Elements of Anti-racist Early Childhood Education: A Literature Review

Umair Majid
Damsadie Hannedige
Prerna Sharma
Pooja Patel

Contents

Executive Summary

The primary objective of this research was to identify the elements and characteristics of anti-racist/bias frameworks for early childhood education. The research question was: What are the elements of (or considerations for) an anti-racist early childhood education?

We conducted a literature review of academic articles and grey literature documents (i.e., policies and frameworks adopted by school boards) and found 22 articles that we analyzed in this report. In the findings section, we discuss two ideas: (1) perceptions and influences, and (2) administrative and classroom factors.

In the first section (learning and influences), we discuss how students and educators learn anti-racism and factors that influence these understandings. We found three themes that captured how perceptions influenced the development and implementation of anti-racist early childhood education: learning racism, creating awareness, and social constructions and identities. Both academic and grey literature articles emphasized the importance of ensuring that anti-racist curricula include teaching methods that expose students to how racism is embedded in policies and structures." Furthermore, articles emphasized the importance of creating awareness of anti-racist early childhood education, especially since children assign racialized meanings at a young age. For this reason, the literature suggests that educators engage students in recognizing labels and stereotypes that may influence attitudes and behaviors. The first section also found the following influencing factors: influence of family and educators on students, the influence of educators on each other, and the influence of media on students and educators.

In the second section (administrative and classroom factors), we discuss several considerations for developing and implementing anti-racist early childhood education: creating anti-racist policies; educator awareness; resources, training, and tools for educators; partnerships between family and educators, addressing racism by developing skills in children; and classroom practices.

Based on these findings, we suggest three priority recommendations for Stoney Creek Montessori to consider as steps towards developing and implementing anti-racist framework for early childhood education:
1. Creating space for discussion and self-reflection
2. Striving to make curricula more accessible and accommodating
3. Engaging people at the right time and in the most appropriate ways

Introduction

Overview: This report has been prepared by Research Associates from the McMaster Research Shop at the request of Stoney Creek Montessori School. Montessori schools believe in fostering children's independence and exploration. With the growing popularity of the Montessori curriculum, many parents in Ontario enrol their children into Montessori Schools, with over 20 facilities offering Montessori curriculum in Hamilton. Montessori Schools also strive to create diverse and inclusive environments for their students. Towards this goal, Stoney Creek Montessori perceives a need for research on an anti-racist framework for early childhood education in Hamilton that could be shared with educators. Stoney Creek Montessori approached the Office of Community Engagement at McMaster University with an interest in researching the elements of anti-racist early childhood education. This report reviews the academic and grey literature from North America to identify and support the development of an anti-racist education framework. The research question for this literature review was: What are the elements of (or considerations for) an anti-racist early childhood education?

Scope: We conducted a literature review of academic (i.e., published anti-racist frameworks or guides) and grey literature (i.e., policies and frameworks developed by school boards) that identified the elements or characteristics of anti-racist/bias early childhood education in North America. We reviewed nine academic articles and 13 grey literature documents in this report.

Terms: In this report, we refer to "anti-bias education" as a teaching and learning approach that aims to create an environment in which every child feels safe and is supported as they develop their social identities. "Anti-racist education" is a similar concept that we identify as focusing on race as the main point of discussion to address issues of equity and justice in the classroom (Derman-Sparks & Edwards 2019; Escayg, 2019). We use anti-racist education as the primary term in this report. We note differences between the concepts where necessary.

Organization: The report is organized in the following way:
- **Background**: This section introduces anti-bias and anti-racist education, discusses the philosophy and approach of Montessori schools, and provides the rationale and objectives for this research.

- **Methods and Limitations**: This section describes our approach to searching for academic articles and grey literature documents that identify the elements of anti-racist/bias education.

- **Findings**: This section provides a summary of our findings, which were divided into the following two sections:
    - Learning and Influences: We discuss how students and educators learn and understand anti-racism. We also identify the role that the media plays in promoting racism and discrimination in the classroom.

- o <u>Administrative and Classroom Factors</u>: We discuss various considerations for developing and implementing anti-racist early childhood education: creating anti-racist policies; educator awareness; resources, training, and tools for educators; partnerships between family and educators; addressing racism by developing skills in children; and classroom practices.

- **Recommendations**: Reflecting on our findings, we suggest the following three recommendations for the development and implementation of anti-racist frameworks in early childhood education:
    - o Creating space for discussion and self-reflection
    - o Striving to make curricula more accessible and accommodating
    - o Engaging people at the right time and in the most appropriate ways

Background

Anti-Racist Education

In 1997, Katz and Kofkin conducted a study that concluded infants could categorize individuals by race and gender as early as six months of age. Other studies have found that children between the ages of three and five can distinguish individuals by race, and often also express biased behaviour (Winkler, 2019). Given these findings, an anti-racist approach to early childhood education (ECE) – designed for children up to the age of six – is especially important, to reduce potential negative racist concepts that may develop at a young age and persist through to adulthood.

As related but nuanced concepts, it's important to distinguish between an "anti-bias" education and an "anti-racist" education:

- **Anti-bias education** aims to create an environment in which every child feels safe and is supported as they develop their identities (Derman-Sparks & Edwards 2019). Specifically, it is about helping children feel empowered and confident. At its core, anti-bias education has four goals: identity, diversity, justice, and activism (Derman-Sparks & Edwards 2019). Anti-bias education starts with helping children develop positive social *identities* and learn respectful language when speaking to others (Derman-Sparks & Edwards 2019). The second goal (diversity) is to help each child feel comfortable and be empathetic when interacting with individuals from different cultures (Derman-Sparks & Edwards 2019). Next (justice), anti-bias education helps children recognize hurtful languages and identify bias (Derman-Sparks & Edwards 2019). Lastly (activism), an anti-bias education helps each child to gain confidence to act against discrimination (Derman-Sparks & Edwards 2019). Anti-bias education helps children develop and recognize various social identities including class, race, gender, and ability while instilling empowerment (Escayg, 2019).
- **Anti-racist education** further supports children by creating equitable classroom environments. Anti-racist education falls under the umbrella of anti-bias education; however, the distinction between the two concepts is that an anti-racist education focuses on race as the main point of discussion to address issues of equity and justice (Escayg, 2019). Anti-racist education recognizes that racism is prevalent and is embedded in all institutions including the education system (Escayg, 2019). Specifically, it puts an emphasis on raising cultural awareness about racial minorities and educating students about racist beliefs and structures (Escayg, 2019).

Montessori Schools

ECE focuses on the formal and informal education of children under the age of six. The curriculum is designed to enhance children's development and prepare them for personal and academic success. ECE can be provided by public or private institutions

such as nurseries, kindergarten schools, daycare, and Montessori schools. The curriculum varies between institutions depending on the age group, teaching strategies, and government policies.

Montessori schools believe in fostering children's independence and exploration. Developed in the early twentieth century by Dr. Maria Montessori, the Montessori curriculum focuses on active learning, allowing children to engage with the curriculum (Meinke, 2019). The classroom varies from the traditional classroom by having a prepared environment with activities laid out according to the learning area, supportive guides, and learning goals that adjust based on individual needs and interests (Stoney Creek Montessori, 2021). Self-guided learning promotes cognitive, social, emotional, and physical growth in children. The program is divided into two levels, toddler (18 months to 3 years) and Casa (3 to 6 years) (Stoney Creek Montessori, 2021).

With the growing popularity of the Montessori curriculum, many parents in Ontario enrol their children into Montessori Schools. There are over 20 facilities offering Montessori curriculum within Hamilton, Ontario. Hamilton is a diverse city with a population of around 750,000 (Statistics Canada, 2016). In 2016, 17.7% of the Hamilton population was a visible minority, with 4.2% being South Asian, 3.3% being Black, 1.9% Chinese, and 1.7% Arab. This statistic does not include the Indigenous community which makes up 2% of the total population of Hamilton (Statistics Canada, 2016). In 2020, the Government of Ontario proposed anti-racist laws such as Bill 197 which prohibited discretionary suspensions for students from kindergarten to Grade 3, promoting a safe learning environment for all students (Office of the Premier, 2020). However, while there have been external pressures to promote anti-racist education, there is a knowledge and practice gap in how community institutions, like Montessori schools, can amend past practices that can amend past practices that may unintentionally reinforce racism and bias in children. Developing an anti-racist framework for ECE may address this gap by serving as a guide for curricula design and classroom teaching practices.

Objectives and Rationale

Despite decades of research on ECE, the literature lacks guidance on anti-racist teaching and learning practices for ECE educators in North America and more specifically in the context of Montessori education. To help resolve this knowledge gap, this research project seeks to investigate the elements or characteristics of anti-racist frameworks for ECE that can inform teaching methods and practices. Specifically, the research question of this report is: *What are the elements of an anti-racist early childhood education?*

This research focuses on anti-racist and anti-bias ECE because of the compatibility between the two concepts. Likewise, this report does not focus on other terms that may be like anti-racist ECE, such as cultural diversity, multiculturalism, and cultural competency due to a lack of consensus on the compatibility of these terms with the goals of anti-racist and anti-bias education, i.e., by centering structural biases and racism at the forefront of policy change (Koubeissy, 2020). Our key research objectives

include identifying elements in anti-racist ECE in North America using existing literature following a literature review format. The knowledge from this work will be used to develop a future guide for early childhood educators in Hamilton, Canada, which will enable incorporating an anti-racist framework into teaching; and inform education and training efforts at institutions that work with educators.

