ETHNIC IDENTITY AS PROCESS

ETHNIC IDENTITY AS PROCESS:

THE ETHNIC SELF AND OTHER AS PERCEIVED BY POST-WAR SCOTS IN HAMILTON

By

TIMOTHY D. EPP, B.A.

A Thesis

Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies

in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements

for the Degree

Master of Arts

McMaster University

MASTER OF ARTS (1994) McMASTER UNIVERSITY
(Anthropology) Hamilton, Ontario

TITLE: Ethnic Identity as Process: The Ethnic Self and Other as Perceived by Scots in Hamilton

AUTHOR: Timothy D. Epp, B.A. (McMaster University)

SUPERVISOR: Professor Ellen Badone

NUMBER OF PAGES: iv, 194

Abstract

In this thesis, I present ethnic identity as one aspect of a multifaceted personal identity, subject to constant change through processes of construction and re-construction occuring within specific social, historical, economic and political contexts. My analysis is based on fieldwork interviews conducted with Scots in Hamilton, Ontario, who migrated to Canada after World War II.

Two primary themes emerged from respondents' statements concerning migration and settlement in Canada. The first concerns changes in self-identification occurring in relation to processes of migration. The salience of in-group differences decreases for Scots with migration to Canada, accompanied by an increased identification with a perceived Scottish collectivity in Canada.

The second theme concerns the display of ethnic identity. Scots in Hamilton may voluntarily choose to express ethnic identity through the appropriation and manipulation of certain ethnic symbols and their combinations. The nature of this display varies in relation to other elements of personal identity, including gender and social class. One interpretation of these differences provided by Scottish respondents centers around social mobility and societal expectations for members of different social classes.

Furthermore, the reification of a popular Scottish culture within Canada lends itself to the appropriation and manipulation of Scottish ethnic symbolism by non-Scots.

In conclusion, I provide several suggestions as to the role and importance of ethnic identity in a contemporary Canadian society of blurred cultural boundaries. I also promote further study on variation in ethnic identification along lines of gender and social class.

Acknowledgements

I wish to thank Dr. Ellen Badone for her supervision throughout the completion of this thesis. I am also grateful for the comments provided by Dr. Matthew Cooper and Dr. Richard Preston concerning revisions to this thesis, and for their participation on my defense committee.

Finally, I wish to thank Dr. Sally Cole for her supportive comments and suggestions during the early stages of this thesis.

Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction

Introduction....1
A.Canadian Ethnic Studies....2
B.Historical and Political Context....8
(i)Canada's Immigration Policy....8
(ii)The White Immigration Policy....10
(iii)Post-World War II....11
(iv)British Decline....13
(v)Destinations....14
C.Research Population and Methodology....15
(i)Contact....15
(ii)Research Population....18
(a)Generation....18
(b)Gender....19
(c)Period of Immigration and Geographic Origins....20
(d)Age....20
(e)Interview Settings....21

Chapter 2: Theories of Ethnicity: Variations and Critique

A.Introduction....22
B.Ethnicity in North America....28
C.Are Scots Ethnic?....30
D.Summary....34
E.Ethnic Boundaries....35
(i)Introduction....36
(ii)In-Group Distinctions....36
(a) Region and Locality....36
(b) Locality and Accent....41
(c)Religion....48
(iii)Out-Group Boundaries....54
(a)Immigration and Canada's Ethnic Population....55
F.Summary....62

Chapter 3: Ethnic Symbolism: Participation and Public Dispaly

A.Introduction....64
B.Canadian Multiculturalism....64
C.Perceptions of Ethnicity and Multiculturalism....68
D.Assimilation....72
E.Participation
The Performance of Ethnicity....75

(i)Music and Dance....77
(ii)Food....80
F.Summary....83

Chapter 4: The Scottish Community
A.Introduction....85
B.The Ethnic Community....85
C.Corktown....91
D.Concession St. Business Section....93
E.Scottish Space in Clubs and Legions....98
F.Summary....110
G.Community, Gender and Social Class....112

Chapter 5: Gender, Ethnic Identity and Community
A.Introduction....114
B.Gender and the Scottish Community....116
C.Migration, Occupation and Gender....119
D.Summary....127

Chapter 6: Occupational Level, Social Mobility and Ethnic Identity
A.Introduction....129
B.Class, Ethnicity and Anthropology....129
C.Occupation and Community....132
D.The Pub Network....134
E.Scottish Cultural Organizations and Societies....142
(i) Dance....143
(ii)Formal Dance Societies....146
(iii)Comparison of Social Networks....152
(iv)Robert Burns....158
(v)The Formal Scottish Community....163
E.Opie's Meats and the Tartan Club....164
F.Interpretations....165
(i)Social Mobility and Ethnic Expression....166
(ii)Motivation for Emigration....167
(iii)Class and Societal Expectations....169
(G)Summary....170

Chapter 7:Conclusions
Conclusions....173

Chapter 1: Introduction

During the first two decades following the Second World War, admission of immigrants to Canada was guided by a preference for immigrants of British origin, a phenomenon characteristic of the ideology underlying the nation's immigration policy throughout the twentieth century. A significant proportion of these immigrants were skilled labourers from Scotland who were escaping post-war conditions of poverty, unemployment and food shortages in their home country. Attracted by job openings in southern Ontario industry, many of these people found employment in the steelmills and factories of Hamilton.

Since the early 1950s, changes in Canadian immigration policy have resulted in the admission of increased numbers of non-British immigrants to Canada. The development and implementation of a national policy of multiculturalism has heightened the cultural visibility of these immigrants within Canadian society.

The analysis of emic perceptions of ethnic identity provides a fruitful approach to the understanding of changing relationships among immigrant populations in Canadian society, in light of these changes in immigration patterns and policy. However, while research in the field of ethnic studies has often focused on the ethnic community and identity of minorities in relation to processes of

integration and assimilation, these studies seldom pay attention to `mainstream' British and French cultural groups in Canada.

In this thesis, I will draw on interview statements provided by Scots in Hamilton during the summer of 1993, examining the role of ethnic identity for Scottish individuals within specific historical, social, economic and political contexts. I will also present ethnic identity as processual, changing with migration processes and in relation to other aspects of personal identity including class and gender. Furthermore, I will present ethnic identity as one aspect of a multifaceted personal identity, varying in its expression by individual Scots in relation to other aspects of identity including class and gender. I will conclude by suggesting further study on relationships among factors of ethnic identity and other aspects of personal identity, and on the applicability of models of the ethnic group and community to ethnic identity in late-twentieth century Canadian society.

A. Canadian Ethnic Studies

Since the 1960s, increased attention has been given to Canadian ethnic studies, prompted by changes in immigration patterns, the increased visibility of an ethnically heterogeneous population, and the development and implementation of a national multiculturalism policy (Buchignani 1982). Since this period, the body of Canadian

ethnic literature has grown rapidly, including the publication of an ethnic history series sponsored by the Canadian Multiculturalism Directorate and a wealth of studies by social scientists appearing in academic journals such as `Canadian Ethnic Studies' and the `Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology', examining the lifestyles and settlement patterns of various ethnic groups.

During the late 1960s, theory of ethnicity also went through a period of significant change. In particular, while earlier approaches emphasized objective markers of ethnic groups, Barth's now-classic Ethnic Groups and Boundaries (1969), provided greater emphasis to the subjective nature of ethnic identification.

These changes in ethnicity theory are also reflected in the constant redefinition of terms including `ethnicity' and `ethnic identity'. In this thesis, I will draw on the definition of `ethnicity' provided by Edward Herberg, who describes this phenomenon as "People who have been counted, and/or who have counted themselves, as belonging to a particular group, usually by birth and by practices and perceptions" (Herberg 1989:3). For the purposes of this thesis, `ethnic identity' will refer to the nature of an individual's allegiance to this group, while `ethnic expression' will refer to the manifestation of this allegiance on the part of the individual.

However, while studies by anthropologists apply Barth's approach through emphasizing a qualitative approach and the consideration of emic perspectives, these contributions have been relatively few in number in comparison to articles by sociologists and cultural psychologists. Anthropological research on ethnicity appears in several edited volumes of sociological analysis (e.g. Li 1990), but other chapters in these works draw primarily on works of sociology and psychology for references.

Furthermore, Buchignani writes that the field of Canadian ethnic studies is dominated by sociological quantitative analysis, and "suffers from a rather constant disregard of history and process and consequently tends to produce static `snapshots' of ethnic behaviour frozen in time" (Buchignani 1982:28). While studies in the field of cross-cultural psychology have illustrated the processual nature of ethnic identification (Lalonde, Taylor and Moghaddam 1992; Moghaddam and Taylor 1987), anthropologists have done little to further this perspective (Buchignani 1980; Greenhill 1992; McKay 1980; Ng 1981; Ralston 1988; Sorenson 1991). Exceptions to this rule include several articles illustrating developmental stages in the formation of ethnic groups (Marger and Obermiller 1983, 1987; Molohon, Paton and Lambert 1979).

Several factors contributing to this trend include government preference for results in the form of measurable

`hard data', the highly defined parameters of study and low potential for unpredicted results characteristic of quantitative studies, and the difficulty of translating qualitative data into public knowledge (Buchignani 1982:24).

Greenhill's (1992) study of English immigrants in Ontario illustrates a second trend in Canadian ethnic studies, centering around the application of the term `ethnic'. While the implementation of Canadian multiculturalism policy has inspired a significant amount of research on ethnic groups, in particular European groups such as the Ukrainians (Lupul 1982a, 1982b, 1983, 1984) and Asiatic groups such as East Indians (Buchignani 1977, 1979, 1981; Ralston 1988), the term `ethnic' has often come to be equated only with these people. With few exceptions (Goyder 1983; Greenhill 1992; Handler 1983; Lambert and Curtis 1983), little attention has been given to the ethnic identity and composition of British and French ethnic groups, leaving the impression of homogeneous collectivities labelled as `Majority Canadians' or `charter groups' (Breton et al. 1975, 1990). However, several recent studies have identified significant variation in terms of cultural and ethnic identity within the `British' category, emphasizing in particular the distinctiveness of Scottish ethnicity (Bumsted 1982; Macdonald 1988; McKay 1992).

A third theme in Canadian ethnic studies centres around the presentation of ethnic groups in the academic

literature. Ethnic groups and ethnic identity have been presented as phenomena which are uniformly experienced by all immigrants. While the publication of John Porter's The Vertical Mosaic (1965) led to increased attention by anthropologists and sociologists to relationships among elements of ethnicity, class and social mobility (Goldstein 1988; Ogmundson and McLaughlin 1992; Satzewich and Li 1987), these studies most often involve comparative analysis of ethnic groups, thus assuming the existence of collectivities sharing a common socioeconomic status. Variation between genders in the construction and expression of ethnic identity has also been largely ignored through a lack of attention to differences in the experiences of male and female immigrants.

In this thesis, I will approach several of these relatively unexplored areas in an analysis of the ethnic identity of post-war Scottish immigrants to Hamilton, Ontario. This industrial urban centre of approximately 300,000 people is located at the western end of Lake Ontario, straddling the Niagara escarpment or the `Mountain', as it is locally known. Through examination of statements provided by interviewees during fieldwork for this thesis, I will illustrate the significance of the immigration experience for the development of personal affiliation with a larger ethnic collectivity. I will also demonstrate the dynamic nature of ethnicity, illustrating the importance of the analysis and

contextualization of perceptions of community and ethnic identity in terms of class and gender.

Before continuing, it is important to note several limits of this study. First, while the present thesis describes changes in self-perception over a significant number of years for each respondent, the research is primarily based on interviews and participant observation conducted with Scots in Hamilton during the spring and summer of 1993. Therefore, this thesis relies on the memories of respondents, expressed in conversations taking place several years after individuals migrated to Canada. Although I took measures to compensate for this factor, including conducting interviews with several respondents on different occasions, this research does not constitute the longitudinal study necessary for the documentation of incremental changes in self-perception amongst Scottish immigrants. However, common themes emerging through interviews provide support for the examination of ethnicity as process and for the existence of intra-group diversity in terms of ethnic identification and the manipulation of ethnic symbolism.

Finally, my involvement in the veterans' legions, pubs and formal societies where Scots socialize in Hamilton impressed upon me the existence of three Scottish social networks in the city. While involvement in other sectors of social life, such as church activities, would have probably

led to the discovery of other social networks, I will concentrate on these three for the purposes of this thesis.

B.Historical and Political Context

Scottish immigration to Canada from the pre-Confederation fur trade period to the early twentieth century is well-documented in a substantial historical literature (i.e. Brander 1982; Bumsted 1980, 1982; Devine 1992; Donaldson 1966; Reid 1976). However, few studies have focused on twentieth century Scottish-Canadians. Exceptions to this rule include a handful of sociological and historical studies of Scots and their descendants in the Maritimes (Davis 1985; McKay 1992). However, government statistical evidence indicates that there have been several significant post-World War II migrations from Scotland to Canada, particularly in the years 1957 and 1966-67 (Ontario Ministry of Culture and Recreation 1981). In the following section, I will provide a descriptive analysis of this phenomenon.

(i)Canada's Immigration Policy

Until the relatively recent past, Canadian immigration policy evidenced a preference for immigrants from Great Britain and western Europe. Identifying this as the `white Canada policy', Freda Hawkins writes that while Canada did not have an official immigration restriction act, "elements of restriction, directed first against the Chinese and later against all potential non-white immigrants, were present in her immigration legislation from the 1880s onwards" (Hawkins

1991:16). Section 38 of the Immigration Act of 1910 prohibited the entry to Canada of persons who had not made a continuous journey from their native country to Canada, and of passengers who journeyed to Canada by means of a transportation company which did not comply with the Act (Hawkins 1991:17). This effectively prohibited the entry of East Indian and Japanese immigrants, whose voyages necessitated a stop in Hawaii. This Act also discriminated against "immigrants belonging to any race deemed unsuited to the climate or requirements of Canada, or of immigrants of any specified class, occupation or character" (Hawkins 1991:17). This clause was expanded in 1919 to include reference to the `nationality' of undesired immigrants, prohibited "by reason of any economic, industrial or other specified class or occupation" due to unsuitability to "climatic, industrial, social, educational, labour or other conditions" or due to "peculiar customs, habits, modes of life and methods of holding property...[and] probable inability to become readily assimilated" (Hawkins 1991:18).

Legislation including the Chinese Immigration Act of 1923 and several orders-in-council of the 1920s and 1930s also contributed to immigration restrictions imposed against persons from Asian countries. However, preference for British and American immigrants was exemplified by official policy. Under the Order in Council P.C. 695 of March 21, 1931, categories of persons admissible to Canada included

British subjects, United States citizens and agriculturalists possessing sufficient means to maintain themselves until employment was secured or a farming practice was established. Wives and fiancees of men holding residence in Canada and their unmarried children under 18 were also eligible for admission (King 1947:2645).

(ii) The White Immigration Policy

In her study of Canadian immigration patterns, Hawkins (1991) identifies several aspects of the ideology underlying the Canadian preference for British immigrants. First, British immigrants since the pre-Confederation era have had "the desire to build and preserve societies and political systems in their hard-won, distant lands very like those of the United Kingdom" (Hawkins 1991:22). The difficulties and hardships which had faced the British immigrant ancestors of many Canadians instilled a sense of ownership of the country, accompanied by strong resistance to the admission of non-British immigrants who had not participated in these pioneering efforts and who were therefore perceived to have little right to the nation's comforts and benefits (Hawkins 1991:22).

Furthermore, Canadian sociologist Jean Burnet writes that Canadian immigration policy prior to the 1960s was "based upon the principle that those who were admitted into Canadian society should be assimilable into the dominant English and French ethnic groups" (Burnet 1987:66). Non-

British immigrants were generally perceived to assimilate more slowly to Canadian lifestyles than their British counterparts.

Canada had also long been dependent upon Britain for the establishment of law and order in the new country, for political ideas and development capital, and for the creation of "the necessary structures and systems, large and small, of a modern state" (Hawkins 1991:22). A significant proportion of Canada's population was of British descent, and this group held British educational, political and legal systems in high esteem.

(iii)Post-World War II

High numbers of British immigrants entered Canada during the first few decades of the twentieth century, with Scots constituting a significant proportion of this immigrant population. However, these figures declined during the two World Wars and the Depression, corresponding with national financial difficulties (Driedger 1989:73; Statistics Canada, 1961).

Jean Bruce writes that several government-sponsored surveys conducted immediately after the war evidenced a resistance toward increased immigration amongst a majority of respondents, reflecting a national state of uncertainty in terms of Canada's social, political and economic future (Bruce 1982:14). However, the end of the war also signalled the release of conscientious objectors and prisoners of war

from agricultural labour and various work projects. Survey results indicated that few Canadians were willing to fill these positions, and immigrant labour seemed a plausible alternative.

Addressing this labour shortage, Prime Minister Mackenzie King announced that Canada would accept candidates from postwar refugee camps and European relatives of Canadian residents, and that certain restrictions prohibiting Asian immigration would be lifted. However, preference for admission would continue to be given to British and American citizens (King 1947:2645).

This emphasis was encouraged by the selection of Britain for the most active of Canada's immigration campaigns, implemented through the establishment of a large proportion of Canada's immigration offices and officials in Britain (Richmond 1967:13-14; Bruce 1982:64).

Several other social, historical and economic factors contributed to an increase in migration from Great Britain to Canada. The war had been an unsettling period for many people in Scotland. Experience in the armed services had introduced many people to new countries and ideas, and to potential alternatives to the British social class system. The post-war Scottish economy was unstable, evidenced by the decline of several interrelated industries including shipbuilding, iron and steel manufacturing, and coal mining (Credland 1969; Hume 1990; Payne 1992).

Immigration statistics from the Department of Manpower and Immigration indicate a significant inflow to Canada of skilled labourers in the areas of manufacturing, mechanical and construction industries. For most years during the period 1948-1967, the greatest percentage of these immigrant labourers were of British origin. Scots were only second to English in numbers of labourers immigrating to Canada (Department of Manpower and Immigration, 1948-1961).

Post-war rationing, housing shortages, and the presence of family, relatives and in-laws already in Canada provided additional incentive for migration to Canada, resulting in high levels of British and Scottish immigration continuing until the late 1960s. (Hollingsworth 1970; Jones 1979; Reid 1976:303; Wood 1964).

(iv)British Decline

However, numbers of British immigrants declined towards the late 1960s, in correlation with several significant changes to immigration patterns and policy.

In the early 1950s, increased demand for emigration from non-European countries prompted the development of a non-discriminatory Canadian immigration policy, resulting in increased numbers of immigrants from Asia and other non-European countries (Burnet 1987:94; Herberg 1989:60; Kalbach 1987:92,94). In 1967, the Canadian government implemented the `points' system for determining the admission of immigrants. Proposed as a more objective measure of admission

eligibility, immigrants could enter the country as Independents, depending on the number of points granted them on bases of "education, personal qualities, occupational demand, occupational skill, age, arranged employ-ment, and knowledge of the official languages" (Driedger 1989: 76). Driedger writes that this policy has encouraged increased numbers of immigrants from Third-World countries, but has been accompanied by a decline in immigration from Britain.

(v)Destinations

While Scots who migrated earlier in the century often settled in rural areas, immigrants between and after the World Wars more frequently had rapidly expanding urban centres as their destinations, offering a greater potential for the securing of employment (Statistics Canada, 1961). Most Scottish immigrants chose to settle in Ontario, although the province of British Columbia also received significant numbers of these immigrants (Department of Citizenship and Immigration: 1954-1966). Statistics indicate that, with the exceptions of the years 1949-1951 and 1959, Scots were consistently listed among the five largest ethnic groups immigrating to the province during the post-war period 1946-1966 (Department of Manpower and Immigration, 1946-1966). Within Ontario, Scots settled particularly in the province's `golden horseshoe' stretching along Lake Ontario from Oshawa, west through Toronto and Hamilton, and southeast to St. Catharines (Elliott and Fleras 1990:56). In particular, the

cities of Toronto and Hamilton received significant numbers of Scottish migrants during the post-war era (Statistics Canada, 1981). However, while Scots have consistently constituted one of the largest ethnic groups in the city of Hamilton during the twentieth century, statistical analysis shows that the proportion of persons in the city claiming British ethnic origins has declined in relation to general population growth, reflecting general immigration trends (Statistics Canada, 1921; 1961; 1971; 1981).

C.Research Population and Methodology

(i)Contact

I began my fieldwork in December 1992 by contacting the Hamilton & District Multicultural Council, the Hamilton branch of the Ministry of Community and Social Services, and Community Information Services at the Hamilton Public Library in order to locate a Scottish group which would be open to participating in my research project. The personnel at the library directed me to the Royal Scottish Country Dance Society (RSCDS), which I shall describe in further detail in a later chapter. However, while I met Scots at the Society's monthly dances and public performances, I soon realized that the membership of the dance classes was primarily non-Scottish. While I conducted several interviews with RSCDS participants and instructors, and was directed by these people to several other Scottish dance groups, I also decided

to extend the bounds of my research beyond the confines of this society.

In January, I attended a Robert Burns Supper at the Royal Connaught Hotel, hosted by the Hamilton Robert Burns Society. Unfortunately, while my attendance at this celebration led to an interview with the Society's Scottish president and secretary, few other people with whom I conversed at the Burns Supper identified themselves as Scottish.

I re-contacted the library and was finally directed by a frustrated information attendant to a British veterans' legion in central Hamilton. The presence and participation of Scots within Hamilton legions was also supported through my observations at another Robert Burns Supper held at one of the Hamilton branches of the Royal Canadian Legion. I arranged for a meeting with the legion's president, and conducted my first interview with him. He agreed to allow me to conduct interviews in the legion clubroom. Through successive interviews, respondents directed me to other legions and clubs which hosted a Scottish clientele. I conducted interviews and participant observation within these settings from March-June 1993.

In January of 1993 I also interviewed a professor of Scottish history at Guelph University, who directed me to the clientele of the Lion's Head, a Scottish pub in central Hamilton. I arranged to meet with several of the pub's

managers and was allowed to conduct interviews in this establishment. Through interviews with pub clients, I was directed to two other pubs and one Scottish bar on the Hamilton escarpment. I conducted interviews and participant observation in these establishments during the summer of 1993.

Altogether, I conducted fieldwork interviews with seventy first-generation Scottish immigrants who are presently living in Hamilton. Fieldwork research was conducted following a snowball sampling procedure, as initial conversations with legion presidents, dance instructors and pub managers provided me with further contacts in these contexts (Bernard 1988:98).

I also gained permission to carry out participant observation fieldwork in these various establishments and societies. Through talking and drinking with legion and pub clients, conversing with other dance participants and attending cultural festivals, I became acquainted with Scots in these various settings. I requested interviews with men and women, asking if I could sit at their table in the legion or have a drink with them in the Scottish pubs. At the end of each interview, I asked respondents if they knew of anyone else who would be interested in talking with me about their migration experiences and Scottish culture.

Interviews followed a semi-structured format (Bernard 1988: 203-224). Although I carried an interview outline with

me, I found legion and pub clients to be more receptive to general conversation than to answering a rigid set of questions. Furthermore, open-ended conversation often presented new angles for research that I had not previously considered.

While I carried a tape recorder to my first several interviews, I quickly discovered that respondents were not comfortable with this format. As a result, I switched to making notes in shorthand while conducting interviews. I typed these notes into my computer as soon as possible after the interview.

(ii) Research Population

Scots interviewed in various Hamilton establishments and societies varied in several significant aspects, including gender, age and social class. However, respondents also shared sufficient commonalities in terms of geographic origin, age and year of immigration to provide a composite picture of my research population.

(a) Generation

I restricted my interviews to first generation immigrants, who had been born in Scotland and/or had Scotland as their last country of residence before migrating to Canada. I chose to restrict my research focus to this population for several reasons. I wanted to explore the importance of ethnic symbolism for the personal ethnic identity of Scottish immigrants in Hamilton, in light of the

proliferation of popular Scottish culture in southern Ontario. I selected first-generation immigrants because I felt that interviews with this population would provide me with the perspective of Scottish immigrants encountering Scottish-Canadian ethnic symbolism for the first time, shedding light on processes of ethnogenesis and cultural maintenance. I was also interested in Gans' (1979) theory of `symbolic ethnicity', but perceived most of Gans' attention to focus on third-generation immigrants. I decided that in focusing on first-generation Scottish immigrants, I would be able to provide a study which would complement Gans' work. While this secondary interest changed in response to topics addressed during fieldwork interviews, I nevertheless maintained my focus on first-generation immigrants.

(b) Gender

Owing in part to gender-related differences in membership and participation within various Scottish social networks, this study is slightly weighted towards interviews with men. Men were present in the legions and pubs more often than women. I also felt that in several situations it would be considered general etiquette for a male anthropologist to associate with other males. Although I did interview several Scottish couples, respondents in the legions often identified themselves as widowers. However, I did conduct a significant number of interviews with women at

one veterans' legion and at the Hamilton branch of the Young Women's Christian Association (Y.W.C.A).

(c)Period of Immigration and Geographic Origins

Most of the Scots with whom I conducted interviews had migrated to Canada between 1948 and 1967, corresponding with the peak post-war period of British immigration to Canada. Prior to emigration, most people interviewed had been born and/or worked in the central urban area of Scotland, with communities of origin ranging from Dumbarton in the west and Edinburgh in the east, and from Lanark in the south to Stirling in the north. Two men also came from northeastern Scotland, and one man came from Stranraer in the southwest of the country. Glasgow was most often mentioned as respondents' place of origin.

(d)Age

Respondents generally were between forty and eighty years old. With the exception of several children present at the RSCDS monthly dances, held at the Y.W.C.A., I never observed or met anyone younger than thirty-six. The children of respondents were most often adults and had left home by the time of my interviews. The age of respondents reflects the general decline in immigration from British source countries.

Respondents were generally less than fifteen years old, or between the ages of twenty and thirty-four, at the time of first migration to Canada. This observation

corresponds with Statistics Canada census figures from 1986, which indicate that most people claiming single Scottish ethnic origins, or multiple ethnic origins including `Scottish', were between twenty and thirty-nine years old at the time of their migration to Hamilton (Statistics Canada, 1986).

(e) Interview Settings

Finally, fieldwork interviews for this thesis were conducted within legions, pubs and societies with Scots of varying social class and occupation. While many respondents told me that they were employed in the steelmills and factories of Hamilton, I also interviewed university professors, a librarian, a technical oil consultant, an insurance salesman and several other people who identified their occupation as `white-collar'.

Chapter 2: Theories of Ethnicity: Variations and Critique

A. Introduction

In the recent past, the very nature of social and cultural categorization has come into question within the discipline of anthropology, in the context of a more general reevaluation of traditional social scientific paradigms. Anthropologists identifying themselves as writers of `new ethnography' have characterized static and fixed images of cultures as "tied to global politics and to rhetorical style rather than to objective realities" (Mahmood and Armstrong 1992:3).

In the midst of this paradigm shift, "tectonic in its implications" (Clifford and Marcus 1986:22), the terminology of `culture' and its subsets, which has occupied a central place in anthropological writing, has been reevaluated in terms of its relevance to the viewpoints and interests of those whom the practitioners in the discipline select as foci of research.

Mahmood and Armstrong (1992) associate the emergence of ethnic studies with this paradigm shift, as the model of ethnic `in- and out-group identification' was viewed by anthropologists as an alternative to studies of cultural boundaries relying on lists of objective criteria.

