

**THE GENDER INTEGRATION OF
THE CANADIAN FORCES**

WOMEN, CITIZENS AND SOLDIERS:

**THE GENDER INTEGRATION
OF THE CANADIAN FORCES**

BY

PAULA TRACHY, B.A.

A Thesis

Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies

in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements

For the Degree

Master of Arts

McMaster University

© Copyright by Paula Trachy, July 2001

MASTER OF ARTS (2001)
(Political Science)

McMaster University
Hamilton ON

TITLE: Women, Citizens and Soldiers: The Gender Integration of the Canadian Forces

AUTHOR: Paula Trachy, B.A. (McMaster University)

SUPERVISOR: Professor L. Vosko

NUMBER OF PAGES: vi, 129

Abstract

The purpose of this thesis was to do a gender-based policy analysis of the gender integration program of the Canadian Forces, looking specifically at women in the combat arms (Infantry, Armoured, Artillery and Combat Engineers). In researching this thesis, I studied primary policy documents extensively, as well as engaging in both participant and unobtrusive observation at Area Training Centre Meaford and Combat Training Centre Gagetown. The research revealed that, despite recent efforts to achieve gender neutrality by the leadership of the Army and the Canadian Forces, what it takes to be perceived as a good soldier remains inextricably linked, with what it takes to be perceived as a good man. In other words, life in the combat arms remains predicated on the male norm. It is my argument that it is exactly this attempt at gender neutrality that inhibits women's integration into the combat arms, by masking the continuance of male privilege through the perception of difference as equivalent with inferiority. This translates not only into unofficial attitudes of soldiers, but also into training standards, equipment and a social infrastructure that assumes that men are the norm. I, therefore, argue that only when women are recognized as different, without assuming physical or social inferiority, will the CF be able to successfully integrate women as equals into the combat arms.

I would like to express my thanks to the following people, without whose cooperation, guidance and encouragement this Thesis would not have been possible. The first people I must thank are my editors Cass, Heather and Joanne. Next are the Commanding Officers of ATC Meaford and CTC Gagetown, and LCdr Vivian from the Employment Equity/Gender Integration Section at NDHQ. Finally I extend a special thank-you to my thesis Supervisor, Dr. Vosko and my thesis committee of, Dr. Porter and Dr. Nossal.

Table of Contents

Introduction: Women, Citizens and Soldiers	1
Gender Integration in the CF – An Overview.....	7
Participation of Women in the CF.....	9
Conceptual Framework.....	10
Methodology.....	20
Chapter Outline	22
 Chapter One: Citizens and Soldiers.....	 27
Theoretical Context.....	28
Canada	33
Women in the Canadian Military	39
United States of America	42
Israel	46
Conclusion	51
 Chapter Two: Women as Soldiers?	 53
Theoretical Context	54
A New CF Policy	58
Women As The Weak Link	59
Gender Sameness On Trial	63
An Equal Opportunity Employer	74
Conclusion	81
 Chapter Three: Entrenching the Male Norm	 83

Theoretical Context 85

Gender Integration in Theory 86

Gender Integration in Practice 97

Conclusion 106

Chapter Four: Addressing the Myth of the Soldier 107

Theoretical Context 110

A New Defence Policy 112

Catalysts for Change 114

Conclusion 116

Conclusion: The Canadian Soldier 119

Bibliography123

List of Acronyms

CFAO – Canadian Forces Administrative Orders

CF - Canadian Forces

NCM – Non-commissioned Member

MOC – Military Occupational Classification

MMR – Minimum Male Requirement

CWAC – Canadian Women’s Army Corps

WRCNS – Women’s Royal Canadian Naval Service

WD – Royal Canadian Air Force – Women’s Division

CO – Commanding Officer

DND – Department of National Defence

NDHQ – National Defence Headquarters

SWINTER – Servicewomen In Non-Traditional Environments and Roles

CREW – Combat Related Employment of Women

4 CMBG – 4 Combat Brigade

4 SV BN – 4 Service Battalion

4 FLD AMB – 4 Field Ambulance

IDF – Israeli Defense Force

SBS – Social/Behavioural Science Study

CSS – Combat Service Support

INTRODUCTION

WOMEN, CITIZENS AND SOLDIERS

Introduction

Traditionally soldiering has been the exclusive domain men and despite of the significant gains in equality of women in industrialized nations, only a handful national military forces have removed all barriers to the full integration of women into land combat related trades¹. The justification for this limitation is illustrated in the following quotation from the Canadian Forces Administration Orders (CFAO 49-15) in 1989:

Empirical evidence gained throughout the history of warfare has proven that the operational effectiveness of an armed force is decisively affected by the combination of human factors. In particular, members of an armed force whose primary role is the engagement of the enemy in battle are faced with severe hardship, degrading living conditions, capture and death. The stresses encountered in battle drive members of the units involved to their physical and psychological limits. The ability to continue to perform effectively under these extreme conditions requires a high level of physical and mental strength and stamina. Most importantly, effectiveness in battle is vitally dependent on a strong bonding among the members, which is essential to units' cohesion and morale. Empirical evidence has shown that human stresses are compounded by added complexities of mixed-gender groups. Concern that such additional stress would seriously jeopardize operational effectiveness has resulted in every major nation in the world maintaining limits on mixed-gender composition in their armed forces, particularly in units which are most likely to face an enemy directly in battle. Consequently, in order not to jeopardize the operational effectiveness directed by the needs of national security, the composition of some units will remain single-gender male. As a result, a number of military occupations will be restricted to men, and in a number of others, there will be a minimum male component.²

¹ Among NATO Allies only Denmark, Norway, Belgium and Canada have lifted the prohibition on women serving in land combat trades. Outside of NATO, I am only aware of women serving in combat in Eritrea. Other nations that allow women into maritime or air combat occupations are France, Luxembourg, the Netherlands, Sweden, the United States, Venezuela and Zambia. "The Role of Women in United Nations Peace-keeping" [gopher://gopher.undb.org:70/00/secretar/dpcsd/dow/w2000/1995-1.en](http://gopher.undb.org:70/00/secretar/dpcsd/dow/w2000/1995-1.en)

² Canadian Human Rights Tribunal Decision: Gauthier vs. the Canadian Armed Forces. (20 February 1989) Section 32.

This statement comes from a submission to the Canadian Human Rights Tribunal. In Gauthier v. the Canadian Armed Forces, it was used to justify the exclusion of women from participating in combat related classifications in the Canadian Forces (CF) in 1989. The text maintains that women are not only incapable of handling combat situations, but that to include them in these occupations would represent a direct threat against both the sovereignty and the security of the nation. The CF policy of excluding and or limiting the participation of women was therefore justified by “bona fide occupational requirements.” Simply put, until recently, women were said not to be able to handle being in combat either physically, emotionally, mentally, or socially and thus posing a threat to operational effectiveness. The Human Rights Tribunal in Gauthier v. the Canadian Armed Forces did not agree. In February 1989, the Tribunal over-ruled the Canadian Forces’ prohibition on women entering the combat arms trades and ordered the full integration of women in the CF. The exclusion of women from combat trades was overturned on the basis of women’s sameness to men. However, these claims of sameness have been ineffective changing the attitudes towards women in combat, as “operational effectiveness” continues to be the *mantra* of those who opposed the integration of women into combat.

In this thesis, I undertake a gender-based policy analysis of the gender integration in the CF. I argue that only through the recognition of gender differences between men and women will the CF be able to successfully integrate women into combat trades. A central feature to this argument is the way in which the socially constructed nature of gender and the institutional construction of the soldier in Canadian society affect the program of gender integration in the CF. This chapter serves as the introduction to the

thesis. It provides a brief overview of the realities of the gender integration of the CF, then establishes the theoretical context in which the policy is to be evaluated. Finally, I give a short outline of what each chapter addresses and what I propose to prove. I begin, however, with the operationalizing of the term 'gender,' which if not properly understood undermines the entire thesis.

When the CF uses the term 'gender' it is used only to describe the biological differences between men and women; gender is used as a synonym of sex. Obviously, there are biological differences between men and women that cannot be ignored when engaging in intense physical activity. However, these physical differences are not as important as the social process which interprets them. It is this social process which uses the physical differences to construct 'gender.' It is my argument that by failing to recognize the socially constructed nature of 'gender', the CF has been unable to achieve full gender integration. In this thesis, the term 'gender' is taken to mean the social and cultural norms which define and govern interactions between men and women. Social norms that depict women as 'docile', 'passive,' and 'fragile' and men as 'strong', 'aggressive,' and 'protective' are deeply entrenched in the paternalistic nature of military service and its rank structure. By making superior ranks responsible for the welfare of their subordinates, social hierarchies are integral to the rank system. The concentration of women in subordinate positions (junior ranking Non-Commissioned Members (NCMs) and Officers) only serves to reinforce the pre-existing societal understanding of men's obligations towards women.³

³ Joan Acker. "Class, Gender, and the Relations of Distribution." *Signs*. Vol. 13 No. 3. Ed. Jean O'Barr (Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 1988). Gillian Creese. "Gender Equity or Masculine Privilege?: Union Strategies and Economic Restructuring in a White Collar Union." *Canadian Journal of Sociology*. Vol. 20 No. 2. (1995)

While the CF program of gender integration is a Forces-wide program, involving a wide spectrum of trades from all three elements (Army, Navy and Air Force), this thesis is limited to the integration of women in combat arms,⁴ specifically concentrating on women in the Infantry. The rationale behind this limitation is two-fold. The first reason, is the obvious difficulty with gender integration expressed in the limited number of women in the combat arms. The second reason, is the historic association with masculinity found within the infantry.

Granted there were isolated instances of women combatants by the Soviets in the Second World War, the Israelis during their War of Independence, and many other nations in similar independence movements; however it was understood that these women were used in this capacity because of the extreme level of the enemy threat. After the threat posed by the enemy diminished, women were immediately removed from their positions as combatants. Similar trends can be seen in the participation of women in the Allied Forces during the Second World War. Each nation chose to limit the participation of women during World War II and drastically decreased this participation after hostilities ceased. The idea behind these limitations was that the only legitimate reason for women to serve was to free a man to fight. Canada was no exception to this rule. However, feminists here have been more effective in making formal legislative changes than in other nations.

While rarely on the battlefield as combatants, women have served throughout history as nurses, cooks, laundry maids, and prostitutes. This history has significant consequences for the women who serve in the military today. Women's historic exclusion from combat combined with the glorification of war and the male soldier

⁴ The Combat Arms include the Infantry, Armoured, Artillery and Combat Engineering trades.

continues to serve as justification for the exclusion of women from the combat services. For many western nations the prohibition on women in combat remains the final archaic reference to gender based occupational restrictions.

The primary methodology used in this thesis is gender-based policy analysis. Gender-based policy analysis is defined by the Status of Women Canada as: A process that assesses the differential impact of proposed and/or existing policies, programs and legislation on women and men. It makes it possible for policy to be undertaken with an appreciation of gender differences, of the nature of relationships between women and men and of their different social realities, life expectations and economic circumstances. It is a tool for understanding social processes for responding with informed and equitable options.

It compares how and why women are affected by policy issues. Gender-based analysis challenges the assumption that everyone is affected by policies, programs and legislation in the same way regardless of gender, a notion often referred to as 'gender-neutral policy.'⁵

In short, gender-based public policy is the study the "inequalities in policy and their connection to power structures in the larger society."⁶

The state is an important site of struggle for women's equality, since many inequalities between women and men are institutionalized in legislation and regulations and entrenched in public policy. Therefore the state, (and its ability to grant privilege or impose disadvantage) has been the focus of feminist struggles for over two centuries.⁷ State-focused forms of public policy analysis require the introduction of accommodations or special programs designed to address specifically "women's issues." These programs are implemented to equalize the different effects of the policies on women, i.e.) maternity benefits and affirmative action initiatives.

⁵ Status of Women Canada "Gender-Based Analysis: A Guide for Policy-Making." (Ottawa: Staigh Associates Ltd. Sep 1998) 4

⁶ Creese. 144

⁷ Mary Hawkesworth "Policy Studies within a Feminist Frame." Policy Sciences Vol. 27 (1994) 97

The way gender equality is used by the Status of Women Canada – i.e., where both genders enjoy the same status and having equal conditions for realizing their full human potential⁸ - reflects a state-centred form of public policy reform. It is the contention of this thesis that such a definition, while an effective means of dealing with discrimination on the surface, is inadequate to address the underlying social stereotypes that originated the discrimination to begin with. Joan Grace contends that such a policy “translates the project of women’s equality (and all that it stands for and hopes to achieve as it relates to women’s particular social experience) into a vague, all encompassing concept that does not attend to the distinctiveness of women or to the specifics of women’s oppression.”⁹ The result of this policy then is to place the blame back on the disadvantaged and to reinforce stereotypes,¹⁰ because despite government initiatives these groups remain disadvantaged. Substantiating this argument, Susan Boyd contends that in order to change the nature of policies pertaining to women, gender-based policy analysts must first understand and then dismantle the public/private divide¹¹ and the hegemonic¹² views in society which support it. The public/private divide is important to

⁸ Status of Women Canada. 3

⁹ Joan Grace. “Sending Mixed Messages: Gender-Based Analysis and the ‘Status of Women’.” Canadian Public Administration. Vol. 40 No 4 1998. 585

¹⁰ Joan Grace. 586

¹¹ “The terms ‘public’ and ‘private’ have at least two meanings...At times, we use ‘public’ to refer to those services, supports, and regulations established by governments. The term ‘private’ in this case, refers to what is not done by governments. Although this kind of ‘private’ can include both for-profit and not-for-profit organizations, as well as households, we are usually thinking of divisions within the formal economy when we talk of the private and the public sectors. At other times, we use ‘public’ to refer to the world outside the private household, to what is done in the public sphere. These two meanings of ‘public’ and ‘private’ often overlap, as do both kinds of private and public spheres.” Pat Armstrong “Restructuring Public and Private: Women’s Paid and Unpaid Work.” .” Challenging the Public/Private Divide: Feminism, Law, and Public Policy Ed. Susan Boyd (Toronto: University Of Toronto Press. 1997) 37

¹² Hegemony is defined as “the concept used to describe the processes that create.. spontaneous consent: (Hegemony) entails the critical passage of a system of domination into the authority of a leading bloc, which is capable not only of organizing its own base through the construction of alliances between different sectors and social forces, but which has as a central feature of that process the construction and winning of popular consent to that authority among key sectors of the dominated classes themselves.” Susan Boyd

public policy because the line between the two spheres is consistently blurred and contested. It is necessary then that gender-based policy analysis address not only the legislation itself, but also the underlying ideas and beliefs that inform that legislation. It is the goal of gender-based policy analysis to transform public policy, “purging it of androcentric bias, reshaping dominate paradigms so that women’s needs, interests, activities, and concerns can be analyzed and understood systematically and generating research methodologies that are neither gender-biased nor gender-blind.”¹³

The Status of Women Canada’s definition of gender equality does however little to address the pre-existing understandings of suitable behaviour for men and women. As will be demonstrated in the thesis, the need to question gender roles and social stereotyping is central to addressing the barriers to the full participation of women in the combat arms trades. The CF will achieve successful integration of women into the combat arms trades only when it recognizes the social construction of gender. By recognizing gender as a social construct, the CF will be able to address the physical and social differences between men and women. Also the CF will avoid reinforcing pre-existing gender stereotypes concerning the responsibility of women for social reproduction.

Gender Integration in the CF- An Overview

In 1989 the Canadian Human Rights Tribunal ordered the CF to remove all official barriers to the participation of women in all previously restricted trades and classifications within the CF. The one exception to the full integration of women was the

“Challenging the Public/Private Divide: An Overview.” Challenging the Public/Private Divide: Feminism, Law, and Public Policy. 21

continuing restriction on women serving on submarines. However, all other trades were to be opened to participation of women immediately. The Tribunal decision reads as follows:

Our conclusion is that the occupational requirement no longer has adequate evidence to sustain it. We must, therefore, find that the present policy of the CAF (Canadian Armed Forces) in designating certain specific occupations and units male-only is a discriminatory practice.

The Tribunal makes the following Order:

The CAF CREW¹⁴ trials are to continue but are not to be regarded as trials, but as the lead-up or preparation for full integration, that is, the CREW exercise will be the first stage of implementation of a new policy of full integration of women into all units and occupations now closed to them.

Full integration is to take place with all due speed, as a matter of principle and as a matter of practice, for both active and reserve forces.

The implementation of the principle requires the removal of all restrictions from both operational and personnel considerations; the minimum male requirement should be phased out; new occupational personnel selection standards should be imposed immediately.¹⁵

To suggest that the CF's compliance with this order has been relatively unsuccessful is an understatement. Recent stories of discrimination, sexual harassment and rape published in the national media have tarnished the reputation of the CF and the gender integration program. A further embarrassment is that in the almost eleven years since the Tribunal decision, the CF has made only marginal gains in the enrollment of women into non-traditional occupations or in the overall representation of women in the CF. In 1989,

¹³ Hawkesworth. 98

¹⁴ The CREW Trials was a plan designated to start in the fall of 1989, in which the performance of women in Combat trades were to be evaluated over a two year period. Female personnel were to be put on one destroyer, and in units of the armoured, artillery, infantry, engineers and signals groups. These women were to be in groups of at least 25% of the total strength of the ship or the unit. The trials never actually happened because the Tribunal ordered the CF to implement full gender integration before the trials began.

Canadian Human Rights Tribunal Decision: Gauthier vs. the Canadian Armed Forces, Section 36

¹⁵ Canadian Human Rights Tribunal Decision: Gauthier vs. the Canadian Armed Forces, Section 63-64

when the Tribunal decision was made, women represented 9.3 percent of officers and 10 percent of the NCMs in the CF; in 1998 women represent 11.8 percent of the officers and 10.5 percent of the NCMs. Overall, women represent only 10.8 of the total CF Regular Force personnel.¹⁶ The majority of women in the CF continue to serve in medical and support military occupation classifications (MOC). The following table is a comparison of the number and classifications of women serving in the CF in 1989 and 1998.

The Participation of Women in the CF

CATEGORY	1989	1998	1989	1998
Total Regular CDN Force	9.9%	10.8%		
		OFFICER	<u>NCM</u>	
Total Officer or NCM	9.3%	11.8%	10.0%	10.5%
Combat Arms	0.3%	2.9%	0.4%	0.9%
Naval Operation/ Technical	1.6%	9.0%	2.5%	4.8%
Air Operational/ Technical	4.4%	6.2%	8.5%	8.7%
Engineering/ Communication	6.2%	8.9%	6.7%	7.2%
Medical/ Dental	41.8%	41.8%	21.2%	23.6%
Support	17.0%	22.4%	24.2%	31.1% ¹⁷

As is evident in this chart, the officer classifications have had the most success in the integration of women into non-traditional occupations, with less success in the NCM trades. These numbers also must be understood in light of the removal of all restrictions

¹⁶ L. Tanner. "Gender Integration in the Canadian Forces – A Quantitative and Qualitative Analysis." (Ottawa: Department of National Defence. April 1999) vii
¹⁷ "Minister's Advisory Board on Canadian Forces Gender Integration and Employment Equity: Success and Opportunities: 1999 Annual Report." (Department of National Defence. March 2000) 5

on the service of women. In 1989, these restrictions meant that of the one-hundred trades open to NCMs in the Regular Forces, twenty-nine were closed to women, sixteen were open to men and women without restriction and fifty-five were subject to various restrictions related to the minimum level of male participation necessary for operational effectiveness.¹⁸ These restrictions designated the maximum level of the participation of women. The justification for limiting the number of women employed in clerical trades, for instance, was that there would not be enough men to fulfill any operational requirements should a war erupt. The minimum male requirement (MMR) is discussed in more detail later in the thesis. The restrictions were removed immediately after the Tribunal decision, and thus account for the dramatic increases in the medical/dental and support classifications. The chart also illustrates that the traditionally masculine trades of the combat arms have experienced the least significant increase in integrating women

The Conceptual Framework

This thesis employs two main theoretical frameworks, historical institutionalism and feminist theory. These bodies of theory, while distinct in their focus, are similar in the way they explore the effects of history and traditions to mitigate the forces of change in society. Historical institutionalism is important to understand the attempts to integrate women into the combat arms because it acknowledges the effects of the exclusively masculine composition of the institution. Historical institutionalism also acknowledges the unique patterns countries take in the development of institutions. Specifically in Canada, the long tradition of associating military service with citizenship has meant that

¹⁸ Canadian Human Rights Tribunal Decision: Gauthier vs. the Canadian Armed Forces, Section 11

the experience of women in the CF has been quite different from other nations, which have relied more heavily on a professional conception of military service.

Feminist theory is important to understanding the systematic way gender can be used to justify the exclusion of women from institutions such as the military. In this thesis I argue that gender neutral standards in the CF are another manifestation of gender restrictions on military service. In this section, I discuss these two theoretical traditions in turn.

Historical institutionalism fits within the spectrum of organizational theory that ranges from rational choice/game theory to the new institutionalism. While each subset of this body of theory has a different orientation, they all attempt to understand the effects that institutions have on political actors, defining of the actors' interests, and structuring power relations with other groups.¹⁹ In this thesis, historical institutionalism alone will be used because of its capacity to "trace sequences of outcomes over time, showing earlier outcomes change the parameters for subsequent developments."²⁰ The works of Peter Hall, Theda Skocpol, Kathleen Thelen and Sven Steinmo are particularly instructive in advancing the central arguments of this thesis.

Before the advantages of historical institutionalism are examined, the nature of institutions and of institutionalism itself must be understood. The exact nature of an institution is in debate within the field itself and can range from anything from a prominent set of ideas in society to an actual working department of a civil organization. Peter Hall includes "the formal rules, compliance procedures, and standard operating practices that structure the relationship between individuals in various units of the polity

¹⁹ Thelen and Steinmo. *Historical Institutionalism in Comparative Politics*. 2

²⁰ Theda Skocpol. "Why I am an Historical Institutionalism." *Polity*. Vol. 28 No 1 (1995) 106

and economy” in his definition of institutions.²¹ Generally, the debate about what qualifies as an institution centres on three understandings of institutions: government institutions - which include the formal characteristics of the government, political institutions - the more overarching structures of the state, and intermediate-level institutions - the nation’s normative social order.²² However, in this thesis, the term institution is used narrowly to describe formal government organizations only.

A critical insight of historical institutionalism is that individuals are not free to create their own interests without interference. Instead their interests are not only mediated, but are informed by the institutions of the society in which they live. Peter Hall stresses that institutions actually contribute to shaping the goals of political actors by mediating power structures among them, and by privileging some, to the disadvantage of others.²³ “By shaping not just actors’ strategies... but their goals as well, and by mediating their relations of cooperation and conflict, institutions structure political situations and leave their own imprint on political outcomes.”²⁴ However, while it is important to understand the effects of institutions on individuals and vice versa, it must be understood that institutions are not the sole factor affecting political actors.

According to Peter Hall and Rosemary Taylor, historical institutionalism differs from all other forms of institutionalism in four areas. The first area is that they recognize that individual behaviour is influenced by the institutions of a society. The second is the emphasis on the asymmetries of power associated with the operation and development of institutions. The third area is the tendency to emphasize path dependence and unintended

²¹ Thelen and Seinmo. 2

²² Thelen and Seinmo. 2, Jonas Pontusson. “From Comparative Public Policy to Political Economy: Putting Political Institutions in their Place and Taking Interests Seriously.” *Polity*. (1995) 119

²³ Thelen and Steinmo. 3

consequences. The fourth and final area is the preoccupation with integrating institutional analysis into other areas, such as ideas and interests, which can affect political outcomes.²⁵ This feature of historical institutionalism is very important in the study of an institution like the CF, which is dependent on its sense of tradition.

Using historical institutionalism, I argue that the CF has developed in a manner that is different from its North American and European counterparts. This development has resulted in a specific national understanding of the relationship between citizenship and voluntary military service that has tremendous implications for the integration of women. This connection (and its implications) is explored in Chapter One. For the time being, it is sufficient to understand that this thesis is *historical* because it recognizes that the political development of gender integration must be understood as a process that unfolds over time, and it is *institutional* because it stresses that many of these temporal processes are embedded in the institution itself.²⁶

To understand wholly the complexities of gender integration in the CF, however the insights from feminist theory are necessary. Although 'feminist theory' does not represent anything like a unified body of theory, two strands of feminist theory are deployed in my case study of gender integration in the CF: liberal feminism, and cultural or difference feminism. In developing my case study, I also draw on theories of women and work and critical International Relations feminist theory. A central question in feminist theory, as a whole, is the question of "on what basis the equality of women should be recognized?" Should women be recognized as "the same" as men and

²⁴ Thelen and Steinmo. 9

²⁵ Peter Hall and Rosemary Taylor "Political Science and the Three New Institutionalisms" *Polity* (1995)

²⁶ Paul Pierson "The Path to European Integration: A Historical Institutional Analysis." *Polity*. (1995)126

therefore equal to men, or should their equality be derived from their physical and social differences²⁷ from men?