Methods and Limitations

Searching for Literature

First, we performed an informal search of articles on anti-racist ECE on Google Scholar and Google.com, which led to three articles on the elements of anti-racist ECE. Then, we conducted a search for published academic articles in ERIC and the Social Sciences Citation Index of the Web of Science on June 5, 2021. At least two reviewers screened through each article using Covidence. We excluded articles that did not explicitly outline "elements," "principles," or "components," etc., of an anti-bias or anti-racist ECE, instead focusing on those with practical application for educators.

To find grey literature, we searched eight of the largest and most diverse provinces in Canada (British Columbia, Ontario, Alberta, Quebec, Nova Scotia, Manitoba, Saskatchewan, and Newfoundland), using the eligibility of the academic database search. Each team member searched for school boards or organizations in each province and reviewed their website for documents related to anti-racist or anti-bias education.

Search Results

We screened 1170 titles and abstract and excluded 1030 because they were not practically relevant (e.g., discussed theories, concepts, or interventions). We reviewed the full articles of 129 studies and excluded 120 primarily because we wanted to focus on articles that specifically used anti-racist or anti-bias concepts in their article. From the academic search, we analyzed nine articles. We have provided a summary of articles that we excluded from this report in the Appendix.

From the grey literature, we found 65 school boards/organizations from British Columbia, 36 from Ontario, 73 from Quebec, 42 from Alberta, 8 from Nova Scotia, 40 from Manitoba, 17 from Saskatchewan, and 5 from Newfoundland. We reviewed the websites of each school board/organization and found 13 documents that discussed elements or characteristics of anti-racist/bias education. Documents were a mixture of policy briefs and teaching and learning tools developed by school boards/organizations. In total, we found 3 documents from British Columbian school boards/organizations, 5 from Ontario, 1 from Quebec, 2 from Alberta, 1 from Manitoba, and 1 from Nova Scotia. No documents were found from Newfoundland or Saskatchewan.

Analysis

We used thematic analysis that involved a staged-coding process with the following steps: pilot coding of two articles, initial coding all included articles, and then focused coding and writing narrative summaries. In the pilot coding, we reviewed two articles as a team to develop consensus on the most important themes and concepts present in the literature. We developed a preliminary coding schema outlining our initial understanding of the literature. This schema was reviewed by the community partner before starting the initial coding. We developed two analysis templates to organize our analysis: perceptions and influence, and administrative factors and strategies. We then analyzed all included articles, specifically noting any differences we wanted to make to our preliminary coding schema. We met again at the end of initial coding to refine the coding schema. Finally, using the final coding schema, each team member reviewed all coding for a theme and developed a narrative summary summarizing its codes. The lead author then reviewed all narrative summaries and compiled them into one findings section.

Limitations

Our academic database search specified studies published in Canada and the United States. There may be literature published in the UK, Australia, and other countries offering important insight on the elements of anti-racist ECE. Similarly, our grey literature search primarily focused on studies published by Canadian institutions, authorities, and organizations. There may be literature published by organizations in the United States that has been missed in our search. Future research might consider broadening the search to include multiple countries.

Findings

Our findings are divided into the following two sections: perceptions and influences, and administrative and classroom factors. In the first section, we explore how students and educators learn and understand anti-racism. We also identify different influences that can contribute to positive or negative perceptions of anti-racist ECE. In the second section, we describe various administrative and classroom factors involved in creating anti-racist ECE such as the following: policies, training and tools, awareness, partnerships, skill development in children, and classroom practices.

Learning and Influences

Learning and Understanding Anti-Racism
Aiding students and educators to confront internalized biases is essential for implementing anti-racist ECE. In this section, we found three key themes following our review of the literature: learning racism, creating awareness, and social constructions and identities.

In the first theme (*learning racism)*, the included literature demonstrated the importance of helping students learn, understand, and communicate elements of racism such as experiencing unfairness (Derman-Sparks, 2011). Another aspect of learning about anti-racism was promoting and representing all identities and races in classroom discussions. For example, to facilitate learning racism, an anti-racism policy by the Peel District School Board suggested adopting curricula that promoted anti-racism with a specific approach (Peel District School Board, 2021). By promoting diversity, inclusion, and anti-racism, ECE may correct misinformation that children may have learnt about themselves or others (Nganga, 2015).

The second theme highlighted the importance of *creating awareness* of racism in ECE. Derman-Sparks (2011) pointed to the need to recognize elements of social identity to enhance our understanding of racism and anti-bias education. It is especially important to create awareness in ECE since some research shows that children assign racialized meanings to people who may look different from them at a young age (Escayg, 2019). Further, a governance policy by the Board of Education of School District No. 46 (2021) highlighted the importance of considering how racism was not only harmful to those directly affected but to all students, staff, families, and community members.

In the final theme (*social constructions, social identities, and stereotypes*), the included literature suggested recognizing how labels and stereotypes influenced both students and educators (Derman-Sparks, 2011). Such labels and stereotypes may relate to social constructions surrounding the white race. Escayg (2019) emphasized that Whiteness needed to be addressed in anti-bias education instead of being ignored or denied, as notions of white superiority may enable an internalized superiority in white children. Wynter-Hoyte (2020) provided further support to these ideas by suggesting that white students can internalize anti-black messages that indirectly promote white supremacy, which can lead to racist tendencies. On the other hand, anti-bias education can contribute to developing the social identity of children that is inclusive of a range of peoples and cultures (Escayg, 2019). For example, "children construct their identities based on what they see and hear" and specifically related to racial identity development through "their experience, especially how they are treated by the society" (Nganga, 2015, p. 2). Young children's social identity can be adversely affected if they notice differential treatment towards theme based on their race (Nganga, 2015). Furthermore, cultural information received from classroom and home environments can conflict; it is essential for educators to reduce cultural misinformation that could hinder positive social and racial identity development by promoting discussions in an anti-bias classroom environment (Nganga, 2015).

Influencing Factors
Influencing factors include those that influence the views, behaviours, and experiences of students and educators with racism and anti-racism. In this category, we found the following two themes: the influence of family and educators on students, the influence of educators on each other, and the influence of media on students and educators. In the first and second themes (*influence of family and educators on students, and the influence of educators on each other*), Derman-Sparks (2011) pointed to various

sociocultural influences from families, environment, and educators that can affect the perceptions of children towards anti-racism. Furthermore, as children interacted with family members, they learned actions or spoken words, and internalized values held by these individuals which influenced children's attitudes and conceptions about racism (Nganga, 2015; Derman-Sparks, 2011). From the educator's perspective, the literature suggested that sharing experiences and facilitating discussions related to racism and anti-racism among colleagues while also involving family can be helpful for implementing anti-racist ECE (Lin et al., 2008).

The second theme (*the influence of media on students and educators*) identified the influence of other sociocultural factors. Firstly, the influence of media and other materials (mainstream culture, books) was found to affect the perspectives and experiences of children with racism (Ecole Bancroft School, n.d.; Notari-Syverson, 2003; Wynter-Hoyte, 2020). Two studies suggested the consideration and selection of appropriate materials to share with students (Notari-Syverson, 2003; Wynter-Hoyte, 2020). Secondly, the influence of a 'dominant group' culture was found to be important. Escayg (2019) highlighted that a dominant group can influence the way whiteness or blackness is defined and this tends to favour white privilege, power, and supremacy. Further, whiteness offers benefits to the dominant group; Escayg (2019) suggested that the benefits attributed to whiteness are not well-recognized in anti-bias education.

Administrative and Classroom Factors

In this section, we discuss the following administrative and classroom factors that contributed to anti-racist ECE: creating anti-racist policies; educator awareness; resources, training, and tools for educators; partnerships between family and educators, addressing racism by developing skills in children; and classroom practices.

Creating Anti-Racist Policies
To establish an equitable and anti-racist education system, there is need for significant administrative change, but there is a lack of anti-racist early childhood policies at a national level (Escayg, 2019). Educational systems developed from a position of privilege, often disregard racial inequalities in society. The structure perpetuates racial biases and systemic racism, diserving racial minorities. One study emphasized the importance of recognizing red flags in existing policies and develop new policies that foster a healthy, anti-racist learning environment (Myers, 2018). Current research can be used to develop new policies and practices can be adopted that reflect anti-racist ECE, and these policies and practices must be accessible and promote awareness of anti-racism (Hamilton-Wentworth District School Board, 2021). Key issues in Peel District School Board's anti-racist policy included the following: accountability, safe reporting, safe spaces, anti-racisteducation, support, professional development, teacher practices, leadership, and criticism of current practices (Peel District School Board, 2021).

An anti-racist ECE framework requires the involvement of students and community members. A student discipline review panel - composed of students, parents, and other

community members - can review and provide feedback to the staff on developing anti-racist policies (Myers, 2018). In 2020, the Calgary Board of Education added a policy that any complaints and concerns brought by students, staff, and parents/guardians must be addressed and investigated appropriately. Furthermore, a policy by the Mission Public Schools (n.d.) classified and addressed complaints of racism and discrimination.

