THE DEVELOPMENT OF MILLENNIAL MOVEMENTS

A THEORETICAL AND COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF MILLENNIAL MOVEMENTS

By

GRAHAM ANDERSON ALLAN, B.A.

A Thesis

Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies

in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements

for the Degree

Master of Arts

McMaster University

November 1971

MASTER OF ARTS (1971) McMASTER UNIVERSITY

(Sociology) Hamilton, Ontario

TITLE: A Theoretical and Comparative Analysis of the Development of Millennial Movements

AUTHOR: Graham Anderson Allan, B.A. (University of Essex)

SUPERVISOR: Professor R.E. Blumstock

NUMBER OF PAGES: vi, 207

Abstract

The purpose of this thesis is to analyse the development of millennial movements in various different areas and different time periods. An attempt has been made to account for the social conditions under which millennial movements arise, and also to explain why the ritual and doctrinal contents of the movements are as they are. In recent years the comparative analysis of millennial movements has flourished, and there is now a relatively large literature on the subject. However, with one or two notable exceptions, these analyses have concentrated in the main on either the similarities in common between apparently diverse movements, or else on the formulation of ideal types and dimensions into and along which all movements can be categorized. There have been very few attempts to create sociological models that either explain under what conditions millennial movements develop, or that illustrate why individual movements develop the specific rituals and beliefs they do.

Because of its historically and geographically comparative approach, this thesis, of necessity, consists of a secondary analysis of selected millennial movements. Nevertheless it is hoped that the model developed for these selected movements will be of use in explaining and understanding other movements.

The millennial movements analysed herein are:

(1) The Plains Indians' Ghost Dance of 1890

(2) The Belgium Congo's Kimbangu-Matswa Ngunzism, (1930-35)

(3) The Crusade of the Shepherds in Flanders and France, (1251)

(4) The Lazzaretti movement in Tuscany, Italy, (1878)

(5) The early Black Muslim movement, (Detroit, 1930-34)

(6) The Irvingite movement, (England, 1830-35)

Acknowledgements

I should like to thank Professor Robert Blumstock, my supervisor, for the many helpful contributions he has made throughout this thesis, and also Professor Robert Drass and Professor Richard Roman for being on my examining committee. My thanks are also due to Mary Allan, Linda Campbell, David Hughes, and Professor Hans Mol for the encouragement and help they have all given me at various times.

I am grateful to Mrs. Judith Anderson for her speedy and accurate typing.

Finally, and most importantly of all, I want to thank my family, both consanguinal and affinal, for the help and support they have provided during the writing of this thesis. In particular I am most grateful to my wife, Mary, and son, Richard, who have cheerfully tolerated the many inconveniences I have made them suffer.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1

Introduction

Millennial elements can be discovered in the majority of the world's religions, generally in the form of a messiah who is to return to earth and recreate the lost paradise.[1] Wallis, (1943. Chapter II), has shown that messianism occurs not only in Christianity, Judaism, and Islam,[2] but also in Buddhism[3] and Hinduism, (admittedly to a lesser extent),[4] as well as in many 'primitive' religions. But millennial movements,

---

[1]Although millennialism, and its Greek equivalent, chiliasm, originally referred purely to the second coming of the Christian Christ after a thousand year reign in heaven, they are now used as synonyms for all beliefs which envisage a transformation of the world, (or a part of it), into an earthly paradise.

[2]Yonina Talmon suggests that millennialism in Islam was introduced by the Christians at the time of the Crusades, and that the idea of a final redemption was alien to Muhammed and his followers. (1966. p164)

[3]"However messianic faith has not been entirely absent in Buddhism. Avolokita, the all-sided one, whose face is turned in every direction that he may see everything and save everyone, has been regarded as a saviour superior to other great Bodhisattvas--that is, future Buddhas. According to tradition, to think of Avolokita was better than to honour thousands of other Buddhas; he would come as the thousandth and last Buddha. Indian and Chinese tradition has held that Buddha would return from heaven in the flesh, his arrival attested by miracles. He would establish a kingdom of heavenly truth and justice." (Wallis, 1943. p7-8)

[4]Wallis suggests there is a messianic element in Hinduism, quoting Krishna in the Bhavagad-gita. The tenth avatar of Hinduism would come at a time of universal wickedness and establish on earth a kingdom of happiness and righteousness.(1943.p7)

as distinct from religions with millennial features, do not occur with a similar consistency, partly because the cyclical time conception inherent in some religions is incompatible with that necessary for the conceptualization of an imminent and total millennium. However they do occur to a surprising extent, given their apparently irrational nature. In this thesis I shall firstly examine the social conditions under which millennial movements arise, for recent research has suggested that apparently diverse movements have many features in common, and it seems likely that these common features extend to the social conditions being experienced by each movement's believers immediately prior to their acceptance of the belief. And secondly I shall analyse why the individual doctrines and rituals of different movements are as they are. Rather than being purely a consequence of the particular personality of a movement's prophet or leader, as some writers seem to suggest, it is thought that the specific beliefs of a movement are also, and perhaps more basically, a consequence of the cultural heritage of the people involved.

Millennial movements can be distinguished from other religious, and secular, movements by their attitude towards salvation. Norman Cohn categorises their conception of salvation as:

(a) collective, in the sense that it is to be enjoyed by the faithful as a collectivity;

(b) terrestrial, in the sense that it is to be realized on this earth and not in some other-worldly heaven;

(c) imminent, in the sense that it is to come both soon and suddenly;

(d) total, in the sense that it is utterly to transform life on earth, so that the new dispensation will be no mere improvement on the present, but perfection itself;

(e) miraculous, in the sense that it is to be accomplished by, or with the help of, supernatural agencies. (1970A. p13)[5]

Within this overall view of salvation there are countless possible ways of imagining the millennium and the route to it; each movement has its unique irreducible particularity and distinctiveness. (Cohn, 1970A. p14; Talmon, 1966.p165) Yet they do manifest a set of common characteristics. Recently a number of sociologists, anthropologists, and historians have been concerned with analysing these similarities by a comparative study of different movements.[6] Sociologically this is an important change in emphasis because in the past most scholars who have analysed millennial movements have been interested in either

---

[5]Cohn uses the term 'millenarian' rather than 'millennial'.

[6]Sylvia Thrupp, 1970; Vittorio Lanternari, 1963; Talmon, 1962, 1966; Bryan Wilson, 1963; and some European work, eg. W.E. Muhlmann, 1961; G. Balandier, 1970, (French edition 1959)

the specific history of individual movements from their formation to their demise; in the theological origins of single movements; or else in the particular personalities of individual prophets. (For example: the numerous writings on the Jehovah's Witnesses and on other institutionalized sects; P.E. Shaw's "The Catholic Apostolic Church", (1946); Jean Seguy's paper "David Lazzaretti et la secte apocalyptique des Giurisdavidici, (1957).) Although anthropologists have tended to investigate questions of greater sociological importance, they too, in the past, have concentrated on individual movements. Some of these investigations have been excellent, for example, James Mooney's "The Ghost Dance Rebellion", (1965), and Peter Lawrence's "Road Belong Cargo", (1964), but nevertheless, because they are specific to single movements, they are individually of little use in developing and testing sociological generalizations. Recently some anthropologists have tried to combine the analyses of a variety of individual movements within one culture area. This applies particularly to Melanesia. Peter Worsley, (1968), I.C. Jarvie, (1963), and Kenelm Burridge, (1969), have all attempted to produce theoretical explanations that can account for the numerous 'cargo cult' movements that have developed in that area.

Sociologists have also shown an increased interest in the comparative analysis of millennial movements, but their approach has been multi-geographical as well as multi-temporal.

A number of important sociological studies have appeared as a consequence of this in the last decade and a half. "Millennial Dreams in Action" edited by Sylvia Thrupp was published in 1962. It was the outcome of a conference held in 1960, and contains seventeen individual papers of relevance to millennialism. However because each paper is apparently written with little reference to the other papers in the volume it fails in its aim to

> "draw together certain findings of historical work and of recent work by anthropologists and sociologists, on religious movements that have been animated by the idea of a perfect age or a perfect land." (Thrupp, 1970. p11)

Nevertheless, together with a similar volume, "Chiliasmus und Nativismus" edited by W.E. Muhlmann, (1961), it reflected the increased interest sociologists and social historians were taking in millennial movements, (e.g. Cohn's "The Pursuit of the Millennium", (1970, first edition 1957), Bryan Wilson's "Sects and Society", (1961), and John Lofland's "Doomsday Cult", (1966).), and provided much of the data used in later syntheses.

Vittorio Lanternari's "The Religions of the Oppressed", subtitled "A Study of Modern Messianic Cults", appeared in English in 1963. In it Lanternari discusses a wide range of millennial and other messianic movements occurring in six separate culture areas--Africa, North America, South America, Melanesia, Polynesia, and Asia (including Indonesia)--and, as would be expected, succeeds in producing a more integrated volume than

Thrupp. However his analysis is not totally satisfactory because of his failure to base his comparisons on an explicitly developed theoretical framework. But, given that he is concerned primarily with the historical development of the movements he discusses, this is a minor criticism. A fourth book that has received some attention is E.J. Hobsbawm's "Primitive Rebels", (1959). Although not concerned solely with millennial movements, the volume's comparative approach, and analysis of sociologically more obscure movements, make it important.

These books created a great deal of interest, and from them developed three articles which are of great importance to this thesis. Specifically I am referring to the review articles by Yonina Talmon, (1962), and Bryan Wilson, (1963), and to the former's consequent article "Millenarian Movements", (1966). These writers succeeded, where others failed, in integrating the comparative analyses of various movements, in isolating a set of characteristics and ideal types common to all movements, and, most importantly, in initiating the formulation of a theoretical model to explain their occurrence.

I shall discuss the conclusions to be drawn from these three articles in some detail for two reasons. Firstly these articles successfully summarized the analyses of millennial movements that had occurred previously, and in doing so eliminated many of the sociological shortcomings of these earlier studies. Secondly these articles are particularly significant

to this thesis because in it I have attempted to answer some of the questions implicitly suggested by them. For example, the fact that there are so many similarities between various millennial movements in itself suggests that there may equally be similarities in the social conditions in which millennial movements arise, and in the mechanisms by which they develop. Thus this thesis is in fact only a continuation of the comparative analysis previously undertaken by these various scholars.

Summary of recent comparative research on millennial movements.

It has already been noted that millennial movements have a specific conception of time, a conception which is not consonant with a number of world religions. Time is viewed as a linear process which leads to a final future. Thus, as Talmon points out, millennialism is a merger between a historical and a non-historical conception of time. (Talmon, 1962. p130) In the minds of the believers historical change will lead to a cessation of all change. That is, millennialism looks to the future for the creation of the all perfect, non-changing world while rejecting the present totally evil and abysmally corrupt one. The transition from the present to the future is always sudden, it is never a gradual progression towards the final goal. Sometimes the transition is expected to occur miraculously without a preparatory struggle, but more frequently

> "unprecedented cataclysms, disastrous upheavals and bloody calamities (are expected)...which

> will destroy the agents of corruption, purge the sinful world and prepare it for its final redemption." (Talmon, 1962. p130)

Although the attitudes towards the present and future are fully determined, the attitude towards the past is more ambivalent. Generally there is a rejection of the past, a rejection which often includes the ritual overthrow of traditional norms. But occasionally the past is viewed as a mythical golden age which will return with the coming millennium. This latter variation is most common when some outside group can be easily identified as the cause of the present evil state of affairs, and when the customs of this outside group have not been assimilated to any extent and are not considered valuable.

Some millennial movements not only conceive of time as perfect, but also of a particular perfect space. That is, the millennium will herald a return to a particular area of traditional importance. For example, the Peasant Crusaders' ideolgy demanded a return to Jerusalem where the millennium would occur, and the Brazilian Tupi Guarna movements set out to discover the 'Land without Evil'.

The majority of millennial movements are messianic, that is Cohn's "supernatural agencies" are personified by some form of culture hero. For Western societies the messiah is usually the returning Jesus Christ, although, as Cohn illustrated, he is sometimes a political leader or king. For example, the

Joachites believed Frederik II of Germany was soon to return to earth, and in parts of Britain it was traditionally believed that King Arthur was sleeping until his glorious return. In other parts of the world different culture heroes, gods, or leaders assume the messianic mantle, or rather have it imposed upon them.

Another common characteristic of millennial movements is their style of secular leadership. In nearly all cases this revolves around a charismatic prophet who is told of the coming millennium by divine intercession, and is bid inform the people of God's plan. The method used by God to reveal His plan is very much culture bound, being repeated with each successive movement within an area. The most common mechanism appears to be a vision experienced in a dream or under the influence of illness or drugs. The specific characteristics necessary for the development of charisma and acceptance of the prophet by his followers will be discussed in greater detail later. It is sufficient here to note

(1) that their prophecies are forged out of the traditional millennial components of their culture,

and (2) that in some cases the leader is so important to the movement he initiated that it collapses when his leadership is no longer available, while in other cases the leader functions purely as a symbolic focus of identification.

Where millennialism is an endemic force, or in Cohn's words, a "persistent tradition", (1970A. p281), any available figure may be seized upon as a leader.

In some cases the charismatic prophet eventually is considered to be the personification of the messiah, although this is not usual. One example is David Lazzaretti of Tuscany in 1875-1878, who originally thought Christ would return to lead His people at the coming millennium, but who by 1878 was preaching that he, himself, would be God's envoy. More usual than the progression from prophetic to messianic leadership is a multiple leadership involving division of labour along one of two lines. (Talmon,1966. p170) Frequently there is a purely secular organizer who is concerned with the practical matters of keeping the movement viable. He prepares the path for the inspired leader to tread. Less common is a division of labour between what Talmon calls internal and external leaders. The internal leader controls the movement as an entity within itself, while the external leader represents it in its relations with the outside world.

The vast majority of movements are restrictive in that the participants in the millennium will only be those people who accept and believe in the prophet's teachings, (elective membership), or, alternatively, be members of an easily identified group, e.g. members of a particular race or of a distinct native group, (ascriptive membership). The effect of

this restrictive membership is to establish and maintain the identity and boundary lines of the group, and thus increase the level of each member's commitment and increase the cohesion within the group as a whole, following the pattern outlined by Georg Simmel. (See Simmel (1955); Coser (1956) Occasionally there is a movement that believes that the millennium will be experienced by everyone irrespective of whether they believe the prophet or not. Often the rationale behind such a belief is that the believers' salvation is a

> "precondition and vehicle of universal delivery. The nation which has been oppressed and humiliated will become a light unto the nations and their guide on the road to God". (Talmon, 1966. p176).