Arguments about “sameness” rooted in certain strands of liberal theory, are premised on the belief that if women and men are to be equal, they must be treated the same, that is, given the same opportunities and benefits based on gender-neutral criteria. Advocates of a “sameness” strategy look for discrimination in the laws and official practices that bar women from the opportunities given to men (e.g. glass ceilings and old boys networks.) They seek to increase the presence of women in non-traditional occupations as a means of ensuring equality. There are degrees of variation within liberal feminist thought. However, most tend to discount the effects of biological or socially constructed differences between men and women. Ideas about sameness and equal opportunity underpinned the Royal Commission on the Status of Women in 1972 and continues to inform the CF’s policy of gender integration.²⁸

The Canadian State has embraced various threads of liberal feminists’ policies since the 1970s. This is not surprising given that this strand of feminism is rooted in the rights-based discourse of liberal theory itself. Within this discourse all humans are perceived to be inherently equal based on their rationality as human beings. It is their right to be granted citizenship, and it is the obligation of the state to remove all official

²⁷ For the sake of brevity ‘social differences’ will be used in place of ‘socially constructed differences’. As previously stated, this thesis understands the social differences between the genders are in fact the result of constructs within society, however given their powerful influence among men and women it would be naïve to suggest that either gender could divest themselves of these understandings at will. Therefore although an artificial constructs, these differences are still understood to be social differences to many in the CF and the rest of society.

²⁸ Susan Findlay “Feminist Struggles with the Canadian State 1966-1988.” *Feminist Perspectives on the Canadian State*. Vol. 17 No 8 (1988) 4 Margaret Buist “Elusive Equality: Women and the Charter of Rights and Freedoms.” *Feminist Perspectives on the Canadian State*. Vol. 17 No 8 (1988) 104. Sandra Whitworth *Feminism and International Relations: Towards a Political Economy of Gender in Interstate and Non-Governmental Institutions*. (New York: MacMillian Press 1997.) 13

barriers to any group achieving full integration into society. Liberal definitions of equality and freedom are based on the limited role of government interference.²⁹ “Liberal individualism denies difference by positing the self as a solid, self-sufficient unity, not defined by anything or anyone other than itself.”³⁰ Liberal feminism works to ensure all formal barriers and women’s full citizenship are removed. Feminism’s call to these liberal ideals has been tremendously successful in removing the formal restrictions to the full citizenship for women, starting in 1917 with the right to vote in federal elections and formal recognition of women as persons in 1929. Liberal feminism stepped up its pressure for the change through during the Royal Commission on the Status of Women, and finally struggled for equal rights for women in the Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms (1982). In fact, it was liberal feminism’s challenge that removed the final restrictions to the full integration of women into the CF. However, simply removing laws and amending policies cannot challenge the pre-existing gender stereotypes that provided the foundation for those laws and policies to begin with.

It is here that difference feminism becomes useful. Carol Pateman challenges the liberal conception of the self by insisting the self and its identity are inseparably linked to one’s sexuality, while not being completely subsumed by it.³¹ Therefore, difference theorists deny the existence of ‘gender-neutrality’ insisting that supposedly gender-neutral policies actually mask a masculine privilege.³² They argue that women must be recognized as women, with all their differences, before true equality can be achieved.

²⁹ Will Kymlicka *Multicultural Citizenship: A Liberal Theory of Minority Rights*. (New York: Oxford University Press. 1995) 34, 75

³⁰ Iris Marion Young. *Justice and the Politics of Difference*. (New York: Princeton University Press. 1990) 228

³¹ Carol Pateman. *The Sexual Contract*. (USA: Stanford University Press. 1988) 199

³² Young. 175

Joan Wallach Scott suggests that by women making themselves the same as men “women [become] mere imitations, and necessarily inferior versions because they [are] not actively representing themselves.”³³ Difference feminists argue that liberal feminist do not sufficiently address historic power inequalities, between men and women. They insist that providing an “equality of opportunity” does not ensure an equality of outcome. Equality of opportunity is inadequate especially in the CF, where there are biological and socially created differences which cannot be properly addressed through the use of purported ‘gender neutral’ standards.³⁴ Increasingly, feminists are arguing that in many cases equitable treatment is best achieved by recognizing difference and by making policy sufficiently flexible to accommodate and address differences.³⁵ Theorists like Iris Marion Young insist that gender has been constructed by society to privilege male over female, therefore the very nature of constructed gender (in its privileging of men to the disadvantage of women) must be challenged before equality can be achieved.³⁶ Carol Pateman argues that Western society is predicated on a ‘sexual contract,’ which guarantees men the right of, access to and the exploitation of, the bodies of women. It is this contract and its corresponding inequalities that are at the centre of the social construction of gender. It is not until this contract is recognized and challenged that women can attain full equality.³⁷ Difference feminists suggest that women must be recognized as equals based on their status as women, not on their ability to be just like men.

³³ Joan Wallach Scott. *Only Paradoxes to Offer*. (Boston: Harvard University Press. 1996) 79

³⁴ Susan Findlay “Feminist Struggles with the Canadian State 1966-1988.” & Margaret Buist “Elusive Equality: Women and the Charter of Rights and Freedoms.” *Feminist Perspectives on the Canadian State*. Sandra Whitworth *Feminism and International Relations*. 13

³⁵ Susan Philips “Discourse, Identity and Voice: Feminist Contributions to Policy Studies” *Challenging the Public/Private Divide*. 253

To limit women's struggle to the demand for inclusion in what is essentially men's social contract, or for engagement in work on identical terms with those of men, ignoring the reality of women's lives, is to seek to make women surrogate men in a world that is still a man's world. That is not only to deform the women who achieve such a goal – it is necessary to exclude the majority of women from the project.³⁸

It is this 'difference' perspective that this thesis deploys. Given the intense day-to-day routine of life in an infantry unit, biological and social differences are ignored at the peril of the success of the integration of women.

Constructs of gender difference have tremendous impact on women and their attempts to challenge inequities in the labour market. As Cynthia Cockburn observes, gender norms have historically defined, not only the work that women cannot do, but also the nature of the work they are permitted to do. In examining the shape of the printing industry, Cockburn demonstrates that women were hired to do menial and repetitive tasks, as these jobs were regarded as unskilled and simple. Whether these jobs were classified as unskilled because of the nature of the work or the presence of women is open to debate, but it remains that the work of women has historically been dismissed as unsuitable for men.³⁹ This division of labour has had the consequence of connecting certain forms of labour with gender, reinforcing masculine and feminine identities. Work became a right of passage to manhood. "By the late 1830s...the notion of 'work', no longer simply the activity of whichever sex turned its hand to a productive task, it was gradually being redefined as 'occupation' and associated with manhood and

³⁶ Young. 177

³⁷ Pateman. NP

³⁸ Cynthia Cockburn. *In the Way of Women: Men's Resistance to Sexual Equality in Organizations*. (New York: ILR Press. 1991) 25

³⁹ Joan Eveline. "Heavy, Dirty and Limp Stories: Male Advantage at Work." *Gender and Institutions: Welfare, Work and Citizenship*. Ed. Moria Gates and Alison MacKinnon (Sydney: Cambridge University Press. 1998) 90

independence.”⁴⁰ Much of this form of masculine identity then has its foundations in the exclusion of women and its correlating belief that it is work only fit to be done by a man. This has resulted in the formation of particular standards to ensure that the nature of work is suitable to masculine physical standards. In other words, the work is heavy and difficult because men have made it that way. There were several reasons behind the creation of gender specific physical requirements, however, central to them is the protection of masculine identity and therefore the morale of the workers. This is particularly true in the case of the CF, as will be explored in Chapter Three.

The entrance of women into traditionally masculine trades results in a challenge to masculine identity and to the status of the trade itself. The result is often resistance by men to the presence of women and attempts to ensure the continuance masculine advantage in the workplace. Joan Eveline identifies the most common form of this resistance as “*heavy, dirty and limp stories*[italics added by author].”⁴¹ These stories are used to dismiss the work that women do. Specifically, the types of stories to which Eveline refers reinforce that women lack the physical stamina to do the *heavy* work of men, the mental stamina to tolerate the *dirty* culture of a masculine workplace and the leadership skills not to go *limp* in times of crisis. The common theme that each of these stories share is that women lack what it takes to do a “man’s job.”⁴²

The identity crisis created by the presence of women in non-traditional trades is intensified in a military situation. No other institution has worked as hard to equate itself with a masculine identity as the military. International Relations (IR) feminist theory looks critically at the connection between militaries and masculinity. Jean Elshtain

⁴⁰ Cockburn. *In the Way of Women*. 78

⁴¹ Eveline. 91

argues that the masculine identity is predicated on the dichotomy of the "*Beautiful Soul and the Just Warrior*." This dichotomy is marked, on the one hand, by the armed citizen ready to be called into the service in the defense of his homeland, and on the other, the mother ready to sacrifice her citizen (read: son) in the defence of the nation. In this romanticized image, men are the *Just Warriors* exposing themselves to battle while women remain, the *Beautiful Souls*, at home and protected from the horrors of war.⁴³ This image has been popularized throughout history, and remains current today.

The exclusion of women from military service has had tremendous consequences. As a result of their exclusion, women have been associated with weakness. As Marcia Kovitz notes, "as weakness, femininity can also mark the antithesis of soldiering: reminding soldiers of what they must not be, and representing the sphere of the defended."⁴⁴ This leads to devaluation of femininity and, therefore, of women. The devaluation of women is reinforced by military training and military culture which values physical strength and aggression. Women serving in combat trades, represent the antithesis of the prescribed femininity, therefore the only role available to these women in military culture is the role of the whore. As Moon notes, in discussing women's role in the US military, "the US military has conflated the different categories of woman (ladies, wives, and whores) to suit its organizational and normative designs. Sexualization of the militarized woman served as the common denominator."⁴⁵

⁴² Eveline. 91

⁴³ Jean Elshtain. "The Discourse of War and Politics: From the Greeks to Today." *Women and War*. (New York: Basic Books 1987)

⁴⁴ Marcia Kovitz. "The Enemy Within: Female Soldiers in the Canadian Forces." *Canadian Woman Studies*. Ed. Luciana Ricciutielli (Toronto: York University Pub. 2000) 39

⁴⁵ Katharine Moon. "Military Prostitutes and the Hypersexualization of Militarized Women." *Gender Camouflage: Women and the US Military*. Ed. Franane D'Amico & Laurie Weinstein. (New York: New York University Press. 1999) 209

While insightful in many ways, feminist IR theory is actively preoccupied with the case of the U.S. military, limiting possibilities for generalization. The Canadian military developed in a different manner than its American counterpart. As a result of these differences, therefore, critical IR feminism is most useful when discussing possible factors for change.

Probably the most significant challenge to military masculinity is the extensive peacekeeping missions that Canada's soldiers have engaged in since the fall of the Berlin Wall. Cynthia Enloe suggests that peacekeeping requires that soldiers re-evaluate their jobs as soldiers, and therefore has a tremendous potential to moderate masculine military aggression.⁴⁶

The crucial question may be whether soldiering for a state calls forth different notions of masculinity than soldiering for a non-state international agency does. What exactly happens to a Canadian or Fijian soldier's presumptions about violence, about femininity, about enemies, or about his own sexuality when he is placed in a position of maintaining peace between two warring armies?⁴⁷

Sandra Whitworth has done extensive studies of the CF from an IR perspective. She disagrees with Enloe's assertion that peacekeeping offers the potential to challenge masculinity and uses the Canadian Airborne Regiment's scandal in Somalia as evidence. I draw on the work of Whitworth and Enloe in greater detail in Chapter Four.

Methodology

The central methodology used in the research of this thesis is documentary analysis since the thesis examines in detail primary policy and CF documents. However, in conducting my research, I also engaged in participant and unobtrusive observation as

⁴⁶ Cynthia Enloe. *The Morning After*. (Los Angeles: University of California Press. 1993) 33-34

⁴⁷ Enloe. *The Morning After*. 34

qualitative research methodologies, to gain a greater understanding of exactly who is in the infantry and of the nature of the Infantry itself. The observations were done in two one-week periods, during the “operational phases” of basic trades training courses.

NCMs were observed at Area Training Centre, Meaford and Officers were observed at Combat Training Centre, Gagetown. Both sets of observations involved following field routines, which will include battle preparation, patrols and attacks.

During the more physically demanding and technically advanced activities, unobtrusive observation was used, either by following along behind the training, or by becoming part of the “enemy force.”⁴⁸ By using unobtrusive observation during complex exercises, I was able to observe the majority of the attack, as well as the interaction between instructors and candidates. During less technical or physically intensive activities, I was able to participate more fully. Therefore, I participated in reconnaissance patrols, defensive routines and route marches. Extensive fieldnotes were taken (using a diary format organized on the basis of process and content issues) throughout both training courses, which informs my approach to the policy analysis of gender integration in the CF.⁴⁹

⁴⁸ An ‘enemy force’ is used during Section or Platoon attacks, when the battle techniques of the course candidates are being evaluated. Their purpose is exactly what the title implies-- they play the part of the sedentary ‘enemy’ during the attacks.

⁴⁹ The entire platoon (both instructors and candidates) was informed about both the intent and the nature of my research. Where possible, I conducted my observation as a civilian. However, where it was required that I observe as a member of the CF, no rank was worn in an effort to preserve my status as a researcher.

Chapter Outline

“There are no gender problems, only leadership problems.”⁵⁰ In this one succinct statement, the CF describes exactly why its program of gender integration has failed in the past and why it will continue to fail in the future. By denying the existence of “gender problems”, and therefore gender stereotypes, the CF undermines its ability to address the unofficial structural barriers⁵¹ that prohibit women from participating in traditionally male classifications. This thesis proceeds in four chapters attempting to highlight the necessity of deconstructing gender stereotypes in a program of gender integration.

Chapter One, entitled “Citizens and Soldiers”, explores the history and participation of women in the CF. The idea of the citizen soldier is central to this chapter. Machiavelli first articulated the ideal conception of the citizen-soldier in his From the Art of War. In this work, Machiavelli contends that citizens provide the best defence of a nation, as compared with the defence provided by a mercenary army. It is therefore an obligation as well as a right of citizenship to perform military service.⁵² This concept found its expression in the Canadian Reserve military service between 1855 and 1948. These volunteer part-time soldiers were at the centre of Canada’s defence policy for every military engagement at the time of Confederation. Therefore, an

⁵⁰ Army Lessons Learned Centre. “Lessons Learned: Leadership in a Mixed Gender Environment” Dispatches Vol. 5, No 2. (1998) 2

⁵¹ An “unofficial structural barrier” is a prohibitive standard of action or performance, which by virtue of its gender-bias limits women’s ability to participate fully. An example of an unofficial structural barrier in the Canadian Army is the fitness test in which the soldier must march 13 km, carrying 55lbs in their rucksack. The very nature of the weight requirement is prohibitive for the majority of women and it is further exacerbated by the design of the rucksack, which has been proven as too big for the majority of women. K. Davis. “Understanding Women’s Exit from the Canadian Armed Forces: Implications for Integration?” Wives and Warriors: Women in the Military in the US and Canada. Ed. Weinstein and C. White. (Westport: Bergin and Garvey, 1997) Dispatches. 32

association has been forged between military service and citizenship obligations. Of course, the tradition has implications for the participation of women in the CF. Using historical institutionalist theory, this chapter establishes the context for the gender integration of the CF. It outlines historic patterns that inhibit and enable the integration of women into the combat arms trades.

Chapter One argues that there is an historic link between citizenship and military service in Canada. This link was formulated through the all, but exclusive, use of militia soldiers in all major Canadian wars in the 19th and 20th centuries. The link between citizenship and reserve soldiering is a unique development, and has contributed directly to social and political pressure to integrate women into the CF. A comparison of Canada and the US is undertaken to illustrate that the connection between soldiering and citizenship is a specific result of Canadian military institutions, and is not a North American phenomenon. In the U.S., military service has historically served as a means of proving one's worthiness to be a citizen. Military service has not been an expression of pre-existing citizenship obligations. A second comparison between Canada and Israel in Chapter One illustrates that the definitions of difference in the construction of citizenship are critical to the construction of the soldier.⁵³

Chapter Two, "Women as Soldiers" explores the historic pattern of the integration of women into the CF through the lens of feminist theory. Initially the CF framed the

⁵² Niccolo Machiavelli "From the Art of War." *The Portable Machiavelli*. Ed. Peter Bondanella & Mark Musa. (New York: Penguin Books. 1979) 483- 517

⁵³ A sub-argument of this chapter is that despite the rhetoric of equality between the sexes, Israel has constructed separate citizenship standards for Israeli men and women. The limited conscription of women into the Israeli Defense Force, the gender-specific terms of service and the small number of occupations available to women clearly illustrate that while Israeli men are citizen-soldiers, Israeli women remain citizen-mothers. Yeal Izizzul. *Between the Flag and the Banner: Women in Israeli Politics*. (Albany NY: State University of New York Press. 1997) 9

exclusion of women on the basis of the physical and social differences between men and women. This led the military to make a limited number of trades available to women and contributed to their inferior terms of service. The prohibition against the recruitment of married women was one manifestation of exclusion. Consistent with marriage bars in other parts of the federal public service lasting well into the 20th century, the CF felt that a woman, once married, was not a suitable employee because her primary commitment lay with her husband and family. However, the gradual rise of the feminist movement combined with the adoption of the Bill of Rights (which prohibited discrimination on the basis of sex) forced the CF to alter its policies to conform more closely to a more liberal definition of equality between the sexes. The weakness of these policy initiatives is that they did very little to challenge pre-existing gender stereotypes or to undermine socially constructed gender differences.

Also in Chapter Two, employment policies in the military since WWII are evaluated. The central argument of this chapter is that while the nature of women's citizenship in Canada changed during the 1980s and 1990s, the understandings of gender remained unchallenged in the CF. Therefore, the removal of all formal restrictions to the participation of women in the CF has been inadequate to challenge pre-existing gender stereotypes. The result has been the inability of the CF to successfully integrate women into the combat arms trades. While the argument made by liberalism was strong enough to guarantee women entrance into the combat trades, it is not strong enough to guarantee them the acceptance of their fellow soldiers. This point is painfully obvious in the results of the Servicewomen in Non-Traditional Environments and Roles (SWINTER) Trials and in the recommendations of the Davis Reports.

Chapter Three, entitled “Entrenching the Male Norm,” addresses the most recent initiatives by the CF to address the lack of success in integrating women into the combat arms. These initiatives range from the Davis Reports in 1997 to the 2000 Minister’s Advisory Board on Gender Integration and Employment Equity in the Canadian Forces. This chapter also covers Army specific strategies like the Diversity Training program.

The argument of this chapter is that even after recognizing its failure to successfully integrate women into the combat arms and to retain those already trained, the CF continues to flounder in its attempts to address the problems faced by women in the infantry. This chapter develops the parallel argument that the roots of the Canadian military’s failures in this area lie in the continued dominance of arbitrary male norms with regard to expectations of what it means to be good soldier. Due to the historical entanglement of conceptions of military prowess and of masculinity it is difficult, but crucial to separate the two. Certainly the demand of the battlefield require high levels of physical performance and, at times, to put commitment to the military ahead of commitment of family. The CF must maintain the standards needed to successfully carry out combat responsibilities. However, a common tendency in Canada and elsewhere has been to not consider carefully enough what standards are really needed for contemporary warfare. For instance the view of some soldiers that the ability to carry eighty pounds over long distances is needed, rather than the current fifty-five pounds, is rooted more in traditional attitudes than in real necessity. Even more important than the physical standards, are the problems of equipment designed for men’s bodies: of training routines that inadequately consider the differences between men’s and women’s muscular systems, and of the expectations that family responsibilities and the infrastructural support

for instant deployment will be taken care of by a wife rather than by institutional arrangements that make a reasonable balance between career and family possible for both men and women soldiers. It is important to acknowledge, as well, that the entry of women for the first time into all male units may be associated with heightened scrutiny of the performance of women in training, as well as resentment on the part of some men, that make these women's experiences different from that of male trainees.

Changing attitudes surrounding gender roles in the CF is a complex process that requires time. However, unless the CF addresses its own institutional gender bias, it will not be able to construct a policy to better implement the integration of women into the Combat Arms. This chapter examines these issues exploring the day – to – day life of an infanteer through the data gathered during field research.

Chapter four, entitled "Addressing the Myth of the Soldier" argues that the policies and programs used by the CF to facilitate the gender integration have been inadequate to the task. Nevertheless the changing nature of military service in the CF has the potential to assist in the integration of women into the combat trades. These new influences include the increased dependence of the Regular Force on militia soldiers, and the participation of Canadian soldier in peacekeeping missions. The emergence of the post Second World War "professional soldier" has also had a significant impact on the perception of military service in Canada. Within this chapter possible sources for change, in the CF are evaluated with a connection to their ability to challenge the male norm.

CHAPTER ONE

CITIZENS AND SOLDIERS

In this chapter I discuss the historical development of the Canadian Forces and the role of women in that development, drawing on a framework informed by historical institutionalism. As noted in the previous chapter and discussed below, such an approach is useful in revealing the way in which current attitudes, practices and rules regarding women's participation in the military are shaped by the formal and informal institutions that have developed over long periods of time. It is argued that the distinctively Canadian reliance on a citizen-soldier has contributed in important ways to the current commitment of the Canadian government to fully integrate women into the CF. In developing this argument I first discuss the Canadian historical experience and then compare it briefly to the contrasting experiences in the U.S. and Israel. These two cases highlight the distinctiveness of Canada's citizen-soldier. They also, however, point to secondary counter-tendencies that should be acknowledged: first the negative consequences of the U.S. reliance on professional soldiers may become more common in Canada as it has moved to a more professional concept of military service, and, second the gendered character of Israel's conception of its citizen soldiers, which have come to be seen as male, points the way in which traditional gendered perspectives can offset the more inclusive implications of a citizen soldier conception.

This chapter establishes the context in which the gender integration of the CF has taken place. It examines the unique development of the nature of military service in Canada and its consequences. Although it is tempting, given the linguistic and cultural

similarities between Canada and the U.S., to deem scholarship on the U.S. military applicable to the Canadian military, there are fundamental differences in the history of the Canadian and American militaries; the most significant of these differences is that throughout Canadian history, soldiering has been a part-time responsibility. Men who were mobilized and trained through their local militia regiments fought every major war that Canada engaged in. In contrast, the U.S. military beginning with the War of 1812, soldiering became the responsibility of a professional military elite. For roughly the first 100 years after Confederation in Canada, the only purpose of the full-time military was to train the militia. The lack of a full-time professional military was the product of the belief that military service was a responsibility of Canada's citizens.

The notion of the citizen-soldier is central to this chapter, which argues that the connection between reserve military service and citizenship is unique to Canada. With only a tiny professional military prior to the Cold War, the defence of Canada fell to its militia soldiers in every major war of the 19th and 20th centuries. This link between citizenship and the duty of soldiering has contributed to social and political pressure in Canada to integrate women into the CF.

Theoretical Context

The insights of historical institutionalism ground this chapter. Historical institutionalism is used in this chapter as “a means of putting the players, their interests, their strategies and the distribution of power among them into context.”⁵⁴ Kathleen Thelen and Sven Steinmo define historical institutionalism as: “the attempt to illuminate how political struggles ‘are mediated by the institutional setting in which they take

place.”” It is used here to evaluate the “formal rules, compliance procedures, and standard operating practices that structure the relationship between individuals in various units of the polity and the economy.”⁵⁵ In this thesis, the Canadian military (and the formal and informal rules and practices governing membership) is the institution under study.

James Kloppenberg argues that we cannot understand institutions without understanding the ideas, and the purposes, that created them; and without understanding the broader cultural values that sustained the institutions that ensured the continuance of the institution into modern society.⁵⁶ The fact that an institution has its own history situated within the national culture requires that it be studied on multiple levels. The first level is the examination of the construction of the institutional actor.⁵⁷ In the case of the CF, the actor is the soldier. Within the conception of “the soldier,” ideas of the dutiful citizen and manliness are personified, ideas evolving out of the institution and of society itself. The second level is the way in which the institution perpetuates its own legitimacy. The legitimacy of any institution is partly dependent on how it is perceived by the population.⁵⁸ The CF is dependent, then, on the continuing perception of legitimacy of its actors and of itself. Because of the importance of perception, the CF must respond to increasing social and political pressures from the rest of society. However, an institution is not incapable of effecting the forces of change as well. The ideas within the institution itself will moderate ideas to conform to its existing institutional culture. The third level is the influence of the culture on institutional

⁵⁴ Pontusson. 119

⁵⁵ Thelen and Steinmo. 2

⁵⁶ Kloppenberg. “Institutionalism, Rational Choice and Historical Analysis.” *Polity* (1995) 128

⁵⁷ Kloppenberg. 128

legitimacy. Cultural factors also shape institutional legitimacy.⁵⁹ In a nation where the military has never been a glorified national institution it is necessary that the CF appear to mirror the culture of the nation.