Educator Awareness
Education programs encourage awareness, recognition, and exploration of perceptions on racism and social justice (Derman-Sparks, 2011). Reflection of personal biases, experiences and perceptions is required to ensure the implementation of anti-racist ECE (Lin et al., 2008; Manitoba Education and Training, 2017; Nganga, 2015; Board of Education of School District No. 46, 2021). Exploration of the different elements and privileges of a white racial identity is important when trying to uplift students belonging to different racial identities (Escayg, 2019).

The anti-racism education program for educators can vary depending on the culture and demographics of the school. Education programs can adopt a data-driven approach by using statistics to demonstrate biases within the education system and its lasting impacts on students belonging to specific groups. This can be followed by reflections and discussions that encourage acknowledgment and acceptance (Myers, 2018). Educators should be equipped with the resources to handle varying situations revolving around racism and hate crime (Board of Education of School District No. 46, 2021). Additionally, it is important that educators utilize their awareness on racism in ECE to identify and recognize gaps at the administrative level that perpetuate racism, oppression, and exclusion (District School Board of Niagara, n.d.).

Resources, Training and Tools for Educators
Educators play the primary role in implementing anti-racist teaching in ECE. For this reason, it is crucial for educators to understand how they can reduce racism and discrimination in their classroom and develop an unbiased environment for students (Edmonton Public Schools, 2021). Professional development related to anti-racism can provide educators with the resources, training, and tools to implement anti-racist ECE (Myers, 2018; Calgary Board of Education, 2020). This may include university courses on anti-racism and resources such as specific strategies to handle racism and harassment in the classroom (Lin et al., 2008). Appropriate training on anti-racism and ethnocultural equity through courses, workshops and community consultation can provide educators with resources to identify and mitigate racism in their classroom (Hamilton-Wentworth District School Board, 2021).

Training and professional development cannot be implemented one-time; education on anti-racism and equity must be ongoing. To successfully implement an anti-racist framework in ECE, educators must regularly share and reflect on their experiences with themselves and their peers (Lin et al., 2008). Administrators can provide space for educators to check-in with each other and discuss progress towards the implementation of anti-racist curricula (Myers, 2018). This may include discussions about handling biases in the classroom, executing anti-racist activities, and the impact of anti-racist

curricula on the attitudes and behaviors of students. Educators can also monitor their progress through end-of-the-year reviews, which can be completed with students and parents (Myers, 2018). For example, the Hamilton-Wentworth District School Board (2020) adopted a policy to offer annual training and other learning opportunities for educators on anti-racism. Training programs can develop culturally responsive educators that can create an equitable learning environment for all students (Nganga, 2015).

Partnerships between Family and Educators

The student experience can be enhanced through partnerships between educators and student families (Derman-Sparks, 2011). Through open communication with parents, educators can implement community expression within their classrooms (Hamilton-Wentworth District School Board, 2021). Educators can conduct home visits to foster healthy relationships with families and gain a better understanding of their culture (Lin et al., 2008). Educators can also introduce conversations on anti-racist practices that parents can contribute to through sharing their ideas, knowledge, and experiences (Lin et al., 2008). Conversations with community members who have experienced systematic and institutional racism, and marginalization can help educators identify issues with the system (Edmonton Public Schools 2021). A deeper understanding of student values and culture can help educators implement strategies that best support them (Lin et al., 2008).

Educators can implement parents' knowledge and experiences to improve classroom curricula and practices. Educators can better understand the cultural and language needs of their students by learning from parents and adopting strategies that they suggest that integrates and recognizes culture in the classroom (Derman-Sparks, 2011; Hamilton-Wentworth District School Board, 2021). Educators may consider adopting a transdisciplinary framework by collaborating with parents to develop an individualized plan for the child. This may include different academic and personal expectations such as the integration of socio-cultural backgrounds in classroom activities (Notari-Syverson, 2003). Furthermore, committees that are representative of the community can be formed with the goal of modifying and monitoring ECE curricula annually to ensure inclusivity (Hamilton-Wentworth District School Board, 2021).

Addressing Racism by Developing Skills in Children

Not only are children aware of racism at a young age, but they can also learn to act against it (Escayg, 2019). Therefore, it is important for educators to comfortably address and converse about racism in the classroom. Whether it be answering children's questions or seeing biased behaviour among students, educators must acknowledge racism and bias-related concerns (Derman-Sparks, 2011; Escayg, 2019). As certain groups of students are more likely to encounter situations of microaggressions and other racist behaviour, educators are responsible for addressing such situations when seen in the classroom.

Children can be taught how to identify and address situations related to racism, prejudice, and discrimination (Derman-Sparks, 2011; Peel District School Board, 2021).

Educators can help children understand and converse about similarities and differences within racial, cultural, or ethnic identities (Manitoba Education and Training, 2017; Nganga, 2015; Ecole Bancroft School, n.d). Children should be aware of concepts such as anti-Indigenous racism, Islamophobia, anti-Semitism, and xenophobia (Halton Catholic District School, 2021). Discussions can go beyond the classroom by educating students on inequity in society (Halifax Regional Centre for Education, 2007). Educators should have open conversations on white privilege, power and how the two intersect (Escayg, 2019). Students must understand different perceptions on race and their influence on systematic racism and non-majority groups (Escayg, 2019). It is essential for children to feel comfortable and safe to converse on topics of racial inequality, biases, prejudice, and racism (Edmonton Public Schools 2021). Through positive interactions in the classroom, children can unlearn biased concepts of race they might be exposed to through outside sources (Nganga, 2015).

Classroom Practices
Anti-racist activities in the classroom are an effective way to implement anti-racist ECE. Anti-racist activities can aim to develop a positive outlook on diversity, race, culture, gender, ability, and sexual orientation (Halifax Regional Centre for Education, 2007). Educators can achieve this through activities, reflections, and conversations. Children should be exposed to diverse backgrounds (racial, cultural, national, and Indigenous), gendered roles, and other societal inequities (different socio-economic backgrounds, ages, occupations, abilities, and sexuality). Many children's views on certain groups such as Indigenous people, Black and visible minorities might be limited to the popular media. Topics such as social justice issues, like those faced by the Indigenous and African peoples, should be addressed in the curricula (Halifax Regional Centre for Education, 2007). Cases of harassment and discrimination should be analyzed as a class. Depending on the classroom demographics, educators should share the history of different cultures. For example, the Halifax Regional Centre for Education developed programs and policies highlighting Mi'kmaq and African Canadian education. The curriculum included the history, language, and culture of the Mi'Kmaq and African Canadian people (Halifax Regional Centre for Education, 2007).

With a modified curriculum, educators can develop a wide range of activities that expose students to anti-racism. Educators can develop assignments and tasks for students that encourage exploration of their own ethnicity, culture, and race (Wynter-Hoyte, 2020). For example, children can share the history of their names, which may allow students to acknowledge and understand their backgrounds while appreciating diversity in the classroom by listening to others (Wynter-Hoyte, 2020). Further reflection can indulge students to ask questions and converse on the similarities and differences within their identities. The materials and resources used in the classrooms should also display diversity. For example, having books that empower marginalized peoples and display images from different cultures in the classroom may be an effective strategy (Mission Public Schools, n.d.; Nganga, 2015; Peel District School Board, 2021). While this varies depending on the demographics of the community, resources should reflect the diversity in the classroom. Multicultural literature that reflects students' cultures can increase student engagement with the material.

Recommendations

Creating Space for Discussion and Self-Reflection

We found that creating space for self-reflection and discussion about potential biases was a common component of anti-racist ECE frameworks. Creating space involved providing resources, tools, and time to have discussions about pre-existing biases. Discussion can be used as a classroom teaching technique to develop children's ability to "interpret, analyze, and manipulate information" (Larson, 2000). The interactive nature of classroom discussion about race may make implicit behaviors more explicit. Discussion can also help educators and students develop an ability to reflect on their learning about race and biases, enabling them to understand how race issues in the classroom affect attitudes and behaviors between each other (Livingston, 2003). Reflection may enable educators to be better aware of their attitudes, beliefs, and values towards anti-racist ECE, which may promote the conscious consideration of implicit behaviors.

For example, Lin and colleagues (2008) suggested for educators to use the journaling method to "reflect on their teaching practices...specific anti-bias strategies they have implemented, how each strategy worked, and how to improve their use" (p. 194). Alongside these journals Lin and colleagues (2008) also suggested facilitating discussions between educators on their first-hand experiences with families with different backgrounds, including what they perceive and/or fear. Both strategies were used to train new educators in implementing anti-racist ECE. However, we suggest the need to avoid implementing these self-reflection activities as a one-time event; rather, conscious, and thoughtful reflection of anti-racist ECE should be sustained over time by the continuous implementation of activities.

