0.5	3.5	Canada	3
Vancouver	0.5	0.2	0.7	Vancouver	2.4
Edmonton	2.9	0.9	3.8	Edmonton	3.9
Calgary	1.2	0.3	1.5	Calgary	2.7
Regina	5.2	2	7.2	Regina	4.2
Winnipeg	6.8	1.3	8.1	Winnipeg	5
Toronto	0.05	0.01	0.06	Toronto	1
Ottawa-Carleton	N/A	N/A	2.4	Ottawa/Hull	3.3
OPP	N/A	N/A	N/A	Ontario	2.1
Montreal	N/A	N/A	N/A	Montreal	1.5
QPP	0.8	0.08	0.8	Quebec	1.9
Halifax	0.7	0.5	1.2	Halifax	2
St. Hubert	0	0	0	St. Hubert	N/A

Table 1B: Hiring rates of visible minorities, aboriginals and women by police services for 1996 and 1995¹⁸

Police Service	Year	Total Selected	Visible Minority	Aboriginal	Women
Calgary	2.0e+07	4860	1(2%) 3 (5%)	11 (23%) 0	11 (23%) 11 (18%)
Edmonton	2.0e+07	5762	2 (3%) 9 (14%)	3 (5%) 7 (11%)	14 (25%) 20 (32%)
Montreal	2.0e+07	2416	23 (96%) 15 (94%)	1 (4%) 1 (6%)	1 (4%) 3 (19%)
RCMP	1996	808	91 (11%)	73 (9%)	277 (34%)
Regina	2.0e+07	115	0 3 (20%)	0 4 (27%)	0 3 (20%)
Vancouver ¹⁹	2.0e+07	3932	14 (36%) 2 (6%)	0 1 (3%)	15 (38%) 12 (37.5%)
Winnipeg	2.0e+07	2472	2 (8%) 8 (11%)	3 (12%) 12 (17%)	2 (8%) 17 (24%)
OPP	2.0e+07	128321	0 19 (6%)	0 7 (2%)	0 120 (37%)
Metropolitan Toronto	2.0e+07	33793	30 (9%) 18 (9%)	4 (1%) 1 (1%)	55 (16%) 21 (23%)

¹⁸ Ottawa-Carleton police service provided hiring estimates for 1997. During 1997, a total of 52 candidates were selected. Of these, 10 percent were estimated to be visible minorities and two percent aboriginals. QPP and Halifax Police did not provide any figures. St. Hubert Police Department did not recruit any VMs and aboriginals.

¹⁹ In addition, from July 1996 to November 1998, there were 40 VM (30 VM men and 10 VM females) Vancouver Police Department recruits enrolled in the Police Academy of the Justice Institute of British Columbia. During the same period, there were 3 aboriginal males and 2 aboriginal females from the Vancouver Police Department in the Police Academy.

The Police Academy in Vancouver receives recruits from British Columbia's municipal police agencies. The Academy uses the assessment center method of selection at the entry level of policing and to identify potential at the supervisory rank (The Assessment Center Method, undated). All the recruits for the police constable's job at the Vancouver Police Service are required to go to the Police Academy during their probationary period before being confirmed as police officers.

Representation by Rank

As Tables 2 to 4 indicate, the ranks achieved by VM and aboriginal police officers ranged from a constable to an inspector or staff inspector in the police services that provided the data by rank. Ten of the 13 police organizations in this study provided such data.

Only three police services reported having both aboriginal and VM inspector and/or staff inspectors. RCMP had five aboriginal inspectors while Winnipeg and the OPP reported having two aboriginal inspectors each. The RCMP, Metropolitan Toronto and Vancouver police organizations had two, three and one VM inspectors respectively.

Female police officers ranged from constable to one Chief of Police in Calgary and one Deputy Chief in the Metropolitan Toronto Police, one Superintendent in Edmonton and two Superintendents in the RCMP. In four other police services, the highest rank attained by a female police officer was that of Inspector.

This analysis suggests that except for the Chief's position in Edmonton, the highest rank attained by aboriginal and VM officers is that of an inspector and/or staff inspector. Only three of the 10 reporting police agencies had an aboriginal and a VM officer at this rank; and that these officers represent substantially less than one percent of each of the police services that reported having them. Female police officers continue to be under-represented in higher ranks as well with the exception of a (white) female chief of police each in the OPP and the Calgary Police Service.

Table 2: Aboriginals by Rank in Police Organizations in Canada

Rank	RCMP July 1998		Vancouver December 1996		Edmonton 1996/97		Calgary 1996/97		Regina 1996/97		Winnipeg January 1997	
	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)
Constable	545 (3.67)	80* (0.54)	6 (0.52)	2 (0.17)	27 (2.67)	9 (0.89)	14 (1.21)	4 (0.34)	15 (4.92)	5 (1.64)	70 (5.77)	16 (1.32)
Corporal	49 (0.33)	2* (0.01)	0	0	0	0	0	0	1 (0.33)	0	8 (0.66)	0
Sergeant	21 (0.14)	0	0	0	1 (0.10)	0	0	0	0	1 (0.33)	3 (0.25)	0
S/Sgt	7 (0.05)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Insp	5 (0.03)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2 (0.16)	0
Supt	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
C/Supt	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dy. Chief	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Chief	0	0	0	0	1 (0.10)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
TOTAL	627 (4.22)	82 (0.55)	6 (0.52)	2 (0.17)	29 (2.86)	9 (0.89)	14 (1.21)	4 (0.34)	16 (5.25)	6 (1.97)	83 (6.84)	16 (1.32)
Note: SMO and A/Comm 0		* as of Dec. 31/97										
M + F =	12876 + 1985 = 14861		1019 + 136 = 1155		900 + 113 = 1013		1055 + 105 = 1160		277 + 28 = 305		1089 + 125 = 1214	

Rank	Toronto January 1998		Ottawa February 1997		OPP 1996/97		Montreal		OPP 1996/97		Halifax November 1998		St. Hubert	
	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)
Constable	24* (0.48)	6 (0.12)	SEE NOTE BELOW		127 M&F		NA	NA	29 (0.76)	8 (0.21)	3 (0.78)	2 (0.52)	0	0
Corporal	0**	0			NA		NA	0	0	0	0			
Sergeant	1 (0.02)	0			NA		NA	0	0	0	0			
S/Sgt	0	0			NA		NA	0	0	0	0			
Insp	0	0			NA		NA	0	0	0	0			
Supt	0	0			NA		NA	0	0	0	0			
C/Supt	0	0			NA		NA	0	0	0	0			
Dy. Chief	0	0			NA		NA	0	0	0	0			
Chief	0	0					NA	NA	0	0				
TOTAL	25 (0.50)	6 (0.12)			150 M&F approx. 12		NA	NA	29 (0.76)	8 (0.21)	3 (0.78)	2 (0.52)	0	0
* Includes Cadets (2 Male) ** Rank does not exist			21 total M&F Aboriginals = 2.4%		Unofficial estimates based on interviews		NA = Not Available							
			Unofficial estimates based on interviews											
M + F =	4426 + 556 = 4982		747 + 119 = 866		Total = 4400		Total = 4110 (Aug 97)		3580 + 221 = 3801		353 + 31 = 384		90 + 12 = 102	

Table 3: Visible Minorities by Rank in Police Organizations in Canada

Rank	RCMP July 1998		Vancouver December 1996		Edmonton 1996/97		Calgary 1996/97		Regina 1996/97		Winnipeg January 1997	
	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)
Constable	455 (3.06)	49* (0.33)	49 (4.24)	9 (0.78)	46 (4.54)	5 (0.49)	39 (3.36)	4 (0.34)	11 (3.61)	0	37 (3.05)	4 (0.33)
Corporal	24 (0.16)		1 (0.09)	0	0	0	0	0	0		0	0
Sergeant	8 (0.05)		3 (0.26)	0	2 (0.20)	0	1 (0.09)	0	0		1 (0.08)	0
S/Sgt	0		0	0	1 (0.10)	0	1 (0.09)	0	0		0	0
Insp	2 (0.01)		1 (0.09)	0	0	0	0	0	0		0	0
Supt	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		0	0
C/Supt	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		0	0
Dy. Chief	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		0	0
Chief	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		0	0
TOTAL	489 (3.29)	49 (0.33)	54 (4.68)	9 (0.78)	49 (4.84)	5 (0.49)	41 (3.53)	4 (0.34)	11 (3.61)	0	38 (3.13)	4 (0.33)
		Not available by gender *as of Dec.97										
M + F =	12876 + 1985 = 14861		1019 + 136 = 1155		900 + 113 = 1013		1055 + 105 = 1160		277 + 28 = 305		1089 + 125 = 1214	

Rank	Toronto January 1998		Ottawa February 1997		OPP 1996/97		Montreal		QPP 1996/97		Halifax November 1998		St. Hubert	
	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)
Constable	302* (6.06)	33* (0.66)			NA	NA	NA	NA	51 (1.34)	10 (0.26)	13 (3.39)	1 (0.26)	0	0
Corporal	0**	0**	SEE	NOTE	NA	NA	NA	NA	0	0	0	0		
Sergeant	25 (0.50)	1 (0.02)		BELOW	NA	NA	NA	NA	0	0	1 (0.26)	0		
S/Sgt	6 (0.12)	0			NA	NA	NA	NA	0	0	0	0		
Insp	3 (0.06)	0			NA	NA	NA	NA	0	0	0	0		
Supt	0	0			NA	NA	NA	NA	0	0	0	0		
C/Supt	incl in Supt	incl in Supt			NA	NA	NA	NA	0	0	0	0		
Dy. Chief	0	0			NA	NA	NA	NA	0	0	0	0		
Chief	incl in DyC	incl in DyC			NA	NA	NA	NA	0	0	0	0		
TOTAL	336 (6.74)	34 (0.68)							51 (1.34)	10 (0.26)	14 (3.65)	1 (0.26)	0	0
	* Includes Cadets (13 Male, 2 Female)	74 total M&F VMs = 8.3%			NA = Not Available	NA = Not Available	NA = Not Available							
	** Rank does not exist	Unofficial estimates based on interviews												
	*** S/Insp													
M + F =	4426 + 556 = 4982	747 + 119 = 866	Total = 4400	Total = 4110 (Aug97)	3580 + 221 = 3801	353 + 31 = 384	90 + 12 = 102							

Table 4: Rank by Gender in Police Organizations in Canada

Rank	RCMP July 1998		Vancouver December 1996		Edmonton 1996/97		Calgary 1996/97		Regina 1996/97		Winnipeg January 1997	
	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)
Constable	7736 (52.06)	1824 (12.27)	719 (62.25)	121 (10.48)	900 (88.85)	104 (10.27)	781 (67.33)	93 (8.02)	167 (54.75)	25 (8.20)	802 (66.06)	116 (9.56)
Corporal	2620 (17.63)	127 (0.85)	157 (13.59)	11 (0.95)	NA	0	0*	0	42 (13.77)	1 (0.33)	134* (11.04)	5* (0.41)
Sergeant	1459 (9.82)	22 (0.15)	106 (9.18)	3 (0.26)	NA	7 (0.69)	214** (18.45)	8 (0.69)	47 (15.41)	1 (0.33)	82 (6.75)	3 (0.25)
S/Sgt	617 (4.15)	5 (0.03)	incl in Sgt	incl in Sgt	NA	1 (0.10)	36 (3.10)	3 (0.26)	10 (3.28)	1 (0.33)	40 (3.29)	0
Insp	286 (1.92)	5 (0.03)	30 (2.60)	1 (0.09)	NA	0	19 (1.64)	0	6 (1.97)	0	21 (1.73)	1 (0.08)
Supt	98 (0.66)	1 (0.01)	0	0	NA	1 (0.10)	2 (0.17)	0	2 (0.66)	0	6 (0.49)	0
C/Supt	33 (0.22)	1 (0.01)	0	0	NA	0	0*	0	incl in Supt	incl in Supt	incl in Supt	incl in Supt
Dy. Chief	5 (0.03)	0	6 (0.52)	0	NA	0	3 (0.26)	0	3 (0.98)	0	3 (0.25)	0
Chief	1 (0.01)	0	1 (0.09)	0	NA	0	0	1 (0.09)	incl in DyC	incl in DyC	1 (0.08)	0
TOTAL	12876 (86.64)	1985 (13.36)	1019 (88.23)	136 (11.77)	900 (88.85)	113 (11.15)	1055 (90.95)	105 (9.05)	277 (90.82)	28 (9.18)	1089 (89.70)	125 (10.30)
Note: S/M 3 and A/Comm 18 are not included		Note: S/M 0 and A/Comm 0			NA = Not Available		* Rank does not exist				* Patrol/detective sergeants	
M + F =		12876 + 1985 = 14861	1019 + 136 = 1155		900 + 113 = 1013		1055 + 105 = 1160		277 + 28 = 305		1089 + 125 = 1214	

Rank	Toronto January 1998		Ottawa February 1997		OPP 1996/97		Montreal		QPP 1996/97		Halifax November 1998		St. Hubert	
	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)
Constable	3399* (68.23)	510* (10.24)	514 (59.35)	104 (12.01)	NA	NA	NA	NA	2805 (73.80)	208 (5.47)	267 (69.53)	29 (7.55)	NA	10 (9.80)
Corporal	0**	0	0	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	372 (9.79)	6 (0.16)	0	0	NA	0
Sergeant	775 (15.56)	37 (0.74)	165 (19.05)	11 (1.27)	NA	NA	NA	NA	266 (7.00)	4 (0.11)	65 (16.93)	2 (0.52)	NA	2 (1.96)
S/Sgt	192 (3.85)	5 (0.10)	41 (4.73)	2 (0.23)	NA	NA	NA	NA	52* (1.37)	2* (0.05)	8 (2.08)	0	NA	0
Insp	40 (0.80)	3 (0.06)	18 (2.08)	2 (0.23)	NA	NA	NA	NA	81** (2.13)	1* (0.03)	7 (1.82)	0	NA	0
Supt	14 (0.28)	0	6 (0.69)	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	0	0	3 (0.78)	0	NA	0
C/Supt	incl in Supt	incl in Supt	incl in Supt	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	incl in Supt	0	0	0	NA	0
Dy. Chief	6 (0.12)	1 (0.02)	2 (0.23)	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	3 (0.08)	0	2 (0.52)	0	NA	0
Chief	incl in DyC	incl in DyC	1 (0.12)	0	0	1 (0.02)	NA	NA	1 (0.03)	0	1 (0.26)	0	NA	0
TOTAL	4426 (88.84)	556 (11.16)	747 (86.26)	119 (13.74)					3580 (94.19)	221 (5.81)	353 (91.93)	31 (8.07)	90 (88.2)	12 (11.76)
	* Includes Cadets (37 Male, 16 Female)				NA = Not Available		NA = Not Available		* Lieutenants ** Comprised of Captains and Inspectors				Note: Total strength '97 102 M&F NA = Not Available	
	** Rank does not exist				Total = 4400		Total = 4110 (Aug 97)		3580 + 221 = 3801		353 + 31 = 384		90 + 12 = 102	
M + F =	4426 + 556 = 4982		747 + 119 = 866		Total = 4400		Total = 4110 (Aug 97)		3580 + 221 = 3801		353 + 31 = 384		90 + 12 = 102	

Recruitment Strategies

The Canadian Police Services surveyed in this study utilize an extensive array of recruitment strategies, both traditional and some innovative new approaches. However, as Table 5 suggests, it seems as if the traditional strategies (such as recruiting through the standard media, employee referrals, etc) are still very popular. Nevertheless, over the last five years, police recruiting visits to community colleges and minority organizations have also been fairly widely used.

Table 5: Recruitment practices of selected Canadian police organizations, 1985, 1987, 1990, 1996/97.

Source	1985		1987		1990		1996/97	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Newspapers, Recruitment brochures, etc.	10	71	10	71	11	79	11	85
Employee referral	9	64	9	63	10	71	9	69
Walk-ins and personal contact	11	79	11	79	11	79	10	77
High school	13	93	11	79	12	86	9	69
Community colleges and universities							9	69
Minority organizations							9	69

Note: N = 14 for 1985, 1987 and 1990. N = 13 for 1996/97 due to the amalgamation of the Moncton police service with the RCMP.

With respect specifically to the recruitment of visible minority officers, the comparative figures (Table 6) reveal that there are important changes in some recruitment strategies. That is, while the use of police officers with contacts, and meetings with high school teachers and administrators have decreased considerably (from 93 to 69 per cent and from 86 to 38 per cent respectively), the use of visible minority role models is on the increase (from 71 to 92 per cent). For 1996/97, strategies used were aboriginal role models; aboriginal and VM constables; and

consultations with aboriginal and VM organizations by 12 (92%) of the police organizations while 11 (85%) of organizations utilized VM/aboriginal community group presentations; high school presentations using VM and aboriginal role models; and qualified and trained recruiters to recruit aboriginal and VM officers.²⁰

²⁰ Some additional recruitment measures by the Metropolitan Toronto Police include introduction of a point system and encouragement of individuals who possess proficiency in other languages, reside in the Metro area and who are familiar with community needs; coaching seminars; a recruitment video; and recruiters making telephone contact with community leaders to attract community representation.

Table 6: Strategies used by police organizations to recruit visible minority police officers, 1985 - 1996/97 and aboriginals 1996/97.

Strategy	1985 VM		1987 VM		1990 VM		1996/97 VM & Aboriginals	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Police officers with contacts	6	43	7	50	13	93	9	69
Qualified and trained recruiters	4	29	6	43	13	93	11	85
VM/AB community group presentations	6	43	7	50	12	86	11	85
High school presentations featuring VM/AB role models	4	29	4	29	12	86	11	85
Meeting high school teachers and administrators	1	7	3	21	12	86	5	38
VM/AB constables	-	-	-	-	12	86	12	92
Consultation with VM/AB organizations	-	-	-	-	12	86	12	92
Advertising in VM/AB media	-	-	-	-	12	86	10	77
Special police recruit team	-	-	-	-	10	71	8	62
VM/AB role models	3	21	6	43	10	71	12	92
Upgrading VM/AB civilian staff	-	-	-	-	8	57	7	54
Police recruitment stories in VM/AB media	-	-	-	-	-	-	5	38
Maintaining contacts with minority/aboriginal families	-	-	-	-	-	-	4	31
Promotional materials in other languages	-	-	-	-	-	-	3	23
Depicting VMs and ABs in promotional materials and ads	-	-	-	-	-	-	5	38

Note: N = 14 for 1985, 1987 and 1990. N = 13 for 1996/97 due to the amalgamation of the Moncton police service with the RCMP.

Aboriginal representation for 1996/97 only; they were surveyed for the first time in this period.

The most popular new approaches in recruiting VM and aboriginal officers, as reported by respondents, include: seminars/outreach programs for minority students; job fairs; the use of minority officers as role models; and, the use of the ethnic media.

Effectiveness of Recruitment Strategies

The main index used to capture the effectiveness of the various recruiting strategies was derived from a survey question (Q.6) that directly asked what methods generate the most applicants. As Table 7 shows, newspapers were ranked the most effective, followed by the use of VMs and aboriginals as role models, community outreach programs/presentations, and job fairs. None of the police organizations surveyed collected systematic data on actual figures for each recruitment method, broken down by the relevant groups (VMs, whites, etc.). Thus, no direct comparison could have been attempted. However, such an assessment can be made using indirect measures, such as representation rates across groups (see section on selection strategies).

Table 7: Recruitment methods that generate the most visible minority and aboriginal applicants, 1996/97.

Source	No. of Police Services (N=13)	%
Newspapers	7	54
VM role models	4	31
Community outreach	3	23
Job fairs	2	15
Community presentations	1	8
VM involvement in recruiting	1	8
Cultural relations officer	1	8

Barriers to Recruitment

In general, perceived barriers (as reported by the police services) remained the same over the past five years (see Table 8 below). There were, however, some **significant decreases** with respect to: distrust of police; policing not being an “honourable profession,” VMs are not welcomed in police services; and, policing as being dangerous. These are important positive trends and reflect a major attitudinal change by police organizations.

Table 8: Barriers in attracting visible-minority candidates as identified by police organizations: 1990 - 1996/97.

VM Barriers	1990		1996/97	
	No.	%	No.	%
Home country perceptions of police	12	86	10	77
Policing not acceptable for VM women	-	-	9	69
Better opportunities elsewhere	7	50	8	62
Distrust of police	12	86	7	54
Policing not an “honourable profession”	12	86	6	46
High physical requirements	-	-	5	38
Lack of advancement opportunities	5	36	3	23
High educational requirements	-	-	2	15
Multiple trips required by applicants	-	-	2	15
VMs not welcomed in police force	8	57	1	8
Policing as dangerous	7	50	1	8
Unclear job requirements	-	-	1	8
Lack of compensation & benefits information	-	-	1	8
Lack of foreign qualification equivalency	-	-	1	8

N = 14 for 1990; N = 13 for 1996/97 due to the amalgamation of the Moncton police service with the RCMP.

Table 8A:
Barriers in attracting aboriginal candidates as identified by police organizations (N=13)

AB Barriers	No.	%
Distrust of police	9	69
Better opportunities elsewhere	8	62
Policing not an “honourable profession”	4	31
ABs not welcomed in police force	4	31
High educational requirements	4	31
High physical requirements	3	23
Lack of advancement opportunities	2	15
Policing as dangerous	1	8
Lack of compensation & benefits information	1	8
Lack of information on job specializations	1	8
Multiple trips required by applicants	1	8

Number of police organizations that indicated they agree (4) or strongly agree (5) that the above are barriers in attracting aboriginal applicants. Resources Devoted to Recruitment

Since this (1996/97) was the first time that aboriginal officers were included in the study, comparisons with previous years are not possible. It seems that distrust of police and better opportunities elsewhere are the main barriers to aboriginal recruiting as perceived by police organizations.

Focus Groups' Perceptions

The issues identified in Table 9 and recommendations summarized in Table 10 are drawn from the report. “Report on Results of Focus Groups and Individual Interviews...” (Appendix I). The report summarizes data selected from focus groups and individual interviews in which members

of racial minorities and First Nations people discussed their experience and perceptions of policing as a career. Two waves of focus groups were conducted.

The first set of focus groups was with potential members of applicant pools involving women and men who are young adults considering their career options. These focus groups took place in London and Toronto, Ontario, and in Montreal, and included students and members of community organizations who identify themselves as members of racial minorities or First Nations, as well as white women. The nine focus groups of members of the potential applicant pool for police services provided insights into the perspectives of minority youth regarding policing as a career.

The second wave of focus groups included men and women who are members of racial minorities or First Nations, and who are officers in the RCMP, OPP, two municipal police services, and a First nations service in Ontario. Several individual interviews were also conducted with officers who hold senior ranks, or who have done extensive work to improve the representation of racial minorities and aboriginal people in policing. Altogether, 12 men and 17 women who are serving officers participated in the second wave.