Two trends in the development of the CF both within Canadian society and within the institution are important to highlight here. The first, and more formal, is the equation of citizenship with military service. Only those who possessed sufficient wealth and status could afford to join the volunteer militia regiments of the 19th century, and the control of the Commanding Officer over all recruitment ensured the exclusion of all those thought to be undesirable. This excluded non-citizens like women and aboriginal people, as well as citizens like African Canadians. The exclusion of “undesirable recruits” intensified a second trend in the development of the CF: the equation of military service with white, English-Canadian masculinity. While initially mutually-reinforcing, these two trends became a source of conflict as the definition of Canadian citizenship expanded in the late 20th century. The nature and results of this conflict are explored in Chapter Two.

Before proceeding, it is essential to define the term ‘citizenship.’ In examining notions of citizenship prior to 1950, I am probing the rights-based liberal definition of civil and political citizenship. While the concept of a social citizenship did exist in this period, I limit my discussion to its civil and political dimensions. Using the work of T.H. Marshall I define civil, political and social citizenship as the following:

The civil element is composed of the rights necessary for individual freedom – liberty of person, freedom of speech, thought and faith, the right to own property and to conclude valid contracts and the right to justice. The last is of a different order from the others, because if it the right to defend and assert all one’s rights

⁵⁸ Kloppenberg. 128

⁵⁹ Kloppenberg. 128

on terms of equality with others and by due process of law. This shows us that the institutions most directly associated with civil rights are the courts of justice. By the political element I mean the right to participate in the exercise of political power, as a member of a body invested with political authority or as an elector of the members of such a body. The corresponding institutions are parliament and councils of local government. By social elements I mean the whole range from the right to a modicum of economic welfare and security to the right to share to the full in the social heritage and to live the life of a civilized being according to the standards prevailing in the society. The institutions most closely connected with it are the educational system and the social services.⁶⁰

Marshall notes, however, when discussing 19th century constructions of citizenship, that it is more accurate to discuss the duties of citizenship than citizenship rights. In the 19th century citizenship rights were earned by fulfilling the duties of citizenship. Theda Skocpol illustrates this point in her book Protecting Soldiers and Mothers, where she argues that the right to social citizenship was bestowed only on those who proved themselves worthy. "The nation's help was lavished on a selected subset of working- and middle-class people, citizens of both races, who by their own choices and efforts had *earned aid* for themselves and their dependents, and even their communities."⁶¹ Those who had not proven themselves loyal and therefore worthy, like the Confederate soldiers, were excluded from the social benefits and political rights of post-Civil War American civil, political and social citizenship.

Regrettably, the exclusion of groups from full citizenship in Canada was not only dependent on the actions of the group itself, as in the case of the Confederate soldier. Often social intolerance and mistrust of their ability to fulfill the duties of citizenship formed the basis for the exclusion of certain groups of people from the full rights of citizens. Alan Carins argues that this belief was the premise upon which Canada's first

⁶⁰ T.H. Marshall "Citizenship and Social Class." Class Citizenship and Social Development: Essays by T.H. Marshall. (Garden City, New York: Doubleday & Co.1964) 71-72

constitution, the British North America Act 1867, was drafted. For the first century of Canada's history, its Constitution rested on a restricted notion of citizenship, reflected in the exclusion of significant segments of the population including women, Aboriginal peoples and visible minorities from full citizenship.⁶²

During the 20th century, perceptions of full citizenship changed. Liberal ideas about rights contributed to a growing perception that the exclusions of any group of individuals from the rights of citizenship was illegitimate. The 1960s saw increased pressure on the government to include visible minorities, indigenous peoples and women in the Canadian polity. However, it was not until the adoption of a new Canadian constitution and the Canadian Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms 1982 that the state bestowed all the rights and responsibilities of civil, political and social citizenship upon these groups.

What follows is a discussion of the institutional development of national military in Canada, the U.S. and Israel. The cases of the U.S. and Israel are examined to illustrate the impact of the national understandings of citizenship on the nature of military service and the impact of military service on citizenship. In both the U.S. and Israel, service in combat in the national defence force has historically served as a means of proving oneself worthy to be considered deserving of full citizenship rights, while in Canada, participation in combat has historically been framed as a pre-existing citizenship obligations.

⁶¹ Italics in the original text. Theda Skocpol. *Protecting Soldiers and Mothers*. (New York: The Belknap Press of Howard University Press. 1992) 151

⁶² Alan Cairns. "The Constitutional World We Have Lost." *Reconfigurations: Canadian Citizenship and Constitutional Change*. Ed. Douglas E. Williams. (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart Inc. 1995) 105

Canada

World War II was the second 'total war' Canada fought in less than thirty years. A nation with a population of only eight million people at the beginning of World War I sent more than 400 000 men to World War I, over 60 000 of whom did not return.⁶³ It is understandable, then, as mobilization intensified for the Second World War, that manpower⁶⁴ shortages were experienced as early as 1940. Like many Western Allies, the Canadian government responded to the crisis by enrolling women in the national military. The Canadian Women's Army Corps (CWAC) was founded on June 26, 1941. The Women's Royal Canadian Navy Service (WRCNS) and the Royal Canadian Air Force - Women's Division (WDs) soon followed. During the war, some 48 000 women served in these three divisions as clerics, nurses, truck driver, and pilots.⁶⁵ By all accounts, the women proved to be an effective addition to the Canadian Forces. When the war ended, however, the three women's divisions were disbanded and a formal prohibition on the enrollment of women in the Canadian military was reintroduced. It took approximately fifty years for all formal restrictions on the participation of women to be lifted when in 1989 the Canadian Human Rights Tribunal ordered the CF to integrate women into combat occupations.

Prior to 1871, the colonies of British North America depended almost exclusively on the British Military for their defence. Nominally, each colony possessed a Sedentary Militia founded on the principle of obligatory service followed by in many European

⁶³ C.P. Stacey. *The Military Problems of Canada*. (Toronto: Ryerson Press. 1940) 77

⁶⁴ I use the term 'manpower' here intentionally. The employment crisis created in the early days of World War II was specifically a shortage of men, not people, which precipitated the hiring of women into non-traditional occupations.

⁶⁵ Ruth Roach Pearson. *They're Still Women After All*. (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart Inc. 1986) 217

nations at the time. This military force consisted of every able-bodied man between the ages of sixteen and sixty-five. It is this Sedentary Militia (and its citizen-soldiers) which is reputed to have defeated the Americans in the War of 1812. The governments of the colonies did not fund or equip these militias, but the men of these colonies were required to participate in the limited military training of annual "Muster Days."⁶⁶ As can be imagined, these Muster Days proved to be of little military value as they inevitably degenerated into drunken buffoonery.⁶⁷ Although it was obvious to military analysts of the day that this military service would be completely useless in a time of war, the Canadian mythology surrounding the militia and the myth of the citizen-soldier has proven to be a central feature in the nation's pattern of military development.⁶⁸

Of dubious military merit at the best of times, the Sedentary Militia actually deteriorated to the point where men began forming their own volunteer militia units for the defence of their colonies. Men of the upper and middle classes would meet weekly to train in military drill and deportment. Each man was expected to purchase his own uniform and to provide his own weapon. These volunteer militias were first recognized

⁶⁶ The term Muster is defined as 'reporting for mandatory military training. Under the sedentary militia this was a yearly requirement of all able-bodied men in the Canadian colonies. These days were usually observed two Sundays in June and the first two Sundays in July. *Militia Act 1777*, Nova Scotia.

⁶⁷ Mrs. Anna Jameson describes the infamy into which the Sedentary Militia fell, in her narrative of the local Muster Day. It reads as follows:

A few men, well mounted, and dressed as lancers, in uniforms which were, however, anything but uniform, flourished backwards on the green sward [grass], to the manifest peril of the spectators; themselves and their horses, equally wild, disorderly, spirited and undisciplined; but this was perfection compared with the infantry. Here there was no uniformity attempted in dress, or appearance, or movement; a few had coats, others jackets; a greater number had neither coats nor jacket, but appeared in their shirtsleeves, white or checked, or clear or dirty, in edifying variety! Some wore hats, others caps, others their own shaggy heads of hair. Some had firestocks, some had old swords suspended in their belts, or stuck in their waistbands; but greater number shouldered sticks and umbrellas. Mrs. M. told us that the former parade day she heard the word of command given thus – 'Gentlemen with the umbrellas take the ground to the right! Gentlemen with the walking sticks take the ground to the left!' George Stanley. *Canada's Soldiers 1604-1954*. (Toronto: MacMillan Co of Canada Ltd. 1954) 209

⁶⁸ John Hasek. *The Disarming of Canada*. (Toronto: Key Porter Books. 1987) 95, Wesley Turner. *The War of 1812: The War that Both Sides Won*. 2nd Edition. (Toronto: Dundurn Press. 2000) 130

as the Active Militia in 1846 when the Government of the United Canadas granted the Governor General the right to authorize volunteer militia regiments. However, the Government was under no obligation to fund or equip these regiments. By 1855 these regiments had grown in popularity so much that the 1855 Militia Bill recognized them as an official defence force of the United Canadas. The Sedentary Militia was retained until well after Confederation, however, the Active Militia became the *de facto* military force in Canada. The recognition of the Active Militia resulted in government funding and then in 1855 to the founding of volunteer military service in Canada.⁶⁹ These militia regiments proved to be tremendously popular and in the years between 1855 and Confederation in 1867, over fifty regiments were founded in the four colonies.⁷⁰

In 1868, the new Government of the Dominion of Canada passed a Militia Bill. Instead of founding a professional Canadian military, the MacDonald government increased the dependence of the nation on the part-time soldiers of the Active Militia. When the final British battalion left the Dominion of Canada on 11 November 1871, the responsibility for the fledgling nation's defence fell entirely upon the Active Militia. The force was not up to the task.

The Active Militia was never designed to be an independent force, and with the departure of the British it was left without the ability even to train its soldiers. More significant structural problems existed in that the force was disproportional in its use of the infantry: 27 448 of the 37 170 militiamen in the Dominion were infantrymen. In the entire Canadian Army, there were only ten batteries of artillery and 1 500 cavalrymen.⁷¹ The composition of the Active Militia meant that it would be completely ineffective as a

⁶⁹ Desmond Morton, *Canada and War*. (Toronto: Butterworths. 1981) 20

⁷⁰ Morton, *Canada and War*. 11

force of aggression or defence, it did not possess the men or the means to wage war. Without the existence of service sectors, the Active Militia could not even move its men about the country, let alone supply them with arms and ammunition. Most conspicuous in its absence was a Canadian navy. Strategists had long agreed that should the Americans attack, Canada's only hope of defence would exist in naval superiority on the Great Lakes. However, the Royal Canadian Navy was not founded until 1909, well after the threat of any American hostilities had dissipated. It is obvious then that these regiments were far from adequate in the defence of the nation. This issue raises the question of exactly what purpose they served?

In the years between Confederation and World War I, the Active Militia fulfilled another role. The Active Militia was an institution of social advancement and civil control.⁷² All members of a regiment were to be interviewed by the Commanding Officer (CO) before they were allowed to join, thus guaranteeing that only desirable men were enrolled. Furthermore, by requiring that all members be able to purchase full dress uniforms, it was assured that only those who possessed wealth could become members. The absence of the working class was further ensured by a rate of pay of \$0.50 a day. This represented one half of a daily labourer's wage. Thus attending militia training would involve not only having to hire someone else to do their civilian job - as civilian employers were reluctant to give time off for training - but would also involve a substantial reduction in wages for the day.⁷³

⁷¹ Desmond Morton. Ministers and Generals. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press. 1970) 33

⁷² Desmond Morton. A Military History of Canada, 4th Edition (Toronto: McClelland & Stuart Pub. 1999)

87

⁷³ Morton. Ministers and Generals. 30

Exclusivity served not only as a source of social validation but also helped to ensure that the soldiers would remain loyal to the regiment's authority when called upon to put down the numerous strikes of an industrializing Canada. Between 1867 and 1914 local militias were called out no less than 120 times by civil authorities to quell civil unrest.⁷⁴

Militia regiments served as points of training and mobilization during the Boer War, as well as for World War I and World War II. Eventually a small cadre of full-time soldiers (the Permanent Active Militia) was founded in 1879, but its express purpose was to assist in the training of the Non-Permanent Active Militias. The reliance on the citizen-soldier was so complete that on the eve of World War I, Canada had a full time army of less than 3000 men of all ranks ranging from Infanteers, to Quarter Masters, to Dentists.⁷⁵ The connection between citizenship and military service is best illustrated by the recruitment policies of World War I.

At the beginning of the First World War, formal legislation was enacted to prevent Native, East Indian or Asian men from enlisting in the Canadian Expeditionary Force (CEF). These three groups were denied the full rights of citizenship and therefore were not obligated to fight in the war. Eventually the manpower shortage created by a disorganized and ill-conceived recruiting formula resulted in the removal of these restrictions. By 1916, native and asian men were actively sought to fill the ranks of both combat and labour battalions. These men were recruited into ethnically-mixed battalions and under the same pay and terms of service as their white counterparts.

⁷⁴ T.C. Willett. *A Heritage at Risk: The Canadian Militia as a Social Institution*. IVS Special Edition. Vol. 1 (New York: London Press. 1987) 6

⁷⁵ Stacey. 77

The social understanding of the centrality of citizenship to military service in Canadian society was illustrated in 1917. Japanese and native communities protested against the conscription of their young men based on their limited citizenship. Disenfranchised groups insisted that “since they had no vote, and no voice in the conduct of the war or of the councils of state, it was unfair to expect them to participate now in the war.”⁷⁶ The government agreed, and in January 1918 an order in council amended the Military Service Act to exempt native and Japanese Canadians as well as any other naturalized Canadians who were deprived of the franchise.⁷⁷ The link between military service and citizenship was further entrenched by legislation that granted only the veterans in these exempted communities the right to vote on their return to Canada.

From the beginning of the war, however, African-Canadians occupied a peculiar position. Due to their status as fully enfranchised citizens, there were no formal restrictions on the recruitment or training of African-Canadians in the CEF.⁷⁸ In fact, the then Minister of Militia Sir Sam Hughes ordered a full investigation into accusations by the black community of discrimination against the recruitment of African-Canadian men. The racism of Canadian recruiters nevertheless prevented many African-Canadian men from being recruited. Many were forced to serve in labour companies, although under much better terms than did the black soldiers from other western nations.⁷⁹

⁷⁶ James W. St. G. Walker. “Race and Recruitment in World War I: Enlistment of Visible Minorities in the Canadian Expeditionary Force.” *Constructing Modern Canada: Readings in Post Confederation History*. Ed. Chad Gaffield. (Toronto: Copp Clark Longman Ltd. 1994) 270

⁷⁷ Walker. 271

⁷⁸ Walker. 273

⁷⁹ Had Canadian authorities kept with the prevailing standard of treatment, black men of the labour companies would have been employed at a reduced rate of pay, reduced rank and severely restricted in their social liberties. The Canadian Colonel of the company insisted that as the men of the labour company were employed in the same work and risks as their white labourers, they were entitled to equal pay and benefits. Walker. 273

Women in the Canadian Military

While women had been employed as nursing sisters for the Canadian military since the 1880s, nursing sisters were employed as civilian contractors attached to the Canadian military. The recruitment of women into the Canadian Army to fill clerical positions was proposed during World War I, but was dismissed. It is no coincidence that Canadian women were only enrolled in the Canadian military after they were given the right to vote (1918), and after they had won legal status as persons (1929). Like asian and native men, Canadian women clearly occupied the position as 'second-class citizens;' women however, also had the burden of gender stereotypes concerning their weak and untrustworthy nature. During World War II, women were the second choice for a Canadian soldier. This can also explain the severe limitations of the terms of service for women. It is not my intention to ignore the role that racism or sexism played in limiting visible minorities and women's participation in military service. It is, however, my argument that these beliefs played a significant role in defining the citizenship of Canada. As these groups were not full citizens, they were not expected to fulfill their obligation as citizen-soldiers.

It was not until the Korean Conflict that the question of women being a permanent part of the military was raised in Canada. Due in large part to a shortage of "manpower," and to the good record of women's service in World War II, Cabinet authorized the enrollment of women into a separate division for women of the Royal Canadian Air Force in March of 1951. The Army and the Navy received authorization to enroll women in 1954 and 1955 respectively, but the stringent limits placed on the number of women serving could not have reduced the strains on "manpower" shortages in any real or

meaningful way. After the close of the conflict, women were allowed to remain in the CF; however, their services were still considered a temporary measure, continuing at the pleasure of the Canadian Government and the Department of National Defence. Each service was permitted to place a ceiling on the enrollment of women in its respective women's corps.⁸⁰ Women serving in the nation's military were not employed on equal terms with their male counterparts. The precise nature of and justifications for women's restricted services are explored in Chapter Two.

On 1 February 1968 the three separate commands of the Army, Navy and Air Force were amalgamated into the Canadian Armed Forces. This amalgamation meant that while maintaining the operational capabilities of all elements, each command headquarters was under the authority of National Defence Headquarters in Ottawa. The separate women's divisions were also dissolved and women soldiers became part of the same military as their male counterparts. Despite these changes, women were still not the equals of their male counterparts.

As the political/ legal status of women changed in Canada, so did the nature of their military service. As women increased their demands on society and the government for equal citizenship throughout the 1970s and 1980s, society and the government increased their demands for women to fulfill their obligations of citizenship. One of these obligations was military service in combat trades. The rapid change in women's legal and social status during the 1970s and 1980s in Canadian society was mirrored in the changes to the status of women in the Canadian Forces, as well as in the nature of their employment. By 1979 women were permitted to serve in 66% of the trades

⁸⁰ Kevin Vivian "From the Past and into the Future: Gender Integration in the Canadian Armed Forces 1970 – 1999." (Ottawa 1998) 4

available, by the end of 1989 all formal restrictions on women's service in the military had been removed. Overall the representation of women in the Regular Force, rose from just 3% in 1968 to 9.9% in 1989.⁸¹

This is not to suggest that women soldiers were actively sought, or readily accepted, by the military community. In fact, I will argue that women attempting to enter combat trades continue to experience resistance. However, in the militia, where the relationship between citizenship and military service is the strongest, women have showed a steady increase in numbers and in successful integration, even in the combat arms trades. Militia infantry training was first made available to women in the summer of 1990; by January of 1992 some 831 women (40 officers and 791 noncommissioned members) were serving in the militia combat arms.⁸² These numbers have increased steadily in the years that have followed. Unfortunately, since no recent studies have been done on the militia, no concrete numbers exist for the level of participation by women or their dispersion throughout the rank structure.

In Canada, the historic connection between citizenship and soldiering helps explain social and political pressures to include women in the combat arms. The absence of this tradition in the U.S. and Israel can be used to explain the different manifestations of the military service of women in those nations.

⁸¹ Vivian. 4, 44

⁸² Vivian. 23

United States of America

The War of 1812 was also a pivotal war for the United States. During this war, the American government discovered its need of a professionalized military force.⁸³ Contrary to Canadian mythology, it was not the Canadian Sedentary Militia who defeated the American invaders, but professional British soldiers. Initially, bolstered by the myth of the Militiaman in the American Revolution, the U.S. relied exclusively on part-time citizen-soldiers. These American Militiamen consistently found themselves wanting, when matched against the professional British soldiers. When the war ended in 1814, the foundations had been laid for a professional American military. In the century that followed the War of 1812, the U.S. engaged in two more European style wars (the Spanish-American War and the American Civil War) as well as countless campaigns to conquer their Aboriginal population. These increased demands for military actions further contributed to the professionalization of the American Army.

American women's participation in the military dates back to the Revolutionary War, when General Washington decreed that women be used as nurses in an effort to free more men for the front.⁸⁴ During the same war other women served in the traditional roles of laundresses, cooks and camp followers. Women continued to serve in these capacities throughout their nation's turbulent nineteenth century. Like their Canadian counterparts, the most formal activity women engaged in with the US military was nursing. Throughout the nineteenth century American military nurses served, died and were decorated for their bravery both aboard hospital ships and on the battlefield. From

⁸³Morton. A Military History of Canada. 65, John Elting Amateurs, To Arms! (New York: Da Capo Press. 1995) 328

the time of the Spanish-American War women nurses were employed under contract with the military. A permanent exclusively female Nurses Corps for the Army was founded in 1901, with the Navy following suit in 1908. However, as they lacked formal military status, women nurses were not given pay or retirement/ veteran's benefits equal to their male counterparts.⁸⁵

Women were first enlisted in small numbers into the American military during World War I, when the U.S. Navy and the U.S. Marine Corps recruited women to fill clerical positions, because of "manpower" shortages. The Army did not recruit women at this time. However, World War II saw American women recruited in large numbers into all four services the Army, the Navy, the Marine Corps and the Air Force. Overall more than 350 000 women served in all four services during World War II. These women served in various trades from secretarial to instructional.⁸⁶ Unlike the Canadians, the American women's services were not dissolved after the close of the war. In fact, military leaders in the U.S. proposed that women become a permanent part of the U.S. military. On 2 June 1948, the U.S. Congress passed the Women's Armed Services Integration Act. These services were limited to 2% of the total non-nursing personnel, and women in the U.S. military, like the women in the CF, were not employed on equal terms with their male counterparts. Women were banned by an act of Congress from combat trades in the Navy and Air Force. However, as the Army and the Marine Corps informed the Congress that given the rapid and constantly shifting nature of the modern

⁸⁴ Connie Reeves. "Invisible Soldiers: Military Nurses." Gender Camouflage. 15

⁸⁵ Reeves.

⁸⁶ Georgia Clark Sadler. "From Women's Services to Servicewomen." Gender Camouflage.

battlefield, they were unable to give a firm definition of combat. Therefore, Congress left the nature of the restrictions on women's service to Army and Marine commands.⁸⁷

Where women could serve was not the only restriction that women in the U.S. faced to their military service. Enlistment ages were higher for women, as were their educational requirements.⁸⁸ Restrictions were placed on the enrollment of married women and pregnancy was grounds for immediate dismissal. Further limits were placed on the rank attainable for women officers, despite of the fact that women officers were only to be in command of other women. In light of these restrictions it almost goes without saying that women served in traditional clerical and medical occupations.⁸⁹

Women's integration into the U.S. military services has been less consistent than the Canadian experience. This has in large part, to do with the inability of the U.S. government to integrate its four services under one command. Congress' inability to control the armed forces allowed the U.S. military to retain a separation from the civil authorities that has translated into very limited control of the military by U.S. civil institutions. It has also limited the amount of social and legal pressure that the U.S. justice system can exert against the national military. Therefore, while the U.S. Air Force and U.S. Navy have removed all gender ceilings and formal restrictions on women in combat in 1990 and 1995 respectively, women's service in combat trades are still at the discretion of the Squadron's or Ship's Commanding Officer. Women in the US Marine Corps and the Army are still officially prohibited from combat positions and non-combat

⁸⁷ Sadler.

⁸⁸ Sadler. 41

⁸⁹ Sadler. 41

trades are still subject to gender ceilings.⁹⁰ This is also a result of the disconnection in the US between formal, legal rights of citizenship and military service.

Race has been critical to the construction of citizenship in U.S. society. This preoccupation has implications for women serving in the military. Although Americans frequently employ the rhetoric of a citizen-soldiery, their claims are undermined by a long history of using visible minorities as soldiers without conferring the rights of citizenship on them. One does not have to search far in American history to find African-Americans being used as soldiers before they were ever granted equal citizenship. Black soldiers were used in the Revolutionary War, the American Civil War, as 'Buffalo Soldiers' in the campaigns against various Native tribes, World War I, and World War II. During each of these wars black soldiers fought in separate companies from white soldiers and were employed under lesser pay and terms of service than white soldiers. Black men and women were not granted even the most basic of citizenship rights – the right to vote- in a significant portion of the country. Although President Harry Truman signed Executive Order 9981 racially integrating the nation's military service on 26 June 1948, the nation remained racially-segregated for at least the next two decades. What is apparent in African-American military service is that military service in the U.S. was not an expression of a pre-existing citizenship duties. The question remains, why did African-American men, and eventually women, participate in the American military?

Although there were many factors contributing to African-Americans' desire to serve in the military, a strong argument can be made for the belief that African-American men and women understood the historic connection between proving oneself worthy of

⁹⁰ David Armor. "Race and Gender in the U.S. Military." *Armed Forces and Society*. Vol. 23 Ed Marilyn Mattsson. (1997) 11, 25

citizenship and military service. "Many African-Americans believed that serving in the military would strengthen their claims for full rights as citizens in a society that continued to deny them equal access to education, housing, and employment."⁹¹ Brenda Moore's statement clearly shows that military service in the U.S. is an attempt to prove oneself worthy of citizenship, not as an obligation of or means to earn one's citizenship. This is further enforced by the fact the U.S. government did not grant citizenship to returning to African American veterans, thus indicating that despite the rhetoric of a citizen based military, military service in the U.S. was not associated with citizenship in any clear political manifestation. Clearly, parallels can be drawn between the attitudes of minority soldiers and the attitudes of women soldiers towards military service.