However, in their study of Frisian ethnic identity, Mahmood and Armstrong note that several of their Frisian interlocutors disagreed with the use of the term `ethnic minority' in describing the research population, and that significant differences existed in the ethnic self-identification of respondents from different Frisian localities (Mahmood and Armstrong 1992:2). In their interpretation of these discrepancies, the authors refer to the problematic nature of a model of categorical organization which, although critiqued for several decades now by scholars in the areas of philosophy (Wittgenstein 1953) and cognitive psychology (Rosch and Mervis 1975), continues to influence the field of ethnic studies. Identified by Mahmood and Armstrong as Aristotelian in its origins, this model is based on the premise that "a concept stands for a set of features that all of the instances of the concept have in common. Each feature is necessary, and taken together they are sufficient for conferring category membership" (Mahmood and Armstrong 1992:4). However, this model fails to express "the deep emotional and aesthetic attachments that group members feel toward their traditions" (Mahmood and Armstrong 1992:6).

Ethnicity theorists have developed several alternative approaches to the study of social categorization which focus on subjective interpretations of ethnic identity.

In Barth's Ethnic Groups and Boundaries, the author draws on current definitions of ethnic groups as

"biologically self-perpetuating...shar[ing] fundamental cultural values, realized in overt unity in cultural forms...mak[ing] up a field of communication and interaction" and being identified by their members and non-members as different from other categories of the same order (Barth 1969:11). However, he proposes that ethnic groups cannot be identified on the basis of objective criteria alone, and emphasizes the subjective nature of in-group and out-group differentiation.

While social scientific approaches to ethnicity have largely continued this approach to ethnic group definition and identification, subjectivists have divided themselves into at least two polarized theoretical camps, often labelled `primordialist' and `circumstantialist'. Several writers have proposed recent syntheses of these approaches (McKay 1982; Scott 1990).

The primordialist approach, promoted in the writings of Geertz (1963), Isaacs (1975), and Isajiw (1974) bases analyses of ethnic group divisions on affective and historical aspects, emphasizing `emotive bonds' surrounding images of a group's distinctive past (Scott 1990:148). These sentiments are not explicable through reference to political and economic interests alone (Mahmood and Armstrong 1992:6; McKay 1982:396). Rather, ethnic group solidarity is explained in psychological terms, with ethnicity defined as

the "intimations of belonging in one family, the strands of communal memory of distant pasts and the vague but keen attachments to the land of the fathers" (Smith 1984:285). While this approach has been challenged as relying on ill-defined emotive explanations, it nevertheless continues to influence and inform current studies of ethnicity. In his examination of the evolution of Scottish nationalism, Esman (1977) emphasizes the significance to national identity of economic and political factors including the discovery of North Sea oil, but also stresses the importance of primordial elements.

The second general theoretical approach has been variously categorized as `mobilizationist', `situationalist' or `circumstantialist'. Promoted in the writings of Vincent (1974), van den Berghe (1976) and Handler (1988), this approach emphasizes ethnic group distinctions and cleavages as arising from `specific and immediate circumstances' (Glazer and Moynihan 1975:19-20). Some writers in this vein emphasize the enhancement of ethnic group identity through addressing `structural conditions', while others emphasize the selection of ethnic identity as a means of obtaining desired political, economic or social ends. In his analysis of Canadian multicultural policy and ethnicity, Weinfeld writes that in the Canadian context "ethnicity becomes an `affective' attribute, lending distinctiveness to individual identity when most roads to achievement and social acceptance

seem those of conformity and convention" (Weinfeld 1981:93). While not all groups or group members share the same goals, this model proposes a behavioural interpretation of general ethnic group solidarity. Extreme positions have been taken by writers in both of these theoretical camps, resulting in statements on the one hand which propose vague concepts of `groupness' binding ethnic group members together, and on the other hand theories which interpret ethnic identity in terms of economic and political determinism.

Furthermore, Mahmood and Armstrong write that some mobilizationist studies (i.e. Handler 1988) continue to rely on objectivist criteria for the identification of ethnic groups, disqualifying certain collectivities from being categorized as ethnic groups, and thus proving incongruous to statements of self-perceived `peoplehood' by group members.

As an alternative to extreme primordialist and mobilizationist models, Mahmood and Armstrong propose the adoption of an approach promoted by several writers in fields of philosophy, cognitive psychology and biology. The authors identify their interpretive approach as `prototypic', maintaining that while ethnic groups may be identifiable in terms of specific traits, "recognizable members share some but not all traits, and those traits are not equally weighted in people's minds" (Mahmood and Armstrong 1992:8). Thus, populations which vary amongst themselves in terms of their identification with ethnic symbolism and manipulation of this

symbolism, may still identify themselves using the same ethnic label (Cohen 1978).

Adopting this approach is advantageous in several ways. It avoids both the trappings of vague emotive interpretations of ethnicity and the deterministic approach promoted by mobilizationist studies, which are sufficient interpretations only in select cases, emphasizing instead "aspect[s] of the human cognitive process of categorization which, though much more complex than traditional models imagined, will persist through all the ups and downs of intellectual debate and political fortune" (Mahmood and Armstrong 1992:11). These cognitive processes may manifest themselves in contexts of political or economic mobilization, but this is not a necessary condition for ethnic identity.

This approach also continues Barth's emphasis on the subjective nature of group differentiation and identification without ignoring objective manifestations of cognitive processes.

Furthermore, while recognizing ethnicity as cultural construct and at times the product of academic and political rhetoric, the value of `ethnicity' and `ethnic group' as analytical tools for the interpretation of societal group differentiation is not negated. As Mahmood and Armstrong write: "if one accepts that the phenomenal world, even if provisional, has a pragmatic reality for us, then investigating how this world is perceived and constructed is

as crucial as the realization that on another level entitivity is a fiction" (Mahmood and Armstrong 1992:12).

Finally, this approach privileges variation in respondents' means of self-identification as `Scottish' or `Scottish-Canadian' and the symbols evoked in these processes.

One criticism of this approach concerns Mahmood and Armstrong's reference to prototypic images. While the authors do not address the origin of these images in their study, this thesis will demonstrate the processual nature of ethnic identity formation within larger political, economic, social and historical contexts, resulting in constant redefinition and recreation of ethnic images and group identity through social interaction.

B.Ethnicity in North America

Perceptions of self and other do not develop in isolation from a larger society. Rather, the formation of ethnic identity must be situated in its historical, social, economic and political contexts.

In her study on Californian Italian-Americans (1984), Micaela di Leonardo writes that ethnicity is a phenomenon of state societies, with those groups differing significantly from the majority population in terms of behaviour or physical appearance being labelled as `ethnic' (di Leonardo 1984:22, 23). However, objective criteria such as the actual possession of a common ancestry amongst members of an

ethnic group are not so crucial to group identification as the perception of their existence: "It is the labelling itself, the cultural process, that is crucial to the construction of ethnicity" (di Leonardo 1984:23).

The author continues to write that this process does not occur within a vacuum, but rather "alter[s] with changing historical periods and var[ies] according to their characteristic economies" (di Leonardo 1984:23).

Several Canadian ethnic studies also assume a dynamic approach to ethnicity. In his study of ethnic soccer clubs in Toronto's Italian community, McKay (1980) summarizes the processualist approach as "emphasiz[ing] the variable and contextual aspects of ethnic phenomena" (McKay 1980:5). Rather than presenting ethnic groups as homogeneous collectivities, the processualist approach stresses both inter- and intra-group diversification, with ethnicity presented not as a mystical primordial entity but rather as "an identity which can be negotiated, aligned, manipulated or somehow transformed for a variety of expressive and instrumental motives" (McKay 1980:5).

McKay writes that the terminology of `assimilation' and `acculturation' tends to oversimplify processes of cultural change and inter-ethnic relations (McKay 1980:7). The process of assimilation is not inevitable, nor is the `maintenance' of tradition within immigrant populations. Rather, the expression of ethnic identity is unpredictable

and multifaceted, interacting with other aspects of social identity including gender and social class.

In Buchignani's (1980) study of Fijian Indians in Vancouver, the author notes that personal identity is socially constructed and produced through interactions in which each actor must understand his or her own collective or social identity as well as that of the other actors involved. In Sorenson's study of Ethiopians in Canada, the author agrees in that "identity is fluid and changeable", but identifies Buchignani's model as limited in that it assumes that all actors will agree on one another's social identities, and "does not include all of the permutations relevant to the process of interaction, [as] these perceptions may actually be widely divergent or...directly opposed" (Sorenson 1991:67).

While these models are not all in agreement with one another, the common emphasis on ethnicity as process provides a basis from which to begin addressing questions regarding the formation of ethnic identity. In the following sections, I will illustrate the usefulness of the models used by Mahmood and Armstrong, Di Leonardo and McKay in the analysis of personal identities of Scots in Hamilton.

C.Are Scots Ethnic?

In her study of English immigrants in Ontario, Pauline Greenhill refers to two themes underlying the categorization of ethnic groups in Canada. The first of these concepts

centres around the identification of Francophone and Anglophone culture as `mainstream', and not `ethnic', while the second observes that "ethnicity is usually attributed to groups other than the[se] so-called `founding nations'" (Greenhill 1992:236, 237). During fieldwork interviews, I consistently asked respondents whether they considered themselves to be members of an ethnic group. While individuals varied in their replies, the responses of several Scots in Hamilton suggest personal identification with such a Canadian `mainstream' population. According to these people, processes of assimilation result in an identity shift from `Scottish' to `Canadian'. Tom, a man from Balloch, told me: *"I'm definitely not part of an ethnic group. I'm Canadian first, like anyone else".*

Respondents often refer to specific processes or events which signify shifts in identity toward becoming `Canadian'. Mary, a barmaid from Glasgow, refers to the birth of her child as such a marker: *"I'm a Canadian. My youngest boy was born here."* Helen, a senior from Bathgate interviewed at the local Young Women's Christian Association [Y.W.C.A.], compared the lengths of her residence in Scotland and Canada: *"I've lived here longer than in Scotland. I'm far more Canadian than Scots."* Elizabeth, an elderly woman from Edinburgh, refers to changes in personal contact with relatives in Scotland: *"I keep in touch with a woman from Dumbarton, but it's not regular contact. We used to get the*

Scots paper but not now. Call us Canadian now." Danny, the proprietor of Hamilton's only Scottish butcher shop, identified the replacement of his British passport by Canadian papers as a marker of identity change: *"When we came, I had no intention of staying in Canada. But I was injured. Now I gave up my British passport, and I'm a Canadian citizen."* Helen, a senior at the Y.W.C.A., changed passports for political reasons: *"I felt funny giving up my British passport for a Canadian passport, but I did it so I could vote. We had to become Canadians."* Among Scots, opinions varied on the acceptability of hyphenated appellations. One man interviewed at a Scottish pub perceived the adoption of the label `Scottish-Canadian' as symbolic of an increased identification with Canadian society: *"I consider myself Scottish-Canadian. I strongly disagree with promoting other cultures in Canada."* Jimmy, a man interviewed at one of Hamilton's legions, perceived incremental shifts in identity as denoted by different appellations: *"My home is in Canada. I am Scottish-Canadian. My kids are Canadian."*

However, for several people the label `Scottish-Canadian' indicates the retention of Scottish identity and a failure to complete the process of the assimilation perceived as necessary for acceptance in Canadian society. This is exemplified in a statement made by Fred, a man from

Perthshire: *"We should be promoting things Canadian. We should do away with the hyphen."*

While most Scots encountered during fieldwork perceive self-appellations of `Canadian' and `Scottish-Canadian' to indicate a shift in identity, most also consider themselves to be `Scottish' in certain respects. People often describe their `Canadian' identity in terms of practical and official domains, whereas `Scottish identity' is associated with emotion and heritage.

John, an instructor of Scottish Country Dancing, distinguishes between Scottish and Canadian aspects of his identity in the following manner: *"I don't see myself as Scottish-Canadian. I see myself as a Canadian with a Scottish background."* Ernie, a man who served an apprenticeship as a toolmaker in Scotland, made similar comments: *"Don't get me wrong ...I'm proud to be Canadian and to keep my Scottish heritage alive."* Another man from Glasgow also perceives this distinction: *"I'm Canadian. My kids speak Canadian. I have a job here, I pay taxes here, I'd fight for this country. But I'm Scottish also. You never forget your heritage, or where you're from."*

While these statements may at first appear paradoxical in terms of identity shift and identity maintenance, they also illustrate the multifaceted nature of personal identity. In Kelner and Kallen's study of Canadian multicultural policy, the authors write that "cultural pluralism encourages

the development of a hyphenated identity...one's national identity is separate from one's ethnic identity" (Kelner and Kallen 1974:23). This premise is evidenced in the distinction made by Scots between emphasizing `Canadian' and `Scottish' identity. In the words of Ruby, a woman from Glasgow: *"There's no conflict between being both Canadian and Scottish."* Further study on the social and historical contexts of the expression of various aspects of personal identity may lead to increased understanding of the relationships between ethnicity and other aspects of personal identity.

D.Summary

To summarize this section, I propose that although these statements indicate variation in respondents' self-perceptions in terms of ethnic and national identity, the theories of `ethnicity' outlined by Barth (1969), di Leonardo (1984), McKay (1980) and Mahmood and Armstrong (1992) continue to provide useful analytical tools with which to examine in- and out-group differentiation between Scots and other ethnic groups in Canada. In the following chapters, I will illustrate that Scots in Ontario perceive themselves to be members of a collectivity which shares a common heritage and cultural symbolism, and which is identified both by members and non-members as distinct not only from other immigrant groups, but also from a more general Canadian populace.

E.Ethnic Boundaries

In Ethnic Groups and Boundaries, Barth states that ethnic groups cannot be identified by content alone. Rather, attention must also be given to the social processes involved in the formation of boundaries which define the categorical limitations of ethnic groups. The formation of the ethnic group constitutes a type of social organization "to the extent that actors use ethnic identities to categorize themselves and others for purposes of interaction" (Barth 1969:14). Barth's ethnic `actors' do not formulate ethnic boundaries in a vacuum, but rather in social and historical contexts which are both specific and constantly changing, necessitating a continuous process of expression and validation (Barth 1969:15). Thus, examination of ethnic groups must emphasize the identification of factors which encourage the emergence of ethnic distinctions within particular contexts (Barth 1969:17, Royce 1982:7).

In the following sections, I will illustrate relationships between changes in self-perception amongst Scottish immigrants in Hamilton and several post-war developments in Canada's national immigration policy. In this analysis, I shall refer to perceived distinctions among Scots themselves in terms of `in-group' distinctions, while perceived differences between Scots and other ethnic groups will be referred to as `out-group' distinctions.

(i) Introduction

In discussions with Scots in Ontario, several aspects of self-other group definition become apparent. First, Scots distinguish in-group variation on the basis of at least five factors: region or locality of origin, manner of speech, religious orientation, class and gender. Secondly, while in-group variation is emphasized in discourse which is either past-oriented or focused on Scotland, discussion concerning Canadian ethnic issues often centres on out-group distinctions. This difference indicates a change in the nature of in-group/out-group identification, corresponding to the experience of migration. Third, respondents did not only identify in-group/out-group distinctions, but also phrased these distinctions in terms of cultural evaluations. As Anthony Cohen writes: "We do not simply become aware of our culture; we also attribute value to it, positively or negatively, and accordingly attribute values to the culture which confronts our own" (Cohen 1982:5). Finally, respondents associated statements of cultural evaluation more often with statements of out-group differences than with statements about in-group distinctions.

(ii) In-Group Distinctions

(a) Region and Locality

In the North American ethnic literature, ethnic groups are often presented as sharply defined, homogeneous

collectivities bearing labels such as `Italian', `Irish', or `Japanese'. While most Hamilton respondents born in Scotland or having migrated from Scotland to Canada identify themselves either as Scottish or as possessing Scottish ancestry, interviews with these respondents also illustrate definite sub-group distinctions within the category of `Scots'. Through the examination of statements provided by interviewees, I will examine relationships between in-group identification and societal context.

First, Scots often identify in-group distinctions in terms of region or locality of origin. On a large scale of analysis, respondents perceived distinct topographical differences between Highland and Lowland regions of Scotland. Laura, a woman from the Glasgow area interviewed at the Y.W.C.A., illustrated the geographical division between these regions: *"There's a sort of division right across above Glasgow and just above Edinburgh. There's a canal which is the division between Highlands and Lowlands."* Laura also associated this regional geographic division with distinct sociocultural patterns, identifying regional differences in subsistence activity and production: *"The Lowlands are all industry. The Highlands are all agriculture and dairy farming. There are fields near the borders. So there's a pure industrial part and a pure agricultural part."*

She also identified regional differences in social customs and linguistic variation as contributing to the

construction of distinct regional identities: "*I went to college in the Highlands; I was told little things to say to people in Gaelic...My uncle on Skye spoke Gaelic; my cousins also spoke Gaelic; all they taught us were swear words...On the Western Isles there's no swimming on Sundays, people only read the bible*".

In considering the import of these statements, it is important to note that this woman is originally from the Lowlands, and is describing the lifestyle and customs of the regional `other'. John also identified several popular symbols of Scottish culture and heritage as having Highland origins: "*There's a difference between Highland and Lowland cultural symbolism. For instance, I'm from Glasgow, and there are no kilts in Glasgow. That's from the Highlands... Highland games are nice to attend, but they're not Lowland in origin.*"

In contrast, John referred to the regional roots of Scottish Country Dance: "*Scottish country dancing was never part of Highland culture. It came from the Lowlands.*" He interpreted the existence of Highland-Lowland cultural distinctions in relation to Scotland's lengthy history of regional political and cultural division: "*In the Highlands they hunted, raised sheep, there was thieving. Cattle stealing was a way of life. There was antipathy between Highlanders and Lowlanders. Lowlanders were settled, agricultural, sedentary peaceable people. Highlanders were*

warring and raiding." These statements correspond with Bumsted's work on Scots in Canada, in which he writes that "Geography, climate, and historical process all combined to draw sharp distinctions between the Lowland and Highland regions" (Bumsted 1982:3). Laura also identified the historical context of Scotland's regional differences, linking regional Scottish differences to Scottish-English sentiment:

> *"Highland people despise Lowlanders...when the English invaded Scotland, they never got past this division. The worst place you can fight is in the mountains. The Lowlands were colored by English culture. This resulted in a mix of English and Scots. They intermarried, and culture and schools were in the English tradition. Highlanders despised this. Lowlanders had allowed themselves to accept invaders, and took up English culture."*

While the Lowlands are seen by Scottish respondents as having been tainted by English influence, the authentic Scottish spirit is still thought to live in the Highlands. Laura associates the involvement of a family member in the Scottish independence movement with his residence in the Western Isles: *"My brother was a Scottish nationalist; he lived on a little isle off the west coast of Scotland..."* However, this distinct identity is perceived by at least one Glaswegian respondent as being threatened by the recent purchase of property in the Western Isles by `Englishmen'.

One woman at the Y.W.C.A. told me that these distinctions do not necessarily imply a lack of inter-regional social interaction: *"My mother was from the*

Highlands...Quite a few here have people in the Highlands." Jean, another woman at the center, reinforced this statement: *"My father came down from the Highlands, worked in the mines."* However, it is important to note that these women identified their parents in terms of their regional origins.

In summary, these respondents perceive distinct differences between Highland and Lowland regions in terms of both topography and the origins of specific cultural symbols and practises. However, the perception of these distinctions seems to stand in contrast to the ethos dominating public Scottish cultural events in Ontario, such as the Fergus Scottish Festival. This annual celebration in southern Ontario combines displays of Scottish `traditional' crafts and culinary dishes with displays of dance and music and competitions of physical strength, amalgamating Highland and Lowland customs under the banner of `Scottish tradition' (Fergus Scottish Festival 1992:6). Highland and Lowland immigrants alike are among the spectators and performers at these events.

At this point, I will make several observations from my interpretation of interview statements provided by respondents and personal observations of Scottish ethnic performance. First, statements regarding regional, in-group differences in cultural practise are usually made in reference to historical or contemporary social patterns <u>within Scotland</u>. However, Scots in Hamilton do not draw

sharp distinctions between one another in terms of regional origin.

Furthermore, these phenomena seem to indicate changes in the salience of collective regional and national identities, and an increased personal association with popular symbols of a collective `Scottish' identity.

(b) Locality and Accent

In an interview with the manager of a Scottish pub, I was told that each of Scotland's two major urban centres possesses a distinct cultural identity: *"Eighty percent of Scottish people here are from Glasgow. In Glasgow, they don't travel much. From one end of the city to the other is a major trip. In Edinburgh, people are more aware of their heritage. People are proud of being who they are: Scots through and through."*

Such in-group distinction by locality was a frequent theme in interviews, and was most commonly associated with the accent and dialect of local residents, as exemplified in my interview with Mary: *"Every little place has an accent. Words are very different. My province includes Edinburgh, Fife and Glasgow. Glaswegian is very broad, a lot of slang. Every part of Glasgow is different."*

John originally came from the northeast of Scotland, while his wife is from the Glasgow area. Indicating the difference between her accent and that of her husband, Regina

stated: "*I wouldn't understand John if he spoke with a northeast dialect.*"

Laura illustrated this local variation as being characteristic of the British Isles: "*For the size of the British Isles, people speak very differently by region and class... Cornwall doesn't understand Kent. I asked for half a stone of potatoes. They didn't understand me and said "ten pounds for a shilling."*

In Scotland, linguistic diversity is further emphasized by the existence and practise of Gaelic in the western Highlands. Elizabeth identified the existence of these regional linguistic differences: "*We don't know Gaelic. It's spoken only in the very north. We're from Glasgow.*"

Several people mentioned that they could identify the local origins of other Scots through listening to their accents. Don, the president of a veteran's legion, noted: "*You can tell a Glaswegian or a person from Fife; you can tell where they come from.*" Accent thus serves as a marker of an individual's local identity.

Differences in speech characteristics also indicate variation in social status. Several respondents referred to particular speech characteristics of specific locales in evaluative terms. In my interview with Helen, she recalled: "*Glasgow and Bo'Ness have a very strong accent. I went to visit a friend in Edinburgh. They have a more polite accent*

there. The Edinburgh accent is different than the average Scots."

More pertinent to this thesis, the role of accent as a marker of local identity carries implications for changes in personal identity accompanying processes of migration. Accent shift among first-generation immigrants is often associated with processes of becoming `Canadian'. Elizabeth referred to post-migration changes in her own accent and the speech patterns of her children: *"Our kids don't care about it [Scottish culture]. They all talk Canadian."*

Several people mentioned the ability to shift between accents according to different social contexts. Mary mentioned that changes in her accent became more apparent on return visits to Scotland, although she was able to switch accents to fit the social context: *"When I go back to visit, people say I've changed. My family says one minute I speak Canadian, the next I'm broad Scottish."* Ruby provided a similar account: *"I become more Scottish when I go back to Scotland. When I go home, I pick up more of an accent again."* A woman interviewed at the Y.W.C.A. commented that return visits raise her awareness of the relationship between accent and identity: *"My brother and sister went back home with a Canadian accent. My sister was nine, my brother was four. They had a cultural difference. They had a funny accent. Identity changes with accent. When I went back, I didn't really have an accent. I may have been two and a half*

at the time." Regina's account illustrates these changes in speech patterns as part of a process of `Canadianization': *"My first trip back to Scotland, everyone there had changed. They used different expressions. I was told I was Canadianized".*

Several people told me that, upon first arrival in Canada, they had experienced distinct linguistic barriers to communication with non-Scots. Sometimes experiences of miscommunication were viewed as humorous, as illustrated by Margaret, an elderly woman from Glasgow:

> *"My first year here I went to a bake shop...I wanted a Christmas cake. I asked for a currant bun. They showed me scones and buns. But I said `No, I want a currant bun'. Then one of the ladies caught on....Another time I took my son to the doctor's. He asked "What do you feed your baby?" I said "I feed him Henzies." He looked alarmed and said "Beans?" I said "No, Henzies, Heinz." He started laughing. I asked him why he was laughing at me. He said "I'm not laughing at you. I'm laughing with you."*

Other respondents perceived experiences of miscommunication as discrimination against Scots. In particular, several people had difficulty in communicating within the Canadian school system. Mae, a woman who has worked with the Hamilton-Wentworth Multicultural Association, mentioned the family of a friend: *"Her ten year-old son went to school, and the teacher said she couldn't understand him. She said `He won't do well in school'."* Jules, a regular at one of Hamilton's legions, recalled: *"I was ten years old when I came. I had two years of school in Scotland. I had*

to go to a special class for speaking English in Canada. I thought it was weird. They put you back a year to learn how to speak English." James, an employee at Ford Motors, recalled a conversation with a Canadian relative: *"My oldest cousin says to me `Would you like to learn how to speak French? First I'll tell you how to speak English'...Dialect is a problem."* In my interview with Margaret, she remarked: *"Discrimination against Scots? There's an attitude. German people weren't liked either. It's accent, it's got a lot to do with accent."*

These experiences of humorous miscommunication and perceptions of discrimination highlight an awareness of significant linguistic differentiation between migrants and citizens of their host nation. In many instances, Scots perceive that change in speech patterns was necessary for adjustment to Canadian lifestyles. One regular at a Hamilton legion said: *"My accent? I had to speak slower. When I first came, you could cut it with a knife."* Helen also felt a need to change her accent, for work-related purposes: *"I dropped my accent. I had to. I worked at Stelco, and I was on the phone all the time."* Adapting to Canadian linguistic patterns, at times involving a perceived loss of accent, was identified by several people as essential to the process of becoming `Canadian'. The president of one Hamilton veteran's legion remarked: *"I'm Canadian. My kids speak Canadian."* One man who works at Westinghouse expressed frustration at

the evident resistance of some Scots to linguistic change: *"My pet peeve is that Scots come to Canada thinking that they're speaking correct English, but no-one can understand them...When you come to another country, you learn to speak the way they do. Scots won't learn English, and that really bugs me."*

Several factors need to be given attention at this point. First, as I have mentioned, experiences of miscommunication encourage awareness of linguistic differentiation between migrants and their hosts. One woman from Falkirk indicated that new immigrants had difficulty in understanding the speech of host society members as well as in being understood: *"It drove me nuts. In ordinary grocery places, there were so many languages. It was in getting used to the babble that it hit me."* This observation seems to stand in contrast to statements made by several people characterizing Scots as being the invisible yet predominant cultural group in Canada, quick to assimilate upon arrival in this country. As McKay (1980) writes, concepts of `assimilation' often tend to oversimplify the migration and adaptation processes. In her study on the ethnic identity of English immigrants in Ontario, Greenhill writes: "Their creation of a sense of English ethnicity is particularly compelling since most, quite clearly, did not expect to find cultural and linguistic divergences between themselves and the Canadians" (Greenhill 1992:239). I propose that further

analysis needs to be conducted on the applicability of labels such as `ethnic' and `assimilated' to immigrant groups in Canada.

Second, accent shift is perceived by most respondents as a necessary and essential component of an assimilation process which migrants must experience in order to become accepted members of their host country. This attitude underlies disapproving statements about ethnic groups including Italian- and Portuguese-Canadian communities who, in contrast to the Scots, do not always speak English as a first language.