The role the group of believers plays in the coming of the millennium varies a great deal. In some groups salvation is believed to be pre-ordained and inevitable. In others the millennium will only occur if every last desire and order of God is fulfilled. Consequently some movements are totally passive, continuing to maintain normal social relations, although perhaps emphasizing proselytization; others are passive but reject all normal relations, for example believers may be expected to leave their homes and families, and gather together in a particular place and watch for divine signs of the coming millennium. Other movements are more active in the rituals to be followed and in their rejection of societal norms, demanding total withdrawal and non-cooperation with secular authority of

all forms, while on the other hand demanding great effort in, for example, the building of monuments or sacred shrines. Finally some movements are highly active, incorporating numerous and specific rituals, sometimes destroying all material possessions and foodstuffs, desecrating graves, commiting arson, and even murdering non-believers. As would be expected the particular rites and rituals that have to be followed are very much culture bound. Peter Worsley has suggested that the more imminent the millennium is believed to be, the more active the movement will be. (1968. p232-233) In more active movements the blame for the non-occurrence of the millennium is often placed on individuals who refused to behave in the ordained manner.

Most frequently the active movements are antinomian, that is, they encourage believers to follow their emotions and desires fully, and to disregard the society's common standards of behaviour, for they often see themselves as God's selected people, and, thus, can do no wrong in His eyes. For them there can be no morality or immorality, for they are above judgement. They have already been judged and selected. A few movements that occur are, however, extremely hypernomian. They insist on total self-discipline and stringent observation of ascetic ideals.

In general, as would be expected, where there is effective formal control and policing by a group hostile or indifferent to the beliefs of the millennial cult, the movement tends

to be hypernomian. Where there is no such control, or where it is rendered ineffective by the potential controllers accepting the millennial doctrine, the movement tends towards antinomianism. And, furthermore, the effectiveness of formal control and policing will not be unrelated to the antinomianism or hypernomianism of the culture itself. In other words, and perhaps most importantly, the greater the freedom for satisfaction of desire there is, in general, in a society, the more likely it is that any movements developing within its milieu will incorporate an antinomian rationale.

The major problems investigated in this thesis stem directly from the above. Because apparently diverse movements in actual fact have features in common it was thought likely that there may be common features in the social conditions under which millennial movements develop. Indeed this has been suggested by many writers, most noticeably, Wilson, (1963) and Talmon, (1966). However, in general, the comparative analysis of the conditions under which millennial movements develop is not as advanced as the comparison of their common features. There is not, for example, a detailed work that compares the origins of millennial movements in modern Western civilization with those in medieval Western society, nor with those in colonial or other areas. Nor has there been any analysis at a theoretical level of the cultural or psychological factors that make millennialism attractive to so many people at differ-

ent times in different cultures.

Similarly, although recent studies have emphasized the similarities between different movements, there are obviously great differences between them, especially in their specific doctrines and rituals. There have been few attempts to explain these differences, and often where an attempt is made, the major variable is assumed to be the particular personality of a movement's leader. However comparisons of movements within one culture area, (eg. Worsley, (1968); Burridge, (1969)), suggest that the cultural traditions of the people may be more important.

Consequently this thesis is concerned with analysing these problems. That is, with a comparative analysis of the origins of millennial movements, and with the formulation of a theoretical model with which to explain their occurrence and the manner in which they develop. It is hoped that an analysis of movements in different areas at different times will illustrate the underlying similarities in the immediate social experiences of the followers, and help account for their acceptance of such apparently irrational movements.[7] For, sociologically, the view that the movements can be explained by reference to mass mental aberration or, in the case of aboriginal movements, to an underdeveloped primitive mind, as

---

[7] Ralph Linton wrote: "The basic feature of both messianic cults and nativistic movements is that they represent frankly irrational flights from reality." (1943, p233)

suggested by some earlier anthropologists and many missionaries and governmental officials,[8] is unacceptable.[9] In contradistinction to such views this thesis attempts to illustrate that millennial movements are understandable phenomena given the social, cultural, and historical conditions of the people involved. Thus it goes beyond most of the recent analyses of millennial movements to the extent that the purpose is understanding and not categorizing.

The method to be used is a secondary analysis of historical and sociological material on a small number of highly selected millennial movements. The examples to be used are not only highly selected because they are, to some extent, an arbitrary sub-set of all the movements that have been analysed, but also because these analysed movements are themselves, in all probability, not representative of all the movements that have, in fact, occurred. (Wilson, 1963. p99) Largely, of course, this is because the organized investigation and analysis of individual and collective behaviour has been dominated by

---

[8] James McLaughlin, reputed to be one of the better Indian agents, wrote of the Ghost Dance in a private letter: "It would seem impossible that any person, no matter how ignorant, could be brought to believe such absurd nonsense." (Quoted by James Mooney, 1965. p29)

[9] "Assume these are rational people acting rationally. Why do they suddenly want to spread a prophecy? Why do they suddenly want to follow a prophet? What are the sociological factors inherent in the situation which make such a course of action reasonable; part, that is, of the logic of the situation? Why is the actual form of the doctrine as it is and why is it readily accepted by the people? Nothing of this is explained by mental confusion." (I.C. Jarvie, 1963.p8)

Western societies. The movements that have aroused most interest amongst academics have been the ones that have directly affected Western society, or parts of it, the most. In general, the greater the popular support for a movement, and, thus, the greater its disruptive potential, the greater the academic attention directed at it.

With the possible exception of early Jewish cults, the vast majority of millennial movements that have been analysed have arisen in one of three historical and geographical settings.

(a) Colonial--where a culture area has been colonized by an imperial power and has had imposed on it the values of that society. If, as is usually the case, these values are incompatible with traditional values, millennial movements may develop. Their development is all the more likely if the dominating power's values, (as taught to the colonized), and actions, (as experienced by the colonized), are discrepant. For example, religious ideology may differ greatly from economic practice.

(b) Medieval European--where the society was increasingly differentiated, but where comparatively rigid status boundaries still existed, maintained largely by the virtual omnipotence of the two great institutions, nobility and church. Despite their differences, the two were becoming increasingly confounded. When

great deprivation was experienced the masses frequently turned to one of the many wandering mystics who, for one reason or another, had not been accommodated into the church-nobility order.

(c) Modern--here the society is highly differentiated and comparatively 'organic'. The followers of millennial movements may no longer consist of highly structured collectivities, (although there will still be many common characteristics), and certainly not all, or even the majority of, the members of any one structured group believe in an imminent millennium. Instead the followers are identified in terms of their acceptance of a particular legitimating agency, for legitimacy is no no longer in the hands of a few great institutions.

Once a theoretical model has been developed, its general validity will be tested by applying it to movements from each of these three settings. The chosen movements were selected for three principle reasons: firstly, together they cover a wide geographical area and historical period, and can, therefore, justifiably be used in a comparative analysis of the origins of millennial movements; secondly, there is a relatively extensive literature available on all these movements, which is, of course, essential for any secondary analysis; and thirdly,

these particular examples each contained elements which seemed to be particularly interesting, both intrinsically and in terms of the theoretical framework being developed.

Outline of the thesis

Chapter 2 will be devoted to a theoretical analysis of the two major problems being investigaged in the thesis: the first, the social conditions conducive to the development of millennial movements; and the second, an analysis of why the specific doctrines and rituals of each movement are as they are. This chapter's primary assumption is that millennial movements are not irrational from the standpoint of the believers, but that they develop from the social and cultural heritage of the believers, particularly with respect to the presuppositions they make about the world's natural and social ordering.

In chapters 3 to 8 the theoretical model developed is applied to six individual movements. These movements are respectively:

(A) the Ghost Dance of 1890 occurring amongst the Plains Indians of America;

(B) the Kimbangu-Matswa Ngunzi occurring amongst the native population of the Congo in the early 1930s;

(C) the Crusade of the Shepherds, 1251, occurring in Flanders;

(D) the Lazzaretti movement occurring in Tuscany, Italy, in 1878;

(E) the Irvingite movement occurring in London, England, in the early 1830s;

and finally

(F) the Black Muslim movement in its early, formative years, (1930-1934), occurring amongst the ghetto blacks of Detroit in the United States of America.

The conclusion, chapter 9, is a summary of the appropriateness of the model developed in chapter 2 for all of these movements.

Chapter 2

Theoretical framework for the analysis of millennial movements.

The purpose of this chapter is to formulate a theoretical framework by which the development of millennial movements can be understood and explained. Two analytically distinct questions will be incorporated into this framework: firstly, an examination of the types of situation in which millennial movements arise; and secondly, an analysis of why each movement takes the form it does, why this doctrine and not that one is included in its beliefs, for example. The major hypothesis behind the analyses of both of these questions is that millennial movements are not totally irrational, and that they cannot, therefore, be explained away by reference to mass megalomania or insanity, nor to the effects of civilization on inherently primitive minds. Instead millennial movements are seen as one possible response to situations that cannot be fully understood or legitimated by the assumptions previously held by a group of people about the world and its natural and social orderings.

Situations conducive to the formation of millennial movements

The concept of 'relative deprivation', which was first

systematically applied to millennial movements by David Aberle, (1970),[10] is of great use in understanding situations in which millennial movements arise. This is partly because the concept is sufficiently abstract to include within its scope situations which appear at first glance to be unrelated to one another; and also partly because it implies that the actual situation itself, objectively viewed, is less important than the perception of it held by the people experiencing it. It is only by considering the perceptions and perspectives of the people who accept a millennial doctrine, (i.e. their own particular 'construction of reality'), that millennial movements can be understood, for it is only then that they appear in any way 'reasonable'.

Relative deprivation is a consequence, experienced by the individual at a psychological level, of the non-occurrence of a desired and subjectively legitimated expectation. Because the expectation is legitimated its non-occurrence leads to a psychological dissonance which, depending on the importance of the expectation for the individual, may, as Festinger has shown, (1957), lead to new patterns of behaviour that effectively lessen, or even eliminate, the dissonance. Millennial movements appear to be one solution for the dissonance produced by certain forms of relative deprivation.

---

[10]Bernard Barber, (1941), also uses the concept.

By definition, relative deprivation is dependent on awareness of alternative situations to which the individual compares his own present situation unfavourably. Aberle suggests that primary amongst the reference situations are

(1) The individual's past situation

(2) A perceived future situation

(3) Someone else's present situation

Reference situation (2) is of particular importance if expectations have been rising. It would seem that people can accept a stable situation, no matter how bad, provided they have no basis for expecting it to be otherwise. However once the conditions begin to change for the better, there is a tendency to expect the change to continue, at least until the situation is comparable to that of an envied second group. (Thus there is a combination of reference situations (2) and (3).) If it does not, an intense dissatisfaction arises which often results in mass movements of one form or another. J. Davies has suggested that the French, Russian, and Egyptian revolutions can be best understood in these terms. (1962). A number of millennial movements result from similar situations, a prime example being the Black Muslim movement. When millennial movements do arise under such conditions, this form of relative deprivation is comparable to Weber's "resentiment". (Weber, 1963. p110-117) He writes that

'resentiment' is

> "a concomitant of that particular religious ethic of the disprivileged which...teaches that the unequal distribution of mundane goods is caused by the sinfulness and the illegality of the priviledged, and that sooner or later God's wrath will overtake them." (1963. p110)

Such an attitude is important in millennial movements because of its dependence on the idea of future compensation for present suffering. Of course, in millennial movements the future becomes imminent. Without the concept of future compensation for present suffering it would seem impossible for millennial movements to arise.

Aberle differentiates four areas where deprivation may occur:

(a) material possessions

(b) status

(c) behaviour

(d) worth

He suggests that deprivation can be experienced in any one of these areas. It seems, however, that when millennialism is accepted, the followers are experiencing deprivation in all four areas at the same time. That is, the type of relative deprivation that leads to the extremely radical acceptance of imminent millennialism is a deprivation at the very core of the internalized, and thus legitimated, hierarchy of assumptions,

values, and commitments that each individual learns, primarily through contact with his culture, or sub-culture, (in differentiated societies), but also through his own individual experiences.[11] It is a total alienation from society, in Marx's words "an estrangement, a loss of reality". (Selsam and Martel, 1963. p297) In other words the relative deprivation must affect an integral part of what Jerome Frank calls the individual's "world view", (1963. Chapter 2),[12] and what Anthony Wallace calls his "mazeway". (1956. p266) It is largely because the relative deprivation is a consequence of the difference between present reality and expectations legitimated at the societal and cultural level that millennial movements are 'movements'. If the relative deprivation only affected individual and personal hopes and desires it would not provide the basis for a mass phenomena, but only for individual changes in belief or behaviour.

Thus it is impossible to say that the deprivation leading to millennial movements is felt only in one area. For example, the American Indian tribes at the time of the Ghost

---

[11] For a discussion of "externalization, objectification, and internalization", as well as consequent legitimation, see Berger, (1969).

[12] Frank shows that many apparently dissimilar occurrences, especially thought reform (brain-washing), revivalist religion, miracle cures, and psychotherapy, rely on similar mechanisms, and thereby illustrates the primacy of a belief in a specific "world view". Jarvie, (1963. p7), also uses the term "world view" and compares it to Popper's concept of "horizon of expectations", (1963).

Dance in 1890 felt an immense deprivation at the loss of the great herds of buffalo that had once roamed freely across the continent. But the feeling of deprivation was great not only because of the loss of material possessions, (eg. food, hide for clothing, bedding, tepees, etc.), but also because the loss of the buffalo created deprivation in terms of behaviour patterns, (primarily because hunting was no longer possible), of status, (as Barber, (1941), and Lesser, (1933), have shown, the whole Indian status system depended on the buffalo and its hunting), and, consequently, of worth.

But although the deprivation is experienced in all four areas, it may be possible, as it was for the Ghost Dance, to determine in what area the precipitating deprivation occurred. Most frequently these are related to the economic sphere of activity, (Aberle's material possessions category). This, of course, is a reflection of the ultimate importance of economic security; and, in turn, is reflected in the emphasis the concept of the millennium always places on the satisfaction of material desires. In a few cases, (notably the cargo cults of Melanesia), this culminates in the promise of an undreamed, (or more accurately, purely dreamed), abundance of material possessions. Occasionally, however, a movement will develop as a consequence of a general overall dissatisfaction with the

present style of life.[13] In such cases it may be impossible to determine in which sphere the initial deprivation occurred.