Israel

Few nations have fostered the image of a militarized womanhood more than Israel. Images of women soldiers holding rifles grace national and international representations of Israel alike. The myth of the women *Sabre*⁹² fighting beside men in combat during the War of Independence (December 1947 to March 1949) has been cultivated actively by both the Israeli government and the military alike. The truth is that while the 1 200 women of the *Palmach* were utilized in combat roles throughout the sixteen month war, the *Haganah* removed women from the front line in the spring of 1948.⁹³ When the *Knesset* finally sat in 1949, the role of women in the formalized Israeli

⁹¹ Sadler. 41, Brenda Moore "African-American Women in the U.S. Military." Armed Forces and Society. Ed Edith Hoshimo Vol. 17 No 3. (1991) 367

⁹² A Jewish Israeli who was born and raised in Israel. The rest of the Hebrew terms in this section are names, and therefore I am unable to translate them.

⁹³ Anne Bloom. "Women in the Defense Forces" Calling the Equality Bluff: Women in Israel. Ed Barbara Swirski and Marilyn Safir (New York: Teachers CollegePress. 1993) 132

Defense Force was hotly debated. At ideological odds were the Zionist rhetoric of equality and the institutional legacy of excluding women from participating in the defence of the *Yishuv*.

The tension between the ideological foundations of Zionism and the actual attitudes towards women's equality were evident in the earliest forms of defence and government. The *Hashomer* Association was formed in the early part of the nineteenth century specifically to govern and protect the fledgling Jewish communities in Palestine, then under the control of the Ottoman Empire. In a memorandum written by Yisrael Shochat in 1912, the aims of this defensive organisation were detailed as follows:

The principle of defence, which we propose, is this: defence has two aspects, active and potential. The day-to-day active defence is, now, in the hands of the Jewish watchmen working in the settlements under orders from the Shomer Association. This Association has, therefore, to take upon itself the leadership of the Yishuv [Jewish settlements in Palestine]. But in addition to this active guard who are always under arms, we need a reserve force with which that active force can be strengthened. Our ideal is that in time of danger all the farmers and the workers who are able to bear arms will participate actively in defence. We must direct our effort to this end; in each and every settlement a local defence association must be organised which will include all able-bodied and eligible farmer and workers.⁹⁴

Just a few short paragraphs later, however, it is revealed exactly who these able-bodied farmers and workers were: "In those settlements in which there are as yet no Jewish workers or watchmen and the number of young men is small, it will be impossible to establish permanent defence associations."⁹⁵ It is obvious that from the foundations of Israeli national defence, women were not considered to bear an equal part of the burden. However, Israeli women did agitate unsuccessfully for the right to participate in watch keeping, and thereby earn the rights of citizenship.

⁹⁴ Yisrael Shochat. "A Proposal for the Defence of the Jewish Community in the land of Israel." Yigal Allon. *The Making of Israel's Army*. (New York: Universe Books. 1970) 113

When women were finally granted the right to attend *Hashomer* meetings in 1915 it was based on a woman's husband's participation in the *Hashomer* as a watchman. The resolutions read as follows: "To bring the wives of guards closer to the *Hashomer* Association, we allow room for passive membership; and the wives of guards may be present at our meetings without the right of expressing an opinion and voting."⁹⁶ These resolutions show clearly that at the founding of Israel, women occupied a second class position in Israeli society. Even this diminished position was not based on the rights of women's humanity, but because of the duties of their husbands.

At the formation of the *Hashomer*, it was legislated that only those men taking part in guarding the community would be granted full citizenship rights. Therefore, the duty of guarding was considered the crucial requirement for full participation in the *Yishuv*. Women's exclusion from the duty of being watchmen would have profound consequences as the nation struggled to define itself and the nature of its citizenship obligations. Granted, the advent of the *Haganah* and the *Palmach* improved the status of women by increasing their responsibilities for the defence of the community, however it was understood even within these institutions that utilizing women for combat was only a result of the desperation of the situation.

The first Prime Minister of Israel, David Ben Gurion, articulated the responsibilities of women citizens in the new Jewish society in his 1949 address to the Knesset:

Now, for the question of women in the Army. When one discusses the position of women, two factors must be taken into consideration. First, women have a special mission as mothers. There is no greater mission in life, and nature has

⁹⁵ Shochat. 115

⁹⁶ Yacov Goldstein. *From Fighters to Soldiers: How the Israeli Defense Force Began*. (London: Sussex Academic Press. 1998) 90

decreed that only a woman can give birth to a child. This is a woman's task and her blessing....We have no intention of putting women into combat units, though no one can be sure, should we be attacked and have to fight for our lives, we should not call on the services of every man and woman. But the law in question deals with a peacetime situation and we want to give women only the most basic military training.⁹⁷

This quotation illustrates two trends in the development of the Israeli military and Israeli women's citizenship. The first is that women are citizens by virtue not of being soldiers, but by being mothers. The second that women's active military service is a desperate last resort, called for only in dire circumstances. The Law of Return and the over two million immigrants that Israel has absorbed since 1949 have insured that women's services were not required beyond their traditional role as caregivers in any of Israel's wars since 1949.⁹⁸

In Israel, women are to fulfill their citizenship obligations by participating in traditionally feminine roles as nurturers and caregivers. Israeli women are the protectors of the Israeli family, and their role is to defend their families as Israel's soldiers defend the nation. "The Israeli woman is an organic part of the family of the Jewish people and the female constitutes a practical symbol of that. But she is a wife and a mother in Israel, and therefore it is in her nature to be a soldier, a wife of a soldier, a sister of a soldier, and a grandmother of a soldier."⁹⁹

The exclusion of women from combat has reinforced the masculine tendencies within a military culture. The constant threat of attack or revolt in the Arab-Israeli conflict has placed women at a disadvantage to protest their subordination within society. Protest could easily be viewed as being ungrateful for the sacrifices that their men and

⁹⁷ Natalie Rein. *Daughters of Rachel*. (London: Penguin Books. 1979) 48

⁹⁸ Izizzul. 11

⁹⁹ Izizzul. 10

protectors have made.¹⁰⁰ This has restricted women to their historic role as citizen-mothers, and allowed the institutions of the state, including the military, to foster a separate citizenship for the women of Israel.

While Israeli women continue to participate in military service, “the woman soldier’s life remains sufficiently circumscribed to allow her to do a national service and to return to society understanding her role as a woman.”¹⁰¹ Currently 65 percent of Israeli women are conscripted into the Israeli Defense Force (IDF).¹⁰² Reasons for exemption for women from the draft include religious objections, marriage or motherhood and being a conscientious objector. Once enrolled into the IDF women are trained in and employed under the authority of a separate Women’s Corps. Even the name of the Corps reveals the nature the service of women in Israel.

Women serving in the Israeli military belong to the Women’s Corps, which is known in Hebrew as *chail nashim* but is usually referred to in its abbreviated version, *chen*, which translates literally as charm and grace. This is not a merely linguistic coincidence. In fact, during their basic military training, women are coached to emphasize their feminine and neat appearance: they receive cosmetic guidance as part of their official basic training.¹⁰³

The women conscripts’ length of mandatory service is for one year and nine months, while male conscripts serve a full three years. Upon completion of this term of obligatory service, women are obliged to remain in reserve service only until they are thirty-four years of age. In actuality, women only serve until they are twenty-four or until the birth of their first child, while men serve until they are fifty-five, regardless of

¹⁰⁰ Galia Golan, “Women in Israeli Society: An Overview,” *Palestine-Israel Journal*, Ed. Zaid Abu Zayyad & Victor Azgielman, Vol. II No 3 (Jerusalem: Middle East Pub. 1995) 16

¹⁰¹ Izizzul, 9

¹⁰² www.idf.il/eng/organization/chen/chen.stm, 30 Mar 00

¹⁰³ Golan, 16

parental status.¹⁰⁴ More telling of the place that women occupy in the IDF is the requirement for unmarried women who are physicians, dentists, surgical nurses, physiotherapists and occupational therapists to serve until they are thirty-four.¹⁰⁵ What is significant about this statement is not that women in these vitally important medical professions are required to serve twenty years less than their male counterparts, but that this is required only of unmarried women. Military service in Israel is constructed to reinforce, not to challenge, the ideology of the citizen-mother.

The construction of two separate citizenships for men and women illustrates the importance that the definition of a citizen has on the construction of a soldier, as well as the construction of a soldier has on who is a citizen.

Conclusion

Undoubtedly, the number of wars that the U.S. and Israeli militaries have fought in comparison to Canada has played a significant role in their construction of professionalized militaries, and therefore in the construction of their citizenship. Regardless of how they developed, however, these institutions have not been confronted successfully with the social/legal challenge to integrate women fully into combat roles. This chapter has illustrated that the movement towards full gender integration in the CF has not been the result of “North American liberalism” or of a commitment to a state imposed conception of a citizen-soldier, but of the historic development of a militia-based national military. Admittedly, it was the peaceful development of the Canadian state that allowed the nation’s government to all but ignore the necessity of constructing a

¹⁰⁴ Bloom. 133

¹⁰⁵ Bloom. 134

professional army until after World War II. Had Canadians experienced as many wars as the Americans or the Israelis, undoubtedly there would have been an increased need to professionalize its national defences. Whether ideology created the government policy or whether the government created the ideology to justify its policy is open for debate. The result, however, was a unique conception of citizenship obligations and responsibilities, with long-lasting implications for the integration of women into the CF.

The next chapter evaluates the historic integration of women into the CF. It is important to recognize that while political and social pressure to integrate women as equals grew in the 1970s, the CF continued to construct women as the 'weaker sex.' Their perceived weakness was informed by the relatively unchallenged social roles of women in the family and the double standard concerning women's sexuality. In practice, this perception of the physical weakness of women was exacerbated by questionable equipment and training standards. The liberal ideology of equality employed by the CF has been powerless in addressing these pre-existing gender norms and stereotypes.

CHAPTER TWO

WOMEN AS SOLDIERS?

Introduction

The shifting status of women as Canadian citizens is shaped by claims of sameness and difference. Canadian society has long struggled with ways to reconcile the tension between the differences between men and women. Prior to the 1970s, the public policy solution was to concentrate on the differences between men and women. Differences in this context, were often used as indicators of women's inferiority, cultivating a second-class citizenship among women. The policies and practices of the CF reflected this strategy. During early campaigns for enfranchisement, advocates for women concentrated on the localized responsibilities of women. This resulted in women gaining the responsibilities of citizenship without enjoying the full citizenship rights. The second mobilization of women, which began in the 1960s, concentrated on the rights of women. By the early 1970s, legislation began to change as the "women's liberation movement" challenged the limitations placed on the citizenship of women. In this period, the women's liberation movement in Canada developed in a pattern distinct from its American counterparts. Canadian feminists mobilized to achieve equality through cooperation with (and pressure on) the federal government.¹⁰⁶ The articulation of women's demands for equal status and an improved position in society came with the 1972 Report of the Royal Commission on the Status of Women in Canada. The focus of this report, as well as advocates of equal rights across the country, was sameness. This "sameness" strategy was eventually used to expand the definition of the citizen-soldier to

CHAPTER TWO

WOMEN AS SOLDIERS?

Introduction

The shifting status of women as Canadian citizens is shaped by claims of sameness and difference. Canadian society has long struggled with ways to reconcile the tension between the differences between men and women. Prior to the 1970s, the public policy solution was to concentrate on the differences between men and women. Differences in this context, were often used as indicators of women's inferiority, cultivating a second-class citizenship among women. The policies and practices of the CF reflected this strategy. During early campaigns for enfranchisement, advocates for women concentrated on the localized responsibilities of women. This resulted in women gaining the responsibilities of citizenship without enjoying the full citizenship rights. The second mobilization of women, which began in the 1960s, concentrated on the rights of women. By the early 1970s, legislation began to change as the "women's liberation movement" challenged the limitations placed on the citizenship of women. In this period, the women's liberation movement in Canada developed in a pattern distinct from its American counterparts. Canadian feminists mobilized to achieve equality through cooperation with (and pressure on) the federal government.¹⁰⁶ The articulation of women's demands for equal status and an improved position in society came with the 1972 Report of the Royal Commission on the Status of Women in Canada. The focus of this report, as well as advocates of equal rights across the country, was sameness. This "sameness" strategy was eventually used to expand the definition of the citizen-soldier to

allow women to participate more fully in the CF. The CF was forced to adhere to legal measures geared to the equality of the sexes; however, the underlying attitudes towards the differences between the sexes remained unchallenged, despite sweeping changes in the 1970s and 1980s. The argument of this chapter is that while the nature of women's citizenship in Canada changed during the 1980s and 1990s, rigid gender constructs remained unchallenged in the CF. Propelled by changes in Canadian society, the official CF policy was amended to recognize equality between the sexes, however, women continued to be treated differently in the day-to-day life of the CF. Women were cast as the weaker sex and, therefore, as less efficient soldiers who threatened the capability of the force. The CF, through its policy of sameness, did nothing to challenge this belief, and therefore, undermined its own attempts to integrate women within its ranks.

Theoretical Context

"We should not expect men to relinquish their privileged positions voluntarily. Organizations, whether we are talking about banks, and businesses, armies, universities, hospitals or city councils are significant concentrations of power."¹⁰⁷ The question for feminists then has never been the necessity of challenging men for equality, but rather, on what grounds this challenge should be made. Probably the most effective challenge in the Canadian state has been launched by liberal feminists because Canadian feminism developed in cooperation with the Canadian state. The success of this challenge has a lot to do with the nature of liberal feminism itself and with the Canadian State. The focus of

¹⁰⁶ Jill Vickers, Pauline Rankin, Christine Appelle. Politics as if Women Mattered: A Political Analysis of the National Action Committee on the Status of Women. (Toronto: The University of Toronto Press Inc. 1993) 30

¹⁰⁷ Cockburn. In the Way of Women. 17

liberal feminism has been on the changing or removing of laws that discriminate against women as persons¹⁰⁸ and in the early stages of the second feminist mobilization, the Canadian State appeared most accommodating to the feminist's interests. In 1967, the government ordered a Royal Commission to study the status of women. The Commission made its report to Parliament in 1970 which included 167 recommendations, 122 of which were defined exclusively in terms of federal responsibility.¹⁰⁹ Women were integrated into government policy-making processes, first by the appointment of a Co-ordinator on the Status of Women in the Privy Council Office (1970), then a Minister Responsible for the Status of Women (1971), and finally, with the establishment a permanent Advisory Council on the Status of Women (1973). In 1976, the Advisory Council was granted departmental status, and Cabinet ministers were directed to integrate "status of women interests" into all departmental agendas.¹¹⁰ The consequence of cooperation with the government was that many feminists found themselves specializing in advisory and lobbying, and "liberal feminism became the 'public face' of the women's movement."¹¹¹

The weakness of the brand of liberal feminism (i.e. sameness feminism) successfully adopted in this period, however, was that it did not allow women to pursue equality on the basis of difference. It required that all women become disembodied, stripped of their gender to become citizens, unencumbered by the limitations of gender, race, ethnicity, or sexual orientation. The absence of a place for women to seek equality as *women* meant that they were forced to seek equality with men by *becoming surrogate*

¹⁰⁸ Cockburn, *In the Way of Women*, 19

¹⁰⁹ Sue Findlay, "Feminist Struggles with the Canadian State: 1966-1988." *Feminist Perspectives on the Canadian State*, 5

¹¹⁰ Findlay, 7

men.¹¹² By seeking equality on the same grounds as men, liberal feminists have been proven incapable of addressing the structural inequalities of citizenship, or of challenging pre-existing gender norms, which have historically contributed to the subordination of women:

From the Declarations of the Rights of Man in 1789 to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights in 1948,...rights to equality have been conceived as those of 'the citizen', without specifying sex. That this has in effect meant men, not women, is evident in the fact, for instance that many kinds of violence against women are not considered a violation of human rights under existing international law and enforced prostitution has never been accepted as falling within the scope of the United Nations conventions outlawing slavery.¹¹³

The problem with this gender-neutral approach can be seen in policy outcomes: "what we are faced with now is a government that has institutionalized the representation of feminist issues: that is, it has integrated women's issues in the 'unequal' structure of representation that is the basis of the policy making process."¹¹⁴ Feminist policies for change have been either misinterpreted or interpreted in such a shallow manner as to completely divorce them from the experiences of women. The result has been continued legal and economic inequalities between men and women:

The traditional insistence on viewing equality between men and women as 'sameness' clashed with the concept of equality which recognizes power imbalance and seeks to redress it. Under the equality of opportunity – or the sameness – approach, women and men are to be treated equally and given the same opportunities unless there is women reasonable justification to do otherwise.¹¹⁵

According to Carole Pateman, the inequality of women cannot be addressed by simply altering legislation, because at the root of the subordination of women is the social

¹¹¹ Findlay. 7

¹¹² Cockburn. *In the Way of Women*. 21

¹¹³ Cockburn. *In the Way of Women*. 21

¹¹⁴ Findlay. 7

contract. The social contract is central to the classical models of liberalism. This contract was freely entered into by all European men and was the means of destroying feudalism and undermining the patriarchal relations between master and servant, thereby guaranteeing men their inherent freedom as persons.¹¹⁶ Conspicuous in their absence from this contract are women. Pateman argues that in classic contract theory only men are individuals, and therefore, only men are born free:

Women are not born free; women have no natural freedom. The classic pictures of the state of nature also contain an order of subjection – between men and women. With the exception of Hobbes, the classic theorists claim that women naturally lack the attributes and capacities of ‘individuals’. Sexual difference is political difference; sexual difference is the difference between freedom and subjection.¹¹⁷

At the birth of the social contract, women’s subjection had already been negotiated in what Pateman calls the sexual contract. This contract ensured the dominance of men through the control of women’s bodies:

Men’s domination over women, and the right of men to enjoy sexual access to women is at issue in the making of the original pact. The social contract is a story of freedom; the sexual contract is a story of subjection. ...The original pact is a sexual as well as social contract: it is sexual in the sense of patriarchal – that is, the contract establishes men’s political right over women - and also sexual in the sense of establishing orderly access by men to women’s bodies. The original contract creates what I shall call, following Adrienne Rich, ‘the law of male sex-right’. Contract is far from being opposed to patriarchy; contract is the means through which modern patriarchy is constituted.¹¹⁸

It is therefore impossible to liberate women through the altering of the social contract to include women as individuals, without challenging the sexual contract, which continues to deny women their personhood. This denial is underscored in granting

¹¹⁵ Margaret Buist. “Elusive Equality: Women and the Charter of Rights and Freedoms.” Feminist Perspective on the Canadian State. 104

¹¹⁶ Pateman. 5, 6

¹¹⁷ Pateman. 6

women citizenship on the basis of gender-neutrality, not on their status as women and persons.

It is therefore necessary to use a theoretical model, which recognizes the differences of women as necessary, in order to discuss their full integration into society as equals. Continuing to predicate the military service of women based on their status as the same as men, will only reinforce perceptions of difference *as* inferiority. This does not mean that standards for battle readiness should be weakened or that different physical standards should be created for men and for women. High uniform standards are needed for physical survival, for the morale of the units, and to ensure that women soldiers get the respect they deserve. These standards must, however, be based on real needs, not on inappropriate perceptions of physical prowess that are arbitrarily derived from the specific experiences and identities of men. The *specific* challenges facing women entering all-male units for the first time, challenges that may make their experience more difficult than that of men entering that unit, require attention.

A New CF Policy

The institutional context of the post-war CF is crucial to the understanding and evaluation of the CF's policy of gender integration. The start of the Cold War, and Canada's subsequent entrance into military alliances meant that a return to pre-World War II predominantly reserve armed service was impossible. The CF began a shift towards a more Americanized and professional large permanent military force. Professionalization is evident in the statistic, that despite the 20 000 men who served in

¹¹⁸ Pateman. 2

the Korean Conflict, not one militia regiment was mobilized.¹¹⁹ This is not to suggest that these men were already serving in the newly dubbed Regular Force at the beginning of the conflict, many were not. It is meant to draw attention to the fact, that for the first time in history, men were recruited and trained for war exclusively through the professional full-time military. For those serving in the CF, the move away from militia based military service, resulted in a weakening of the connection between citizenship and military service, while enhancing exclusivity of military service and thereby, unintentionally, the masculine identity of those serving. The Korean Conflict was not fought by Canadian citizen-soldiers, but by a professional Canadian military.

While the CF was entrenching its masculine and exclusive identity, Canadian society began a slow and sometimes turbulent shift towards a more inclusive citizenry. Despite the professionalization of the CF, the connection between citizenship and soldiering remained strong in Canadian society and, as the post war period progressed, previously excluded groups began to agitate for inclusion into full Canadian citizenship.

Women as the Weak Link

When women were first enrolled into the CF during both the World War II and the Korean Conflicts, their difference from men was central to their terms of service. For the men of the military and the Canadian Government in this period, the primary roles of women were wives and mothers, and these roles were not to be combined with paid work, except in the most dire of circumstances.¹²⁰ The military service of women continued to be predicated on this ideology well into the 1970s. During this period, women were enrolled in separate divisions. Their training involved very few military skills, and instead included lectures on poise, etiquette and hair care. Even their uniforms

¹¹⁹ Morton. A Military History of Canada. 233

were designed to emphasize femininity. Only women between the ages of eighteen to forty-five were permitted to enroll. Single women were preferred. However, married women were permitted to join during WWII, as long as they did not have children. Those servicewomen that married or became pregnant during their period of service were immediately released. Finally, service women were restricted to “non-combat related trades,” which translated into roughly nineteen percent of the total number of trades in the CF.¹²¹

During the war, the women in the CWACs, the WDs and RWCNS were subjected to a whisper campaign aimed directly at their morality and character. It was alleged by the men of the CF that all women serving in the Canadian war effort were “women of loose morals.”¹²² There were several possible explanations for the nature of these allegations; however, they all had their roots in the challenge to military definition of masculinity offered by women in uniform. The concept of masculinity was then and continues to be today, dependent in part on the concept of femininity to which it was opposed, and these women challenged both. Military service had been the domain of men and remained linked to proving one’s status as a man. The presence of women within the organization called into question the masculinity of the men in the trades that the women occupied. Like the men in other traditionally male dominated occupations, a significant part of their gender identity was based on the belief that women cannot do the work they performed. The presence of women in the clerical trades therefore undermined

¹²⁰ Lieutenant(N) K.D. Davis. “Women and Military Service in Canada: 1885-Present.” (CFPARU: June 1996)

¹²¹ L. Tanner. “Gender Integration in the Canadian Forces – A Quantitative and Qualitative Analysis.” (Ottawa: DND. 1999) 4

¹²² Pearson. 169-187

this belief and lowered the status of the male soldiers in clerical and medical trades.¹²³ In short, the whisper campaign was as much about negotiating masculinity as it was about enforcing standards of “feminine” actions. World War II created two legacies for women in Canadian military service, neither of which has ever been properly addressed by the leadership of the CF. The first legacy is, that while the whisper campaign in Canada was not as widespread or as damaging as the one carried out in the U.S., it set a precedent for tolerating the objectification and harassment of women in the CF. The second is the attitude that women are lesser soldiers compared to men, illustrated by the fact that at the close of the war, women veterans did not receive the same benefits or recognition as their male counterparts.

In 1945, after the cessation of conflict in Europe, the Canadian Government disbanded the three women’s services. Prior to their release, the women were given classes in home economics and child-care in order to ensure a smooth transition back into civilian life. Women were not enrolled in the CF again until the Korean conflict. Despite the rather lethargic implementation of women’s service during the Korean Conflict by the Canadian government, there were over 5 000 women serving in traditional trades at the close of the conflict.¹²⁴ While the close of the war did not result in the total disbanding of the separate services for women, the majority of women serving had to be released as each service was permitted to establish its own limits on the number of women it would employ.

¹²³ Gillian Crease *Contracting Masculinity: Gender, Class and Race in White Collar Unions 1944-1994*. (Toronto: Oxford University Press 1999) 13

¹²⁴ Tanner. 4

Women served in the CF between 1955 and 1968 at the pleasure of Parliament and to say that women did not have the support of the CF leadership would be a fair assertion. After the Korean Conflict, the Royal Canadian Air Force established a ceiling of 2 500 women, while the Navy and Army were even more reticent to employ women setting ceilings at 400 and 90 women respectively.¹²⁵ The Air Force terminated its recruitment in 1963 and the number of women serving fell to 500. In 1965 the Canadian Government set a ceiling of 1 500 women for all three services, which at the time represented 1.5% of the total force.¹²⁶ These restrictions were justified within the CF by the formal prohibition against posting women in combat zones, and therefore necessary for the combat readiness of the CF.