Third, accent shift implies a shift in personal ethnic identity for many migrants. This shift is reflected in statements about `becoming Canadianized', or `speaking Canadian'. This point is also expressed in statements regarding Scottish heritage. Allan, a man from Bathgate, stated: *"My children are all proud of their Scottish roots. They can all speak Scots."* One participant in a women's social group said: *"I will never lose my accent. I'm very proud of my history."* Margaret also voiced similar perceptions: *"Heritage to me means accent, the country I came from, all the things that happened hundreds of years ago..."* Not only is accent perceived as a marker of ethnic identity, it also lends authenticity to culture and heritage, as exemplified in a statement by one member of a Celtic band performing at the multicultural Earthsong festival in

Hamilton: *"You need to be really Scottish to sing. Anyone can play Celtic music, but singing requires accent."*

Finally, accent was identified by several Scots as an important factor in the formation of social networks in Canada. One respondent noted: *"You feel more comfortable with your own. The accent draws you."* Another woman reported that accent was an important factor in prompting her to join an immigrant's self-help organization. It is significant to note that these statements do not differentiate between regional or local variations of Scottish accents, but rather associate <u>any</u> Scottish accent with authentic heritage and acceptability in Scottish circles. Accompanying the experience of migration, the internal differentiation of Scots by variations in speech patterns has been overshadowed by an emerging sense of a general Scottish-Canadian collectivity, juxtaposed against images of other ethnic collectivities. Whereas differentiation in accent and dialect is utilized in respondents' statements to indicate variation among Scots <u>in Scotland</u>, statements concerning linguistic differentiation <u>in Canada</u> more often focus on differences between migrants and members of the host society, contrasting Scots with other immigrant and ethnic groups in Canada.

<u>(c)Religion</u>

A third means by which respondents subdivided the category of `Scots' was on the basis of religious

affiliation. Most often, this distinction was phrased in terms of differences between Protestants and Catholics. Members of these religious groups are perceived to congregate in different regions of Scotland. Scott, a man from Edinburgh, associated the Highland and Lowland regions with definite religious differences: *"Highlanders were all Catholic, and Lowlanders were Protestant, but my cousin's wife is from a part of the Highlands where there are few Catholics."* Differences in religious orientation are often associated with segregation in various spheres of social behaviour. A man interviewed at a Scottish pub identified one of these spheres as the educational system: *"Catholics and Protestants go to separate schools."* Segregation between individuals of differing religious affiliations was also deemed appropriate in terms of dating and marital relationships. Scott informed me: *"In Scotland, my grandfather told my mother, `Don't ever bring a Catholic home'."*

Religious intolerance was a motivating factor in several couples' decisions to emigrate, as Jimmy's account attests: *"Why did I come? My wife is a Catholic. I was a Protestant. People feel the two should be separated. My wife and I said `To hell with it', and got married."*

Many respondents described religious differences within Scotland in terms of `tension' and `rivalry'. Elizabeth's husband Timothy recalled situations involving the

visible identification of rival religious groups that resulted in displays of violence, particularly in large urban areas hosting several different religious populations: "*It's pretty bad in Glasgow.*" However, the degree of this violence was often qualified in statements contrasting Scottish clashes with the religious conflict in Northern Ireland.

Ruby identified the Orangemen's parade as another public event which was associated with displays of violence between religious groups: "*At home on St. Patrick's Day the Orangemen would line the street and pelt others. At home two years ago, there was a big parade. They had the Riding of the Marches and the most colourful bands. It wasn't like Ireland, but people lined the streets and made catcalls, threw tomatoes at the marchers.*" This event was also mentioned by Margaret: "*There's some Protestant/Catholic tension there. Not that much, only sometimes like when they have the Orange parade.*"

The city of Glasgow is often identified as the seat of much religious tension and violence, partly as a result of the relationship between religion and the sport of soccer. As Scott observed: "*There is religious tension between the Catholics and Protestants in Scotland, but it's not violent, except for soccer or rugby matches.*"

Scotland's two largest soccer club teams, the Rangers and the Celtics, have their home base in Glasgow. In conversations regarding sports, respondents were quick to

identify soccer teams with religious groups. In the words of Mary: "*There's especially religious tension in sports in Glasgow. The Rangers are Protestant, the Celtics are Catholic. They have separate colours. The Rangers are royal blue, the Celtics are red, white and green.*" Allan described this association in slightly different terms: "*Left-kickers are Catholic, right-kickers are Protestant.*" Danny, the proprietor of Hamilton's Scottish butcher shop, pointed out that the association between religious groups and soccer teams has a lengthy history: "*The priests started the Celtics in 1885. The Rangers were started in 1873.*" The soccer match provides another context in which Catholics and Protestants are often segregated. One man interviewed at a Scottish pub commented that: "*Catholics and Protestants can't sit together at games in Scotland.*" A man from Inverness recalled a vivid display of religious and team rivalry at a game which he had attended as a young boy: "*The Catholics and Protestants had to sit in different sections. One time, I saw them raising the flag of the Pope in the Protestant section. I didn't know why until I saw them set it on fire.*" Strong social divisions between religious groups are apparent in descriptions of schoolyard and soccer match violence in association with religious boundary crossing[1]. Concerning

---

1. Feldman (1991) writes of the significance of religious boundary crossing in his study of religious violence in Northern Ireland.

the schoolyard context, Timothy recalled: "*When Protestant kids went to a Catholic school, others would beat them up, or vice versa. Jews were in-between.*" Similarly George, a man who works in one of Hamilton's steelmills, recalled: "*One Rangers player got death threats because he was Catholic.*" Most accounts of soccer match violence referred to events which happened at least ten years ago. Ruby perceived the degree of violence at soccer games to have declined significantly: "*There used to be fights when games were held, but I don't think it's what happens today.*"

In contrast to depictions of religious tension and violence in Scotland, several respondents perceived greater religious tolerance in Canada. Ruby informed me that: "*In Scotland, you're either Presbyterian or Catholic. I didn't know any Catholics until I met my husband in Canada...I thought it was great, there's no distinction here.*" One man describing himself as a Protestant recalls his experience of re-migration to Canada: "*The second time I came to Canada, the first people I met were nuns. I realized that Catholic and Protestant tensions weren't so prevalent in Canada. The nuns offered my family a place to stay.*"

The two co-owners of one Scottish pub in Hamilton explained that they were originally of different religious backgrounds: "*Protestants and Catholics couldn't sit together in Scotland. Here we can own a pub together.*" One of the pubs' patrons was also aware of this increased religious

tolerance: *"Here one owner of this pub is Catholic, the other is Protestant."*

The Fergus Scottish Festival hosted another visible display of this religious tolerance among Scots in Canada. Two neighbouring booths selling Scottish memorabilia and food bore the banners of different religious groups: St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church and St. Joseph's Catholic Church.

Statements emphasizing contrasts in religious tolerance between the Scottish and Canadian contexts make it clear that religious in-group boundaries have become less salient with the experience of migration to Canada. Comments about religious differences among Scots were often made in reference to lifestyles and customs in Scotland. However, several people interpreted differences between Scots and other ethnic groups in Canada in terms of religious variation. One man interviewed at a veterans' legion recalls: *"When we came there was only a scatter of ethnic groups here, but there were tensions; the Scots versus the Irish, the Catholics versus the Protestants."* Another man interpreted tensions between Italian and Scottish immigrants in similar terms: *"The Scottish-Italian difference is between Protestants and Catholics."*

These statements and observations indicate changes in the perception of in- and out-group boundaries in association with the experience of international migration. In-group differences in religious affiliation, accent and regional

origins which were salient within Scotland are identified as having decreased in importance within Canada. Rather, the construction of an image of a Scottish-Canadian collectivity in which these differences are accepted and tolerated is emphasized.

However, the formation of an in-group collectivity also implies the existence of out-groups, or in this case non-Scottish collectivities. In the final section of this chapter, I will examine statements provided by Hamilton Scots which differentiate between Scots and other immigrant groups in Canada.

(iii)Out-Group Boundaries

In his study of Mexican immigrants in Canada, Whittaker writes that the Mexican moving north of the border "becomes an idea rather than a human...tell[ing] us more about the stresses undergone by those constructing it than about the people it purports to describe" (Whittaker 1988:29). In a similar vein, analysis of images of other ethnic groups in Canada as depicted by respondents reveals much about in-group and out-group boundaries, and evaluations made by Scots in Hamilton.

In my analysis of this data, I will emphasize several themes revealed in comments pertaining to perceptions of out-group boundaries and changes in patterns of immigration to Canada. First, recent changes in immigration patterns favouring increased numbers of non-British immigrants and

resultant changes in Canada's national ethnic composition are often referred to by Scots with disfavour.

Second, while several respondents speak in positive terms of Scottish settlement in Canada and contributions to Canadian society, the immigration and settlement of non-British groups is often referred to in negative terms, reflecting a perception of a lack of societal contributions by these collectivities.

(a) Immigration and Canada's Ethnic Population

During fieldwork interviews, I often asked respondents about their sentiments toward return migration to Scotland. Several people disliked this idea, owing to perceived changes in Scotland's ethnic composition.

One woman from Glasgow who co-manages a British pub with her husband perceived changes in patterns of immigration to Scotland as threatening ideals of `heritage' and `community': *"I wouldn't want to be in Scotland now. There are no jobs, and [Scotland's] lost its heritage. Too many people have filtered into the country; you only feel a sense of community in small towns."*

Timothy responded in a similar manner: *"Go back? Sometimes I get fed up. But now Scotland is full of Pakistanis. They have stores and run the buses. It's nice for a visit."*

These statements indicate perceptions among Scots in Hamilton of changes in Scotland involving the influx of

immigrants identified by Scots as undesirable, resulting in perceived negative shifts in national character. These changes are perceived by respondents as having occurred after their own migration to Canada.

Several people expressed similar sentiments in regards to immigration and ethnicity in Canada. Tom told me: *"Colored people get in first. That's why there's a racial mix here now... Thirty years ago, colored people here were few."*

Don perceives a rise in numbers of non-British immigrants as corresponding with a current decline in the annual numbers of British immigrants to Canada: *"Emigration [from Scotland] has slackened off. Now things are more strict, and you need a trade."* A woman interviewed at the Y.W.C.A. voiced similar perceptions: *"It's very hard to come from Britain now. If too many people leave Britain, the government [of Scotland] has to take other foreign people in."*

Scots in Hamilton often express perceptions of current difficulties in migrating from Great Britain to Canada, in contrast to perceptions of the relative ease with which non-British immigrants are thought to be able to enter Canada. Danny put it this way:

> *"It's the toughest thing in the world to get [Scots] in here now. You used to be able to sponsor them. Now it's almost impossible to get people through. But the Chinese and Japanese can come into the country if they can buy land and hold it for three years. Then they get landed immigrant*

status. I had to wait for five years before getting my citizenship."

George expressed similar concerns:

"They want more Asians here. My nephew had a job set up and they wouldn't let him in. It's hard for Scots to get landed immigrant status. Unless you have a turban, it's hard. My mother and father sponsored my cousins. Now they take minorities first."

In examining these statements, it is important to remember that several significant changes have occurred in regards to the ethnic composition of the immigration flow to Canada and the nation's immigration policy since the time at which many of these Scots arrived in Canada. Doug, a regular at one of Hamilton's Scottish pubs, associated the 1967 introduction of the point system of immigrant selection with an increased display of official favouritism towards non-British immigrants:

"When I walked in, it was no problem. My friend wanted to migrate to Canada. They have a fifteen point system here now. You have to have a place to live, a job, a sponsor, and assure that you won't be on welfare. My friend had all of this, but he still couldn't get in. Look at the Arab people. Unless you've got a fucking turban, you can't get in."

Implicit in these statements is the perception of British and, more specifically, Scottish immigrants as desirable in contrast to immigrants of different race and custom. Doug exemplified this positive in-group evaluation in the following manner: *"Now they take anyone. British don't come anymore. Refugees can walk in, but there's been a fall-off in British migration."*

Not only are non-British immigrants categorized as simply `anyone', but they are often perceived and characterized by respondents as contributing less to Canadian society than British or Scottish immigrants. This is illustrated in the statement of one man who identifies himself as one of Hamilton's ironworkers: *"When I came, I brought a skill. Today many immigrants can do nothing, and have nothing to offer. But still there are countries dumb enough to say `Come on in'."*

Doug characterized non-British immigrants as financially dependent on the Canadian government, in contrast to a financial self-sufficiency which he perceives as characteristic of Scots:

> *"A lot of people screw the system. I've been here eighteen years, and I've never gotten a pogey cheque. I've got a trade and I've never gotten any government subsidy...So many [Scottish] people would love to come here, but they're either over-qualified or there are no jobs. There's also a preference for Jamaicans and Blacks."*

Through these statements, people construct images of a Scottish collectivity in Canada with certain in-group traits which distinguish Scots from members of other ethnic groups. As part of a larger British collectivity, Scots are perceived as valuable and desirable immigrants, while members of non-British groups are not. Scots contribute to Canadian society through enduring difficult immigration experiences, and through bringing manual skills and remaining financially

self-sufficient, qualities not perceived to exist among members of other ethnic groups.

Scots were also identified as being different from most other immigrant groups owing to their status of `founding' or `charter' peoples, as identified by Margaret: *"The Scots built this country...the Scots and the Irish and the Italians, but the Italians were later."* One man from Glasgow voiced concern with a perceived lack of attention provided by the media to the contemporary Scottish population in Canada, in contrast to an emphasis on the role of Scots in earlier Canadian history: *"You're asking us what is important to write about? Look at Sir John A. Macdonald. There were as many Scots here as French at that time, but you don't hear anything about Scots today. You just hear about the French."*

Scots are also characterized by respondents as assimilating to Canadian lifeways with greater ease than other immigrant groups. This point will be examined in greater depth in the following chapter on ethnic performance.

Several of these observations correspond with assumptions underlying post-war immigration legislation. In his speech in 1947 on national immigration policy, Prime Minister Mackenzie King identified British immigrants as the preferred targets of an advertising campaign promoting migration to Canada. King also stressed that immigrants to Canada were to be financially self-sufficient. Hawkins (1991) identifies the general post-war resistance towards

non-British immigrants as being founded on a concept of British `ownership' of the nation through a long history of exploration and the hardships of settlement. More recent immigrants who haven't `earned' their place in Canada through these experiences are not as welcomed by the general populace.

Respondents also compared and contrasted Scots with other European immigrant groups in Hamilton, particularly the Italians. The manager of one of Hamilton's Scottish pubs associated the Italian-Scottish connection to the large number of post-war Italian immigrants admitted to Canada:

> *"Italians are another proud nation. They have more pride in their country than the English do. The dominant immigrant forces in Canada are Brits and Italians. They're the two major immigrant groups...Just like Italians, Scots have a very strong identity."*

Several people identify Italians as `ethnic', in contrast to Scots, who `assimilate'. This is evidenced in the statement of one woman from Glasgow: *"I think of ethnics as Germans and Italians."* A patron of one Scottish pub directed me to `real' ethnic groups: *"If you want to see ethnic groups, go to Mohawk Park on Sunday. There are Italians, Croats, Germans...They all get together after the soccer games."*

Scottish respondents also pointed to markers of ethnicity, including group solidarity, as evidence of Italians as constituting an ethnic group. Allan told me: *"Other ethnic groups come together, but Scots disperse."*

Another respondent supported this perception: *"Scots don't feel the need to conjoin as Germans and Italians."*

Several respondents also consider linguistic differences to be markers of ethnic group identity. While Scots were perceived as becoming Canadianized in their speech, members of other immigrant groups such as the Italians, who continued to use a mother tongue other than English, were considered to be `ethnic'.

Italians also are depicted by respondents as exhibiting distinct personality traits as a collectivity. Janis, a secretary at McMaster University, recalled her parents' positive experiences with Italian neighbours:

> *"My parents moved into a small street in the north end. All their neighbours were Italian...My mother said her best friends were Italian. They were the nicest people to live with. Mondays were wash days. If your wash wasn't out on a line, neighbours would come to see if you were o.k."*

Margaret contrasted Scots and Italians in the following manner:

> *"Italians are such a strong group...Italians always wore running shoes. Let's say they're lovers, not fighters. Scots are fighters. If you had German generals and Scottish soldiers, you'd have the best army in the world."*

In contrast, other people perceived Italians as collectively exhibiting undesirable personality traits and mannerisms. One woman recalled her experience at a Hamilton veterans' association:

> *"When we came here, I first went to the British Imperial Club. When the Italians came in, I stopped going. Italian men kept approaching me at dances. I was always taught never to refuse a dance, but I said `Look, I'm here with my husband.'*

They don't take no for an answer. They also came up to me outside of Robinson's and made advances even when I said I was married."

F.Summary

When speaking of Scots in Canada, respondents often compared and contrasted Scots with other non-British ethnic groups such as Italians and East Indians in terms of group solidarity, linguistic distinctiveness, and collective personality traits and social behaviour. These characteristics are considered markers of `ethnic' groups, in contrast to `assimilated' Scots. However, I have also illustrated an increased sense of personal identification with a Scottish collectivity in Canada through changes in the self-perception of Scots, corresponding with recollections of personal migration experiences. While the salience of in-group differences diminishes with the experience of migration, Scots in Canada associate themselves with a larger Scottish ethnic collectivity which they contrast with other immigrant groups. Scots are depicted as financially self-sufficient and assimilated to Canadian society. Scots are identified with and by a particular assortment of symbols and activities considered unique to popular Scottish culture in Canada.

Thus far, I have concentrated on cognitive perceptions of Scots and other ethnic groups as presented by Scots in Hamilton.

These perceptions are also evidenced through analysis of Scottish cultural activity and the association with, and manipulation of, symbolism of popular Scottish culture. In the next chapter, I will turn my attention to perceptions of multiculturalism in Canada and participation in public cultural events.

Chapter 3: Ethnic Symbolism: Participation and Public Display

A. Introduction

As I have mentioned in the introduction to this thesis, increased attention has been given to ethnicity by sociologists and anthropologists within recent decades. During the early 1970s, several American sociologists identified a flourishing of cultural societies and events in urban North America as evidence of an ethnic revival, or a `new ethnicity'. Herbert Gans (1979) refers to this emergent phenomenon as `symbolic ethnicity', consisting of voluntary, infrequent, leisure-oriented participation in events and organizations marked as `ethnic', but lacking any significant basis in daily routine (Gans 1979:9-12). Gans identifies participation in aspects of symbolic ethnicity as most characteristic of third-generation immigrants.

Several studies by sociologists have applied Gans' theory of symbolic ethnicity to Canadian multiculturalism. In the next section, I will discuss these studies in relation to the implementation and development of official Canadian multicultural policy.

B. Canadian Multiculturalism

In Canada, post-war changes in patterns of immigration to Canada were accompanied by a heightened awareness of inter-ethnic relationships within a nation becoming

increasingly ethnically heterogeneous. In particular, strained relations between Anglophone and Francophone Canadians became apparent with threats of Quebec's separation. In 1963, the Royal Commission on Bilingualism and Biculturalism was established "to deal with the status of the country's two official languages and related issues" (Kelner and Kallen 1974:24). Members of ethnic groups which were neither anglophone or francophone raised concerns about the relegation of all other ethnic groups to the status of `second-class citizens'. This `Third Force', spearheaded by members of the Ukrainian group in particular, presented protests as briefs and public hearings, resulting in Book IV of the Commission's report: The Cultural Contribution of the Other Ethnic Groups (1970).

In response to the recommendations of this report, the federal government under Pierre Trudeau announced in 1971 the implementation of a policy of `multiculturalism within a bilingual framework', with a view to benefitting all cultural groups within Canada while also strengthening national unity. The policy's four prime objectives were to provide support and assistance to groups demonstrating desire, effort and need for cultural development and displaying potential for contributing to Canadian society; assistance towards full participation by cultural groups in Canadian society; promotion of creative encounters and interchange among cultures in the interest of national unity; and continuation

of assistance in immigrant education in at least one of the official languages (Kallen 1982:53).

Various studies (i.e. Buchignani 1982; Burnet 1979; Kelner and Kallen 1974) have identified steps taken at the levels of federal and provincial government towards a permanent multicultural policy, including the creation of the Canadian Consultative Council on Multiculturalism, the production of radio and television programs on contemporary Canadian ethnic groups, and the publication of a series of texts examining the history of several ethnic groups within Canada, including the Scots (Reid 1976).

However, recent studies focusing on inter-ethnic relations have critiqued Canada's multicultural policy as a failure in terms of promised national unity. In particular, several writers have pointed to the absence of government-sponsored support for structural aspects of ethnic groups, including the maintenance of languages other than French or English, as an indication that multiculturalism policy only pays lip-service to cultural diversity (Lupul 1982a, 1982b, 1983; Rahim 1990). Roberts and Clifton write "with very few exceptions, ethnic groups in this country cannot perpetuate coherent cultural traditions because they lack the relevant social structures" (Roberts and Clifton 1982:91). Several other studies have focused on multiculturalism policy as promoting ethnic inequality and inter-group tensions (i.e. Lambert and Curtis 1983; Lupul 1983; Ziegler 1980).

Roberts and Clifton identify the ethnic conferences, presses and festivals which receive government funding as promoting `symbolic ethnicity' (Roberts and Clifton 1983:91). Rather than sociocultural innovation and development, what remain highlighted are symbolic fragments of static, past-oriented `museum culture'. Research by Weinfeld (1981) has suggested that support for expressive elements of the `new ethnicity', such as recreational and aesthetic activities, draws attention away from the instrumental aspects of ethnicity "as a problem-solving, survival program or design for living, intimately connected with an ethnic group's life chances" (Weinfeld 1981:12). As one reviewer candidly remarked, "it is not only cheaper but also more visible to support "folkish" activities like arts and crafts...than it is to reduce discrimination" (Schroeter 1978:101).

However, while support for structural aspects of many ethnic groups has not been promoted by government multiculturalism programs and policy, increased attention to aspects of `symbolic ethnicity' has increased the visibility of ethnic groups and ethnic symbolism. For the purposes of this thesis, it is important to note that increased visibility of non-British ethnic groups has also been prompted post-war changes in immigration patterns, increased numbers of persons admitted from non-British source countries and a corresponding decline in numbers of British immigrants. Furthermore, several Scots perceive non-British groups as

receiving greater support and a higher level of funding from the government of Canada for the promotion of ethnic culture than British ethnic groups.

In the following section, I will illustrate in-group and out-group perceptions and boundaries through examination of respondents' statements depicting the nature of participation by Scots and non-Scots in cultural events and societies promoting the visibility of ethnic groups and ethnic symbolism.

C.Perceptions of Ethnicity and Multiculturalism

In fieldwork interviews, I often asked Scots for their opinions on multiculturalism in Canada. Presented with these questions, respondents demonstrated a marked emphasis on symbolic and expressive aspects of ethnicity reminiscent of Gans' theory of `symbolic ethnicity' (1979), with little mention of other aspects of ethnic lifeways. During an interview, one male steelworker began to list events which he had attended and organizations with which he had held membership: *"I love the Highland Games. There's a big sign on the board for the Tattoo in Toronto."* Mary also expressed similar interests: *"I go to the Highland Games and the Tattoo; I listen to the pipes, wear Scottish pins and eat Scottish food on special occasions."*

In light of this emphasis on symbolic display, it is important to note that several recent studies have critiqued the social construction of `inauthentic' popular Scottish

culture (Berthoff 1983; Cowan 1992; MacDonald 1988; McKay 1992). Cowan writes that the tendency for `self-mythologization' amongst the Scots is illustrated in that "[only] about 1 percent of the Scottish population today speaks the Gaelic language, yet it is the visible and audible culture of these people which is celebrated at Highland Games in both the old country and in North America" (Cowan 1992:24). Macdonald also writes of the `Scottish stereotype' as manifested in kilts, nostalgia and romanticism (Macdonald 1988:134). McKay identifies Nova Scotia's visible Scottish symbolism as `post-modern tartanism', existing solely for purposes of commodification and consumption as "free-floating signifiers, which may be attached to highways, oil companies, and even...to cartons of milk" (McKay 1992:47). However, as Berthoff writes of Scottish-American Highland Games,

> "the kinship may be attenuated and even mistaken, the symbolism contrived, the legends mostly romance, and none of it quite what it is taken for. But for many in the past thirty years this symbolic ethnicity has come to carry real force...offer[ing] unusually full assurance that after all one has a known place among people like oneself" (Berthoff 1983:29).

Similarly, statements provided by Scottish respondents in Hamilton indicate the importance of cultural symbolism for personal ethnic identity.

The comments of several respondents indicate that levels of involvement in popular Scottish culture are perceived to be associated with degrees of `Scottishness'.

Several people declined interviews and referred me to their associates, making remarks such as *"You really don't want to talk to me; I don't belong to any of the organizations or clubs, and I don't do country dancing...talk to them; they've been involved in the Burns society, and their church does the kirking of the tartan."* Referring to her friend's collection of Scottish curios and active participation in the Hamilton Tartan club, Ruby noted that *"Mary was much more into the Scottish stuff."*

These statements carry at least two implications: first, a reification of the concept of `culture' as a formal, voluntary phenomenon in which one can participate at will; second, a process of personal association with images of `Scottish' culture through social interaction, often involving visible markers of identity (Barth 1969). A statement made by Laura illustrates this last point: *"I don't eat Scottish foods. The only thing we did of ethnic nature was six of my daughters danced in an Irish dancing troupe. Other than this, there was no dwelling on Scottish or Irish aspects."*

For several respondents, displays of ethnicity seemed most appropriate within the formal spheres of group performance and presentation, or within the company of other Scots. When asked about his experience of Scottish ethnicity in Canada, Fred replied: "*I play Scottish country dance music*

on my accordion, and I belong to the Burns society, but I do these things only for other Scots."

Allan identified the expression of ethnicity falling outside of formal contexts as being less `authentic': *"We had more of a homespun Scottish heritage...relatives come from Scotland, and mother bores them by playing Scottish music."*

While many people refer to Scottishness in terms of participation in specific societies or events, several respondents voiced a concern with an overemphasis on visible markers of culture. Referring to past experience at ethnic festivals, Mae remarked that she had attended culinary and musical displays hosted by members of other ethnic groups, whereas *"Other Scots left once they finished their own performances...I'm interested in more than superficial things; some people here don't go beyond that."*

This emphasis on both the formality and privacy of ethnic display privileges participation and demonstration in publicly organized events. In July 1993, the Royal Scottish Country Dance Society performed in Hamilton's Earthsong festival, a multi-cultural event drawing performers and spectators on an international scale. Several of the Scottish dancers were respondents who had earlier maintained that ethnicity should be maintained `privately'. John told me: *"I'm proud to be Scots, but I don't wear it on my sleeve."*

In order to understand the import of these statements, I suggest that the implicit definition of `private' does not refer to phenomena unseen by the larger public audience, but rather to a conscious avoidance of disturbance to lifeways collectively identified as `Canadian' (Edwards and Doucette 1987:54, 61). For example, several Scots voiced disfavour with the turban as part of the daily apparel of East Indian immigrants, but accepted the presence of Indian music and food booths in the Earthsong public multicultural festival. This festival represents a special public context in which ethnic diversity is acceptable by Scots, in contrast to the perceived threat to everyday Canadian lifestyles presented by the turban as an element of daily attire. Several respondents also felt that the everyday behaviour and appearance of Scots should blend in with Canadian society. In the words of the manager of one of Hamilton's Scottish pubs: *"Scots don't bother anyone else. Scots keep to themselves."*

D.Assimilation

This emphasis on the `private' display of ethnicity also applies to perceptions of other ethnic groups. Many respondents recall personal experiences of adjustment and assimilation upon arriving in Canada. In particular, several people found it necessary to change their accent in order to be understood more easily by Canadians.