Finally Aberle suggests that relative deprivation can be felt by an individual qua individual, or by an individual as a member of a group, (or category). As millennial movements have been defined as mass collective movements, the concern is with relative deprivation experienced at a group or macro level. The causes of the relative deprivation affect the group collectively because they affect the shared characteristics which define the group. Consequently the whole group can be mobilized into some form of mass movement with relative ease. The shared characteristics of the group result from shared experiences, for example as members of a particular tribe, ethnic group, or socio-economic class. If the shared characteristic defining the group is only one of many applying to each individual, and, therefore, only one of the many by which he can define himself and give meaning to his existence, i.e. if the society is organic, in Durkheim's terms, there may be a variety of attempted 'solutions', for the content of any one solution will not be consonant with other characteristics of some of the people affected by the deprivation.

---

[13] These are comparable to the types of movement Roszak, (1969), analyses. In these latter there is a generalized dissatisfaction with industrial society's emphasis on technology and material consumption, and its lack of concern for the spiritual essence of man. Such seems to be the case for example with the millennially inclined 'Jesus Freaks'.

The most important single difference between the three geographical and historical settings mentioned previously--colonial, medieval, and modern--is their position on the mechanistic-organic scale. Colonized societies tend to be undifferentiated and mechanistic, with the vast majority of the population acting in similar patterns and accepting similar beliefs. Medieval society tended to be differentiated into diverse strata, and thus was more organic in general. However, it was not organic within each differentiated stratum. To a large extent, each individual's life-style was determined by a small number of highly important characteristics, (in particular, occupation), and people sharing these characteristics can be regarded as living relatively similar lives. Therefore medieval society was organic at a societal level but mechanistic at a sub-societal level. Elements of this can still be seen in modern society, but on the whole each stratum has itself become more organic, with each individual interacting far more with individuals from other strata, and dependent on them for a wider variety of his everyday needs. As a consequence of this, each individual in modern society has a multifold self-identification; there is no determined single dimension through which he gives meaning to his life. There are many different types of commitment on which he can base his world view. In medieval society the alternatives were more limited. And in mechanistic colonial society they

are even more restricted. Consequently the less organic and the more mechanistic the society, the more likely it is that people with equivalent status will accept similar beliefs. For in organic societies not only will people within the same category not experience relative deprivation to the same extent, as the focus of the deprivation will be less important for one person and more important for another, but even where relative deprivation is experienced to the same degree, different people are able to alleviate the resulting dissonance by different means. Imminent millennialism is only one of the possible responses. Even in movements where the determining characteristics of membership are totally closed, for instance in the Black Muslim movement, only a small proportion of the possible believers are actual believers. As well as resulting from differences in experience leading to differing levels of relative deprivation, this is also a consequence of people having knowledge of numerous other responses to the dissonance experienced.

There is also the possibility that in differentiated societies, (and all organic societies are, ipso facto, differentiated), people may experience relative deprivation for different reasons. But no matter what the primary cause, some of the affected may respond in the same way and accept the preaching of the imminent change. In other words, although the reasons may differ the effect is the same. Thus the

believers of a particular millennial cult may consit of minority sections of a number of groups experiencing dissonance as a consequence of different relative deprivations.[14] However the process is limited by the need for the prophecy and doctrine to be consonant with each group's cultural heritage, and with the causes assumed by the affected to be responsible for their present conditions.

Psychologically relative deprivation results in dissonance experienced by each affected person. But the dissonance experienced in the case of millennial movements is very different in content from that discussed by Festinger, although not in basic form. He wrote that:

> "Two elements are in a dissonant relation if, considering these two elements alone, the obverse of one element would follow from the other." (1957. p13)

Festinger was concerned with dissonance at a micro level, and investigated cases where the individual experienced dissonance in situations which were important to him, but which did not affect his basic assumptions and legitimations. Even when Festinger investigated a quasi millennial movement, he was interested in the effect of disconfirmation, and not with the initial causes of the belief. (1956)

Here dissonance is used at a macro level, both in the

---

[14] Throughout, this model applies only to people converted to a belief in the imminence of the millennium. Thus people born into millennial sects or cults, (i.e. second or third generation believers), are explicitly excluded.

sense that it derives from circumstances that similarly affect a group of people and not just a single individual; and more importantly, in the sense that it questions the total set of assumptions, (the world view or mazeway), of each individual affected. Similarly the elements which are dissonant are macro variables, the legitimated traditional or changing social and cultural expectations, and the social reality as perceived by the affected individuals. However although the dissonance that results in acceptance of imminent millennialism involves qualitatively different elements from the type Festinger envisaged, the effects are not that dissimilar. In both cases there is likely to be a change of attitudes, beliefs and, consequently,behaviour. The difference lies in the radicalness of the change; the latter can be accommodated without changing the fundamental assumptions or world view of the individuals concerned, the former cannot. Under such circumstances millennialism is attractive because it provides a satisfactory interpretation of the present, as well as giving the hope of a perfect future.

Before discussing the social and cultural factors involved in the formation of a movement's specific doctrine and ritual, --(for again it is not thought that the contents of millennial movements are a consequence of chance, or purely of the individual personality of a charismatic prophet),-- it may be useful to briefly summarize the major hypotheses so far

developed in this chapter. Basically these are three in number, and together form a model by which the development of situations conducive to the formation of millennial movements can be explained. This model suggests that there must be:

I. Relative deprivation of a (generally) differentiated collective, with respect to past experiences, future expectations, or the current situation of persons considered equal or inferior. Although the relative deprivation may initially occur on only one of four dimensions, (material possessions, behaviour, status, and worth), its fundamental importance to the world view of the person means it eventually incorporates the other dimensions.

II. The situation manifests itself at the psychological level in dissonance, due to the situation's lack of legitimation from the standpoint of the previously accepted world view.

III. This requires a new interpretation of the situation, entailing an extensive revision of this previously accepted world view. (It would be wrong to think of a totally new world view, for like old religions, old world views "provide the cultural building blocks for the next (ones)".[15]

---

[15]See footnote 21.

Condition III is fulfilled by conversion to a belief in the imminence of the millennium, and if enough converts are gained leads to the formation of a millennium movement. But a belief in the imminence of the millennium is only one of several alternative responses to condition III.[16] In other words, the conditions outlined above are necessary for the formation of millennial movements, but by themselves are not sufficient. Millennialism is only one of the functional, or in Worsley's terms, "competential", alternatives.[17] The reasons why the movements are not, for example, revolutionary, in the narrower, purely secular sense of the word, or other-worldly, must be explained.

One of the main reasons is that millennial movements nearly always develop as a response by a group with no knowledge of the political machinery of the ruling elite, or with no political influence with which they could attempt to change the social situation. (Indeed, if they had any political influence it is unlikely that the conditions would ever become

---

[16] Barber makes this point strongly when, after utilizing a theory of relative deprivation to explain messianic movements, he writes: "It is here suggested that the messianic movement is only one of several alternative responses." (1941. p667).

[17] Worsley, (1968.pxxx), suggests that S.F. Nadel, (1954. p259-260), uses the word "competence" rather than "function" while discussing the concept 'religion' to avoid any implications that religion is in any way a functional requisite. From this Worsley conceived of "competential alternatives" for the same reasons.

so bad as to create the need for a millennial belief.) In Talmon's terms, the followers are pre-political or non-political. (1966. p184-185)[18] For example, the followers of millennial movements in colonized areas generally have no knowledge of differentiated political structure, or of its relation to other differentiated spheres of Western social organization. Similarly, where society is highly stratified, and political control firmly, and traditionally, in the hands of the higher strata, (as was the case in medieval Europe), political solutions will not be part of the cultural heritage of the mass of the lower strata, and, therefore, will not be easily accepted by them. This suggests the most basic reason for the millennial alternative being the accepted one. Millennialism is incorporated in the traditional eschatology of the people involved, while revolutionary doctrine in a secular political sense is not. There is no revolutionary heritage, no revolutionary ideology, and no revolutionary consciousness. There is, however, a millennial consciousness.

Furthermore, millennialism is an example of strong desires being transformed into beliefs. From a wish, a hope,

---

[18] "Pre-political is not used here to mean that millennial movements are a preliminary stage in the development of a political movement. Although it is often the case that millennial movements develop into strictly secular political movements, "pre-political" here refers only to the political knowledge of the followers at the time of their acceptance of the belief that the millennium is imminent.

and a desire for a better future, develops the illusion that the dream will become social reality, (i.e. this-worldly reality, not other-worldly reality). This is confounded and strengthened because the deprivation concerns this-worldly social constructs: social worth, social status, socially accepted and socially rewarded behaviour, and socially desired possessions.

Millennial movements may evolve into other "competential alternatives", especially when there is a diffusion of knowledge about the functioning of the political system of the dominating group. Millennial movements frequently provide a starting point for what develop into more reality orientated revitalization movements. (Wallace, 1956. p277; Wilson, 1963. p105) Thus they may be pre-political in a second sense.[19] Even when the millennium fails to occur,[20] the movement has not only provided hope but often a basis of social solidarity from which other types of movement, (i.e. alternative, and more realistic responses to the deprivation), can develop.

The development of the doctrine

Thus if millennialism is part of the cultural heritage

---

[19] See footnote 18.

[20] Occasionally the millennium appears to occur, at least partially. Some of the cargo cults in Melanesia demanded the destruction of all foodstuff and other material possessions. When, as a consequence of this, the Administration brought in provisions to alleviate hunger, etc., the followers believed it to be the beginning of the millennial cargo.

of a group, that is, if it is one of the assumptions held about the (future) ordering of the world, it may be used as a rationale for explaining the dissonance experienced as a consequence of the disparity between traditional or changing expectations and social reality. If millennialism is not part of the cultural heritage, an explanation in these terms would not be satisfactory to the group involved. Nor would it be as satisfactory if other alternative secular rationales that could explain the situation were culturally available. Given this, there are still "countless possible ways of imagining the millennium and the route to it". The particular variant developed as a response to a situation will be a composition of elements derived from:

(1) the cultural traditions surrounding millennialism in the society,

(2) the specific history and consequences of the social situation,

and (3) the individual personality of the prophet, (and in many cases those of his immediate disciples).

The effect of the prophet's personality will be modified by his own perception of the developing situation, (including the role he desires to play in it), by his status within the society, and by his knowledge of other millennial movements, however vague such knowledge may be. It is hypothesized that

each of these former three, (culture, social situation, and personality), interacts with one another so that a millennial ideology develops that is consonant with all three.

Millennial movements can only be fully understood in this inter-related dialectical manner. Thus both Talmon, in her discussion of Worsley's major hypothesis, and Lanternari, in an analysis of the relationship between the millennial prophet and his followers, are correct when they write, respectively:

> "(By taking) into consideration the social conditions and cultural milieu which give rise to (the movements) they cease to be bizarre and fantastic and become fully understandable and not illogical reactions." (Talmon, 1962. p140)

> "There is probably no known religious phenomenon in which the dialectical interpretation of the relationship between personality--the individual personality of the prophet--and culture--the social personality of the group--becomes more convincing than it does in regard to messianic cults." (Lanternari, 1963. p304)

The interdependence of the existing social situation and the cultural heritage of the people has already been illustrated in the analysis of the formation of relative deprivation and cognitive dissonance, as well as in the discussion of the need for a 'millennial consciousness'. The importance of this latter need has, at times, been underestimated, largely because, although nearly all religions have a millennial or, at least, a messianic element, the movements themselves seem to have occurred only in what Peter Berger calls "the orbit of the Biblical tradition", (1969. Chapter III, (p69).), by which

he means those areas where Christian, Jewish, or Islamic religions are dominant. However the idea that only areas in the Biblical orbit produce millennialism is somewhat misleading, especially in regard to the colonial situation. Because millennialism has occurred frequently in this situation, a situation dominated by the Christian powers of Western Europe, there has been a tendency to assume such movements are a consequence of the recent impact of the Bible and the misunderstood teachings of the missionaries. But this is far from the truth. Elkin wrote in "Social Anthropology in Melanesia":

> "With few exceptions most of the natives preserve their fundamental beliefs and their traditional religions, their ancient rituals are performed or remembered in hiding ready to be resumed in the open as soon as the opportunity arises."(1953.p7)

Similarly many of the more insightful missionaries have realised that the natives only accept that part of Christianity which agrees with their own indigenous religion. The concept of the millennium is often one of these features.[21] Mircea Eliade argues that

> "If so many cargo cults have assimilated Christian millenarist ideas, it is because the natives have rediscovered in Christianity their old traditional eschatological myth." (1970.p143)

---

[21] All new religions build on the foundations of the old religions. Native acceptance of Christianity is no exception, nor is millennialism. "...even when a religion becomes old, it will still, despite the reluctance of its priesthood, provide the cultural building blocks for the next religion." A.F.C. Wallace, 1966. p4.

Millennialism, thus, is often present in the traditional culture of colonized areas, and has found additional support in some of the teachings of the colonizers. By accepting part of the Bible as true, (that part that agrees with the traditional theodicy), the colonized are strengthened in their millennial beliefs; beliefs which, because of the disparity between the social, political, and economic conditions of colonialism and the traditional pre-colonial situation, are of utmost importance to the colonized in interpreting the meaning of their experiences. For, as Belshaw has shown, cargo cults and other millennial movements are not illusions but attempts to solve certain problems in native terms, (1950. p123-123), and these terms, of necessity, involve in part the assumptions and presuppositions of their native culture. The same applies to movements in other areas of the world and in other time periods. To re-iterate, the form a movement takes, and the ideology it adheres to, are determined mainly by the cultural heritage, and in particular the millennial heritage, of the followers. In Wilson's terms:

> "The special forms which movements frequently display are often dictated by their use of the cultural stock of their own society...In addition to the persistence of mythical themes, patterns of action, institutionalized responses to circumstances of tension, anxiety and danger, also persist." (1963. p104)

Wilson also raises the important point that the meaning given to cultural components can change once they are incor-

porated in new movements. He also suggests that some myths and practices acquire a new significance which they never enjoyed within the traditional culture, especially when they are associated with restorative movements. He stresses, however, the fact that their basis for inclusion within the ideology and ritual of new movements, even when they are adapted, is the relevance given them as traditional, (although until then, perhaps relatively insignificant), components of the society's culture.