Striving to Make Curricula More Accessible and Accommodating

Included studies suggested the need to make anti-racist ECE frameworks more accessible and accommodating to a range of peoples. Some studies suggested that the values of students from diverse backgrounds may not be aligned with current curricula; an anti-racist ECE framework may benefit from promoting visual tools, hands-on activities, maps and features in creating a more accessible learning space. Active learning - a set of teaching activities that emphasize reflection about learning - may improve accessibility for diverse students (Pekdogan and Kanak, 2016). Furthermore, the principles of Universal Instructional Design (UID) are "a process that considers the potential needs of all learners by identifying and eliminating unnecessary barriers to teaching and learning when designing and delivering instruction" (Watt et al., 2014). UID follows nine principles: equitable use, flexibility in use, simple and intuitive, perceptible information, tolerance for error, low physical effort, size and space for approach and use, a community of learners, and instructional climate. We suggest incorporating the use of UID and active learning activities in anti-racist ECE frameworks. Engaging diverse peoples in curricula design can help to understand how they define accessible

curricula, which institutions can use to inform the development of an anti-racist ECE framework.

Engaging People at the Right Time and in the Most Appropriate Ways

Developing and delivering anti-racist ECE cannot be done without engaging people at the right time and in the most appropriate ways. Since anti-racism uses race as the focal point for discussing teaching and learning, engagement of diverse peoples in curricula design and evaluation is essential (Lin et al., 2008). ECE institutions may consider reflecting on the demographic makeup of their student population and region, and then strive to have representation from various communities in the design and evaluation of anti-racist ECE at their institution. Engaging diverse peoples must also consider engaging diverse parents. Studies have shown that engaging communities and parents improve educational outcomes in children (Avvisati et al., 2014, Fryer et al., 2015). For example, one study of 11 active community-school collaborative classes found that involvement, feedback, and resource development that resulted from collaborations had positive teaching benefits (Wang et al., 2016). However, engaging communities requires active engagement, ongoing building of community-school relations, and the possibility for communities to contribute to school activities (Wang et al., 2016). The Parent, Family, and Community Engagement (PFCE) Framework for Early Childhood Systems provides a visual guide for developing positive and goal-oriented relationships that includes three values (equity, inclusiveness, and cultural and linguistic responsiveness) and seven principles (policies, regulations, and standards; leadership and governance; infrastructure and funding; state, regional, and community partnerships; consumer education and engagement; professional and workforce development; and continuous learning and quality improvement) (National Centre on Parent, Family and Community Engagement, 2018). This framework can be used to guide initiatives that engage diverse peoples and communities in the design of anti-racist ECE.

Conclusion

This report described the findings of a literature review of academic and grey literature that identified elements or characteristics of anti-racist/bias frameworks for early childhood education. We discussed perceptions and influencing factors that contribute to understanding anti-racist/bias education. We also discuss several considerations that institutions may need to make to develop and implement anti-racist/bias framework. We offer the following three recommendations:
1. Creating space for discussion and self-reflection
2. Striving to make curricula more accessible and accommodating
3. Engaging people at the right time and in the most appropriate ways

Bibliography

Avvisati, F., Besbas, B., & Guyon, N. (2011). Parental involvement in school: A literature review. *Revue d'économie politique*, *120*(5), 759-778.

Avvisati, F., Gurgand, M., Guyon, N., & Maurin, E. (2013). Getting Parents Involved: A Field Experiment in Deprived Schools. *The Review of Economic Studies*, rdt027.

Board of Education of School District No. 46. (2021). *25 Anti-racism*. Governance Policies. https://sd46.bc.ca/wp-content/uploads/25_anti-racism.pdf

Calgary Board of Education. (2020, June 25). *CBE shares our commitment to anti-racism and equity* [News Centre]. https://www.cbe.ab.ca/news-centre/Pages/cbe-shares-our-commitment-to-anti-racism-and-equity.aspx

Derman-Sparks, L. (2011, July/August). Anti-bias Education: Reflections. *Exchange*, 55-58. Retrieved from http://ccie-catalog.s3.amazonaws.com/library/5020055.pdf

Derman-Sparks, L., & Edwards, J. (2019). Understanding Anti-Bias Education: Bringing the Four Core Goals to Every Facet of Your Curriculum. *YC Young Children, 74*(5), 6-13. Retrieved September 4, 2021, from https://www.jstor.org/stable/26842300

District School Board of Niagara. (n.d.). *Equity, Inclusion & Anti-racism*. https://www.dsbn.org/equity/home

Ecole Bancroft School. (n.d.). *Stand up to racism*. http://bancroft.emsb.qc.ca/school%20pages/2020-2021/Stand%20Up%20to%20Racism.pdf

Edmonton Public Schools. (2021). *Board Policy GGAB.BP Multicultural Education*. Recommendation Report. https://epsb.ca/media/epsb/ourdistrict/boardoftrustees/boardmeetings/2020-21/january262021/02-BoardPolicyGGAB.BPMulticulturalEducation.pdf

Escayg, K. (2019). "Who's got the power?": A critical examination of the anti-bias curriculum. *International Journal of Child Care and Education Policy, 13*(6), 1-18. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40723-019-0062-9

Escayg, K. A. (2020). Anti-racism in U.S. early Childhood education: Foundational principles. *Sociology Compass, 14*(4). https://doi.org/10.1111/soc4.12764

Fryer Jr, R. G., Levitt, S. D., & List, J. A. (2015). *Parental Incentives and Early Childhood Achievement: A Field Experiment in Chicago Heights* (No. w21477). National Bureau of Economic Research.

Halifax Regional Centre for Education. (2007). *Race relations, cross cultural understanding and human rights in learning.* Policy. https://www.hrce.ca/about-hrce/program/race-relations-cross-cultural-understanding-human-rights-rch

Halton Catholic District School. (2021). *Anti-racism.* https://www.hcdsb.org/our-board/human-rights-and-equity/anti-racism/

Hamilton-Wentworth District School Board. (2021). *Anti-racism and ethnocultural equity procedure.* Procedure for Policy No. 5.4. https://www.hwdsb.on.ca/about/equity/

Koubeissy, R. (2020). Celebrating diversity isn't enough: schools need anti-racist curriculum. The Conversation. https://theconversation.com/celebrating-diversity-isnt-enough-schools-need-anti-racist-curriculum-140424

Larson, B. E. (2000). Classroom discussion: A method of instruction and a curriculum outcome. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *16*(5-6), 661-677.

Lin, M., Lake, V. E., & Rice, D. (2008). Teaching anti-bias curriculum in teacher education programs: What and how. *Teacher Education Quarterly, 35*(2), 187-200.

Livingston, J. A. (2003). Metacognition: An Overview. Retrieved from https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED474273

Manitoba Education and Training. (2017). *Creating racism-free schools through critical/courageous conversations on race.* https://www.edu.gov.mb.ca/k12/docs/support/racism_free/full_doc.pdf

Meinke, H. (2019). *Exploring the pros and cons of montessori education.* Rasmussen University. https://www.rasmussen.edu/degrees/education/blog/pros_cons_montessori_education/.

Mission Public Schools. (n.d.). 2.2.2 *Anti-racism.* District Administration Corporate Policy. https://www.mpsd.ca/Board/antiracism/Documents/2.2.2%20Anti%20Racism%20-%20Draft.pdf#search=anti%20racism

Myers, L. C., & Finnigan, K. S. (2018). Using data to guide difficult conversations around structural racism. *VUE, 48*, 38-45.

National Centre on Parent, Family and Community Engagement. (n.d.). *Parent, Family and Community Engagement Framework for Early Childhood Systems.* Retrieved from https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED609027.pdf

Nganga, L. (2015). Culturally responsive and anti-biased teaching benefits early childhood pre-service teachers. *Journal of Curriculum and Teaching, 4*(2), 1-16. https://doi.org/10.5430/jct.v4n2p1

Notari-Syverson, A., Losardo, A., & Lim Y. S. (2003). Assessment of young children from culturally diverse backgrounds: A journey in progress. *Assessment for Effective Intervention, 29*(1), 39-51.

Office of the Premier. (2020). *Ontario Taking Bold Action to Address Racism and Inequity in Schools.* Ontario. https://news.ontario.ca/en/release/57543/ontario-taking-bold-action-to-address-racism-and-inequity-in-schools

Peel District School Board. (2021). *Directive 16- Anti-racism policy-progress report #2*. https://www.peelschools.org/about/ministry-directives/Documents/Directive-16---Anti-Racism-Policy---Progress-Report-2.pdf

Pekdogan, S., & Kanak, M. (2016). A Qualitative Research on Active Learning Practices in Pre-School Education. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, *4*(9), 232-239.

Statistics Canada. (2016). *Census Profile, 2016 Census - Hamilton, Ontario*. Retrieved from https://www12.statcan.gc.ca/census-recensement/2016/dp-pd/prof/details/page.cfm?Lang=E&Geo1=CMACA&Code1=537&Geo2=PR&Code2=35&Data=Count&SearchText=hamilton&SearchType=Begins&SearchPR=01&B1=All&TABID=1

Stoney Creek Montessori. (2021). *Why Montessori?*. Retrieved from https://stoneycreekmontessori.com/why-montessori/

Wang, J., Lai, S. C., & Wang, C. M. (2016). Beyond the Classroom Wall: Community Engagement Instruction. *World Journal of Education*, *6*(6), 31-41.

Watt, S., Vajoczki, S., Voros, G., Vine, M. M., Fenton, N., & Tarkowski, J. (2014). Lecture Capture: An Effective Tool for Universal Instructional Design?. *Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, *44*(2), 1-29.