Several people expressed views that immigrants should not bring cultural `baggage' to Canada, or should discard this baggage at the nation's doorstep. Any practice or symbol identified as `ethnic' which might potentially introduce change into Canadian lifeways and traditions is viewed with disfavour. Don exemplified this point through a familiar cliche: *"When in Rome, do as the Romans do."*

As I indicated in the last chapter, the ethnic category of East Indians was often identified by respondents as causing such change to Canadian culture, particularly in terms of ethnic apparel. However, the emphasis on assimilation also extends to audible symbols of ethnicity, including language and accent. I have already mentioned accent shift as identified in several accounts, accompanying processes of migration and changes in personal identity. Scots who had recently arrived in Canada were often identified as possessing a thick Scottish accent, or `speaking broad', whereas second and third generation immigrants were said to `speak Canadian'. One senior lady remarked: "*I remember coming over [to Canada] and going into this store. I met a lady who was speaking broad Scottish. I could've sworn she just got off the boat.*"

While the broad accent remains a linguistic format into which some Scots can shift at will, several respondents informed me of their expectations of linguistic assimilation for members of other ethnic groups. This was exemplified in

an interview with a male postal carrier who views the use of the Italian language by another immigrant as an obstacle to full integration into Canadian society: "*This Italian woman moved into little Italy, and didn't understand English. She won the lottery, and someone else had to translate for her so she could claim her prize. Scots don't have a problem with language. Most Gaelic was wiped out in the 1800s.*"

To summarize this section, several common themes emerge from interviews with Scottish respondents. First, there is a notable emphasis on the expression of ethnicity through manipulation of visible and audible markers, recalling Robert and Clifton's analysis of Canadian multiculturalism as `symbolic ethnicity'.

Second, ethnic display is considered appropriate by most respondents if maintained privately. This sense of `privacy' privileges display within publicly visible formal societies and events, with the provision that such display did not demonstrate the potential for introducing significant change to Canadian lifeways.

Finally, respondents indicated that new immigrants should be subject to processes of assimilation involving the loss of any publicly visible symbolism which would introduce cultural change to Canada. These statements must be examined in the context of changes in Canada's immigration and cultural policies since the 1950s and 1960s, when most respondents arrived in Canada. Anthony Richmond writes of the

`white Canada' immigration policy of the twentieth century as attempting to preserve a predominantly Anglo-Saxon society. A common perception of the time was that British immigrants would be absorbed faster and more easily than those from other countries (Richmond 1967:14). Illustrated through the promotion of immigration campaigns and offices in Britain until the late 1960s, this preference for British immigrants was a significant factor contributing to the ethnic composition of post-war immigrant populations.

Statements provided by Scottish respondents need to be examined in the context of post-war changes in immigration policy and patterns of immigration to Canada. Combined with a trend toward an increasingly ethnically heterogeneous Canadian society, these changes no doubt influenced ethnic `self' and `other' perceptions amongst respondents.

E.Participation: The Performance of Ethnicity

During the summer of 1993, I interviewed Scots involved in events and societies promoting formal displays of `Scottish culture', including Hamilton's Earthsong festival and `An Evening in Scotland', and the Fergus Scottish Festival. Before proceeding with my analysis, I will briefly describe each of these events.

Earthsong is a public multi-cultural festival featuring a wide variety of musical performances, crafts and food representing nations and cultural groups from around the world. Funded regionally as a tourist attraction, the 1993

festival was held at a city park bordering on Hamilton Harbour, off of Lake Ontario. Flags of the world were anchored off of the shoreline, including the Union Jack. Neither one of the two flags of Scotland were displayed. Participation by Scots in the festival included several performances by the Royal Scottish Country Dance Society (RSCDS) and several Scottish/Celtic singing groups, as well as a Scottish food booth. While the dance groups will be discussed in more detail in the final chapter, I will make passing reference to them at this point.

`An Evening in Scotland' was a two-hour program of music and dance performed in August, 1993, by the Argyll-Sutherland Highlanders and the Schiehallion Highland Dancers, hosted by the Royal Military Museum. The performances were held in front of Dundurn Castle in Hamilton, the historic home of Upper Canada's first prime minister, Sir Allan McNab, who was, significantly, himself a Scot.

Established in 1946, the Fergus Scottish Festival is advertised as "the largest and one of the most prestigious cultural events in North America...dedicated to the preservation of the visual, musical, athletic and written heritage of Scotland" (Fergus Scottish Festival 1993:2). The three-day festival is held in the town park in early August, and hosts events including an annual Scottish Tattoo featuring performances by Scottish dancers, pipe and brass bands, and drum corps; a day of competitions in the areas of

Scottish music, dance, and heavy weight events; and demonstrations of `Scottish Cultural Traditions' including caber tossing, sheep dog demonstrations and pipe band performances (Fergus Scottish Festival 1993:4,6,8). Although this festival took place outside of Hamilton, many respondents refer to it in discussions on Scottish ethnicity.

Two themes become apparent through analysis of these events. First, events and societies advertised as `Scottish' do not rely exclusively on Scottish membership. In some instances, the promotion of Scottish culture does not involve any direct link between participants and Scottish heritage or ancestry. Rather, there appears to be a reification of culture, privileging voluntary, leisure-oriented participation by persons regardless of ethnic origin, again reminiscent of Gans' theory of symbolic ethnicity (1979). Second, for a number of respondents, the level of personal participation in Scottish cultural events and societies increased with migration to Canada.

(i)Music and Dance

Performances at Earthsong by the RSCDS were held on one of the four stages spread throughout the park, where groups including Maori dancers and Canadian folk music artists had performed in the day's celebrations. Accompanied by recorded bagpipe music, adults and children of both sexes danced in precise steps to a lively program of jigs, reels and strathspeys. The dancers' apparel provided a bright

visual display: men and boys were clad in kilts, stockings with tassels, sporrans, belts, and white shirts; women wore tartan shawls and white dresses, while young girls were dressed in kilts. Although the display of costume and music was presented as being "Scottish", the names of dances bore witness to a wide variety of topics including a tribute to Germany (Trip to Bavaria) and Canada's Centennial (St. John's River). These selections also evidenced the recent and international origins of some dances.

While the music, dance and apparel of the RSCDS dancers provided a symbolic representation of popular Scottish culture, conversations with several performers revealed that Scots are a minority within the Hamilton RSCDS branch. Several respondents reminded me of the international character of the RSCDS, with no requirement that dancers be of Scottish descent. The nature of this society will be examined in more detail in the final chapter of this thesis.

Furthermore, while individual elements such as the kilt are immediately recognizable as symbols of Scottish clan systems, brief conversations after performances revealed that while several performing families wore family or provincial tartans, many participants chose kilt patterns on the basis of style or availability. Thus, while the wearing of kilts was an essential element of the RSCDS performances, neither the choice of tartans by dancers nor the ethnic identity of

the dancers themselves revealed any direct association with Scottish heritage.

Accompanying the RSCDS dance performances, Earthsong featured several musical groups presenting themselves as `Scottish' or `Celtic'. One of these, Killiecrankie, consisted of flute, acoustic guitar and two fiddles. A band member introduced the band as playing `Scottish music' including jigs and traditional songs of love and emigration from Scotland. These selections were introduced as being `a bit cloudy', thus demonstrating `the real Scottish spirit'. Several brief interviews revealed that most band members originated from Stratford, Ontario. In reference to the band's lead singer who came from Glasgow, one male fiddle player said "*[he's] the only true Scottish member of the band; the rest of us are apprentice Scots. We can't wear kilts, but we don't have to wear underwear*".

The performance of `An Evening in Scotland' provides another example of formal Scottish ethnic display. The Argyll-Sutherland Highlanders opened this event by marching and piping from the Military Museum to a grassy area in front of Dundurn Castle. The following program featured a brass band wearing kilts with the Argyll tartan, playing musical numbers including a medley of Nova Scotian tunes of Scottish influence. The program also included performances by the Schiehallion Dancers, a Highland dance competition group

consisting of young girls clad in white blouses and skirts with tartan aprons and blue vests.

The location of this event on the grounds of Dundurn Castle, combined with the presence of the Argyll-Sutherland Highlanders, illustrates the role of Scots in Canada's political and military history. However, once again conversations with band members and dancers indicated no necessary direct association between individual performers and Scottish heritage or ancestry. As Greenhill writes, "customs definitely associated with a particular ethnic culture can be undertaken and/or performed by people who do not see themselves as part of that group" (Greenhill 1992:238).

(ii)Food

The absence of this connection between performance, per-former and heritage is also demonstrated in the sale of Scottish food at the various festivals. The Earthsong festival included a Scottish food booth, operated by one of Hamilton's Scottish pubs. Culinary fare included haggis[2], Scotch pie and Irn Bru, a popular Scottish soft drink. A young man playing bagpipes in front of the booth's entrance told me that he wasn't connected with the pub, but rather was a student in one of the piping schools in the area. The

---

2. Berthoff (1983) refers to haggis as an "old peasant dish of highly seasoned meat scraps cooked in a sheep's stomach" (Berthoff 1983:24).

combination of signs indicating Scottish fare and the piper's presence created an atmosphere symbolizing the ethnic identity of the booth. When I asked one worker who was managing the booth, I was told: *"Who's running the booth? The Scotsman. Someone authentic."* This man indicated that several people of Scottish origin had stopped at the booth and commented favourably on the presence and quality of the food. However, not all workers at the booth were of Scottish origin, and presumably neither were all passers-by who sampled the food.

Furthermore, the concern for cultural authenticity exhibited at this Earthsong food booth appears in sharp contrast to the ethnic backgrounds of several shopkeepers at the Fergus Scottish Festival. While several people operating booths selling `Scottish' souvenirs and food maintained that fellow salespeople at the festival were primarily of Scottish descent, not everyone held to this opinion. One couple selling printed histories of family names consisted of a Scots woman and a man with `mixed' ethnic heritage. Concerning other shopkeepers, the couple indicated that *"a lot of people not of Scottish descent come here because they like the music and food. Some people with Scottish shop tents are Scottish, but a lot of people with food booths aren't."*

The suggestion that non-Scottish spectators were present at the Fergus festival was further suggested by

several Black people appearing at the festival in kilts and operating Scottish food booths. The truck parked beside one of these booths bore the logo of a Scottish meat company in the Hamilton area, displaying an invitation for passers-by to `have a taste of Scotland'. Items sold at the booth included Scottish oat cakes, candy, Irn Bru and Scotch pies. However, when questioned as to her ethnic origins, the proprietor informed me that she was from Kenya, and to her knowledge possessed no Scottish ancestry. She indicated that the closest she had been to Scotland had involved several years of residence in Ireland, and she identified most food booths at the festival as being run by non-Scots.

Personal identification through the manipulation of ethnic symbolism is also a situational and voluntary phenomenon. Several people who identified themselves as Scottish also informed me that their association with Scottish cultural symbols and activities had been strengthened after migrating to Canada. As Bill, a member of Killiecrankie, said: *"People from Scotland don't cling to Burns and tartans until they leave their country and move abroad. I grew up with Celtic music; it's a longing, you begin to miss the symbols when you move".*

Laura agreed with this point, but stated with concern that she viewed elements of Scottish-Canadian ethnic display largely as inauthentic cultural `trappings', indulged in by *"people who never saw a kilt in Britain, couldn't sing a*

Scottish song, don't know Burns, but come to Canada and get into all of the trappings."

Regina interpreted her growing affinity for elements and symbols of Scottish culture in the following manner: "*I came over here and realized I'm Scottish...when I went home, they said `You've become more Scottish since you've been away'...Lowlanders become more proud of their heritage in Canada than in Scotland.*"

F.Summary

In summary, interviews with respondents indicate that Scots in Hamilton associate participation in cultural/ethnic activity with formal, public events and societies. Popular images of Scottish culture are constructed and promoted through the advertising and production of these events and societies, exemplified by the visible and audible imagery of the piper at the Earthsong food booth entrance, and the setting of Dundurn Castle for the performances by the Argyll-Sutherland Highlanders and Schiehallion dancers.

These formal spheres are also the venues identified by most respondents when answering questions regarding participation in aspects of Scottish and multicultural activity. However, while presented as being `Scottish', these cultural displays exemplify the reification and objectification of Scottish culture more than any direct connection between individual performers and Scottish ancestry or heritage. The Kenyan woman selling Scottish meat

at the Fergus Scottish Festival indicates a blurring of cultural boundaries in the presentation of ethnic identity and `tradition' (Marcus and Fischer 1986). In his article on Highland culture, Trevor-Roper identifies the display elements which are symbolic of Scottish culture, such as the kilt and tartan, as `invented tradition', dating from the eighteenth century. The manipulation of these same symbols in late-twentieth century Canada for the expression of personal ethnic identity suggests the ongoing `re-invention' of tradition.

Furthermore, the accounts of several people illustrated various stages and degrees of participation by Scots in aspects of Scottish culture. More specifically, some respondents increased their involvement and participation in cultural events and societies after they had migrated to Canada. This observation further suggests changes in perceptions of the ethnic `self' and `other' in relation to experiences of immigration.

Chapter 4: The Scottish Community

A. Introduction

Up to this point, I have illustrated an increased self-identification by respondents with a perceived Scottish collectivity in Canada, corresponding with processes of migration. One way in which Scots in Hamilton tend to identify and express their affiliation with this Scottish collectivity is in reference to `community'. However, these perceptions do not reflect the images of the residential and commercial `ethnic community' presented in much of the sociological and anthropological literature on ethnicity in Canada. There is not one homogeneous Scottish community in Hamilton, but rather several networks of interconnected social spheres, varying in certain aspects of membership and ethnic symbolism. In this chapter, I will portray the Scottish community in Hamilton as described by members of the city's Scottish population, illustrating variation in perceptions of the ethnic collectivity and community along lines of gender and social class.

B. The Ethnic Community

Early sociological analysis of the immigrant community in north America promoted changes in the conception of immigration from images of persons fleeing a disordered world to come to the ordered American "community", to depictions of persons leaving "a simple, humanly satisfying face-to-face,

traditional rural community to come to a complex world of strangers" (di Leonardo 1984:133). While the social organization of the immigrant's original `community' was valued, immigrants were required to forsake this community and assimilate to North American lifestyles as a prerequisite for social mobility and success.

However, the apparent North American ethnic revival and a growing emphasis on `grass-roots' movements have promoted more positive images of the immigrant collectivity, presenting the practise of ethnic traditions within the `ethnic community' as adding flavour to North American society. Turning more specifically to the literature on ethnicity in Canada, perhaps one of the most influential studies in this vein is sociologist Raymond Breton's (1965) analysis of immigrant collectivities in Montreal. Breton wrote that the three communities with which the immigrant comes into contact in the receiving country are "the community of his ethnicity, the native (i.e. receiving) community, and the other ethnic communities" (Breton 1965:193). Immigrants may become integrated into any one of these communities, in which interpersonal `fields' or networks of personal affiliations are reconstructed from the home country. These communities develop along a path from simple, informal networks through a process of structural formalization to a state of `institutional completeness' identified as the ability of the ethnic community to "perform

all the services required by its members. Members would never have to make use of native institutions for the satisfaction of any of their needs" (Breton 1965:194).

Breton concluded that few ethnic communities could claim true institutional completeness, and that linguistic differences between members of a certain ethnic group and the native society, the proportion of manual workers in the ethnic group, and whether the migration of this group was an individual or group phenomenon all influence the development of institutional completeness (Breton 1965:204, 205).

At this point, it is important to note that differences in the definition of the `ethnic community' among social scientists may also reflect methodological differences in academic approaches to ethnicity. Breton's study relies on census tracts recording numbers of immigrants in urban areas, and bases his scale of institutional completeness the number of "churches, welfare organizations, newspapers, and periodicals in each ethnic community" (Breton 1965:195).

The ethnic community has also been defined and interpreted in subjectivist approaches to ethnicity. Assuming a mobilizationist approach, Marger and Obermiller identify ethnic identity and the ethnic community as being "the products of confrontation and competition among a variety of groups for the society's rewards" (Marger and Obermiller 1987:2).

In her study of ethnicity in the United States, sociologist Mary Waters (1990) writes of the `ethnic community' in more of a primordialist vein: "the idea of being `American' does not give people a sense of one large family, the way that being French does for people in France. In America, rather than conjuring up an image of nationhood to meet this desire, ethnic images are called forth (Waters 1990:153). Thus, the ethnic community is a "voluntary, personally constructed, American creation" that, owing to its `contentless' nature, is able "to provide the feeling of community with no cost to the individuality we Americans value so highly" (Waters 1990:166).

Anthony D. Smith reconciles objectivist and subjectivist approaches to ethnicity in his identification of the ethnic community as "a named social group with alleged common ancestry and shared history, one or more elements of distinctive culture, a sense of territorial association and an active solidarity" (Smith 1984:285). While outsiders to the community identify it by its solidarity and separateness and proper name, these elements appear to the participant as external manifestations of `inward myths and memories'.

While these studies illustrate a multiplicity of approaches to the study of ethnic community, they accept the existence of this community without question, treating it as the natural result of immigration to North America. However,

several other studies have identified certain problems with the very concept of the `ethnic community'.

Murray (1979) writes that, because of the plethora of definitions provided in social scientific journals, "there are no clear-cut criteria with which to decide whether there is a `community'" (Murray 1979:166). However, he proceeds to evaluate the existence of the Toronto gay community as a `quasi-ethnic community' on the basis of factors including territory, institutional completeness, collective action and solidarity, temporal aspects, shared values and norms, primary groups and conflict management (Murray 1979:166, 167-173).

In her study of Portuguese immigrants in Toronto and Paris, Brettell (1981) writes that early community-study and network analysis approaches (i.e. Arensberg 1957; Boissevain and Mitchell 1973) often lend themselves to mere `tautology', as they first identify a `community' and then prove its existence (Brettell 1981:1). However, while the concept of social networks has proven to be a useful analytical tool, "the concept of the `urban ethnic community' - in both the geographical and network senses -needs careful scrutiny, especially since "community" in one or both senses is not necessarily inevitable and cannot simply be assumed" (Brettell 1981:1).

Di Leonardo (1984) writes of several changes in the identification of `community' in the literature on ethnicity.

While sociological analyses have often approached `community' as "small settlements...limited groups of people who see one another daily over a lifetime" (di Leonardo 1984:133), di Leonardo writes that a new cultural emphasis on the `virtue and necessity' of community lends itself to definitions of a vague sense of `togetherness', while retaining the original material connotations of `community' through metaphor: daily face-to-face contact, organization and groupness (di Leonardo 1984:133). Images of the unchanging white ethnic community, with social patterns recreated from the immigrants' home country, have been challenged by the disruption of immigrants' lives by the migration experience, the changing composition of ethnic neighbourhoods and social networks through movement of personnel across group boundaries and interaction with the receiving society. The ethnic community's existence does not rest on identification only in terms of objective criteria, but rather on subjective perceptions: "labelling a human collectivity a community confers upon it a hoped-for alliance of interests, solidity, and tradition" (di Leonardo 1984:133).

I will draw on DiLeonardo's processual approach in my analysis of statements provided by respondents concerning the existence of a Scottish community in Hamilton, arriving at a definition of `community' through interpretation of respondents' statements.

C.Corktown

One characteristic commonly attributed to the institutionally complete ethnic community is that of residential segregation (Balakrishnan 1982; Darroch and Marston 1971; Driedger 1978; Driedger and Church 1974; Guest and Weed 1976; Kalbach 1990).

When questioned as to the existence of a Scottish community in Hamilton, several respondents noted the absence of any residentially segregated Scottish area akin to the visible urban collectivities of other ethnic groups (Kalbach 1990:36, 37). One respondent asked "*You mean like a little Italy?*" Bob, a participant in the Hamilton branch of the RSCDS, stated:

> *"At Barton and James, there's an Italian community, but you won't find a Scottish community anywhere now. People get together at social events. Scots weren't like the Italians. People spoke Italian, and wouldn't learn English. Scots didn't have to come together for support...Hamilton is loaded with Scots. Sometimes I wonder who's running the island. People are scattered throughout the city now. Scots seem to assimilate into Canadian society quicker and easier than some of the other European immigrants did."*

While no-one identified an existing Scottish neighbourhood, several respondents referred to an area of the city situated at the foot of the Niagara escarpment in the central section of the city, known for its Scottish residents. However this area, called `Corktown', is more famous for its history of Irish Catholic settlement during the nineteenth century and has been depicted by the city

newspaper as homogeneously Irish until the 1950s, even though the proportion of Irish immigrants decreased after the turn of the century (Hamilton Spectator: Aug. 31, 1953:2; May 24, 1958:39; Dec. 18, 1965:29; June 27, 1967:26a; July 7, 1987:C1).

One woman interviewed in a legion provided a verbal map of this ethnic neighbourhood:

> *"There is a Scottish community in Hamilton. There's a residential section from James Street south above Main Street that was Irish. The Anglican church didn't like strangers, but it was very Scottish, old country types. This side of Walnut St. was Scottish, around Young St. and the west side of Walnut St. The Irish were as far up as Charlton and Stanford. Scots were up to James St. There was a scatter of ethnic groups, but there were tensions between the Scots and the Irish, and between the Catholics and Protestants. My grandmother used to say, `You don't talk to those Irish bastards'."*

Several respondents spoke of this British neighbourhood as disappearing along with increased ethnic diversity introduced to the area during the late 1950s and 1960s, accompanying urban renewal projects and rezoning. In one interview, Bob began to talk to his wife Anne about her experiences in Hamilton neighbourhoods:

> *"When you came to Canada, there was a white area in Hamilton where I was raised. In the North End, there was a large section of Scots, as well as little Italy. In 1960, the city was starting to blossom. English, Irish and Scots were living in specific areas. That's possibly why you felt comfortable here. Had you lived in the north end in a Portuguese area...Just below the edge of the mountain there was Corktown, with Irish and Scots. North of that, down to the bay, there were Portuguese, Italians, Germans. In the nineteen-sixties, the city started growing and the area diversified."*

However, ethnic diversity has existed in Corktown at least since the turn of the century, as the neighbourhood housed Germans and Italians as well as Scots and Irish immigrants (Hamilton Spectator May 24, 1958:39). Di Leonardo writes that the `myth of community' has obscured the reality of the constantly changing nature of the ethnic neighbourhood, as people change residence and move in and out of the neighbourhood, and as businesses open and close. As social scientists seeking stability in this myth, we have exaggerated the numbers and length of stay of neighbourhood residents. Increased awareness of change leads us to proclaim that ethnic communities are endangered. However, "in so doing we falsify history and create misconceived nostalgia for worlds we have never lost" (di Leonardo 1984:135). One Hamilton steelworker told me: "*There is no residential Scottish area, but there was when I first came.*" As Raymond Williams writes, "if there is one thing certain about the organic community, it is that it is always gone" (Williams 1960:277).

D.Concession St. Business Section

In his study of the Sicilian-Canadian community in Hamilton, Migliore (1988) writes that the community's high level of institutional completeness depends in part on an ethnic business network which is able to meet the needs of community members (Migliore 1988:85). Such a network does not exist for the Scottish community. At the brow of the

escarpment in central Hamilton, there is a small business section including a Scottish butcher shop, pub and convenience store which sells Scottish newspapers. All three shops are located within one block of each other. There are also several Scottish pubs in the city. However, there is no business community comparable in size or self-sufficiency to that which Migliore depicts, lending support to Breton's statement regarding the low level of institutional completeness of Scottish communities in Canada (Breton 1965:195). Nevertheless, these shops do serve important functions for Scots in Hamilton. The convenience store has provided an important link between Scottish immigrants and Scotland through the sale of Scottish periodicals and magazines. Several respondents report that the store is a regular stop for them in their weekly schedule. One woman interviewed at a British pub said: *"I've been here eighteen years and I've only missed going to Walt's for the soccer news maybe three or four times. The Sunday Telegraph comes every week."*

Eddie, the Polish proprietor of this store, has operated it for forty-seven years, and has sold popular magazines, tabloids and newspapers from Scotland during the past twenty-five years. Eddie's wife Helen informed me: *"We're the original sellers of papers from Scotland. Agnes Murphy asked Eddie to sell them twenty-five years ago."* In telling me about the history of the shop, Eddie illustrated

both the popularity of these publications and the importance of this link with the home country: *"Twenty-five years ago, the papers were printed on Sunday in Scotland. They were sent by plane on Sunday. I went to the airport and by the time I got back, there was a line-up to pick them up here."*

Discussing the popularity of Scottish publications in Hamilton with Eddie and Helen, I became aware of an important focal point of interest for Scottish immigrants. The proprietor and his wife agreed that it was primarily Scots who purchased the publications, and more specifically that people bought the papers in order to follow news of soccer teams and matches: *"Ninety-eight percent of the people who buy Scottish papers are Scots. The other two percent are followers of soccer...People here love to talk about `back home' and soccer. The demand for papers was so great because of the soccer teams."*

Eddie described the community of his Scottish clientele in terms of occupation: *"There is a Scottish community. They're good, hard-working, honest people. The community consists of sixty- to sixty-five percent blue collar workers, some doctors, lawyers and business people. Most of them are skilled tradesmen."* Directing my attention to the small cluster of neighbouring Scottish businesses, he stated *"This cluster is mostly accidental. We were here first. The butcher came up for the Scottish trade that we started."* Referring to a vacant shop a block to the west of

his own store, he continued:"*Then the pie and chip shop started as a bake shop. He closed down three to four years ago.*" Turning his attention to a bar across the street, the plate glass window bearing paintings of a thistle and a kilted man playing bagpipes, he continued: "*The Tartan Toorie was a pizza shop before. It's the focal point here.*"

While a `Scottish trade' exists between these shops, Eddie perceives this trade to be in decline:

> "*People come in here to eat. We used to import stuff from Scotland like sweets, Cadburys, cookies, drinks and bars. There used to be a heavy demand. Things are tailing off a little. People get Canadianized...Now immigrants don't want papers. I think more professionals immigrate now. The demand will keep on going down.*"

Across the street, Danny's butcher shop is stocked with haggis, Scotch pies, Scottish candy and pop, and other food imported from Scotland. Advertisements on the walls inside the store promote soccer matches, Scottish vacations and the Loch Ness Monster, one of the most widely known symbols of Scotland. The business office at the back of the store is decorated with photographs of the Rangers Football Cup, Scotland's World Cup Squad of 1974, a picture of Robert Burns, a Scottish historical map, a colour picture of a thistle, and a bumper sticker displaying the message: `Glasgow's Miles Better'. In an interview, Danny talked about relationships between the neighbouring Scottish businesses:

> "*I've had the shop for twenty-two years. We do our specialty stuff here. People come in because of the patter. Three generations come shopping*

here...Men often go shopping. They make their orders here, and then have a pint in the bar. They come back here for their orders and then go home...The convenience store gets Scottish newspapers. We used to get the Scottish annuals, but we don't break into his business. We work together. The pie shop, he did different food. We never sold the same thing as he did."

The Tartan Toorie bar next door, with flags hung above the counter representing Scotland, Ontario and Canada, also has a Scottish proprietor.

While this business section is the only visible cluster of Scottish establishments in the city, respondents did not mention it in their description of the Scottish community in Hamilton. One factor which may account for this involves the `Mountain' location of these establishments in relation to the pubs and legions located below the `Mountain', which are frequented by a large proportion of my research population. This may also indicate the perception of a social division in Hamilton marked by the escarpment, a hypothesis which is supported by the observation that another legion on the `Mountain' which serves Scottish clientele was not mentioned by respondents as part of the `Scottish community'.

Instead, for some respondents `community' referred more to a sense of `togetherness' than to a particular place or society: *"There definitely is a Scottish community in Hamilton. There is a feeling of patriotism when you meet another person from Scotland, even if you don't know them."*

Fred agreed with the proprietor of the convenience store in identifying the Scottish community in terms of occupation: *"There's definitely a Scottish community. But is it close-knit? Hamilton attracts Scots because of its industry. In Stelco and Dofasco, you can find an identifiable concentration of Scots."*

However, discussions regarding the existence of a Scottish community tended to focus most often around three networks of social interaction, identified by overlapping membership and distinguished from each other by a combination of factors including age, class and occupational differences. The first network, consisting of social relations between members of several veterans' legions, will be discussed in this section. The second network includes Scots who gather regularly in several pubs located near the heart of the city. Scots in the third network participate in one or more dance societies and/or the local Robert Burns society. I will discuss the latter two networks in the next section. The butcher shop and a social club serve as common focal points for members of all three networks. While interviews were also conducted at a senior citizens' drop-in center and at the `Tartan Toorie', these were not identified by respondents as part of the Scottish community in Hamilton.