The terms of service for women during this period were even more restrictive than during the Second World War. Married women were not recruited at all, pregnancy or marriage resulted in release, initial engagement contracts were for a shorter period of time than those of men, pension benefits were less than those received by men and finally subsidized education for officers was not available for female officers.¹²⁷ Even the amalgamation of the three commands, the Air Force, the Navy and the Army and the official recognition of the right of women to participate in military service through the dissolution of separate services for women did nothing to effect changes to the policy of military service for women in Canada.

Concentration on sexual difference resulted in limitations in career opportunities for women, as well as extra expenses to the CF. Between 1955 and 1971, women served as radio operators, administrative clerks, nursing assistants, x-ray technicians, finance

¹²⁵ Tanner. 4

¹²⁶ Tanner. 4

clerks, personnel and defence coordinators, teletype operators, dental assistants and supply technicians. Women were placed in trades where there could be a high enough concentration that there would be at least thirty-five women on a base in order to justify the expense of special quarters, facilities and supervision. Trades that required expensive or long-term training were closed to women, as they were not expected to make a career out of the military. Further prohibitions on women in the field or at sea resulted in lower eligibility for promotions.¹²⁸ These expectations were so effectively enforced, that at the time of the Royal Commission on the Status of Women in Canada (1972), of the 1 600 women in the CF only 450 had more than ten years of service.¹²⁹ The Canadian government tolerated the CF's activities, partly on the basis of formal legal and constitutional limitations on the formal equality of women.¹³⁰

Gender Sameness on Trial

By the 1960s, Canadian citizenship was becoming more inclusive. Women, First Nations and linguistic/ visible minorities in Canada began to pressure for more equitable treatment under the law and formal recognition under the Constitution.¹³¹ For women, these demands translated into The Royal Canadian Commission on the Status of Women, which convened in 1967. In 1972, The Royal Commission on the Status of Women tabled its report. At the time of the Commission there were 1600 women in the CF, of which 1 082 were NCMs, with the remaining 529 as officers. Of the 529 women

¹²⁷ Tanner. 5

¹²⁸ Tanner. 4 Davis "Women and Military Service in Canada." (1996) 14

¹²⁹ The Report of the Royal Commission on The Status of Women in Canada. (Ottawa: Information Canada. 1970) 136

¹³⁰ Davis. "Women and Military Service in Canada." (1996) 17

¹³¹ Cairns. 112

officers, 400 were nurses.¹³² Within the Report, the Commission made six recommendations with regard to the military service of women in Canada. These recommendations were as follows:

- a. The elimination of the restrictions on recruiting married women;
- b. Equal initial engagement periods for men and women;
- c. Retention of pregnant service women;
- d. Equal pension benefits;
- e. Opening of all occupations to women; and
- f. Opening military colleges to women.¹³³

These recommendations were rooted in liberalism. In the Commission's mind, there were no real differences between men and women, each made their decisions based on reason and rationality. Men and women were equally rational individuals, and therefore there was no justification for institutional impediments to women becoming full citizens. For the Royal Commission and other liberal feminists, full citizenship meant the unqualified right to participate fully in military service, based on capability and desire. As previously suggested, Canadian feminists viewed the state as not only a legitimate means of effecting change, but as having a responsibility to ensure these changes were made. This was the first time the government faced a challenge to the military service of women based on their claim of "sameness to men."

As a result of these claims, in concert with the Bill of Rights (1960), the prohibition on recruiting married women and the release of pregnant women was rescinded in 1971. In the next four years, the CF removed the 1 500 woman ceiling,

¹³² The Report of the Royal Commission on The Status of Women in Canada. (Ottawa: Information Canada. 1970) 134

opened subsidized civilian education through the Regular Officer Training Plan, and standardized enrollment periods and pension benefits for both men and women. Following these measures and an extensive review of military classifications by military experts, the CF opened roughly 66 percent of all officer and non-commissioned classifications in the CF to women. The result was that the representation of women rose from 1.5 percent in 1968 to 5.9 percent in 1978.¹³⁴

In March 1978, the Canadian Human Rights Act was proclaimed. The Act prohibited any employer to discriminate against potential employees on the basis of race, national or ethnic origin, colour, religion, age, sex, marital status, family status, pardoned conviction or disability. The Act permitted exclusion only on the basis of “bona fide” occupational requirements. The liberal definition of equality and citizenship was further entrenched when the Canadian Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms (1982) was adopted as part of the new Canadian Constitution. Social and government pressure concerning the combat related restriction on the employment of women prompted the CF to launch its first extensive study into the effects of the expansion of military service for women. Servicewomen in Non-Traditional Environments and Roles (SWINTER) was a six-year study of women’s employment in areas traditionally closed to them because of their proximity to combat. At the time of the SWINTER trials, combat trades, combat support trades, and combat service support trades were closed to women, as well as isolated postings such as CFS Alert.

The goals of SWINTER were outlined as the following:

- a. Comparing the individual effectiveness of service women versus servicemen for representative work at trial units;

¹³³ Vivian.

¹³⁴ Vivian. 4

- b. Comparing the effectiveness of groups of servicewomen versus similar groups of service men and of integrated groups versus all male groups for representative work at trial units;
- c. Assessing the behavioral and sociological impact of servicewomen on trial units, including the sociological impact, if any, on the immediate families of personnel at trial units;
- d. Assessing the degree of acceptance of the public and our allies for the employment of servicewomen in non-traditional roles and environments; and
- e. Examining the resource implications of the expanded participation of servicewomen in the Canadian Forces.¹³⁵

The nature of the objectives established for the trials clearly indicates that while the government was moving towards establishing the citizenship of women on the basis of “sameness,” the CF still held an understanding of women and their military service predicated on difference equated with inferiority. These perceived gender differences were used to legitimize the restrictions on the service of women.¹³⁶

Although this study covered women placed in non-traditional areas in the Army, Navy and Air Force as well as women stationed at CFS Alert on the tip of Ellesmere Island in the high arctic, only the results of those women placed in land environments are evaluated here. The Army Command decided that women would not be integrated in either combat support units (such as Communications Squadrons) or combat arms units

¹³⁵ Vivian. 6

¹³⁶ These social or gender differences were and continue to be used in a circular manner as a means of justifying further social restrictions. In the case of the CF, the perception of gender difference created restrictions on the military service of women and the restrictions on the military service of women reinforced the perception of gender differences: “To the extent that these references establish distributions of power (differential control over or access to material and symbolic resources), gender becomes implicated in the conception and construction of power itself.

The French anthropologist Maurice Godelier has put it this way: ‘it is not sexuality which haunts society, but society which haunts the body’s sexuality. Sex-related differences between bodies are continually summoned as testimony to social relations and phenomena that have nothing to do with sexuality. Not only as testimony to, but also testimony for – in other words, as legitimization.’ Scott. 1069

(such as infantry units). Instead, the trial would involve only combat service support units (CSS). The land portion of the trial commenced in 1978, with the employment of seventy-two women in “near combat” positions at 4 Canadian Mechanized Brigade Group (4 CMBG) in Germany. Of the seventy-two women, fifty-five served with 4 Service Battalion (4 SVC BN) and the remaining seventeen served with 4 Field Ambulance (4 FLD AMB).¹³⁷ Career managers chose the most qualified women, but the women were given the option of declining the posting. The CF conducted two studies. The first was a Social/ Behavioural Science (SBS) study, to assess the social/behavioural impact that the presence of women would have on a combat service support unit. The second was a study based on both the SBS report and the annual reports of the COs of the two regiments involved in the study. At the close of the trials in 1984, these reports deemed the SWINTER Trials unsuccessful.

The SBS report, tabled first, saw far more potential for the integration of women than the final Land Staff report. While the SBS report found that women’s integration had been unsuccessful, it attributed this lack of success to the poor selection of women and to the very vocal dissent against the presence of women.¹³⁸ Furthermore, the “trial” nature of the employment of women, led to the impression that the CF leadership was not in full support of the presence of women in field units, undermining the legitimacy of the trials themselves. To gain the support of their male counterparts, the women needed to be seen to have the support of the CF leadership.¹³⁹

¹³⁷ Vivian.

¹³⁸ Major R.E. Park. “Final Report of the Social/ Behavioural Science Evaluation of the Final SWINTER Land Trial.” Research Report 85-1 (Ottawa: DND April 1985) 47

¹³⁹ Park. 48

The women participating in the trial complained of being isolated and being improperly prepared physically and/or mentally for life in a CSS unit. An even more disturbing result of the trial was that the presence of women in CSS units did nothing to challenge the ideology of the men, who were against the presence of women in CSS positions prior to the beginning of the trial. This was possibly a result of the poor selection and preparation of the women trial members for life in a field unit. Despite the fish-bowl effect, and the often-unwelcome feelings many women reported experiencing in these field units, the SBS report found that operational effectiveness had not been adversely affected. They based this finding on the final questionnaire of the trial, in which roughly 50% of the men said that they accepted the presence of women in CSS positions. It is interesting to note that 4 FLD AMB had marginally more success in integrating women into the unit, causing speculation that the historic connection between women and care-giving could be transferred, even into combat related circumstances. Therefore, the SBS report concluded that women could be employed effectively in CSS positions.¹⁴⁰

With an eye to the social tensions experienced during the SWINTER trials, the report made a series of recommendations that would encourage the integration of women into CSS positions. These policy recommendations were as follows:

- a. A requirement exists to officially identify the liability of servicewomen for combat duties.
- b. If it is determined that women be equally liable for combat duties, the regular postings of servicewomen in applicable trades to land units should support such a commitment.
- c. Leaders responsible for supervising men and women require specific additional training. This training should emphasize the importance of the leadership role in facilitating gender integration, and how to differentiate

¹⁴⁰ Park. iii

between stereotypes and observations which more accurately describe persons and situations.

- d. Clear CF policies and operating procedures should be outlined on how supervisors are to deal with fraternization, sexual harassment, and pregnancy within mixed-gender units.
- e. The socialization of women to prepare them for employment in the land environment must begin at the recruitment stage. This preparation should include informing potential applicants of their liability for serving in field units.
- f. The principle of preparedness through proper selection applies also to the implementation of realistic and appropriate physical selection standards.
- g. Additional environmental and fitness training may be necessary for both servicemen and servicewomen.¹⁴¹

None of these recommendations was followed immediately. It was not until well into the 1990s that any were implemented, and the final three recommendations remain unaddressed in present-day CF policy.

The Land Forces report had a less encouraging interpretation of the trial. Citing women as a direct threat to the operational effectiveness of any unit, the Army leadership recommended that CSS trades remain closed to women. The final report concluded:

Female trial participants proved as skilled and capable as men in non-physically demanding trades, however, the majority were less capable of performing many of the essential and physical general tasks required of every combat soldier on the battlefield. In many cases, such jobs could either not be completed by servicewomen or the completion time for the job was unacceptably extended. This then frequently resulted in service men either voluntarily or being ordered to assist servicewomen. In many cases, the male leaders purposely avoided giving servicewomen the more physically demanding and dirty tasks. All of this resulted in a loss of morale and operational efficiency. Accordingly, it would appear that the employment of servicewomen in combat service support unit would lower the effectiveness of that unit by degrees. The more women in the organization, the less operationally effective the unit will be.¹⁴²

The Army could not have been more clear about its meaning. The threat that women posed to operational effectiveness was based on their proposed weaknesses as

¹⁴¹ Park. 54

soldiers. According to the Land Forces report, the women on the trial were unable to work together, or within mixed gender groups, and were incapable of completing the physical requirements of soldiering. The study made no mention of the possibly hostile attitudes of men towards women in CSS positions or of any effect these attitudes could have had on the women in the study. Also, the inexperience of women in fieldcraft, the inappropriate selection of candidates by career managers and the poor design of equipment for women were not of concern to the Army leadership.¹⁴³

The only male attitudes discussed were the attitudes of the NATO allies. In general, the CF concluded the allies were not ready for women in combat: "the [Allies] had reason for feeling that women were a joke. Many of the Canadian servicewomen refused to perform sentry duty alone because they were terrified that they might be taken prisoner."¹⁴⁴ The report never specifies how many women actually refused to perform sentry duty; however, earlier in the text, only two women were cited as being unwilling to perform this duty.¹⁴⁵

The attitudes portrayed in this report exemplified the unwillingness of the Army to accept that the poor performance of women in a field unit could be related to the organization of the institution. The problems experienced by women were the responsibility of the women experiencing them, and the inability of women to conform to

¹⁴² "Final Land Forces Report on the Trial of Servicewomen in Non-Traditional Roles and Environments (SWINTER)" (Ottawa: DND December 1985)

¹⁴³ None of the women in the trial had ever participated in field exercises in their careers. Despite this fact the Report continued to compare their field craft to that of men with far more professional experience. Also, although much was made of the selection of only 'qualified' candidates, the presence of women who were obese or afraid of the dark would seem to indicate that it is unlikely that these candidates were selected with any sense of what life in the field would be like. Park.

¹⁴⁴ Final Land Forces Report (SWINTER Trial) Annex E-3

¹⁴⁵ Final Land Forces Report (SWINTER Trial) Annex A 11-b

the male norm.¹⁴⁶ According to Joan Eveline, the existence of the advantage to the male standard at work is rooted in the very designation of certain jobs as men's work. Often legislation implemented to ensure the presence of disadvantaged groups within the trade, serves only to normalize the pre-existing male standard, while entrenching the "otherness" of the disadvantaged group. This was the case with the SWINTER Trials. Women's presence as part of a trial reinforced their status as the "other," at the same time as normalizing the existing qualification of CSS positions as the job of a man.

According to the Land Forces report, women were not only incapable of dealing with the physical and mental demands of the field, they often lacked the requisite "team-spirit" to be become integrated into the section.¹⁴⁷ This observation contradicted the SBS report, which cited the attitudes of men as the main impediment to women becoming fully integrated into a combat section. It also failed to acknowledge any legitimate reason for tensions in the section. Again, the failure to acknowledge the possible implications of hostile male attitudes was a dangerous oversight on the part of the Land Forces leadership. In so doing, the leadership failed to recognize that a hostile work environment not only drives women out of the field but actually produces and reinforces the attitude that women are inferior and unable to cope in a man's work environment. On the other hand, women in the trials understood that behind the "symbolism of masculine job descriptions lies a very real force: the power of men to harass, belittle, ostracise, dismiss, marginalise, discard and just plain hurt them..."¹⁴⁸

The poor performance by women in the trials was attributed to three factors. The first was that the women were not properly prepared mentally or physically to work

¹⁴⁶ Eveline.

¹⁴⁷ Final Land Forces Report (SWINTER Trials)

effectively in a field unit “without putting undue burden on other members of the unit.”¹⁴⁹

As these women were chosen by their career managers and did not volunteer, it was unfair to fault the women for not having a proper grasp of what life was like in a field unit. The CF’s claim to have chosen only the ‘most qualified women’ for the trials was undermined by SWINTER reports of women who were afraid of the dark.

The second area of concern, directly tied to the first, is that the women and men in the study were unprepared for work in a mixed-gender environment. The report did not acknowledge the claims of women who felt there was no way they could have fit in. Women in the SBS report complained that if they acted masculine they were deemed to be faking it, and if they acted feminine they were perceived to be weak. Many felt that they were in a no-win situation. The women of SWINTER believed that it did not matter what their strengths were as individuals or as a group, their physical differences preoccupied the men in their sections.¹⁵⁰

The confusion about how women should act relates to the construction of both femininity and masculinity in the CF. Women entering formerly exclusively male enclave of the CSS challenged the pre-existing gender division of that form of labour. Therefore, they not only challenged the limits of their own femininity, but also blurred the boundaries of masculinity. The legitimization of war has long relied on direct appeals of manhood and by connecting the strength of the nation to the masculinity of its male subjects. Women’s presence in near combat positions challenged this position of power

¹⁴⁸ Eveline.

¹⁴⁹ Vivian. 7

¹⁵⁰ Park. 7, 42

for masculinity, and in doing so, the entire power basis of the gender hierarchy in the CF.¹⁵¹

Finally, there was little reason given to either the men or the women for the need to establish a working relationship or a properly integrated work environment.¹⁵² This can be directly related to the attitude of the leadership and to its obvious non-commitment to the presence of women in near-combat positions. The report faulted the inability of women to cooperate with each other or with men, but did nothing to address the possibly of structural barriers within the battalions.

The conclusions of the Land Forces trial are thus reflections of the bias in the objectives of the study. Women's presence was seen to impede operational effectiveness based women's supposed inability to cope with life in a "man's environment." These trials did nothing to challenge stereotypes of women as weaker members, due to inadequate training and improper selection of female candidates. Rather, they reinforced these beliefs for many men. At the heart of this failure was the CF's endorsement of an equality strategy rooted in "sameness." In intense physical situations, it is impossible to ignore the obvious physical differences between men and women. If the only standards informing judgments were those based on real operational needs, and if all soldiers in a unit met these standards, then, the physical differences between men and women would have been irrelevant. However, by attempting to force women to adhere to a model of "soldier" that involved "masculine" characteristics not required for operational effectiveness, the CF reinforced and indeed over emphasized physiological differences between men and women. These differences were then constructed as weaknesses, and

¹⁵¹ Scott. 1073

¹⁵² Vivian. 7

the idea of women serving in near combat positions was dismissed as a joke. The final SWINTER report from the Land Forces Command was tabled in 1986 and recommended that “servicewomen not be eligible to serve in land element second line combat service support units.”¹⁵³ The Army made one final recommendation and warning to those pressuring for the integration of women:

Acceptance of this recommendation also implies the continued exclusion of women from serving in army combat support units and army combat arms units. If this recommendation to continue to exclude servicewomen from all army combat units is not approved, and then it is recommended that change, or progress, occur in a gradual and methodical manner. To do otherwise, such as to immediately open all army combat units to servicewomen, would jeopardize rather than enhance the successful implementation of change. The development of a plan for such change should be the responsibility of the army.¹⁵⁴

The threat underlying this recommendation is obvious. The Army would not tolerate further civilian interference with regards to the employment of women. Government policies out of step with army doctrine would result in retaliation.

An Equal Opportunity Employer

This recommendation, however, was not in keeping with the changing political climate in Canada and was overturned by the Charter Task Force, which tabled its report in September 1986. The report of the task force was based on Section 15 of the Canadian Charter of Human Right and Freedoms, as well as a Parliamentary Sub-Committee report “Equity for All”, submitted to the Government in October 1985. Although the Task Force did maintain the prohibition against women serving in combat arms occupations (citing threats to operational effectiveness), it removed the restriction against women serving in second line service and medical battalions. The result was that 75% of trades

¹⁵³ Vivian. 9

in the CF became open to women.¹⁵⁵ However, the Charter Task Force in its own decisions left room for criticism and discrediting of the decision. By suggesting that the presence of women represented a threat to operational effectiveness in combat arms, but not in Combat Service Support, the Task Force ignored the fact that second line battalions could be used as combat units in the event of an enemy incursion. The continuing prohibition and reaffirmation of the threat women posed to operational effectiveness in combat arms fundamentally undermined the position of women in second line positions.

Pressure to prove the “bona fide” occupational requirement of the exclusion of women from combat mounted and the Army commissioned another study. Combat Related Employment of Women (CREW) was scheduled to begin trials involving women in combat arms trades in 1989 as a result of the Charter Task Force recommendation. These trials were to include a substantial number of volunteer women in combat arms training and battalion life.

However, the trials were pre-empted by Canadian Armed Forces v. Gauthier decision. This court case was launched on the complaint of five men and women alleging discrimination by the CF on the basis of their sex, two of who settled out of court prior to the trial date. Of the three that remained, their complaints were the following. Isabelle Gauthier, a reserve administration clerk who was denied a transfer to the Regiment De Hull because the regiment had already reached its 10% quota for female personnel, made the first complaint. The second was by Steven Houlden, a retired regular force pilot who claimed it was discrimination to permit only male pilots to fly

¹⁵⁴ Final Land Forces Report (SWINTER Trials) 9

¹⁵⁵ Vivian. 10

into combat missions. The Tribunal did not deal with Houlden's case as the Air Force had removed all restrictions on women flying combat missions in 1987, based on successful SWINTER Trials. The final complainant was Marie-Claude Gauthier, who alleged that although she had met the training requirement for a marine engineering technician, the trade was not open to women because it would require sea time for both training and career progression.¹⁵⁶ The formal trial began on 11 June 1986 and the final decision was rendered on 20 February 1989.

The challenge of the women was against the policy of minimum male requirements (MMR). The MMR policy was the result of the CF prohibition on women in combat. By allowing only men in combat, any trade would have to have a minimum number of men who could be deployed in an operational setting in the event of an eruption of hostilities. It was the MMR policy that restricted Gauthier from being enrolled in the Regiment de Hull, because it had already reached its maximum complement of women. What the MMR meant to women serving in the CF was that of the fifty-five trades with an MMR, the requirement inevitably ensured the MOC was dominated by men: "even in the administrative clerk occupation, where the original MMR was 50% of the total established positions, and is now 32% [the number was lowered based on the new liability of women to serve in CSS positions after SWINTER], males occupy 68% of the total positions."¹⁵⁷ The MMR was the very practical application of the attitude of the CF toward threat that women posed to operational

¹⁵⁶ Canadian Human Right Tribunal Decision: Gauthier vs. the Canadian Armed Forces. Para 3&4

¹⁵⁷ Canadian Human Right Tribunal Decision: Gauthier vs. the Canadian Armed Forces. Para 11

effectiveness: that the number of women increased, operational capabilities were decreased in direct proportion to the number of women.¹⁵⁸

The Tribunal did not accept the CF's understanding of the threat that women posed to military preparation. In its final decision, the Canadian Human Rights Tribunal found no evidence that the prohibition against women serving in Combat Arms was based on a "bona fide" occupational requirement. Furthermore, they could find no proof that enrolling women in combat trades would result in a threat to operational effectiveness and, therefore, would represent a detriment to national security:

Occupational selection standards, the removal of all restrictions against women in the air force, the commitment to CREW trials focused on women in actual combat units and environments, are all evidence that on the face of it a number of individuals in the Forces and outside observers believed that the preference for men could no longer be [a] salient feature of employment. No doubt, there are those who honestly believe the full integration of the women into the military is an idea whose time has come and those who equally honestly believe that the risks of integration have not yet been disproved. Our conclusion is that the occupational requirement no longer has adequate evidence to sustain it. We must, therefore, find that the present policy of the [CF] in designating certain specific occupations and units as male only is a discriminatory practice.¹⁵⁹

The Tribunal ordered the CF to remove all formal restrictions on the full integration of women into the CF, with the exception of service on submarines.¹⁶⁰ The CREW trials were to continue; however, they were to be used not as trials, but as a plan for the full integration of women into the CF. The Tribunal also ordered that an external monitoring body be established to regulate and direct the integration policy for the CF, to ensure that "[f]ull integration [takes] place with all due speed, as a matter of principle and as a matter

¹⁵⁸ Final Land Report (SWINTER Trials.) 6

¹⁵⁹ Canadian Human Rights Tribunal Decision: *Gauthier vs. the Canadian Armed Forces*. Para 64

¹⁶⁰ Maritime Command rescinded the restriction on women serving on submarines in April 2001. The integration of women into the sub-mariner trades marks the removal of all official gender based restriction on military service in Canada.

or practice, for both active and reserve forces.”¹⁶¹ The Tribunal gave the CF ten years to integrate women. However, it did not define full integration. Nor did it define the consequences should the military fail to meet this objective.

The CF, for its part, complied with the letter of the decision and immediately removed all formal restrictions to the participation of women in all trades of the CF. However, the Army leadership made limited efforts to implement any of the recommendations of the SSB SWINTER report to ease women’s integration. Since, in 1998, women only comprised 11% of the total force and less than 1% of combat arms NCMs and 3% of combat arms officers,¹⁶² these attitudes clearly had a significant impact on the success of women in the combat arms. The full gender integration of the CF has been hampered by problems with training standards, equipment, discrimination, harassment and the CF’s questionable commitment to the task itself.

These issues are rooted partly in the conflict between sameness and difference, exacerbated in practice by the paternalistic and masculine culture of the combat arms. Officially, the Army adopted a policy of equality between the sexes in 1989. However, underlying discriminatory attitudes remain. In the CF, instead of an acceptance of high standards of physical and mental performance based solely and reasonably on operational needs, conceptions of “effective performance” remain entangled with conceptions of physique and personality that have traditionally been seen as characteristically masculine. Correspondingly, according to these assumptions, in order for a woman to be a soldier, she must abandon her socially assigned gender roles to conform to the masculine norm of the soldier. The CF and the Army did little to challenge this basic assumption in the

¹⁶¹ Canadian Human Right Tribunal Decision: *Gauthier vs. the Canadian Armed Forces*. Para 64

¹⁶² Tanner. 11,12,14

decade between 1989 and 1999. In fact, their reluctance to make the requisite changes to the kit carried by soldiers has served to reinforce gender stereotypes.