Winkler, E. N. (2009). Children are not colorblind: How young children learn race. *PACE: Practical Approaches for Continuing Education, 3*(3), 1-8.

Wynter-Hoyte, K., & Smith, M. (2020). "Hey, Black Child. Do You Know Who You Are?" Using African diaspora literacy to humanize blackness in early childhood education. *Journal of Literacy Research, 52*(4), 406-431. https://doi.org/10.1177/1086296X20967393

Appendices

1/ early childhood & educati*
2/ early childhood educator$
3/ 1 or 2

4/ racis*
5/ pedagog*
6/ inclusiv*
7/ divers*
8/ equit*
9/ anti-bias*
10/ multicultur*
11/ 4 or 5 or 6 or 7 or 8

12/ black and early childhood educat*
13/ indigenous and early childhood educat*
14/ 9 or 10

15/ framework$
16/ theor*
17/ tool*
18/ characteristic$.ti.
19/ principle$.ti.
20/ component$.ti.
21/ item$.ti.
22/ element$.ti.
23/ qualit*.ti.
24/ factor$.ti.
25/ or/15-24

26/ 3 and 11
27/ 14 or 26
28/ 25 and 27

Appendix B: Characteristics of Included Academic Articles

Author (year)	Title of Study	Research Objectives	Country of Publication	Summary of Findings
Beneke et al. (2019)	An inclusive, anti-bias framework for teaching and learning about race with young children	Highlights the importance of addressing race in ECE, and introduces a framework for teaching and learning race.	United States	NA
Derman-Sparks (2011)	Anti-bias Education: Reflections	Shares personal reflections, and discusses the current state of anti-bias education. This is based on a framework for anti-bias education.	United States	It is 30 years since NAEYC published Anti-Bias Curriculum Tools for Empowering Young Children (Derman-Sparks & ABC Task Force, 1989). Since then, anti-bias education concepts have become part of the early childhood educa- tion narrative in the United States and many other countries. It has brought a fresh way of thinking about diversity and equity among young children. In 2010, an updated edition — Anti-Bias Education for Young Children and Ourselves — incorporated the insights and experiences of anti-bias educators throughout the country.

Derman-Sparks et al. (2020)	Teaching about identity, racism, and fairness: Engaging young children in Anti-Bias education	Provides recommendations or strategies to practice anti-bias education in ECE classrooms.	United States	Anti-bias education is an optimistic commitment to supporting children who live in a highly diverse and yet still inequitable world. Rather than a formula for a particular curriculum, it is an underpinning perspective and framework that permeates everything in early childhood education—including your interactions with chil- dren, families, and colleagues. Anti-bias education developed from the need to identify and prevent, as much as possible, the harmful emotional and psychological impacts on children from societal prejudice and bias. Its four core goals reflect research about these negative influences.
Escayg (2019)	"Who's got the power?": A critical examination of the anti-bias curriculum	Offer a comprehensive critique of the anti-bias curriculum, though presented as congruent with the empirical evidence with respect to the education of young children and race.	United States	This article, however, offers a more comprehensive critique of the anti-bias curriculum, including an analysis of the conceptual frameworks underpinning several of the associated teaching strategies. In addition, the present article illustrates how the anti-bias curriculum, though presented as congruent with the empirical evidence with respect to the education of young children and race, departs

				considerably from these data. Furthermore, the curricula under scrutiny fail to engage young children in critical discussions and classroom practices centering on: (i) power relations; (ii) racism; (iii) whiteness; and (iv) white privilege. This critique concludes with a preliminary conceptualization of anti-racism in early childhood education.
Lin (2009)	Teaching Anti-Bias Curriculum in Teacher Education Programs: What and How	Discusses what an anti-bias curriculum is, suggests a framework for it and rationale for involving teachers in certain activities to promote an anti-bias curriculum.	United States	NA
Myers (2018)	Using Data to Guide Difficult Conversations around Structural Racism	Provides a framework for difficult conversations on race and implicit bias in system-level data, to avoid blaming and shaming and to break through defensiveness to arrive at a solution.	United States	NA
Nganga (2015)	Culturally Responsive and Anti-Biased Teaching Benefits Early Childhood Pre-Service Teachers	Examines pre-service teachers' perceptions of a culturally responsive, anti-bias curriculum.	United States	Pre-teaching data showed that pre-service teachers had a superficial understanding of an anti-bias curriculum. However, post-teaching data showed that after experiencing culturally responsive curricula, pre-

				service teachers developed a better understanding of anti-bias curriculum and gained essential self-awareness in diversity contexts.
Notari-Syverson (2003)	Assessment of Young Children from Culturally Diverse Backgrounds: A Journey in Progress	Discusses the cultural biases of traditional assessment approaches used with preschool and kindergarten aged children.	United States	Abstract just mentions that there are 4 approaches described that can be integrated into everyday routines and can draw on the observations and interactions with children and families.
Wynter-Hoyte (2020)	"Hey, Black Child. Do You Know Who You Are?" Using African Diaspora Literacy to Humanize Blackness in Early Childhood Education	Examines the partnership between a teacher and teacher educator disrupting a colonized early childhood curriculum that fosters a dominance of whiteness by replacing it with the beauty and brilliance of Blackness.	United States	Our Sankofa methodology revealed that African Diaspora literacies fostered (a) positive racial and gender identities, (b) community, and (c) positive linguistic identities in the work to help children to love themselves, their histories, and their peoples.

Appendix C: Characteristics of Excluded Academic Articles

Author (year)	Title of Study	Research Objectives	Country of Publication	Summary of Findings
Acar-Ciftei (2016)	The critical multicultural education competencies of preschool teachers	Determine the perceptions of preschool teachers regarding critical multicultural education competencies	Turkey	The scale, which consists of 42 items, is composed of four sub-dimensions, namely awareness, knowledge, skill and attitude, and the scale can be used as a one-dimensional structure as well. The eligibility of the Critical Multicultural Education Competency Scale (CMECS) for this study is analyzed by looking at the reliability with item analysis. An Alpha model is used for the reliability analysis of the items in the scale and of the sub-dimensions of the scale. As a result of the reliability analysis, which is applied to determine the suitability of the CMECS, it is found that the size of the reliability coefficients vary between 0.674 and 0.887. The reliability coefficient for the whole scale is calculated as .811. As a result of the research, it is determined that the preschool teachers find themselves adequate throughout the overall scale

				but only partially adequate in terms of knowledge and awareness. It is seen that the variables of gender, age, ethnicity and native language cause significant levels of differentiation in the perceptions of the teachers.
Acevedo (2019)	Young children playing their way into intercultural understanding	Analyze young children's enquiries and intercultural understanding as they interacted and respond to an enquiry-based global curriculum	United States	These broad categories were adapted and subcategories created to represent young children's intercultural understanding as evidenced through their play, enquiries and language. The findings of this study provide evidence to suggest that global exploration can enhance the lives of children when it: (1) builds on children's curiosity about the world and, through play, (2) highlights the development of knowledge, perspectives and action for a more just world.
Albritton et al. (2019)	Systematic review of early childhood mental health consultation: implications for improving preschool discipline disproportionality	Examine existing literature on mental health consultations and behavioural consultations in ECE context.	United States	Findings associated with this systematic review suggest that ECMHC could be a promising practice for targeting internalizing and externalizing behavioral concerns in prekindergarten students across a variety of settings. However, more research is needed in the areas of mental

				health/behavioral consultation and disciplinary disproportionality, as well as on the impact of such practices on preschool children of color.
Araujo & Strasser (2003)	Confronting prejudice in the early childhood classroom	NR	United States	NR
Beneke & Cheatham (2020)	Teacher candidates talking (but not talking) about disability and race in preschool	Examine how teacher candidates "maintain or resist normative discourses of race and dis/ability with young children during book reading"	United States	Findings revealed how—despite stated intentions to advance educational justice—teacher candidates drew on discourse models that reinforced status quo notions of normativity. We argue that understanding how teacher candidates navigate dis/ability and race talk with young children in the context of literacy instruction can lend insight into the teacher education experiences needed to support these critical conversations.
Bennett et al. (2018)	Culturally responsive literacy practices in an early childhood community	Discuss culturally responsive teaching frameworks and practices in ECE context	United States	Early childhood educators continue to see an increase in their culturally diverse student population. As our country continues to grow as a multicultural nation, it is imperative that our early childhood classrooms embrace this rich diversity

				and provide experiences that affirm all students, families and communities. We (teacher educators) synthesized the current research into the following five frameworks that we believe embody the foundation of culturally responsive teaching (CRT) in an early childhood set- ting: (a) developing a culturally responsive classroom com- munity, (b) family engagement, (c) critical literacy within a social justice framework, (d) multicultural literature, and (e) culturally responsive print rich environments. In this article we situate each framework within the larger context of research. Next we move beyond discussing CRT practices by offering ideas on how culturally responsive class- rooms look and how to implement this pedagogy and in an early childhood setting with real classroom practices.
Blaisdell (2019)	Right to the classroom: seeking spatial justice in Kindergarten	Examine how schools promotes systemic racism, using concepts of neoliberalism and racialization and critical race theory. Also justifies practices that restrict educations rights of students of	United States	This article uses Lefebvre's concept of right to the city to frame the practices of a Kindergarten teacher and her ability to create a more racially equitable classroom space. It explains how the