E.Scottish Space in Clubs and Legions

Most respondents associated the concept of `community' with frequent face-to-face social group interaction with

other Scots sharing similar personal histories and occupation. Scots such as Tom, who replied that a Scottish community did not exist in the city, often based their observation on an apparent absence of Scottish social congregations: *"There's a large number of Scottish people here. But if you're looking for a group that hangs together here, there's no Scottish community. People fall in line with baseball or football, but there's not a Scottish community."* One man identifying himself as a pipe-fitter from Glasgow pointed more specifically to the absence of any identifiable Scottish club: *"There is not a Scottish community in Hamilton per se. Scots do tend to congregate, but there's no definite community. You can't go to a Scottish club here...There are more English pubs in Burlington[3] than Hamilton."*

However, other respondents identified an existing Scottish community in Hamilton within a network of veterans' legions and clubs. Timothy reported that: *"Scots only get together in clubs ...My parents didn't move into a Scottish area of the city. People only socialize in clubs...Little*

---

3. Burlington is an urban center located to the northeast of Hamilton along the shore of Lake Ontario, and hosts a population of 90,000. While having served as a `bedroom' community for Hamilton industries in the past, processes of rezoning in the early 1970s established a regional boundary between the two cities. Burlington has since developed into an industrial community and economic center in its own right (Personal Communication with the Department of Economic Development, Hamilton, March 18, 1994).

Scotland is in the clubs." In particular, two veterans' legions were frequently mentioned. Each of these legions is located at the periphery of a major commercial section, in the central and north-eastern areas of the city. The first of these, known as the `58', is a branch of a larger national legion, established in 1910 to provide social services for war veterans. This branch was opened in 1927, providing services to veterans and their dependents including legal advice, citizenship training, and facilities for social activities including dart boards, pool tables and a bar.

The other legion, established in 1935, is known as the `BIC'. One woman from Glasgow informed me of the importance of this legion in terms of `community': *"There's a Scottish community. I know a lot of Scottish folk. Many people go to the BIC ...my husband is a member of the BIC"*

Timothy identified the community within this legion metaphorically, in terms of an ethnic neighbourhood: *"The Scottish community in Hamilton is at the BIC. People get together there in groups...Little Scotland is in the Hamilton legions."*

This legion also provides community services and facilities for the larger urban populace. One man recalled his participation in legion service activities: *"I made friends with people from Scotland. Everyone goes to the BIC. I've also belonged to the Tartan Club and the Lothian Club. We visited hospitals and old people."*

Don, the president of the `BIC', also informed me of other social events hosted by the legion:

> *"We have gatherings here; our trip to the races in May is always a sell-out. For twenty-six dollars, you get a free program, the races, a meal and a dance. In June we have our Decoration Day parade. We do a procession to Mount Hope. There are fourteen graves of RAF men, young airforce men up there. Much training was done at Mount Hope for Canadian pilots. We'll have the procession until the club defuncts."*

The legion also offers community outreach services for youth groups, seniors, and new Canadians.

Besides being known by Hamiltonians as a gathering place for Scottish immigrants, the `BIC' is known in Scotland, perhaps through reports by other emigrants making return visits or return migrations to their home country. As Ernie told me, *"It's important to find friends from Scotland. The British Imperial Club is known in Scotland. I lived with a friend who started coming to the British Imperial Club. His wife's relatives had come to Canada earlier."*

Both of these legions promote themselves as serving national veteran collectivities. The `58' is a branch of a larger Canadian veterans' legion, while the `BIC' belongs to an organization serving British veterans. Membership is divided into categories of active, social and independent members. I was informed by Don: *"To join the club as an active member, you have to have served in Her Majesty's forces. Canadians and Australians can't be active members, but they can be social members. They're a good bunch of*

boys, but they couldn't get in to vote; only active members can vote." The members of a women's veterans' club within the BIC were identified as `independent' members of the legion. During the 1980s, the `58' was recorded as having over a thousand members (Hamilton Spectator Sept. 18, 1985:D16).

While Waters' `family' model of the ethnic community does not seem applicable to the legion network, Danny identified the existence of a mutual-aid community in the legions: *"I've gone back for funerals, when someone from the BIC or the Legion dies. There's always a big turnout. I also go there for soccer."* Don shares similar perceptions: *"The Legion 58 is larger than the British Imperial Club. But this is a close-knit family. If someone is in dire straits, people help out."*

Within this veterans' collectivity, respondents directed me to a Scottish community identified by the creation of ethnic territory within these establishments. The creation of this territory is accomplished in at least three interrelated ways: through spatial arrangement of tables and chairs within the legion clubrooms, patterns of social interaction, and social events.

First, I will provide brief descriptions of the buildings housing these legions and the interior layout of their clubrooms. The `BIC' is located in a smaller building than the `58'. As a result, the interior layout also differs

between the two buildings. The main clubroom of the `BIC' is located on the second floor. Upon entering the clubroom, one sees the bar directly ahead. The seating area to the right seems crowded as a result of the small size of the room and the inclusion of seven tables to the north, south and west of a pool table occupying the central floorspace. This area also includes a small library of books donated by members, a blackboard and a television set.

Most of my respondents sit in the `Scottish area', to the west and north of the pool table. Tables to the south of the pool table are identified as occupied by `East-Coasters'. Only four tables are located beyond a small partition in the seating area to the left, making it seem relatively spacious. A dart board, pictures of the Queen and of aircraft from the Second World War decorate the walls of this area. While this area is identified by respondents as the `Canadian section', this is also the usual seating area for a weekly British-Scottish women's club which rents the basement of the BIC.

The clubroom of the `58' is approximately four times the size of the `BIC' clubroom. Located on the ground floor of the building, this room appears quite spacious owing to the distance between tables and to a large open area between the entrance and the bar. The pool table is located against the west wall of the room, far from the table where most of my Scottish respondents have their usual seats. This room also included a dart board, and a picture of the Queen hung

above the bar. Several long tables placed end-to-end immediately in front of the bar were identified by respondents as the `Scottish table'.

The presence of a `Scottish table' is not an unusual occurrence within legions and social clubs. I conducted several interviews in a senior citizens' drop-in centre and in a Navy veterans' club. Respondents in both situations identified `Scottish tables' in these places.

While I interviewed Scots in several other areas of both legion clubrooms, and while some respondents preferred to move to a table away from the Scottish section for interviews, these verbal maps and corresponding seating patterns illustrate ethnic segregation within establishments serving a more generic population.

Patterns of social interaction between Scots and members of other ethnic groups, and within the informally designated `Scottish' areas, also illustrate ethnic boundaries. In the `BIC', the central position of the pool table corresponds to the significance of snooker as a prime clubroom activity. Snooker games were usually in progress during my visits to the `BIC'. With each additional visit to the clubroom, I watched these games and their participants, and made several observations.

First, I noticed that, without exception, the men who play snooker always sit in the Scottish area. Through interviews, I became aware that most of these men were first-

generation Scottish immigrants. I never witnessed a snooker game involving anyone from the `East-Coaster' section.

Second, verbal interaction between snooker players and persons seated in the clubroom illustrated the ethnic exclusiveness of the game. Snooker is regarded by respondents as a game during which spectators do not converse in depth with players, and I was cautioned by respondents to be quiet while games were in progress. However, I noticed that a significant amount of light-hearted, humorous banter occurs between spectators in the Scottish section and snooker players. Spectators in the `East-Coaster' section rarely speak to snooker players.

Many respondents also have regular seats within the Scottish area. While Scots in the BIC would on occasion sit in the `Canadian' section of the clubroom, I never observed this mobility to occur between `Scottish' and `East-Coaster' sections. Verbal interaction between people seated at tables is usually confined to members of the ethnic in-group. Alcohol purchase are also usually confined to round-buying for one's own table, or for other Scots sitting at neighbouring tables.

In summary, patterns of social interaction in the legions, particularly in the `BIC', illustrate the existence and constant re-creation of ethnic boundaries. One machinist at the `BIC' illustrated this with a touch of sarcasm: *"There is a Scottish community in the pubs and clubs. But they made*

a mistake here. Now the BIC is a Newfie club. They made a mistake and let one Newfie in. He had thirteen in his family."

Several respondents also mentioned social activities which drew Scots together in the legions. Each legion possesses a large television set, and on Saturday mornings, British soccer games are televised. One man from Glasgow identifying himself as a `Scottish-Canadian' perceived collective soccer-viewing as important in terms of community solidarity: *"There's a community of Scots through soccer, people with the same lifestyle."* As another man interviewed at the `58' put it: *"Soccer is a cult here, we watch it here on Saturday mornings."*

While observing a Saturday-morning soccer-viewing session at the `58', I noticed that the members of the `Scottish table' had relocated themselves to a table in front of the television screen near the clubroom entrance. Listening to cheers from this table for favoured soccer teams, I noticed that these men were the only people in the legion who had relocated themselves in this manner. The rest of the tables in the clubroom were in their usual positions. People were holding conversations and playing pool in various sections of the room. Watching the Saturday morning soccer game seems to be an activity whose participants are primarily the members of the Scottish table.

This connection between Scots and soccer has been examined by H.F. Moorhouse (1984, 1986) as both an ethnic and class-related phenomenon. I will discuss this in further detail in the final chapter of this thesis.

Drinking is another social activity which legionnaires presented as characteristic of Scots: *"Scots come together to drink."* People often referred to the legendary capacity of Scots for alcohol in joking terms, but drinking also seemed to be a primary social activity for most respondents. One of the managers of a Scottish pub identified the importance of drinking and soccer-viewing to the solidarity of the Scottish club community: *"There should be more Scottish clubs. Going to the pubs and the soccer thing are the two most social things that Scots do. I don't know of the dance society."*

Each legion also hosts and promotes special events promoting popular Scottish culture, including Robert Burns suppers within the legions, and Tattoos and Highland Games in the larger urban community and region. Referring to the `BIC', Doug informed me that: *"The only Burns supper I attend is in the club"*

Respondents identified the existence of a Scottish community in terms of ethnic territory in legion clubrooms, commitment to fellow Scots exhibited through attendance at retirement celebrations and funerals, and patterns of social interaction including snooker playing, drinking and soccer-viewing. The Scottish community in the Hamilton legions is

not static or unchanging. Rather, it is vibrant and in constant flux. I will illustrate this through several observations.

First of all, several respondents indicate recent changes to the general membership of this community. One man interviewed at the `58' said: "*The Scottish community is in Legion 58...The community existed years ago, but not so much now.*" Don reported that, as a result of membership regulations, the legions increasingly host an aging population of veterans: "*There's no-one left from World War I, and people from World War II are in their late sixties.*" While he perceives membership to be declining in number owing to a combination of the aging factor and economic conditions, Don maintains faith in the commitment of its members to one another: "*During the last year, the club has been emptier, partly due to the recession. But when things pick up...the day will come again when the club will be full. This is just a testing period...There are many people out there. They come out of the woodwork to help or pay respect to each other. One man who retired gave his testimonial. Many people came for that.* The second aspect of flux within this network concerns the decline in immigration from Great Britain and subsequent changes to the ethnic composition of legion clientele. Several Scots at the `BIC' indicated that the `East-Coaster' section was a more recent development than the Scottish table.

Third, the nature of general membership has also changed during the recent past. Several people who were children during the Second World War informed me that they were entitled to social membership and legion benefits due to their parents' involvement in the British armed forces. Social memberships are also available to anyone who is willing to pay for these privileges.

Fourth, Scots do not automatically or inevitably become members of this community upon arrival in Hamilton. Several people provided accounts of how they first joined the Scottish community in the legions, indicating that this is a process in and of itself. Ernie recalled:

> *"I made a lot of friends here who are Scottish. When I first came to Canada, I went to the HMCS Star. It's a naval base, with mostly Canadians there...some people come to Canada, and ask if there are Scottish people around. Taxi drivers take them to the BIC. The British Imperial Club is well-known in Scotland...I joined the British Imperial Club in 1964. I felt at home. It's predominantly Scots here, people who were in the services. Active members are veterans."*

Membership in the Scottish community within the Hamilton legions depends on eligibility for legion membership and acceptance within the legion's Scottish collectivity.

Finally, the legions themselves have moved from one location to another since their establishment (Hamilton Spectator April 4, 1952:4; Sept. 13, 1967:44).

The Scottish community is thus portrayed as dynamic, existing in the minds and actions of its members in a constant process of construction and restructuring.

F.Summary

In summary, the Scottish community in Hamilton, as identified by respondents during fieldwork interviews, does not fit within the more popular models of the `ethnic community' in sociological and anthropological literature.

It is not a residential community, but rather consists of several networks focused on veterans' service legions and clubs. The small number of visible Scottish business establishments and the limited services which are provided contribute to the low level of this community on Breton's scale of institutional completeness (Breton 1965:195). Following Breton's theory, this may be influenced by the low degree of linguistic difference between Scots and Canadians, and by the individual or family-based nature of the migrations of most respondents (Breton 1965:204,205).

This community does not appear to have been founded on mobilizationist or `family' ideals. Respondents rarely mentioned politics in interviews. While a few respondents share a sense of commitment to other legion members, the community does not appear to meet respondents' needs for a `family'. Rather, the legion community appears to meet social needs of Scots in Hamilton through offering social activities reminiscent of activities pursued in Scotland. People come together to drink, play snooker, watch television and talk to one another. Legions and clubs often facilitate

the formation of social networks and friendships with other people of a common ethnic and occupational background. As Buchignani writes, "actual ethnic communities are perhaps best seen as a set of overlapping personal social networks between ethnic individuals" (Buchignani 1982:23).

The ethnic character of the legion community is not readily identifiable in terms of Scottish cultural symbolism, but rather is most notably defined by accent and the manipulation of space in establishments serving a more generic Canadian or British population. The creation of the `Scottish table' illustrates Barth's theory of boundary formation and maintenance through spatial manipulation at the level of the legion clubroom.

In terms of the focus of this thesis, one final point merits attention. Scots do not inevitably become members of this community upon migrating to Canada (Brettell 1981). Community participation is defined in terms of individual membership in one or more of the legions or clubs, and legion membership is often contingent upon participation in the British Armed Forces during the First and Second World Wars. The Scottish community within the legion network thus has a membership which is directly related to several specific historical events and processes. For example, the average age of this population reflects the post-war decline in numbers of British immigrants, and the age of these immigrants upon arrival in Canada. The manager of the `BIC'

told me that he is concerned for the future of the legion, because of the aging veteran population and the current national recession.

These factors all point to the importance of conducting analysis of the ethnic community within historical, political and economic contexts. The ethnic community and its membership are constantly in process, both at the level of the individual community member and at the level of the community at large.

G.Community, Gender and Social Class

Until this point, I have examined one social network identified by several people as a Scottish `community'. At this point, several characteristics of membership in this community merit attention.

First, while both men and women identified the Scottish community as existing within the legion network, most of my interviews in the legions were conducted with men. The Scottish table at the `58' hosted only men, while the women contacted at the `BIC' were either barmaids or belonged to a social group which met in the basement of the club once every week. Several women identified themselves as affiliated with the legions through their husbands. However, women appeared to be largely on the periphery of the legion and community.

Furthermore, legion members are generally of blue-collar, working-class occupations. Most men worked, or

continue to be employed, in steelmills or other factories in Hamilton. Membership in the Scottish community as identified by respondents is thus biased in terms of gender and social class. In the remaining chapters of this thesis, I will discuss factors of gender and class as they relate to the formation of ethnic identity among Scots in Hamilton.

Chapter 5: Gender, Ethnic Identity and Community

A. Introduction

Prior to the relatively recent past, little attention was given to variations in experiences of immigration and ethnicity between men and women. On her study of the Vancouver press, Doreen Indra writes that, both within social scientific literature and the media, images of ethnicity and ethnic identity have been largely created for, of and by men (Indra 1981). During the 1980s, anthropologist Roxana Ng (1981, 1982, 1984, 1986) and sociologist Dorothy Smith (1987) began to examine images of `ethnic women' as social constructs formed at the boundaries of social interaction between members of various ethnic groups and gender. Several studies have also identified the importance of examining relationships among gender, ethnicity and class. Cassin and Griffith have identified relationships among ethnicity, social and economic power, and gender (Cassin and Griffith 1981). Di Leonardo (1984) also illustrates these relationships, emphasizing links among gender, occupation and collective ethnic identity. She writes that a lack of prior attention to relationships among these factors may result from difficulties in tracing the influence of women's occupational involvement on the life of the immigrant family, as "women tended...to work for shorter periods, often part-

time, and in lower-paid jobs than their husbands" (di Leonardo 1984:192).

Similar biases were experienced in the analysis of interview statements for this thesis, as membership in the legion community was predominantly male. Women were identified by both Scottish men and women as socially peripheral to this community. This gender-related difference in network membership corresponds to images of independent male breadwinners and dependent female homemakers and caregivers presented in statements regarding migration. These differences in labour and occupation are also reflected in accounts depicting gender roles during processes of migration.

However, while comments provided by both men and women support these generalizations, the accounts of several women illustrate that these images are in part social constructions which fail to account for gender-based variation in immigration and ethnic experience.

In this chapter I will examine the legion network, illustrating that membership is predominantly male and women are perceived as peripheral to this community. Careful analysis of interviews with respondents reveals the manipulation of images of ethnicity, class and immigration patterns in the creation of gender-based varieties of identity.

In my analysis of these statements, I will again build on the work of di Leonardo (1984), emphasizing the economic context of ethnic identity formation. Individuals leave their country of residence and migrate to another for specific reasons, often related to current political or economic climates in both receiving and source countries. Immigration must therefore always be examined within its historical, political and economic contexts.

B.Gender and the Scottish Community

I have previously documented the importance of the legion and pub community to Scots in Hamilton. Most respondents indicated that while they had not searched for Scottish associates upon arriving in Canada, social interaction with other Scots within the legion networks provided a sense of comfort and belonging. Often persons at the `Scottish' tables share similar occupations and socioeconomic backgrounds. Tim, one of the two non-Scots seated at the `58' Scottish table, said:

> *"You can trust people at this table. If you got people at this table together, you could build a house. One helps the other. They have different trades and apprenticeships, but they're all trustworthy. They stick together, but they do let outsiders in. Everybody has been in the armed forces. If you were in the armed forces, you can be a social member. There are also affiliated members."*

Fieldwork observations and interviews reveal the Hamilton legion network as male-dominated in its membership and leadership. In several legions, the only regular female

customers were either accompanied by men or were employed as barmaids or secretaries, as in Ruby's case: *"I just come here to work in the office."* Women appear at the legion in greater numbers on Friday and Saturday nights, usually accompanied by their husbands.

While men attend the `BIC' on a daily basis, and often have regular seating patterns in the clubroom, the women who form the Good Neighbours Club meet once a week downstairs. When these women come upstairs into the main part of the club on Thursdays, they always sit in the section designated as `Canadian'. I never observed a woman sitting alone in the main clubroom area.

Furthermore, women do not sit at the `Scottish table' in the `58'. Televised soccer matches are watched on Saturdays by the men from the `Scottish table'. Women sit in other parts of the club, but I was never directed or introduced to any women from Scotland in this legion.

Several people recalled changes in seating regulations had occurred during the recent past, replacing even stricter divisions between men and women in legion clubrooms. One man at the `BIC' recalls that women were only allowed to join one veterans' legion after one woman who had served in the armed forces applied for membership:

> *"This is the story behind women joining the club. Men had said that women couldn't join the B.I.C. But they had to let Kitty in, because she's a veteran and demanded her rights. Any veteran can't be kicked out. Then they opened up the*

> *B.I.C. to women. They rent the basement to women on Thursday afternoons for a dollar a year."*

Ruby is secretary at the Royal Hamilton Light Infantry [R.H.L.I.], and recalls a similar division between men and women in this legion:

> *"The R.H.L.I. used to have a lady's lounge, where only ladies could sit. Men could only sit there if accompanied by their wives. Only men could sit in the other part. However, the women would sometimes come into the men's area to play cards with the men. The then-president says that they had a blast together. One day the president of the R.H.L.I. wanted to sit down. The place was packed, and the only open seat was in the ladies' area. He was going to sit down, when someone informed him that, according to club rules, he could only sit there if accompanied by his wife. He says that the next executive meeting, he changed the rules."*

Ruby also mentioned that women often gain membership and social contacts through their husbands: *"This is my husband's regiment's club."* One woman interviewed at the Y.W.C.A. recalls: *"My husband met guys at work. I made friends through his family at clubs and dances."* Margaret provides a similar account:

> *"I never wanted to go back to Scotland. I knew people who were so homesick, but we brought our own people here for a visit. My husband went home, but he wouldn't go back to live. Things haven't changed there... Finding Scottish friends in Canada was important. Canadians didn't want anything to do with immigrants, or with people who didn't own their own home. So we stuck together...I made most of my friends through the legion. My husband joined in 1958. He was president for ten years. I'm a member of the legion, but no other clubs."*

These statements present women as being less directly involved with the legion and club community than men in terms of attendance, participation and membership. In the next

section I will illustrate statements provided by Scots in Hamilton as revealing images of gender-related occupational and migration roles which correspond to differences between Scottish men and women in terms of their relationship to the legion community.

C.Migration, Occupation and Gender

In fieldwork interviews, respondents often referred to gender-related occupational differences amongst Scots in Hamilton. Scottish men are often depicted by respondents as being oriented toward occupations outside of the home, while the roles of women are depicted as centring around the home. This difference is illustrated in several ways.

First, during the period immediately following World War II several male-dominated Scottish industries experienced significant declines in production and employment levels. A common factor motivating migration to Hamilton amongst my respondents was thus the search for male employment.

Ernie listed the opportunity to practice his apprenticeship skills and sponsorship by a Canadian company as important factors influencing his family's decision to emigrate:

> *"I came in 1963. I was with the military police in Scotland. I had to do compulsory conscription for two years. Then I finished my apprenticeship as a toolmaker. I worked as a toolmaker for three years in Canada, but I found better money in construction...A tool and dye company offered to pay my way to Canada, with an obligation to work for the company for two years."*

Tim recalls a Canadian manufacturing company's advertising campaign as being directed specifically at Scottish men: *"Dofasco employed twelve thousand people, but had no apprenticeship program. They sent guys over to Scotland to look for men with apprenticeships. Westinghouse sent general foremen to go over and pick workers."*

Immigration to Canada also provided a welcome career change for some men. Alec, a regular at the `58', recalls: *"I was in the coalmines. If you were in the mines, you weren't in the [armed] Services unless you were called up, but you couldn't leave the coalmines...I came to get out of the coalpits."*

The second way in which this gender-related difference in occupational roles is illustrated centres around the stages of the migration process. Men would often migrate first, while their wives remained with family and assumed the responsibility for taking care of children. Tony recalled: *"I came first. I've been here for twenty-six years in the steel mills. I brought my family five weeks later. We go home every year."* One woman interviewed at the Y.W.C.A. provided a similar account: *"My husband's sister and brother-in-law came first. Then mom and dad came. Then he came. Six months later, the baby and I came."*

This order of migration was influenced in part by post-war situations of poverty, rationing and unemployment in Scotland.

One man who had switched professions from coalminer to stone-cutter upon coming to Canada said: "*I came by myself. I couldn't afford to bring my family over all at once. My wife and two kids came later.*" Mary reported a similar situation: "*We saved for our tickets. First my husband saved up for his ticket. He came out, and then six months later my baby and I came out. He worked and saved up for our tickets.*"

Once a man had secured a job and a place to live, his family would join him in Canada. In interviews with men, this was often expressed as `sending for' or `bringing' his wife or fiancee. Accounts of migration experiences often present men as being independent immigrants who came to prepare the way for the migration of the rest of their family in terms of finances and residence. In contrast, women are often depicted as being dependent on male financial success for their migration to Canada and reunification with their spouses. The account of one woman interviewed at the Y.W.C.A. illustrates her own sense of dependence upon her husband for admission into Canada: "*When I came, it was easy. I just had to prove that my husband wanted me.*"

Women are also often depicted as having very strong emotional attachments to their Scottish `home', consisting of family and friends in their community of origin. Ruby's migration account illustrates the loneliness of the migration experience: "*Nobody I knew came from Scotland with me.*

Nobody I knew came. My brother emigrated, but he's dead now."

The combination of these factors is perceived by several people to result in the social isolation of Scottish women in Hamilton, and in some cases the undertaking of return migrations. A number of respondents identified the experience of emigration as a central component of Scottish collective identity. Several respondents knew of other Scots who had completed return migrations, and who had re-migrated to Canada. Jimmy mentioned the option of return to Scotland as a positive factor influencing his choice of migrating to Canada: *"I came to Canada, rather than going to Australia. If I didn't like it, it was easier to get back again."* However, most often people who actually undertook successive migrations are viewed with disfavour and referred to in slightly derogatory terms, reflecting a sense of shame or embarrassment. This attitude may be illustrated in reference to several points.

First, instances of return migration are often referred to in epidemiological terms. The motivating factor for returns was often identified as `homesickness' (Gmelch 1980), with the return trip being referred to as the `thousand dollar cure'. One man recalled: *"I came by myself first, and then I sent for my girl-friend later. The transition wasn't a problem. There was always the thousand dollar cure...My wife got homesick, and went back on*

holidays. That cured her homesickness." John indicated the effects of inflation on the `cure': *"One family I know got homesick here...That's the million dollar cure. They had to sell and go back."*

The second way in which subsequent migrations are identified as shameful centres around the observation that people who undertook return migrations are often perceived as being deluded as to social and economic conditions in Scotland. In the words of one woman interviewed at the Y.W.C.A. seniors' centre: *"Some people who come to a new country lose their identity. Instead of embracing the new country, they go back. There's something they cling to."* Re-migration is perceived as the reawakening of migrants to the difficult social and economic conditions of the home country, shattering the romanticized images of their memories (Gmelch 1980:143, 145). Don is familiar with incidents of return migration and re-migration amongst his Scottish acquaintances:

> *"Some guys went back. Some never came back to Canada. Some came back. They were homesick, they got fed up and went back again. Some got jobs and stayed back in Scotland. Some came back again. They go back to their old pals, and find things aren't as they remembered. Their old pals were married, and other things had changed. There are new overpasses, wide roads that are different from your memories. Old miners' houses have been knocked down, and they've been replaced by new highrises...I thought of moving back, especially right after I lost my wife, but I changed my mind. But I know of people who have returned and re-migrated."*

While men and women have shared the experience of emigration, the homesickness and self-delusion motivating couples and families to undertake these secondary migrations are most often attributed to women, as is exemplified in a statement made by Ernie: *"People have gone back to live, but the majority come back to Canada. Men move back mainly because of their wives, who missed their families back there."*

Several accounts provided by women also supported this gender-based emotional difference. Mary recalls her husband's experiences of return migration: "*My husband came to Canada six months before I did...People do go home, but in less than a year they're back here. People get really homesick. My husband went home for the sake of his first wife. Your lifestyle is different.*" Another woman at the Y.W.C.A. told me about her own experiences:"*I came to Canada and went back. I came in April, and went back in September for one year. I was homesick."*

Gender-related occupational roles are also presented in the comments of Hamilton Scots centring around the formation of social networks in Hamilton. For men such as Jimmy, the formation of Scottish skilled labour collectivities within Hamilton factories facilitated the formation of work-based social networks: "*Many Scots who came out spent time in Stelco and construction, so I met fellow Scots through work."* Another man from Glasgow recalls his

workplace as being important in the formation and development of friendships in Hamilton:

> *"When I first came, I was disappointed, but I toughed it out. I was used to full employment. I couldn't find it at first in Canada, and I missed the social life from home...I missed my friends while I was unemployed, but I found commonalities with other workers and made friends when I became employed again."*

Men interviewed in pubs and legions often share common work-places, or were introduced to these establishments by workmates.