Nowhere is the commitment of the Army to gender integration more obvious than in the question of kit. As early as 1991, the Minister's Advisory Board on Women in the Canadian Forces (MABWCF) made formal recommendations that the kit and equipment issued to women be redesigned to suit women's bodies:

For one thing, the Board in its visits to over forty-five bases and installations has heard the same complaints over and over again from hundreds of women. Details were provided in our Second report last year and it is not our intention to add to our findings which were corroborated in our visits this year. Yet the representatives who met with us at our Annual Meeting in May 1993 declared a lack of awareness of the extent of complaints and questioned the validity of those they received directly.¹⁶³

The piece of kit most identified to be in urgent need of correction was the rucksack. To pass their basic infantry qualifications at both the officer and NCM levels, course candidates must be able to carry fifty-five pounds for thirteen kilometers in less than two hours and twenty minutes.¹⁶⁴ The task itself is difficult enough, but when the design of the pack is taken into consideration it becomes almost prohibitive. Initially the leadership of the Army denied the potential problems posed by the design of the rucksack.

However, it has recently acknowledged that the rucksack is ill designed for women. The frame itself is too large for the average woman's body, to say nothing of the fact that the design forces the wearer to bear all the weight of the pack on their shoulders -a muscle group where women are biologically differentiated from men. The weight-bearing design, coupled with weights that are proportionally more of the female body weight, has made

¹⁶³ "Minister's Advisory Board on Women in the Canadian Forces - 1992-1993 Annual Report." (Ottawa: Department of National Defence. 1993) 6a

¹⁶⁴ "Lessons Learned - Leadership in a Mixed Gender Environment." Dispatches, (1998) 21

the rucksack the most prohibitive piece of equipment to the full integration of women into the CF.

It is here that the CF adheres to the official doctrine of sameness between the sexes as the justification of the male norm. Many argue that to redesign the rucksack with concessions to physiological differences between the sexes would be granting women 'special treatment.' In the opinion of Army leadership, successful integration can only be achieved by treating men and women exactly the same.¹⁶⁵ Therefore, although the CF has launched an initiative to redesign the rucksack, the expressed objective is to make it 'smaller' for both the women and men who are of smaller stature.¹⁶⁶ In the case of the rucksack, the official 'sameness' policy of the Army serves to reinforce the unofficial preoccupation with differences. By not recognizing the physiological differences, the Army is reinforcing the belief of women as weaker and less efficient soldiers. It should be noted here again, that when I discuss the physiological differences between men and women I am not suggesting that women's differences equal weakness. They are just differences in the physical bodies of men and women.

The dangerous nature of femininity can also be seen in the recent redesign of the CF Distinctive Environmental Uniform. The uniform was altered with an eye to increased functionality. The 1993-94 Minister's Advisory Board on Gender Integration in the Canadian Forces (MABGICF) report suggested that the following:

The process of reconsideration should begin with a re-evaluation of the principles of uniform design as they relate to members of the CF. For example, in a general sense it is undoubtedly one of the aspirations of uniform/dress design that it present a professional, disciplined look that is functional. Given the reality of the Forces today, that look should emphasize the professional capacities of all members, rather than the small differences of gender. In this, the notion is that women's

¹⁶⁵ Final Land Forces Report (SWINTER Trial) Annex A-9c

¹⁶⁶ "Lessons Learned – Leadership in a Mixed Gender Environment." *Dispatches*. (1998) 31

uniforms should not be designed to ensure that female serving members look like 'ladies', or 'nicer' than men; nor should their uniform design sacrifice functionality to emphasize (or de-emphasize) body shape.¹⁶⁷

It was believed that the fit of the old uniforms was responsible for the increased instances of eating disorders among women at Canadian Forces Military Colleges. The expressed hope in the redesigned women's environmental uniform was to stem the tide of eating disorders among women at the military colleges. However, as nothing was done to correct the outlandish sizing charts (which puts a woman who wears a size fourteen in civilian sizes in a size twenty in terms of military sizes), the possibility of success for this initiative is limited. Furthermore, the text itself suggests a flaw in the ideology behind the redesign. It suggests that to look feminine is to look unprofessional, therefore in order to look professional one must look masculine, an argument which appeals to the traditional masculine/feminine dichotomy. The redesign of the uniform to look more professional, and therefore less feminine, underlines the assumption of CF leadership that to be a woman is to be unprofessional. It is exactly this attitude which is at the core of the problems with gender integration in the CF.

Conclusion

The CF and the Army, in particular, have failed to formally recognize the socially constructed gender and physiological differences between women and men, and to specify, clearly, situations where these must be taken into account, such as in training, in family relationships, in the provision of personal infrastructure, and the potential for excessive scrutiny or prejudice. This failure has undermined women entering all-male

¹⁶⁷ "Minister's Advisory Board on Gender Integration in the Canadian Forces – Annual Report 1993-1994" (Ottawa: Department of National Defence. 1994) 30

units for the first time and, has been compounded by the absence of clear uniform and evidence-based standards in judging performance. These failures on the part of the CF and the Army have resulted in limiting women's participation in the combat arms. As 1999 approached, the leadership of the CF began to pay closer attention to the limited number of women succeeding in combat training and the extreme difficulty the CF had in retaining those women who were successful. In 1996, the Army leadership commissioned Lt. (N) K.D. Davis to conduct a study into the training and retaining of women in the combat arms. These reports, as well as the most recent CF policies to assist in gender integration are evaluated in the next chapter.

CHAPTER THREE

ENTRENCHING THE MALE NORM

Introduction

Cursing under my breath, I tugged at my shoulder straps in a futile attempt to lift my webbing¹⁶⁸ into a more comfortable position. It had begun to rain heavily and the webbing seemed to grow heavier with each drop it absorbed. I had to admit I was beginning to question my sanity for proposing this form of research, then I looked up and caught the Section Commander smirking at me. "Want to join the infantry yet, Leading Seaman?" he asked.¹⁶⁹ I looked around at the rest of the section. They too were adjusting their equipment and hunching deeper into their raincoats. A few were preoccupied with their attempts to keep their cigarettes dry, but the majority of them were watching me.

I could understand why they would be curious. Women in the infantry are under intense scrutiny to start with, but when a clerk from the Naval Reserve arrives in the final week of training to do some "academic observations" about what life in the infantry is all about it is only natural that it would result in increased attention. The instructors and students had been informed that I was there to observe their training for my M.A. thesis about women in the infantry, which only served to pique their interest. Perhaps because they had more time in the trade, the instructors were particularly interested in my actions.¹⁷⁰

¹⁶⁸ Webbing is a set of pouches for carrying essential equipment, such as the canteen and ammunition. It is worn around the soldier's waist and is supported by a set of yoke suspenders as well as a belt.

¹⁶⁹ As well as being a MA student, I am currently a Leading Seaman in the Canadian Forces Naval Reserve.

¹⁷⁰ In the two weeks I spent observing infantry training courses in Meaford and Gagetown, they watched me as closely as I observed them. It is my hope that they found those two weeks as enlightening as I did.

Although the results of my field research are discussed in more detail later in the chapter, its broad findings inform the chapter's main argument. My field research demonstrates life in the infantry continues to be predicated on the masculine norm. The leadership of the CF has done little to challenge pre-existing gender norms or to explore the prohibitive nature of course training standards. Those women who have made it to the battalion face the attitude that they were pushed through their training in compliance with a political agenda. One result is that the attrition rate among women is almost four times higher than the attrition rate among men.¹⁷¹

This chapter argues that recognizing its failure to successfully integrate women into the combat arms and to retain those already trained, the CF continues to flounder in its attempts to address the problems faced by women in the infantry. To date, rather than being challenged, pre-existing gender stereotypes are reinforced by the solutions provided by the CF, which underscore the disproportionate responsibility women bear for social reproduction. The CF has attempted to treat the problems of gender integration via a series of initiatives, which treat the symptoms without addressing the dominance of the male norm. Directions to CF leaders to make accommodations for diversity so long as they do not impede operational effectiveness reinforces the norm. The suggestion that difference requires accommodation within limits implies, however, that those who do not conform to the norm threaten operational effectiveness. Without recognizing the physical and social differences between men and women, these differences will continue to be viewed as weaknesses instead of potential strengths and continue to undermine the claims of women to equality in the CF. The search for true equality requires challenging the mind-set that difference is equated with inferiority. The challenge inherent in the

¹⁷¹ Davis. "Understanding Women's Exit from the Canadian Forces."

recognition of difference is that the differences will be used to undermine claims to equality. If implemented properly, with a program that successfully challenges this understanding of difference, the long-term prospects for equality are significant.

Theoretical Context

Life in the infantry is hard, uncomfortable work in which one is exposed to the elements in every season of the year. Perhaps a more rational question is not, why women are not in the infantry, but rather why anyone is?

A large part of that answer has to be found in the association between work and masculinity. As industrialization progressed, factory work increasingly became differentiated into physical and mental labour, or in other words into skilled and unskilled labour. A contradiction, however, emerged as men adopted the semi-intellectual status through mental or sedentary work, the intellectual man forfeited a little masculine toughness.¹⁷² As a means of preserving their masculine identities, mental or skilled workers claimed their labour required a level of intellect or skill which women could not attain. Increased financial remuneration and increased status in the hierarchy of capitalist work reinforced their claims. Manual labour, which lost some of its status, continued to hold appeal on the basis of physical strength and stamina.¹⁷³ Cynthia Cockburn cites a study done by Paul Willis which found “that it is a social imperative for [teenage boys] to differentiate themselves, sharply and clearly, from girls. Manual work is identified as hefty masculine and desirable.”¹⁷⁴ In both mental and manual labour, the masculinity of

¹⁷² Cynthia Cockburn. Brothers: Male Dominance and Technological Change. (London: Pluto Press 1984)

132

¹⁷³ Cockburn. Brothers. 132-135

¹⁷⁴ Cockburn. In the Way of Women. 135

the occupation is then reinforced by a culture in which the objectification of women provides the foundation for male camaraderie. "The social currency...is women and woman objectifying talk, from sexual expletives and innuendo, through to narration of exploits and fantasies."¹⁷⁵ Key to maintaining and proving one's masculine identity in labour is the continued exclusion of women.

Inherent in the necessity to preserve this masculine identity is the rivalry between men themselves, between the skilled and the unskilled worker; a rivalry embedded in capitalism and patriarchy.¹⁷⁶ It was precisely the required level of physical and mental skill in traditionally male dominated occupations that was used as justification to deny women access to these occupations: "worse than nature, is the hierarchical principle of patriarchy and of capitalism as it is manifested in the sphere of work. The political definition of skill, like class and gender is always dynamic and relative."¹⁷⁷

Perhaps no other institution has been more active in the cultivation of masculine identities through patriarchy than the military: "policymakers define the military as an arena limited to tough men able to 'make the grade'; basic training is intentionally

¹⁷⁵ Cockburn. *Brothers*. 130

¹⁷⁶ Patriarchy is not a set structure, it changes and evolves over time to take different forms in different societies. However despite its many mutations, patriarchy can be understood to be "a system of social structures and practices in which men dominate, oppress and control women." It is not only women though who are subject to the effects of patriarchy. Patriarchy is as much about regulating and controlling the relationships between men as it is about controlling women. Patriarchy is a set of social relations, which has a material base, and in which there are hierarchical relations between men and solidarity among them, which enables them to control women. The military itself depends on the currency of hierarchy as a means of controlling the actions of its members, and on the strength of paternalism to ensure the well being of subordinates. Therefore patriarchy is at the foundation of the military as an institution. Cynthia Cockburn. *Brothers*. 125, S. Duncan "Theorising Difference in Patriarchy." *Environment and Planning*. Vol. 26 (1994) 1178

¹⁷⁷ Cockburn. *Brothers*. 128

marketed as a 'masculine proving ground.'¹⁷⁸ Any woman who enters this proving-ground challenges the masculinity of the soldiers:

Because the military is so closely associated with masculinity, the presence of women was particularly threatening to men. If women could perform tasks that previously only 'masculine' men could supposedly do, the activity itself was devalued in men's eyes because the masculine goal of separation from feminine identification is challenged.¹⁷⁹

This association precludes the treatment of women as equals. Women who enter military service therefore have their service defined and circumscribed, both officially and unofficially, by the men with whom they work. Because women are necessary participants in the modern day, military it is essential to military men to define women's roles in the military "in such a way as not to challenge the masculinity of men engaged in identical tasks."¹⁸⁰

Gender Integration in Theory

In response to the poor success rate of women in the Combat Arms, the Chief of Land Staff commissioned Lt(N) K. D. Davis to conduct a study of women and men serving in the Combat trades, as well as, of women who were unsuccessful in combat arms training. The first of the three Davis Reports was tabled in September of 1997 with the final two following in January and May of 1998. These reports were based on interviews with women and men in groups that included all ranks from Private to Lieutenant- Colonel.¹⁸¹ The first report dealt only with women and men currently serving in the combat arms. The second report interviewed women who formerly served in the

¹⁷⁸ Christine Williams. Gender Differences at Work. (Los Angeles: The Regents of the University of California. 1989)46

¹⁷⁹ Williams. 42

¹⁸⁰ Williams. 43

combat arms, and the third and final report interviewed men and women in the Army Reserves (Militia).

There were some weaknesses within the research, as the majority of women interviewed in the second report were 'training failures', and women in the lower ranks were over-represented.¹⁸² However, the Davis report represented an important first step in understanding that limitations to the success of women in the combat arms were not limited to 'official rules' alone. This report recognized that within the institution there exists inherent structural barriers. The second Davis report listed eight key issues which inhibited the performance of women in the combat arms:

- a. experience of significant non-acceptance of women by men without adequate warning or preparation of the women;
- b. perception of 'quotas';
- c. perceptions on the part of leaders, instructors, and peers of women's social and sexual behaviour;
- d. experiences of isolation and competition among women by those wishing to gain acceptance within a male culture;
- e. perception of 'suitability' for the combat arms;
- f. physical training processes and training injuries;
- g. perception of differences in post-training disposition (after ceasing trained from combat arms training) based on sex; and
- h. the impact of Reserve Force experience on the decision to join the CF.¹⁸³

Each of these barriers relates directly to the inability of women to conform with the male norm by virtue of their gender and, not necessarily, their physical difference. The gender barrier can be traced back to the division of labour into categories of men's and women's work. Traditionally, masculine jobs have been endowed with more status and importance than those occupations traditionally done by women. The presence of

¹⁸¹ Lt(N) Davis. "Chief of Land Staff Gender Integration Study: The Regular Force Training and Employment Environment. (The Davis Reports) (Ottawa:NDHQ. 1997) 5

¹⁸² "The Davis Reports." (1997) 4

¹⁸³ Lt(N) Davis. "Chief of Land Staff Gender Integration Study: The Experience of Women Who Have Served in the Combat Arms." (Ottawa: NDHQ January 1998) v-vi

women in traditionally masculine jobs devalues the work and therefore threatens masculine identity.¹⁸⁴

A telling example of the barriers that women seeking careers in the combat arms face is found in the section entitled “Male perceptions: Employment of Women in the Combat Arms” of the Davis Report (1997). This section indicates clearly that men believe that it is not their fault or the fault of the institution that women have been unsuccessful in the combat trades. Rather, the fault lies with women because they lack the motivation, the interest and the leadership capabilities to be infanteers or infantry officers.¹⁸⁵ The report shows that men resent in the presence because of the perception of preferential treatment, and because of the effect that men perceive women have on the ‘male culture’ of the combat arms. Ironically, it is this ‘special treatment’ of women which provides men with the ability to dismiss the participation of women as substandard, thereby preserving the masculine identity of their labour.¹⁸⁶

The numerical rarity of women coupled with rigid notions of femininity, have resulted in intense scrutiny of the social/sexual life of women. Particularly pronounced in military culture, is the division of women into two categories: the Madonna and the whore. Women serving in the military cannot be easily reconciled with the image of the Madonna and, therefore, are forced into the category of the Whore.¹⁸⁷ This construction has tremendous implications for the women serving in the combat arms, with regard to the attitudes of men in their section towards accepting women and issues like sexual harassment. The Davis report found that many men perceive that women in the military

¹⁸⁴ Williams. 47, Cockburn. Brothers. 179

¹⁸⁵ “The Davis Reports.” (1997) 15

¹⁸⁶ Williams. 47 and Cockburn. Brothers. 96

¹⁸⁷ Moon. 213

have power connected to their sexuality. Women can then use their sexuality to gain special treatment and favours from supervisors. Women can also use this 'disproportionate sexual power' to destroy their male rivals.¹⁸⁸ This paranoia is illustrated in the widely-held belief among men in the combat arms that "the presence of women creates considerable potential for men to be accused of harassment."¹⁸⁹ This statement clearly indicates that there is something fundamentally wrong with the understanding of the nature of harassment and discrimination in the CF. Clearly, the men do not see their own inappropriate and discriminating behaviour as increasing the potential to be charged with sexual harassment. By claiming that women's behaviour causes harassment, the problem can be dismissed as the result of a woman who could not cope with life in a "man's world," or the malicious attempt of a woman to destroy the career of her rival.

The categorization of women employed by the military is at the root of sexual harassment in the combat arms. By placing military women in the category of Whore, military men gain the right of unrestricted access to the bodies of military women.¹⁹⁰ It is this accessibility, coupled with the threat present in women in combat arms, that creates the proper climate for sexual harassment. In this climate, sexual harassment and rape become means of enforcing the male privilege of the combat arms: "rape was not an act of sex – consensual sex is easily available. Rape was an act of violence, a breach of military order and discipline...a definitive no vote ...against women in the Army, against

¹⁸⁸ "The Davis Reports." (1997) 15

¹⁸⁹ "The Davis Reports." (1997) 15

¹⁹⁰ Pateman.

female officers, and against the notion that women could coexist with men in...the hostile environment of the battle field.”¹⁹¹

The Davis Reports made the following recommendations to improve women’s participation in the combat arms trades:

- a. develop and implement a combat arms instructor selection process to ensure that only candidates who support a diverse Army approach are selected;
- b. provide training to instructors and leadership at all levels to increase skills and knowledge for training and leadership in mixed gender and culturally diverse environments (imperative that training address gender specific issues and challenge gender-role assumptions and consequent actions in the training and employment environment);
- c. monitor the combat arms training and employment environment using qualitative research measures (participant observation, interviews content analysis of course reports, et.) to eliminate systematic barriers, gender discrimination, and harassment and ensure maintenance of an environment which promotes the maximum performance and contribution of all training candidates and personnel;
- d. monitor selection, promotion, transfer and attrition within combat arms occupations by sex;
- e. conduct research on the combat arms training leadership approaches to ‘team performance’ to identify current practices that do not produce positive team performance in mixed gender and culturally diverse environments, and to identify new methods of promoting teamwork ‘in a diverse Army’;
- f. conduct exit interview outside of the chain of command (e.g. Base personnel Selection Officer) to increase organizational understanding of the processes which affect women in the combat arms environment, and facilitate action to resolve any outstanding issues prior to the release of individual women from the combat arms and or the CF;
- g. facilitate increased ‘critical mass’ of women in training and employment environments, within a positive training and employment environment is paramount to increasing the retention of women in the combat arms, regardless of critical mass);
- h. review physical and psychological performance standards, (which are formally stated and those that are informally practiced), to ensure that they are based on ‘bona fide’ occupational requirements and that facilitate the maximum performance of female and male candidates;
- i. monitor combat arms candidate performance to identify inappropriate peer discrimination and harassment, and ensure all individuals are

¹⁹¹ Neilson DeMille The General’s Daughter. 339

provided with appropriate discipline and/or education to address their inappropriate behaviour;

- j. analyze Reserve transfer files, by gender, to determine if there are systemic biases in the transfer application processes;
- k. develop and implement standard combat arms selection criteria at the recruiting level to ensure that only qualified candidates (men and women) who support a diverse Army approach are selected;
- l. develop and implement a standard recruiting approach, that includes appropriate responses to female applicant inquiries about the nature of employment in the combat arms (women should be given information in relation to the specific challenges that they will face when they enter a non-traditional employment environment for women);
- m. monitor the quality of recruiter and potential combat arms applicant interactions to eliminate systemic barriers in communication; and
- n. analyze post-training disposition by gender to determine if there is a difference between the rates at which women and men are processed for occupation transfer and release once deemed unsuitable for further training in the combat arms.¹⁹²

However, these recommendations address gender from a sameness approach and therefore none of them challenge the dominant ideologies surrounding the gender division of labour. Instead, they are only recommendations of accommodations to be made for women, thereby reinforcing the perception of overall unsuitability of women for the combat arms.

The Davis Reports are significant in that they are the first studies by the CF to recognize formally that the barriers faced by women in the combat arms are not isolated to official restrictions on the participation of women written in the CFAOs. Sadly, the reports fall short of recognizing the need to accept gender differences, not just challenge gender stereotypes. Without recognizing women as physiologically and socially different from men, these differences will continue to be viewed as weaknesses and not as potential strengths.

¹⁹² "The Davis Reports." (1998)

The Army did recognize the validity of the concerns and the recommendations raised by the Davis Reports. In response, it implemented a 'Diversity Training Program' for all officers and NCMs as well as "The Leadership in a Diverse Army" policy statement. These curricular materials implicitly adopt a sameness strategy and effectively prescribe ignoring the difference between men and women.

Most disturbing, however, is the propensity of these programs to actually undermine their own objective by reinforcing stereotypical equalities between the sexes. "The Diversity Training Instructors Manual for Master Corporals and Above" contains a subsection entitled "Dispelling Myths and Stereotypes Exercises." This exercise contains a list of gender stereotypes to be dispelled, ranging from women being unable to meet the physical fitness requirements of the combat arms, to women being unstable during certain phases of the moon.¹⁹³ The exercise attempts to dispel the myth in a factual and liberal way, except for one. The gender stereotype reads: "Women and men in same proximity = sex." The response to the stereotype is: "Yes it does, but it does not detract from the fight ability of men or women (Ground Zero Chapter 4)."¹⁹⁴ The lack of any serious attempt to dispel this myth is disturbing. Firstly, Chapter Four of Ground Zero made no such pronouncement, and the issue of fraternization was not even addressed in that chapter. Secondly, the passage implies that women are responsible for all sexual acts between the men and women of the Army, consensual or otherwise. Acts of sexual violence, no matter when or where they are committed, are the responsibility of the perpetrator alone and should be dealt with accordingly. However, they are not necessarily a result of gender integration and therefore should not be dealt with in this

¹⁹³ Diversity Training Manual, MCpl and Above. 23

¹⁹⁴ Diversity Training Manual. 23

section. Obviously consensual sexual relations between men and women infants on 'off duty' hours will happen, but should not be of concern to the leadership of the Army. Men and women engaging in sexual activities during operational phases of training is unprofessional behaviour. It then behooves the leadership of the Army to impress upon its soldiers, male and female, that this type of activity is inappropriate and intolerable. Again, this is not an issue that should be discussed as a result of gender integration.

The final reason the treatment of this myth and its response is disturbing is that it does nothing to challenge the disproportional responsibility that women bear for fraternization, in fact it reinforces the image of military women as the Whore. As identified in the Davis report, women are held almost exclusively responsible for fraternization. By allowing that the close proximity of men and women will inevitably lead to sex, the Army does nothing to challenge the myth of the sexual promiscuity or the sexual privilege of women.

The training program concludes with the directive to all leaders to accommodate diversity so long as it does not impede operational effectiveness. The implication is that any accommodation of difference is a threat to operational effectiveness, but that within certain limitations these threats may be tolerated. Examples of acceptable and non-acceptable accommodations were not given. Without a clearly defined policy statement, the Army will continue to subject women to the perception of receiving 'special treatment' based on the variation of accommodation that each leader sees fit to grant.

The recent attempt by the CF to address the issues of gender integration can be found in the "Canadian Forces Employment Equity Plan 1999" and the "1999 Annual Report of the Minister's Advisory Board on Canadian Forces Gender Integration and

Employment Equity” (MABCFGIEE). Both of these documents concentrate heavily on the need to create a more “accommodating work place for women.” By insisting that accommodations be made without challenging the male norm of the combat arms, the Advisory Board and the Employment Equity Plan are merely re-enforcing the belief of the unsuitability of women for the combat arms.