> "(Although) these cultural responses are often re-constructed in the context of millennialism, (acquiring) new significance and (being) associated with new situations, they constitute distinct cultural continuities nonetheless." (Wilson, 1963. p104)

Thus, although the ritual and eschatological content of millennial movements are influenced by the prevailing social circumstances, they are still to a very great degree culture bound. That is, the existing situation can only play variations on a cultural theme.

Similarly, although the prophet is also influenced by the existing social conditions, he, too, generally acts out his role within cultural limitations. Each society has institutionalized ideal life-styles that prophets are expected to follow. Such life-styles have the function of setting the prophet apart from other men and, in effect, become an important part of the prophet's legitimation qua prophet within the

society. (See Dorothy Emmet, 1956) The particular life-style comes to be considered 'natural' and 'right'. It is not thought of as being a social construct, but is given an existential status. That is the life-style is objectivated in Berger's and Luckmann's sense, (1967), and becomes an integral element in the society's concept of 'prophet'. The life-style is a reflection of the society's development in general, and in particular of the part played by religion in the functioning of the society and of the patterns of behaviour which the society defines as religious.

For example in many colonized areas the traditional religion pervades every aspect of social life. The religious sphere is not differentiated from other spheres of life. To act socially involves actions with religious significance, and, although there are religious specialists, these specialists are considered specialists partly, (but only partly), because of their ability to act in ways which are considered religious or mystical. (This is not to say that the behaviour is not socially learnt, of course.) Thus the ability to fall into a trance or to experience visions is a necessary part of acceptance as a religious leader. Consequently any prophet, including of course one whose prophecy is millennial, follows these patterns. His message is given to him as a vision or as a dream, and it is because of this that it is given religious significance.

In the medieval situation religion is differentiated as

an institution, ie. has become increasingly specialized, but is still only partially differentiated from other spheres of activity. The religious specialists now have to have a greater intellectual training, especially in terms of literacy skills, and are also separated from other men by modes of dress, place of dwelling, and, theoretically, in attitude towards the secular. The millennial prophet is frequently an unofficial copy of the official religious specialist. He is literate, (unlike the mass of his potential followers), and has a knowledge of the written religious tradition. He lives a monastic life but without the protection of the monastery and the official Church. As a hermit he also differs from a monk in the reality, and not just the ideality, of his poverty.

In modern society religious specialization has not increased noticeably but the differentiation of social life has. And so has literacy and the scope of science. Revelation now comes through a rational analysis of the official religious text, eg. the Bible or the Koran. Acceptance of the prophecy may be likewise based on rational analysis, and not solely on faith in the prophet's psychic experiences. Just as the scientific approach dominates secular activity, so it comes to dominate the religious. Its power as a legitimating agency is all embracing, even when the end results are a denial of science and a cry for the spriritual integrity of man and his relationship with God.

But the prophet's style of life is only one aspect of his importance. Of greater significance here are the basis of his relationship to his followers, (i.e. his charisma), and the formation of his prophecy. Charisma, according to Max Weber who introduced the concept to sociology, is

> "a certain quality of an individual personality by virtue of which he is set apart from ordinary men and treated as endowed with supernatural, superhuman, or at least specifically exceptional powers or qualities. These are...not accessible to the ordinary person, but are regarded as of divine origin or as exemplary, and on the basis of them the individual concerned is treated as a leader." (1947.p358-359)

Weber was primarily concerned with the legitimation of power and authority, and used this concept of charisma in formulating a charismatic authority type by which he could explain social change. (Friedland, 1964. p18-21) His other two ideal authority types, traditional and rational-legal, are both more stable types, and any change within or between the two is generally, though not exclusively, accounted for in terms of the charismatic authority type. Thus the concept of charisma can be considered an integral part of a sociology of innovation.[22]

Because of his primary concern with how charismatic leadership became charismatic authority and with how charismatic authority related to the other authority types, Weber

---

[22]Friedland, (1964. p19), claims that Bendix, (1969), uses this term. (Chapter X) Worsley, (1968. pxxxviii, footnote 1), maintains Bendix does not imply it as strongly as Friedland suggests.

never satisfactorily analysed how charisma itself developed. Furthermore although Weber clearly indicated there was a social dimension involved in the possession of charisma, he also stressed it as a psychological attribute of the individual, an emphasis which can be seen in his definition. It is also an emphasis that has been followed almost exclusively by many post-Weberian students. The error in such an analysis was highlighted by Reinhard Bendix when he wrote:

> "In times of trouble the 'natural leader is...the man who is believed to possess extraordinary gifts of body and mind." (1969. p299. Emphasis added).

The social basis behind the subjective legitimacy of the charismatic in the eyes of his followers is, sociologically at least, most important. As Worsley has written, charisma for the sociologist

> "...can only be that which is recognized, by believers and followers, as 'charismatic' in the behaviour of those they treat as charismatic. Charisma is thus a function of recognition: the prophet without honour cannot be a charismatic prophet. Charisma, therefore, sociologically viewed, is a special relationship, not an attribute of individual personality or a mystical quality." (1968.pxii)

Eli Chinoy claims that

> "it is probably true that personalities that are potentially charismatic are continually being generated."

He continues

> "No prophet can succeed unless the circumstances are propitious. He succeeds when a potential

> following exists because of the problems that some people face." (1961. p279-280)

In other words the message the prophet preaches must be relevant. It must provide a vehicle by which the dissonant feelings of the followers are made consonant. This is achieved, in general, by the interacting nature of the relationship between the prophecy and social circumstances of the time, experienced by both the prophet and the followers. If the prophecy is not the consequence of such a relationship there will be no mass movement. Expressive speakers and striking personalities can continuously be found. They may even promote prophecies and doctrines but they lack a following, for their message lacks relevancy. That is, relevancy for a mass of followers. It will be relevant for the individual preacher, and incidentally be formed through the interaction of the various components that make up the situation experienced by the prophet. But if the situation is not experienced by a mass of followers, or, alternatively, the message does not incorporate important elements of their own culture, (i.e. has not developed from a viewpoint consonant with their own cultural, or sub-cultural, viewpoint, but only from that (different one) of the prophet), there will be no movement, and the would-be prophet will not be considered charismatic.

> "If genuine charisma is to be understood, analysis must be directed toward the social situation within which the charismatic figure operates and the character of his message. In sum while there are

> plenty of people with messages, these must be relevant to social groups before they begin to be received and become the basis for action." (Friedland, 1964. p21)

Thus the prophet plays his role within the cultural limitations of his society's implicit definition of 'prophet', and his prophecy must be formulated, if it is to be acceptable, so that it is consonant with the symbolisms and the traditions of his potential followers' culture or sub-culture, particularly the millennial elements in it. But this alone is not enough. Over and above this the message must be relevant to the situation of his potential followers. It is suggested that a millennial prophecy will only be relevant, and will only be given credence, if the potential followers are experiencing dissonance as a consequence of an overall deprivation that affects the very basis of their world view.

Obviously a millennial doctrine cannot, and does not, include every millennially significant element in the culture, or even reflect all the components of the particular social circumstances. Instead each prophet, to a lesser or greater extent, performs an implicit 'selection' of those elements which, for one reason or another, have been most salient in his individual biography. It is because this selection is basically implicit that the formation of millennial prophecies, ideologies, and doctrines can only be understood as a process of interaction. The initial doctrine, as first prophesized

by the prophet, will itself be formed through a similar process from his knowledge and experiences of the culture, (for from the cultural tradtions come his own assumptions about reality), and his perception of the social situation (in its full historical context). Equally, if not more, importantly, both the eschatological and ritual components of the prophecy will be continually modified and augmented in the course of proselytization by the shared assumptions, values, and perceptions of the believers. It is in this way that the prophecy can be said to form out of the joint interaction of the cultural traditions surrounding millennialism, the specific history and consequences of the social situation, and the individual personality of the prophet and his immediate followers.

In each of the next six chapters I shall examine a separate millennial movement and apply the model developed here to it. These six movements can be taken as representative of the majority of known millennial movements for they occurred in diverse cultural areas and arose over a wide span of time. In each of them it will become clear that the movement attracted people who were experiencing extensive relative deprivation of a kind that led them to question their whole life-style and made it necessary for them to embrace a new world view. Similarly it will become apparent that the specific doctrine and ritual of each movement consisted both of

components that reflected the social situation causing the relative deprivation and of ones which were important in terms of the cultural heritage of the people involved.

The first millennial movement to be examined is the Ghost Dance of 1890 which gained the support of the vast majority of the Indian tribes in the Plains area of America.

Chapter 3

The Ghost Dance of 1890

The Ghost Dance of 1890, which has attracted a lot of attention because it partly contributed to the Battle of Wounded Knee and the Sioux outbreak of 1890-1891, was in effect the consummation of a number of millennial movements that proliferated amongst the indigenous Indian tribes of North America in the late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Of particular importance is its immediate forerunner, the Ghost Dance of 1870. In terms of the theoretical perspective used in this thesis one of the most interesting problems is why the Ghost Dance proved unacceptable to the Indians of the American Plains in 1870, yet in 1890 formed the basis of the largest native movement ever occuring in that area.

The first movement to which the Ghost Dance can be traced back was a movement led by an un-named Delaware prophet in 1762. His doctrine, revealed to him in a vision, held that the liberation of the Indians could be accomplished by open warfare with the whites, together with a total rejection of all things associated to them. Thus the war was to be fought with native weapons, primarily bows and arrows. Not surprisingly, when this doctrine was subjected to test in battle it resulted in a massacre of the Indians. Forty years later a Shawnee prophet

named Teuskwatawa taught much the same doctine with the exception of the reliance on native weapons, but this again resulted in a military defeat, and the prophet's loss of honour amongst his people.

In 1860 another millennial movement arose, this time started by a Wanapum prophet named Smohalla, also known as the 'Prophet of the Dreamers' because of his tendency to continually experience visions. His standing as a prophet was greatly enhanced by his apparently over-coming death after a dual with another shaman. He was left for dead at the side of a river, but the waters washed his body downstream where he was sighted and rescued by a white farmer. Slowly he recovered, but instead of returning immediately to his people wandered through Arizona, California, and parts of Mexico. Finally on reaching home he told of his return from death and claimed to have learnt while in the spirit world how the Great Spirit required all Indians to behave. (Lanternari, 1963. p111) Basically his doctrine, as those before it, called for a return to native customs, and a rejection of white ones. If this were done the white man would be driven out, the dead would return, and the land replenished, It is interesting that the influence of Christianity was beginning to be felt in this movement. Smohalla was educated by Roman Catholic missionaries, and their rituals, if not their doctrine, contributed to those of his cult. For example the ceremonies of

worship took place on a Sunday and included choral singing and the recitation of liturgy. In 1877, as a result of Smohalla's teachings, Chief Joseph, a Nez Perce, led his tribe to a major but unsuccessful uprising in Idaho, although this was not Smohalla's object.

Finally the millennial movement most affecting the ritual and doctrine of the 1890 Ghost Dance was the Ghost Dance of 1870. It appeared first amongst the Paviotsos, expounded by their prophet Wodziwob, but spread quickly amongst other tribes of the Pacific coast, being adopted by a number of other prophets including Frank Spencer, (also shown as Wenyuga), and Numataivo, who was the father of Wovoka, the prophet of the 1890 movement. However it was not accepted by the Plains tribes, although they undoubtedly heard of it through traditional inter-tribal contacts, especially those of trade. It was only in 1890, when their circumstances had altered considerably, that they accepted a millennial prophecy.

Wodziwob prophesised that all the Indian dead were to return to earth in a railroad train--(the first transcontinental train had made its maiden run a year before in 1869). There is some confusion as to what else he prophesized, although Cora DuBois states he claimed that all races would henceforth live in peace amid plenty. (1939. p4) However this was not the way the movement was interpreted. The commonly accepted doctrine called for the destruction of the white race

and of all non-believing Indians, effected by a natural catastrophe which was to be concurrent with the returning of the Indian dead. The dance itself was held around a totem pole, as is customary for Paviotsos dance rituals, with men and women holding hands and singing songs taught them by Wodziwob. In this way the millennium was to be brought closer. It is interesting to note that the Mormon church, itself a millennial sect, became concerned in the movement at this time, already having accepted the Indian tribes as one of the ten lost tribes of Israel. Their influence, however, was greater in the 1890 Ghost Dance, where they took Wovoka to be the messenger that God had promised Joseph Smith would appear in 1891. There is some evidence that the white shirts worn by the Sioux in the massacre at Wounded Knee were based on the Mormons' endowment robe. (Mooney, 1965. p34)

Apart from the 1890 Ghost Dance, the Earth Lodge cult--whose adherents built underground houses to protect them from the natural catastrophe supposed to occur with the returning ancestors--and the Bole Maru cult were both derived directly from the 1870 Ghost Dance.

Conditions leading to the acceptance of the doctrine

As is suggested by their names, the 1890 Ghost Dance was in many respects very similar to the 1870 version. The question then arises why the 1870 Dance was not accepted by

the tribes of the Plains, especially as it is certain that they would have heard about it through trade and contact with the Pacific coast tribes. Indeed Numataivo, one of the 1870 leaders, came from the Plains area, and it was his son who formulated the 1890 version. (Considering Wovoka's family background it is not at all surprising that the two doctrines are so similar. The rituals his father enacted must have left a deep impression on his young mind.)

The reason why the Dance was accepted in 1890 but not twenty years previously was simply that the circumstances of the Plains Indians had altered radically during that time. Although in 1870 there was some deprivation and non-fulfillment of expectations through the encroachment of white Americans into tribal lands, the Indians were still able to live largely according to the customs of traditional life. By 1890 this had all changed. Not only were they restricted to small reservations, where in effect they were under the often autocratic control of the Indian agents, who were political appointees, but most importantly, the great herds of buffalo, which had appeared never-ending in 1870, were now virtually extinct. In Lesser's terms:

> "The Ghost Dance spread among American Indian tribes at a time when the final destruction of native culture was well advanced. Perhaps the greatest destructive influence was not so much the influx of white settlers or the consequent appropriation of tribal lands as the annihilation of the great herds of buffalo." (1933.p109)

Wheras formerly the Indians had killed the buffalo simply according to their needs, they began, in common with an increasing number of white hunters, to hunt them for gain, as buffalo had become an important commercial commodity. But with no controls over the numbers killed, the buffalo were quickly overhunted, and the great herds that twenty years ago had wandered freely across the plains became extinct.