The first wave of focus groups provided rich data on perceptions of policing as a career (see report in Appendix I). Racial minority and aboriginal youth reported many negative experiences with police that have created significant barriers to their recruitment into policing. Yet they also conveyed a strong belief in the importance to racial minority and First Nations communities of having a representative police force. Applicant pool participants believe that police organizations must change so that discriminatory and exclusionary practices are eliminated if policing is to become an attractive career to racial minority and First Nation youth.

The focus groups with serving officers dealt with four issues: 1) recruitment and selection; 2) mentoring, career development and promotion; 3) the culture of police organizations; and 4) strategies and prospects for change in police organizations. The report in Appendix I discusses the results of discussions of each of these themes.

The officers generally indicated that their career choice had been strongly influenced by relatives or friends who were police officers or by others positive, personal experiences with police in their communities. Among the attractive features of a career in policing are job security, the pay, and most important, the opportunity to be of service to one's community. Many of the officers of First Nations or racial minority backgrounds described how their presence in the police service made contributions to their communities. Officers discussed the differences between First Nations and mainstream policing. They identified barriers to movement from reserve into mainstream police services, and discussed the need for mainstream services to address their poor retention rate for the First nations officers they hire. Both aboriginal and racial minority officers identified many barriers to the recruitment of minorities into policing. Absence of role models, and the white male police culture are significant barriers for minority and aboriginal men, and even more for women.

Barriers to promotion and lack of career development opportunity were major sources of dissatisfaction to serving officers of minority or First nations background (see Appendix I for details). Several officers noted that progress has been made when mandatory employment equity has been in force, but with the repeal of Ontario's Employment Equity Act in 1995, the power of the "old boys' network" has been reasserted. A white male police culture currently presents barriers to promotion as well as a negative work environment for many officers of First nations or racial minority background, as well as for white women in different ways.

Table 9 presents some specific examples of how applicant pool members and serving officers perceive police organizations and careers. Table 10 lists examples of recommendations for changes that would address barriers to entry and career development for racial minorities and First Nations people, in order to improve their representation and retention in police services.

Resources Devoted to Recruitment

As Table 11 shows, the resources devoted to visible minorities , aboriginals and women recruitment efforts vary considerably across police services. For instance, Edmonton has five officers assisting in recruiting visible minorities, aboriginals and women (spending 25-50 per cent of their work time), whereas Regina has one officer on a part-time schedule (less than 25 per cent of the officer's time). Most of the services (approximately 70 per cent) have separate recruitment units within their Human Resources Divisions/Departments. While less than 50 per cent of the police services in this study reported that they do not currently incur extra costs in recruiting VMs, the majority (approximately 57%) do foresee incurring additional costs in future recruiting.

Table 9: Examples of Focus Group Members' Perceptions of Police Organizations

Issues Mentioned by First Nations Applicant Pool	Issues Mentioned by Racial Minorities Applicant Pool	Issues Mentioned by Serving Officers
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The idea of being a police officer was associated with negative images such as racism, discrimination, corruption, tear gas, and stereotyping. Young children see mainstream officers as "being white, male and racist." Aboriginal peacekeepers in reserve communities often lack community support. They are perceived as powerless by the Native community and discriminated against by city and provincial police forces. Reserve policing viewed as being influenced by politics of the community. For example, when a new Band Council is elected, police officers may be replaced. Perception that becoming a police officer would distance the individual from his or her community. Police organizations would have to change to make policing attractive as a career. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> For racial minority participants "policing as a career" conjured up phrases such as "authority", "interesting job", "secure career", "keeping order in society", "command respect", "power", "racism", "sexism", "harassment", "white male", "desensitized". Negative experiences reported by a black student: police stopped him and asked, "do you have a criminal record?" The police officer calmed down when he found out the student attended university and that his father was a doctor. Felt police focus on "blue-collar crime" and ignore corporate "wasp" crime, and that they attribute guilt by association, and tend to stereotype all blacks as drug dealers, etc. Concerns about working with a white partner who might "hate me" and not "back me up" in a crisis. One woman expressed concerns about the horror stories of women in the force, "that get raped or brutalized – that still happens and nobody does anything because they're supposed to be the police, and they're supposed to be good. Why should I apply?" 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Most of those serving had prior personal experience and some first-hand contact with policing. Attractions to the force included contact with the public and the opportunity to serve their community. Non-white participants mentioned joining because of community service, but also to "make sure that all minorities get a fair chance. I knew what prejudice could be like... and that was one of the reasons why I wanted to be a police officer". A Native officer said that he and his brother thought they could "make things better for our people" and "we were successful at that – by the time we left there were less B&E's, car thefts and drunk driving. I saw policing as a way to solve problems in our community. Now there are 13 or 14 other young officers and I think we had something to do with that." A black officer noted that his presence in the police department was noticed by and important to the community. Two women officers work for First Nations services. There were no barriers to entry for them. Being a role model to children in the community is a significant commitment and source of satisfaction. Difficulties in recruiting Black and Native youth because they know friends who were wrongly treated by the police.

Table 9: Examples of Focus Group Members' Perceptions of Police Organizations (continued)

Issues Mentioned by First Nations Applicant Pool	Issues Mentioned by Racial Minorities Applicant Pool	Issues Mentioned by Serving Officers
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strong recognition of the importance of policing, as an institution, to Native and racial minority communities. • Police need to be more aware and knowledgeable about First Nations communities and culture and about the relationship between First Nations and Canadian society. • Participants were concerned about the stereotyping of Native people by police and society in general. • Perception exists that minorities are receiving special consideration in hiring for police positions, when this is not the case. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Women discussed the notion of physical standards and felt that police services should select on the basis of physical fitness and skill rather than brute strength, and that communication and negotiation skills should be emphasized. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • EE viewed as positive. Many younger participants joined police services during early 90's when EE was included in provincial legislation. Concern about the repeal of EE and that progress may be lost. • Higher educational requirements, physical requirements, requirement to locate far from individual's community (Natives), lack of diversity because of cloning of middle level, promotions, interview selection boards and subjectivity, seniority heavily weighted, and hiring of tough women, were all viewed as barriers. Current hiring in OPP of retirees from municipal police services is also a barrier. • "Old boys network" in mainstream policing discourages women, racial minorities and aboriginal people. • Fears of resentment and backlash from white male officers when they get promoted. • There are always parties going on but you're never invited. • Feeling of isolation within organizational culture in which they are not accepted for who they are. • "Most police officers are narrow minded, they have strong views and to combat that is really, one person can't do it all. It will take generations to curtail the way things are now. Minorities are just starting to get a foothold."

Table 10: Examples of Focus Group Members' Recommendations for Changes in Police Organizations

First Nations Applicant Pool Members	Racial Minority Applicant Pool Members	Serving Officers
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide education and information regarding all aspects of police officer occupation, how to become a police officer, and positive aspects of the police role. Information can be made available through Aboriginal friendship centres, Native newspapers, magazines and radio. • Publicize the presence of Native officers with a "powerful future", and the difference they are making. Promotions of Native officers should be publicized, so that people in the community would be aware that progress is possible. • Provide more information to aboriginal communities so that they can monitor progress and needs for change in police-community relations. • Assess the issues surrounding the image of Native officers on reserves and take measures to improve respect for this role. • Aboriginal people should work together to raise levels of understanding and awareness through education and community development. • Participants expressed a hope that their participation in the focus group might result in their voices being heard, and in some movement toward needed changes. They suggested that studies such as this should be available to the public. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It is perceived that police have a tendency to stereotype minorities and women and to treat them with disrespect. Negative experiences of this kind with police create a serious barrier to recruitment of women and minorities. • Need to be more representative of the community, both to provide effective police services and to change the pattern of minority under-representation in policing. • Police organizations need to change and to become accountable for their exclusionary and discriminatory practices. • It is important that there be role models from under-represented groups, youth-oriented programs, mentoring and internship opportunities in policing as means of making police services more attractive to minorities and women. • Police need to do a better job of communicating with and understanding concerns of women and minorities. Informal contact in a variety of situations with a cross-section of minority communities, not just people with problems, would build mutual understanding. • Police need to give more responsive, effective and appropriate service to members of the community who are women and/or racial minorities, in order to build respect for police services and their work. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is a need to assess the criteria being used in selection to ensure that value and priority are placed upon experience and skills related to cross-cultural communication and understanding, community ties, personal flexibility, openness to diversity and change, and absence of racist and sexist attitudes and beliefs. • Important that police services communicate their desire for applicants who have interests and skills appropriate to community policing, in order to guide the process of self-selection of youths into careers. • Strategies to reduce racism in the culture of the mainstream police force in order to retain racial minority and aboriginal officers that are hired. • Recruiters should target aboriginal youth that are neither immersed in nor oriented toward traditional society, nor full participants in mainstream society. Youth "in the middle" may be open to community-oriented nature of police work. • Use officers who are visible minorities, Natives and women for outreach recruitment. • VTP and other mentoring and co-op programs that expose youth to police work.

Table 10: Examples of Focus Group Members' Recommendations for Changes in Police Organizations (continued)

First Nations Applicant Pool Members	Racial Minority Applicant Pool Members	Serving Officers
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Workshops for police involving elders and Native youth would increase awareness. • There was support for the concept of community policing, and visibility of police on the streets: "they create the image of being people's kind of cops". • Recruit and deploy locally: it is better to have "home grown cops" who understand "the struggles of the community" because they have "been there" and can "relate". 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Need for more women and minorities in leadership/top management positions in policing, both as role models, and as influence on the culture of the organization. • Police services need to do a better job of communicating what they do and why, in order to inform the public about police work and how to pursue this career. • There is a need to use up-to-date criteria for recruitment, including emphasis on physical fitness instead of strength, as well as on communication and negotiation skills. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • School visits and working with youth organizations such as Brownies, Girl Guides, Jr. Achievement, Rangers, Native Friendship Centre and Other First Nations and Minority youth organizations effective approach to recruitment. • Race relations committees and programs for ESL students. • Use of Native advisors and community liaison staff in police HR departments. • Different recruiting efforts needed for racial minority and First Nations women. • Need to find ways to encourage and support independent thought and openness to organization change and diversity in members of police services. • Organizational support for diversity, anti-racism policy, and disciplinary action viewed as positive changes. • Leadership that supports change and diversity considered one of the most important ingredients of progressive change. • Mandatory Employment Equity is needed. Government must set the example.

Table 11: Resources Devoted to Recruitment

	No. of police officers recruiting VMs, ABs, and women			Proportion of time devoted to recruiting VMs, ABs, and women				Budget available for advertising for 3 groups	Total budget available for recruiting 3 groups	Total budget for recruiting all police constables	Other	Separate recruitment unit in HR Division?	
Police Service	# Full-time	# Part-time	Other	100%	50-90%	25-50%	<25%					Yes	No
RCMP	-	-	60	-	-	-		-	-	-	-	x	
Vancouver	2	1	-		x			not specified	not specified	\$8,600	\$5,000 grant	x	
Edmonton	5	-	-			x		no specific amt	\$2-3,000	\$272,000	-	x	
Calgary	1	-	-	x				\$12,000	n/a	\$400,000	-	x	
Regina	1	-	-				x	\$500	\$4,700	\$4,700	-	x	
Winnipeg	3	-	-				x	\$3,000	not specified	\$563,000	-	x	
Toronto	-	10	-		x			-	-	-	-	x	
Ottawa	-	1	-		x			not assigned	-	\$15,000	-		x
OPP	7	all comm. officers	-		x			-	-	\$50,000	-	x	
Montreal	1	2	-		x			-	-	-	-	x	
QPP	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-		x
Halifax	-	4	-				x	very little	virtually non-existent	\$3,000	-		x
St. Hubert	-	1	-				x	none	none	\$2,000	-		x

Selection Procedures and Strategies

The effectiveness of the recruitment strategies geared towards attracting VMs can also be assessed through final selection figures and ratios. However, the final figures should be understood within the context of a host of other issues involved in the staffing process. These include an understanding of various criteria used by the police services and associated “hurdles,” and administrative issues involved in the decision-making process.

Selection Instruments and Hiring Criteria

As in other organizations, Canadian police services, at least in this study, use a variety of selection instruments and criteria in screening candidates for positions within the services, with the most popular shown in Table 12. In essence, with the exception of St Hubert²¹, all the other police services in this study use a multiple hurdle process in screening applicants. Applicants failing one hurdle are allowed to re-do the tests/hurdles, some with the failed tests (Vancouver, Calgary, Winnipeg, Toronto, QPP, and Montreal) and some all over again (Regina - except education test; Ottawa - except GATB; Halifax, OPP, Edmonton, and the RCMP). Table 13 below reveals the failure rates, by group, for the major hurdles (figures are only for the three police services that reported this data). It is evident that VM failure rates are higher than non-whites for some of these hurdles.

It is clear that two of the most popular selection instruments used are the interview and the psychological tests (including the general aptitude tests). Since many VMs fail these tests, it is pertinent that their validity be assessed - Tables 14 and 15 show relevant information. With respect

²¹ Only the Quebec Police Academy Diploma used.

to the interview, while all the police services have structured formats, only seven score the responses and in no instance are VMs (or ABs) included in the team that does the scoring. For the psychological test, only four police services have implemented (or are implementing) validation strategies.

Table 12: Most popular selection instruments used by Canadian police organizations in 1996/97. (N = 13)

Selection Instrument	No.	%
Physical fitness examination	13	100
Background investigation	13	100
Fingerprint check	13	100
Interview(s)	12	92
Medical examination	12	92
Character reference check	12	92
Application form	11	85
English test	9*	69
Personality test or other psychological assessment	9	69
Aptitude test	8*	62
Academically related courses	7*	54
Police officer selection test	6*	46
Essay	6	46
Intelligence test	6	46
Polygraph test	5	38
Mathematics test	4	31
Assessment centre	3	23
Point system	2	15
Report writing	2	15
Other	2**	15

N = 13. Number of organizations that ranked selection instruments as usually (3) or always (4) used. (Also included if not ranked but checked); * In some cases it was indicated that these test were included in RRSST, PCEE, & GATB tests; ** Other included: 1) life skills & qualified expertise; 2) urine sample, strip to underwear and take temperature.

Table 12A: Number of police organizations that used the following selection criteria or standards to choose constables. (N=13)

Selection Criteria or Standard	No. (N = 13)	%
Physical fitness/current health	13	100
Driver's licence	13	100
Eyesight-visual acuity	13	100
Reference/background investigating reports	13	100
Eyesight-colour sight deficiency	12	92
Education	11	85
Language	11	85
Citizenship	10	77
Eyesight-vision	10	77
Experience	9	69
Age	8	62
Performance during probationary period	8	62
Aptitude test results	7	54
Lifesaving, first aid, CPR	7	54
Performance during recruit training	7	54
Personality test results	6	46
Achievement test results	5	38
Polygraph test results	5	38
Intelligence test results	4	31
Swimming	4	31
Height and weight	3	23
Computer skills	3	23
Other *	3	23

* Other included: minimum score on interview; competencies; Canada Safety Council safe driver ? or equivalent.

Other: RCMP Minimum score on interview
 Ottawa Competencies
 Halifax Canada Safety Council safe driver or equiv.

Table 13: Failure Rates of Selected Groups in the Multiple Hurdle Process (most recent recruit class) by selected police services

Type of Hurdle/ <i>Police Service</i>	Visible Minorities		Aboriginals		Non-Minorities	
	No. Processed	% failed	No. Processed	% failed	No. Processed	% failed
<i>Calgary</i>						
Police Applicant Test	86	60%	39	46%	896	32%
Physical Abilities Test	14	36%	12	33%	505	24%
Interview (2 on 1)	9	0%	8	50%	343	29%
Interview (3 on 1)	6	33%	0	n.a.	222	34%
<i>Winnipeg</i>						
Police Applicant Test	56	71%	46	46%	348	41%
Physical Abilities Test	17	12%	28	7%	240	13%
<i>Toronto</i>						
General Aptitude Test Battery (GATB)	410	62%	28	50%	860	45%
Written Communication Assessment (WCA)	410	26%	22	23%	860	3%
Physical Readiness Evaluation for Police (PREP)	410	22%	22	14%	860	9%
Behaviour Exit Interviews	59	30%	6	0%	64	17%
Background Investigation	29	34%	4	0%	24	13%
Psychological Interview	17	18%	3	33%	20	10%

Table 14: Type and characteristic of interview used in selection of police officers in selected Canadian police organizations, 1990 and 1996/97.

Police Service	Type of Interview		Interview Scored		Interview scored by VMs & ABs		Interview Weight		Number of Interviews		How Interviews are conducted	Number of VM & AB interviewers		Who Interviews	
	1990	1996/97	1990	1996 /97	1990	1996 /97	1990	1996 /97	1990	1996 /97	1996/97	1990	1996 /97	1990	1996/97
RCMP	Other*	Other*	Yes	Yes	No	No	N/A	50% **	1	2	Other +	1	9	Non-commissioned personnel officer	Trained recruiters in divisional staffing & personnel officers
Vancouver	Structured	Structured	No	No	No	No	N/A	40%	2	4	Sequential	2	0	Recruiting sergeant or detective	Sgt/i/c recruiting & polygraph, Assessment centre assessor, background investigator
Edmonton	Structured	Other*	Yes	Yes	No	No	40%	35%	3	3	Sequential	0	?	Recruiting-unit member	-
Calgary	Structured	Structured	No	Yes	No	No	30%	**	2	2	Board	0	?	Staff sergeant detectives, constables	Trained police officers
Regina	Structured	Other*	No	No	No	No	100%	-	2	2	Board	0	0	Recruiting officer, chief, superintendent	Recruiting officer + H.R. secretary
Winnipeg	Structured	Structured	Yes	Yes	No	No	100%	60%	3	2	Both	1	0	City & police recruiting officers, personnel & training inspector	#1 Recruiting Sgt + police personnel; #2 Personnel division inspector, staff Sgt. personnel & training inspector
Toronto	N/A	Structured	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	N/A	-	N/A	-	-	N/A	-	N/A	-
Ottawa	Structured	Structured	No	Yes	No	No	40%	60%	3	1	-	1	2	Recruiting officer + 3 senior officers on recruiting board	Sr. officer + Sr. patrol supervisor
OPP	Structured	Structured	Yes	Yes	No	No	100%	pass **	1	1	-	3	1	Trained uniformed recruiting officer	Fully trained recruiter interviewers
Montreal	Structured	Other*	No	Yes	No	No	80%	60%	2	1	-	0	2	Civilian and police professionals	HR specialist + an officer
QPP	Structured	Structured	Yes	Yes	N/A	No	100%	32%	1	1	-	1	0	Civil & police employees, retirees	Officers
Halifax	Structured	Structured	Yes	Yes	No	No	100%	100%	2	2	Board	0	2	Personnel & board of senior officers	#1 HR staff #2 Board of senior administration
St. Hubert	Structured	Structured	Yes	Yes	No	No	100%	40%	1	2	Both	N/A	0	Police inspector + 2 lieutenants	Police officers with rank Lieutenant and above

* Combination of structured and unstructured

** RCMP: 50% in aggregate score with RRSI, if minimum is achieved.

Calgary: Candidates must meet cut score on critical dimensions otherwise holistic weight.

OPP: Interview must be passed in order to proceed.

? Edmonton: A combination; all 3 females; all 3 VMs or AB.

Calgary: Varies

How is interview conducted: "Sequential" means the applicant moves from interviewer to interviewer, "Board" means that two or more interviewers conducted the interview at the same time; and "Both" indicates more than one board interview where the boards are conducted separately.

+ RCMP: Recruiting interviewer conducts applicant interview, followed by separate suitability interview.

- Not available

Table 15: Validation and adverse-impact analysis of psychological tests used, 1990 and 1996/97

	Validation		Have any selection instruments been developed on the basis of a validation strategy?	Has the relationship between test scores and job performance been examined separately for:		Adverse Impact:				Description of process for final decision to hire:
				Different racial groups	Males and females	By VM	By different racial groups	By Sex		
Police Service	1990	1996/97	1996/97	1996/97		1990	1996/97	1990	1996/97	1996/97
RCMP	Yes	Yes	Yes, content validation used for RRRST, cadet exams.	In progress	In progress	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	The required number of applicants in each division is selected top-down by aggregate test and interview score in each group.
Vancouver	No	No*	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Once a candidate has successfully passed all stages of the selection process the decision to hire is based on achieving a balanced class.
Edmonton	Yes	Yes	Yes, police constable entrance exam developed on JA	-	-	Yes	-	Yes	-	
Calgary	Yes	No*	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	Committee of: Chief or Deputy, Personnel officer, inspector from field, Psychologist and recruiting personnel discuss individual applicants and make selections.
Regina	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Chief makes final decision after interviewing candidates

Winnipeg	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Consensus of final selection panel consisting of 3 senior officers, reviewing all applicants who have advanced to the final stage of the 13 step selection process.
Toronto	N/A	-	-	-	-	N/A	-	N/A	No	No	-	-
Ottawa	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Review of entire file. Look at mix of group as long as meet minimum requirements.
OPP	No	Yes	Yes, validity tests available through CSS, Hay Mgmt & Dr. D. Hoath, force psychologist	Yes	Yes	No	No?	No	No?	No	No?	All phases of process completed. Applicant file reviewed by 3 member Sr. Mgmt Board. If all phases successfully completed, applicant is offered employment in 1st available recruit intake (3 intakes per yr.)
Montreal	No	No	Yes, content validity for interview & scoring key, physical aptitudes test, medical exam & driving exam.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Recommendation made by selection committee and approved by 3 different management levels.
QPF	N/A	No	-	No	No	N/A	No	N/A	No	No	-	-
Halifax	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Successful interview.
St. Hubert	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Consensus between the interviewers.

* study in progress or work in process

Issues in Selection Systems

In general, the Police Services are doing a reasonable job in recruiting VM and aboriginal persons as officers. There are some problems with the selection systems used by some of the Services. There are several issues the Police Departments may want to re-examine. These are:

1. Adverse impact
2. Lack of validation
3. Job interview issues

I Adverse Impact

As Table 13 indicates, some of the selection methods used by the Toronto, Calgary, and Winnipeg police services seem to have adverse impact on either VMs or aboriginals or both.

For instance, for Toronto, the GATB test, the WCA, and background checks – all three had adverse impact on VMs. The number of aboriginals is too small to assess adverse impact. In the case of the Winnipeg and Calgary Police Services, the Police Applicant test had an adverse impact on VMs in Winnipeg and both VMs and aboriginals relative to others in the case of Calgary.

It is critical that these three police services re-examine these selection methods and attempt to assess their validity and adverse impact and if the adverse impact continues, it might be useful to find alternate and valid selection methods. This is what the legal rulings have indicated.

A number of the other police services have indicated that they do not keep data for each stage of selection by minority groups. For both validation and legal purposes, it is important for each police service to keep such data, both to assess adverse impact and to take steps to eliminate such an impact.