				teacher and researcher collaboratively engaged in racial spaces analysis and critical race theory to develop greater racial spatial awareness. The teacher was able to use this awareness to resist neoliberalism and the racialization space in her classroom. The article explains how framing classroom practice according to right to the city can help teachers and researchers work together towards spatial justice in schools, where the educational rights of students of color are not limited by reductive notions of property based in whiteness.
Blaise & Taylor (2012)	Using queer theory to rethink gender equity in early childhood education	Examine the perception of gender and gender equity among young children	United States	
Boutte et al. (2011)	Moving beyond colorblindness in early childhood classrooms	Discuss the development of a sense about racism and power in young children	United States	Countering the position that colorblindness is desirable for teachers and children, this article encourages early childhood education teachers to engage in conversations about race and racism with young children. We discuss why

				the early childhood years are important for interrupting racism and make suggestions for helping children develop tools for addressing it. Annotated examples of children's drawings about racism from a second-grade classroom are shared to demonstrate that young children are not colorblind and that they think about and experience racism in their daily lives. We conclude that it is both an educational and ethical necessity to address racism with young children.
Bradshaw (2013)	A framework for providing culturally responsive early intervention services	Provide a framework that offers a way for EI service providers to better meet the needs of the culturally diverse children and families they serve	United States	NR
Brown et al. (2000)	Unpacking biases: developing cultural humility in early childhood and elementary teacher candidates	Provide tools for practice - or tools for teacher educators that train teachers on how to develop cultural humility	United States	Changing demographics in the U.S. require a focus on educating future teachers on how to engage children and families with diverse backgrounds. Teacher educators have been charged to address teachers' cultural competence and provide pedagogical instruction for working with diverse populations. We bolster this

				line of inquiry by sharing activities used in our university classrooms that support the development of teacher candidates' cultural competence vis-à-vis cultural humility. Acknowledging the development of cultural humility as a process, we provide teacher candidates with opportunities to transform their knowledge, skills, and abilities for working with diverse children and their families, through guided critical reflection, real life situations and field experiences.
Brown et al. (2010)	Seeing the strange in the familiar: unpacking racialized practices in early childhood settings	Examine how racism and classism are woven in everyday practices in ECE settings	United States	While the cases are situated in specific public school settings – a parent teacher association (PTA) fundraiser, a mandated literacy program, and a read-aloud – they shed light onto a variety of contexts as these are all common phenomena in many American elementary schools. Together, the cases illustrate how racism has been normalized through familiar practices in early childhood settings. Through description and reflection, the authors suggest ways to start seeing

				the strange in the familiar, unpacking racialized practices across three settings, and advocating new ways of thinking about these common practices leading to change and transformation.
Byars et al. (2020)	Advancing Equity in the Early Childhood Workforce	Examine equity and diversity in the ECE workforce. Discusses the Diversity-Informed tenets (10 tenets).	United States - also has data from Tanzania	This article explores how the early childhood field can support capacity building around equity in the current workforce and build a more diverse, representative workforce at all levels. The authors explore hiring practices, strategies for equipping a diverse workforce, and the actions necessary to realize equity and inclusion through organizational change using interviews with early childhood organizations across the US and data from a project in Tanzania. Affinity groups and Communities of Practice are highlighted as promising practices to promote equity and excellence within organizations and with external partners. The authors provide a diversity-informed framework to critically examine intentional strategies to ensure the field represents the communities

				being served and continues in the hard yet necessary work of equity in early childhood.
Chen et al. (2009)	Becoming a culturally responsive early childhood educator: A tool to support reflection by Teachers embarking on the Anti-Bias Journey	Examine a framework for practicing culturally responsive education in ECE context	United States	As children begin to construct an understanding of human differences and similarities during their earliest years, early childhood teachers are challenged to be culturally responsive to the diversity of the children and families. Based on our review of the literature and other existing tools, this article discusses a framework for thinking about this work and proposes critical elements for teachers to re-examine their practice. The article describes a reflective tool structured to provoke thinking about attitudes, assumptions, and knowledge base regarding culturally responsive teaching.
Childress (2020)	Putting relationships first: using principles from regio emilia to be responsive to our students	Practice Regio Emilia principles in the ECE context	United States	NA

Christman (2010)	Creating social justice in early childhood education: a case study in equity and context	Examine how social injustice is within an ECE program using a framework for social justice	United States	Findings indicate that the program should (a) carefully examine whether students have a predisposition towards social justice before they actually enter the program, (b) create a critical consciousness involves introducing students to the language of critique and the language of possibility, (c) intentionally hire faculty who are committed to social justice is essential, and (d) purposefully structure the program so that students are exposed to a very broad concept of community. Although pockets of resistance were uncovered in both the larger department and the college in which the program resides, the program itself remains solidly committed to social justice. Staying connected to scholarship, to the children, to context, and to social justice remains essential to the goals of this program and recognizing the program's areas for improvement is vital to the language of critique that the program uses.
Curenton et al. (2020)	Validity for the Assessing Classroom	Assess the validity and usefulness of the Assessing	United States	Preliminary psychometric information from 142 observations across 52

	Sociocultural Equity Scale (ACSES) in Early childhood classrooms	Classroom Sociocultural Equity Scale (ACSES) in ECE context		teachers (average of 2 videos per teacher) provided internal consistency and validity information. Our analyses resulted in a significant and highly reliable 5-factor solution comprising 33 items. These five factors are: Challenging Status Quo Knowledge, Equitable Learning Opportunities for RMLs, Equitable Discipline, Connections to Home Life, and Personalized Learning Opportunities. Concurrent and divergent validity between ACSES and the Classroom Assessment Scoring System (CLASS) indicated these factors are associated with distinct aspects of classroom interactions. Lastly, correlations between teacher socio-demographic (age and race/ethnicity) and professional (years teaching, education, and major) characteristics and ACSES factor scores were considered. Practice or Policy: Results are discussed in relation to research contributions of the measure as well as pre-service education and in-service professional development for teachers.

Earick (2010)	The power of play and language on early childhood racial identity in three U.S. Schools	Focused on racial identity development through play, language and in-group messaging in ECE context.	United States	The outcomes of each clearly identify issues signifying a relation among race, play, and language in both student-to-student and teacher-to-student discourse. Discussion includes how critical incident logs and language events transform White teacher identities and support self-reflection. The relations that exist among theory, practice, and academic achievement in the field of racial identity development are discussed, as is the role that play-based curriculum models can have on identity consistency in early childhood classrooms.
Erwin (2012)	Community and Connection in Inclusive Early-Childhood Education: A Participatory Action Research Investigation	Identify a participatory action research approach as a way of minimizing the disparity between what we learn through research and how we can use this information to produce positive outcomes in immediate and meaningful ways	United States	In this article, we describe how we implemented PAR to help deepen our understanding of community and diversity. One of the key questions that guided our investigation was, "What does it mean to be fully inclusive across all aspects of diversity?" We discuss the lessons learned and implications for how we can approach services for children with disabilities and their families.

| Flores (2011) | Validation of the Early Childhood Ecology Scale-Revised: A Reflective Tool for Teacher Candidates | Validation of the Early Childhood Ecology Scale-Revised (ECES-R) as a reflective tool for early childhood teacher candidates | United States | The Early Childhood Ecology Scale-Revised (ECES-R) has been developed as a reflective tool to help early childhood teacher candidates examine their beliefs concerning classroom ecology. Using cultural responsivity and classroom management theories as the theoretical framework, the authors posit that the ECES-R identifies five dimensions that promotes a high-quality, culturally responsive classroom ecology. These include the sociocognitive, sociocultural, sociolinguistic, socioemotional, and sociophysical dimensions. |
| Han (2011) | Use of Racial Identity Development Theory to Explore Cultural Competence among Early Childhood Educators | Explore early childhood educators' cultural competence through a lens of racial identity development theory | United States | Findings suggest that representative characteristics of racial identities are evident among White early childhood educators, and that these characteristics influence their conceptualizations of teaching and understanding culturally diverse young students. Thus, authors recommend that racial identity development be considered as a crucial element of teacher professional developments in order to enhance their cultural competence. |