Although not the only significant change to occur to the Plains Indians' way of life, this was undoubtedly the most important. For the buffalo, more than anything else, symbolizes the Plains culture, and its influence permiated every aspect of tribal life. Not only was buffalo meat the staple diet, even for the sedentary tribes that grew crops, but every other component of the animal was put to some use or had some cultural significance. For example buffalo hide, after being cured into leather or rawhide, was used for making clothing, shoes, shields, and tepees. Tools were fashioned from both buffalo horns and bones, for instance the animal's shoulder blade was used as a hoe. Buffalo sinew was used for sewing, whilst buffalo hair was used for binding, and among other things, as a hair-brush. The rough side of a buffalo tongue was also used for this latter prupose. Even buffalo dung was important as the kindling for fires.

Equally importantly, the buffalo was used in many traditional and religious ceremonies. In fact the collective

hunting of the buffalo was an important ceremony in itself, and, after the effective veto by the white government against war parties, provided the only means of attaining honour through bravery and daring. The buffalo's religious significance is illustrated by the custom among many tribes of offering all albino buffaloes to their supreme deity, symbolized by the sun. Similarly the buffalo head, or a part of it, was often significant in rituals. Some Indian fraternities used to wear it over their own heads during their ceremonies, and, indeed, it formed part of the War Dance headdress. Finally the buffalo's importance was symbolized in Indian culture by the practice of kicking buffalo dung to establish and emphasize the veracity of all statements.

From the above it can be seen that the annihilation of the buffalo herds resulted in extreme deprivation not only in terms of past patterns of behaviour and availability of important material artifacts, but also in terms of worth and status, as the traditional methods of measuring and attaining these had disappeared. Under such circumstances it is not surprising that a feeling of dissonance arose which enabled the Ghost Dance to attract many adherents.

However the loss of the buffalo herds was only one, albeit the most important, of the changes that occurred. The population of the Indian tribes had been growing smaller since contact with the white culture, partly because of war-

fare and the like, but mainly through the spread of epidemics and disease, particularly smallpox, whooping cough, measles, and influenza, the last three of which caused many deaths in 1889 and 1890. The invasion of white settlers, and the consequent encroachment of tribal lands, and eventually of reservation land guaranteed under treaty, also added to the hardships and relative deprivation experienced. Furthermore the food rations, which were also guaranteed the Indians by treaty following the extermination of the buffalo herds, were often not forthcoming because of re-allotment of financial resources by Congress. Even when the promised herds of cattle were delivered, no account was made for their loss of weight through the winter months. This could be as great as six hundred pounds per animal, particularly when Texas cattle were substituted for the agreed upon, and more sturdy, northern ranch cattle. The government also frequently failed to provide the warm clothing they had pledged on time. With the buffalo skins no longer available extreme hardship prevailed if, as often happened, the clothing did not arrive until winter was at its height. This must have been of added importance in the winter of 1890-1891, when there was an unusually heavy snowfall.

Finally the tribes were 'encouraged' to embrace agriculture, a totally foreign form of existence to most of them, on land which many white settlers had found unproductive.

Even for those sedentary tribes with some form of agricultural heritage it was largely a female occupation, giving no status and having little honour. What few crops were grown in 1890 were, in any case, ruined by drought. The combination of the loss of buffalo, deduction in government supplies, and crop failure resulted in widespread hunger which combined with illness led to many deaths, and consequently increased the deprivation experienced by the Indian tribes. This resulted in a further lack of legitimation for the old world view, already discredited by the loss of the buffalo and the subjugation of the Indian people to the whites.

The Sioux, largely because of the massacre at Wounded Knee in December, 1890, where three hundred Sioux men, women, and children were slaughtered, have received particular attention from Mooney and others, and provide an "apt illustration" (Gluckman, 1961. p10; Bell, 1968. p180) of the conditions prevalent amongst the Plains Indians in 1890. The Sioux 'outbreak'--in which no white citizen was molested or killed, and no property destroyed--was directly caused more by maladministration and hasty action on the part of the then Indian agent--a man

> "destitute of any of those qualities by which he could justly lay claim to the position--experience, force of character, courage, and sound judgement" (quoted by Mooney, 1965. p93)--

than by the Ghost Dance itself, although elements of the latter were incorporated into the outbreak, and of course the

same general historical conditions led to the unrest resulting in both.

The following long quote from Mooney illustrates these conditions:

> "The Sioux (at one time controlled) an immense territory extending...from Minnesota to the Rocky Mountains and from the Yellowstone to the Platte. Millions of buffalo to furnish an unlimited food supply, thousands of horses, and hundreds of miles of free range made the Sioux, up to the year 1868, the richest and most prosperous, the proudest, and withal, perhaps, the wildest of all the tribes of the plains.
>
> "In that year...a treaty was negotiated with the Sioux...by which they renounced their claims to a great part of their territory and had "set apart for their absolute and undisturbed use and occupation"--so the treaty states--a reservation which embraced all the present state of South Dakota west of the Missouri river...At one stroke they were reduced from a free nation to dependent wards of the government. It was stipulated also that they be allowed to hunt within their old range, outside the limits of the reservation, so long as the buffalo abounded--a proviso which, to the Indians, must have meant for ever...
>
> "But the times were changing...Swarms of hunters began to exterminate the buffalo at such a rate that in a few years the Sioux, with all the other hunting tribes of the plains, realized that their food supply was rapidly going. Then gold was discovered in the Black Hills, within the reservation, and at once thousands of miners and...lawless desperadoes rushed into the country in defiance of the protests and the pledges of the government, and the Sioux saw their last remaining hunting ground taken from them. The result was the Custer war and massacre, and a new agreement in 1876 by which the Sioux were shorn of one-third of their guaranteed reservation, including the Black Hills, and this lead to deep and widespread dissatisfaction throughout the tribe...

> "In 1882, only six years after the Black Hills had been seized, the Sioux were called on to surrender more territory...The result...was another agreement, in 1889, by which the Sioux surrendered one-half (about 11,000,000 acres) of their remaining territory...
>
> "Dakota is an arid country...not suited to agriculture, as is sufficiently proven by the (failure of) white settlers in that and the adjoining state of Nebraska...To wild Indians hardly in from the warpath the problem was much more serious... The buffalo was gone. They must depend on their cattle, their crops, and the government rations issued in return for the land they had surrendered. If these failed, (as they did), they must starve...
>
> "In 1888 their cattle had been diminished by disease. In 1889 their crops were a failure...Then followed epidemics of measles, grippe, and whooping cough, in rapid succession, and with terribly fatal results. Anyone who understands the Indian character needs not the testimony of witnesses to know the mental effect thus produced...Then came another entire failure of crops in 1890, and an unexpected reduction of rations...They had been expressly and repeatedly told by the commission that their rations would not be affected by their signing the treaty, but immediately on the consummation of the agreement Congress cut down their beef rations by (over 3,000,000) pounds, (approximately 120 pounds per individual)" (Mooney, 1965. p69-72)

It was under such circumstances of cultural and personal deprivation--and they were not confined to the Sioux--that the Ghost Dance spread amongst the Indians of the Plains. The loss of the buffalo, with their over-riding and all-embracing cultural significance, together with the taking of tribal lands and the effective banning of tribal warfare and military societies, resulted in the destruction of nearly all meaningful native customs, and undoubtedly caused widespread dissonance, which was augmented by the continuing disregard for Indian

welfare manifested by both the white government and white citizens. This dissonance could be reduced by believing in the supernatural, and thus easily achievable and totally moral, annihilation of the white population, and in the promise of a better, nay perfect, future, when the increasingly revered customs of old would again dominate. And this of course was basically the doctrine of the Ghost Dance.

It is interesting in terms of the theoretical model being used to note that, according to Kroeber, the tribes in North California, where the 1870 Ghost Dance proliferated, were experiencing

> "as great a disintegration by 1870...as the average tribe of the central United States had undergone by 1890". (quoted in Barber,1941.p665)

The prophet and doctrine of the Ghost Dance

The leading prophet of the 1890 Ghost Dance was, as already mentioned, a Paiute by the name of Wovoka, also at times known as Jack Wilson. He was the son of Numataivo, one of the prophets of the 1870 version, and was obviously influenced by his father's beliefs, although the latter died when Wovoka was only fourteen (c1871). After his father's death, Wovoka became attached to the family of David Wilson, a rancher, who bestowed on him the name Jack Wilson. From this association he gained some knowledge of English, and, in Mooney's words,

> "a confused idea of the white man's theology" (1965. p6)

He continued to work on the Wilson ranch, but attracted no special attention until he was slightly over thirty, although he was known for his solitary and contemplative disposition. He first gave the dance to his people around 1887, but it was not particularly well received until two years later when he experienced his great revelation.

According to one of Mooney's informants, a neighbouring ranchman who knew him well, Wovoka was taken ill shortly before he began to preach. During his illness there was an eclipse of the sun, (probably the total eclipse of January 1st, 1889, (Mooney, 1965. p16)), an event which always creates great excitment and fear amongst Indians, as they believe the sun to be the supreme living being and their most important God. When there is an eclipse they interpret it as being caused by some supernatural demon attacking Him, and in an effort to drive off the demon sing incantations and make loud noises. The combination of his sickness and the frantic excitment of the other Paiutes created, according to Mooney, an atmosphere conducive to visionary experiences.

Throughout North America Indians attached great significance to visions, and, according to Lowie (1963. p170), the Plains Indians, at least, gave them precedence in their religious life. All Plains Indians would attempt to experience visions and dreams, which are believed to be messages from the supernatural, whenever they had an important decision to

make (eg. over when to start the buffalo hunt or whether to attempt a war raid), or whenever an important stage was reached in their life cycle. To facilitate this, they would isolate themselves in lonely places, fast for a number of days--usually four as this number had particular religious significance--and frequently mutilate themselves, as they did whenever there was a death in the clan. For example, to aid the visionary experience, the Crow frequently cut off a finger joint in the left hand, thereby arousing supernatural pity. (Lowie, 1963. p170) Often too, as in the cases of Smohalla and Wovoka, visions were experienced in sickness, or a state of unconsciousness. Surprisingly often Indians were left for dead, only to regain consciousness and tell of new visions--for all visions were narrated to the tribe as a whole. On returning to consciousness, the visionary is almost invariably restored to good health. Where this occurs in combination with millennial or, in Wallace's term, 'revitalization' (1956.p264) movements, Lanternari suggests it symbolizes the

> "sickness afflicting Indian society and the possibility of recovery through the revitalization of ancient religious values". (1964.p120)

In Wovoka's vision of 1889, he was taken by God to see all the Indian dead engaged in traditional sports and pastimes, in a land full of game. God told him to return to his people and tell them they must be good and love one another, and not quarrel or fight. They must forsake all their old warlike

customs and live in peace with other tribes and with the whites. If they obeyed his instructions, they would at last be re-united with the dead, and live in a world with no sickness, death, or old age. Wovoka was then given the Dance to teach his people, and told that if they repeatedly performed it for four complete and consecutive nights, they would secure and hasten their future happiness. With the returning ancestors there was to be a great flood and whirlwind which would destroy all white people but leave unharmed all faithful Indians. Wovoka was also promised control of the elements, so that he could make it rain or shine at will. This was a traditional claim of Indian shamans, (DuBois, 1939. p3), but in this case may have received extra credence because of the unusual weather conditions at the time. They included the worst drought for many years in the summer of 1890, and a deep blanket of snow in the winter of 1891-1892, a very unusual occurrence in the area. (Mooney, 1965. p9 and p85) The people were no longer to mourn their dead in the extravagant traditional manner, (which included killing horses, burning tepees, cutting the hair, and mutilating the body). In the words of an Arapaho whose son had just died:

> "I shall not shoot any ponies, and my wife will not gash her arms. We used to do this when our friends died, because we thought we would never see them again, and it made us feel bad. But now we know we shall all be united again". (Mooney, 1965. p24)

Both the promise of no sickness or death in the coming world,

and the prescription against mourning reflect the recent experiences of these people, who had been afflicted by disastrous epidemics of European diseases in 1889.

The origins and development of the doctrine.

From the above it can be seen that the doctrine was partly syncretistic, having a number of Christian elements in it. This is a consequence of the Christian influences in Wovoka's life. However the doctrine was acceptable to the Indian population as a whole only because these influences were also beginning to affect them. Increasingly Indians were attending missionary schools, and often found the missionaries to be the only sympathetic white people. Gradually Christian elements were pervading all the native religious practices. For example, the Supreme Being, superior to other gods, was now being conceived in vaguely monotheistic terms, and in some areas it was common to consecrate ground by sprinkling sacred powder over it before religious festivals.

The emphasis on a gentle morality in the Ghost Dance also undoubtedly stems from Christian teaching, for this type of morality was foreign to the Plains Indian culture, at least in terms of out-groups, such as other Indian tribes, or the whites. In their system honour could only be gained in one of two ways: either in the hunting of buffalo, or by extreme bravery, courage and success in warfare. In fact the lust for glory was often the chief motive in starting a war feud.

However the proscription against fighting and war can perhaps be understood when considered against the obvious numerical and military superiority of the whites, which had been illustrated many times over, even as recently as 1876 when Sitting Bull and his warriors were defeated after their slaughter of General Custer and his troups in the battle of Little Bighorn, and 1877 when Chief Joseph of the Nez Perces was defeated. Combined with the virtual impossibility of ever engaging the whites in battle and returning home without the loss of any men--an ideal of utmost importance if honour is to be gained (see Lowie, 1963. p114)--it is not altogether surprising that the Indians left the extermination of the whites to supernatural powers. Furthermore by claiming the whites would be destroyed by supernatural agencies, Wovoka was able to disclaim any overt hostility in his movement, and thus protest more effectively against its suppression. Wovoka illustrated his lack of hatred for white culture by continuing to wear Western clothes and work for a white farmer. However his acceptance of white culture was not always emulated by the believers, who altered his ritual to suit their own situation.