II Lack of Validation

Lack of validation (or relating success on selection instruments to job performance) is a serious concern. As Table 15 indicates, only four police services validate psychological tests. Two police services – Calgary and Vancouver – indicate that a validation study is in progress. RCMP, Edmonton and the OPP have validated the RRST, the cadet examinations and police constable examination respectively. Montreal police indicate that they have performed content validation for job interview and scoring key, physical, medical and driving examinations.

The OPP appear to have conducted differential validation (i.e. a selection method having a differential effect in the selection of minorities) and the RCMP has a study in progress. The balance of the police services have not assessed differential validity for their tests etc. for aboriginals and VMs. Thus, a majority of police organizations do not conduct validation and 11 of 13 police agencies do not do differential validation studies.

III Job Interviews

As is evident in Table 14, all police services have structured job interview formats. However, only seven of the 13 police departments score job interview responses. Moreover, even though seven police departments had aboriginal and VM and/or female interviewers (ranging from 1 in the OPP to nine in the RCMP), no police service included them (VMs, aboriginals) in the team that does the scoring of job interviews.

This is a serious problem since interviews count for 30 to 100 percent weight in selection. Research indicates that interviews tend to be subjective and have poor validity unless they are properly structured and validated (Wiesner and Cronshaw, 1988; Gatewood and Field, 1998).

Police services need to ensure that they follow proper validation procedures, score the interviews and include VMs and aboriginals on scoring teams (so as not to have adverse impact on the selection of these minorities) and have job interviews that are legally defensible.

Administrative Issues in Decision-Making

In developing a short list of candidates for selection, most of police services utilize a system whereby candidates only proceed to the next stage if they meet the minimum requirements of the hurdles. However, one service (the RCMP) uses a top-down procedure to achieve equity priorities; Edmonton also adjusts the bio-medical tests for women. Further, in order to encourage minorities to apply (as well as satisfying some legal requirements), most of the police services have formal and/or informal accommodation policies for VMs. For instance, the respondents stated that they allow Sikhs to wear turbans at work (on this question, n=9) and three have special accommodation policies for VM women (Edmonton, Regina and Winnipeg).

The setting (choice and development) of selection standards vary across police services. However, in general, the Human Resources division in each service, the Police Chief, and Police Services Boards, in line with provincial legislation, feature prominently in the development of these standards.

Most Canadian Police Services also administer employment equity (EE) programs; notable exceptions are Ottawa/Hull, the OPP, and St. Hubert (see Table 16 below). For those services with employment equity programs, six have recruiting goals and timetables specifically for visible minorities and aboriginals, viz., the RCMP, Vancouver, Edmonton, Regina, Toronto and Montreal police services. Three police services have established future hiring goals to year 2001 and beyond.

Ten police organizations had VM and aboriginal liaison officers; ten police departments had advisory committees with VM and aboriginal members and seven had VM/AB community involvement in recruiting VM/AB applicants.

Promotion Criteria

Eleven of the 13 police organizations in this survey provided information on the criteria for promoting officers. As Table 17 indicates, promotional exam, seniority, promotional board review and performance appraisal were the topmost criteria for promotion to the sergeant and/or staff inspector position by 10, 9, 7, and 6 police organizations respectively. For inspector and/or staff inspector position, promotional board review, promotional exam and performance appraisal were used as the top promotional criteria by 7, 6 and 5 police organizations respectively.

In several police organizations, officers to the rank of inspector (as in Vancouver) and superintendent (as in Edmonton) are covered by collective agreements with Police Associations. Hence, the criteria for promotion up to and including these ranks is jointly negotiated. This may have an impact on the promotional chances of VM and aboriginal officers, as explained in the following section.

Table 16: Employment equity programs in police agencies.

Police Service	Employment Equity program	Employment Equity recruiting goals	Employment Equity recruiting timetables	1996/97 goals	Future goals	VM or AB liaison officers	Advisory committees with VM/ AB members	VM /AB community involvement in recruiting VM/AB applicants
RCMP	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	16.6% VM 9.0% AB (3 yr avg. hiring goals)	N/A	Yes	Yes
Vancouver ²²	Yes (mission statement)	Yes	Yes	1/3 of recruits hired from racial minorities	ongoing	Yes, VM & AB	Yes, VM & AB	N/A
Edmonton	Yes	Yes	Yes	11 VM in 1997 5 AB in 1997	N/A	Yes, VM & AB	Yes, VM & AB	Yes, VM & AB
Calgary	Yes	No	No	N/A	N/A	Yes, VM & AB	Yes, VM & AB	Yes, VM & AB
Regina	Yes	Yes	Yes	6% VMs & 12% ABs	Yes, by 2013	Yes, VM & AB	Yes, VM & AB	Yes, VM & AB
Winnipeg	Yes	No	No	N/A	N/A	Yes, VM & AB	Not applicable	No
Toronto	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	N/A	Yes	Yes
Ottawa	No	No	No	N/A	N/A	Yes, VM & AB	Yes, VM and AB	No, in progress
OPP	No	No	No	N/A	N/A	Yes, VM & AB	Yes, VM & AB	Yes, VM & AB
Montreal	Yes	Yes	Yes	10% VMs & 1% ABs of new hires ²³	Yes, 1996 to 2001	Yes, VM & AB	N/A	N/A
QPF	Yes	No	No	N/A	N/A	Yes, VM & AB	Yes, VM & AB	Yes, VM & AB
Halifax	Yes	No	No	N/A	N/A	Yes, VM & AB	Yes ²⁴	Yes, VM & AB
St. Hubert	No	No	No	N/A	N/A	No	No	No

²² EE for aboriginals and VMs is covered under collective agreement as of Jan. 1995.

²³ Also, women are expected to be 25% of new hires and ethno-cultural communities 5% of new hires by 2001.

²⁴ Halifax Police has had for some time (since 1992) a Black Liaison Committee consisting of local Black leaders and police representatives; also there is a Black Police Officer who has been working for several years and has been designated full-time working with Black youth.

Table 17: Top promotional criteria in selected (N=11) Canadian police organizations, 1996/97.

Promotional Criteria	Rank															
	Corporal		Sergeant/ Staff Insp.		Inspector/ Staff Insp.		Chief Inspector		Supt.		Staff Supt.		Deputy Chief		Chief	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Promotional Exam	4	36	10	91	6	55	2	18	1	9	NA		1	9	1	9
Seniority	3	27	9	82	3	27	NA		NA		NA		NA		NA	
Performance Appraisal	1	9	6	55	5	45	2	10	1	9	1	9	3	27	3	27
Psychological Tests	0	0	1	9	1	9	1	9	1	9	NA		2	18	2	18
Promotional Board Review	2	18	7	64	7	64	4	36	3	27	1	9	4	36	4	36
Promotional Individual Review	0	0	0	0	1	9	1	9	NA		NA		2	18	2	18
Assessment Center	0	0	2	18	3	27	2	18	NA		NA		3	27	2	18
Other	0	0	1	9	1	9	1	9	NA		NA					

Number of criteria ranked #1 = most important (sometimes more than one: If not ranked, included all criteria checked)
N = 13 (OPP - not available; QPP - not completed)
Other criteria included: knowledge exam, management exam, in-basket exercises, self development and reference checks.

Table 18: Promotion, career development and promotion processes in selected police services

Police Service	Special promotion measures	Special career development programs for designated groups	Mentoring programs for designated groups	Who conducts promotional interview or who comprises the committee for the following ranks: a. Corporal b. Sgt/staff sgt. c. Inspector/staff inspector d. Chief Inspector	Structure of promotional interviews
RCMP	NA	No	Yes	a & b. See discussion under promotion presently under review c. Divisional boards; after exams, National boards d. - g. NA	Structured and unstructured
Vancouver	No	No	No	a. No longer promote to this rank b. Panel of 3 - sgt, s/sgt, insp c. Panel of 3 - chief & 2 deputy chiefs e. No longer promote to this rank g. Police Board	Structured at Sgt and Insp level
Edmonton	No	Yes Many internal and external courses available to enhance promo potential	No Note: Have a mentor program for recruits and many members within the Dept have a mentor	a. Rank does not exist b. Interview is not part of promo criteria c. Rank does not exist d. Rank does not exist	Structured Interviews only for Supt rank and above
Calgary	No	No	No	b. Detective Sgt: 2 s/sgt & 1 inspector Staff sgt: 1 insp & 2 supt c. 3 D/C & Assessment Centre e. Assessment Centre, Chief g. Assessment Centre, Chief	Structured Supt & D/Commr different - discussion with Chief
Regina	No	No A workshop for aboriginals only on writing promo exams	Yes, for aboriginals	a & b. NA c. Chief and deputy e. Appointed g. Board of police commission	Structured

Winnipeg	No	No	No	No	a. Patrol detective sgt - 2 insp & 1 city rep b. 2 insp & 1 city rep c. S/Sgt - 2 superintendents & 1 city rep d. Inspector - 2 D/Comms and 1 city rep g. Chief of police, Dir of Corp Services, Dir of Corp HR, Commissioner for parks, protection and culture	Semi-structured 20 minute oral presentation by candidate to panel, followed by 15 min question period by panel
Toronto	See Promotion Process					
Ottawa-Carleton	No	No	No	No, mentoring for hiring only	a. No corporal promo rank b. Rank higher than position applied for all	Semi-structured
OPP	No	Yes for all.	Yes for all Career dev'p and planning system available to all uniform employees		Interviews are conducted only for specific vacancies advertised at next rank level. Reps from community policing committees frequently sit on promo vacancy board	Structured Specific questions focus on job description for vacancy sought at different rank levels
Montreal	No	No	No	No	a. NA b. HR specialist & commander c. HR specialist & chief inspector/ass't directors d. HR specialist & Assistant-director	Structured
QPP	No	No	No	No	a. 1 sgt & 2 jr officers b. 1 sr and 2 jr officers c. 3 sr officers d, e, f & g. NA	Structured
Halifax	No	No	No	Yes, for aboriginals	a & b. 3 members sr Admin staff c. Consulting firm and sr Admin d, e, f & g. NA	NA
St. Hubert	No	No	No	No	a. Sgt - Lieut-Inspector b. Lieutenant - Inspe, Deputy chief c. - d. Deputy chief & chief e, f. - g. Chief Quebec police academy	Structured

Lateral or Direct Entry Opportunities, Accelerated Promotions

None of the police services in this study have any mechanism in place for lateral or direct entry to positions for VM and aboriginal persons other than at the entry level positions from outside the police service. The only exception is at very senior levels such as the Chief of Police as in the case of the Calgary and the Vancouver Police Services. In addition there were no career development plans directed towards these groups.

Vancouver had lateral entry at second class constable level from regional police services; OPP stated that they had First Nations direct appointments policy and have hired one aboriginal officer at the Inspector level but could not provide any figures for any other lateral appointments.

Almost all police services stated they have no special measures directed at VM and aboriginal officers for accelerated promotions as recommended by a number of Commissions and Task Forces. The reason in most cases was that the collective agreement with the respective police associations does not permit any of these measures.

Rate of Promotions of Designated Groups in Selected Police Services

Since 1993, the Vancouver Police Department has promoted one visible minority to the category of sergeant/staff sergeant, one woman to the position of corporal, two women to the position of sergeant, and one woman to the position of inspector. In 1997/98, a visible minority male is expected to be promoted to the category of sergeant/staff sergeant and another to the position of inspector.

The Vancouver Police Department uses a number of criteria in assessing officers' suitability for promotion, especially the use of performance appraisals and interviews. A total of 76 officers

were promoted between 1993 and 1996 (23, 13, 24, and 16 respectively). One of the promoted officers came from the visible minority group (in 1995), and none came from the aboriginal group. Of the 76, four were women (two in 1993, one in 1994, and one in 1995). Of the 34 expected promotions in 1997/98, two are expected to be from the visible minority group.

The Winnipeg Police Service promoted one aboriginal male to the position of inspector in 1995, and four aboriginal males to the category of detective/patrol sergeant in 1996. They also promoted one woman to the category of detective/patrol sergeant in 1993 and two were promoted to this category in 1996. One woman was promoted to the position of sergeant in 1993 and two were promoted to this position in 1996. In 1995, one woman was promoted to the position of inspector.

A lateral transfer was the Deputy Chief of the Hamilton-Wentworth Police to the Chief of Police in Calgary. The Chief is a woman.

The Calgary Police Service uses a number of criteria in assessing officers' suitability for promotion, especially the use of performance appraisals and interviews. Following a "promotional freeze" in 1993-94, a total of 41 officers were promoted in 1995-96 (21 and 20 respectively). None of the promoted officers came from the visible minority and aboriginal groups; of the 41, three were women (two in 1995 and one in 1996). Of the 53 promotions in 1997, two (one female and one visible minority) were from the designated groups.

The present Chief of the Edmonton Police is an aboriginal person. One visible minority was promoted to the category of sergeant/staff sergeant and a visible minority male is expected to be promoted to the same category in 1997. One aboriginal male was promoted to the position of superintendent in 1995.

The Edmonton Police Service uses a number of criteria in assessing officers' suitability for promotion, especially the use of promotional board interviews and performance appraisals. A total of 83 officers were promoted from 1993 to 1996 (18, 14, 27 and 24 respectively). One of the officers came from the visible minority group (in 1995) and two came for the aboriginal group (in 1995). Of the 83 promotions, two were women (one promoted in 1994, and one in 1995). Of the 37 expected promotions in 1997, one visible minority and five women are expected to be from the designated groups.

The RCMP promoted 1316 officers (281 women and 1035 men) in 1997. Of these, 69 aboriginal males were promoted to constables and 2nd class constables (27 and 42 respectively), five to corporals, one to staff sergeant, one to inspector and two to cadet. Seven aboriginal women were promoted to constable and 2nd class constable (five and two each); one to corporal and 1 to cadet. Ninety-eight VM males were promoted to constable and 2nd class constable level (33 and 65 respectively), one to corporal, one to sergeant and ten to cadets. Eleven VM women were promoted to constable and 2nd class constable (one and ten each respectively) and four to cadet.

The Regina Police Service promoted one aboriginal male to the position of corporal and one female to sergeant/staff sergeant since 1993. A total of 90 police officers have been promoted from 1993 to 1996 (43, 13, 24 and 6 respectively). Of these none came from the VM group, one from the aboriginal (as stated above) and one female.

The St. Hubert police force has not promoted any VM or aboriginal officers, but one female to the position of sergeant in each year 1995 and 1996.

In the Metropolitan Toronto Police Service, a total of 149 officers were promoted in 1995 and 1996 (five and 144 respectively). Twenty-one were VMs and aboriginals and 33 were women, all in 1996. Of the 288 promotions in 1997, 29 were VMs, four aboriginals and 46 women.

In 1996, 18 VM males were promoted to the position of constable and two to the sergeant/staff sergeant position, and one aboriginal male as a constable. In 1997, 29 VM males were promoted as constables and 3 aboriginal males and 1 female to the constable's position.

With the exception of one aboriginal superintendent in the Edmonton Police Service in 1995; one aboriginal inspector each in the RCMP in 1997 and in the Winnipeg police department in 1995, almost all promotions of VM and aboriginal officers range from cadet to staff sergeant in four of the nine police services that provided this information (see Tables 26 to 28). The remaining five²⁵ either do not keep any record of VM and aboriginal promotions (as in the case of Montreal) or were unable to provide this information.

Promotional Processes in Selected Police Organizations

Although 13 police services were surveyed, full reports outlining promotional programs were available from only six. Additional information on one other police service was obtained through external means. The attached Tables 19 to 25 contain a summary of the information supplied by police organizations on their promotional policies and practices. The details included in the tables are limited to key points relevant to the issue of promotions. Reports were obtained from Winnipeg, Edmonton, Calgary, Vancouver, OPP, Metropolitan Toronto and the RCMP.

²⁵ OPP, Ottawa-Carleton, QPP, Montreal and Halifax police did not provide any data on the promotion of VMs and aboriginal police officers.

Issues Contributing to Promotional Barriers

A number of issues that may contribute to promotional barriers for VM and aboriginal officers are evident in the reports provided by the police organizations. They include, but are not limited to: seniority as specified under collective agreements; lack of proactive communication programs which promote diversity; fixed number of applicants per available position; composition of interview panels and other type of decision-making boards; and absence of special measures to promote under-represented minority groups.

1. Many of the reports indicated that promotion was based on seniority, which is stipulated as a requirement under most collective agreements. Using this method of decision-making ultimately blocks the advancement of under-represented minority groups because they do not possess appropriate levels of seniority to achieve promotion. For example, as Table 19 indicates, in Edmonton the average seniority of aboriginal members is 6.1 years, but the eligibility to apply for promotion is eight years. Additionally, Tables 20 to 25 indicate that the average number of years until promotion can occur was approximately eight years for all police organizations reporting. Visible Minority and Aboriginal members, relative to other officers, will likely not possess the necessary seniority levels to be promoted.
2. There appears to be a lack of proactive communication programs in promoting under-represented minority members in the police organizations.
3. Six of the reports received indicated that officers could not advance further in the promotion process unless they achieved a “pass/fail” mark (also referred to as a cut-off score).²⁶ The

²⁶ Metropolitan Toronto Police had not reported a pass/fail rate at the time their report was being written, but indicated that it would be announced in the future.

lowest pass/fail grade was 65%. This may eliminate a number of candidates from the promotion process, with a distinct possibility of differential impact by race and gender.

4. Several of the police organizations made reference to ratios of number of applicants to available positions. This further reduces the opportunities for many officers. For example, Table 19, in the case of Winnipeg Police Service, indicates that for every 1-5 positions available, the Service will review 7 candidates per opening. Limiting the number of applicants who can apply for an open position eliminates a number of candidates from going further in the promotion process. This may be especially true of VM and aboriginal officers who have lower seniority to begin with.
5. The use of boards or panels in the final decision-making process is used extensively in all cases.²⁷ Most of these boards utilize three ranking officers to interview and make assessment on final candidates. Therefore the decision to form the board is based on rank. A considerable amount of research has looked at the composition of boards and the effects of same-race in interviewing situations. It has been found that when a person of one race interviews another person of the same race (white interviews white or black interviews black, for example), they tend to assign higher ratings to those of the same race as they are (Prewet-Livingston et al., 1996; Lin et al., 1992). Therefore, the police services should consider a mix of participants, including gender and race, when selecting the board. This is obviously another limiting factor for VM and Aboriginal members who probably face white-males in the interview process.²⁸

²⁷ RCMP uses a panel or board in determination of final performance ratings and assignment of final ratings.

²⁸ The only reference to the composition of their board was Calgary (Table 21) which considered it from a "personality perspective" and have opted to utilize the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI) as a way to form their boards. The MBTI is based on the theory of psychological

Considering that only a few Visible Minority and Aboriginal members are in higher ranks, this is another serious barrier to promotion for these officers.

6. There was an obvious absence of special measures to promote under-represented minority officers in most police organizations.

Eliminating Promotional Barriers

Three of the reports reviewed have attempted to remove barriers for minorities from their promotional systems (RCMP, Metropolitan Toronto Police and Calgary). All three appeared to be moving in the right direction. One assumption for their positive initiatives may be that some of them utilized the services of outside consultants who possessed extensive knowledge in the area, and could provide an objective review of the process. Calgary conducted an extensive North American review and have taken positive initiatives. The one area of concern in their program is the emphasis on seniority, which is one of the most limiting barriers to promotion for the under-represented minority members. This is not to take away from the Calgary program, since they are working diligently to find a program that works effectively for them. Additionally, it should be noted that several other police forces may actually be implementing progressive procedures. However, information was not available and hence no assessments could be made on their efforts.

The following are the more positive initiatives undertaken by the three police organizations above to eliminate biases and barriers towards minorities in the promotion systems.

types developed by C.J. Jung. The term type in personality theory refers to groups of individuals who roughly share the same amount of common traits. MBTI is not recommended for use in selection and is considered an invalid tool of assessment, (see Gatewood and Feild, 1998, pp. 565-567).

1. Recognizing that seniority was creating a barrier to advancement for minority officers, the RCMP, Toronto and Calgary have incorporated the concept of merit into their promotional system. Thus, an individual's accomplishments and abilities are considered and that seniority is not the only deciding factor. The necessary competencies (traits) required to perform the job duties for each given level is determined. Each officer is then assessed against these competencies which are required to perform the job, and a composite score of tests, abilities and in some cases seniority is determined (Calgary uses seniority as the deciding factor when the same scores exist between candidates). The RCMP system allows for more flexibility with the use of a band of points, which avoids the necessity of ranking scores. If two members are only five points apart for example, they are not rank ordered but sit together in a pool of candidates within the band and each is given equal consideration (Cascio et al., 1991). Junior members of the force now have an equal opportunity to be considered along side more senior members, since the band of points earned does not distinguish the candidates based on a seniority system.
2. Each of these police forces has been proactive in reporting their new programs to their members. Their programs were developed in consultation with their employees. Each of the groups conducted surveys and town hall meetings or focussed groups to elicit information. In many cases, the changes that occurred were as a result of having listened to their employees.
3. The RCMP has eliminated the pass/fail mark, recognizing the adverse impact that test scores can have on under-represented minority groups and thus opening up eligibility for

promotional considerations to more candidates. In addition, ratios do not exist, which have the effect of blocking opportunities for many potential candidates.

Although the RCMP, The Metropolitan Toronto Police, and The Calgary Police Services appear to be moving in the right direction, it still remains to be seen if they will be successful in increasing the under-representation of VM and aboriginal officers. The goal for all police forces must be to more closely resemble the workforce they represent.

Table 19: Winnipeg Police Services

Police Service	Promotion Eligibility	Promotion Criteria	Exam	Ratios	Panel/Other
Winnipeg – Effective April 1996	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Constable may apply for Patrol/Detective Sergeant after 8 year of service 	Seniority 25 pts. Exam 30 pts. Oral Present. 45 pts. Total 100 pts	100 multiple choice, 120 minutes 65% passing grade	Projected # 1 – 5 7* 6 – 10 5 11+ 3 (per opening)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3 persons semi-structured depends on rank consensus candidate gives 20 minute oral presentation panel questions period not to exceed 15 minutes Supervisor provides promotion submission
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 24 month rank of Patrol/Detective Sergeant apply for Sergeant rank 	Seniority 20 pts. Exam 30 pts. Oral Present. 50 pts. Total 100 pts	100 multiple choice, 120 minutes 65% passing grade		
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 24 month rank of Sergeant apply for Staff Sergeant or Inspector 	Exam 40 pts. Oral Present. 60 pts. Total 100 pts	80 multiple choice = 32 pts. 1 question, written 400 words = 8 pts.		
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Staff Sergeant may apply for rank of Inspector in any year applications accepted 	Exam 40 pts. Oral Present. 60 pts. Total 100 pts	180 minute test <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Study material available 28 days in advance 125 pages maximum No carry over of examination marks from previous competition 		

- No special measures to promote reported
- No mentoring programs reported
- No special career development programs or opportunities to prepare
- No Aboriginal holds a senior ranking position; 1 VM holds a senior position (Deputy Chief)

Table 20: Edmonton Police Services

Police Service	Promotion Eligibility	Promotion Criteria	Exam	Ratios	Panel/Other
Edmonton - Effective February 1996	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Constable can write promotion exam after 5 years, but no promotion until 8 years To Group II (Sergeant/Detective) and to Group III (Staff Sergeant) Promotion to Superintendent (must apply if interested)) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Performance Skills and Abilities Leadership Personal Qualities (All have equal weighting)	70% passing grade Only written once in a career	Chief Committee can nominate up to 8 members from Group I to II, and 8 members Group II to III	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Division team determines short list Peer assessment Candidate may give five minute presentation Divisional head given first opportunity to nominate a candidate Board comprises Chief of Police and Deputy Chiefs of Police

- Extensive training for all levels, employees are encouraged to participate in self-development. 50% tuition reimbursement
- No special measure to promote
- Does not offer special career development programs
- Mentoring program available to all members
- The average seniority of Aboriginal members is 6.1 years (which is not even at allowable promotional level). It varied from 2 years for Filipino members to 12.5 years for West Indian members. A majority of VMs were below 8 years of service and therefore unable to apply for promotion).
- Promotions were allotted as follows in 1997: 94% white male, .81% aboriginal, 1.2% VM.