Hanson (2019)	The First Peoples Principles of Learning: An Opportunity for Settler Teacher Self-Inquiry	This paper is written from the perspective of a settler teacher as she engages in self-study research to develop her understanding of the curricular plan.	Canada	This paper is written from the perspective of a settler teacher as she engages in self-study research to develop her understanding of the curricular plan. The author describes her emerging self-awareness as opening to a deeper understanding of her Euro-American worldview, cultural narratives that maintain gaps between settler teachers and First Peoples perspectives, and how ongoing self-inquiry is a way to improve as an educator.
Harris (2015)	Developmentally universal practice: visioning innovative early childhood pedagogy for meeting the needs of diverse learners	Address the characteristics of developmentally universal practice for a variety of learners both from diverse cultural and/or linguistic backgrounds	United States	This evaluative paper will address characteristics of DUP and using DUP for a variety of learners both from diverse cultural and/or linguistic backgrounds. A section is also devoted to relational pedagogy and preparing teachers to teach DUP with instructional strategies for early learning environments.
Howlett (2019)	Building a Classroom Library Based on Multicultural Principles A Checklist for Future K-6 Teachers	Using the six multicultural principles as a foundation and employing an evaluation checklist to develop and expand classroom libraries in the most culturally responsive manner	United States	The purpose of this article is to underscore critical attention on educating our nation's teachers by developing a critical eye for high-quality MC literature that is available for the classroom as well as an ongoing

				commitment to seeking out the most effective array of literature for the children in their classrooms.
Husband (2014)	Increasing Reading Engagement in African American Boys	Discuss strategies for teachers to implement in and across curriculum, pedagogical and school contexts to increase reading engagement in African American boys	United States	little has been written regarding increasing reading engagement in African American boys in P-5 contexts. Given this gap within the scholarship, the purpose of this article is to present a multi-strategic framework for increasing reading engagement in African American boys in early childhood and elementary contexts. Drawing from scholarship related to reading engagement, I discuss strategies for teachers to implement in and across curriculum, pedagogical, and school contexts to increase reading engagement in African American boys.
Husband (2019)	Using Multicultural Picture Books to Promote Racial Justice in Urban Early Childhood Literacy Classrooms"	provide a framework of multiple approaches to teaching children about race through multicultural picture books.	United States	In this article, I argue that multicultural picture books can and should be used to promote racial awareness and racial justice among young children. I discuss reasons why early childhood teachers should abandon colorblind approaches to race and racism in their classrooms. Then, I provide a framework of multiple approaches to

				teaching children about race through multicultural picture books.
Hyland (2010)	Social Justice in Early Childhood Classrooms	Look at the research on early childhood teaching for equity and makes recommendations to teachers for developing such practices.	United States	In early childhood programs and in preschool and primary classrooms' it is critical for teachers to address injustice and develop equity-based pedagogies because children form ideas about fairness and their own sense of identity within the larger world during these early years (Boutte 2008)
Hyun (2001)	Gender-Fair and Gender-Congruent Practices for Young Children's Naturalist Intelligence: From the Perspective ofDevelopmentally and Culturally Appropriate Practice (DCAP).	Help early childhood practitioners understand young children's gender differences in their learning; promote developmentally and culturally appropriate gender-fair and gender-congruent practices in conjunction with young children's naturalist intelligence	United States	Examines young children's gender differences in learning and their gender-oriented culture and promotes developmentally and culturally appropriate gender-fair and gender-congruent practices in conjunction with young children's naturalist intelligence.
Jackson (2018)	Community Mapping as a Tool for Developing Culturally Relevant Pedagogy	Explore the process and outcomes of a class community mapping project as a pedagogical method for developing CRP with early childhood preservice teachers.	United States	This article explores the process and outcomes of a class community mapping project as a pedagogical method for developing CRP with early childhood preservice teachers. Using culturally relevant pedagogy to frame our investigation, we report our findings on the impact of the community

				mapping project on the preservice teachers' development of CRP as it relates to the theory's pedagogical tenets of conceptions of self and others, social relations, and conceptions of knowledge. The findings suggest that community mapping is comprehensive in that it incited new understandings and beginning beliefs about each dimension of CRP.
Kilinc (2017)	Expanding opportunities to learn to support inclusive education through drama enhanced literacy practices	Examine how the Early Years Educators at Play (EYEPlay) professional development (PD) programme supported inclusive learning settings for all children, including English language learners and students with disabilities.	United States	The study findings showed that EYEPlay PD practices enhanced inclusive learning settings for diverse groups of students by increasing access and expanding opportunities to learn and supporting a positive learning environment.
Kirova (2010)	Children's representations of cultural scripts in play: facilitating transition from home to preschool in an intercultural early learning program for refugee children	Focus on the role of play as a cultural activity in refugee children's transition from home to preschool	Canada	The pilot study that used the Participatory Action and Learning methodology demonstrated that the intercultural approach to education could open possibilities for new directions in early childhood practice in which a hybrid space is open for children and adults who share it to bring their knowledge and ways of being in the world. In this space,

				play is a vehicle for preserving cultural group identities while creating a common culture.
Kirova (2016)	Shaping the habits of mind of diverse learners in early childhood teacher education programs through powerpoint: an illustrative case	Examine the use of PowerPoint as a teaching tool in a workplace-embedded program aimed at bridging immigrant/refugee early childhood education into post-secondary studies, and how, in the process, it shapes students' habits of mind		The findings demonstrate that Power- Point enhances western authoritative ways of being through its modes of communication and representation, means of organizing information, forms of representing content and pedagogical approaches, thus obsolescing or displacing immigrant/re- fugee students' own indigenous ways of knowing. Since learning always involves the development, integration, and reorganization of tools, and the medium is an extension of the self (McLuhan, 2003), the students should have multimodal opportunities to engage with and represent knowledge. When such opportunities are not provided, the life experiences and cultural knowledges of immigrant/refugee students are silenced. Expanding communicative and representative forms in early childhood teacher education programs is necessary to promote a more inclusive environment.

Klibthong (2012)	Re-imagining inclusive education for young children: a kaleidoscope of Bourdieuian Theorisation			Under this question, I situate early childhood inclusive education in four components (active learning environment, involvement, relationships and wellbeing), and critically analyse these in terms of Bourdieu's three conceptual lenses. I argue that effective inclusive education of young children must not conform to modernist epistemology, which locates knowledge exclusively in teachers and that, Bourdieuian conceptual tools offer refreshing epistemological and reflective radars for re-imagining and enacting pedagogical practices that contribute to all children's holistic development.
Long (2013)	We've been doing it your way long enough': Syncretism as a critical process	The article is looking at the importance of teachers' appreciation of syncretism as a powerful learning process for challenging discriminatory and exclusionary practices	United States	Found that teachers' new practices opened possibilities for syncretism by embracing knowledge, languages, traditions and practices from students' homes, communities and African heritage, as well as from school.
Machado (2017)	Fostering and Sustaining Diverse Literacy Practices in the Early Childhood Classroom	Review articles that have looked into how teachers foster and sustain children's diverse literacy practices within the early childhood classroom	United States	findings are organized into 3 groups - (1) comparing languages and literacy practices, (2) hybridizing literacy practices, and (3) engaging children's linguistic and cultural repertoires.

MacNevin (2017)	The Black baby doll doesn't fit the disconnect between early childhood diversity policy, early child	Explore how multicultural policy approaches, which mandate the inclusion of culturally and ethnically 'diverse' play materials in early childhood classrooms influence the pedagogical practice of educators and, in turn, children's play and social interactions.	Canada	NR
MCGuire-Schwartz 2007	Transforming Universal Design for Learning in Early Childhood Teacher Education from College Classroom	Focus on application of Universal Design for Learning from theory to practice from the college classroom to the practicum experiences of preservice teacher candidates.	United States	NR
Mendoza 2001	Transforming Universal Design for Learning in Early Childhood Teacher Education from College Classroom Examining Multicultural Picture books for the Early Childhood Classroom: Possibilities and Pitfalls	Examine two books featuring Mexican American protagonists to illuminate issues and problems in contemporary theories race as ways of understanding such issues and problems	United States	NR
Minkoff 2020	Exploring Intergroup Dialogue as a Sociocritical Pedagogy in Preservice Early	Looked at impact of intergroup dialogue on a cohort of preservice early childhood educators	United States	Intergroup dialogue contributed to participants' sense of self as related to their praxis by expanding their sense of identity to be more

	Childhood Education			inclusive and aware of dimensions of power and privilege.
Mogharreban 2009	Exploring Intergroup Dialogue as a Sociocritical Pedagogy in Preservice Early Childhood Education	Share a framework for preparing for and implementing inclusive Pre-kindergarten classrooms based on their experiences working with an interdisciplinary study	United States	Five key issues are addressed, collaboration and role definition, program decisions, instruction, child outcomes, and necessary resources.
Monroe 2018.pdf	Increasing early childhood preservice teachers' intercultural sensitivity through the ABCs	Examine the implementation of the ABCs of Cultural Understanding (the ABCs), a multi- component instructional activity to promote intercultural sensitivity, in a preservice early childhood education course.	United States	ABCs helped the participants develop intercultural sensitivity and strengthened their awareness and appreciation of other cultures
Murray 2015.pdf	Not Black Like Me: The Cultural Journey of an Early Childhood Program	Describe how employing the Undoing Racism program to increase awareness and access to all students led to structural change	United States	Diverse stu- dents within the institution are unable to connect with a faculty member with whom they can identify. The faculty in this program took the initiative to discuss how the learning environment offered to pre-service teachers truly recognizes and creates learning opportunities inclusive of all cultural identities. The faculty and students participated in the Undoing Racism training program and further extended the conversations