There were also many indigenous elements in Wovoka's doctrine and ritual. The Dance form itself is the traditional Indian way of worshipping, and appeared in many ceremonies, for example, the War Dance, and the Sun Dance, as well as the

the more millennial Dream Dance (1815), and Dance of the Prophet (1834). The Dance taught by Wovoka differed from traditional Dances, but like them consisted of a simple step, with participants dancing, (or perhaps more accurately, shuffling) in circle formation. Sometimes there was a pole or totem, or even a cedar tree--which for some tribes had religious significance because of the blood like colour of its wood and its evergreen foliage--in the middle of the circle, although this was not prescribed by Wovoka. Another indigenously significant aspect of the doctrine was the length of time the dancing must be continued. The Dance was to start in the late afternoon or evening and continue for four nights until the morning of the fifth day. (Mooney, 1965. p22-23) As already suggested the number four has traditional importance in the indigenous religion, many rituals for example having to be repeated four times. (see Lowie, 1963. Chapter 6) One further aboriginal practice incorporated in the movement is the painting of the face and body with sacred red paint, which was preferably obtained from the same source as that which the prophet Wovoka used. Tablets of the ore from which the paint came were themselves considered sacred and given supernatural powers.

Finally there has been some speculation as to whether the resurrection of the dead was a part of the traditional religious beliefs of the Indians of the Plains, or whether it had not, rather, been added by the impact of Christianity.

There has been evidence produced for both sides. In her monograph on the 1870 Ghost Dance, Cora DuBois wrote that:

> "Whether or not informants were adherents of (Wovoka), they were all agreed that his doctrine was neither new nor unique, but that it was simply one expression of a recurring native pattern. The impression was gotten that in almost every generation shamans arose who preached the imminent return of the dead and in addition were capable of performing miracles, among which weather control was a favorite...Dr Willard Park, on the other hand, has gained the impression in the course of recent ethnographic field work among the Paviotsos that the doctrine of the return of the dead in large numbers was new with the 1870 and 1890 prophets. He believes that the old element in the area was the resurrection of particular individuals by certain rare and outstanding shamans who had the power to bring back the souls of the dead as they lingered on the flowery path to the spirit land. Some shamans were able actually to enter the spirit land and return the soul to its body."
> (DuBois, 1939. p3)

The truth would appear to be somewhere in between these two positions, for the idea was certainly not new in 1870, as is seen by its inclusion in earlier millennial outbreaks. Indeed a number of elements of Indian religion are, at least, consonant with the doctrine. For example the Indians believed in the survival of the soul after death, but had no notion of reward or punishment. They envisaged the dead as living very much as they had while alive, hunting buffalo, living in tepees, etc.--a belief based on the experience told by those accredited with returning from death. (Lowie, 1963. p180-181) Thus it was a simple step to conceive of the dead returning to live in the traditional manner.

Spier has suggested that the doctrine of the resurrection of the dead was a central part of the eschatological mythology of the tribes of the interior plateau of Northwest America, and that from there it spread amongst the other tribes to form the basis of the recurring millennial movements. (Spier, 1935. p5) It would appear then that, in general, it was only in the movements themselves that the resurrection of the dead came to be a central tenet, although lying dormant in the cultural mores of the people.

On the other hand, despite statements by Barber (1941. p663) and Lanternari (1963. p108) to the opposite, there is virtually no messianic element--at least in the strict meaning of the word--in Indian religion. Consequently the 1890 Ghost Dance, like those before it, cannot be described as messianic. There was no particular culture hero or god leading the returning ancestors, rather the disaster which was to overcome the white population would be in the form of a natural catastrophe. Although Wovoka occasionally made reference to Jesus (eg. see Mooney, 1965. p23), this was a reflection of his own upbringing in the Wilson family, and was not incorporated into the doctrine of the Ghost Dance by the mass of believers.

The doctrine and ritual of the Ghost Dance varied in detail from tribe to tribe and from prophet to prophet, as would be expected. On the foundation supplied by Wovoka

> "each tribe has built a structure from its own mythology, and each apostle...has filled in the

> details according to his own...ideas of happiness" (Mooney, 1965. p19)

In part, at least, the differences are also caused by the diversity of language between these otherwise culturally comparable peoples. There are at least six different families of language in the area, each with a number of linguistic branches and distinct dialects. (Lowie, 1963. p5) However the different tribes are not without means of communication with one another as there is a uniform sign language understood by nearly all tribes. It was by this imperfect medium, which included only relatively basic concepts, that the doctrine of the Ghost Dance was disseminated and transmitted amongst the tribes. Consequently slightly different interpretations of its doctrinal, eschatological, and ritual content developed, re-enforced and magnified by each tribe's somewhat distinct cultural and supernatural beliefs.

In the main, however, the differences were minor. For example the nature of the final catastrophe, which was to wipe the whites from the face of the earth, varied. Some tribes believed it was to be accomplished by a mighty earthquake which would bury the whites but leave the Indians unharmed, while others believed a great flood would occur--(symbolic of the changes expected after the droughts of 1889 and 1890)--with only the Indians being capable of climbing to the high ground.

The ritual, both before and during the Dance, also varied,

with, for example, the Arapaho consecrating the dance ground, the Sioux taking purifying 'sweat-baths' (similar to the Finnish sauna bath) before the start, and also wearing white 'Ghost shirts', and the Paiute shaking blankets in the Dance to drive away evil spirits. The designs painted on the face and body also differed widely from tribe to tribe, according to the patterns traditionally considered important. In general traditional Indian dress was worn if possible, with no white-made artifacts of any sort allowed, (except for beads, which symbolised the porcupine quills that were no longer readily available). The Cheyenne, however, wore discs of German silver. Finally, in accord with the Ghost Dance doctrine and the supernatural manner in which the millennium was to occur, no weapons of any form were allowed in the Dance area by most tribes. But the Sioux,

> "perhaps the wildest of all the tribes of the plains," (Mooney, 1965. p69)

hung bows and arrows from nearby trees.

This it can be seen that each tribe introduced modifications into the basic Ghost Dance doctrine corresponding to their own customs and particular needs. Wherever a movement spreads amongst different cultures or sub-cultures this pattern pertains, as has frequently been recognised.

Summary

The 1890 Ghost Dance fits the model developed in chapter 2 well. Not only is there clear evidence that the Plains Indians only accepted the doctrine as a consequence of their changed social situation, but also the doctrine consisted of elements that were culturally significant to the Indians. Furthermore the hypothesis that the original prophecy is changed by the believers so as to be consonant with their own particular heritage is substantiated. Each tribe modified Wovoka's prophecy somewhat so that it was more meaningful for them.

The relative deprivation experienced by the Plains Indians was sudden and total. Within a few years they had become a dominated nation and had lost much that they valued. Their tribal lands were continually being appropriated from them, and illness and disease were rife. But most importantly they could no longer live according to the customs of the past. Not only had the hunting ranges, where they had previously hunted as they pleased, been severely limited by the claims of the whites, but in any case the buffalo, with its all embracing cultural significance, was virtually extinct. Fifteen years before great herds had roamed freely across the plains, but now the herds were all gone, exploited by both whites and Indians for pecuniary gain. Because of the buffalo's cultural

significance and because it supplied so many of the daily artifacts needed for the indigenous way of life, the relative deprivation experienced because of its disappearance, combined with that experienced because of the other changes, (eg. being forced to live on a reservation), was total. It necessitated a new world view that could explain the situation to the Indians. The idea that the relative deprivation led directly to the acceptance of a new millennial world view is supported by the failure of the nearly identical 1870 Ghost Dance to gain a following in the area, for in 1870 there was comparatively little deprivation experienced. Furthermore there is evidence that the people who did accept the 1870 Ghost Dance were experiencing "as great a disintegration" as the Plains Indians were in 1890.

The doctrines of both the Ghost Dances were very similar. This is obviously a consequence of Wovoka being the son of one of Wodziwob's chief assistants. More important than their similarity though is the basis on which they were given recognition. It was only because they contained many elements of traditional cultural importance, together with ones that reflected the current situation as the Indians were experiencing it, that the prophecies proved acceptable. Furthermore the prophecies were given divine significance because they were given to the prophets as dreams and visions, for it was traditionally believed that God communicated with man in this manner.

Finally the 1890 Ghost Dance illustrates how the prophecy of the prophet is changed gradually through the interaction of social circumstances and cultural traditions on it. Each tribe made its own modifications to Wovoka's doctrine. Admittedly the unsophisticated nature of the Indian sign language helped in this, but nevertheless it is not by chance that what changes were made were consonant with each tribe's particular customs and situation. The inadequacy of communication only facilitated such changes.

Chapter 4

The Kimbangu-Matswa Ngunzi Movement

The Kimbangu-Matswa movement, also known as Ngunzism, was nominally based on the prophecies of Simon Kimbangu and Andre Matswa, two separate and distinct prophets who both symbolised the incongruence of native life patterns in the Lower Congo during its colonial 'development'. Although the two prophecies (of which Kimbangu's was by far the more significant) were distinct and although neither of them was basically chiliastic, they had, by 1934, encompassed one another, and were interpretated as messianic and millennial by the followers, through the mediation of numerous minor prophets. The movement is especially interesting for this very reason. The interplay of the traditional cultural heritage, the social situation, and the original prophecy (in this case prophecies) can clearly be seen in the development of the millennial belief. The original prophecy was continually transformed and modified by components which were significant because of their position in the traditional cultural beliefs of the people and because of the contingencies of the social situation they found themselves in.

The recent history of the Congo

The history of the Congo, like the history of most of Africa, is dominated by the effects that European contact had on indigenous social life, especially with regard to the two great Western institutions of slavery and colonization.[23] Slavery disrupted traditional life, especially near coastal areas, by the physical removal of a not insignificant proportion of the native population. According to Basil Davidson, (1955, p56), R. Delgada has estimated that between 1486 and 1641 1,389,000 slaves, generally between the ages of fifteen and thirty, were removed from Angola alone, an average of 9,000 people per annum. L. Jadin estimates the figure rose to 25,000 per annum in the eighteenth century, and over 30,000 per annum at the beginning of the nineteenth century. Apart from the obvious disruption to tribal life that the removal of such vast numbers of the young and healthy members of the society had, the slave trade also tended to reduce the authority of the tribal chiefs, both because of their obvious powerlessness, and because they so frequently acquiesced to the slave-traders' wishes in return for the safety of their own kin. Even when slavery was made illegal in the West, (enforced by the positioning of man-of-war ships outside the

[23]The West had not, of course, had a monopoly of either slavery or colonialism. Slavery indeed has been present in many societies at one time or another, including the native Belgian Congo. The slavery of the West, however, differs at least in its extent and scope. Nowhere else has slavery been exploited to the measure achieved by the European slave-traders. The same applies to recent Western colonialism.

traditional slave embarking ports), the slave trade still contined, albeit on a far smaller scale, until the turn of the century, this time promoted by Arab slave-traders via the island of Zanzibar.

But if slavery had disrupted traditional tribal life, it was nothing compared to the disruption caused by what followed. Through using his immense private fortune to good effect in European diplomatic circles, (see Davidson 1955.p64), Leopold II of Belgiumwas, in 1885, able to obtain control of the whole Congo basin, an area approximately equivalent in size to Europe, not for the Belgian government or people, but for his own private wealth. While on the surface legitimating his presence in terms of a 'civilizing mission', Leopold exploited the people and resources of the country in a manner rarely equalled.

In 1885 he issued a decree whereby the Congo Free State (alias Leopold II) declared itself the owner of all 'vacant lands'; and he supplemented it in 1891 with a decree that declared the Congo Free State the owner of all the fruits of these 'vacant lands'. Effectively, therefore, he owned and controlled all the minerals and resources, including the valuable ivory and rubber, of this vast area. He divided the country into three zones, one for private estate (ie. his private estate), one for private trade (i.e. for the concession companies who gave him 25% of their profits), and one closed for "reasons of public security". Leopold returned a profit

from the private estate zone of approximately $7.5 million in the first ten years of his enterprise. Furthermore he obtained large sums from the concession companies, one of which showed a net profit over six years of operation of about $2.5 million on a paid-up capital investment of some $25,000. (Davidson, 1955. p67)

But although his profits were healthy, his methods were not, at least not for the natives. Lord Lansdowne called them

> "bondage under the most barbarous and inhuman conditions...maintained for the mercenary motives of the most selfish character". (quoted by Davidson, 1955. p67-68)

Forced labour was used for the collection of the valuable ivory and rubber. (The natives who did the collecting, of course, had no legal right to these resources because of Leopold's 1891 decree). More 'responsible' natives were in charge of ensuring that each district provided the required amount of ivory and rubber, and were ordered to kill all natives who refused to work or, alternatively, did not work hard enough. They were encouraged in this by the knowledge that they would receive the same treatment if the area as a whole did not provide the required amount of resources. To promote frugality each native overlord was required to bring a right hand for every cartridge he did not return to the administrator. In this way the administration could guarantee their cartridges were not being used for other purposes.

Eventually, through reports such as Roger Casement's to the British government, and books such as E.D. Morel's "Red Rubber", as well as the efforts of the latter's Congo Reform Association, the nature of Leopold's 'civilising mission' was recognised. In 1908 the Congo was annexed by the Belgian government and Leopold's 'System', as it became known, lost its last means of survival. While it had existed it created havoc worse than that caused by slavery. Morel estimated that the population of the Congo was decreasing at the minimum rate of 100,000 per annum between 1891 and 1905 (i.e. 1.5 million in the fifteen year period). Others thought the figure higher. Casement estimated it at three million between 1895-1905. A British Baptist missionary, John Weeks, wrote in 1903

> "Without any fear of contradiction...the condition of the people is, to put it mildly, one hundred per cent worse than in 1893...The population (of the area) dropped in thirteen years from 50,000 to under 5,000." (quoted by Davidson, 1955. p76)

But although formal control changed hands in 1908, the methods used lasted, as did the 'philosophy' behind them. The forced delivery of rubber and other natural products gradually ceased, but forced labour was still used by government agencies, for example in building roads and railways, and in the militia. Although there was a legal maximum of sixty days forced labour for any adult, this maximum was often ignored. All European employers could have any native who slackened in his work, or who went absent, imprisoned and flogged. As late as 1926 Gide

found evidence that some concession companies were still using variants of the old Leopoldian methods to induce the natives to collect more rubber. A further consequence of the increasing European contact was the spread of new diseases, which often reached epidemic proportions.