Table 21: Calgary Police Services

Police Service	Promotion Eligibility	Promotion Criteria	Exam	Ratios	Panel/Other
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Calgary Police Service January 1999 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Must have five or more continuous years of service from the date of last hire Must have one year continuous service at present rank May only apply for the next subsequent rank Prior police experience is not considered 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Must possess the required competencies, knowledge, skills and ability to perform the work Merit Commitment to the organization's core values Where ability and merit are relatively equal, seniority will be determining factor 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Examinations held for the positions of: Inspector, Staff Sergeant and Sergeant/Detective May write examination for the next subsequent rank Minimum Pass/Fail 50% Focused study material 50 questions multiple choice 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No ratios, all candidates that possess the required competencies and are supported by the Service's Inspectors/Managers are interviewed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Pass promotional examination No current discipline on file Application for promotion Candidate prepares personal resume Candidate and supervisor complete competency based promotion assessment Candidate's supervisor makes presentation on candidate's behalf at Candidate Eligibility Meeting (CEM) CEM comprised of all Service's Inspectors/Managers CEM members vote on candidate's suitability Candidate requires minimum of 75% support from CEM to advance to interview 3 on 1 Behavioral Descriptive Panel Interview Interview scored by comparing candidates responses to a predefined competency based job profile Interview boards present results to Board of Officers (Chief and Executive) Board of Officers review candidates resume, competency assessment interview results and personnel file

Table 22: Vancouver Police Services

Police Service	Promotion Eligibility	Promotion Criteria	Exam	Ratios	Panel/Other
Vancouver	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Must have 8 years of service 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Based on five components (exam, assessment centre, supervisory evaluation, interview and experience and education), candidate accumulates points and must receive an overall score of 3.0 or greater to be placed on an eligibility list • Many acquire same scores, so seniority is deciding factor 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 70% pass/fail rate • Assessment Centre 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supervisory Evaluation – 3 supervisors • Interview

• Lack of information since no information on promotions provided in their report. Information reported was obtained externally.

Table 23: Ontario Provincial Police (OPP)

Police Service	Promotion Eligibility	Promotion Criteria	Exam	Ratios	Panel/Other
Orillia, Ontario		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Knowledge, skills and abilities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Examination/exercise process administered for those with positive assessment • Study package and/or study guidelines are issued • Pass mark must be obtained 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Leadership/Management Competency credit issued to successful candidates and is valid for three years • Local committee assesses applicants based on documented facts including a self assessment submitted by the member. • Peer, subordinate or other input may be sought. • Individual must demonstrate why they should be considered for promotion

- Onus is on individuals to create and implement a development plan for promotional purposes. Assistance is available from the supervisor.
- Some postings, such as Northern Ontario, require the commitment of new recruits to service for a fixed period of up to five years before being transferred to an area of their choice. This limits promotional opportunities.
- Little information supplied by OPP.

Table 24: Metropolitan Toronto Police

Police Service	Promotion Eligibility	Promotion Criteria	Exam	Ratios	Panel/Other
Toronto – Effective February 1997	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Constable to Sergeant/Detective (First Class Constable's can apply) • To Staff Sergeant /Detective Sergeant (First Class Constable or higher can apply; previous supervisory experience) • To Inspector (First Class Constable or higher; previous supervisory experience law enforce.) • To Superintendent (First Class Constable or higher; previous managerial experience law enforce.) 	<p>Exam Interview Total</p> <p>40% 60% 100%</p> <p>Exam Interview Total</p> <p>40% 60% 100%</p> <p>Mgmt. Exam Interview Total</p> <p>40% 60% 100%</p> <p>No Exams</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Minimum pass mark TBD* • Ranked according to composite score on exam and interview. • Those receiving the highest score above required standard shall enter interview process at a ratio of 4:1 based on projected vacancies <p>(Same applies for all levels)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 4:1 based on vacancies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Behavioural Event Interview/Reference Checks • Panel 3 Individuals, Sr. officer from MTO police service (chair) and one or two staff/detective sergeants or higher or a senior officer from another police service <p>(Same applies for all levels, except that the rank increases as the level increases)</p>

• Statistics reported for January 1998 indicated that the highest rank for 1 male Aboriginal was Sergeant out of 812 employees in that level. VM held 3 positions at the rank of Staff Inspector out of 36 employees in that level.

• Promotion processes based on competencies identified for each rank (outside consultants assisted). System based on merit.

• Selection criteria based on bona fide job requirements. The First Class Constable rank set as a minimum eligibility (was previously Fourth Class). Allows for broader assessment and eliminates former rank and time-in-a-rank requirements which amounted to systemic barriers).

• Behavioural Event Interview is a structured format designed to reduce bias. Exam and interview will make up a composite score.

• Opportunities provided for succession planning and career development.

* TBD = To be determined

Table 25: RCMP

Police Service	Promotion Eligibility	Promotion Criteria	Exam	Ratios	Panel/Other
Ottawa (Federal Jurisdiction) Effective February 1998	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Corporal must possess 7 years of experience 	<p>Based on performance - 8 competencies based on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Leadership • Service orientation and delivery • Thinking skills • Personal effectiveness and flexibility • Organization and planning • Interpersonal relations • Communication • Motivation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Multiple-choice simulation exercise which assesses 6 of 8 competencies (except communication and motivation) • No cut-off scores • Simulation exercise has 48 items (6 per competency) and time allotment of 4 hours. • Performance ratings on PRP converted to numerical values (from 1-10 in each competency). • PRP score and passing mark on job simulation will each count 50% towards the promotion score. • Formula devised to facilitate band – so that composite scores could be placed in bank (not rank ordered) • Simulation Exercises 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Performance report for promotion (PRP) submitted by applicant providing verifiable examples of their performance for each of 8 core competencies • BARS (Behaviourally anchored rating scale) used • PRP must be signed off by supervisor – completes rating sheet • Independent review board one rank-level above will assign final rating – feedback provided • Panel interview eliminated from process • Carry over scores from previous cycle

- Extensive consultation with outside experts to develop a system to meet the needs of a representative and composite workforce. Virtually all recommendations made by Consultants were accepted into their programs
- Banding using 1.0 x SEM based on available data produces smaller banks in both large and smaller division – this will allow more junior members and members of under represented groups to given an equal opportunity.
- Independent performance review board provides accountability by consistently monitoring all forms using the same standards. Avoids inflated scores and over time an escalation of scores.
- Simulation exercise increased in time by approximately 1.5 hours.

Table 26: Promotions of Aboriginals by Rank in Police Organizations in Canada

Rank	RCMP January-December 1997		Vancouver December 1996		Edmonton 1996/97		Calgary 1996/97		Regina 1996/97		Winnipeg January 1997	
	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)
Constable	69** (0.46)	7 (0.05)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Corporal	5 (0.03)	1 (0.01)										
Sergeant	0											
S/Sgt	1 (0.01)											
Insp	1 (0.01)											
Supt	0											
C/Supt	0											
Dy. Chief	0											
Chief	0											
TOTAL	76 (0.51)	8 (0.05)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
* Cadets = 2 M and 1 F ** Includes 42 M and 2 F 2 nd Class Constables Source: RCMP Employment Equity Report, 1997												
M + F =	12876 + 1985 = 14861	1019 + 136 = 1155	900 + 113 = 1013	1055 + 105 = 1160	277 + 28 = 305	1089 + 125 = 1214						

Rank	Toronto Jan-Dec 1997		Ottawa February 1997		OPP 1996/97		Montreal		QPP 1996/97		Halifax November 1998		St. Hubert	
	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)
Constable	3 (0.06)	1 (0.02)	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	0	0	NA	NA
Corporal	0	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA			NA	NA
Sergeant	0	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA			NA	NA
S/Sgt	0	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA			NA	NA
Insp	0	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA			NA	NA
Supt	0	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA			NA	NA
C/Supt	0	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA			NA	NA
Dy. Chief	0	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA			NA	NA
Chief	0	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA			NA	NA
TOTAL	3 (0.06)	1 (0.02)	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	0	0	NA	NA
			NA = Not Available		NA = Not Available		NA = Not Available		NA = Not Available				NA = Not Available	
M + F =	4426 + 556 = 4982		747 + 119 = 866		Total = 4400		Total = 4110 (Aug 97)		3580 + 221 = 3801		353 + 31 = 384		90 + 12 = 102	

Table 27: Promotions for Visible Minorities by Rank in Police Organizations in Canada

Rank	RCMP Jan-Dec 1997		Vancouver December 1996		Edmonton 1996/97		Calgary 1996/97		Regina 1996/97		Winnipeg January 1997	
	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)
Constable	98** (0.66)	11 (0.07)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Corporal	1 (0.01)	0			0							
Sergeant	1 (0.01)	0			1 (0.10)							
S/Sgt	0	0			incl in Sgt							
Insp	2 (0.01)	0			0							
Supt	0	0			0							
C/Supt	0	0			0							
Dy. Chief	0	0			0							
Chief	0	0			0							
TOTAL	100 (0.67)	11 (0.07)	0	0	1 (0.10)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	* Cadets = 10 M and 4 F ** Includes 65 M and 10 F 2 nd Class Constables Source: RCMP Employment Equity Report, 1997											
M + F =	12876 + 1985 = 14861		1019 + 136 = 1155		900 + 113 = 1013		1055 + 105 = 1160		277 + 28 = 305		1089 + 125 = 1214	

Rank	Toronto Jan-Dec 1997		Ottawa February 1997		OPP 1996/97		Montreal		QPP 1996/97		Halifax November 1998		St. Hubert	
	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)
Constable	29 (0.58)	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Corporal	0		NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Sergeant	0		NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
S/Sgt	0		NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Insp	0		NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Supt	0		NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
C/Supt	0		NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Dy. Chief	0		NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Chief	0		NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
TOTAL	29 (0.58)	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
			NA = Not Available		NA = Not Available		NA = Not Available		NA = Not Available		NA = Not Available		NA = Not Available	
M + F =	4426 + 556 = 4982		747 + 119 = 866		Total = 4400		Total = 4110 (Aug97)		3580 + 221 = 3801		353 + 31 = 384		90 + 12 = 102	

Table 28: Promotions by Rank and Gender in Police Organizations in Canada

Rank	RCMP Jan-Dec 1997		Vancouver December 1996		Edmonton 1996/97		Calgary 1996/97		Regina 1996/97		Winnipeg January 1996	
	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)
Constable	519** (3.49)	207*** (1.39)	0	0	0	NA	0	0	0	0	0	0
Corporal	167 (1.12)	19 (0.13)	0	0	0	NA	0*	0	0	0	0	0
Sergeant	146 (0.98)	6 (0.04)	7 (0.61)	0	22 (2.17)	NA	3** (0.26)	1 (0.09)	12 (3.93)	15 (1.24)	2 (0.16)	0
S/Sgt	59 (0.40)	2 (0.01)	0	0	incl in Sgt	NA	0	0	11 (3.61)	6 (0.49)	0	0
Insp	49 (0.33)	2 (0.01)	8 (0.69)	0	0	NA	12 (1.03)	0	1 (0.33)	0	0	0
Supt	14 (0.09)	0	0	0	1 (0.10)	NA	1 (0.09)	0	2 (0.66)	0	0	0
C/Supt	5 (0.03)	1 (0.01)	0	0	0	NA	0*	0	0	0	0	0
Dy. Chief	6 (0.04)	0	1 (0.09)	0	1 (0.10)	NA	2 (0.17)	0	2 (0.66)	1 (0.08)	0	0
Chief	0	0	0	0	0	NA	0	0	0	0	0	0
TOTAL	965 (6.49)	237 (1.59)	16 (1.39)	0	24 (2.37)	NA	18 (1.55)	1 (0.09)	28 (9.18)	22 (1.81)	2 (0.16)	0
	* Cadets = 69 M and 44 F ** Includes 407 M and 159 F *** Includes 4 A/Comm Source: RCMP Employment Equity Report, 1997						* Rank does not exist ** Sgt Det				* Patrol/detective sergeants 21 = 19 M, 2 W	
M + F =	12876 + 1985 = 14861		1019 + 136 = 1155		900 + 113 = 1013		1055 + 105 = 1160		277 + 28 = 305		1089 + 125 = 1214	

Rank	Toronto January 1998		Ottawa February 1997		OPP 1996/97		Montreal		QPP 1996/97		Halifax November 1998		St. Hubert	
	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)	M (%)	F (%)
Constable	239 (4.80)	46 (0.92)	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Corporal	0	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Sergeant	3 (0.06)	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
S/Sgt	incl in Sgt	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Insp	0	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Supt	0	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
C/Supt	0	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Dy. Chief	0	0	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Chief	0	0	NA	0	1 (0.02)	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
TOTAL	242 (4.86)	46 (0.92)	NA	NA		NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
			NA = Not Available		NA = Not Available		NA = Not Available		NA = Not Available		NA = Not Available		NA = Not Available	
M + F =	4426 + 556 = 4982		747 + 119 = 866		Total = 4400		Total = 4110 (Aug 97)		3580 + 221 = 3801		353 + 31 = 384		90 + 12 = 102	

V. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. *Representation*

There has been substantial improvement in the representation of VMs and aboriginals from 1985 to 1998, especially in the last 5 years. However, VM and female representation continues to lag behind the labour market representation of these groups (as per the 1991 Census). This is especially true in the management ranks achieved by minorities and women. Concerted effort is required in order to attain acceptable levels of representation commensurate with their external representation. Promotional barriers need to be removed and lateral or direct entry into management positions and, to some extent, accelerated promotional measures need to be adopted by police organizations, as recommended by various inquiries and commissions, in order to improve the representation of minorities and women in management ranks of police organizations.

2. *Recruitment Barriers*

Perceived barriers in attracting VM candidates for police officer jobs, as identified by police services, have declined considerably. In order to attract qualified minorities, police organizations may wish to increase the use of VM and aboriginal role models, and community outreach programs.

To improve minority group perceptions of police, organizations will need to increase cross-cultural communication and diversity training of police officers; adopt pro-active strategies to reduce racism against minorities; provide mentoring programs; and work increasingly with youth organizations, aboriginal friendship centers and race relations committees.

3. *Recruitment Measures*

To increase the effectiveness of recruiting efforts, continued and enhanced use of role models to recruit minorities and women is essential. Additionally, concerted effort is required to more closely align police agencies recruiting efforts with community minority and female organizations.

4. *Selection Methods and Removal of Adverse Impact*

Selection needs to be improved. Police agencies should give special attention to selection methods that can have an adverse impact on minorities and women. Consideration for alternate and valid selection methods may be necessary in order to select successful police officers and to comply with the law. Data needs to be kept for each stage of the selection process for both validation and legal purposes.

More structured interviewing approaches should be considered by all police departments. As well, the interviewers and interview scoring teams should include a cross-section of females and minorities to ensure that biases in selection are reduced to a minimum..

5. *Promotion Measures*

Police agencies should look to organizations outside their discipline to determine successful models for promotions and lateral transfers. Bank of Montreal, for example, has successfully worked closely with community groups and their employees to increase the representation of women and minorities. Communication and managerial accountability to achieve goals to increase the representation of minorities and women appear to be key factors in this process. Generally, increased communication illuminating a top-down approach, elimination of stringent seniority rules

as well as cut-off scores, attention to promotion board composition, and increased use of merit based systems whereby competencies are established for each position are keys to success in promotional programs, especially for women and minorities.

REFERENCES

- Arvey, R., Nutting, S., & Landon, T. (1992). Validation strategies for physical ability testing in police and fire settings. *Public Personnel Management*, 21, 301-312.
- Bellemare, J. (1988). *Investigation into relations between police forces, visible and other ethnic minorities*. Montreal: Quebec Human Rights Commission.
- Breton, R. (1986). Multiculturalism and Canadian nation building. In Cairns, A., and Williams, C., (Eds.). *The politics of gender, ethnicity and language in Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Cascio, W.F., Outtz, J., Zedeck, S., & Goldstein, I.L. (1991). Statistical implications of six methods of test score used in personnel selection. *Human Performance* 4, 233-264.
- Cawsey, R. (1991). *Justice on trial: Report of the task force on the criminal justice system and its impact on the Indian and Metis People of Alberta* (Edmonton).
- Cheney, P., & Mahoney, J. (1998). Alberta probe blasts native police forces: MLA condemns sloppy techniques and poor management - Klein says he's prepared to act. *Globe & Mail*, December 3, A9.
- Coulton, G., & Feild, H. (1995). Using assessment centers in selecting entry-level police officers: Extravagance or justified expense? *Public Personnel Management*, 24, 223-254.
- Dupuis, R. (1993). Aboriginal Peoples and employment equity. In *Sharing the harvest: The Road to self reliance, Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples*. Ottawa.
- Dussault, R., & Erasmus, G. (Co-Chairs) (1996). *Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples*. Ottawa: Commission.
- Dutton, D. (1986). The public and the police: Training implications of the demand for a new model police officer. In J. Yuille (Ed.), *Police selection and training*. Boston: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.
- Dye, T., & Renick, J. (1981). Political power and city jobs: Determinants of minority employment. *Social Science Quarterly*, 62, 475-486.
- Eisenger, P. (1982a). Black employment in municipal jobs: The impact of black political power. *American Political Science Review*, 76, 380-392.
- Eisenger, P. (1982b). The economic conditions of black employment in bureaucracies. *American Journal of Political Science*, 26, 754-771.

- Federation of Canadian Municipalities, Standing Committee on Race Relations, Year in Review, 1997-98* (1998), June.
- Forsyth v. Matsqui Police Service* (1988). Canadian Human Rights Reporter, D/5854.
- Gatewood, R.D., & Feild, H.S. (1998). *Human Resource Selection*. Fort Worth, TX: Dryden Press, Harcourt Brace College Publishers.
- George, P., & Kuhn, P. (1993). Expanding employment in the Canadian economy. In *Sharing the Harvest: Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples*. Ottawa.
- Hamilton, A., & Sinclair, C. (1991). *Report of the Aboriginal Inquiry of Manitoba: The justice system and Aboriginal people*. Winnipeg: Queen's Printer.
- Hickman, T. (1989). *Royal Commission on the Donald Marshall Jr. Prosecution*. Nova Scotia: Queen's Printer.
- Hill, D. (1984). The future of policing in multicultural and multiracial communities in Canada. *Report of Proceedings of the Symposium on Policing in Multicultural/Multiracial Urban Communities*. Ottawa: Multiculturalism Canada.
- Hochstedler, E. (1984). Impediments to hiring minorities in public police agencies. *Journal of Police Science and Administration*, 12, 227-240.
- Hogan, J., & Quigley, A. (1986). Physical standards for employment and the courts. *American Psychologist*, 41, 1193-1217.
- Hoover, L. (1992). Trends in police physical ability selection testing. *Public Personnel Management*, 21, 29-40.
- Inkster, N. (1991). Luncheon Address. In Jain, H., Pitts, B., & DeSantis, G. (Eds.). *National Conference on Racial equality in the Workplace*. Hamilton: McMaster University.
- Jain, H. (1994). An assessment of strategies of recruiting visible minority police officers in Canada: 1985-1990. In Macleod and Scheiderman, D. (Eds.). *Police Powers In Canada: The evolution and practice of authority*. Toronto: The University of Toronto Press.
- Jain, H. (1988). The recruitment and selection of visible minorities in Canadian police organizations. *Canadian Public Administration*, 31, 463-482.
- Jain, H. (1987). Recruitment of racial minorities in Canadian police forces. *Relations Industrielles*, 42, 790-803.

- Jain, H. (1981). Discrimination against Indians: Issues and policies. In Lundy K., and Warne, B., (Eds.), *Work in the Canadian Context*. Toronto: Butterworths.
- Jain, H., & Hackett, R. (1989). Measuring effectiveness of employment equity programs in Canada: Public policy and a survey. *Canadian Public Policy*, 15, 189-204.
- Jain, H., Taggar, S., & Gunderson, M. (1996). The status of employment equity in Canada. McMaster University Working Paper, #420.
- Jayewardene, C., & Talbot, C. (1990). Police recruitment of ethnic minorities. Ottawa: Ministry of Supply and Services Canada.
- Juliani, J., Talbot, C., & Jayewardene, C. (1984). *Urban centurions: A development perspective on municipal policies in Canada*. Ottawa: Crimcare Inc.
- Kathy Harting v. Timmins Board of Police Commissioners* (1987). Canadian Human Rights Reporter, D/487.
- Koch, G. (1998). Alberta's native policing a failure, report finds: It's detested by those it's supposed to serve, study author says. *National Post*, December 3, A5.
- Lewis, C. (1992). *The Report on the race Relations and Policing task Force*. Toronto.
- Lewis, C. (1990). The Report of the Race Relations and Policing task Force. *Canadian Police College*, 14.
- Lewis, C. (1989). *The Report of the race Relations and Policing task Force*. Toronto: Solicitor General.
- Lewis, W. (1989). Toward representative bureaucracy: Blacks in city police organizations, 1975-1985. *Public Administration Review*, 49, 257-268.
- Lin, T-R., Dobbins, G.H., & Farh, J-L. (1992). A field study of race and age similarity effects on interview ratings in conventional and situational interviews. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 77 (3), 353-371.
- Martin, S. (1991). The effectiveness of affirmative action: The case of women in policing. *Justice Quarterly*, 8, 489-504.
- Martin, S. (1994). Outsider within the station house: The impact of race and gender on black women police. *Social Problems*, 41, 383-400.