				to address the needs of the program. Using the theoretical framework of critical race theory, this paper describes how employing the Undoing Racism program to increase awareness and access to all students led to structural changes.
Neuharth-Pritchett 2001.pdf	Through the Eyes of Preservice Teachers: Implications for the Multicultural Journey From Teacher Edu	Study looked at pre-service early childhood education students' a) definitions of multicultural education, b)sources of information from which to construct their definition, c) perceptions of multicultural education in schools, and d) perceptions of the ways that multicultural education should be implemented.	United States	Teacher education programs must assist students in their conceptualization and critical reflection on multicultural education by capitalizing on opportunities throughout the students' experiences for them to critically reflect and examine their own and others' experiences regarding diversity
Peck 2015.pdf	Understanding Preschool Teachers' Perspectives on Empathy: A Qualitative Inquiry	Focus on how teachers expressed empathy in the context of early childhood edu-cation.	United States	One theme, expressing sincere empathy, and four sub-themes emerged that described how teachers express empathy with children and families in early childhood education. The sub-themes included (1) embrace inclusion as a philosophy, (2) be relaxed and balanced, (3) accept and respond to family

				culture, and (4) engage in meaningful communication with families
Pence 2008.pdf	Discourses on Quality Care: The Investigating 'Quality' Project and the Canadian Experience	Describe contexts within which reconceptualist approaches to research and practice in early childhood education are taking place in BC	Canada	NR
Perez 2016.pdf	Repositioning childhood lived experiences within adult contexts: A Black feminist analysis of childhood/s regulation in early childhood care and education	Discuss Black feminist perspectives to interrogate and (re)examine childhood regulatory spaces.	United States	To emphasize these points, we describe these same childhood experiences as if they were happening to adults. Examples of situations interrogated include everyday childhood routines, the use of assessment to determine ability grouping, and implementation of classroom management systems. Theorizing the narratives with a Black feminist lens inspires the rethinking of everyday (sometimes unrealized) regulation of younger human beings in early childhood care and education.
Perez 2017.pdf	A Call for Onto-Epistemological Diversity in Early Childhood Education and Care: Centering Global South	Call for onto-epistemological diversity in the field of early childhood education and care. Specifically, discuss the need to center the brilliance of children and communities of color,	United States	Paper introduces Black and Chicana feminisms as global south visions to transform approaches to research and pedagogy in ECEC and, in turn, disrupt inequities.

	Conceptualizations of Childhood/s			
Poole 2018.pdf	Repurposing Principles and Successful Pedagogical Techniques from Mister Rogers' Neighborhood for the Early Childhood Music Classroom	Analyze principles and pedagogical techniques that were used in Rogers's television program which connected with young children and educated them on difficult concepts. Also, suggested ways the principles can be applied to early childhood music classroom	United States	Techniques used in show included: communicating with children, establishing routines, managing expectations and transitions, presenting concepts through multiple formats, and exposing children to our multicultural world
Purcell 2007.pdf	A Qualitative Study of the Initiation and Continuation of Preschool Inclusion Programs	Understand and describe how school districts and special education cooperatives initiated and continued preschool inclusive programs	United States	Important factors for an inclusive program are shared vision, utilizing key personnel, and developing a structure within which the program could work.
Reyes 2006	Creating an Inclusive Early Childhood Professional Development System in New Mexico, USA	Shares New Mexico's experience and lessons learned from their work in the creation of a professional development system in early childhood that is culturally and linguistically responsive	United States	Creating a state comprehensive professional development system for the preparation of early childhood personnel in the USA requires a development framework that is inclusive and responsive to diversity.
Sanders 2007	DAP in the 'hood: Perceptions of child care	Investigate how developmentally appropriate practices are	United States	An integrative model for the study of developmental

	practices by African American child care directors caring for children of color	implemented by African American directors of subsidized child care centers		competencies in minority children. Child Development, 67, 1891–1914], which places racial ethnicity in the center, we examined how these directors integrated professional standards of practice (developmentally appropriate practice) with community understandings of the role of preschool/childcare in this community; the function of social stratification on their articulated practices; and their understanding as to how they include the Latino immigrant families. We discovered patterns that reflect a community-interpreted understanding of developmentally appropriate practice.
Seidl 2015	Multicultural apprenticeships in teacher education	Explore the theoretical structure of multicultural apprenticeships in teacher education	United States	Three different multicultural apprenticeships are used to provide concrete examples of the characteristics of this approach to preparing teachers for diverse classrooms.
Sheets 2003	Linking Teacher Behaviors to Cultural Knowledge	Investigate how teachers conceptualize and implement multicultural education	United States	NR
Smith 2018	Critical Science and Mathematics Early	How to support teachers with multicultural education and how	United States	NR

	Childhood Education: Theorizing Reggio, Play and Critical Pedagogy into an Actionable Cycle	this can be connected to science and mathematics		
Soodak 2002	Implementing Inclusive Early Childhood Education: A Call for Professional Empowerment	Contrast how children and families experience inclusive early childhood education with what it might look like if all stakeholders assume responsibility for using effective practices.	United States	We suggest that to move from mediocrity to excellence in providing inclusive early childhood education, professional empowerment must occur at the individual and program levels.
Souto-Manning 2010	The Role of Action Research in Fostering Culturally-Responsive Practices in a Preschool Classroom	Analyze an early childhood teacher's shifting perceptions of what it means to engage in culturally-relevant teaching, respecting and honoring cultural diversities	United States	Based on our experiences and action research, we propose that as preschool teachers position themselves as learners and value stories, families, and cultures in their own classrooms throughout the year, they will be better able to honor diversities in integral ways as they shift their understandings, coming to recognize the cultural construction of knowledges and practices. In doing so, they will be better positioned to create inclusive early educational settings that are welcoming of all children.
Souto-Manning 2017	Generative text sets: Tools for negotiating critically inclusive early childhood teacher education pedagogical practices	Using generative text sets as tools for developing and enacting critically inclusive early childhood teacher education pedagogies.	United States	Pedagogically, findings suggest that by drawing on tenets of critical pedagogy in planning and teaching with generative text sets, we can (1) shift and expand the definition of literacy practices;

			(2) introduce counter-narratives to traditional power discourses which frame diversities as deficits in early childhood education (Goodwin et al., 2008; Valdés, 1996); and (3) explicitly address issues of discrimination, prejudice, power and privilege within the literacy curriculum, capitalizing on the experiences that preservice teachers (and the young children they teach) had inside and outside (pre)schools and classrooms.
Steglin 2005	Making the Case for Play Policy: Research-Based Reasons to Support Play-Based Environments	Help teachers and directors implement play-based early learning environments, discusses emotional development within diverse early childhood settings	USA	no abstract
Stites 2018	Preservice Teacher Perceptions of Preparedness to Teach in Inclusive Settings as an Indicator of Teacher Preparation Program Effectiveness	Examine early childhood teacher perceptions about their preparedness to work in an inclusive setting	United States	The findings indicated that preservice teachers lacked a coherent understanding of inclusion and perceived themselves as needing additional development to be fully prepared to teach in an inclusive setting.
Szente 2008	Preparing Preservice Teachers to Work with Culturally and Linguistically Diverse Children: A Service	Discusses reflections of preservice teachers working with culturally diverse children (a service-learning experience)	USA	Since Fall 2006, 105 students have contributed over 1,500 hours of academic tutoring in area schools. Data from the journals and case studies indicated that all the preservice teachers benefited

	Learning Experience			from this course component and were able to gain hands-on experience regarding how to better work with culturally and linguistically diverse young children. Participants' general pedagogical understandings expanded as they were able to apply classroom readings and theories of child development in the classrooms. They gained a better understanding of the children and themselves. Through their service students were also able to help meet regional and local needs as well as university and college goals, such as providing "international focus to our curricula and research programs" and becoming "more inclusive and diverse" (University of Central Florida, 2005, p. 1).
Tsigilis 2006	Prospective Early Childhood Educators' Attitudes toward Teaching Multicultural Classes: A Planned Behavior Theory Perspective	Examine prospective early childhood educators' attitudes towards teaching multicultural classes using planned behaviour theoretical framework	Greece	Results showed that the planned behavior model can be applied to the multicultural domain. Self-assessed knowledge significantly increased the predictability of the prospective students' intentions only for the first group (R2= .61). It was concluded that prospective early educators' participation in courses regarding cultural diversity facilitated their

				attitudes towards teaching children from various cultural backgrounds.
Voss 2011	Teaching All Children: Preparing Early Childhood Preservice Teachers in Inclusive Settings	Prepare early childhood preservice teachers for inclusive settings	United States	Measures of self-perceptions of preservice teachers indicate significant growth in preservice teachers' confidence and skills for working with students with special needs through structured inclusive field experiences.
West 2001	Teaching the Third Culture Child	Discussed inclusive practices in early childhood education, discusses child development theory	United States	NR
Young 2018	Deconstructing teacher quality in urban early childhood education	Explore the potential influence that a teachers' educational background may have on kindergarten readiness for African American children in urban early learning settings.	United States	Our assessment indicates that the early learning of African American children in urban settings warrants further consideration by educational stakeholders. Specifically, the process and structural quality of urban early learning environments requires more culturally responsive approaches to policy and practice.
Zabeli 2020	Preschool teacher's awareness, attitudes and challenges towards inclusive early childhood education: a qualitative study	How preschool teachers understand inclusive education	Kosovo	The results indicate that teachers have a common understanding of inclusion, but they lack proper skills and knowledge on adequate teaching methods to work with children with special needs. However, they see inclusion to be an essential

				process and an excellent opportunity for all children.