However the situation in general was improving. No longer, for example, was there the mass disruption of life so common under slavery and during Leopold's rule. Even the fixed prices of ivory and rubber throughout the first world war did not totally undermine the newly found hope, although the state of traditional society can be gauged by the fact that the number of independent chieftainships had risen to 6095 by 1918, some containing as few as 150 adult males. (Davidson, 1955.p88)

After the war the Belgian administration attempted to resuscitate tribal life by restoring the close knit patterns of tribal authority. A number of eulogies praising tribal life appeared, and a system of indirect rule was created, whereby the administration governed through the traditional tribal chiefs. Although there are obvious inconsistencies inherent in indirect rule--basically because the administration holds all the power, and hence is free to replace tribal rulers who do not obey their instructions--this new approach, including as it eventually did the formation of 'Native tribunals' sitting in judgement over a wide variety of crimes against tribal law and custom, combined with the comparative alleviation of native

conditions, led to new expectations and a re-affirmation of the importance of native culture. It was in this setting, extenuated somewhat by the economic depression of 1921 which lowered the prices of all mineral exports, that Simon Kimbangu first preached his prophecy and the Kimbangu movement first made ground. As I shall illustrate later, Kimbangu's actual prophecy was not really millennial; it was only a decade later, after the natives' perception of social reality had changed, that it came to be interpreted thus.

Throughout the 1920s the hopes of the indigenous population increased. Following the pattern suggested by Davies, (1962), the alleviation of the hardships suffered under Leopold led to rising expectations. But these new expectations were not to be satisfied. Indeed what concessions were made by the Administration only served as kindling in the demand for further concessions. The contradictions of colonial government became increasingly apparent. Not only were the values of the European community obviously discrepant from their behaviour, at least in the way they treated the natives, but also, as far as the natives were concerned, the claimed aims of the Administration were incompatible with their policies. Clearly the Administration had no desire to give them equal status with the Europeans. Furthermore, the Administration continued to suppress native movements, despite continuing to encourage a return to traditional native patterns of behaviour. In particular this

suppression was evident in the way Kimbangu's and Matswa's movements were treated. On top of all this the early 1930s saw a world-wide economic depression which lowered the prices paid for Congolese crops by a large percentage. Without any knowledge of the economics of world-wide trade, the natives were bound to interpret these reductions as yet another attempt by the Administration to keep the natives' standard of life below that of the whites.

Conditions leading to the acceptance of the doctrine

Thus briefly, the situation prior to the outbreak of millennialism in the Congo in the 1930s was one where expectations had been rising after many years, even centuries, of degradation and debasement. With the ending of Leopold's System, and its more obscene techniques of government, the native population was given hope for the future. At the same time the indigenous culture, with its tribal traditions, was promoted by the administration, thereby increasing the expectation of a satisfactory life-style. However by the 1920s the new hopes were being undermined for a number of reasons. Firstly, the natives were not making the progress they must have hoped for; they were still being treated as inferior, and were still having to accept the apparently arbitrary authority of the administration, which had not by any means rid the country of all Leopold's methods. Indeed it supported many of them, if admittedly to

a lesser degree. Secondly, the re-emphasis on traditional tribal social organization was limited, as was shown by the administration's attitude to any questioning of its authority, and by its repression of native movements. Even native rituals and beliefs were totally discouraged by a combination of missionary and administrative power, no matter how emasculated they were in comparison to the old beliefs. Furthermore where aspirations were directed at modernization through contact with European industries in the urban areas, they were incapable of being satisfied. The Belgium administration not only encouraged, to its limited extent, a return to tribal life, but actively discouraged participation in modern technology through its limited provision of facilities for secondary education of a technical nature. (There had never, needless to say, been a shortage of secondary education for would-be clerics.) Finally the depression of the 1930s resulted in deprivation at a material level for the many natives who had come, during the previous few years, to rely on the income gained from export materials.

Thus, by the 1930s, after a number of years of rising expectations, deprivation was experienced in worth and status, material possessions, and, not least of all, in patterns of expected behaviour, producing a form of macro cognitive dissonance leading to a situation conducive to the formation of millennial movements.

The reason why the response was millennial, and not, for example, political, as might be expected considering the Pan-African movement, is relatively clear. For although the native population had probably heard of Pan-Africanism and other similar movements, they would have meant little to them politically, for there was no way for them to have ever experienced political interaction. The Belgian Congo was administered exclusively from Belgium. Even the white settlers had no political powers or rights, not even voting ones. Furthermore the administration actively discouraged the migration of natives to Europe, unlike the French. Under these circumstances it is not surprising that the movement that developed as a response to the deprivation experienced was not a secular, politically differentiated one, but a religious and millennial one. Of course, under these circumstances, a religious movement is a form of political movement. Max Gluckman in writing of native African churches with respect to the Mau Mau uprising in Kenya states that they all foresee

> "...the coming of a Messiah: they cleanse from sin and witchcraft and they heal the sick. Some are rackets. But all are political movements" (1954. p724)

The prophets of the movement

Simon Kimbangu was born around 1890 in a village called Nkamba, then a stronghold of Protestantism, and came into con-

tact with European culture both as a houseboy for a European family in Kinshasa, and as a pupil at the missionary school. He had strongly desired to become a pastor, but, because he failed the necessary examinations, had to be content with the inferior position of catechist. He nevertheless read the Bible fervently, especially the prophetic writings of the Old Testament, and always carried a book of the Psalms of David with him. Indeed his failure to gain official sanction to preach, together with his Old Testament readings, undoubtedly influenced his belief in his divinely ordained mission.

Kimbangu's prophetic destiny did not, according to Andersson, occur suddenly. It was made known to him

> "in a sequence of dreams and visions of a dynamic and compelling character, which occurred at intervals during an appreciable span of time" (1958. p49-50)

The most crucial vision of all occurred on the 28th March 1921. (Balandier, 1970. p415) In this he was ordered to go to a nearby village and heal a sick child by the laying on of hands. At first Kimbangu resisted but eventually went and, with ecstatic shaking and violent convulsions accompanied by preaching and readings from the Bible, laid his hands on the child and thereby healed him. News of this miracle quickly spread in the neighbouring area and people flocked to Nkamba both to be cured and just to hear the new prophet preach. Rumour of his healing power begat further rumour despite his low level of

success with other attempted cures, and he became revered as a 'Ngunzi', (a special prophet sent as an emissary from the divine world with a particular mission, and given power to heal as a consequence of the divinity incarnate in him), throughout the Congo.

> "The news that the despised 'blacks' now had a prophet of their own swept over the land like a tidal wave. 'Not only the white people could be great and powerful, for a mighty one, a man worthy of note could arise from the ranks of the Africans whom they had scorned'". (Andersoon, 1958. p57).

Kimbangu's own teachings were based very much on the Bible, both Old and New Testaments. Nevertheless there are some currents of what Andersson terms the 'Old African' religion. Actually there is, in general, much in common between the traditional religion of the area and Biblical teachings, no doubt in part because Christianity was known to the Congolese as early as 1450. Both, for example, believe in a supreme God (Nzambi) and in the continued existence of the soul after death. The traditional theology believed the soul of the dead existed beneath the earth but could still influence human life. In certain circumstances, particularly where the person was an important member of the society, eg. royalty, the soul could be re-incarnated. According to native tradition the soul could also leave the body in life, eg. in dreams or visions. Furthermore prayers of despair and prayers for better times are common to native tradition and to the Old Testament, as is one form

or another of ancestor cult. There is also the element of faith healing common to both religious systems.

But Kimbangu's teachings contained many elements only found in Christianity, and a few only found in native religion. For example, his faith healing was always achieved by the Christian laying on of hands accompanied by readings from the Bible, preaching, and, occasionally, immersion; and he always prayed for his miracles to occur in the name of Jesus Christ. His doctrine included monogamy--very much against indigenous belief--and the destruction of the figurines that were traditionally believed to protect the possessor from 'minkisi' (evil spirits). Kimbangu also discouraged the formation of a separate native Christian church, suggesting instead the natives continue to attend the missionary services.

On the other hand his faith healing was always achieved while in an ecstatic state, accompanied by much shaking, trembling, and physical exertion. This part of the ritual came from the traditional indigenous religion. A prophet had always had to prove his legitimacy by his ability to experience ecstatic hallucinations, which were taken as the traditional sign of supernatural blessing. As the new movement gained popularity there was obviously a need for leaders at a local level, as it quickly proved impossible for Kimbangu to minister to more than a small proportion of his followers. The chief means by which a potential leader was selected and given

Kimbangu's blessing was similarly by his ability to emulate Kimbangu's ecstatic trembling, which under Kimbangu was believed to indicate the presence of God's Holy Spirit in the individual.

On realising the extent of Kimbangu's popularity, the Administration, fearful of any political uprising and, according to Andersson-a Protestant missionary--spurred on by the Catholic clergy, attempted to arrest him. At first he fled but later returned and, after speaking to his followers in a manner reminiscent of Jesus's preaching at Gethsemane, surrendered himself to the authorities. Throughout his trial Kimbangu stressed his belief in Jesus, Christianity, and the Bible, but, according to Andersson (1958. p67), inaccurately translated documents implied he saw himself as the Saviour and Redeemer of the black people, and had encouraged them to revolt. Consequently he was sentenced to death--a sentence the prosecution had not asked for. Through the intervention of the Colonial Government the sentence was changed to one of life imprisonment. He was taken to a prison in Elizabethville where he died in 1950.

His imprisonment and deportation did not, however, entail the end of Ngunzism, as his movement became known. Although the rebellion feared by the authorities did not occur, (apparently machine guns were mounted in the streets of Kinshasa immediately after his trial), his sentence gave added weight

to the movement, and caused him to be thought of as a martyr for the black race. Numerous rumours about his fate appeared, most of them stressing his invulnerability. One, for example, was that he was to be shot, but water not bullets came from the soldier's rifles. Another claimed he was put in a cauldron suspended over a fire but calmly went on reading while the water boiled around him. Yet another suggested that he was to be sent by rail to Boma but the train would not start until Kimbangu was taken off it. Pilgrims continued to arrive at Nkamba to kneel before the prophet's house. Similarly the waters of the Mpumbu, where Kimbangu had told the sick to bathe, were revered for their curative powers, and ten years later were still being sent by rail to people who lived at a distance from it.

However after Kimbangu's imprisonment, and the movement's repression, Ngunzism was driven underground, and its doctrine became anti-white, (which, of course, caused it to be further repressed). At the same time, in the hands of the numerous minor prophets and leaders who were proselytizing the cult, the influence of the traditional indigenous culture became greater. The followers were obliged to cut themselves off from the European commumity, and were forbidden to wear clothes made from European material. The children of believers were not to be sent to European, i.e. missionary, schools but to special native ones where Ngunzism could be taught. When because of

the anti-white doctrines the authorities attempted to further suppress the movement--it had already been officially outlawed--the believers realized more flexible techniques than outright hatred and separatism were needed.

> "We obey the enemy while awaiting the day when the yoke of our servitude shall be broken" (quoted by Andersson, 1958. p70)

Kimbangu's prohibitions against alcohol, polygamy, and adultery were maintained, (although as always there were some reports of 'spiritual marriages'), but new rituals and techniques were introduced. For example, Wednesday now became the native sabbath, purportedly because Kimbangu's trial began on a Wednesday. The movement became ever more concerned with discovering and exorcizing 'minkisi' and with the communal divulgence of individual sin. New methods, relying more heavily on indigenous beliefs, were introduced for discovering the veracity of novitiates' and believers' confessions.

In a few cases all work ceased, no food crops were planted or cultivated, and believers were bade live on wild grasses and berries. Already there were millennial aspects to the doctrine, mainly of a messianic nature. Kimbangu was expected to return, possibly accompanied by Christ. However at this stage millennialism was not paramount. The movement was mainly a religious rivivalistic one, with Kimbangu's teachings at its base, but with it progressively responding to the existing social situation by means of elements symbolic of the

traditional indigenous culture.

Between 1924 and 1930 little was heard of Ngunzism, although it undoubtedly still existed underground, as is shown by its re-emergence in 1930 after the trial of Andre Matswa, the second major prophet of the movement.

Andre Matswa was born and raised on the outskirts of Brazzaville. He attended school and became a mission teacher, leaving this to work as a clerk in the customs department at Brazzaville. In 1924 he enlisted in the French army and fought in the Moroccan campaign, (1924-1925), but was deeply affected by his involvement in a colonial war. (Balandier, 1970 p392) After being discharged he went to Paris, where he worked as a book-keeper for the sanitary authorities, and there came into contact with a number of left-wing and anti-colonial, Pan-African organizations (including Marcus Garvey's 'Back to Africa' movement in the United States). These contacts, combined with his military experiences, made him realize the possibility of organized opposition to colonialism. He founded the 'Association Amicale des Originaires de l'A.E.F.' (French Equatorial Africa), commonly known as the Amicale Balali. He declared the formal goals of the organization to be the provision of financial assistance to exiles of the A.E.F. who found themselves in financial difficulties, and the maintenance of cultural bonds between the people of the Congo and expatriots.

The organization was officially recognised as a 'utilite publique', and was alloted an annual grant of Frs. 1,000 by the government of French Equatorial Africa. Matswa decided to further the movement's funds by organizing a collection amongst the people of his birthplace. He obtained the sanction of the government, and a recommendation from the Colonial Ministry, and, according to Andersson, (1958. p118), sent three delegates there in 1929. They were received by the native population with great fervour and excitment, and were given comparatively large donations, considering the latter's economic circumstances. The ease with which the contributions were gained makes it extremely doubtful that Matswa's stated goals were the ones told the natives. Indeed it seems unlikely from Matswa's contacts and the movement's development that they were ever the real 'raison d'etre' behind its formation. Rather it indicates that they must have been highly compatible with the natives' own interests. Almost certainly there was Pan-African doctrine involved as this concept was becoming increasingly popular amongst the indigenous people. The chiefs especially were enthusiastic about the movement and, according to the administration, often taxed their people for contributions, or gave the organization money already collected for official taxes. However forced contributions appear to have been as unlikely as they were unnecessary, for the movement undoubtedly had wide popular support, as was shown by its subsequent history.