- Mastai, J. (1986). A Report to the Federation of Canadian Municipalities on Municipal initiatives for improving race relations in Canada. Ottawa: National Symposium on Multiculturalism and Race Relations, 14-15 February.
- McLaughlin, V., & Bing, R. (1987). Law enforcement personnel selection: A commentary. *Journal of Police Science and Administration*, 15 (4), 271-276.
- Murphy C.J., & Clairmont, D. (1996). *First Nations Police Officers Survey*. Ottawa: Solicitor General Canada, June.
- Normandeau, A. (1990). The police and ethnic minorities. *Canadian Police College Journal*, 14.
- Oppal, W. (1994). *Report on the Commission of Inquiry into Policing in British Columbia*. BC.
- Oziewicz, E. (1993). Better training on racism urged for Montreal police: Prejudiced attitude must change, Ryan says. *Globe & Mail*, 19 January, A4.
- Potts, L. (1983). Equal employment opportunity and female employment in police agencies. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 11, 505-523.
- Prewet-Livingston, A.J., Field, H.S., Veres III, J.G., & Lewis, P.M. (1996). Effects of race on interview ratings in a situational panel interview. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 81 (2), 178-186.
- Riccucci, N. (1986). Female and minority employment in city government: The role of unions. *Policy Studies Journal*, 15, 3-16.
- Rolf, C. (1991). *Policing in relation to the Blood Tribe: report of a Public Inquiry*. Vol 1: Findings and Recommendations (February).
- Skolnick, J. (1967). *Justice without trial*. New York: Wiley.
- Steel, B., & Lovrich, N. (1986). Equality and efficiency trade-offs in affirmative action - real or imagined? The case of women in policing. *Social Science Journal*, 24, 53-70.
- Stein, L. (1986). Representative local government: Minorities in the municipal work force. *Journal of Politics*, 48, 694-716.
- Stein, L. (1985). A representative protective service: Concept, demand and reality. *Review of Public Personnel Administration*, 5, 78-89.
- Suriya, S. (1993). The representation of visible minorities in Canadian police: Employment Equity beyond rhetoric. *Police Studies*, 16, 44-62.

- Swol, K. (1998). Private security and public policing in Canada. *JURISTAT, Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics*, 18, 1-11, December 3.
- Walker, S. (1985) Racial minority and female employment in policing: The implications of glacial change. *Crime and Delinquency*, 31, 555-572.
- Warner, R., Steel, B., & Lovrich, N. (1990). Economic, political, and institutional determinants of minority employment in municipal police departments. *American Journal of Police*, 41-61.
- Wiesner, W.H., & Cronshaw, S. (1988). A meta-analytic investigation of the impact of interview format and degree of structure on the validity of the employment interview. *Journal of Occupational Psychology*, 61, 275-290.
- Winters, C. (1992). Socio-economic status, test bias and the selection of police. *The Police Journal*, April, 125-135.
- Winters, C. (1989). Psychology test, suits and minority applicants. *The Police Journal*, 52, 22-30.
- Wycoff, M., Susmilch, C., & Eisenbart, P. (1980). *Reconceptualizing the police role: An examination of theoretical issues, information needs, empirical realities, and the potential for revision*. The Police Foundation.

APPENDIX I

REPORT ON RESULTS OF FOCUS GROUPS AND INDIVIDUAL INTERVIEWS: RACIAL MINORITIES AND WOMEN IN POLICING:

**Carol Agocs
Associate Professor
Department of Political Science
The University of Western Ontario
London, Ontario N6A 5C2**

1998

**RECRUITMENT, SELECTION AND CAREER DEVELOPMENT FOR ABORIGINAL PEOPLE,
RACIAL MINORITIES AND WOMEN IN POLICING:
REPORT ON RESULTS OF FOCUS GROUPS AND INDIVIDUAL INTERVIEWS**

Table of Contents

Introduction	page 3
Methodology and Research Team	5
First Wave of Focus Groups: Applicant Pool	7
Second Wave of Focus Groups: Serving Officers	20
References	43
Appendices: Protocol for Focus Groups	42

**RECRUITMENT, SELECTION AND CAREER DEVELOPMENT FOR ABORIGINAL PEOPLE,
RACIAL MINORITIES, AND WOMEN IN POLICING:
REPORT ON RESULTS OF FOCUS GROUPS AND INTERVIEWS**

Introduction

Recent data from Statistics Canada have documented the persisting pattern of under-representation of racial minorities and women in policing in Canada. Although the representation of women has increased since the mid-seventies, when women constituted less than one percent of police officers, only 13 percent of publicly employed Canadian police officers were women in 1996. While visible minorities accounted for ten percent of the employed labour force in Canada in 1996, they made up only three percent of police officers. Aboriginal people also constituted three percent of Canadian police officers (Swol, 1998). Policing may be considered an attractive career since it is highly visible to the public and renders essential and indispensable services to the community. Furthermore, the 1996 Census reported that the elite occupation of commissioned police officer (ranks of Inspector and above) is one of the 25 highest paid occupations in Canada. However, the familiar pattern of a gender-based pay gap is evident in policing: the average earnings of men working full time as commissioned police officers were reported to be \$64,865 in 1995, while women's earnings were \$50,011 (Statistics Canada, 1998: 10).

Acknowledgements:

The author would like to acknowledge the assistance of Michael Foster, Research Assistant, who worked tirelessly to seek out information and contacts in police services, and to arrange for the participation of students and serving officers in focus groups. Thanks are also extended to Chris Moise, who assisted with the focus groups in London, and to Leslie Cross and Cliff Latincic, who did library research for the project.

Helpful suggestions on the first draft of the survey questionnaire for the larger project were provided by Inspector Brian Cryderman, Staff Services, Peel Regional Police, Brampton, Ontario; Staff Sergeant Rod Silverson, Recruiting and Training, London Police, London, Ontario; and Sergeant Michael Glennie, Human Resources, Durham Regional Police, Oshawa, Ontario.

For assistance in the recruitment of participants in focus groups, sincere thanks are extended to Corporal L.L. Nolan, Royal Canadian Mounted Police, Newmarket Detachment; Sergeant Linda Martell, Staffing and Personnel, Royal Canadian Mounted Police, "O" Division; Inspector Julie Grimaldi, Planning Officer, Ontario Provincial Police; Sergeant Karen Moffatt, Ontario Provincial

Police, London; and Sergeant Lees, Human Resources (Recruiting and Training), London Police; C. Lloyd Stanford, Le Groupe Stanford Inc., Montreal; Lonnie Montour, former Coordinator, First Nations Centre, Fanshawe College; Vivian Peters, Coordinator, First Nations Services, University of Western Ontario; Jody Lynn Waddilove, undergraduate Political Science student, University of Western Ontario, and Mary Nelder, M. Nelder Management Services, Manitoulin Island, Ontario.

There is a scarcity of in-depth information, from the perspectives of under-represented and disadvantaged groups, about how policing is perceived as a career, and about the barriers that may limit their entry and career development in police organizations. Therefore as part of the collection of data for the larger study for the Canadian Centre for Police Race Relations, a series of focus groups was conducted to provide information about the varying perspectives of members of groups that are under-represented in careers in policing.

Two waves of focus groups were conducted: 1) potential members of applicant pools, consisting of women and men who are young adults and considering their career options, and 2) serving officers employed by various police services including municipal police forces in Ontario, the Ontario Provincial Police, and the RCMP. The focus groups included interviews with: (a) racial minority men and women, including persons of Black, South Asian and Asian ancestry and/or identity, (b) First Nations men and women, and (c) white women separately or in combination with racial minority women.

The first wave of focus groups collected data from male and female university and college students and members of community organizations who identify themselves as members of racial minorities and First Nations, as well as white women. The purpose of these focus groups is to document perspectives of members of these groups who represent the potential applicant pool for police services. The focus group discussions provided a better understanding of how these young adults view policing as a career, and of the experiences and information that influenced those perspectives. The focus group interviews also examined their perspectives on the importance of having a representative police service, and their opinions about barriers that might deter them or other members of their group from selecting policing as a career. Focus group members were recruited from among members of student organizations, including the Black Students' Association at The University of Western Ontario, the First Nations Centre at Fanshawe College, and women who were undergraduates at Western. Participants for the first wave of focus groups were also recruited from community organizations in Montreal and Toronto.

The second wave of focus groups was conducted with serving officers recruited using formal and informal contacts within a number of police services, including municipal forces, the OPP, and the RCMP. Several individual interviews were also conducted with officers who hold senior ranks, or who have had extensive experience in working to improve the representation of minorities, First Nations people and women in policing, or to improve relationships between police services and First Nations or minority communities.

Methodology and Research Team

The research project began with a literature review to identify publications and reports on previous research that were helpful in deciding what issues to examine in the focus group interviews. Sources on the effective use of focus groups in research were also consulted. With this foundation, the protocols and questions used to conduct the focus groups were developed (see Appendix).

To assist in the recruitment of focus group participants, setting up and scheduling the groups, and conducting the focus groups in southwestern Ontario, student research assistants were hired. They were selected with two primary criteria in mind: interest in policing, and some contact and understanding of policing issues in relation to race, culture and gender; and representativeness of the populations whose concerns we are examining. The student assistants were all students of social science in their third or final year of undergraduate studies.

Michael Foster, who assisted throughout the focus group segment of the research, had served as an auxiliary officer and had considerable knowledge of the organization and operation of police services, and a network of useful contacts. He is seeking a career in policing and is concerned about and committed to the development of more representative police services and the improvement of police-community relations. Mike easily established rapport with officers and was responsible for recruiting most of the police officers who participated in the focus groups. Chris Moise had worked with the Black Students Association and had previous experience in security work as well as courses in criminal justice. His assistance was relied upon to recruit Black students for the applicant pool groups in the London area, and to assist in the focus groups with these groups. Chris' interest in policing seems to have been reinforced by his experience with the research team; he is now seeking employment with a police service. Robert McCormick, who was referred by the First Nations Services office at Western, was hired to assist in recruiting Native focus group participants. He established a number of helpful contacts for the study in southwestern Ontario before the pressure of his other responsibilities required him to resign from the project.

These student research assistants were funded in part by the grant from the Canadian Centre for Police Race Relations, and in part by the Work-Study Bursary program of the University of Western Ontario.

In addition, two consultants assisted by recruiting participants and conducting focus groups in more distant locations. Mary Nelder, a graduate student living on Manitoulin Island, recruited and interviewed three First Nations police officers, all women. (This part of the study was funded by the co-investigator.) These interviews were important because no women of First Nations ancestry in policing were located in southwestern Ontario. Indeed, because women of racial minority backgrounds are rare in policing, we were able to recruit very few serving officers who are racial minority women to participate in our study. This in itself is a noteworthy finding of the study.

Another consultant, Lloyd Stanford, conducted four focus groups as part of the first wave of the study, which dealt with the "applicant pool" for policing. Two groups were conducted in Toronto and two in Montreal – one in English and one in French.

The focus groups were conducted in various locations convenient to the participants, generally in small classroom or board room settings with chairs around a large table. Light refreshments were provided, and participants were offered reimbursement for parking and bus fare.

All participants were assured confidentiality; hence no names or other identifiers were linked to the data during the interviews and transcriptions, and no names of persons or specific police services are included in the report on the findings. This commitment to confidentiality was essential to securing participation in the focus groups and candid discussion of perspectives and experiences.

Even so, members of the research team working in all locations recruited and secured agreement to participate from many more individuals than actually appeared at the agreed upon time and place for the interviews. For whatever reason, it is very difficult to get people to turn up to participate. However, those who did participate impressed the research team with their thoughtfulness, sincerity, candidness and commitment to improving the representation of members of disadvantaged groups in policing, and to better police-community relations. In the end, we suspect that interest in policing as a career, and commitment to social justice and to more inclusive police organizations, were the motives that caused those who did participate to volunteer their time and give us the benefit of their thinking and experience. In every group, participants were concerned that the results of our research be communicated widely and lead to action on the part of decision makers to address issues identified in the study. It is the opportunity to contribute to change that seemed to be the primary reason why people chose to participate in the study.

In relation to the method of using focus groups to provide research data, it is important to realize that the emphasis is on the quality, not the quantity, of participants and their views. The purpose of focus groups is not to interview large numbers of people – survey methods are appropriate to this need. The strength of focus group interviews is that they provide deep insight into the perspectives and experience of participants, and help us to understand the reasons for the social behaviours we are seeking to understand. Hence in reporting on the results of focus groups we are not interested in a “head count”, but in the diversity and quality of views represented in groups of persons who share some dimension of social experience. Focus groups put interviewees into a situation in which they can discuss similar and differing experiences and perspectives, hence bringing out the diversity of views among people who also have something in common. Hence in reporting focus group findings we seek to identify common themes and patterns, and differing views. We also seek to explain why people think as they do about the issues of concern. In addition, we present the concrete suggestions and recommendations for change – the creative new ideas – that members of marginalized groups have put forward in response to our request for their assistance.

First Wave of Focus Groups: Applicant Pool

Focus group interviews were conducted with students who were at the point in their lives where they were considering career alternatives, and who were interested enough in policing as a career to accept an invitation to participate in a focus group on the subject. These groups were held at Fanshawe College and the University of Western Ontario in London, in Toronto, and in Montreal, during the spring, summer and fall of 1997.

Focus group discussions were held with four groups of Native participants, five groups of racial minority participants of varying backgrounds, and one group of white women students.

Specifically, the following focus groups were conducted:

- 1) seven first and second year undergraduate students recruited through the Black Students Association at the University of Western Ontario (three men and four women, several of whom were immigrants to Canada)
- 2) three racial minority students (Black, South Asian and Asian) who have recently graduated from high school and are entering Western (two women and one man)
- 3) four students recruited through the First Nations Centre, Fanshawe College (two men, two women)

- 4) three students recruited through the First Nations Services office, University of Western Ontario (two women, one man)
- 5) four women students including a mixture of backgrounds (two undergraduates and two in MA programs) attending the University of Western Ontario.
- 6) five young adults, whose ancestry included Hispanic (one), Asia-Pacific (three) and Middle Eastern (one), interviewed in the French language in Montreal (16 persons had been invited)
- 7) 18 young adults, including 12 Native, one Black, two Asian-Pacific and three South Asian participants, interviewed in English in Montreal (26 participants had been invited)
- 8) 14 First Nations persons interviewed in Toronto (12 were invited: 8 men and 4 women) five members of Toronto's Black community ranging in age from 18 to 30, two of whom plan to pursue careers in policing (18 were invited).

The protocol and questions used in the first wave of focus groups are presented in the appendix.

Findings from First Wave Focus Groups: Potential Members of Applicant Pools

While there were some common themes, the focus groups identified patterns of concerns and suggestions for change which were different for Native and racial minority participants. The major points that came out in the discussions are summarized below, for each group. Quotations are used to capture the powerful images and analysis that was often seen in the transcripts.

First Nations Participants

When asked what words come to mind when the phrase "being a police officer" is used, the images were largely negative: "bureaucracy, red tape, racism, discrimination, corruption, tear gas, riot shields, helmets, faceless, brutality, links with organized crime, stereotyping, judgemental, drunken Indian stigma, Natives as scapegoats for society's troubles". In one group (Anglophones in Montreal), the view of the police as an institution was found to be overwhelmingly negative, notwithstanding the recognition that "not all police are bad". Police were said to focus on minor infractions or misdemeanours while being indifferent to serious incidents, such as assault, spousal abuse, and deaths involving Native people. There was a sense that aboriginal people feel it is useless to report crimes because white officers won't take them seriously. Police officers were said to have a discriminatory attitude toward Native youth in particular, and a lack of interest in "kids".

Police could not be trusted. In the other focus groups, images of policing were somewhat more balanced, using words such as "power, authority," "a lot of responsibility", "hard work (the hours)", "rules and regulations" as well as noting "insensitivity", "white", "a lot of men", and "needing more minorities". In a Montreal group, the police were seen as "a service of white males".

Police work was seen as "tough", dangerous, physically demanding and "stressful". Policing was perceived as "blue collar work", and police were viewed as not adept at handling the more stressful and complex parts of the job. Police were seen as "power tripping", and needing to be "aggressive". There was mention of long hours of driving as a negative feature.

However, some aspects of police work were said to be attractive, including the pay. Several participants said that they are attracted to the analytical component of police work – problem-solving, forensics and the behavioural science aspects, and undercover street work – but patrol work was not seen as attractive. A few participants expressed an interest in law as a career.

The discussion of what police work was like noted that it is hard to sort out the "glorified" images from the "negative" images, and that "we don't know a lot" about policing. Most exposure comes from TV.

However, participants in the focus groups also reported rather extensive first hand acquaintance with police as a result of their own experience or that of relatives. Many participants had family members, including a father, brother, uncle and cousin, in policing, and had gained first hand information about the occupation from this source. For some, there was inspiration in these examples.

However, much of the experience with police that was described by focus group members was negative. One participant told how disrespect for the police is rooted in past experience, and views based on that experience: "The police [are seen as] a bunch of white guys trying to beat up Indian people. My mother was struck when she was pregnant because she was trying to defend my father who was getting beat up by two officers. My experiences with policing as a young child are negative....I know the officers that come on the reserve treat them like children and talk to them like they are children. We don't have the right services. We don't have the money to build nice buildings. We don't have the money to set up and draw up our own resources like the way the municipality can."

All of the focus groups of Native participants discussed the particular issues surrounding Aboriginal peacekeepers in reserve communities. Images of policing were said to be influenced strongly by daily experience with these First Nations officers. Although this is a career that was perceived as relatively accessible, these officers were seen as lacking in community support. It was

generally agreed that "regular" police should not be performing police functions on reserves. However, Native constables face "double jeopardy" in that they are not respected by the community because they are perceived as powerless, and they are stereotyped as Natives by the larger community, and discriminated against by city and provincial police forces. For example, Native police are not allowed to directly enter the OPP and municipal police services. As a result, "they are looked at as officers who are not as adequate – who couldn't get a job in any municipality." There needs to be a more respectful and cooperative relationship between Native and non-Native police organizations. For example, one participant noted that on-reserve officers "don't have the right uniforms. Some of them go through the entire police college without a uniform while all the others have the uniform.... Our police services up north have left over RCMP uniforms. And that tells you something. The government can't even afford to give our own First Nations brand new uniforms. They have to be given leftovers. How do you expect our police officers to do a great job and for the people to be proud of them when you can't even give them the benefit of giving them first rate services? So, in my mind, they should be treated the same, they should be looked at the same, they're not. "

Another issue surrounds the image of reserve policing as influenced by the politics of the community. For example, when a new Band Council is elected, police officers may be replaced. On-reserve officers may be faced with arresting their relatives or searching them for weapons. If they do their job, they may pay dearly:

"As actual policing goes, no, we don't have any. And I can understand that simply because in the past, maybe five years ago, the constable on my reserve, his car was burned, his house was surrounded with broken bottles, he was caught and those guys beat him up pretty bad and humiliated him by stripping his clothes off and tying him to a tree. So, that sort of message to a young boy at a time when he wanted to be a reserve officer or a police officer in general... A lot of our kids don't know the difference between on-reserve and off-reserve policing. They only see officers as being white, male and racist."

The perception that becoming a police officer would distance the individual from his or her community also makes policing unattractive as a career. It was thought that "people would feel awkward around you" or "won't act the same around you". Large police organizations are perceived as unattractive, unfriendly places: "once you leave your community you become a piston in the Ontario police machine." Or, "having no consideration for the community and the people in the community, we become a pest in the Ontario police service... You forget about all the things that you know" from your background.

One of the Montreal focus groups took a predominantly negative view of police officers and the work they do, so it is not surprising that none of its members expressed an interest in policing as a career. One comment was, “our people don’t want to be police: they have morals.”

However, a few individuals in each of the other focus groups – both women and men – were interested in obtaining further information about policing, and/or indicated some interest in the career. One man had been in the Canadian Forces and liked dealing with weapons and the structure of the organization. Another man – a young student who is highly articulate and perceptive – is strongly attracted to the analytical and problem-solving aspects of police work (“the pure analytic working mind”), and is considering applying to the RCMP. However he comes from a small reserve in northern Ontario where police are distrusted and a career in policing would not be encouraged, because of negative experiences with police. A woman thought she would like the problem-solving nature of police work, the research and investigation, and the communication with people. Another woman had wanted to be a police officer since she was a teenager.

Still another reported,

“my reserve has put forth five candidates to be hired by the RCMP, five! Not one of them [was] hired... not because of lack of qualifications.... They met the standards, they never got a call back. Why? They don’t want them. Don’t know the reasons why... It’s just ‘sorry, sorry, your interview was unsuccessful. I do wish you luck in your future endeavors. Hopefully you will not be deterred from policing as a career.’ Oh gee, thanks. Oh, I’m not going to be deterred because I’m not given a reason why I’m not hired... Thanks for coming out. Yeah, exactly.”

Everyone agreed that police organizations would have to change to make policing attractive as a career for First Nations people. Also, they did not feel they have enough knowledge about policing, so are unable to decide to pursue this field. In discussing barriers to Native entry and career development in police organizations, the groups noted a lack of knowledge about career options in policing, and about how to find out about them, and about the education required, etc. They wondered what kinds of specialties might be open to them.

There were a few focus group members who were keen to enter policing and had made efforts in this direction, including making contacts, seeking knowledge of police services, working out and getting in shape, and doing volunteer work with police. Several participants had positive experiences with the London police department’s summer program for students and spoke highly of it as an approach to helping youth to become aware of policing as a career possibility.

Although there was ambivalence about policing as a career among the First Nations participants, there was a strong recognition in all the groups of the importance of policing, as an

institution, to Native people and communities. In discussing whether it is important for First Nations to be better represented in policing, most participants said yes, "because we are a minority and have no voice". It is important to have First Nations and other groups represented in policing in a multicultural society, in order for police work to be done effectively. Examples of policing in minority communities in large cities such as New York were mentioned. In the succinct words of one participant, "policing is a form of power. If we are not involved as a people, then we give up the power to govern ourselves."

There was a difference of opinion as to whether First Nations should seek separate solutions to policing issues. Some participants proposed that communities need to have their own systems of policing that they can trust and control. "Our people would be looking after our own people." Others felt that this approach would be impractical and that a solution would have to be found through increasing First Nations influence within the framework of policing in Canada.

There was also a strong sense of the need for police to become more aware and knowledgeable about First Nations communities and culture and about the relationship between First Nations and Canadian society. This theme relates to a perceived lack of respect on the part of police for Native people. There was also discussion in several focus groups of the importance of police becoming more "culturally educated and understanding", and more aware of cultural differences. "We need to close that gap, considering that Canada is one of the most multi-cultural countries in the world. In Montreal it was noted that "Montreal is a huge melting pot", and there was doubt that police acknowledge that. Police should learn to see things from the perspective of the minority ethno-cultural groups, many felt.

There was concern about the stereotyping of Native people by police and society in general. In all of the focus groups there was discussion of the need for the media to portray Native people more accurately, and to present images of equality and justice in interactions between Natives and police. For example, police officers should not be shown as "getting away with" killing Native people.