However, several factors presented greater difficulties for women in the construction of social networks in Hamilton. First, Scottish women tended to be employed outside of the home less often than men, or for shorter periods with more interruptions. In the account of Agnes, a woman from Aberdeen, this gender-based division of labour reflects the occupational patterns of her parents: *"My father was a coalminer in a small village, Pleam in Stirlingshire. Mother was a housewife. There was no work for the ladies in those days. We had poor, poor days."* In some families, unemployment resulted from periods of adjustment immediately following marriage or leaves of absence during pregnancy.

Second, while some women reported that they had been employed outside of their home, several people perceived the primary responsibilities of Scottish women in Hamilton to be house-work, cooking and the raising of children, as is exemplified in the account of one woman: *"I worked in*

Hamilton, but not at first. I had a little boy." Several people referred to the preparation of traditional cuisine as being the responsibility of women, as exemplified in Ruby's account: *"I make potato scones and shortbread. I'm a real old country cook."*

One legionnaire at the `BIC' recalls: *"Mom made tinker potatoes. I remember her peeling new potatoes. Gypsies would come to the door, and she'd give them some. She'd take old oatmeal for it. She'd add some gravy or Crisco. She'd use Scotch oatmeal. Then she'd add spring onions. The oatmeal would stick to the side of the pot. She'd serve this with ham or other meat."*

Another woman interviewed at the Y.W.C.A. listed various Scottish dishes which she prepares: *"I make homemade vegetable soup, steak pie and mushy peas. When the kids were younger, I made Scottish pancakes with a cup of tea and a cookie. Granny made scones, dumplings and stew."*

In order to examine women's social networks outside of the home, I asked several people if Scottish women formed social groups as Scottish men did in the legions and pubs. One man who works in one of Hamilton's steelmills said: *"Women get together every November to go shopping."* Another man from Paisley told me: *"Women get together for showers."* One man from Glasgow perceived strictly defined domains of social interaction for men and women: *"Women? Yeah, they go shopping, and to flea markets. This is a man's pub."* While

these may again be generalizations on the part of the men interviewed, social spheres facilitating the formation of social networks among women seem to be few in number, in comparison with the number of venues available to men.

However, these generalizations about Scottish men and women must be considered to be, at least in part, social constructions which do not correspond with all migration accounts of Scots in Hamilton. For example, some women did not report experiences of homesickness and return migrations, while some men did. Similarly, not all women were dependent upon husbands or fiancees for their migration to Canada. One woman told me that she had come to Canada with three girlfriends, after they had each experienced the dissolution of a romantic relationship.

D.Summary

Generalizations about gender-related occupational roles provided by both Scottish men and women correspond with differences in legion and club community membership and participation, indicating the relationship between community formation and the perceived identity of social others within the Scottish ethnic collectivity in Hamilton. Furthermore, these observations suggest variation in ethnic identity and its expression, corresponding to gender differences. Further study will be required to understand fully the nature of these differences, but the evidence provided here serves as a caution against presentations in the literature of

homogeneous ethnic groups, communities and personal identities.

Chapter 6: Occupational Level, Social Mobility and Ethnic Identity

A.Introduction

Until this point, I have focused on the community and ethnic identity of working-class Scots in Hamilton. My research initially centred on this population for several reasons. I was introduced to the `BIC' as hosting a group of Scots early in the fieldwork process. Initial conversations led to successive interviews with legion members and to other locations in this network, including the R.H.L.I. and the `58'.

However, I quickly became aware that my population was bounded by certain factors including social class and occupation. In this final chapter, I will illustrate relationships among factors of ethnic identity, ethnic community membership, social class and occupation through the analysis of statements provided by members of three Scottish social networks in Hamilton.

B.Class, Ethnicity and Anthropology

Several trends have emerged in the anthropological and sociological analysis of class and ethnicity in Canada. Numerous studies have examined differences among ethnic groups in terms of social and occupational stratification (Lautard and Loree 1984; Ogmundson 1990; Ogmundson and Mclaughlin 1992; Porter 1965), occupational and social

mobility (Satzewich and Li 1987; Wilkinson 1981), and social standing or prestige (Goldstein 1988). Other studies have identified `class' and ethnicity as two incompatible forms of group consciousness which displace each other according to variations in terms of social mobility and status (Bell 1975; Dofny and Rioux 1964). However, few studies exist of such differences within a single Canadian ethnic group (Cassin and Griffith 1981; Goyder 1983; Ralston 1988).

In his examination of ethnicity and class identity of French- and English-speaking Canadians, Goyder (1983) draws on Milton Gordon's theory of `ethclass' (Gordon 1964) to illustrate the multi-dimensional aspect of both class and ethnic identity. The `ethclass' is essentially a single social class grouping within a single ethnic group, "the subsociety created by the intersection of the vertical stratifications of ethnicity with the horizontal stratifications of social class" (Gordon 1964:51). Gordon writes that, while the members of a single ethnic group share a sense of historical identification or `peoplehood', similarities in social behaviour are stronger between members of the same social class. Social interaction in primary groups and primary relationships, those which are "personal, intimate, emotionally affective, and which bring into play the whole personality", is usually confined to one's own social class segment of one's own ethnic group (Gordon 1964:32). The ethclass is thus the locus of `participational

identification', combining both a sense of peoplehood and behavioral similarities in social groups of people with whom "we can really relax and participate with ease and without strain" (Dobratz 1988:232; Gordon 1964:54).

However, most studies which draw on Gordon's theory again identify an inverse relationship between class and ethnic identity. As individuals attain higher levels of education and move from blue collar to white collar occupations, the salience of ethnic identity decreases and that of class identity increases (Baltzell 1964; Ben-Rafal and Sharot 1987; Gans 1979; Marger 1978; Nelli 1980; Roche 1984). Few studies have challenged these hypotheses (Dillingham 1981; Dobratz 1988; Rothman 1974), or have applied Gordon's theory to Canadian society (Goyder 1983). In this section I will illustrate that Gordon's concept of `ethclass' applies to the first generation Scottish immigrant population in Hamilton. However, while expressions and manifestations of ethnicity and ethnic community vary according to occupational level, ethnic identity does not necessarily decrease in salience with increased social mobility. Instead, my analysis will support Mahmood and Armstrong's model, which privileges multiple variations in the identification of an ethnic group by its members through the manipulation of a range of ethnic symbols.

C.Occupation and Community

As noted in Chapter Five on the Scottish community, most Scots in the legion and club network have similar occupations. Most men completed five-year apprenticeship programs in Scotland, and have been employed as blue-collar skilled tradesmen in both Scotland and Canada. Respondents identified themselves as electricians, millwrights, machinists, and painters. Men often list factories and manufacturing centres as places of work, including Dofasco, Stelco, Westinghouse, Otis Elevators and Canada Wire.

Similarity in occupational level lends to the sense of compatibility that legion and club clients share with each other. Often members of one legion hold membership in several others, forming a network identified by similarity in members' occupational type and level, and featuring drawing cards including bars and televised soccer games. Alec, a man interviewed in the `BIC' recalls his history of involvement in this network:

> *"I've belonged to some clubs in Hamilton. There was the Bluebell club, the Tartan and Heather clubs. And there was the Ulster Canadian club. I also joined the Branch 58 Legion and some lawn bowling clubs. The clubs I joined always met on alternating Saturdays. On Saturday night, there was always something to do. I had friends who were Irish. They were in the Masonic Lodge. I also went to dances. My son was a drummer in the St. Catharines pipe band. Soccer here is a cult on Saturday mornings. I met friends from Scotland at the BIC and Branch 58. I was an elder in the St. Andrew's society. When I was a window cleaner, I only got Sundays off. But once an elder, always an elder. I go to weddings and funerals...When I came*

to Canada, I joined the Royal Canadian Legion 58. Four years ago, I joined the BIC. I sold my house when my wife died and moved to First Place. I would go to the golf course and drink too much. I needed a different place where I could drink. It cost too much money to join the Legion, so I came to the BIC and got a membership. I found a place to drink."

Locations in this network were identified as `working class' by members and non-members. I was informed by Scots one university professor that: *"You can find the Lowland working class in the Royal Canadian Legions. They get together on Saturday for sports results. But part of that is a strong military tradition".*

Social activities within the legions and clubs also contribute to this working-class identification. In particular, soccer-viewing is identified as primarily a `working-class' activity, both in the literature (i.e. Moorhouse 1984) and by Scots encountered in Hamilton. As one pub customer told me during a televised soccer match: *"This is grass-roots Scottish culture".*

Several reasons were provided by Scots for their interest in soccer matches. For some, soccer-viewing had been a weekly social ritual in Scotland. Jimmy informed me that these social gatherings are recreated in the Hamilton clubs and legions: *"I'm a member of the Tartan club. I'm a regular attender at the dances. On Saturday afternoon, we get together here and watch T.V. Saturday was a big day back*

home. Many people are soccer fans. That rivalry comes to the table at the Legion."

Several men had played soccer in Scotland, and the televised games remind them of a part of their lives which they left behind upon migrating to Canada. One regular customer at the `BIC', explained that: *"Many people here played soccer. The clubs remind them of home."* His friend added: *"Some people here played soccer in the 1950s. The older players die off, and a younger crowd comes in, but they still go back to the old soccer."*

D.The Pub Network

In chapter four, I mentioned the existence of three Scottish social networks within Hamilton. The second of these shares several characteristics with the club and legion network, particularly the promotion of soccer-viewing and alcohol consumption as symbolic of Scottish working-class culture. This network consists of three pubs located on the borders of the central Hamilton commercial sector. The `Scotsman' is located in Hess Village, a small segregated shopping area to the west of the central shopping area, hosting specialty shops and restaurants. The other two pubs, the `Lion's Head' and the `Cat 'n Fiddle', are located one block apart in an area to the south of the central shopping sector. This area supports commercial outlets including a service station/taxi center, a small shopping center and

several boarded-up buildings which once hosted restaurants and bookstores.

The `Scotsman' is situated toward the center of Hess Village, away from the closest street. The painted figure of a kilted Scottish man on the sign outside introduces clients to the ethnic background shared by the pub's manager and a significant proportion of its clients. Posters bearing headlines about Scottish soccer teams and matches line the walls of the bar area on the main floor. Above and behind the bar sits a plush toy figure of a kilted piper. Next to the piper, a television set occupies a prominent place where it can be seen by pub clients across the main seating and drinking areas. Small placards line the walls introducing clients to true Scottish scotch and ale. The walls of the second-floor drinking and dining area are lined with small posters describing aspects of Scottish history, including the origins of several tartans. The pub offers clients four primary separated spaces in which to eat or drink, including the seating areas on the main and upper floors, an outside patio used during the summer months, and a standing area in front of the bar.

I was referred to the Scottish clientele of the second pub, the `Lion's Head', by a professor of Scottish history. Bearing the lion of the Scottish national flag on the sign above the front door, this pub was introduced to me by one of its managers as located in one of Hamilton's oldest

buildings. This pub is much smaller than the `Scotsman', with one drinking and dining area located on the main floor of the building. Unlike the `Scotsman', partitions do not divide this space from the standing area in front of the bar. The inner walls of the pub are lined with photos and posters of Scottish soccer teams, Scottish pub signs, pictures of sites in Glasgow from the turn of the century, and a poster advertising international Tattoos. Another advertisement promotes a brand of whisky with a picture of Robert Burns and the slogan: "True Scotch for a True Scot". A blackboard menu on the wall advertises several Scottish dishes including Scotch pie, and a small stage at the front of the pub hosts concerts of Celtic music during the summer.

The `Cat 'N Fiddle' is located one block south of the `Lion's Head'. Unlike the `Scotsman' or the `Lion's Head', the clientele of this pub is not primarily Scottish, nor does the pub identify itself with Scottish symbolism. I was informed by the manager that at times a small group of Scottish golfers drops in at the pub on Sunday afternoons. I was not able to meet anyone from this group and my only interviews here were conducted with the wife of the proprietor and one client. However, I did interview several other Scots at this establishment, and several clients at the other two pubs included this location in their description of the Scottish community. This pub also plays a role in a soccer-related ritual which I will mention shortly.

While I have mentioned the `Tartan Toorie' in a previous section, this establishment was not referred to by clients as part of the pub network. Dave, a Hamilton ironworker at the `BIC', explained this distinction in the following manner: *"The Tartan Toorie isn't really a pub. It has more than seven owners."* However, I was told by Hamilton's Scottish butcher that men who place orders for meat at his establishment often go next door to this bar for a drink while their orders are being filled.

Several factors distinguish the pub network from the legion and club network. While locations in both networks sport fully stocked bars, the pubs serve Scottish scotch and ale, unlike the legions which serve Canadian and American beer. The `Lion's Head' and `Scotsman' also serve bitters from Ireland and English cider. The legions facilitate social activities including drinking, snooker playing, darts, soccer-viewing and social outreach activities, whereas the primary social activities in the pubs consist of eating, drinking, soccer-viewing and musical concerts.

There is also a general division between the clientele of the two networks in terms of age. Pub clients tend to be younger, between the ages of twenty and fifty, whereas legion and club clients are often between the ages of forty and seventy.

The legions have a longer history within Hamilton than any of the pubs, all of which have opened for business since

1990. Dave provided me with a short history of the British and English pubs in Hamilton: *"Before there were Scottish pubs here, people drank at the legions. In Hamilton there was originally the Winking Judge, then the Gown and Gavel, then the Cat 'n Fiddle."* Members of both the pub and legion networks do have some commonalities. The pub circuit clientele is predominantly male, although women appear more frequently than in the legions. I talked to several women in the `Lion's Head' who were regular customers and who usually sat at the north end of the bar. However, they did not consider themselves Scottish. As in the legions, the only women who did identify themselves as Scottish were employed as barmaids.

This gender-based division of labour and social space is reflected in pub talk among men. One conversation overheard in a Hamilton pub centred around the wives of three men. According to the conversation, women belong in and control the home. Men try to get away from the home and their wives' control, resulting in tension between husband and wife. Several comments were made regarding the ability of the men to `control' their wives. The men also talked with a mixture of humour and pride about a recent fight between two women who had ripped each other's clothing. While they laughed about the apparent lack of emotional control amongst women, these men also attributed physical strength to these women, a characteristic which is valued amongst

working-class Scottish men. This suggests a certain ambivalence in perceptions which Scottish men hold of Scotish women.

However, during weekly evenings of Celtic music at the Lion's Head, women are as welcome to perform as men. A married couple are co-proprietors of the `Cat 'N Fiddle'. Although the clientele at the `Scotsman' was predominantly male, the pub served female customers on a more regular basis than the legions. John told me that this gender-related membership pattern reflects Scottish working class life-style. He identified the pub in Scotland as a daily social arena for men:

> *"It's mostly men in the pubs...I'll describe a typical Scottish week to you. On Monday and Tuesday, the men go to the pub for a pint after work. On Wednesday and Thursday, it's up to one or two pints. On Friday, the men spend the whole night at the pub. On Saturday, the men bring their wives to the pubs for dances."*

The clientele of the `Scotsman' is also different from both the legions and the other Scottish and British pubs in that it provides a welcome atmosphere for families. I observed young children in the pub on several occasions, where they were tolerated by the other pub customers.

Many Scottish men in the legions and pubs are employed by common industries and work at the same location. Several pub customers listed Dofasco and Stelco as places of employment, and occupations including postal carrier, electrician or machinist. However, pub proprietors also told

me that doctors, lawyers and university students also frequented these establishments.

While other pub proprietors were quick to tell me that these establishments served `ordinary' people, the location of one pub in Hess Village suggests a membership differing in social class from Scots interviewed in the legions. This area is promoted, and commonly identified by Hamiltonians, as a shopping area attracting an upper-middle class clientele. One Glaswegian man interviewed at the `Lion's Head' related the presence of the `Scotsman' in this commercial section to the social mobility of the pub's manager: *"Yeah, Hess Village is upper class. The manager of the Scotsman came from the same area of Scotland that we did. But people come to Canada for the buck."*

Similar to the legion and club circuit, several forms of `working-class' social activity were favourites with clients, particularly the consumption of alcohol and soccer-viewing. Interest in this sport often centres around the `Scotsman' which is both the headquarters for the Hamilton Rangers Fan Club, and is currently the one pub in the city with legal rights to broadcast Scottish soccer games. During the fall, a schedule of World Cup matches is posted on one wall of the pub. One construction worker at the `Scotsman' informed me: *"Soccer is a way of life. People gather here to watch soccer games. The Scotsman gets broadcasts of Scottish soccer matches. You might be able to watch Celtics/Rangers*

matches every second week. People watch soccer and toss one-liners."

The broadcasting of World Cup matches, particularly between the Rangers and Celtics, is a major social event at the `Scotsman'. I attended one viewing session in late summer of 1993. The pub was packed with spectators half an hour before the game began, leaving little room for standing or sitting. Most spectators were drinking and conversing in small groups, keeping an eye on the television set for the start of the game. Except for barmaids, there were no women present. All heads turned to the television set as the image of Glasgow's Ibrox playing field appeared on the screen. It quickly became apparent that the game was to be played in the heavy rain that many Hamilton Scots had cited as a reason for not returning to take up residence in their homeland. As the man from Edinburgh with whom I had been conversing said: *"Well, that's Scottish weather for you."* After panning the players assembling on the field, the camera focused on one Rangers player who made an obvious gesture of looking towards the Celtic line and grabbing his crotch. The man next to me yelled out: *"And that's Scottish too!"* The game commenced amidst the cheering and commentary of the pub's spectators.

I was later told by one of my companions that after these soccer matches, men would quite often walk to the `Lion's Head' for a drink, and then to the `Cat 'N Fiddle'.

Later, they would make their way back to the `Lion's Head'. Several other men in the pub supported this statement.

The `Lion's Head' also hosts other group social activities including musical concerts and dominos tournaments. In some years, this pub also hosts Robert Burns suppers.

In summary, several related factors lead to the recognition of the pub circuit as a second Scottish social network in Hamilton. These factors include the identification by several people of these pubs as meeting places for Scots, patronage of more than one of these pubs by several respondents, and the promotion of Scottish social events within these establishments.

E.Scottish Cultural Organizations and Societies

Interviews also revealed a third Scottish social network in Hamilton, consisting of two organizations and two societies promoting Scottish culture. This network is identified by membership criteria similar to that which I have just outlined.

Two organizations and one society promote Scottish dancing. The second society promotes activities centring around the work of the poet Robert Burns. Before examining these groups in further detail, I will discuss the importance of dance to Hamilton Scots as revealed in comments made by interviewees.

(i) Dance

Other than soccer-viewing and drinking, dancing was the social activity most often mentioned by respondents as bringing Scots together. Dancing was identified in interviews with both men and women, and with people of varying economic and occupational backgrounds, as a visible marker of Scottish culture.

Several people mentioned dances as important social gatherings in Scotland. Ruby recalled that dancing was an important activity during wartime: *"I was sixteen when the war came. Everything stopped. There was a blackout... As time went on, the churches would have dances to keep kids off the street."* Dancing was also important in the formation of social networks, as is revealed Laura's account of her first meeting with the man whom she later married: *"I met my husband in Glasgow. He was in electronics. The war came, and London was the only place with t.v. He came to Scotland, and repaired radios in homes. He used to do Aberdeen and Fife. We met at a dance. My sister's boyfriend introduced us."*

Dances were also important social events in terms of facilitating the formation of new social networks in Canada. Elizabeth and Timothy, an elderly couple interviewed in their home, told me about their first experiences in Canada: *"There wasn't a Scottish community then. We met people at the dances. A lot of Scottish people came to them. We made*

friends through the dances that were put on by the `BIC', and then by the Legion."

Margaret, a senior at the Y.W.C.A., recalls that dances were important meeting points for Scots: *"When we came to Hamilton, we went to all the RSCDS dances. People with Scottish background get together in clubs like the Tartan Club and the RSCDS."*

Don told me that dancing was also popular with `BIC' members: *"We have gatherings here. In May, we have a trip to the races. There's always a sellout for that. For twenty-six dollars, you get a free program, the races, a meal and a dance."*

Dances also attracted members of other ethnic groups. In Chapter Two, I provided the account of one woman who had met Italian men at the dances. Another woman at the Y.W.C.A. told me: *"At the `BIC', the dances used to be eighty per cent Portuguese."* Jimmy told me that the Tartan Club also holds dances on a regular monthly basis: *"I'm a member of the Tartan Club. I go to dances regularly."*

However, while several people mentioned dancing in the context of the legion network, one respondent noted that these events are not as common as they were at one time: *"There are still some Scottish functions, like dances. But there are not so many now. The Tartan Club still has them. But people are careful not to drink and drive now, so they stay home and drink."* Several people also mentioned

dancing at the Y.W.C.A. senior's center. Joe, a Hamilton steelworker, told me: *"I go to Opie's once a week. Other places to find Scots are the Tartan bar, the Y.W.C.A. dance classes, and the Scottish pubs."* Laura told me that Scots played an important role in the center's establishment: *"The foundation of the Y.W.C.A. seniors' center is Scottish. The founding member was Scottish. This was the first seniors' club in Hamilton. I credit the Y with foresight."* She also mentioned several forms of dancing done at the center: *"They started for three years upstairs. A lady taught square dancing. Now it's been eighteen years in existence. Then, we met once a week on Thursday, and dancing was on Friday ...The city hall pays for instructors and for certain classes. Other classes, like line dancing are paid for by ourselves."* In several interviews, Scots mentioned taking square dancing and line dancing lessons at the Y.W.C.A. Line dancing is also a favourite activity at the monthly Tartan Club meetings.

(ii)Formal Dance Societies

While the clubs and the Y.W.C.A. offer dancing instruction and social dances on an occasional or regular basis, several other societies and organizations in Hamilton specifically serve to promote different forms of Scottish dancing.

The Royal Scottish Country Dance Society and the White Cockade offer Lowland Country Dance dancing and instruction, while the Schiehallion Dancers are a Highland dance group.

The RSCDS was founded in 1923 by two ladies in Scotland, Mrs. Ysobel Stewart and Mrs. Jean Milligan, in order to preserve and promote country dances with origins dating as far back as the seventeenth century which were perceived to be in danger of being forgotten (Smith 1975:5). Today, the Society has branches, teachers' associations and affiliated groups around the world, has published a series of booklets illustrating dance steps and formations for teachers, and holds summer schools in several countries each year. The Hamilton Branch of the RSCDS is one of nineteen Canadian branches and one hundred and sixty-two international branches located in the United Kingdom, Australia, Austria, Canada, France, Japan, Kenya, The Netherlands, New Zealand, South Africa, Sweden and the United States. The society's headquarters are located in Edinburgh (RSCDS 1992: 11-19).

To illustrate the cosmopolitan nature of this `Scottish' society, several people told me that I could go almost anywhere in the world, don a kilt, and go dancing with fellow RSCDS dancers. On an international scale, these statements illustrate the voluntary nature of ethnic identification through the manipulation of ethnic symbolism, with no requirement for ethnic ancestry or lifestyle. This observation recalls both Gans' (1979) theory of `symbolic ethnicity' and Fischer's post-modernist approach to ethnicity (Marcus and Fischer 1986).

The Hamilton RSCDS branch was founded in 1951 with assistance from the Hamilton Y.W.C.A.. The branch's original members included several described as "long-time enthusiasts of Scottish culture" (Smith 1975:1). An Interim Committee was soon formed, and dancers were divided into `a more experienced group' and a `main group' (Smith 1975:2). In 1957, the branch had adult dance classes at four levels: basic, intermediate, advanced and demonstration. Children's classes were also started (Smith 1975:8). Dancers performed at the Embro Highland Games, and in 1954 the group's charter as the first Canadian Branch of the Royal Scottish Country Dance Society was received by the society's president and secretary. The branch has developed a regular program of monthly dances at the Y.W.C.A., and several members have been certified as teachers. Members of this group were observed

in performance at the Earthsong Festival, the Fergus Scottish Festival, and in two beginners dance classes in Hamilton.

The White Cockade is listed in the RSCDS Bulletin as an Affiliated Group, with its own president and secretary. The White Cockade also promotes Lowland country dancing, hosting dances at the Y.W.C.A. on the third Saturday of every month.

The Schiehallion Dancers were established in 1967 in order to `perpetuate Scottish heritage' through "bringing Highland dancing to the attention of many delighted audiences" (Schiehallion Dancers). The dancers, most of whom are young women, have served as `fine ambassadors' of town, province and country while performing in Canada, the United States, Great Britain and Europe, and at events including the Edinburgh Military Tattoo, the Last Tattoo in Berlin, the Festival of Flowers in the Channel Islands, and the opening and closing ceremonies of The Brier, the annual Canadian Curling Association national championships.

In my analysis of respondents' statements regarding dance, several common themes emerge. First, although both men and women often refer to dancing as a cultural activity drawing Scots together, dancing is more often associated with women than with men. This is illustrated in several ways. Statements by working-class respondents of both genders regarding various forms of dancing were often made in reference to the participation of female relatives or

friends. One regular at the `58' Scottish table told me: *"My daughter runs a dance company. She's got three studios in Burlington, Stoney Creek, and on the mountain."*

One man recalled that his mother had encouraged her children to take up dancing: *"My mom was a professional ballroom dancer. She tried to teach her children to dance, but we didn't want to ...There was a ballroom at Parkdale and Queenston where mom used to go...Old country people enjoy dancing."*

John's mother also promoted dancing in her family: *"Mom got us into country dancing."* Andy, an RSCDS dance instructor, told me that his daughters had carried on the tradition of Scottish dancing more than his son: *"Of our children, Elaine does Scottish dancing. Karen does some Highland dancing and some country dancing. She loves the bagpipes. Ian has danced."*

Both in Scotland and Canada, dancing also provided an avenue for women to associate with their husband's social network, as the weekly dance was one of the few regular occasions on which women would appear in the legions and clubs. Janis recalled: *"My parents went to the Tartan Club and Moose Lodge. Every Saturday night, there was a dance somewhere...Mom didn't go to the clubs besides going to the Saturday night dances, unless it was a special occasion. Otherwise, only men went there."*

Membership in the three formal Scottish dance societies in Hamilton is also predominantly female. Responses to a survey published in the Rant, the quarterly publication of the Royal Scottish Country Dance Society in Hamilton, came from twenty women and eleven men. While only three of these men indicated that they were of Scottish descent, twelve women claimed Scots ancestry and four of these reported Scotland as their place of birth.

While these results suggest a significant percentage of male members, personal observations at several dance classes and monthly dances held at the Y.W.C.A. support the indication of a greater percentage of female participants than male. At one of the monthly dances, I inquired about the noticeable absence of teen-age dancers. One adult dancer told me: *"Few teens come. Girls find it hard to find boys who are interested."* Teen girls did not show the same willingness to dance with other women as did adult women dancers. Tom, the coordinator of the White Cockade, identified similar trends in this dance society: *"There are a number of professionals. One lady is a school teacher...We have lots of widows that come. Lots of women go on their own. They're involved where their husbands aren't. Women dance with women. There's a wide range of people."*

Valerie, an RSCDS instructor, also identified a gender imbalance in both Highland and Country dancers: *"Boys don't dance...Highland dancing is done by men only, not by women.*

It's different for Scottish dancing. Females are interested in doing it, and more do it than men. With the Ukrainians, lots of boys dance. They've been here for one hundred years, and you still see Ukrainian culture. It's not the same with Scottish..."