More discrediting still, when the board dealt with issues limiting gender integration, it placed child-care and a work/family balance within its section for gender integration. Granted, only a woman can become pregnant, however, by placing child-care and family responsibilities under the gender integration section, the board is re-enforcing the attitude that children and family concerns are exclusively the concern of women. As with all gender stereotypes, the stereotype creates behaviours that reinforce the itself. Childcare is a perfect example of the nature of gender stereotypes. Women in Canada spend twice as much time in unpaid household work, as men including elder and childcare. This means that Canadian women spend three times as long cooking and washing dishes, and nearly seven times as much time cleaning housing and doing laundry, as men do.¹⁹⁵ This distribution of household work has resulted in the creation of a double day for women. In the CF, this is of tremendous significance because of the necessity for prolonged absences due to operational requirements and career progression. Admittedly, there is little that the CF can do directly to enforce a more equitable distribution of child and household care by its members. However, it must be very careful not to justify this division through policies which legitimate unpaid housework as the exclusive purview of women.

¹⁹⁵ Ron Colman “Gender Equality in a Genuine Progress Index.” Made to Measure Synthesis Papers. 1998

The double day of the women in the CF makes them less deployable and, therefore, overall less desirable for employment. As illustrated by the recommendations of the Board, military service in Canada continues to be predicated on the assumption that there are two members of a family dedicated to one military career. Usually the husband, who is a member of the CF obligated to deploy at a moments notice, and his wife who is exclusively responsible for the care of the household and the family.¹⁹⁶ The recommendations of the Board and Employment Equity Plan do not challenge this perception and therefore reinforce the attitude that social reproduction is the exclusive responsibility of women.

Finally, and probably most harmful to the participation of women in the combat arms, has been the inability of the CF to challenge the perception that physical fitness standards had to be lowered in order to facilitate the participation of women in the combat arms. This belief is further reinforced by the lack of trade specific fitness tests prior to women commencing infantry training. Currently, the only test necessary to complete prior to enrolling in the CF is the gender and age specific CF EXPRES test, and it is the only physical requirement for passing basic training. However, the CF EXPRES test is hopelessly inadequate in the preparation of men and women for the rigors of a basic infantry qualification. This has resulted in a number of women who have enrolled in the infantry failing the course due to physical fitness. This shortcoming is even more damaging because of the visibility of any woman attempting to complete an infantry course. The Minister's Advisory Board recommended that a 'combat arms' specific trade test to be taken before the man or woman is enrolled in a combat trade, however, as of

¹⁹⁶ Karen Davis. "Understanding Women's Exit from the Canadian Forces: Implications for Integration?" *Wives and Warriors: Women and the military in the United States and Canada*. Ed, Laurie Weinstein and

this moment no such test has been developed.¹⁹⁷ While the implementation of such a test would improve the potential for females to successfully complete combat arms training, the board does not question the suitability of the current standard or the training and equipment used to achieve this standard. Both are designed specifically to the advantage of men. Instead the Board implies that the women recruited are unsuitable because of their inability to conform to the male norm.

However, examining policy statements alone cannot adequately describe the effects of the dominance of the male norm. The following discussion, based on my field research, explores the realities of masculine privilege in the infantry.

Gender Integration in Practice

As any public policy student knows, policy implemented can and will have unpredictable consequences. The policies of the CF for gender integration are no exception.¹⁹⁸ Two central themes emerged in my field research. The first theme is the importance of physical fitness standards to the morale and skill of an infantry soldier. The physical hardships of the infantry are as old as the trade itself. Infanteers have always been required to march great distances, carry heavy weights and sustain intense levels of physical exertion during battles. These hardships are the substance of myths, legends, literature and film. It is the glorification of these hardships which creates the

Christine White. (New York: Bergin & Garvey. 1997) 191

¹⁹⁷ Minister's Advisory Board on Canadian Forces Gender Integration and Employment Equity. (1999) 27

¹⁹⁸ The following section is a summary of research findings during the two-weeks of participant and unobtrusive observations conducted in support of this thesis. This secondary phase of researching for this thesis consisted of participant observation on infantry courses at both the officer and NCM levels. When conducting observations at the Battle School in Meaford and the Combat Training Centre in Gagetown, two central themes emerged within the research regarding gender integration. This summary of the research will be organized around these two themes. No names or platoon designations will be used as all research subjects were guaranteed anonymity.

most enduringly romantic attraction of the Infanteer for society and are central to the recruitment and retention of infanteers themselves. They have also served the historic purpose of the exclusion of weak soldiers, and standards have been created with this in mind. By creating intense standards, achievable only by the most physically fit of men, the infantry all but guaranteed the exclusion of women. By excluding women, the infantry remains a masculine trade and, therefore, deeply connected with the identity of the soldier as a man. The ability of women to meet these standards fundamentally undermines the infanteers' claim to true masculinity.

The infantry is a job that, in the rivalry between trades within the CF, possesses very few distinguishing qualities. Like the rivalry between skilled and unskilled work, the infantry does not embody the traditionally masculine traits of great technical skill or independent thinking. However, it is widely acknowledged that an infanteer is required to have tremendous physical stamina. Over the years, the Regular Force Regiments have built their personal pride and inter-regimental reputations on the physical exploits of their soldiers. Therefore, any proposal to lower the physical fitness standards is seen as a direct threat to the reputation of the regiment and to the reputation of the soldiers themselves. It is within this paradigm that the belief that women pose a potential threat to operational effectiveness finds its greatest support.

In the past few years, instructors at both the facilities at Meaford and Gagetown have noticed a decline in the endurance levels of all their students.¹⁹⁹ This has resulted in an increase in injuries to course candidates and in an overall lowering of training standards. However, most often the lowering of fitness standards were directly attributed to the presence of women by men in the infantry. It was most commonly asserted that

women could not meet the physical standard, so the standard was lowered or removed altogether. The integration of women was cited for the adoption of the C-7 rifle, the removal of chin-up requirements for the physical fitness test (PT test), and the phasing out of the 50-calibre machine gun from basic infantry training (a claim that is undermined by the common use of the 50-calibre machine gun by women in the Navy). The current PT test (13km with a 55-lb. rucksack) is considered to be far too easy, and not at all indicative of what life in the Battalion, or in battle, would be. This standard, however, is perceived by men as the maximum that women can perform. The lower standard of training has allowed “weaker” men to complete infantry training and thus threaten the reputation of the regiment and of the masculine identities of the soldiers.

The biggest problem with the so-called lowering of physical fitness standards is that it fundamentally undermines the presence of women in the infantry. The threat to the morale of soldiers created by the perception of the lowering of these standards causes resentment among male soldiers, and effectively limits the ability of a female soldier to be integrated into the platoon as an equals. Changes in standards then have created something of a ‘catch-22’ situation. The requirement to carry between fifty to eighty pounds is quite obviously prohibitive for the majority of women. This problem is further exacerbated by the design of the rucksack itself, which was discussed at some length in the previous chapter. Solutions to this problem are not easy to find, nor will they be inexpensive.

Central to the successful integration of women must be a commitment on the part of the Army to not only be an employer which presents equality in opportunities, but also creates equality of outcomes. As women are equals in their platoons, carrying the same

¹⁹⁹ Personal Conversation - Instructor CTC Gagetown. June 2000

amount of weight for the same distances as their male counterparts, it is necessary that a soldier's weight-bearing equipment must be designed to maximize their physiological strengths and differences. It would not fundamentally undermine the CF's commitment to equality to have two differently designed rucksacks for men and women. This recognition of the physical differences between men and women would not be a form of special treatment for women; rather, it would signal a genuine commitment of the CF to gender equality. This simple adjustment would challenge the male norm by recognizing the physical differences between the bodies of men and women. The recognition of women's bodies as different, but not as inferior to men's bodies, is the first step towards creating a gender sensitive norm and to ensure an equality of outcomes, not just an equality of opportunities.

In fact, the current physical training standard, predicated on the male norm, may actually contribute to permanent injury among female candidates. A study conducted of US Marine Corps trainees, during basic training found that women had a slightly increased chance of developing Patellofemoral syndrome,²⁰⁰ which accounted for a full 10% of reported injury and 2.1% of unreported injury during the study. The disorder accounted for only 1.1% of reported injury and 0% of unreported injury rates in male candidates.²⁰¹ With proper physical training to strengthen women's inner thigh muscles, a portion of these injuries could be avoided. Physical training sensitive to physical needs of women could have immeasurable benefits for the future retention and careers of

²⁰⁰ Patellofemoral Syndrome is a condition of the knee joint, in which the cartilage behind the kneecap (patella) is worn away by the grating of the femora against it. The kneecap being pulled off centre by a quadriceps muscle that is not stabilized by equally strengthened inner thigh muscles causes the condition. The condition is common in women with larger hips and would exacerbated by the linear exercises of military training like running, weight-bearing marches or battlecraft performed in boots, which do not offer sufficient support for the knee joint. <http://www.medstat.med.utah.edu>.

female infantry candidates. This measure could also ensure that the physical standards of training remain high enough to sustain regimental morale, while easing some of the training which has proven to be injurious for women in the infantry. Furthermore, given the overall decline in physical fitness of all course candidates, a gender specific physical training course between basic training and infantry training for men and women could be useful in increasing the number of successful male and female candidates while reducing rates in injury to both.

The second theme which emerged from my field research is the dominance of pre-existing gender stereotypes, which are used by infanteers as justification for the lack of women in the combat arms. As previously mentioned, when the CF uses the term 'gender,' it is used to mean only the physical differences between men and women. The CF uses 'gender' to mean 'sex'. However, the term 'gender' is much broader and encompasses the social rules and norms which regulate the interaction of men and women. These rules and norms apply to both men and women, and are used to define what it means to be a 'man' or a 'woman'. Surrounding soldiering, these rules and norms have been traditionally very clear: a man was the soldier and the protector, exposed to the horrors of battle and the hardships of war to ensure the safety of his nation and family, and women remained protected at home, unsullied by the horrors of a battlefield, caring for the next generation of soldiers. A by product of this relationship, however, was that strength and military purpose have been associated with masculinity, while weakness and caregiving have been designated as feminine qualities. Each gender definition is directly

²⁰¹ Sandra Almeida et al. "Gender Differences in Musculoskeletal Injury Rates: A Function of Symptom Reporting." Medicine and Science in Sports and Exercise. Vol. 31 No12 Ed Peter Raven (1999) 1811

opposite to and therefore, linked inextricably to the other and neither definition means anything without the other.

The continuing existence of these gender roles is evidenced in comments like in order for a woman to succeed in the infantry, she could not “act like a girl because the guys would eat her alive.”²⁰² “Acting like a girl” was clarified as “being shy, smiling and in general being feminine.”²⁰³ Even women used the term feminine as interchangeable with weak. As one woman commented, “I try not to act feminine, because you have to think of the morale of the section.... If I am being whiny and complaining it will only negatively effect the morale of the guys in my section.”²⁰⁴ This construction of ‘feminine’ as ‘weak’ means that women who want to be in the infantry must reconstruct their gender identity to be more aggressive and hard. However, as observed in the SWINTER and Davis Reports there is a limitation to the redefinition of gender that women can accomplish. The men of the CF control the extent that women can redefine their gender. Women in the infantry negotiate their gender in accordance with the standards created and enforced by men in the infantry and this definition has the effect of denying women full equality. The success of women in the combat arms depends heavily on the ability of each individual woman to understand and adhere to this construct within their section.²⁰⁵ Inevitably, this means keeping their professional and personal lives very separate, as well as gaining an acute understanding of the male culture in which they work.

²⁰² Thesis observation. CTC Gagetown. June 2000

²⁰³ Thesis observation . CTC Gagetown. June 2000

²⁰⁴ Thesis observation. CTC Gagetown. June 2000

²⁰⁵ “The Davis Reports.” (1998) 27, Eveline. 96

Gender stereotypes are frequently cited as justification for the absence of women in the infantry by men. Often men suggested women were not in the infantry because women did not want to be infanteers. According to these men, women were not raised to be soldiers; women were raised to be mothers and caregivers. Very few men said that women did not belong in the infantry. Instead they stated that they were more than willing to welcome women as infanteers, as long as they could do the job. An infanteer's definition of a woman capable of doing the job was inevitably a woman who could meet all the male requirements. The idea of accommodation of women has no legitimacy among men in the infantry. However, they did frequently question why any woman would want to be an infanteer. The men had difficulty expressing why they would want to be in the infantry. Their explanations encompassed many themes, however most clear is that they remained in the infantry because it was their job, and because they were men. "It is different for men, we don't mind being cold wet and dirty.... This is what we do, and we are not going to let our buddies down by quitting."²⁰⁶

Gender differences are also cited as the possible reason that the CF has had marginally more success in its attempts to integrate women into the Infantry as Officers than NCMs. It was suggested that "the inherent distances between men and women can be masked in the commission."²⁰⁷ The level of closeness and dependence required of an Officer is not the same as a Private in the section. A woman infantry officer can and must be more withdrawn and distant from her troops than an NCM. The nature of the job and the training may also be responsible for the larger numbers of women officers: officer candidates are trained with far more respect and independence than are NCMs.

²⁰⁶ Thesis observation. ATC Meaford. May 2000

²⁰⁷ Thesis observation. CTC Gagetown. June 2000

There is far less yelling, and less requirement for immediate reaction to the word of command. Furthermore, once the four phases of an Infantry officer's training are completed, the most physically difficult part of the officers training has been finished. These phases are also typically completed while the woman is young and childless, therefore career progression would not be as large of a potential interference with family responsibilities. NCM's on the other hand maintain the same level of physical intensity throughout all of their career courses.

The initial idea of putting all women into one regiment in an attempt to gain a "critical mass" of female infanteers was suggested to be both the salvation and the bane of gender integration of the CF. Given the numerical rarity of women in the Infantry they are under considerable scrutiny. While conducting observations, an instructor pointed out the one female in the section. After the section attack the instructor commented on her poor battlecraft. Admittedly her battlecraft was somewhat wanting, however, her male counterparts were struggling with the movements as much and in some cases more than she was. If there were more women, the potential for anonymity could conceivably increase. While all women spoken to insisted that their section was "a great group of guys" with whom they were friends, they also commented on the morale boost that having another woman to talk to provided.

The CF policy of critical mass was designed with this purpose in mind, to allow women a support network. Problems women face in the Infantry are unique, and often difficult to explain to other women, even if they are members of the CF. However, when women are concentrated in one or two locations, most men are not exposed to women in positions of authority or as soldiers. This allows pre-existing gender roles, for the most

part, to go unchallenged. One man commented that initially he was apprehensive about the integration of women, believing that they were neither physically or mentally suitable for the trade. However, after instructing on courses where he saw women “keep going when they had obviously passed their limits, while so-called ‘men’ were quitting” he changed his opinion.²⁰⁸ This statement illustrates two points: first the only way men are going to accept women as equals is if they see them do the training, and second men in the infantry still have a very physical definition of what it takes to be a real man.

Another common reason cited for the absence of women in the combat arms was family considerations. It is generally agreed that the operational imperatives and time demands of the infantry are not conducive to family life for men or women. However, the double day for women makes the accommodation of both career and family more difficult. It was these responsibilities, which were historically used to preclude married women and mothers from military service, as the loyalties of the women would be divided between the family and the military.²⁰⁹ The presence of small children in a military household is burdensome to single or dual service couples as the CF deployment schedule is still predicated on the assumption of one full-time parent at home with the children.²¹⁰ Also women are faced with the added stress of being designated “unfit field”²¹¹ as soon as they become pregnant. Pregnancy thus slows a woman’s career progression, as pregnancy and maternity leave would require that the woman be out of the battalion for almost two years. Coupled with the unchallenged belief that “pregnancy

²⁰⁸ Thesis observation. CTC Gagetown. June 2000.

²⁰⁹ Williams.

²¹⁰ Davis. Wives and Warriors

²¹¹ ‘Unfit Field’ is the term written on the pregnant woman’s medical record. It designates that the member is not allowed to go on military exercises where she will be spending time in ‘field conditions.’ As this is where the majority of combat arms training occurs, pregnancy results in an immediate halt to the woman’s career progression.

has no place in the army,” this could result in the resentment of other members of the Regiment who perceive their workload has been increased in an effort to ‘pick up the slack’ created by the pregnant member.

Conclusion

Women in the infantry present a unique opportunity to explore and expand the definitions of military service and the nature of citizenship in Canada. However, these potential gains are all but destroyed by the inability of the CF to challenge the male norm that dominates the nature of military service. Attitudes towards women in the Infantry have changed in the past eleven years since the Tribunal Decision and these changes are to be commended. However, these changes must be continued. Equality is not a matter of ignoring differences, but rather of recognizing and respecting them.

As the CF is reflection of Canadian society in general it is difficult to suggest how to change attitudes which are dominant in society at large. A shift in gender norms is necessary before any real change can be pursued both in society and in the CF. This challenge, however, does not absolve the CF from trying to alter these stereotypes. Rather, it makes it critical that the CF be conscientious in its efforts to avoid reinforcing these stereotypes through its policies. CF initiatives like Critical Mass and creating a more supportive work environment may actually serve as a means of reinforcing these stereotypes.

The following chapters of this thesis address the changing definitions of masculinity in the CF as well as possible catalysts for change in the CF through ideological transference and peacekeeping.

CHAPTER FOUR

ADDRESSING THE MYTH OF 'THE SOLDIER'

Introduction

Probably the most famous woman to have successfully completed infantry training in the CF is Sandra Perron. She worked for five years as an infantry officer with the Royal 22nd Regiment in Valcartier Quebec. Perron attained the rank of Captain before she quite the CF after thirteen years of service in the mid-1990s and she gained attention when a picture of her bound to a tree during a training exercise at CTC Gagetown was published in the national media. In 1998 she was appointed as the Head of the Minister's Advisory Board on Canadian Forces Gender Integration and Employment Equity, which tabled the report "Success and Opportunities: 1999 Annual Report." Perron has since become a manager at General Motors in Quebec. In a recent interview, she commented on her frustration at the attitude that insists that it is impossible to stop the abuse of women in the CF because of "a macho military culture."²¹² Perron went on to comment that, "it's very, very critical that we stop giving the Canadian Forces that excuse. I work presently in a macho work environment in General Motors in an assembly plant, yet diversity is embraced."²¹³ This statement is important for two reasons. The first is that it is the first public admission that masculine military culture itself forms a barrier to the full integration of women. The second is that in comparing masculine culture on the assembly line and in the combat arms, Perron identifies the inadequacies of the current program of gender integration, based on its failure to understand military masculinity.

²¹² Valerie Lawton. "Canada's Military is 'Biased'." The Hamilton Spectator. 16 March 2001

²¹³ Lawton.

In the past ten years since the Gauthier decision, the CF has devoted tremendous amounts of time and energy to address the problems of gender integration. The CF and the Ministry of National Defence have established Minister's Advisory Boards, Employment Equity Plans, harassment prevention plans, Diversity Training and the CF is currently in the initial stages of forming the Defence Women's Advisory Organization. However, each of these initiatives has failed to generate significant changes in the lives of women in the CF, most noticeably women in the combat arms.

Women in the combat arms still face discrimination, harassment and even the threat of personal violence. This is not to suggest that all men in the combat arms are aggressors, or that all women are victims. This would be an injustice not only to the men but also to the women of the CF. It would also be a grave misrepresentation of military service in Canada. Even the critical Davis Report on the experience of women who had left the combat arms found that some women have had a relatively positive experience in the combat arms.

Success, in most of these cases, was attributed to an awareness that the gendered processes that they encountered in the combat arms was a male combat arms cultural phenomena, rather than an attack on them as individuals. These women also perceived quickly that their social and sexual lives would have to be above reproach, and kept separate from their combat arms peers, and chain of command.²¹⁴

The objective of this thesis is to highlight the narrow margin of success since the CF introduced its gender integration policy and to underscore that the success of the women was not solely dependent on their physical or mental skill, but on their social and sexual activities. Without recognizing and addressing these social barriers to the success of

²¹⁴ "The Davis Reports." (1998) 27

women in the combat arms, the CF will continue to fail in its attempts to integrate women.

This chapter argues that the policies and programs used by the CF to facilitate policies of gender integration have been inadequate to the task. The CF's failure to challenge the male norm in practice has resulted in policies which actually slow the pace of gender integration. However, some development trends within the institution itself do offer some hope for women in the CF. Canada's commitment to international peacekeeping offers several possible avenues for changes to militarized masculinity in the CF, through increased dependence on militia soldiers, increased contact with soldiers from other nations and peacekeeping itself.

The CF is not immune to institutional change. Since the Second World War, the CF has shifted in its formation to concentrate on a more American style full-time professional force. The emergence of the post-World War II professional soldier has had a significant impact on the perception of a military career for women. However, because of the end of the Cold War and Canada's increased commitment to UN missions, in spite of forces-wide reductions in personnel, the militia has again begun to attract the attention of military planners. The dictates of the new international climate have resulted in increased interaction between Canadian soldiers and soldiers from other nations. This international cooperation could contribute to the process of integrating women into the CF, but it could also have negative implications. Contact with highly integrated forces like Sweden, for example, could encourage positive attitudes towards the integration of women among soldiers in the CF. Contact with intensely masculine forces, like the U.S. Marine Corps, could reinforce resistance among Canadian soldiers.

Another possible source of change for the definition of masculinity in the CF is found in UN peacekeeping, an activity which requires that soldiers fundamentally alter the defined purpose of their job and therefore their masculine identities.

Theoretical Context

Some feminist International Relations theorists assert that the masculinity associated with military service is a more extreme form of masculinity than that found anywhere else in society.²¹⁵ To become a soldier, young men must prove that they are not women or gay men, by displaying suitable aggression and violence in basic training. In this sense, violence perpetrated by soldiers in training has shifted from “men’s violence,” to a more institutionalized or hegemonic “masculine violence.”²¹⁶ In his 1985 study, Connell finds that hegemonic masculinity is “implicated in violence in the ways it splits not only men from women but separates ‘feminine’ characteristics and values and assigns these to women and inferior men.”²¹⁷ It is tied, not only to the individual workers or soldiers gender identity, but also with the strength and legitimacy of the institution itself. As a result, the threat posed by a woman armed with a gun is not only a threat to the masculinity of the soldiers she works with, but to the nature of war itself.²¹⁸ As former Marine Corps Commandant William Barrows commented:

War is man’s work. Biological convergence on the battlefield would not only be dissatisfying in terms of what women could do, but it would be an enormous psychological distraction for the male who wants to think that he’s fighting for that woman somewhere behind, not up there in the same foxhole with him. It

²¹⁵ Jan Jindy Pettman. *Worlding Women* (Sydney: Allen & Unwin Ltd. 1996) 93

²¹⁶ Pettman. 94

²¹⁷ Pettman. 94

²¹⁸ Pettman. 143

tramples the male ego. When you get right down to it, you have to protect the manliness of war.²¹⁹

The soldier's definition of masculinity goes deeper than the definition held by many other male workers, and the inability of the CF to recognize the necessity to change it has inhibited its attempts at gender integration. It is important to note here that Pettman, while admitting the dominance of the masculine ideal, suggests that definitions of masculinity may vary in degree from nation to nation: "are there appeals to different notions of a good man or a good soldier in, for example, Japan or Chile? The particular understandings of what it is to be a man, and the skills and practices that are called on in the name of states and patriotism may vary."²²⁰

It is the violent definition of masculinity that Sandra Whitworth explores in her evaluation of Canada's role as international peacekeepers. Whitworth argues:

...in contrast to the notion that the Canadian military by virtue of its participation in peacekeeping mission is a quite benign, altruistic and peaceful institution, [The Canadian Airborne Regiment] in fact, it is one in which the glorification of force, hierarchy, racism and violence against women, are like most militaries, an important part of its culture.²²¹

There can be no argument that the Airborne Regiment had one of the most exclusive, masculine, and violent definitions of soldiering in the CF. The Airborne were an elite force that possessed a definition of masculinity that was far more extreme than the norm in the rest of the CF.

I am more inclined to agree with Cynthia Enloe, who suggests that peacekeeping offers the best opportunity for soldiers to "perform military duties without being

²¹⁹ Pettman. 144

²²⁰ Pettman. 95

²²¹ Sandra Whitworth. "Gender, Race and the politics of Peacekeeping." *A Future for Peacekeeping?* Ed Edward Moxon-Browne (London: MacMillian Press, 1998) 14-15

militaristic.”²²² I would not go so far as to agree that “militarized masculinity is only shirtsleeve-deep,”²²³ however, I would argue given the history of the CF, that militarized masculinity is far more susceptible to change than Sandra Whitworth suggests. The first and most significant change that the CF underwent in the post-war era is the shift from an Army of citizen-soldiers, to a professional American style Army.