There was also concern about unfounded perceptions that minorities are receiving special consideration in hiring for police positions, when this is not the case. A woman who had been trying for years to enter policing, so far unsuccessfully, reported, "a lot of people seem to think as long as, like for me, being a woman and being Native, 'Oh, you're in there for sure, like no problem.' But I still have to meet the qualifications like everybody else." Another recounted that the politics of the times make the life of a Native police officer very difficult, and discourage Native youth from considering policing as a career. It is not helpful when Native constables are stuck in jobs far away

from their communities, where they are invisible, “working as a janitor, or in reception, or in custodial stuff, or as a grounds keeper”. On the other hand, a Native officer may be “under a microscope”, or expected to solve all problems involving Native people: “because we’re Native doesn’t mean that I know everybody in Kettle Point” (a scene of current police-community tensions).

With reference to what could be done to encourage better relationships between Native youth and police services, there was praise for mentoring programs that involve police officers in activities with Native youth. The Montreal group lamented a budget cut that ended one of these programs. Another group suggested that “regular” police should participate in community events, in small numbers, out of uniform and with their families, to “take a look at how we live and listen to stories”, in order to learn about First Nations and reduce the stereotypes and the chasm between the communities. They cautioned, “when you come to these gatherings, forget that you are a police officer, come as you are, to be accepted for who you are as a person, not for what your profession is; but if you can’t do that don’t even bother coming.”

With deep irony, one participant noted that a police officer will “come to the reserve in their shiny uniform” and “stand up on a podium” to talk to the community – the wrong approach. Ironically, however, after people in the community help him out by explaining things to him, he uses it, so he keeps his job because, well, ‘I know this, and I know how to do this and that’s why I should be hired because I’m a bit of a Native expert. I’m pretty familiar with the culture, you know, I know the lingo a little bit, I’m pretty good.’ ...People like that are the ones that keep people like me out of police jobs. It’s gotta be a partnership and to form that partnership comes education on both sides.

The focus groups suggested a number of initiatives to attract and retain more members of First Nations in policing. These included:

- 1) Provide education and information regarding what police officers do, requirements for this occupation, how to become a police officer, and positive aspects of the police role. Information can be made available through Aboriginal friendship centres, Native newspapers, magazines and radio.
- 2) Publicize the presence of Native officers with a “powerful future”, and the difference they are making. Promotions of Native officers should be publicized, so that people in the community would be aware that progress is possible.
- 3) Provide more information to aboriginal communities so that they can monitor progress and needs for change in police-community relations.

- 4) Assess the issues surrounding the image of Native officers on reserves and take measures to improve respect for this role.
- 5) Aboriginal people should work together to raise levels of understanding and awareness through education and community development.
- 6) Participants expressed a hope that their participation in the focus group might result in their voices being heard, and in some movement toward needed changes. They suggested that studies such as this should be available to the public.
- 7) Workshops for police involving elders and Native youth would increase awareness.
- 8) There was support for the concept of community policing, and visibility of police on the streets: "they create the image of being people's kind of cops".
- 9) Have more minorities; "draw on the ethnic mosaic". Token minorities ("a Black face in a white organization") is not a solution.
- 10) Recruit and deploy locally: it is better to have "home grown cops" who understand "the struggles of the community" because they have "been there" and can "relate".

To sum up, many participants in the First Nations focus groups would probably agree that "we can't change history, but we can improve the future."

Racial Minority Participants

When asked to write down phrases that came to mind in relation to "policing as a career", the focus group participants included the following: "authority", "interesting job", "responsibility", "dealing with various classes of society", "secure career", "safety", "fighting crime", "keeping order in society", "enforce the law", "command respect", "protecting," "uniform," "power", "racism", "sexism", "trouble", "harassment", "unwanted", "white male", "young", "fit", "desensitized".

Some participants had neighbors, relatives or friends who work in policing, or had participated in London's PEACE program for youth. These students tended to have rather positive attitudes about policing, and some willingness to consider policing as a career. Commenting on the PEACE program, one student said,

for me it was really a nice experience and I've also passed on a lot of information and interpretation about what policing is all about to family and friends. Especially since it was a minority program, being a minority – if we are able to understand what it is all about and if we can sort of relate that to other minorities, you know. Instead of a white person relaying to a colored person, you know, it might be more understandable that way.

In another focus group of Black students, many of whom had come to Canada from other countries, both men and women reported many negative experiences with police officers. These experiences had strongly influenced their views of policing as a profession and their perspectives on the relationship of police to the Black and larger racial minority communities. For example, the men reported that they were often stopped by police when driving or walking on the street, and reported that the first question police often ask is "do you have a criminal record?"; "what are you doing?"; "where are you going?" "That's the first thing they see when they see you: trouble". One student recounted,

As soon as I came to this country, five months ago, I was walking with my younger brother and some police officer came up to me and said, 'Excuse me, sir, where are you going tonight? We just got a criminal call about two black men fitting your description in this neighbourhood who committed a crime.' I looked at him, and it was like, 'Well, you've got the wrong people — maybe they're further ahead.' When he found out that I go to Western and what my dad does — because my dad is a doctor — and because I'm well spoken, he calmed down a little bit. So it's that kind of experience that had an effect on me.

Affluence was not always a shield against this kind of trouble:

With a lot of my minority friends, a lot of them come from affluent families and we get pulled over in nice cars all the time. I remember one time — it was in St. Catharines—I was with one of my Oriental friends and the police pulled us over and gave him a hard time and asked him what it feels like to be 17, Oriental, and driving a \$110,000 car.

In Toronto, the women noted, large numbers of police often park outside Black clubs "waiting for trouble." "It's almost like they're on a big power trip, that they have something to prove. What am I doing? I'm waiting for a ride. Is it really necessary to tell me to 'move along'?" To these students, the police presence in this setting is intimidating and seems to have no legitimate purpose in that these are social clubs, not places where crime is likely to occur. A man commented, "it comes down to a question of respect... It's the way you talk to somebody....If you come out with something nasty, like 'move on, move on,' that's harassment — it's like they don't want to know." Later, a woman gave an example of a situation in which police officers were helpful to her and spoke in a respectful manner. Several students expressed concern that they did not want to engage in stereotyping themselves in speaking of police officers.

A woman noted that there is a large gap between what she had been taught about the police in elementary school ("Officer Friendly") and her experience living in Canada, where she has never met a "friendly" officer.

The Black students all agreed that it is very important to educate police and to put them into situations where they interact with diverse people of other cultures and races, not just people with problems. Their analysis was that stereotypes held by police officers are based in part on experience, but the experience police have had probably does not provide the basis for accurate perceptions or appropriate attitudes and behavioural responses to members of racial minority communities. They felt that police focus on "blue-collar crime" and ignore corporate "wasp" crime, and that they attribute "guilt by association", and tend to see all Blacks as drug dealers, etc. Police tend to see young Black men in groups as dangerous; there were many incidents recounted by the men of being stopped by police when they were with friends on the street or in a car. However one student noted, "we don't walk in the shoes of police – who knows what their reality is?" The view was expressed that bias develops from experience. There is a large communication gap between minority communities and police. The police also need to market themselves better "to all consumers".

To counteract the inappropriate attitudes and behaviours police display toward racial minorities will take education. But education alone is not enough – there need to be experiences that create cognitive and affective change, and changes in representation. The students feel that to some degree police simply reflect their society, and society will have to change before the police will truly change. They perceive white Canadians as highly prejudiced and good at hiding their prejudice ("racism with a smile"). Many examples were cited, such as racial minority teens being followed around and harassed in shopping malls and not being hired for retail jobs, etc. The students discussed their experiences living and travelling in other countries, and noted that in Nigeria, police are not biased and treat everyone the same, and in England the police are "laid back" and "polite". It was said that Canadian police need to be more like the "bobbies" in their attitudes and approach.

In discussing what the police services could do to become more open, the students all agreed that having more people of colour and women in policing would be important. Even having white women on the force would help racial minority women feel they could relate to someone. Police need to respond to victims, especially of rape and abuse, with officers of the same gender and culture: big white men can't comfort rape victims. Many circumstances require diverse responses: there should be mixed partners on patrol.

More women and minorities are needed in administration to influence policy.

No one wants to be the only minority group individual on the police force: a more representative organization is needed. Role models are needed to encourage racial minority youth

to think about policing careers; now there is "nothing to look up to". There is a "no representation – no recruitment cycle" now that will be hard to break. It was noted that policing doesn't have a very attractive image: "how intelligent must you be to be a cop? Ya don't!" "You don't need an A average to become a cop." "You can't press-gang people into policing." It was suggested that parents may want their children to aspire to high levels of education and to safe and prestigious careers, and may view policing as incompatible with these aspirations.

A woman noted, however, that police departments could do a more effective job of marketing policing careers. "To say that minority people aren't interested is not an excuse because you should market your organization and appeal to them and make them want to." Immigrant youth and parents need to be informed that policing in Canada may not be not the same as policing in their home countries. It was suggested that internships for new recruits might be an effective way to let them become familiar with policing.

There are many barriers that keep racial minorities and women out. For example, the training program is geared to white males and women therefore drop out. There was thought to be too much emphasis on physical skills and emergency skills, yet it was suggested that chases, shootouts and brawls are very rare in police work in Canada. More emphasis should be placed on communication and negotiation skills, not just on physical strength. The standard should be physical fitness, not strength: martial arts training, and negotiation skills useful in de-escalating situations, would be useful: "we don't need 6'6" cops, 250 pounds." Knowledge of languages should be a criterion for recruitment. For example, one participant had found it revealing and helpful to observe a Mandarin speaking Francophone Quebecois officer at work.

It was suggested that barriers to improved representation should be taken down and more women and minorities admitted. This would help to change the image of policing. It was also agreed that everyone hired should be screened on "moral fibre" regardless of their formal qualifications: how they feel about Blacks needs to be assessed. It was suggested that recruiting from universities might produce more "enlightened and sensitive" officers.

In recruiting, police services should put women and men of colour in advertising and show role models. For example, Colin Powell is an important role model in the US Army. Among other ideas about what police services could do, it was suggested that police should be put into the communities for discussion with groups, to establish rapport, and there should be liaison councils and focus groups of police and minorities to resolve problems. There should be sensitivity and awareness training in police colleges, and/or police should be trained in universities.

In discussion of whether they would consider policing as a career, the students expressed considerable openness to considering some aspects of police work such as forensics, investigation or administration. One woman is planning a career in law. However, another woman expressed concerns about being a woman in policing:

I've heard horror stories every day of women in the force, or women in the navy, or women anywhere that get raped or brutalized – that still happens and nobody does anything because they're supposed to be the police, and they're supposed to be good. So. Nothing gets done to them. So, why should I apply and basically just say, 'Here I am, go ahead, just do anything you want to me just because I want to be a police officer.' I don't think so.

Several students were concerned about working with a white partner who might "hate me" and not "back me up" in a crisis.

Several of the participants noted that they wouldn't want to be hired out of "tokenism", or "to fill a certain quota" or "improve the statistics," but because of their ability.

Women

A mixed group of white and minority women discussed the questions in depth and developed a progressive understanding of the issues as the discussion proceeded. There was a rather pronounced difference of opinion early in the discussion between women who had worked closely with police, and who had quite strong negative responses to policing based on this experience, and women who had had little contact with police except for an uncle who was a police officer: these women's notions about policing were quite positive.

This group agreed that the police should be more representative of the population of racial minorities and First Nations as well as women. They discussed at some length the damaging impacts of having male officers in uniform working with rape and sexual assault victims. They also noted the need to have women in decision making positions in policing.

One member of this group was interested in a career in law enforcement, and had work experience in the field. However, she like the other members of the group felt strongly that there is a great need for change in the culture of police organizations if policing is to become an attractive career for women. They discussed a variety of ideas about how to bring about change in the culture of policing, emphasizing the need for "accountability", by which they meant that each officer must be accountable for ethical behaviour and fair treatment of citizens and fellow officers. This must be ensured by top leadership commitment to equality and service to the community. There also needs to be training of all police on a regular basis, not just every five years, in working with

diversity, anti-racism and anti-sexism. There was considerable discussion of job requirements in policing, and of the appropriateness of various physical standards. There was a sense that physical strength is perhaps over-emphasized, and that police services today should select on the basis of physical fitness and skill rather than brute strength, and should emphasize communication and negotiation skills. It was noted that the physical standards that are used in recruiting don't seem to apply to men who have been on the force for some years.

Women must be assured that they will be safe when paired with male officers on the job. Bringing significantly more women into policing would help to change the culture. However, there was skepticism – strong for one participant – about the possibility of reforming the police, who were perceived to be part of a larger societal framework that oppresses women.

Common Themes Emerging From the First Wave of Focus Groups: "Applicant Pool"

1. It is perceived that police have a tendency to stereotype minorities and women and to treat them with disrespect. Negative experiences of this kind with police create a serious barrier to recruitment of women and minorities into policing.
2. There is a need for police to be more representative of the community, both to provide effective police services and to change the pattern of minority under-representation in policing.
3. There is a need for police organizations to change and to become accountable for their exclusionary and discriminatory practices.
4. It is important that there be role models from under-represented groups, youth-oriented programs, mentoring and internship opportunities in policing as means of making police services more attractive to minorities and women.
5. There is a need for police to do a better job of communicating with and understanding concerns of women and minorities. Informal contact in a variety of situations with a cross-section of minority communities, not just people with problems, would build mutual understanding.
6. There is a need for police to give more responsive, effective and appropriate service to members of the community who are women and/or racial minorities, in order to build respect for police services and their work.
7. There is a need for more women and minorities in leadership/top management positions in policing, both as models of the possibility of success, and as influences on the culture of the organization.

8. There is a need for police services to do a better job of communicating what they do and why, in order to inform the public about police work and how to pursue this career.
9. There is a need to use up-to-date criteria for recruitment, including emphasis on physical fitness instead of strength, as well as on communication and negotiation skills.

Second Wave of Focus Groups: Serving Officers

The second phase of the study in which serving officers were interviewed included eight focus groups and nine individual interviews. A majority of those interviewed held the rank of constable, but about a third held higher ranks. One participant had recently left a position as a police officer but all others interviewed were currently serving. Altogether, 12 men (five Blacks, one Asian and six Native), and 17 women (13 white, one Asian, three Native and no Blacks) were interviewed individually or in focus groups. The police services represented included the RCMP, the OPP, two municipal police forces, and two other services (including a First Nations service).

Three individual interviews were conducted with women who hold senior management positions in police services, and four individual interviews were also conducted with officers of First Nations ancestry from various ranks in the RCMP, OPP, and two municipal police forces. In addition to speaking from their own experiences and observations, several of these individuals had spent much of their careers working to improve relationships between police organizations and minority communities, and to remove barriers to the participation of women and minorities in policing. These interviews were frank and provided rich insights into the difficulties of survival and career advancement, as a woman or person of Native ancestry, in the police organizations of the recent past and present.

In addition, the researcher went on a ride-along with a woman officer during her night shift, in order to obtain a first hand experience of police work. This proved to be extremely valuable as a source of insight into the demands and challenges of police work.

The following analysis of the interview and focus group data from serving officers focuses on the following issues:

- 1) Recruitment and selection of police officers;
- 2) Mentoring, career development and promotion of police officers;
- 3) The culture of police organizations; and
- 4) Strategies and prospects for change in mainstream police organizations.

The analysis focussed upon issues affecting Black, Asian and First Nations men and women in policing, with selected comparisons to the experiences of white women.

Findings: Focus Group and Individual Interviews with Serving Officers

Recruitment and selection of police officers

(1) Development of interest in policing as a career

Participants in the interviews were asked how they became interested in policing as a career. Many had developed their career interest as children or teenagers. A large number of those interviewed had been influenced by relatives who worked in policing. Two officers – a man and a woman – were positively influenced by relatives, both women, who were RCMP officers. Another had a brother, uncles and grandfather in policing in the Caribbean. A Native officer had two brothers and an uncle in policing, and his father and grandfather had been RCMP special constables. Another Native officer was influenced by an older neighbour who had succeeded in entering the RCMP, and became his role model, while another had an older brother who was a First Nations officer. Still another was influenced during university, and subsequently recruited into policing, by a detective who was a relative of a friend.

A considerable number of participants were strongly influenced as children by officers who visited their elementary schools. Several officers told of their interest in policing being awakened by personal experiences involving police. Early experiences with police were not always positive: a woman who holds a senior position in policing told of having her wallet stolen when she was in high school. An officer took a report and nothing was done. She then found the wallet herself, and resolved to have that man's job some day.

Many of those interviewed were attracted to policing by their experience as children in their communities, particularly in the West Indies where police officers were perceived as helpful in the community, and on reserves. For many, participation in sports as children and youth prompted an interest in working in a police organization.

Long-service officers had typically entered policing at a young age, while more recent recruits generally had completed university degrees before entering a police service. Some of the women and men in mid career had entered police services out of high school and completed undergraduate or graduate degrees while employed as officers. Several of the younger officers mentioned having been influenced by police recruiting or training staff who encouraged them to apply, or by faculty or friends in university or college, in some cases in criminology programs. A majority of officers interviewed reported that they had a college or university background in the fields of criminology or law and security before entering policing.

Some had applied for an auxiliary position before their regular application in order to give police work a try. Four Black officers had experienced police work in other countries, particularly in

the Caribbean, prior to immigrating to Canada, and then joined police services here. Two Native officers had entered the mainstream police organizations after having served in First Nations police forces, under a lateral transfer arrangement.

A common theme in these experiences was some first-hand contact with policing, rather than an abstract interest in this career. Through personal experience, most officers were already familiar with the work before applying to a police service.

(2) Satisfaction and attractions of a career in policing

In commenting on their perceptions of the advantages and satisfactions of police work, most participants mentioned their enjoyment of the variety of the job: "one of the parts that I really enjoy is the diversity of the job. A lot of the times when I answer a call, wherever I go it's almost always a new learning experience." Job security and good pay were also mentioned by several people as attractions of police work. "Independence", "working on your own", and "being outside" were also valued aspects of the job.

Personal development was mentioned as one of the satisfactions of police work. One officer explained how, as a child, "I used to walk to school and kids used to throw rocks at me. Chinese kid, throwing rocks at me, right? So, a lot of discrimination, that's what I found.... People used to make jokes and I'm used to that... So I think that brought down my self-esteem, when I was younger and when I grew up, but through martial arts and everything, when I did that, that built my confidence... I get a lot more respect... When I first came into policing... I'd go to a call, and I was soft-spoken. But as an officer, you have to lay everything down in front of them, right? Boom! And that was different for me. So I've learned that aspect of the job. It's helped me off duty as well.... I get a little bit more respect than I did before, just the way I'm using the tone of my voice."

The contact with the public, and the opportunity to serve their community, were mentioned as attractions of policing by most of those interviewed. Community service was a theme mentioned by all of the First Nations and Black officers, and the officer of Asian ancestry. Many expressed this commitment in strong terms, for example, "what I originally joined for... is to make sure that all the minorities get a fair chance.... I knew what prejudice could be like... and that was one of the reasons why I wanted to be a police officer, so I'll know that, at least there'll be one officer who'll make sure that minorities, if they face me, will be dealt with fairly. So I knew that I'd be the one, probably, in a million, but still, there'd be that one chance". A Native officer who grew up off reserve also described the discrimination he as endured as a child as an influence upon his career choice and

his awareness of how discrimination occurs both within the police organization and the urban community.

A Native officer said that he and his brother had entered policing with an idea that they could “make things better for our people”, and “we were successful at that – by the time we left there were less B and Es, car thefts and drunk driving. .. I had an honourable idea. I saw policing as a way to solve problems in our community. I saw that we did a good job. It was safer to walk on the road. Me, my older brother and older cousin [also an officer] began to paint a picture for the aboriginal community. We can do something good, project a model for other young aboriginal people. Now there are 13 or 14 other young officers at [community name]. I think we had something to do with that.” This experience took place in a First Nations police service. Another officer who entered directly into a municipal police force expressed disappointment that there was so little opportunity to “help people”, as he had expected, because of “pressures to get the job done” and being “always under the gun”. Doing the job as he believes it should be done requires more time than is considered appropriate.

(3) Service to the community as a minority police officer: the importance of “being there”

A Black officer noted that his presence in the police department was noticed by and important to the community: “My experience has been that whenever I’ve been in the community and I’ve talked with other Black people, they are cognizant of how many other Blacks are on the department. They might not necessarily deal with the police every day, but they’re still aware that, ‘Oh, aren’t there two or three other Black guys,’ whatever the case may be,’ and a woman as well?’ Or, ‘yeah, there’s some Chinese guy on the department.’ It seems that, by virtue of our skin colour or structure or whatever, that people know how many of ‘us’ there are within the department. So I’ve sort of felt that I was ...carrying the torch, or just standing out as a representative of pretty well any and every minority culture or community, just by virtue of my skin colour. I guess that’s a good thing in a way, because it gives some people encouragement to say, ‘yeah, when I grow up I can be like him. He’s black as well.’.. So it’s kind of nice to know that just by your presence, you haven’t even opened your mouth, that you’re giving a positive impression in your community....It seems that people are , not necessarily more receptive to me, but they’re just happy to see that there is a little difference, a little mix...”

An Asian officer spoke of the ways in which his background and skills enabled him to serve minority communities: “I’m Chinese. But on calls that I do when I’m dealing with Koreans (or other minorities) They usually tend to go up to the officer that’s of the different race. Like, they don’t even

want to listen to the Caucasian officer that's talking. It's like, 'I want to talk to this officer'... It's always like that... They feel you can understand....With my language skills, I speak Cantonese. I find that a lot of Vietnamese people speak Cantonese.. and you go there and speak Cantonese and they understand, and that's great. And in Korean martial arts...I pick up a lot of Korean as well. So that helps a lot".

A Native officer described how being Native, and from a reserve, had opened doors for him in the community when he began his policing career in the Maritimes. Another aboriginal officer working in a municipal service spoke of liking to work downtown: "You get to know the people. Especially the Native people. A lot of Native people look up to me. They see me and they could come to talk to me, one on one. .. Whether I have to pick them up, arrest them for intoxicated in a public place, take them to detox or what-have-you, most times they treat me very professionally. I think they still have that respect. I hope so."

In one focus group, officers described how generalized behaviour patterns taught in police college conflict with cultural practices in some communities and interfere with rapport , such as the instruction not to sit down when speaking with people in their homes. Minority officers may have more sensitivity to other cultures because "we are just raised differently". Or they may be perceived by ethnic and minority communities as "able to understand where I'm coming from, and knows what we're all about". A Native officer mentioned that his background growing up on a reserve had developed in him "a natural interest in the people", and an "understanding of the social dimensions that made the community work": he had seen first hand "the dilemma Native people are in."

A varied background is an asset in policing in a diverse society, but it is not always appreciated in the recruitment process. A young officer, a university graduate who had traveled widely and could claim important achievements as a student, felt that he was perceived as lacking in life experience when new on the job. By the same token, an aboriginal officer felt that the recruitment process does not consider ties to one's community as an asset or consideration. There is a need to assess the criteria being used in selection to ensure that value and priority are placed upon experience and skills related to cross -cultural communication and understanding, community ties, personal flexibility, openness to diversity and change, and absence of racist and sexist attitudes and beliefs. These criteria need to be used side by side with recruitment of more women, minorities and First Nations people to ensure that recruits will be assets to their communities as well as to police organizations.