Sandra, the director and choreographer of the Schiehallion Dancers, agreed with this observation: *"The group consists mostly of teen-agers, people who started dancing when they were five or six years old. They come here for dance lessons...Mostly girls dance, but a couple of boys come for special events."*

Valerie interpreted these differences as reflecting male dislike of the dance costume: *"Scottish men hated wearing a kilt. They think that you have to wear a kilt, and that threw them off. Wives say that their husbands won't come because they have to wear a kilt. People who aren't Scottish don't feel self-conscious in kilts. That helps. I went to France one year. We had a Frenchman in charge of our dance group. He was proud to wear a kilt. That helped."*

Another interpretation was provided by Anne, a student at one of the RSCDS classes. If her account is at all exemplary of other Scots, dancing may provide one of the few social venues for women outside of the house: *"I went to the RSCDS with my first husband. That was my night out."*

(iii)Comparison of Social Networks

Personal observations and interviews with Scots reveal several significant features distinguishing these organizations and societies from the legion and pub networks.

First, participants in the dance societies are often employed in different occupations than members of the legion and pub communities. While many of the men in those networks hold skilled manual labour jobs, responses to the Rant questionnaire suggest that participants in the dance societies more often hold white-collar jobs. Both men and women from the RSCDS listed occupations in the teaching and medical fields. Men also listed occupations including airline pilot and a technical oil advisor, while those listed by women include secretary, financial consultant, florist, Presbyterian minister, developmental disabilities worker, travel counsellor, banker, and library technician.

Andy interprets this relation between occupation and membership as reflecting educational levels of RSCDS participants: *"I don't tend to think about it as a class thing. The better-educated have white-collar jobs rather than blue-collar jobs...People who enjoy the RSCDS are generally white-collar workers."*

Tom mentioned a similar pattern in White Cockade membership: *"All of our members are also members of the RSCDS. Our membership takes in all groups. There are a*

number of professionals. One lady is a school teacher. I'm with life insurance." Sandra commented on the Schiehallion Dancers: *"There are about forty dancers, mostly of middle class backgrounds."*

The second difference between the dance societies and the legion and pub networks is found through analysis of ethnic display and the manipulation of ethnic symbolism. While I observed pictures of the Queen hanging on the walls of legions and the Y.W.C.A., there was little display of Scottish cultural symbolism. There are several exceptions to this point. On the wall of the `BIC' hangs a poem dedicated to the soldiers at Dunquerque, or in the poet's spelling `Dunkirk'. Several of the legions also host Robert Burns suppers on an annual or occasional basis. However, neither the architecture nor the usual decor of the legions suggests the ethnic identity of their members.

I have already described the decor of Hamilton's Scottish pubs, all three of which display Scottish symbolism in the form of signs bearing kilted pipers and thistles, posters and photos of Scottish pubs and soccer teams, photos of Glasgow, advertisements for Tattoos and Burns Scotch, and the sale of Scottish beer and ale. I have also noted differences between pubs and legion membership in terms of age and occupation.

Most people interviewed in the legions and pubs referred to attendance at Highland Games, Robbie Burns

suppers and kilts as symbols of Scottish cultural identity. However, most of these people only attend the Highland Games on an irregular basis, and most people participated only at the level of spectator.

In contrast, two of the dance societies [Schiehallion and RSCDS] include strong performance components in the form of demonstration groups. I observed RSCDS dancers performing at Earthsong and the Fergus Scottish Games. The Schiehallion dancers performs at public events including `An Evening in Scotland' and the Robert Burns Society's Burns Supper. Tom differentiated between the White Cockade and the RSCDS: "*We're a social dance group, not a teaching group...We're not a demonstration group.*" However, he also noted that the RSCDS and the White Cockade shared a common founder and overlapping membership.

These observations indicate differences between network membership, both in terms of occupation and the nature of participation. Working-class respondents tended to be occasional spectators at Scottish cultural events, whereas the Scottish performers at these events tend to hold white-collar jobs outside of their involvement with these societies and events. These patterns may reflect several factors, including the finances required in some cases for performance apparel and dance instruction, levels of pre-migration participation in formal aspects of Scottish culture, and the formation of personal social networks along lines of social

class in Hamilton, corresponding to class differences between participants in the formal events and societies.

The third difference between the dance societies and the legion and club network centres around the formality of dance. For several respondents, dancing was an activity in which anyone could participate without a strong commitment to maintaining a formal sense of Scottish culture. Helen, a member of the YWCA seniors' centre, told me: *"I never went to Robbie Burns suppers. I did country dancing at church and wore a kilt, but I don't consider myself that Scottish."* Another woman at this centre said:*"I have gone to various dances, but I don't get involved in clans or multicultural societies."*

However, dancing within the context of the Scottish dance societies and at public cultural events is often identified as being `formal', as Laura illustrates:

> *"The RSCDS does a certain type of dancing called country dancing. I feel that this has more `tone' to it. People come who want to dance, but not ballroom dancing...When you start children off to learn dances, you have to have a teacher who is recognized. They're vigorous in the teacher training. You have to do it a certain way, and you can't add or subtract from it...Children compete at different places. Children grow up to be adults, and they're still competing. You have to adhere strictly to a certain form of dancing. Cliques form; no matter how good a dancer you are, you have to be recognized by the society. It's very formal."*

One man interviewed at the `Lion's Head' identified formal Scottish cultural performance with an upper class population: *"The Lord Provost from Edinburgh came to Hamilton*

and visited Dundurn Castle. They put on a show with kilts, dance and pipes." When I asked about this sense of `formality', a man at the `Lion's Head' agreed that there are notable differences between Scottish social networks in Hamilton: *"There is a difference between the Burns Society, the RSCDS and the working class. People back home who had money to get their kids into dancing get together here and say `They have a society, why shouldn't we?'. Maybe they overdo it."*

Several RSCDS instructors and participants were aware of these perceptions, and attributed them to misconceptions on the part of the working-class. Tom said: *"The Tartan Club has dances every month. So does the White Cockade. We're definitely not upper crust."*

John also said that perceptions of the RSCDS as `snobbish' were mistaken: *"The RSCDS offers a good form of exercise and excellent discipline. I don't think it is snobbish, but the people in the pubs say it is."* Valerie identified this stereotype as a carry-over from life in Scotland:

> *"A lot of people look on the RSCDS as being snobbish. But it was the same way in Scotland, partly because of what the teachers made you do. The teacher says `point your toes'. People say `I didn't do that in Scotland'. It's the same thing with men wearing kilts. People see it as snobbish. Maybe the society appeals to a different group of people. It's hard to figure."*

Laura said that Country Dancing has become `formalized' in comparison with dancing in the Scottish past:

"People used to dance for joy, but now everybody who does is a professional."

John shared these perceptions, and provided some historical background to the development of Country Dance:

> *"Country dancing is an out-growth of the Lowlands. It used to be more of a coming together of people on the farms. The fiddlers struck up a tune, and people danced. Now it's been formalized into Scottish Country Dancing...Now everyone's in kilts. Then, people would dance in boots or whatever they had. Dancing during the last fifty years has been done in kilts. Kilts are more of a Highland costume."*

John also told me that the snobbish stereotype of the society is promoted by the RSCDS and non-dancers alike:

> *"The RSCDS is often characterized in a way that's not totally justified. After the First World War, dances were being lost. Miss Milligan and others saw their job as saving these dances. But it has become almost a class society on its own. People who do not do country dancing look on it as a snobbish society. This is fermented by headquarters. They get themselves in a perpetuating upper class thing, with the emphasis on `Royal'. Once you've got `Royal', you've got another class...This is not how Scottish country dancing was done. It used to be that people would get a fiddler in and dance. But other influences came from the schools and the dancing masters."*

Sandra also said that Highland Dancing has evolved from a more informal practice: *"Highland dancing is more formalized. Now you enter competitions and get a number. It's more organized."*

In this section, I have illustrated that, while Scots in Hamilton commonly emphasize the general importance of dance as a social activity, significant differences exist between the forms of dance held within legions and clubs, and

the more `formal' types of dance promoted by several Scottish cultural societies. An analysis of ethnic identification through the manipulation of the image of Robert Burns illustrates similar variation in terms of social class.

(iv)Robert Burns

Most male and female respondents of various occupations recognize the poet Robert Burns as an important image of Scottish culture, along with Highland Games and kilts. Several statements provided by Helen exemplify this point: "*There is a Scottish community here. I don't think that there's a Scottish club, but Mac*[4] *has a big Robbie Burns Day, with lots of pipe bands. Fergus and all the little towns outside of Hamilton have their Scottish Days.*"

Many respondents interviewed in the legions reported attendance at Burns suppers in these establishments. Ruby identified several churches which hosted these events: "*We've [R.H.L.I.] thought of having a Burns day, but there are so many around. There's one at my church, the East Mountain Presbyterian. There's also one at McNab Street Presbyterian.*"

For Ruby, Robert Burns carries personal sentimental value, as she is able to trace her ancestry to the poet's

---

4. `Mac' refers to McMaster University, located in Hamilton. Covering 296 acres in the city's west end, the university had an enrolment of approximately 21,000 students during the 1992-93 academic year (personal communication with Public Relations, McMaster University, March 18, 1994).

wife: *"My background goes back on my mother's side to Robert Burns' wife, Jean Armour."*

One man interviewed at his home on the `Mountain' showed me several books which he owned on Robert Burns and on Scotland. The manager's office at the butcher shop bore several pictures of Burns, and a plaque in the `Tartan Toorie' commemorated the poet. Jimmy said of his collection of Scottish curios: *"I've got a couple of bottles, figures of men in full Highland dress. I've got an original etching of Robert Burns, poet laureate. It's my prize possession."*

Scots also associate Robert Burns with formal education. Laura recalled studying Burns' poetry in earlier school years: *"I've never joined the Burns Society, but Burns was part of our school curriculum. I've got a beautiful book of Burns' poetry. I keep it because it's unusual."* One man at the `Lion's Head' had similar recollections: *"Burns? We had to learn it in school."*

However, while pub customers recognized the figure of Robert Burns, the manager of the `Lion's Head' wasn't convinced that they were well-acquainted with the poet's work: *"We had a Burns supper here. But people really don't know his poetry that well."* Several people associate Robert Burns suppers with the upper-middle class. Andy told me: *"Running a Burns supper says that you're one notch above. The middle-class participates in Scotland."* Laura also made this association: *"I went to a Burns supper with my daughter.*

The only reason I went was her principal was of the upper crust in Toronto. To keep her in the principal's good books, I had to buy myself a ticket."

In summary, while the poet Robert Burns is readily associated with Scottish culture by members of each of the three Scottish social networks, and while several of the legions and pubs host Robert Burns suppers on the occasional year, respondents generally associate the poet and his annual celebration with a higher level of social class than is regularly found in the legions and pubs.

Danny also noted variation in markers of `Scottishness' between people of different social classes:

> *"There is no Scottish community in Hamilton...There's the Burns Society, but that's not for the regular person. They're snobbish...The only time we really get something Scottish for the regular person is when someone like the comedian Billy Connelly comes along. The first time he came, the place was sold out. That was the most booze they've sold at Hamilton Place. The Burns Club is snobbish, but Billy Connelly is the working person's man."*

This observation is supported by several statements made by Fred, the Burns Society's current president, and Inid, a Society member. Fred told me that his society serves a social group which meets on a monthly basis for programs and discussions on aspects of Scottish culture:

> *"In our meetings we look at poetry, entertainment, singing, and artifacts that are Scottish or Scottish-related. We had a Scottish butcher come in, who showed us how to make clootie dumplings. You put coins inside of the dumplings, wrapped in paper. It's like a traditional birthday cake. We also had a debate on the merits of Scottish country dancing."*

Fred informed me that several years ago he had assumed charge of the society, taking over from a man whose leadership had contributed to the society's former undignified activities:

> *"There was one man in total control. He called a meeting for people of Scottish origin. Both of us had attended Burns Club functions before...The club had meetings prior to our joining, such as a whisky tasting promotion by one company...The minute books indicate meetings and entertainment...It was basically a social club for elderly people. It wouldn't have been long before the club would have passed from existence. The mean age of its members was in the seventies. At the time, there weren't the type of people here who would attract me. Business people and people downtown were concerned for the group."*

Inid views the image of the poet in the old Burns Club with disfavour: *"The club had little to do with Burns. It was a clique. The leader had knowledge of Burns, but the club dealt only with one type of person. It presented an insulting image of Burns."*

Under Fred's leadership, the Society seems to be undergoing a process of `formalization'. In my interview with Mae, she spoke of the transition between the old and new forms of this organization:

> *"Previous to the current regime, the Burns Society was barely kept alive. It was plugged into the multicultural council. People at that time counted Scots in multiculturalism. The Burns Society was an old people's social club. There wasn't sufficient interest, the club floundered, and there was a resultant power struggle."*

This `power struggle' resulted in the Burns' organization changing name and social status from a `club' to a `society'. In a telephone interview with the former

president of the Burns club, I was informed: *"The Bonnie Doon Burns Club was part of the Burns Clubs of Scotland. It was founded in 1932. We had real social nights then. People would come in and give talks."*

This process of formalization is also illustrated in Fred's statements regarding plans for future changes in membership criteria:

> *"We've found in our efforts to generate membership that it's difficult to maintain interest...In Vancouver and Calgary, the societies are exclusively male. The one in Vancouver has only thirty-seven members, one for each year of Burns' life. It's very exclusive...We talked about the future of the society at our last meeting. We decided to write a letter to several other clubs, talking about our division problems and suggesting a series of cooperative ventures. Amalgamation is not acceptable, but cooperation is workable. People are interested in the ball, but not enthused enough to come to meetings. One member says we should remain the way we are. Another member says we should appeal to a more elitist group. The Calgary group consists of professional people, entrepreneurs, a get-ahead type of people. Not followers, but leaders. At a Burns conference in Edinburgh, the membership consisted entirely of professional people. There were between three-hundred-and-sixty and four hundred people at that conference...We don't want to amalgamate with other groups that are Scottish in the area, but rather to rethink the basis for membership."*

Inid also favours these changes: *"Our image would change if we amalgamated with the Tartan Club. Rather, we need to appeal to a higher strata of society for membership, in the spirit of Burns. We need to look at the membership of other clubs."*

In 1993, the society hosted their annual Burns Supper at the Royal Connaught Hotel in Hamilton. The price of

admission for this event was forty dollars for a ticket, relatively costly in comparison with the twenty-five dollar tickets for Burns Suppers at several local legions and churches. The event included performances by the Schiehallion Dancers, and a `coming out' ceremony for two young girls. Danny referred to this ceremony as exemplifying social class distinctions: *"The Burns Club has gotten away from what it used to be. Now it's a coming out party for young girls of Scottish descent. It's not for regular people."* For Laura, this ceremony constituted an unauthentic representation of Scottish tradition, derived from the English upper class:

> *"Burns suppers are nice evenings, but I'm surprised at how many women wear kilts. I would never wear a kilt. To me, that's not right...`Coming out' was English. People of the court did that, the kings and the queens. At a certain age, boys were selected by the king for valets. The queen selected maids. That belongs to the upper echelon. A sort of snobbery goes with it."*

(v): The Formal Scottish Community

Scots in Hamilton consider the dance societies and the Burns Society to be related in several ways. First, they were identified by respondents as sharing `snobbish' or upper-class membership. Second, both dancing and the social activities of the Burns Society were identified as becoming or having become formalized within these societies. Third, social interaction occurs between these societies. As an example of this point, I refer to performances by the

Schiehallion Dancers at the Burns Society's 1993 Robbie Burns Supper. Several people are also members of more than one of these societies, as my interview with Andy revealed: "*Yes, there is a Scottish community. I meet many people through dancing in the Society. I also meet people from the Burns Society that I wouldn't otherwise rub shoulders with.*"

Sandra also noted: "*The parents of Schiehallion Dancers are often associated with the Burns social and Tartan clubs...Schiehallion Dancers are often quite comfortable in both the Tartan Club and the Burns Society.*"

E.Opie's Meats and the Tartan Club

While these three networks vary in the social class of their respective membership, interviews with Scots identified the Tartan Club and Opie's Meats as common focal points attracting Scots of different social class levels.

The Tartan Club is a social club which holds dances once a month at the Veteran's Service League. While the membership of the Tartan Club is predominantly working-class, this club was identified as a meeting place for Scots along with the Burns Society and the RSCDS by members of different occupational levels. The Schiehallion Dancers also performed at the Tartan Club. I met several family members of a prominent Hamilton politician at one of the club's dances.

The clients of Opie's Meats also came from a variety of occupational and class levels. This establishment was mentioned by respondents in interviews with RSCDS

instructors, Burns Society members, and participants in the pub and legion networks. Danny told me about the wide range of customers which Opie's attracts: *"I lead a good, simple life. I socialize with regular guys. The Burns Society orders its haggis from me. It's always been that way, and I can visit with those people too."*

Several factors may account for this phenomenon. The Tartan Club is the only social club in Hamilton promoting itself as Scottish, and Opie's is the only Scottish butcher in Hamilton. Furthermore, Opie's is apparently the only place in the city which sells the haggis, a central key feature at Burns suppers.

F.Interpretations

I have illustrated the existence of class-based differences between Scottish social networks in Hamilton, expressed through variation in the manipulation and display of ethnic symbolism. Scots who hold blue-collar jobs and attend the legion and pub networks recognize Scottish dance, Robert Burns and the Highland Games as symbols of Scottish culture. However, participants and instructors in Scottish organizations and societies, and performers at cultural events often hold white-collar jobs.

Although consideration of these differences warrants a more extensive research program than this thesis will allow, I will briefly outline one possible interpretation for these

differences, as suggested by several Scots in fieldwork interviews.

(i) Social Mobility and Ethnic Expression

As I have indicated in the introduction to this chapter, most studies of class and ethnicity focus on the comparative analysis of differences between ethnic groups in terms of socioeconomic status and social mobility. Gordon's (1964) theory of `ethclass' proves an exception to this rule, integrating the analysis of class and ethnicity within the context of a single ethnic group.

In her study of Greek Orthodox, Italian Catholic, and Swedish Lutheran residents of a Midwestern American town, Dobratz (1988) explores relationships between the ethclass tendency and social mobility amongst her research population. In her conclusions, the author writes that "upwardly mobile persons are not less likely than non-mobiles to associate with others of the same class, religion and national origins" (Dobratz 1988:251).

Interview statements made by Scots in Hamilton suggest similar conclusions, most specifically that the salience of ethnic identity and association with a perceived ethnic collectivity does not decrease with social mobility. Rather, according to several respondents the expression of ethnic identity appears to vary in relation to perceived societal expectations for members of different social classes.

(ii)Motivation for Emigration

Among Scots interviewed for this thesis, many people provided similar responses to questions regarding their motivation to emigrate. Ernie told me: *"I came to try and better myself. I wanted to own my own home, have no debts, and retire at 60. It's tougher to do in Scotland. Unemployment was much higher there."* Jean, a woman interviewed at the Y.W.C.A., put it this way: *"We came over in 1952 to give our daughter a better life. In Scotland we had to use ration cards for food and clothes. We came to give our girls a better chance."*

Whether the benefits of migration were intended for self or family, post-war migration of Scots to Canada were often based on the desire for better lifestyles and occupation.

Several respondents associated leadership and participation in Scottish ethnic societies and organizations with an unusually strong drive for social mobility, exemplified in my interview with Danny: *"The gap is made by people who have gotten further ahead here. You can always go up to people, but they will never drop down."* The manager of the `Lion's Head' associated the drive for social mobility with new opportunities encountered in Canada:

> *"One of the better things about Scots is that they're content not knowing what they can't have. They're probably a lot more aware of class differences over here. There, you work and go to the pubs. But they're happy. They don't crave a*

fancy home. But once you get a taste of it...Scotland's a great place to live if you're rich, but if you're not, it's a struggle."

John also identified the critical motivation for mobility between these social class levels as a certain form of disillusionment with personal social or economic limitations: *"Rebellion comes from the person who has seen that there's something better... Scots as a whole look for bettering themselves."*

Fred agreed with this theory, identifying leaders and participants in formal Scottish events and societies as social achievers: *"There is a relationship between Scottishness and class. It's not necessarily that people in the societies come from the upper stratum, but rather that they're `get ahead' type of people. People like that, who have achieved."*

Fred perceives that people in these societies often come from low-status socioeconomic backgrounds: "*People often come from very poor backgrounds. They have no money. It took a lot of money to come here. People took jobs as bus conductors. They had little educational background."*

He told me that his disillusionment with the British class system, combined with the social and economic opportunities offered through his experience with the armed forces, provided motivation for him to continue his formal education and to assume leadership positions including those

of university professor and president of the Robert Burns Society:

> *"One of my reasons for leaving Britain was the class thing. I was very cynical about the class system in Britain. It works on old school ties, where one meets appropriate people. You get jobs by who you know and where you went to school...Without education, you couldn't break into the upper stratum. In the Air Force, the upper stratum was available with the right qualifications."*

(iii)Class and Societal Expectations

Interviews with Andy and John increased my awareness as to several factors which serve as possible explanations for the relationship between social mobility and variation in the expression of ethnic identity amongst Scots in Hamilton.

Andy perceived certain societal expectations as applying to Scots with higher education levels: *"It's part of the education system, or else part of social custom. Reasonably well-educated people in Scotland are expected to take initiative to do things and lead.".*

John agreed with this interpretation, drawing from experiences with his own family:

> *"In almost any society, you can find people willing to do the organizing, and those willing to follow. I think that it may well be the fact that all four of my brothers were involved in organizing and leading things because people of status were expected to do so. Also, you see your mom and dad doing certain things, and you follow in their footsteps."*

He also identified factors of economic status, education and the availability of personal leisure time as

contributing to the development of leadership skills and initiative in cultural events and societies:

> *"Participants in the Highland Games need a certain amount of money for costumes and instruction. Successful teachers are the ones who get classes going on their own...People like my mom and dad, with social status, have free time. Education also plays a part, giving you time and leisure and open horizons. You see that there are all types of things to do, and you investigate."*

John perceives people who attend the legions and pubs to be more strictly limited in terms of these factors than members of formal cultural societies such as the RSCDS. Emphasizing the correlations between cultural expectations for members of different social classes and societal leadership, he continued:

> *"When you work in the steel mill and you get off your shift, you're bodily tired. Cultural expectations and opportunities play into this too. If you start doing something, people say "Who does he think he is?..A lack of education closes doors. If you don't have much education, the football match is all you know, and you're accustomed to drinking with your buddies every night."*

Although further analysis is required for a greater understanding of variation in ethnic identity and display between individuals of different social class levels, these statements suggest several possible factors which may contribute to these differences.

(G)Summary

In this chapter, I provided further evidence which illustrates that Scots do not constitute a homogeneous collectivity in Canada. Instead, interviews with Scottish immigrants in Hamilton reveal the existence of at least three

Scottish social networks, the membership of which varies in terms of gender, occupation and social class.

While membership in the legion and club network is predominantly male, women are observed more frequently in pub settings and constitute a significant proportion of participants in formal societies and organizations promoting Scottish culture.

While several respondents deny the existence of class differences within Canadian society, Scots in the legions tended to perceive societies such as the RSCDS and the Robert Burns Society as `snobbish', promoting `formalized' variations of Scottish cultural symbolism and activity.

Scottish men in the legions and clubs often are employed in Hamilton's steelmills and factories. The pub clientele is mixed in terms of occupation, ranging from factory workers to several doctors and lawyers. Members of the formal ethnic societies and organizations hold white-collar jobs including university professor and technical oil consultant.

The Tartan Club and Opie's Meats appear as two focal points serving a cross-class population of Scots in Hamilton.

These networks also vary in the display of ethnic symbolism. Legion clubrooms are not readily identifiable in terms of Scottish symbolism, although they do occasionally host Robert Burns Suppers. Legion members also attend Robert Burns Suppers and Highland Games, but on an irregular basis.

Pubs are readily identifiable as `Scottish', although the promotion of ethnic symbolism is confined to pub premises. The formal dance and Robert Burns societies include strong components of public display and performance, and are readily identifiable in terms of ethnic symbolism. Members of these societies were observed in performance at several cultural festivals in the Hamilton region.

In summary, fieldwork interviews and personal observations
indicate that the expression of ethnic identity varies in correlation to factors of class and social mobility. Participation in social networks implies certain behavioral norms which are manifested in variations of the display and manipulation of ethnic symbolism particular to different forms of ethclass. Mobility between social classes does not result in a decreased salience of Scottish ethnic identity. However, in combination with perceived societal expectations for members of different social classes, social mobility serves as one possible explanation for variation between members of different Scottish social networks in terms of the nature and level of participation in Scottish cultural events and societies.

Chapter 7: Conclusions

Throughout this thesis, I have emphasized emic definitions of ethnic identity. Although subjective models are not new to the field of ethnic studies, primordialist approaches often fail to emphasize the context of identity formation and display, while mobilizationist studies often reduce ethnic identity to a phenomenon serving only political purposes. I have pursued an alternative route through the examination of individual perceptions of the ethnic self and other as revealed in interview statements provided by Scots in Hamilton, locating the formation of ethnic identity within specific historical, social, economic and political frameworks. While few studies have taken this approach to ethnic identity, I propose that it is a valuable model in terms of its relevance to the dynamic nature of interpersonal, inter-ethnic relations.

In particular, the formation and modification of ethnic identity for Scottish respondents in Hamilton has occurred within the contexts of post-war changes in Canada's national immigration policy and the subsequent development and implementation of a national policy of multiculturalism.

Ethnic identity is thus processual, formed and modified in correspondence with individual migration experiences and processes. Scots who immigrate to Canada increasingly identify themselves with a perceived Scottish

collectivity in Canada, emphasizing out-group differences and de-emphasizing in-group differences of regional and local origin, accent and religion, which are perceived to exist for Scots in Scotland.

The Scottish ethnic community in Hamilton is also dynamic, constantly changing in terms of participation and location within public establishments. However, respondents' definitions of community fail to correspond to models of the `ethnic community' in Canadian ethnic literature. Due in part to differences in methodology, approaches such as Breton's (1965), which rely on objective criteria including census records and numbers of `ethnic' establishments within an urban area do not necessarily reflect emic perceptions of `community' as presented in this thesis. Hamilton lacks any identifiable Scottish residential area or institutionally complete business section. Instead, the Scottish ethnic community is unbounded, existing in the form of social networks existing within legions, pubs, and formal cultural societies. Membership and participation in these social networks, and the appropriation and manipulation of ethnic symbolism within these networks, varies in relation to other aspects of personal identity, including social class and gender.

For example, working-class Scots tend to attend Highland Festivals and Robert Burns Suppers on an occasional basis as spectators. However, performers in Scottish cultural

societies and organizations, and at public events, tend to be primarily from the upper-middle class.

One interpretation for these differences, as provided by respondents, centers around issues of social mobility and societal class expectations in terms of social behaviour. This indicates the usefulness of `ethclass' models, but also illustrates that ethnic identity does not necessarily decrease in importance to the individual with `upward' mobility, but rather changes in the nature of its expression.

Furthermore, Scots in Hamilton consider the expression of ethnic identity to be most appropriate within `private' contexts. However, this definition of `privacy' privileges display in formal, public contexts, whereas the display of ethnic markers outside of these contexts is viewed with disfavour by respondents.

Depicting Scots as readily assimilable to Canadian lifestyles, respondents identify members of these immigrant groups which continue to display cultural differences as `ethnic'. The daily display of ethnic identity, as exemplified in the East Indian turban, is perceived as introducing unwelcome change to Canadian society.

I have also illustrated that the expression and display of ethnic identity for Scots in Hamilton often constitutes a matter of personal choice. While visible and audible symbolism may serve as markers of ethnicity, ethnic identity is not dependent upon such objective criteria.