A New Defence Policy

At the close of World War II, Canada had one of the largest and best equipped militaries in the world, with over 1.1 million men and women serving “for the duration.”²²⁴ The course of the war had done nothing to change the opinion of the leadership of the CF about the worth of part-time soldiers, and in 1946 each element tabled their plans for the post war CF. The Army’s Plan G called for 55 788 regulars and 155 396 reservists, while the RCAF asked for 30 000 permanent soldiers and a reserve force of 50 000.²²⁵ Only the Navy did not submit a formal request for a reserve force that would outnumber its permanent staff. These requests clearly show that, while the number of men had increased, the traditional Canadian association between citizenship and military service remained unchanged by the war. Of particular interest to this historic association was the request of the army leadership to have the service of 48 500 men of the Militia based on “compulsory service.”²²⁶ This is interesting in the Canadian context because conscription was proposed for militia service, not Regular Force service. It is also interesting because of the reaction of the King Government which immediately

²²² Enloe. *The Morning After*. 30

²²³ Enloe. *The Morning After*. 31

²²⁴ George Stanley. *Canada’s Soldiers 1604-1954*. (Toronto: The MacMillian Co of Canada Ltd. 1954) 387

²²⁵ Desmond Morton. *A Military History of Canada*. 227

dismissed the idea as “perfectly outrageous.”²²⁷ The nation was exhausted by its war effort and, despite international pressures, by the end of 1946 the CF had shrunk to 51 000 men of all ranks in all three services.²²⁸

The return to a small permanent force was not, however, in keeping with the changing international climate. The post war obligations of Canada and the emerging Cold War between the U.S. and the Soviet Union meant that a return to the pre-war policy of a large militia and small Regular Force would be impractical. In the early years after World War II, Canadian military advisors began to favour a more American style of professionalized military service. This new attitude meant that by 1952 the Regular Force was allotted a strength of 100 000 men, while the Reserve Force was only allotted 47 000 men.²²⁹

The shift to a professional force had several implications for women serving in the CF. First it diminished the historic connection between military service and citizenship. The weakening of the association between military service and citizenship allowed the CF leadership to restrict the service of women even more than they had during World War II. Second, it reinforced the connection between military service and masculinity, which was further reinforced by the contrived nature of the military service of women. This is not to suggest that the historic link between citizenship responsibilities and military service was broken; the previous chapters of this thesis have proven that it remained strong in the minds of Canadians and central to the policies of the state. However, it is a recognition that the professionalization of the CF intensified the

²²⁶ Desmond Morton. *A Military History of Canada*. 227

²²⁷ Desmond Morton. *A Military History of Canada*. 227

²²⁸ Stanley. 387

conflict between the ideologies of masculinity and citizenship already found in Canadian military service. Finally, the increased professionalization of military service allowed women and women's rights advocates a more standardized institution against which to pursue their claims.

Catalysts for Change

The collapse of the Cold War also has implications for the ideological composition of the CF. The potential for ideological transference that exists today is greater than at any time in history. The cooperation between national militaries in international peacekeeping/peacemaking missions, joint training exercises and military alliances have combined with the predominance of American media to influence the Canadian soldier as never before. With increased contact with professionalized and masculine forces, the potential for adopting and accepting the attitudes of other nations towards military service and military women is tremendous.²³⁰ The increased contact with U.S. forces and media, for instance, could potentially encourage the current resistance of the men in the CF, as the more professionalized and masculine definitions of soldiering in the U.S. are adopted.²³¹ This presents a very real risk to the attempts to integrate women into the combat arms. This is not to negate the potential that Canadian

²²⁹ The Regular Force and Reserve Forces here are of all three elements: Army, Navy and Air Force. Stanley 390

²³⁰ It has been the attempt of this thesis to prove that the more professionalized military service in the U.S. has also been more masculine. An example of this increased attention to masculinity in military service can be found in the reluctance the U.S. Army leadership to allow US soldiers to wear UN blue helmets while in Bosnia. While U.S. unilateralism cannot be dismissed as a factor, the Army leadership explained that an U.S. Army Officer wearing a blue helmet would not be taken seriously because it would undermine his 'command presence' (read: masculinity). The fragility of this masculinity is further reinforced by the decision not to allow male Army Officers to carry umbrellas on rainy days. Female Army Officers however are permitted to carry umbrellas. Enloe. "The Right to Fight: A Feminist Catch-22" MS July/August 1993. 84

soldiers may have their attitudes towards women effected positively by interaction with other nations who include women in combat (for example, the Netherlands). I am, however, suggesting that U.S. influences may be more powerful given the nation's geographical and cultural proximity to Canada.

The Army increasing its reliance on militia soldiers could possibly counteract this risk. After the close of the Second World War, the Canadian government instituted a large professional military force for the first time in Canadian history. However, with the close of the Cold War the government has, once again, increased its reliance on the part-time soldier. The increased participation of reservists in UN and NATO missions, combined with the increased number of transfers of members from reserve to regular force service, could potentially reinvigorate the historic link between military service and citizenship obligations in Canada. As women in the militia have found life in the combat arms to be far more accepting and accommodating²³² than women in the Regular Force, the potential for ideological transference in this instance could be tremendously positive.

Finally, the very nature of the extensive participation of the CF in peacekeeping missions worldwide offers a challenge to the dominant masculine definition of soldiering. This thesis is not suggesting, as does Judith Hicks Stiehm or the 1995 UN report "The Role of Women in United Nations Peace-keeping," that women possess something of a natural proclivity for peacekeeping. Such sentiments are naïve and reductionist. Nor do my findings concur with those of Sandra Whitworth, that peacekeeping creates a crisis in military masculinity that can only be alleviated by resorting to violence. Rather, my

²³¹ Pettman

²³² "The Davis Reports." (1998)

argument is that peacekeeping challenges the pre-defined roles and definitions of soldiers, because their mission is to preserve life rather than take it. UN missions also often have the effect of delegitimizing violence, because the soldiers have witnessed the effects of unfettered violence on a population.

With these facts in mind, peacekeeping requires skills not traditionally associated with militarized masculinity, for example mediation, conflict resolution/negotiation, nurturing and protecting of weaker members of a community and promoting peace. Obviously these activities require a new definition of soldiering, which may not be entirely compatible with traditionally masculine definitions.²³³ This is evidenced in the reluctance of the U.S. military to become involved in UN peacekeeping missions. Many in the U.S. military leadership fear that the wearing of the blue beret will diminish the masculinity of their soldiers and officers.²³⁴ The Canadian Airborne Regiment is another example of certain forms of masculinity being incompatible with peacekeeping.

It was exactly this violent definition of soldiering, which lead to the disgrace and disbanding of the regiment in 1994 after the Somalia Scandal. The disgrace of the Regiment forced the CF to address issues of racism, hazing, harassment and misogyny in Canadian soldiers, and to implement educational programs and policies to deal with these issues. Obviously, the CF has not been successful in totally removing these abuses, however, the Somalia Scandal did force the CF to admit their existence.

Conclusion

It is almost with an air of pride that Canadians define themselves an 'unmilitaristic people.' It is also a point of pride that the nation itself was not born in

²³³ Enloe. The Morning After.

bloody revolution, but in peaceful negotiations. Many Canadians see this spirit of compromise as continuing today in our nation's self-proclaimed role as "the world's peacekeepers." After all, it was the Canadian Lester B. Pearson who originally articulated the idea that soldiers could be used to prevent war. For his vision Lester B. Pearson won the Nobel Prize. Since the end of the Cold War, Canadian soldiers have been used almost exclusively in these humanitarian missions. Over 100 000 Canadian soldiers have served in over fifty United Nations missions in the last forty years. Currently the CF has more than 2000 personnel participating in more than eighteen UN or NATO missions around the world.²³⁵ Canada's role as peacekeepers is glorified in Canadian society in every form from beer commercials to 'Heritage Moments' to the new ten-dollar bill.

However, peacekeeping alone cannot challenge centuries of rigid gender norms surrounding soldiering. The CF will have to engage actively in policies and initiatives that challenge pre-existing gender norms and stereotypes for men and women in order to see women accepted as equals in combat arms trades. This is not to negate the progress that women in the CF have made in the sixty years since World War II. The CF has made substantial progress in the opportunities available to women seeking a career in the military. It is also not to suggest that all things masculine are evil or that aggression and violence have no purpose in the training of a military. I do, however, suggest that when aggression and violence become tied to one gender identity, especially to the derision of the other, that these notions of masculinity must be challenged. A soldier's identity must include speed and violence on the battlefield as well as tolerance in his/her professional

²³⁴ Enloe. "The Right to Fight"

²³⁵ "Defence: A National Institution." 18- 19

and personal relationships. The existing barriers to the full integration of women into the combat arms cannot be addressed through the a strategy of sameness. The barriers that remain are institutional and gender-based barriers and, without addressing gender as a social relationship and separating gender from sex, the CF will not be able to address the hidden costs of the masculine nature of soldiering.

CONCLUSION

THE CANADIAN SOLDIER

Bending at my waist, I attempted to pull the rucksack further up onto my back. Frustration began to set in as I tugged at the shoulder straps hopping a little to relieve the pressure on my shoulders. It was no use, the straps were already as tight as they could be. In fact I was beginning to suspect the slightly numb sensation in my arms had something to do with how tight the straps already were and a possible restriction of circulation. I straightened back up, and started to fiddle with the waist belt. Given that it was a flimsy piece of canvas, I already knew it was useless. I caught the eye of one of the 'enemy force' soldiers and he wandered over to ask if I needed any help. I smiled and told him I was fine, and he wandered back to where he was before. The enemy force had spent the entire week taking care of me. The guys had carried my rucksack to the back of the truck, set up cots for me to sleep on, and even made me Mr. Noodle soup when I commented unfavourably on the IMPs.²³⁶ The breaking point came when one of the guys asked me if I knew how to fire the C-7 rifle.²³⁷

I tried to accept that the enemy force soldiers were only trying to be helpful as they believed that I was inexperienced in fieldcraft, an illusion that my own performance in the field did nothing to actively dispel, but my gut reaction was to be offended. Part of that reaction had to do with the fact that I was not as inexperienced in fieldcraft as my current MOC and element would suggest. I had served in infantry regiments for years prior to transferring into the Naval Reserves. In fact, it was my years of service in the

²³⁶ IMPs or individual meal packages, are the preserved rations given to soldiers when deployed to the field.

²³⁷ All members of the CF are trained and tested annually on proficiency with the C-7 rifle, regardless of their gender, trade or element.

militia that inspired my to research this subject. However, my offense was also rooted in something deeper. The fact that the Regular Force infants insisted on treating me like a real life “Private Judy Benjamin”²³⁸ indicated to me that the attitudes of men in the infantry remained unaltered, despite the numerous CF initiatives to integrate women.

In March 2001, the Minister’s Advisory Board on Canadian Forces Gender Integration and Employment Equity released its 2000 Annual Report.²³⁹ The Board found that while the plan for gender integration was suitable, the CF failed in the implementation of the plan noting:

in conclusion, while the CF EE[Employment Equity] Plan is reasonable, the commitment varied, and the results few, the board remains nonetheless confident that because employment equity is an integral part of the operational imperative, the Canadian Forces will make it happen. It is hoped that this realization will be embraced sooner rather than later, *the time has come for results.*²⁴⁰ [Emphasis added in original text]

The Board cites several initiatives that the CF has developed as evidence of the sufficiency of the plan. These initiatives include:

- ◆ the development of child care programs through the Military Family Resource Centres;
- ◆ the implementation of the Good Working Relationship Programs at MARLANT [Maritime Atlantic Headquarters in Halifax] and MARPAC [Maritime Pacific Headquarters in Esquimalt];
- ◆ the establishment of a Wellness Centre for Women in Edmonton;
- ◆ the special efforts for cross-cultural training and education for instructors at CFLRS [Canadian Forces Leadership and Recruitment School];
- ◆ the development of the Tommy Prince and Aboriginal entry programs;

²³⁸ A movie and then television show popular in the early 1980s, in which Goldie Hawn portrayed a spoiled rich woman who mistakenly joins the U.S. Army. Upon her arrival at boot camp, Pte Benjamin displays a total lack of military knowledge and inability to conduct herself in a soldierly fashion.

²³⁹ Due to the late date of the report’s release I will not deal in any substantial way with the concerns it raises. I will however note the final conclusions of the 2000 Report.

²⁴⁰ Minister’s Advisory Board on Canadian Forces Gender Integration and Employment Equity 2000 Annual Report. (Ottawa: Department of National Defence. 2001) 3

- ◆ the creation of the Defence Advisory Groups.²⁴¹

This thesis has established that it is the inadequacy of the entire plan rather than the initiatives recommended by the board, that precipitates failure in its implementation. Equality between the sexes should be predicated, not on women's sameness to men but rather their difference. Only by recognizing the physical and socially constructed nature of gender differences can the association between masculinity and military service be adequately challenged. Unless the CF addresses the underlying social construction of gender, these and all other initiatives implemented by the CF will fall negligently short of their stated goals. The inability to grasp the significance of gender itself needs no further testimony than the official coupling of the gender integration program with employment equity initiatives directed at visible minorities. While it is not my intention to discount the discrimination experienced by men of ethnic or visible minorities in the CF, it is my contention that this discrimination had different forms and manifestations in society and within the CF.

As this thesis has shown, there are no easy solutions to the problems faced by women as they attempt to join the combat arms. These problems stem from both the physical and social frameworks which inform service. Pre-existing gender stereotypes remain unchallenged by CF policy initiatives and thereby undermine CF attempts at gender integration. It is these underlying tensions that must be addressed by the CF if any meaningful initiatives for gender integration are to be implemented.

There is, however, still hope that women will be fully integrated into the CF as equals. To this end, I have outlined possible catalysts for positive change within the

²⁴¹ Minister's Advisory Board on Canadian Forces Gender Integration and Employment Equity 2000 Annual Report. (Ottawa: Department of National Defence. 2001) 9

traditions of the military institution itself. The tradition of the citizen-soldier is once again being strengthened through the reliance of the CF on reservists to fill its billets on international peacekeeping missions. This, combined with new definition of masculinity and soldering required by peacekeeping itself, may prove important in breaking down the resistance to women in combat. However, the paradigm shift needed for the full and equal integration of women into the combat arms will not come overnight, or without the active support of the leadership and soldiers of the CF. The critical evaluation of the social construction of gender and of the soldier is central to the creation of a successful gender integration program in the CF.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Acker, Joan. "Class, Gender, and the Relations of Distribution." Signs. Vol. 13 No. 3. Ed. Jean O'Barr. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 1988.
- Almeida, Sandra et al. "Gender Differences in Musculoskeletal Injury Rates: A Function of Symptom Reporting." Medicine and Science in Sports and Exercise. Vol. 31 No12 1999.
- Armor, David. "Race and Gender in the U.S. Military." Armed Forces and Society. Vol. 23. 1997.
- Armstrong, Pat. "Restructuring Public and Private: Women's Paid and Unpaid Work." Challenging the Public/Private Divide: Feminism, Law, and Public Policy Ed. Susan Boyd. Toronto: University Of Toronto Press. 1997.
- Army Lessons Learned Centre. "Lessons Learned: Leadership in a Mixed Gender Environment" Dispatches Vol. 5, No 2. 1998.
- Bloom, Anne. "Women in the Defense Forces" Calling the Equality Bluff: Women in Israel. Ed Barbara Swirski and Marilyn Safir. New York: Teachers College Press. 1993.
- Buist, Margaret. "Elusive Equality: Women and the Charter of Rights and Freedoms." Feminist Perspectives on the Canadian State. Vol. 17 No 8. 1988.
- Canadian Human Rights Tribunal Decision: Gauthier vs. the Canadian Armed Forces. 20 February 1989.
- Cairns, Alan. "The Constitutional World We Have Lost." Reconfigurations: Canadian Citizenship and Constitutional Change. Ed. Douglas E. Williams. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart Inc. 1995.
- Cockburn, Cynthia. In the Way of Women: Men's Resistance to Sexual Equality in Organizations. New York: ILR Press. 1991.
- Cockburn, Cynthia. Brothers: Male Dominance and Technological Change. London: Pluto Press 1984.
- Colman, Ron. "Gender Equality in a Genuine Progress Index." Made to Measure Synthesis Papers. 1998.
- Crease, Gillian. Contracting Masculinity: Gender, Class and Race in White Collar Unions 1944-1994. Toronto: Oxford University Press 1999.

Creese, Gillian. "Gender Equity or Masculine Privilege?: Union Strategies and Economic Restructuring in a White Collar Union." Canadian Journal of Sociology. Vol. 20 No. 2. 1995.

Davis, K. "Understanding Women's Exit from the Canadian Armed Forces: Implications for Integration?" Wives and Warriors: Women in the Military in the US and Canada. Ed. Weinstein and C. White. Westport: Bergin and Garvey. 1997.

Davis. "Chief of Land Staff Gender Integration Study: The Regular Force Training and Employment Environment. Ottawa: NDHQ. 1997.

Davis. "Chief of Land Staff Gender Integration Study: The Experience of Women Who Have Served in the Combat Arms." Ottawa: NDHQ. January 1998.

Davis K.D. "Women and Military Service in Canada: 1885-Present." Ottawa: CFPARU. June 1996.

"Defence: A National Institution." 2000.

DeMille, Nielson. The General's Daughter. 1997.

Diversity Training Manual, MCpl and Above.

Duncan, S. "Theorising Difference in Patriarchy." Environment and Planning. Vol. 26 1994.

Elshtain, Jean. "The Discourse of War and Politics: From the Greeks to Today." Women and War. New York: Basic Books. 1987.

Elting, John. Amateurs, To Arms! New York: Da Capo Press. 1995.

Enloe. "The Right to Fight: A Feminist Catch-22" MS July/August 1993.

Enloe, Cynthia. The Morning After. Los Angeles: University of California Press. 1993.

Eveline, Joan. "Heavy, Dirty and Limp Stories: Male Advantage at Work." Gender and Institutions: Welfare, Work and Citizenship. Ed. Moria Gates and Alison MacKinnon. Sydney: Cambridge University Press. 1998.

"Final Land Forces Report on the Trial of Servicewomen in Non-Traditional Roles and Environments (SWINTER)" Ottawa: DND December 1985.

Findlay, Susan. "Feminist Struggles with the Canadian State 1966-1988." Feminist Perspectives on the Canadian State. Vol. 17 No 8. Toronto: Resources for Feminist Research. 1988.

Golan, Galia. "Women in Israeli Society: An Overview." Palestine-Israel Journal. Ed. Zaid Abu Zayyad & Victor Azgielman. Vol. II No 3 Jerusalem: Middle East Pub. 1995.

Goldstein, Yaccov. From Fighters to Soldiers: How the Israeli Defense Force Began. London: Sussex Academic Press. 1998.

Grace, Joan. "Sending Mixed Messages: Gender-Based Analysis and the 'Status of Women'." Canadian Public Administration. Vol. 40 No 4 1998.

Hall, Peter and Taylor, Rosemary. "Political Science and the Three New Institutionalisms" Polity. 1995.

Hasek, John. The Disarming of Canada. Toronto: Key Porter Books. 1987.

Hawkesworth, Mary. "Policy Studies within a Feminist Frame." Policy Sciences Vol. 27 1994.

Izzul, Y. Between the Flag and the Banner: Women in Israeli Politics. Albany NY: State University of New York Press. 1997.

Kovitz, Marcia. "The Enemy Within: Female Soldiers in the Canadian Forces." Canadian Woman Studies. Ed. Luciana Ricciutelli. Toronto: York University Pub. 2000.

Kloppenber. "Institutionalism, Rational Choice and Historical Analysis." Polity. 1995.

Kymlicka, Will. Multicultural Citizenship: A Liberal Theory of Minority Rights. New York: Oxford University Press. 1995.

Lawton, Valarie. "Canada's Military is 'Biased'." The Hamilton Spectator. 16 March 2001.

Machiavelli, Niccolo. "From the Art of War." The Portable Machiavelli. Ed. Peter Bondanella & Mark Mussa. New York: Penguin Books. 1979.

Marshall, T.H. "Citizenship and Social Class." Class Citizenship and Social Development: Essays by T.H. Marshall. Garden City, New York: Doubleday & Co. 1964.

Militia Act 1777, Nova Scotia.

"Minister's Advisory Board on Canadian Forces Gender Integration and Employment Equity 2000 Annual Report." Ottawa: Department of National Defence. 2001.

"Minister's Advisory Board on Canadian Forces Gender Integration and Employment Equity: Success and Opportunities: 1999 Annual Report." Ottawa: Department of National Defence. March 2000.

"Minister's Advisory Board on Gender Integration in the Canadian Forces – Annual Report 1993-1994" Ottawa: Department of National Defence. 1994.

"Minister's Advisory Board on Women in the Canadian Forces - 1992-1993 Annual Report." Ottawa: Department of National Defence. 1993.

Moon, Katharine. "Military Prostitutes and the Hypersexualization of Militarized Women." Gender Camouflage: Women and the US Military. Ed Franane D'Amico & Laurie Weinstein. New York: New York University Press. 1999.

Moore, Brenda. "African-American Women in the U.S. Military." Armed Forces and Society. Ed Edith Hoshimo Vol. 17 No 3. 1991.

Morton, Desmond. A Military History of Canada. 4th Edition Toronto: McClelland & Stuart Pub. 1999.

Morton, Desmond. Canada and War. Toronto: Butterworths. 1981.

Morton, Desmond. Ministers and Generals. Toronto: University of Toronto Press. 1970.

Park, M.E. "Final Report of the Social/ Behavioural Science Evaluation of the Final SWINTER Land Trial." Research Report 85-1 Ottawa: DND April 1985.

Pateman, Carole. The Sexual Contract. Los Angeles: Stanford University Press. 1988.

Pearson, Ruth Roach. They're Still Women After All. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart Inc. 1986.

Pettman, Jan Jindy. Worlding Women. Sydney: Allen & Unwin Ltd. 1996

Philips, Susan "Discourse, Identity and Voice: Feminist Contributions to Policy Studies." Challenging the Public/Private Divide.

Pierson, Paul "The Path to European Integration: A Historical Institutional Analysis." Polity. 1995.

Pontusson, Jonas. "From Comparative Public Policy to Political Economy: Putting Political Institutions in their Place and Taking Interests Seriously." Polity. 1995.

Reeves, Connie. "Invisible Soldiers: Military Nurses." Gender Camouflage.

Rein, Natalie. Daughters of Rachel. London: Penguin Books. 1979.

Sadler, Georgia Clark. "From Women's Services to Servicewomen." Gender Camouflage.

- Scott, Joan Wallack. Only Paradoxes to Offer. Boston: Harvard University Press. 1996.
- Shochat, Yisrael. "A Proposal for the Defence of the Jewish Community in the land of Israel." Yigal Allon. The Making of Israel's Army. New York: Universe Books. 1970.
- Skocpol, Theda. "Why I am an Historical Institutionalism." Polity. Vol. 28 No 1 Ed. M.J. Peterson. New York: North East Political Science Association. 1995.
- Skocpol, Theda. Protecting Soldiers and Mothers. New York: The Belknap Press of Howard University Press. 1992.
- Stacey, C.P. The Military Problems of Canada. Toronto: Ryerson Press. 1940.
- Stanley, George. Canada's Soldiers 1604-1954. Toronto: MacMillan Co of Canada Ltd. 1954.
- Status of Women Canada "Gender-Based Analysis: A Guide for Policy-Making." Ottawa: Staigh Associates Ltd. Sep 1998.
- Tanner, L. "Gender Integration in the Canadian Forces – A Quantitative and Qualitative Analysis." Ottawa: DND. 1999.
- "The Role of Women in United Nations Peace-keeping"
Gopher://gopher.undb.org:70/00/secretar/dpcsd/dow/w2000/1995-1.en
- Thelen and Steinmo. Historical Institutionalism in Comparative Politics.
- Turner, Westley. The War of 1812: The War that Both Sides Won. 2nd Edition. Toronto: Dundurn Press. 2000.
- Vickers, Jill, Rankin, Pauline Appelle, Christine. Politics as if Women Mattered: A Political Analysis of the National Action Committee on the Status of Women. Toronto: The University of Toronto Press Inc. 1993.
- Vivian, Kevin. "From the Past and into the Future: Gender Integration in the Canadian Armed Forces 1970 – 1999." Ottawa: Department of National Defence. 1998.
- Walker, James. "Race and Recruitment in World War I: Enlistment of Visible Minorities in the Canadian Expeditionary Force." Constructing Modern Canada: Readings in Post Confederation History. Ed. Chad Gaffield. Toronto: Copp Clark Longman Ltd. 1994.
- Whitworth, Sandra. "Gender, Race and the politics of Peacekeeping." A Future for Peacekeeping? Ed Edward Moxon-Browne. London: Macmillian Press, 1998.

Whitworth, Sandra. Feminism and International Relations: Towards a Political Economy of Gender in Interstate and Non-Governmental Institutions. New York: Macmillian Press 1997

Willet, T.C. A Heritage at Risk: The Canadian Militia as a Social Institution. IVS Special Edition. Vol. 1. London: London Press. 1987.

Williams, Christine. Gender Differences at Work. Los Angeles: The Regents of the University of California. 1989.

www.idf.il/eng/organization/chen/chen.stm. 30 Mar 00

www.medstat.med.utah.edu.

Young, Iris Marion. Justice and the Politics of Difference. New York: Princeton University Press. 1990.