One senior officer noted that even though higher levels of education are now required, this does not ensure progressive attitudes among recruits. Some recruits are "dinosaurs in attitude"

because of the influence of television images of policing, which convey an unrealistic image of what police work involves. As was mentioned in the report on the applicant pool focus groups, it is important that police services communicate their desire for applicants who have interests and skills appropriate to community policing, in order to guide the process of self-selection of youth into careers.

Related to the notion of community service was the attraction of having influence and recognition in the community: "I think that with police work it's like having a front-row ticket for the greatest show on earth. With police work you will have seen a variety of things that people are not privy to. And I think that when I first got on, one of the things that I first found intriguing is just by virtue of the uniform or the car and whatnot, it's almost like Moses parting the Red Sea, people just sort of move for you." Another officer commented, "When you go to a place, they show you everything." A Native officer noted, "my own people looked at me as a success."

(4) Personal values and ethical commitments as motives for working as police officers

Participants' descriptions of their motivations for entering and staying in police work often reflected strongly held values that they felt could be advanced through a career in a police service. In the words of a Black officer, "I'm one who abhors violence. I don't see any need for it. I think there's so much more that can be solved with diplomacy."

Most Black and Native officers felt they were making a positive contribution to their communities through the way they functioned as police officers, and that their style of policing was a positive example. A long service officer who had worked in Black communities in Nova Scotia commented that "the new age of community policing is something that we did 10-15 years ago and we never got credit for it". Native respondents described how they analyzed situations and people and responded with flexibility, helping instead of focussing narrowly on enforcement and "getting in their face". One officer contrasted "policing *for* the community" with "policing the community".

(5) First Nations policing in contrast to other police services

For most of the Native respondents, the first exposure to or experience with policing occurred in reserve communities and involved the special First Nations police – stand-alone police forces in reserve communities staffed by Natives. For example, in Ontario, the First Nations Policing Program was developed by the OPP on the premise that First Nations people should police First Nations people. There was much less commitment by the OPP to the premise that the OPP itself should be representative of the population of Ontario, including Natives. The arrangement

contributed to distancing between the mainstream OPP organization and First Nations. A Native officer estimated that the representation of aboriginal officers in the regular OPP has probably not changed much since about 1980. Yet today, an estimated sixty percent of First Nations people in Ontario live off reserve, and many more move back and forth between reserves and off-reserve communities. Clearly the existence of First Nations police services does not address the policing needs of all aboriginal people.

The Native respondents mentioned the large difference between policing in First Nations communities as compared with other services. On the reserve, "our focus was to help the people, it was to get out there and play with the kids. We used to constantly have hockey sticks. We work with the younger kids." Another Native officer spoke of carrying baseballs in the trunk of the car for interludes of play with the children. He explained that police officers, like teachers, spend their own money – "healing money"—on the community. This approach to policing is effective in First Nations communities, but it does not lend itself to accountability mechanisms in mainstream police organizations that rest on quantitative performance indicators and time-based measures. Moreover, mainstream police organizations may be unattractive to many First Nations officers who are convinced of the benefits of community oriented approaches to policing.

Working in one's own community presents many challenges because "basically everybody you know is here, family, friends, acquaintances." An officer may have to charge or arrest any of these persons – even former teachers, family and friends. There are also advantages due to insider's knowledge: "I know the people. You know who's the dangerous ones and who aren't. Really there aren't too many dangerous people in the community. But the dangerous ones you definitely do know, from growing up. You've seen and heard things, and know what they're capable of."

Two women who are currently working as officers in First Nations services were interviewed. They had applied to work in their own community because "they were specifically asking for female officers down here"; for this reason they did not experience barriers to entry. Both of the officers had college backgrounds in law and security, and one had worked in an exchange program in a municipal police force. For these women, the influences that led them to enter careers in policing were similar to those of the other officers interviewed – relatives in policing, encouragement from family members and college staff, and a desire to help people and the community by reducing crime. Being a role model to children in the community was a significant commitment and source of satisfaction. One officer explained, "One of the big things that I wanted to do is...get to know the little kids. As they say, they're going to be our future leaders! I'd like to get in there [schools] just

to show that we are people too, and that we can be approached without the little kids being afraid.” She added, “When I first got on, going out to the community, kids would say, ‘You’re a cop? You’re a lady though. You can’t be a cop’. So it was funny for the first little while. Then later on they got used to me.”

A few lateral transfers from First Nations police services into mainstream police organizations have been used in the nineties to improve the representation of Natives, but such transfers are still rare. One Native officer who had not experienced this arrangement commented that such transfers need to be done with care to ensure that the individual’s skills are needed, that the person would be able to adapt to the mainstream organization, and that the newcomer goes through an initial learning period. An officer who had experienced lateral transfer noted that “people didn’t like the way I was parachuted in...it was hard”. A successful transfer requires strong and unwavering support at high levels of the organization.

Transferring into a mainstream police service is not an attractive option in the eyes of some First Nations officers, who prefer the “closeness in Native communities, whereas in the city you don’t really know anybody. You don’t know what to expect. The danger level is a lot higher. People don’t know each other, so they couldn’t care less about the other person. There’s a lot more caring in the small community.”

Several respondents told of Native officers they knew who had been in mainstream police services and left to join First Nations services. Their motives included frustration with the mainstream organization’s attitude toward Native people, racist comments and attitudes of white officers, and the attraction of working directly with their own people. One individual knew of 10 individuals who had left the OPP to join First Nations police units. Another officer knew of two Native women who formerly worked in policing but left because of racism in the mainstream organization, and because of tensions surrounding events at Ipperwash.

It is clear that improving the representation of First Nations officers in mainstream police organizations will require more than recruitment. Issues of retention need to be addressed by means of strategies to reduce racism in the culture of the mainstream police force.

(6) Perceived reasons for difficulties in recruiting minority and First Nations youth into policing

Participants had some suggestions as to reasons why it is difficult to recruit Black and Native youth into policing. One Ontario officer noted that friends in Montreal are unlikely to join the police “because they know friends, or they know people, who were wrongly treated by the police, and because of that, they will not join....Those that apply – (snaps fingers)—Money. That’s all they go

for. And so when they go, you have the weakest, the lowest Blacks... because all they care about is the money....So I know it's going to be tough for them (police service in Montreal) to have the proper ratio of representation, to represent the public they're serving....I heard how other Blacks think about the police. And it's really negative, and I know that I wouldn't want to work there as a Black officer."

A Native officer with extensive experience in working in aboriginal communities proposed that recruiters should target their encouragement and assistance to aboriginal youth who are neither immersed in and oriented toward traditional society, nor full participants in mainstream society. Youth "in the middle" may be open to the community-oriented nature of police work.

Other disincentives affecting the attractiveness of mainstream as compared with First Nations policing to aboriginal people may include the requirement to leave one's family and community and "walk all by yourself in a white man's world." As well, members of First Nations pay a financial cost when they join a police service that requires them to move off reserve, since they become liable for taxes, and their cost of living increases.

A Native officer in a municipal service said, "from time to time...they [Native citizens] have called me an apple. Means you're red on the outside but white on the inside...It's not very popular for First Nation people to be police officers."

(7) How minority police officers can contribute to recruitment of minorities into policing

Several officers suggested that they would be able to make a contribution to building a more representative police: "...it's us going out and being ambassadors, if you will. We have to go out and say, 'you see, I'm a police officer. I'm Black, I'm okay, you can touch me. I'm not going to bite... and just being an outreach type of person, because maybe it's just personality but I think culture has to do with it as well. I've mentioned some Black people who say, 'Well, my son wants to join. Anything you could tell him?' You just have to make yourself available for that sort of stuff over and above the regular day to day police work. And just let people know that, yeah, it's okay to join. There are stumbling blocks, just like everything else, and if they have certain myths that you can dispel, you have to do that as the ambassador."

A Native officer in a mainstream police service spoke with pride of his success in mentoring a Native applicant from a reserve and recruiting him into the organization. However, he believed that without employment equity requirements, and with a current practice of recruiting mostly from other police forces in order to save training dollars, the possibilities of doing this in the future are not promising.

(8) Effective approaches to recruiting by police organizations

As suggested above, the use of minority and female officers to do outreach recruitment in First Nations and minority communities, and to girls and young women, was considered an important approach that should be expanded. Outreach needs to involve personal contact and face to face communication between minority and female officers and youth in their communities.

Because many people who enter police work develop their interest in this occupation at a young age, it is also important to begin recruiting when children are still in elementary school. School visits by police officers were mentioned as important influences by many of the officers, and these were activities that many respondents expressed interest in being involved in. It was suggested that working with youth organizations in the community such as Brownies, Girl Guides, Jr. Achievement, Rangers, Native Friendship Centres, and other First Nations and minority youth organizations would be an effective approach to recruitment. Race relations committees and programs for English as a Second Language students might also be fruitful vehicles for recruitment. The use of Native advisors and community liaison staff in police human resource departments was also suggested. VIP and other mentoring and co-op programs that expose youth to police work were cited as effective by many current officers and by members of the applicant pool focus groups, and these programs should be expanded. An additional benefit of this approach is that it helps to develop understanding of, and support for, community policing.

It was recommended that recruiting efforts should focus on racial minority and First Nations women as separate groups; just reaching and recruiting Native and minority men is not enough, particularly given the rarity of minority women in policing at present. An effective approach to recruiting minority and Native women would require police services to make this a priority, and would require them to develop ways of making policing attractive as a career, in order to convince Native and minority women to join. At present there are few role models for First Nations and racial minority women considering careers in policing. A woman who is a First Nations officer in a reserve community was optimistic, however: "If you're giving workshops or presentations at the school, there are a lot of female kids wanting to be police officers."

Participants generally felt that their police organizations were making a sincere effort to recruit more minorities and women. There was praise for the efforts of recruitment and liaison officers. A Native officer stated that "as far as myself, no barriers at all [to getting a position]. It was just there for the taking. If you met the specifications, away you go."

It is important to consider the context for these experiences and perceptions. Many of the younger participants in our study had been recruited into provincial and municipal police services

during the early 90s when employment equity requirements were included in provincial legislation. With these requirements in place, there was a perception that women and minorities were welcome as recruits into policing, and that there were few barriers to entry inherent in the recruitment and selection process. A majority of the women interviewed mentioned that they applied for positions in policing because they knew that services were looking for women applicants. However, these women also had a sense that their levels of education and experience gave them career options, so applying to a police department was one choice among many. In the words of one high-ranking woman officer, "I always had the view that the organization needs me more than I need it."

Since the 1995 election in Ontario, which resulted in the repeal of provincial employment equity legislation, there is a perception of a right-wing shift in public attitudes regarding special measures to recruit and promote women and minorities, and a sense that momentum toward progress may be lost. More discussion of broader issues affecting recruitment is contained in the sections of this report that discuss the culture of policing, and effective approaches to change in police organizations.

(9) Perceived barriers to the participation of racial minorities, First Nations people and women in policing

The requirement to relocate far from the individual's home community was mentioned by many as a barrier to recruiting Natives, racial minorities and women in policing. Another officer mentioned the current strong emphasis on high educational requirements as a barrier; however, most respondents felt that a higher level of education among recruits was beneficial and should be encouraged. A few officers felt that unnecessary physical requirements still existed, and were a barrier to the recruitment of women, including minority women. Women may also be disadvantaged by a tendency in some police services to recruit women who are "tough", who are clones of male recruits, rather than looking more broadly for women who can do the job.

Officers of higher rank cited current provisions in the OPP's collective agreement for hiring retirees from municipal police services as a barrier to recruiting young women and minority members into policing. There has been a large number of retirements from the OPP and other services in recent years and there has been a considerable amount of replacement hiring, presenting the possibility of increasing the diversity of police services through the recruitment process. However, to the extent that retirees are hired instead of investing in youth, in an attempt to save training costs, this opportunity is lost.

The written exam has posed a barrier to entry for some Native applicants. Selection interviews done by one person instead of a panel were also considered a possible barrier to the recruitment of minorities, especially when the interviewers are “corporals and sergeants who still have those racist biases.” It was suggested that the use of an outside agency for hiring might alleviate bias.

Officers generally felt that recruitment should not involve differential standards for different groups of applicants. Everyone should have to pass the exam at the same level; otherwise there would be animosity among officers and the public, and a sense that Natives and minorities who do get hired are brought in because of that, not because of merit. It was recommended that police services work with Native people who desire to enter policing but do not meet the qualifications for entry, in order to help them to qualify.

A few individuals had made several attempts to enter policing before finally being successful. One, a bilingual officer, did not pass the written exam requirements for the OPP or RCMP but was able to enter a municipal service. Two aboriginal women officers described difficulties in passing the vision requirement, but this barrier was ultimately overcome by means of flexibility on the part of police services to which they had applied. Another Native officer was aware of two otherwise excellent aboriginal candidates who were excluded from entering another police force by poor eyesight. Police organizations could deal with such barriers by making efforts to accommodate strong applicants from under-represented groups who have physical limitations that can be overcome through problem-solving.

Respondents were specifically asked about barriers to the recruitment into policing of women who are members of First Nations or racial minorities. The lack of role models was mentioned by many, as was the need to present policing as an attractive career option and to specifically target recruitment efforts toward these groups. For First Nations women, there are also barriers within the community that need to be addressed. A Native officer noted a discrepancy between community notions about women's roles and the requirements of policing, citing an example of a woman chosen as a police officer by her community, but then asked why she was wearing a gun (as required by the Police Services Act). Another Native officer with lengthy experience in policing indicated that he was not aware of any First Nations women who are or have been in the OPP, and indicated that those who occupy decision making positions in First Nations communities had not been pushing for women's entry into mainstream policing. At the same time, the “old boys' network” in mainstream policing continues to discourage both women and aboriginal people.

(10) Job satisfaction in policing

In general, there was a positive attitude among respondents toward their careers in policing, and a high level of satisfaction. A Native officer said, "I'm happy that I'm working, I get up every morning, I have a smile on my face, I go to work and I really truly enjoy my job." A long service officer in the RCMP commented, "The force is still a good organization to join, there is no doubt about it. I would like to see more visible minorities get in and achieve what we never had the opportunity to achieve." However, as we will discuss in the sections of this report that address issues of promotion and the culture of police organizations, these are significant sources of dissatisfaction for many officers who are women and/or members of First Nations or racial minorities.

Mentoring, Career Development and Promotion of Police Officers

(1) Optimism and fears about promotion

For many longer serving minority officers, barriers to promotion were a significant irritant that cast a negative light on their experience with policing as a career. A Black officer with 24 years' service spoke of making efforts to acquire diversified experience in order to make himself eligible for promotion, to no avail. In contrast, younger officers tended to view promotion as a future possibility. Officers with high seniority felt that things were easier for younger minority officers. "Younger officers have opportunities for education, and don't have to stand for this bullshit. They can say I have had enough of the force and can go, but for us back then, we had our lives tied up in the force". An officer who was an immigrant to Canada added that Canadian born younger officers "have become accustomed to the mentality of the Canadians and how to work with them. We had to learn it on the job, and it is very difficult to learn how to be Canadian and a police officer."

Officers with less seniority expressed considerable optimism about career prospects and a more positive view about their experience in policing. One officer explained, "deep down inside I want to show that I can really achieve something, that I can actually be promoted and do something else. I know I can, and that's what's good. So I know if I serve my time, work hard, cross all the t's, dot all the i's, it's possible. When the time comes I'll consider it." A Native woman commented, "After I get good at what I'm doing, I know eventually I'll go for sergeant, and maybe staff sergeant."

However, there were also fears of resentment and backlash from white male officers. In the words of a Black officer, "I know one thing. Once a minority, whether it's a woman or a black or a Chinese or whatever, when it comes to promotion, if I get promoted compared to a few other

guys, the first thing they're going to say is, 'Oh, it must be because you're black.' It must be because you're female." That is something that always happens. There's a girl in my section. She was just selected for a position. Everybody who talked to me said, "Oh, I don't know about this. She's the only female who applied and she got it", and so on. And they're not denying that she's a good officer, but the fact that she's female comes before anything else." Another officer commented, "She was definitely qualified. She's a great officer."

The issue of promotion seemed to be fraught with complexities for these officers. One explained, "promotion can be viewed in two respects. It would be good to be recognized for your skills and your abilities and you can deal with various challenges... but it seems that the backlash that has fallen on some of the women in our department, just because they're women, could fall on us as minorities... So it's almost similar to why people of various ethnic backgrounds don't join the police department, because they're afraid that, yeah, I might be a good police officer just because I'm.. fill in the blank".

Many minority officers expressed the view that management was encouraging and supportive regarding their promotion prospects, but their colleagues would be opposed: "Officers tend to be very critical of decisions that come from the upper ranks, and very cynical of those decisions as well. So even if one were to say, 'We selected Officer Jane Doe because she has rescued 13 children out of a burning bus before it got hit by a train. And she caught all these bad guys. And this and that and the other. There would still be that undertone of, well, she's still a woman. So I think that it would almost work against the organization to actually promote... The more you push that person [woman or black] into higher profile ranks, the more backlash the organization stands to receive because they're doing such promoting. It really is a double-edged sword. You don't want to do too much, but you can't really do enough."

An aboriginal woman officer recounted that her selection as an acting supervisor was soon followed by accusations from her male peers that she was "fooling around with the boss". These false accusations did not surprise her because "a lot of men think that that's the only way females can go up." She continued, "No matter where you go, when you're female, you'll always have to prove yourself. Like I'm getting tired of it."

(2) Perceived barriers to promotion

A younger officer feels that his lack of a university degree will be a barrier to promotion: "right now it seems if you don't have university you can't go anywhere in the hierarchy". However, others

indicated that their police organization would assist them to pursue university courses, and they intended to take advantage of those opportunities.

While police services have changed promotion criteria and practices in recent years to make them more objective, for instance by requiring applicants to take exams, there is still subjectivity due to the use of an interview board, and seniority is weighted quite heavily in some organizations. The result is that promotion is slow, and may present the possibility of bias.

The requirement to relocate is a barrier to Native officers' seeking promotion, because many are reluctant to move, and to move their families, far from their home communities. The same was true of Black officers. The necessity for relocation was questioned.

Other perceived barriers are more subtle and difficult to address. An aboriginal officer believes that aboriginal officers are considered "security risks" and not included in critical incidents because of the assumption that they will reveal strategic plans to the Native community. Another Native officer commented, "if you tend to go with the flow, you're more likely to get promoted, while if you're one of the people who say, 'I don't agree with that,' you're one of the people who's blackballed. And I see some of that going on, where guys get blackballed, just because they voice their opinion. And they're not too far off what everybody else is thinking, but they're the only ones who step up and say, 'No, this is a bunch of crap.'" Another young minority officer indicated that he informs officers with whom he goes out on calls that he won't lie for anyone, so they should behave properly, because he wants to be sure that "fairness is done on the calls I'm with". He feels that perhaps this means that he won't be seen as a "team player", and he will suffer because of it.

A Black officer commented on the perceived importance of fitting in socially as a factor in receiving positive performance evaluations: "I think I had written on my assessment once about me not socializing enough...I had my friends within the Black community who I also have to go and socialize with."

(3) The power of the Old Boys' Network

Both men and women officers referred frequently to the Old Boy's Network (OBN) and its power to punish and reward. In the somewhat ironic words of a younger minority officer. "I think you're either one of the old boys or you're not. You gotta be one of the boys. The older guys, the guys with more experience. And that's how it works. I'm sure that's a fact to do with promotion and stuff like that. You want to be liked, you want to be part of the boy's club, before you're even considered for promotion. ...Most guys play hockey, and I feel kind of left out because I don't play

hockey. Does that mean I can't be a sergeant someday? It shouldn't be a factor, but you never know".

Several Native officers expressed the view that the power of the OBN makes the possibility of promotion slim for officers of aboriginal ancestry because promotion is based upon ties with the Old Boys, and there are no Native people in those networks.

(4) The importance of mentoring and support from supervisors

Several officers with long seniority spoke of promotion and career development as dependent upon whether or not one was lucky enough to have a supportive supervisor. A woman who has risen to a senior rank experienced some support from individual male superior officers when she was a constable, but no support from "the system". A Black officer told of an Inspector who had worked with him when he was a corporal recommending him for an officer candidate program. This involved being placed in variety of positions to get experience. That year they were getting women involved in officer training program, so women were sent to headquarters to get training and the Black officer was sent to a small community where he didn't have access to materials to prepare for the exams. He failed by a point and a half, and felt that he had been put in an area to his disadvantage. After this the supportive officer left, and he was never supported again by another officer.

Mentoring was considered to be of critical importance, and being in the right place at the right time to benefit from mentoring made all the difference to careers. One officer suggested that in the Maritimes some years ago "there was no mentoring, even the people within the force that were assigned as a mentor to teach [new police officers] the ropes ...did not have any interest, at all in helping them. One guy actually left the force because he felt he needed the support and he was making too many mistakes and he eventually got discouraged and left....Recruiting them is one thing but getting them to stay is another". The formal mentoring role of the coach officer is also important to a new recruit. One woman mentioned that she knew of a woman officer who was sexually harassed by her coach officer.

(5) The positive impact of mandatory employment equity on promotion of minorities and women

Several officers, particularly those at higher ranks, mentioned the positive effect that employment equity legislation had on promotion opportunities. A high ranking woman officer noted that prior to the repeal of employment equity in Ontario, decision makers were forced to look at whether there were qualified women available for senior positions. Now, senior management

positions in the organization are filled by older men; the Old Boys' Network is uncontested, and women are experiencing barriers to promotion.

A male officer of aboriginal ancestry explained that he was offered a secondment into the training and recruitment section as a result of employment equity, and had the opportunity to take many courses not usually available to constables. He commented, "I was offered the ball and I ran with it", building his knowledge and seniority. He was encouraged by a senior officer to go for promotion to sergeant, wrote his exam and scored the second highest mark, but was not selected because his seniority and operational experience were not considered high enough. However he had seen individuals with less seniority chosen for promotion. He wondered aloud if the three person interview board that selects those who will be promoted is fair to minority candidates: "you have no idea what is said behind those doors." The experience "left a bitter taste in my mouth", and dampened his ambition to seek promotion. At the final stage, the selection is a subjective process conducted without the participation of minorities. He believes that now, without employment equity, there is nothing to counteract the subjectivity that may result in biased decision making, and no impetus to make police services more representative of the population. Measures to deal with "prejudice" that may still affect the promotion process might include the addition of minority officers to the interview/selection board, or awarding of points to candidates who are members of under-represented groups.

The Culture of Police Organizations

The culture of an organization may include shared meanings attached to behaviour, attitudes regarding people and behaviour, norms, and values. Informal behaviours may also be considered aspects of organizational culture. These behaviours may involve communication as well as practices that are not covered by formal policies and rules, such as socializing on and off the job. The prevailing culture of an organization is shaped by those in positions of power, and by interaction over time among members of dominant peer groups as they respond to the flow of events. There is a tendency for the dominant culture of an organization to support and legitimize the traditional structure of values, norms, opportunities and privileges that prevails within the organization.