Individuals in Hamilton may choose to identify themselves as Scottish with or without the performance or display of such ethnic symbolism.

Scots are able to draw from a range of symbols in the expression of ethnic identity, including behavioural traits perceived to be characteristic of Scots in Canada such as financial self-sufficiency and assimilation to Canadian society, and visible and audible ethnic symbols including accent, dress, food, music, dance, and the character of Robert Burns. Individuals are able to appropriate and manipulate any one or several of these symbols in the construction of ethnic identity.

The expression of ethnic identity is thus a voluntary phenomenon for Scots in Hamilton, and does not require any identifiable Scottish ancestry or daily commitment to a `Scottish' lifestyle on the part of the individual. In this report, my findings are reminiscent of Gans' (1969) theory of `symbolic ethnicity'. However, where Gans focused primarily on third-generation immigrants, I have demonstrated the applicability of his model to first-generation Scottish immigrants. Furthermore, while middle- or upper-class Scots participate in this form of ethnicity through weekly or monthly meetings with other Scots in cultural societies, for working-class Scots in Hamilton, being `Scottish' often means assuming a regular daily seat around the legion's Scottish table. On a larger scale, it is possible to suggest that

`white' ethnic groups in Canada, such as the Scots, participate in symbolic forms of ethnicity to a greater extent than immigrant populations bearing more distinct physical or linguistic variation. However, further study is required for elaboration on this point.

Finally, I have illustrated the blurring of ethnic boundaries within Canadian society. Scots and non-Scots alike may participate in Scottish cultural societies and organizations, don Scottish apparel such as the kilt, and perform Scottish dances and musical numbers within cultural societies and organizations, as well as at public cultural and multicultural events. This blurring of cultural boundaries is exemplified by the participation of blacks at Fergus, and the cosmopolitan organization of the RSCDS.

Fischer (1986) writes of this participation by outsiders in the culture of another ethnic group as representing a search to "fill gaps in one's own past and tradition through...using a proxy for explorations of one's own past" (Marcus and Fischer 1986:175). Ethnicity itself thus becomes a cosmopolitan phenomenon in a blurring of cultural boundaries. In a nation divided by geographical, political and cultural differences, ethnicity provides a means of identification with a group perceived to possess a common ancestry, history and culture. However, it is beyond the scope of the present thesis to explain fully the

popularity of ethnic culture amongst a larger generic population.

In light of the importance of ethnic identity for Scots in Hamilton, I propose a re-examination of the categorization of `mainstream' and `ethnic' immigrant populations. This organization of differences in ethnic markers including physical and linguistic traits implies that social categories such as `British' constitute homogeneous collectivities against which other immigrant populations may be compared by degrees of assimilation and acculturation. However, I have illustrated that Scots in Hamilton identify themselves as distinct from a larger British population through the creation of ethnic territory within the city's legions and clubs, the establishment and frequenting of Scottish pubs, and through ethnic performance in the contexts of public events and formal societies.

I propose that further study is necessary on the unbounded nature of ethnic communities within Canada. If there ever was a time when sharp boundaries existed between immigrant populations and the rest of Canadian society, that time is long past. The model of the ethnic community presented by Scots in Hamilton reflects the dynamic nature of social relations which cross and transcend our categories of social organization.

I also propose that further analysis be conducted on gender-related variations in ethnic identification. While

Gordon's model is helpful in illuminating class-related differences in ethnic identity and its expression, few studies have been conducted on differences in the experience of ethnicity between men and women, or among women.

In conclusion, I again stress the importance of examining ethnic identity as a processual phenomenon amongst white ethnic groups such as the Scots in Hamilton, voluntarily expressed by individuals in many variations, and reflecting the dynamic nature of interpersonal relationships amongst the populations which studies of ethnicity purport to describe.

Bibliography

Arensberg, Conrad M.
1957 Discussion of R. A. Manners "Methods of Community Analysis," in Vera Rubin (ed.) Caribbean Studies: A Symposium. Institute of Social and Economic Research, Jamaica. p.44f.

Balakrishnan, T.R.
1982 Changing Patterns of Ethnic Residential Segregation in the Metropolitan areas of Canada. Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology 19(1):92-110.

Baltzell, E. Digby
1964 The Protestant Establishment: Aristocracy and Caste in America. New York: Random House.

Barth, Fredrik
1969 Ethnic Groups and Boundaries:The Social Organization of Culture Difference. Boston: Little, Brown and Company.

Bell, D.
1975 Ethnicity and Social Change. In N. Glazer and D. Moynihan (eds.), Ethnicity: Theory and Experience. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Ben-Rafal, Eliezer and Stephen Sharot
1987 Ethnic Pluralism and Religious Congregations: A Comparison of Neighbourhoods in Israel. Ethnic Groups 7:65-83.

Bernard, H. Russell
1988 Research Methods in Cultural Anthropology. Newbury Park: Sage Publications.

Berry, John
1977 Multiculturalism and Ethnic Attitudes in Canada. Ottawa: Information Canada.

Berthoff, Rowland
1983 Under the Kilt: Variations on the Scottish-American Ground. Journal of American Ethnic History, Spring 1982:1-40.

Boissevain, Jeremy and J. Clyde Mithell
1973 Network Analysis: Studies in Human Interaction. The Hague: Mouton.

Brander, Michael
1982 The Emigrant Scots. London: Constable.

Breton, Raymond
1965 Institutional Completeness of Ethnic Communities and the Personal Relations of Immigrants. American Journal of Sociology 70:193-205.

Breton, Raymond, Jean Burnet, Norbert Hartmann, Wsevolod Isajiw and Jos Lennards
1975 Research Issues on Canadian Cultures and Ethnic Groups: An Analysis of a Conference. Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology 12(1):81-94.

Breton, Raymond, Wsevolod W. Isajiw, Warren E. Kalbach, and Jeffrey G. Reitz
1990 Ethnic Identity and Equality: Varieties of Experience in a Canadian City. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Brettell, Caroline B.
1981 Is the Ethnic Community Inevitable? A Comparison of the Settlement Patterns of Portuguese Immigrants in Toronto and Paris. The Journal of Ethnic Studies 9(3):1-17.

Bruce, Jean
1982 After the War. Don Mills, Ontario: Fitzhenry and Whiteside.

Buchignani, Norman
1977 A Review of the Historical and Sociological Literature on East Indians in Canada. Canadian Ethnic Studies 9(1):86-108.

1979 South Asian Canadians and the Ethnic Mosaic: An Overview. Canadian Ethnic Studies 11(1):48-68.

1980 Culture or Identity: Addressing Ethnicity in Canadian Education. McGill Journal of Education 15(1):79-93.

1981 The Social and Self Identities of Fijian Indians in Vancouver. Urban Anthropology 9(1):75-98.

1982 Canadian Ethnic Research and Multiculturalism. Journal of Canadian Studies 17(1):16-34.

Bumsted, J.M.
1980 The Scot and Canada. Review of Jean M. MacLennan: From Shore to Shore, J. Clinton Morrison Jr.: Robert W. Morrison Senior, G. Murray Logan: Scottish Highlanders and the American Revolution, Royce MacGillivary and Eunan Ross: History of Glengarry, William Dawson Le Sueur: William Lyon Mackenzie, A.E.D. Mackenzie: Baldoon, Jean Murray Cole: Exile in the Wilderness, David R. Williams: The Move for a New Country, James Hunter: The Making of the Crofting Community. Bulletin of Canadian Studies 4(2), Oct. 1980:89-99.

1982 The Scots in Canada. Ottawa: Canadian Historical Association.

Burnet, Jean
1979 Myths and Multiculturalism. Canadian Journal of Education 4(4):43-58.

1987 Multiculturalism in Canada. In Leo Driedger (ed.), Ethnic Canada: Identities and Inequalities. Toronto: Copp Clark Pitman Ltd.

Burnet, Jean R. and Howard Palmer
1988 "Coming Canadians": An Introduction to a History of Canada's Peoples. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart.

Cassin, A. Marguerite and Griffith, Alison I.
1981 Class and Ethnicity: Producing the Difference that Counts. Canadian Ethnic Studies 13(1):109-129.

Chapman, Joe
1985 `It's Legion's Diamond Jubilee'. Hamilton Spectator, September 18, 1985:D16.

Clifford, James and George E. Marcus, eds.
1986 Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Cohen, Anthony P.
1978 `The Same-But Different': The Allocation of Identity in Whalsay, Shetland. Sociological Review 26(3):449-469.

1982 Belonging: the Experience of Culture. In Anthony P. Cohen (ed.), Belonging:Identity and Social Organisation in British Rural Cultures. St. John's: Institute of Social and Economic Research, Memorial University of Newfoundland.

Cowan, Ted
1992 The MacRoots Phenomenon or, the Myth of Scottish America. Now and Then, Summer 1992:24-25.

Credland, Geoffrey D. and George T. Murray
1969 Scotland: A New Look. London: Scottish Television Limited.

Darroch, G. and N.G. Marsten
1971 The Social Class Basis of Ethnic Residential Segregation: the Canadian Case. American Journal of Sociology 77:491-510.

Davis, Nanciellen
1985 Ethnicity and Ethnic Group Persistence in an Acadian Village in Maritime Canada. New York: AMS Press.

Department of Citizenship and Immigration
1954-1966 Immigration Statistics.

Department of Manpower and Immigration
1946-1966 Immigration Statistics.

Devine, T.M.
1992 Scottish Emigration and Scottish Society. Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers Ltd.

di Leonardo, Micaela
1984 The Varieties of Ethnic Experience: Kinship, Class, and Gender among California Italian-Americans. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Dillingham, Gerald L.
1981 The Emerging Black Middle Class: Class Conscious or Race Conscious. Ethnic and Racial Studies 4:432-451.

Dobratz, Betty A.
1988 Socioeconomic mobility and ethclass in primary group relations. Ethnic Groups 7:227-257.

Dofny, Jacques and Marcel Rioux
1964 Social Class in French Canada. In M. Rioux and Y. Martin (eds.), French-Canadian Society, Volume 1. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart.

Donaldson, Gordon
1966 The Scots Overseas. London: Robert Hale.

Driedger, Leo
1978 The Canadian Ethnic Mosaic:A Quest for Identity. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart.

1989 The Ethnic Factor: Identity in Diversity. Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson Limited.

Driedger, Leo, ed.
1987 Ethnic Canada: Identities and Inequalities. Toronto: Copp Clark Pitman Ltd.

Driedger, Leo and Glenn Church
1974 Residential Segregation and Institutional Completeness: A Comparison of Ethnic Minorities. Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology 11(1):30-52.

Durkheim, Emile
1947 (1893) The Division of Labor in Society. Translated by George Simpson. Glencoe, Ill.: Free Press.

Edwards, John and Lori Doucette
1987 Ethnic Salience, Identity and Symbolic Ethnicity. Canadian Ethnic Studies 19(1):52-62.

Elliott, Jean Leonard and Augie Fleras
1990 Immigration and the Canadian Ethnic Mosaic. In Peter S. Li (ed.), Race and Ethnic Relations in Canada. Toronto: Oxford University Press.

Epp, Timothy D.
1993 Thesis Question Form. The Hamilton Rant 23(4), August 1993.

Esman, M.
1977 Scottish Nationalism, North Sea Oil, and the British Response. In M. Esman (ed.), Ethnic Conflict in the Western World. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Feldman, Allen
1991 Formations of Violence: The Narrative of Body and Political Terror in Northern Ireland. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Fergus Scottish Festival
1992 [Festival Booklet]

1993 [Festival Booklet]

Fischer, Michael M. J.
1986 Ethnicity and the Post-Modern Arts of Memory. In James Clifford and George E. Marcus (eds.), Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography. Berkeley: University of California Press.p.194-233.

Gans, Herbert
1979 Symbolic Ethnicity: The Future of Ethnic Groups and Cultures. Racial and Ethnic Studies 2:1-20.

Geertz, C., ed.
1963 Old Societies and New States. New York: Free Press.

Glazer, N. and P. Moynihan, eds.
1975 Ethnicity: Theory and Experience. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Gmelch, George
1980 Return Migration. Annual Review of Anthropology 9:135-159.

Goldstein, Jay
1988 The Influence of Ethnicity, Occupation, and Nativity on Social Standing: Some Western Canadian Data. Canadian Ethnic Studies 20(1):66-77.

Gordon, Milton
1964 Assimilation in American Life: The Role of Race, Religion and National Origins. New York: Oxford University Press.

Goyder, John C.
1983 Ethnicity and Class Identity: The Case of French- and English-Speaking Canadians. Ethnic and Racial Studies 6(1):72-89.

Greenhill, Pauline
1992 English Immigrants' Narratives of Linguistic and Cultural Confusion: Examples of Ethnic Expression from Ontario. Ethnic and Racial Studies 15(2):236-265.

Guest, A.M. and J.A. Weed
1976 Ethnic Residential Segregation: Patterns of Change. American Journal of Sociology 81:1088-1111.

Hamilton Spectator
1952 `Presents Charter Showing Change in Veteran Body'. Hamilton Spectator, April 4, 1952:4.

1953 `Viscount Montgomery Leads Veterans' Parade'. Hamilton Spectator, August 31, 1953:2.

1967 `The Proud People of Corktown'. Hamilton Spectator, June 27, 1967:26a.

Handler, Richard
1983 In Search of the Folk Society: Nationalism and Folklore Studies in Quebec. Culture 3(1):103-114.

1988 Nationalism and the Politics of Culture in Quebec. Madison.

Hanley, Robert J.
1958 `Parish Socials, Wakes and Weddings: `Corktown' Fading into History'. Hamilton Spectator, May 24, 1958:39.

Hawkins, Freda
1991 Critical Years in Immigration: Canada and Australia Compared. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Herberg, Edward N.
1989 Ethnic Groups in Canada: Adaptations and Transitions. Scarborough: Nelson Canada.

Hollingsworth, T.H.
1970 Migration: A Study Based on Scottish Experience between 1939 and 1964. Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd.

Hume, John R.
1990 Scotland's Industrial Past. Edinburgh: National Museums of Scotland.

Indra, Doreen
1981 The Invisible Mosaic: Women, Ethnicity and the Vancouver Press, 1905-1976. Canadian Ethnic Studies 13(1):63-74.

Isaacs, H.
1975 Idols of the Tribe. New York: Harper & Row.

Isajiw, Wsevolod
1974 Definitions of Ethnicity. Ethnicity 1:111-124.

Jones, Huw
1979 Modern Emigration from Scotland to Canada. Scottish Geographical Magazine 95(1):4-12.

Kalbach, W.E.
1987 Growth and Distribution of Canada's Ethnic Populations, 1871-1981. In Leo Driedger (ed.), Ethnic Canada: Identities and Inequalities. Toronto: Copp Clark Pitman.

1990 A Demographic Overview of Racial and Ethnic Groups in Canada. In Peter S. Li (ed.), Race and Ethnic Relations in Canada, Toronto: Oxford University Press.

Kallen, Evelyn
1982 Multiculturalism: Ideology, Policy and Reality. Journal of Canadian Studies 17(1):51-63.

Keen, F.J.
1967 `Forty Years of Progress for Hamilton Legion'. Hamilton Spectator, September 13, 1967:44.

Kelner, Merrijoy and Kallen, Evelyn
1974 The Multicultural Policy: Canada's Response to Ethnic Diversity. Journal of Comparative Sociology 22:21-4.

King, William Lyon Mackenzie
1947 House of Commons Debates, May 1, 1947. In Howard Palmer (ed.), Immigration and the rise of Multiculturalism. Vancouver: Copp Clark Publishing.

Lalonde, Richard N., Donald M. Taylor and Fathali M. Mogahddam
1992 The Process of Social Identification for Visible Immigrant Women in a Multicultural Context. Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology 23(1):25-39.

Lambert, Ronald D. and James E. Curtis
1983 Opposition to Multiculturalism Among Quebecois and English-Canadians. Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology 20(2):193-207.

Lautard, E. Hugh and Loree, Donald J.
1984 Ethnic Stratification in Canada, 1931-1971. Canadian Journal of Sociology 9(3):333-344.

Lees, Janet
1987 `Corktown Residents want more of a say in just how their Community is Developed'. Hamilton Spectator, July 7, 1987:C1.

Li, Peter S., ed.
1990 Race and Ethnic Relations in Canada. Toronto: Oxford University Press.

Lupul, Manoly R.
1982a The Tragedy of Canada's White Ethnics: A Constitutional Post-Mortem. Journal of Ukrainian Studies 7:3-15.

1982b The Political Implementation of Multiculturalism. Journal of Canadian Studies 17(1):93-102.

1983 Multiculturalism and Canada's White Ethnics. Canadian Ethnic Studies 15(1):99-107.

1984 Visible Symbols: Cultural Expression Among Canada's Ukrainians. Edmonton: Canadian Institute of Ukrainian Studies.

Macdonald, Norman
1988 Putting on the Kilt: The Scottish Stereotype and Ethnic Community Survival in Cape Breton. Canadian Ethnic Studies 20(3):132-146.

Mahmood, Cynthia K. and Armstrong, Sharon L.
1992 Do Ethnic Groups Exist?: A Cognitive Perspective on the Concept of Cultures. Ethnology 31(1):1-14.

Marcus, George E. and Michael M. J. Fischer
1986 Anthropology as Cultural Critique: An Experimental Moment in the Human Sciences. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Marger, Martin
1978 A Reexamination of Gordon's Ethclass. Sociological Focus 11:21-32.

Marger, Martin N. and Phillip J. Obermiller
1983 Urban Appalachians and Canadian Maritime Migrants: A Comparative Study of Emergent Ethnicity. International Journal of Comparative Sociology 24(3-4):229-243.

1987 Emergent Ethnicity among Internal Migrants: The case of Maritimers in Toronto. Ethnic Groups 7:1-17.

McKay, James
1980 Entity vs. Process Approaches to Ethnic Relations and Ethnic Identity: A Case Study of Ethnic Soccer Clubs in Toronto's Italian Community. Canadian Ethnic Studies 12(3):56-80.

1982 An Exploratory Synthesis of Primordial and Mobilizationist Approaches to Ethnic Phenomena. Ethnic and Racial Studies 5(4):395-420.

McKay, Ian
1992 Tartanism Triumphant: The Construction of Scottishness in Nova Scotia, 1933-1954. Acadiensis 21(2):5-47.

McKay, J. and F. Lewins
1978 Ethnicity and the Ethnic Group: A Conceptual Analysis and Reformulation. Ethnic and Racial Studies 1:412-427.

Migliore, Sam
1988 Religious Symbols and Cultural Identity: A Sicilian-Canadian Example. Canadian Ethnic Studies 20(1):78-94.

Moghaddam, F.M. and D. M. Taylor
1987 The Meaning of Multiculturalism for Visible Minority Immigrant Women. Canadian Journal of Behavioural Science 19:121-136.

Molohon, Kathryn T., Richard Paton and Michael Lambert
1979 An Extension of Barth's Concept of Ethnic Boundaries to Include Both Other Groups and Developmental Stage of Ethnic Groups. Human Relations 32(1):1-17.

Moorhouse, H. F.
1984 Professional Football and Working Class Culture: English Theories and Scottish Evidence. Sociological Review 32:285-315.

1986 It's Goals That Count? Football Finance and Football Subcultures. Sociology of Sport Journal 3(3):245-260.

Murray, Stephen O.
1979 The Institutional Elaboration of a Quasi-Ethnic Community. International Review of Modern Sociology 9(2):165-177.

Nelli, Humbert S.
1980 Italians. In Stephan Thernstrom (ed.), Harvard Encyclopedia of Ethnic Groups. Cambridge: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.

Ng, Roxana
1981 Constituting Ethnic Phenomenon: An Account from the Perspective of Immigrant Women. Canadian Ethnic Studies 13(1):97-108.

1982 Immigrant Housewives in Canada. Atlantis 8(1):111-7.

1984 Sex, Ethnicity or Class? Some Methodological Considerations. Studies in Sexual Politics 1:14-45.

1986 The Social Construction of `Immigrant Women' in Canada. In Roberta Hamilton and Michelle Barrett (eds.), The Politics of Diversity: Feminism, Marxism and Nationalism. Montreal: The Book Centre Inc.

Ogmundson, R.
1990 Perspectives on the Class and Ethnic Origins of Canadian Elites: A Methodological Critique of the Porter/Clement/Olson Tradition. Canadian Journal of Sociology 15 (2):165-177.

Ogmundson, R. and J. McLaughlin
1992 Trends in the Ethnic Origins of Canadian Elites: the Decline of the BRITS? Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology 29(2):227-242.

Ontario Ministry of Culture and Recreation
1981 Ontario ethnocultural profiles: Scots.

Palmer, Howard
1975 Immigration and the Rise of Multiculturalism. Vancouver: Copp Clark Publishing.

Payne, Peter L.
1992 Growth and Contraction: Scottish Industry c. 1860-1990. Glasgow: The Economic and Social History Society of Scotland.

Porter, John
1965 The Vertical Mosaic: An Analysis of Social Class and Power in Canada. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Rahim, Aminur
1990 Multiculturalism or Ethnic Hegemony: A Critique of Multicultural Education in Toronto. The Journal of Ethnic Studies 18(3):29-46

Ralston, Helen
1988 Ethnicity, Class and Gender Among South Asian Women in Metro Halifax: An Exploratory Study. Canadian Ethnic Studies 20(3):63-83.

Reid, W. Stanford, ed.
1976 The Scottish Tradition in Canada. Generation Series. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart.

Rex, J.
1970 Race Relations in Sociological Theory. London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson.

Richmond, Anthony H.
1967 Post-War Immigrants in Canada. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Roberts, Lance W. and Rodney A. Clifton
1982 Exploring the Ideology of Canadian Multiculturalism. Canadian Public Policy 8:88-94.

Roche, John P.
1984 Social Factors Affecting Cultural, National, and Religious Ethnicity: A Study of Suburban Italian Americans. Ethnic Groups 6:27-45.

Rosch, E. H. and C. Mervis
1975 Family Resemblances: Studies in the Internal Structure of Categories. Cognitive Psychology 7:573-605.

Rothman, Jack
1974 Planning and Organizing for Social Change. New York: Columbia University Press.

Royal Commission on Bilingualism and Biculturalism
1970 Report: Book Four, The Cultural Contributions of the Other Ethnic Groups. Ottawa: Queen's Printer.

Royal Scottish Country Dance Society
1992 Bulletin No. 70. October 1992. Edinburgh: The Royal Scottish Country Dance Society.

Royce, Anya Peterson
1982 Ethnic Identity: Strategies of Diversity. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Satzewich, Victor and Li, Peter S.
1987 Immigrant labour in Canada: The Cost and Benefit of Ethnic Origin in the Job Market. Canadian Journal of Sociology 12(3):229-241.

Schiehallion Dancers [Pamphlet]

Schroeter, Gerd
1978 In Search of Ethnicity: Multiculturalism in Canada. The Journal of Ethnic Studies 6(1):98-107.

Scott, George M. Jr.
1990 A Resynthesis of the Primordial and Circumstantial Approaches to Ethnic Group Solidarity: Towards an Explanatory Model. Ethnic and Racial Studies 13(2):147-171.

Smith, Anthony D.
1984 Ethnic Myths and Ethnic Revivals. Archives Europeennes de Sociologie 25(2):283-305.

Smith, Dorothy E.
1987 The Everyday World as Problematic: A Feminist Sociology. Toronto: The University of Toronto Press.

Smith, Robert
1975 A History of the Hamilton (Ontario) Branch of the Royal Scottish Country Dance Society. Hamilton: Royal Scottish Country Dance Society.

Sorenson, John
1991 Politics of Social Identity: "Ethiopians in Canada. The Journal of Ethnic Studies 19(1):67-86.

Statistics Canada
1925 Sixth Census of Canada, 1921. Volume II: Population. Ottawa: F.A. Acland.

1961a Population: Ethnic Groups. The 1961 Census of Canada,

1961b Population: Citizenship and Immigration. The 1961 Census of Canada, volume I, part II: Population, General Characteristics. Bulletin Section 1.2-8. Ottawa: Dominion Bureau of Statistics.

1961c Population: Religion by Ethnic Group. The 1961 Census of Canada, volume 1, part III: Population, Cross-Classification of Characteristics. Bulletin Section 1.3-8. Ottawa: Dominion Bureau of Statistics.

1961d Population: Birthplace by Citizenship and Ethnic Groups. The 1961 Census of Canada, volume I, Section III:Population,Cross-Classification of Characteristics. Bulletin Section 1.3-9. Ottawa: Dominion Bureau of Statistics.

1961e Population: Characteristics of Immigrants, Provinces and Metropolitan Areas. The 1961 Census of Canada, volume 1, part III: Cross-Classification of Characteristics. Bulletin Section 1.3-11. Ottawa: Dominion Bureau of Statistics.

1971a Population: Citizenship and Immigration. Population: Ethnic Groups. The 1971 Census of Canada, volume 1, part 3: Population. Bulletin Section 92-728. Ottawa: Statistics Canada.

1971b Population: Ethnic Groups. The 1971 Census of Canada, volume I, part 3: Population. Bulletin Section 92-723. Ottawa: Statistics Canada.

1971c Population: Ethnic Groups by Birthplace. The 1971 Census of Canada, volume 1, part 4: Population. Bulletin Section 92-738. Ottawa: Statistics Canada.

1971d Ethnic Groups. The 1971 Census of Canada, volume 3: Population. Bulletin Section 92-723. Ottawa: Statistics Canada.

1981 Population: Language, Ethnic Origin, Religion, Place of Birth, Schooling: Ontario. The 1981 Census of Canada, volume II:Provincial Series. Bulletin Section 93-930. Ottawa: Statistics Canada.

1986 Profile of Ethnic Groups. In The 1986 Census of Canada. Bulletin Section 93-154. Ottawa: Statistics Canada.

1991a Ethnic Origin: The Nation. The 1991 Census of Canada.

1991b Immigration and Citizenship: The Nation. The 1991 Census of Canada. Bulletin Section 93-316. Ottawa: Statistics Canada.

Tonnies, Ferdinand
1957 (1887) Community and Society. Translated by Charles P. Loomis. East Lansing: Michigan State University Press.

Trevor-Roper, Hugh
1984 The Invention of Tradition: The Highland Tradition of Scotland. In Hobsbawm and Ranger, eds., The Invention of Tradition. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

van den Berghe, P.
1976 Ethnic Pluralism in Industrial Societies: A Special Case? Ethnicity 3(3):242-255.

Vincent, J.
1974 The Structuring of Ethnicity. Human Organization 33:375-9.

Waller, Adrian
1965 `It Isn't Corktown Any More'. Hamilton Spectator, December 18, 1965:29.

Waters, Mary
1990 Ethnic Options: Choosing Identities in America. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Weinfeld, Morton
1981 Myth and Reality in the Canadian Mosaic: "Affective Ethnicity". Canadian Ethnic Studies 13(3):80-100.

Whittaker
1988 The Mexican Presence in Canada: Liberality, Uncertainty and Nostalgia. The Journal of Ethnic Studies 16(2):29-46.

Wilkinson
1981 Education and the Social Mobility of Three Ethnic Groups: A Canadian Case Study. Canadian Ethnic Studies 13 (2):61-72.

Williams, Raymond
1960 Culture and Society. New York: Doubleday.

Wittgenstein, L.
1953 Philosophical Investigations. (trans. G.E.M.Anscombe.). Oxford.

Wood, J. David
1964 Scottish Migration Overseas. Scottish Geographical Magazine 80:164-176.

Ziegler, Suzanne
1980 Measuring Inter-Ethnic Attitudes in a Multi-Ethnic Context. Canadian Ethnic Studies 12(3):45-55.