A long service officer who is Black summed up his observations of mainstream police culture: "the police force is very political, basically to go along with the name of the game that is being played to get ahead. Your intelligence and your knowledge, at times, means nothing. It's who your friends are, and how well you accept the criticisms that are thrown at you. You do it with a

smile and keep on drinking. You go to all their parties and you're the butt of the jokes, but you take it with a grin and you might succeed, but if you have a mind of your own and are prepared to stand on your own two feet, you will not succeed."

(1) Surviving in the white male police culture

Nearly every respondent described ordeals they had experienced as part of daily life in various mainstream police organizations. In municipal forces, the OPP and the RCMP, these negative experiences were meted out by white male peers and supervisors, and were targeted toward white women, and racial minority and Native women and men, in different ways.

A male officer of Asian ancestry explained, "When I first came on I heard about another Oriental male officer, or two of them, that...didn't make it, or had a hard time within the force. So when I first came on I knew I had boots to fill. I had to prove myself and that was hard. I had a supervisor call me, and he still does call me, 'Oriental guy'...You always want to be doing something so that people aren't watching you, so you don't stand out...When you're first starting they make you nervous...they're right on your back. And I had one sergeant who's known for getting on people's backs. He was on my back for the entire process. That didn't help at all. My self-esteem just went..."

A Native officer – a woman – described how "when I first started, some people would talk about Natives. I'd sit there and I'd say, 'Well, sorry to tell you guys, but I'm Native, and maybe you could keep your judgements to yourself when I'm around. I'd appreciate it.' And then I heard a few rumours where they said the reason I was hired here was because I was native and female."

Being visible – standing out and attracting negative attention – is a significant problem for those who are different from the white male norm. In the white male police culture, difference appears to be associated with assumptions of inadequacy, as well as with stereotyped expectations of all individuals who are perceived as members of a gender or racial category. A Black officer explained, "I find that being a minority, whatever you do sort of stands out for longer....One Black guy gets in trouble. That stays for a long time. Because let's say 10 Caucasian guys get in trouble, but there's a lot of them. ...I know that personally, I have to work hard to achieve beyond average, or if you do just average, you'll be considered lesser. So if you don't try to reach for higher, you don't stand a chance."

(2) Informal social behaviour on the job and socializing off the job

Social events on and off duty were described by many respondents as far from refreshing and pleasant – they were proving grounds in relation to gender and race. A Black officer explained, “If you are going to be accepted by the white community then you’ve got to prove yourself, that you are not a coward. You got to stand up to a lot of nonsense—what kind of guy is he, is he one of the boys, is he going to drink, is he going to party with them”. Another Black officer added, “If you go to a function...everything you say and do is monitored so you cannot even drop your guard. You’re always on the defensive and as a result they don’t know who you are.”

Being marginalized by white male colleagues is equally problematic for some Black officers: “You realize that they change shifts to go out and party that you were not invited”. “There are always parties going on and always getting invited for dinner or for weekends and stuff like that and we are never included.”

(3) Isolation and marginalization of individuals who are women and/or minorities

Several interview participants made poignant comments about the sense of isolation they have felt as individuals within an organizational culture in which they are not accepted for who they are. A Native officer working in a municipal police department did not share this view: he commented, “I really enjoy the camaraderie of my fellow officers.” However, other Native and racial minority as well as female officers feel that they cannot be themselves with fellow officers, and that they have no support system within the organization.

A long service officer who is Black commented: “The least acceptance that I feel is within the police community. My Black community has accepted me, they look at me as a role model. The community in general look at you as a police officer. Within the police community, that is really where the problem is.” Another Black officer added, “Most police officers are narrow minded, they have strong views, and to combat that is... really, one person can’t do it all. It will take generations to curtail the way things are now. Minorities are just starting to get a foothold” .

Native officers in mainstream police organizations spoke of the difficulties of maintaining one’s identity and sense of self within an unsupportive and isolating environment. One opinion was that Native officers, “when they get into that old boy’s system, they lose track of who they are. They lose their identity somewhere, and that’s something I’m struggling hard with...not to lose track of who we are.” A senior officer commented about Native officers in municipal forces, “it takes a lot of guts to march to a different drummer”.

For most women and members of racial minorities, the only and most significant support system is the family, including parents who are proud of their career, as well as partners and children. For some women, since their numbers have begun to inch upward, there is support and relaxation in informal networks and social groups of women who meet from time to time. Most women in policing, however, are quick to dissociate themselves from the “feminist” label.

The Black Law Enforcers Association is also a source of support and pride for its members in the Toronto area. There was no mention of a supportive association or informal group involving Native officers or those of Asian ancestry.

When asked about the role of the Police Association (police officers’ union), all respondents with the exception of one woman indicated that they received little or no support from this source. Indeed, this organization’s culture appears to underlie and reinforce the white male culture of the police organization itself.

Respondents who mentioned deriving support from a formal or informal association of women also noted the hostility with which their gatherings are viewed by male peers. A Black officer mentioned that even a casual conversation among a group of Black officers in a hallway seemed to be seen as threatening by white officers. Police organizations – beginning with those in leadership positions – should make clear their support for women’s and minorities’ networks and organizations.

(4) Attitudes toward employment equity

The dominant culture of police organizations appears to include an attitude of hostility and resistance to mandatory employment equity, accompanied by assumptions that women and minorities are not qualified to be police officers, particularly if their entry into the organization occurs in a context of mandatory employment equity. Some women and persons of Native ancestry who were hired by police services during active employment equity initiatives believed that they had been hired only because of employment equity.

However, in looking at the overall representation of minorities and women rather than at individual cases, some minority officers saw little impact of employment equity, despite the widespread hostility toward it: “When I went to (police) college it was supposed to be the time of employment equity...A lot of people, when they were hiring and asking for minorities, they cried out loud, ‘Reverse discrimination!’... And a lot of them would come up to me, ‘Oh you were hired because you were Black.... And when I went to college, even though it was employment equity, there were ten minorities, and that’s including four females, out of 310. But yet, it was employment

equity...One of my instructors pointed it out. He said, 'you guys are all saying that employment equity is not fair. Look around you.' Everybody looked around them. I was the only Black in my class. You know they're arguing it's reverse discrimination, but yet, the end result, who was hired? Still the same thing as before. The only difference I'd have to say is, there were more women, that was the only thing. But minority-wise, you don't see them anywhere."

Employment equity did not result in large changes in numerical representation of women and minorities. In response to a question about the representation of minority women, a respondent indicated that "there were only two of them in the whole college." An Asian officer noted, "at college I was the only Oriental male there". A young Black officer commented, "there's been about four or five black officers... and there's 300 officers" in the service. Yet there has been a lot of backlash.

There is a need for training in police organizations at large to counteract the myths about employment equity by providing accurate information.

Strategies and Prospects for Change in Mainstream Police Organizations

There was strong recognition of the need for change in police organizations among respondents, together with a conviction that change is indeed happening, and a sense of optimism that progressive change will continue to occur as new leadership and younger, better educated officers take their places in police organizations. In particular, there was a sense shared by high ranking officers and more recent recruits that police organizations need to find ways to encourage and support independent thought and openness to organizational change and diversity in members of police services. A younger racial minority officer summed up his analysis as follows:

"In terms of negative experiences...I think it's just a case of supervisory, administrative sorts of things. ...Yes, it is a paramilitary organization with rank and order and all that sort of stuff, and there's a set regimen that you're supposed to follow. But I think the downside of the set order and having to follow things is that sometimes it can inhibit your own get-out-and -get-there, dig-a-little-deeper sort of thing. Like sometimes you might look at a situation from a particular perspective that...other officers wouldn't. And that's not to say that they're lacking in something. It's maybe because of your biology, or your investigative background or your communication skills, that you'll look at something a little differently, but that's not what they want. It's not necessarily the independent thought which is fostered and encouraged...It's just more of a get in, service the need, and leave... Sometimes I've found that what I would like to do or how I would like to handle something isn't necessarily the way that your supervisors or administrators would like me to handle the situation. How they want results and how I can achieve results sometimes aren't necessarily running parallel."

(1) Barriers to change

Lack of diversity in the mainstream police organizations because of cloning of middle level decision makers through the recruitment and promotion processes is perceived as a fundamental barrier to change. A young racial minority officer explained, "Until such time as more people of varying ethnic origins are hired, and they spend time on the department, maybe a few are promoted, maybe a few within neighboring police services, some transfers, this sort of thing, the department from an administrative standpoint will just sort of run the same course. I'm not necessarily saying that this is a bad thing, but when somebody doesn't have the same type of cultural experience as someone who has traveled to different places in the world, been a part of different things, until such time as somebody is able to have that sort of cultural understanding, and is able to go out and recognize [that someone from a different culture is] a real crackerjack, and that person is worthy of being promoted... Until such time as people are able to recognize those unique character attributes of people, or cultural attributes, it'll be the same old song and dance...It's just time in my opinion".

Several participants pointed out that it is not enough to recruit and promote women and minorities, if those who are brought in think like those who perpetuate the traditional culture of policing, or if they must conform to traditional norms of police organizations just to survive. Not merely women, but feminist women, together with Native people and racial minorities who understand and identify with their communities, and who are progressive in their thinking and willing to "break the brotherhood code", are needed if police organizations are to change. Evidently police services do not screen or select for these qualities when they hire and promote, so the perpetuation of traditional thinking may be a persisting pattern.

(2) Prospects for change

Several respondents indicated that participating in studies such as this, and being asked by senior officers to give their perspectives on problems of diversity and change, are among the signals that change is taking place: "Personally, it is one of the greatest opportunities to be able to speak out and say something for the minorities."

Organizational support for diversity, particularly the new anti-racism policy, and disciplinary action to enforce it, were considered important in creating change: "People think twice about discriminating when they know there will be enforcement". Recently initiated programs of Native cultural awareness for officers were mentioned both by aboriginal officers and by officers of high rank as promising steps toward change.

Turnover – the retirement of older officers and the hiring of young and better educated recruits – was mentioned by most respondents as a significant force for change. In parallel, it is important to facilitate the promotion of younger officers with fresh ideas. However, progress toward promotion is slow in today's climate. Barriers to promotion were cited both by minority officers and by officers of high rank as important impediments to broad organizational change, because change requires new leadership.

Leadership that supports change and diversity is considered one of the most important ingredients of progressive change. Many respondents expressed enthusiasm for the appointment of Chief Commissioner Gwen Boniface (OPP), and for recent promotions of women and minorities to the rank of sergeant in several police services. However, an officer of aboriginal ancestry noted that sergeants are not in a position to make change: "your hands are tied – you are looking up the ranks because your future depends of them. Only if you get into the senior officer ranks can you make a difference."

However, several participants recognized that fresh leadership alone cannot work miracles: "The problem is so deep and systemic that it is hard to eradicate and to...bring about change. It is one thing for the Commissioner to say this is what we want in those nice words [ie improve the representation of under-represented groups], which is what they want at the higher level, but what's happening at the management level and the supervisor level?" Several respondents, including officers of senior rank, noted that progress toward greater diversity throughout the ranks of police services will be harder to attain in the absence of mandatory employment equity requirements. During the short period that these were in effect in Ontario, there was some progress in recruiting and promoting women and minorities in police organizations. Although the RCMP is still subject to employment equity, there is now stagnation in the provincial and municipal environment, and the challenge is to make change survive in difficult times.

A Native officer's view is that "change can only come from outside, and has to be mandated." A Black officer suggested that "the change has to come from the government; the government has to set an example." Another noted that "outside pressure" is an effective stimulant to change, and that "going outside" is a strategy that minorities inside police organizations have rarely used because of the high risk involved. It would take willingness to support each other to make such a strategy successful. A senior officer in a municipal force commented on the role of police boards and the community in supporting change.

The participants in the study were under no illusions about the difficulty of bringing about change: "I think that nothing is going to be fixed overnight...It's going to take time, and people are

just going to have to understand that they should recognize the cultural diversities and intellectual diversities within their own departments. Sure, we all wear the same uniform... but even though we are all officers, we are all individuals too, with different backgrounds and understandings of things. And if there is any way that a department or organization can tap into those things, the whole organization will be much richer for being able to tap the energies that lie within a person".

References

Statistics Canada, The Daily, Tues. May 12, 1998, "1996 Census: Sources of income, earnings and total income, and family income," <http://www.statscan.ca/Daily/English/980512>.

Swol, Karen. "Private Security and Public Policing in Canada," Statistics Canada: Juristat, Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics, catalogue no. 85-002-XIE Vol. 18 no. 13.

APPENDIX: PROTOCOL FOR FOCUS GROUPS

A. Focus Groups: First Wave -- "Applicant Pool"

1. Welcome and introductions

FACILITATORS ARRIVE 1/2 HOUR BEFORE THE SESSION STARTS. SET UP THE TABLE WITH SEATING ALL AROUND, PENCILS AND PAPER, AND REFRESHMENTS. SET UP AND TEST THE TAPE RECORDER.

GREET EACH PARTICIPANT AS THEY ARRIVE. HELP THEM FIND A PLACE FOR COATS AND TO HELP THEMSELVES TO REFRESHMENTS.
BEGIN AT THE APPOINTED TIME.

Welcome to our focus group, and thank you for taking the time to assist us in our research on policing as a career. We are collecting information from several sources for this study. There is a survey of 14 police services across Canada which is starting this month. In addition, we are interested in the perspectives of people participating in a number of focus groups like this one. The research deals with things that police services are doing, or could do, to provide more opportunities for members of First Nations, members of racial minorities, and women of all groups. As you know, the question of how police services can become more representative of the communities they serve is getting a lot of attention these days. Our research is designed to better understand the various perspectives on why and how people consider policing as a career, and on their experience with career progression once they accept employment with a police service.

Our research team includes Prof. Harish Jain of the School of Business at McMaster, and others who are assisting him at Mac. Here at Western, the project is being coordinated by Prof. Carol Agocs in Political Science, with the assistance of Mike Foster and Chris Moise.

The purpose of our discussion today is to learn your perspectives on policing as a career. I will be asking you to discuss a few general questions about this topic. The discussion will last until [time]. Of course you are free to leave the room at any time you choose.

If you agree, we will tape record the discussion so that we can use the results for our research. In addition, Chris will be taking some notes.

We have a few ground rules for the session.

First, we would ask you to agree that what is said in this room, stays in the room – we want everyone to feel comfortable with being candid. These sessions are confidential, in the sense that no names of individuals are attached to the information.

Second, we all need to realize that while there may be some similarities in experience and perspective among participants, we will find that members of the group will differ as well. There are no right or wrong answers to any of the questions you are asked to talk about – we are not looking for any particular answers or viewpoints. The purpose of the discussion is to provide a chance for everyone to speak and to listen – the contribution of each person is needed and will help to make the focus group a good source of information for us, and an interesting learning experience for you. We hope you will enjoy the experience.

Will it be ok with you if we tape record the discussion?
[If anyone says NO, don't tape it: take notes only]

2. Discussion questions

1. Let's go around the table and get acquainted a bit. Would you please briefly introduce yourself and tell us about where you're from, what program of study you are in, and what your thoughts are about what kind of career or work you might like to pursue.

2. Please use the pencil and paper you have before you to jot down some words that come to mind when I say the phrase, "being a police officer". What do you think of in connection with the idea of being a police officer?

Now let's see what came to your minds? [Name], would you mind getting us started?

Have you had any experiences with policing that have influenced your ideas and feelings?

3. Do you have any personal experience with policing as a job, or do you have relatives, friends or professional associates who are police officers?

What impressions have you formed about policing, based on what you know about their experience?

Are these individuals you know who have policing experience from the same community or background as you?

4. Have you ever considered policing as a career for yourself? Why or why not?

Have you ever applied for a job in a police organization? What happened?

5. Police organizations are getting a strong message these days that they need to become more representative of the community — they need to do more to attract and retain people from groups that are under-represented in policing at the present time.

Is there anything that police organizations could do to make policing more attractive as a career for yourself or for others who share a similar background? [or, for members of First Nations/ racial minorities/ women, as applicable]

Are you aware of anything that might be a barrier to attracting more [women; members of racial minority groups; members of First Nations; etc.] to work in policing?

3. Closing

Thank you very much for your participation. This has been a thoughtful discussion, and the perspectives and experiences you contributed will be very helpful to our study. We hope you have gained something from the experience of participating, as well.

Let me remind you that we agreed that what was said in the room stays here when we leave. This is important in order to protect the confidentiality of all of you, and also to avoid the possibility of influencing others who might participate in one of our focus groups in the future.

If in the future you would like information on the results of the study, please feel free to get in touch with Prof. Carol Agocs at Western. Her phone is 679-2111, ext. 4937 or 3266.

Thanks again!

B. Protocol for Focus Groups: Second Wave -- Serving Officers

1. Welcome and introductions:

FACILITATORS ARRIVE 1/2 HOUR BEFORE THE SESSION STARTS. SET UP THE TABLE WITH SEATING ALL AROUND, PENCILS AND PAPER, AND REFRESHMENTS. SET UP AND TEST THE TAPE RECORDER. HAVE 4x6 CARDS TO MAKE NAME TAGS, AND CA BUSINESS CARDS, AVAILABLE.

GREET EACH PARTICIPANT AS THEY ARRIVE. HELP THEM FIND A PLACE FOR COATS AND TO HELP THEMSELVES TO REFRESHMENTS.

Welcome to our focus group, and thank you for taking the time to assist us in our research on policing as a career. We are collecting information from several sources for this study, which is partially funded by the Canadian Centre for Police Race Relations. There is a survey of 14 police services across Canada which started in the spring. In addition, we are interested in the perspectives of people participating in a number of focus groups like this one.

The research deals with things that police services are doing, or could do, to provide more opportunities for members of First Nations, members of racial minorities, and women of all groups. As you know, the question of how police services can become more representative of the communities they serve is getting a lot of attention these days. Our research is designed to better understand the various perspectives on why and how people consider policing as a career, and on their experience with career progression once they accept employment with a police service. We hope that the results of this research will help police services to do a better job of recruiting and advancement for under-represented groups.

Our research team includes Prof. Harish Jain of the School of Business at McMaster, and others who are assisting him at Mac. Here at Western, the project is being coordinated by Prof. Carol Agocs in Political Science, with the assistance of Mike Foster.

The purpose of our discussion today is to learn your perspectives on policing as a career, based on your experience and thinking. I will be asking you to discuss a few general questions about this topic. The discussion will last until [time]. Of course you are free to leave the room at any time you choose.

If you agree, we will tape record the discussion so that we can use the results for our research. In addition, Mike will be taking some notes.

We have a few ground rules for the session.

First, we would ask you to agree that what is said in this room, stays in the room – we want everyone to feel comfortable with being candid. These sessions are confidential, in the sense that no names of individuals are attached to the information.

Second, we all need to realize that while there may be some similarities in experience and perspective among participants, we will find that members of the group will differ as well. There are no right or wrong answers to any of the questions you are asked to talk about – we are not looking for any particular answers or viewpoints. The purpose of the discussion is to provide a chance for everyone to speak and to listen – the contribution of each person is needed and will help to make

the focus group a good source of information for us, and an interesting learning experience for you. We hope you will enjoy the experience.

Will it be ok with you if we tape record the discussion?
[If anyone says NO, don't tape it: take notes only]

2. Discussion questions

1. Let's go around the table and get acquainted a bit. Would you please briefly introduce yourself and tell us about where you're from, what police service and function you are in, and how long you have been in law enforcement.

2. What were the key influences on your decision to become a police officer? What persuaded you to try policing as a career?
Did you know, or were you influenced by, women [or members of your own community] who were serving as police officers?

3. Please think back to the time when you decided to enter law enforcement as a career. Use the pencil and paper you have before you to jot down some words that capture your expectations at that time about policing or law enforcement as a career. Now let's see what came to your minds? [Name], would you mind getting us started?
What do you consider to be the advantages of policing as a career?

4. Now let's compare the reality of your experience as a police officer with your expectations. Has policing turned out to be what you thought it would be like as a career? Are your hopes and expectations about policing as a career being fulfilled?
What barriers have you seen or experienced that particularly get in the way of career development for [women, racial minorities, Native people] in policing?

5. If through this study you could speak directly to chiefs and other decision makers, what would you tell them?
What should they keep on doing to improve the representation of minorities in law enforcement?
What should they stop doing? Begin to do?
How receptive do you think the chiefs and other decision- makers will be to this advice?
Do you think that studies like this make any difference?

3. Closing

Thank you very much for your participation. This has been a thoughtful discussion, and the perspectives and experiences you contributed will be very helpful to our study. We hope you have gained something from the experience of participating, as well.

Let me remind you that we agreed that what was said in the room stays here when we leave. This is important in order to protect the confidentiality of all of you, and also to avoid the possibility of influencing others who might participate in one of our focus groups in the future.

If in the future you would like information on the results of the study, please feel free to get in touch with Prof. Carol Agocs at Western. Her phone is 679-2111, ext. 4937 or 3266.

Faculty of Business
McMaster University

WORKING PAPERS - RECENT RELEASES

407. Ali R. Montazemi and Kalyan Moy Gupta, "A Framework for Retrieval in Case-Based Reasoning Systems", June, 1995.
408. Ali R. Montazemi and Kalyan Moy Gupta, "An Adaptive Agent for Case Description in Diagnostic CBR Systems", June, 1995.
409. Roy J. Adams, Noel Cowell and Gangaram Singh, "The Making of Industrial Relations in the Commonwealth Caribbean", June, 1995.
410. Jiang Chen and George Steiner, "Approximation Methods for Discrete Lot Streaming in Flow Shops", June, 1995.
411. Harish C. Jain and S. Muthuchidambaram, "Bill 40 Amendments to Ontario Labour Relations Act: An Overview and Evaluation", June, 1995.
412. Jiang Chan and George Steiner, "Discrete Lot Streaming in Three-Machine Flow Shops", July, 1995.
413. J. Brimberg, A. Mehrez and G.O. Wesolowsky, "Allocation of Queueing Facilities Using a Minimax Criterion", January, 1996.
414. Isik Zeytinoglu and Jeanne Norris, "Global Diversity in Employment Relationships: A Typology of Flexible Employment", March, 1996.
415. N. Archer, "Characterizing World Wide Web Search Strategies", April, 1996.
416. J. Rose, "Immediacy and Saliency in Remediating Employer Opposition to Union Organizing Campaigns", July, 1996.
417. Roy J. Adams and Parbudyal Singh, "Worker Rights Under NAFTA: Experience With the North American Agreement on Labor Cooperation", September, 1996.
418. George Steiner and Paul Stephenson, "Subset-Restricted Interchange for Dynamic Min-Max Scheduling Problems", September, 1996.
419. Robert F. Love and Halit Uster, "Comparison of the Properties and the Performance of the Criteria Used to Evaluate the Accuracy of Distance Predicting Functions", November, 1996.

Innis Ref.

HB

74.5

.R47

no. 435