By the end of 1929 the authorities were becoming increasingly suspicious of the political propaganda disseminated by the organization, and raided its offices, confiscating Frs. 110,154 in the process. At the beginning of 1930 Matswa was arrested and taken to Brazzaville from Paris for trial. His trial occasioned serious civil disturbances in the town, partly as a consequence of the presence of many tribal chiefs, together with their followers, who were called by the Administration to give evidence against Matswa.

Although, in Andersson's terms, these chiefs had

> "extremely divergent conceptions of the object for which the collections were made", (1958. p121)

Matswa retained his popular support. When he was sentenced to three years imprisonment and ten years exile, (together with the three delegates he had sent from France), a riot occurred, and attempts were made to storm the court building.

Like Simon Kimbangu, Matswa's status amongst the native population was increased by his martyrdom, and, as with Kimbangu, a large crop of myths occurred attesting to his indestructability. He, too, was regarded as a Messiah soon to return. With his imprisonment and the proscription of his movement, there was a return to Ngunzism. But now, largely because the hopes and expectations held in the immediate post War period failed to materialise, combined with (and including) the effects of the continued degradation and lack of status to which the African

population was subjected, (in many ways symbolised by Matswa's banishment), Ngunzism became more conretely millennial.

The development of the millennial doctrine

In 1930 a number of minor prophets and leaders of Ngunzism were arrested and some of their writings were confiscated. These attested that

> "...war is impending...The Lord is at hand, He will come either in the daytime or during the night. No-one knows the exact time, not even the whites. These too, are aware that war is imminent. The whites and the blacks are in separate camps." (quoted by Andersson, 1958. p97)

On Jehovah's appearance, destruction

> "will overtake the transgressors and the whites; those who have abandoned the old way of life on the other hand, will be saved, enter into glory and have part in the new Kingdom..."(Andersson, 1958. p98)

Leading the forces of the divine will be Simon Kimbangu and Andre Matswa.

Although the above passage speaks of the believers being those who "have abandoned the old way of life", the movement was becoming far removed from Kimbangu's original teachings and was incorporating many features with traditional significance. For example, believers were forbidden to have any contact, social or physical, with non-believers. The prohibition of physical contact, which reached its zenith with the coming of the Salvation Army, was based on the old African belief that

grace and blessing could be dissipated by physical touch. The prohibition against the cutting of hair and nails often found in this period also stemmed from the same source. In some districts the practice of rubbing the face and arms with earth from the traditional burial grounds, which relates back to the old ancestor cults, was common. So too were prohibitions against cutting down trees in the village areas, sleeping naked, and killing or eating certain animals. This latter applied particularly to sheep and to the mbemba bird, as it was believed that Kimbangu and other prophets may take the form of these animals to effect their return. The mbemba bird is a type of pigeon that has traditional religious significance because it is believed to act as a messenger from the spirit world. This belief was almost certainly confounded by the Biblical story of Noah's use of the dove during the great flood, as the two birds are closely related. The eating of pork was also forbidden, partly because of traditional beliefs, but also no doubt because pork was forbidden to the Jews, and because Jesus ordered evil spirits to enter into a herd of swine at Gadarenes. (St. Matthew, 8:28-32)

At the same time large numbers of natives began to attend secret nocturnal services held in the forest. (Secret partly, at least, because of the administration's attempted suppression of the movements, but also no doubt, contrary to Andersson's opinion, partly because of the cultural significance

of secret societies.) The missionaries and administration were refused all information about these meetings although they were aware they took place. However two Swedish missionaries, Alden and Stenstrom, did manage to discover one of these rituals in progress. They report that:

> "The natives themselves (were) in a state of mental intoxication which was certainly not much less wild than that of the old pagan priests at their 'fetes nocturnes'--everything predisposed to something strange...We also witnessed the wildest orgies, this time indulged in the name of Christian ecstacy, divine inspiration and guidance. The participants in this nocturnal festival, men, women and children, indeed, even mothers with suckling infants tied to their backs with a blanket, performed the most amazing movements imaginable. They rushed wildly in and out of the crowd...leapt high up in the air...flung themselves backward...stretched their necks... groaned...shook themselves...This wild witches' dance was accompanied with a couple of rattles with a tremendously exciting sound." (quoted by Andersson, 1958. p104)

They also report that the whole crowd began to talk in tongues, (glossolalia), and at one stage jumped into the ceremonial fire with bare feet and legs. The practice of fire-walking relates to traditional African ceremonies. It is found in many cultures, often as a test of courage or as part of an initiation rite. Fire itself is also often thought of as a sign of purification. Under Ngunzism fire-walking became a test of moral qualities.

> "One who burns himself is wicked and unrighteous, one who is not harmed by the fire is a perfect man," (quoted by Andersson, 1958. p219)

Throughout the movement prayers and sermons became less important, and music and hymn singing more so, particularly

specially created Ngunzi hymns sung to native melodies. Kimbangu and the other prophets had always relied on loud singing to help attain a state of ecstacy, but now the Christian hymns of the missionaries were being replaced by native hymns accompanied with drums and rattles.

The healing of the sick, and the banishing of evil spirits, which as already mentioned were important elements of the 'Old African' religion, retained the prominence given them by Kimbangu at the start of the movement, although the techniques now used tended to deviate far from the ones he originally taught. There was also less emphasis on individual sin as such, and more on the coming Kingdom, although the communal admission of sin remained important.

In general, then, there was a move away from pure Christianity as taught by the missionaries and by Kimbangu. Much of its symbolism remained however. For example, according to Lanternari, the natives took

> "the cruciform gesture from Christianity...(and accompanied) it with words that vitiate its entire meaning: 'In the name of the Father, of Simon Kimbangu, and of Andre Matswa'." (1963.p28)

Nevertheless some prophets appeared who felt no further need for the Bible, and told their followers not to bring them to the meetings. There may also have been a rejection of Christian sexual mores, although reports on this subject always seem to be exaggerated. It appears certain, however, that many prophets, at least, felt no need to abide by Kimbangu's injunctions on

monogamy and sexual restraint.

The millennial aspects of the movement were re-kindled in 1935, with the arrival in the Congo of the Salvation Army. This was partly because of their liberal teachings, but mainly because of the deep significance attached to the letter 'S' on their epaulets. What else could this stand for but 'Simon Kimbangu'? Furthermore the Salvation Army referred to itself as "God's Army", and were thus taken to be the forces representing Kimbangu and Matswa sent by God to purge the country of Belgian rule. Although the Army missionaries were white, they were assumed to be the re-incarnated aboriginal dead. The deep cultural significance of physical contact with those assumed possessed by spirits, (good or evil), was strongly illustrated in this phase of the movement. Those accused of being a 'ndoki' (a witch), or being possessed by 'minkisi' (evil spirits) could prove their innocence by going to the Salvation Army posts and touching an officer or his clothes, or even by standing under their red flag. If on the way home the accused died it was taken as a sign that he (or she) had indeed been a ndoki. If on the other hand the suspect lived, it was taken as proof that he was not.

Summary

The Kimbangu-Matswa Ngunzism illustrates exceptionally clearly the on-going interaction between culture and prophecy,

mitigated by the social circumstances and historical processes in which millennialism becomes viable. As conditions changed, producing, but not satisfying, new expectations, Kimbangu's prophecy was altered and mediated by elements with traditional significance, until a movement consonant with the cultural heritage of the people and their immediate history appeared, by which the natives could attempt to understand, or at least give meaning to, their experiences.

The social conditions in the Congo in the early 1930s were such as to lead to relative deprivation being experienced by the natives. Following Leopold's civilizing mission in 1885 conditions for the native population were extremely harsh. However with the Belgium government's annexation of the Congo in 1908 they gradually improved. By the 1920s tribal life was returning to normal, although with the improved conditions new expectations were fostered. The return to tribal ways was encouraged by the Administration's decision to implement a system of indirect rule through tribal chiefs. However a number of factors led to dissatisfaction for the indigenous population. Firstly conditions although improved were still debasing. The natives, for example, were still being forced to work for the government and European land-owners for minimum returns. Secondly because there was greater contact with Europeans the discrepancy between European and native standards was widely apparent. Thirdly the inability of the natives to obtain any

education fitting them for higher 'European' occupations led to dissatisfaction, especially in the towns. And fourthly, and perhaps most importantly, the Administration's support for a return to traditional customs was seen to be limited. Where a tribal chief did not follow the instructions of the Administration, the chief was automatically replaced. Furthermore whenever a movement developed that gained any popular level of support it was suppressed by the government. Thus the treatment of Kimbangu and Matswa, and that of their movements, symbolized in many ways the half-heartedness of the Administration's support for traditional customs.

Thus briefly there had been a period of great hardship followed by a period when these hardships had been alleviated. This led to an increase in expectations over and above the changes that were being made, as Davies suggested is often the case. (1962) Consequently great feelings of relative deprivation were experienced. Partly because of the total lack of knowledge about Western political structure, this deprivation found expression in a millennial movement.

Although the movement claimed to be based on the prophecies of Kimbangu and, to a lesser extent, Matswa, this was only nominally true. Neither leaders' prophecy was millennial as first proselytized. Indeed Matswa's was not even religious. Despite this they came to be interpreted thus, and the two prophets themselves came to be viewed as messiahs soon to return.

The doctrine of the movement varied from region to region, as would be expected given that it was spread by numerous minor prophets. What is important is that all the innovations introduced were culturally significant. Within a very short time nearly all the Christian elements Kimbangu had based his prophecy on had disappeared. In this way not only did the doctrine become more meaningful for the people, but it also increased the perceived significance of native worth, thus negating the actual realities of European domination. In this movement more than any of the others analysed the interaction of the culture and social situation on the prophet's original prophecy is clear.

Chapter 5

The Crusade of the Shepherds, 1251

The later Middle Ages, (particularly the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries) were a period in which millennial fervour was rife amongst certain classes in North-western Europe. Many popular movements arose, all with the general purpose of re-capturing Jerusalem for Christianity, and thereby effecting the second coming of Christ. In this they emulated, to some extent, the numerous official Crusades which took place prior to and during the period. But although they shared many of the broader theological ideals of the official Crusades, they shared none of the latter's political goals; goals which by the time of the Fourth Crusade had patently come to dominate. With the increasing worldliness of the official Crusades, and of the Church as a whole, particular sections of the poor became, at various times, more convinced than ever that

> "they and they alone were the true instruments of the divine will, the true custodians of the eschatological mission". (Cohn, 1970A. p89)

In particular it was the urban poor and the landless peasants who saw themselves in this light. In Flanders in 1251 it was these people who made up the body of the members of the Crusade of the Shepherds. To understand fully why they were willing to embrace millennialism, it is necessary to see how

their expectations had not been realised and how their life-style was not producing the satisfactions they considered legitimate. For, once again, their situation was one in which conditions were changing, so that their previous way of life was no longer possible, while the advantages of the predominant new one were not available to them.

Conditions leading to the acceptance of the doctrine.

Europe in the eleventh and twelfth centuries had been a very 'open' society in all matters including religious ones, contrary to wide-spread present belief.[24] People were largely free to travel where they wished and to believe what they pleased. In Heer's terms:

> "It is sheer prejudice which condemns the entire Middle Ages as a Dark Age, based on the hackneyed assumption that the medieval mind was narrow, dominated by a fanatical clergy, strait-jacketed by a rigid set of dogmas". (1962. p20)

Europe's 'openness' was in part the basis, and in part the consequence, of a highly developed system of trading established between many widely diverse areas. Their mutual reliance on each other created the need for free passage along trade routes, and for tolerance of widely discrepant beliefs. Flanders, as the unproclaimed capital of the woollen industry, in many respects symbolized Europe's development at the time. Not only

---

[24] 'Open' is not here meant in the usual sociological meaning of mobility by achievement rather than ascription.

did it rely heavily on foreign lands for the raw materials of its industry, (eg. wool from England, dyes from Norway, Central Germany, South-western France etc. See Carus-Wilson, 1952. p375-378), it also relied on exporting a large percentage of its finished produce. Trade routes were established to places as far afield as North Africa, as well as to neighbouring countries.

However the widespread system of trade led to consequences that eventually resulted in the system's demise throughout Europe, and, incidently, caused the religious inquisition of the fourteenth century and the wars and feuds of the fifteenth. Of particular importance was the development of towns. In Flanders the urban phenomenonwas particularly widespread, although some towns only had two or three hundred inhabitants, and, indeed, the vast majority never exceeded a few thousand. But irrespective of their size, it was the social organization of the towns that made them significant. At the top were the traders and entrepreneurs, the patricians and burgesses, who, because of their economic superiority, politically controlled the towns and the trade that went on therein. It was their fight for urban autocracy against the feudal nobles and landowners that eventually produced the nationalist struggles that characterized fourteenth and fifteenth century Europe, and created a 'closed' society from the previous 'open' one.

Next in line came the skilled craftsmen who, although

dependent on the entrepreneur for work and materials, were not totally without power and influence. Through the guilds, the medieval forerunners of today's trade unions, they were able to demand a certain standard of minimum working conditions which, in general, included a wage based on the cost of living, (Carus-Wilson, 1952. p384), and, because of the nature of their skill, were ensured a degree of autonomy. Perhaps equally importantly they were able to limit the number of skilled workers to an economically beneficial level. Even so they were dependent on wages from the entrepreneur who alone reaped the profit.

Beneath the burgesses and skilled workers came the most numerous class of all, the urban proletariat, made up largely of recently migrated landless peasants. Two factors tended to increase their numbers in Flanders in the middle of the thirteenth century. Firstly there was a rapid growth in the population at the time, resulting inevitably in a shortage of land. The already small holdings of the peasants could not be further divided to support the additional population. The younger children of the family were thus forced to become a landless peasantry and hence an urban proletariat. Secondly, the wide-scale trading between distant lands had created a need for a money economy, and caused the introduction of many new and attractive artifacts into European society. The feudal lords, who had previously been satisfied with payments in kind and a relatively simple life-style, now demanded monetary payment so

that they could satisfy their new material desires by purchasing these artifacts from the urban merchants. Thus they became less interested in the old system of privileges and duties and more interested in renting their lands as a purely economic transaction and in making their estates more efficient. It was found that this could be done more easily by renting large areas to a few rather than small areas to many. The non-financial services previously rendered by the peasants no longer seemed attractive or necessary to the overlords. Consequently many peasants were forced by one means or another to give up their rights to the property and become freemen in the towns, where they swelled the numbers of the unskilled proletariat.

Without any economic basis for gaining political power, or even creating an effective political organization, the urban proletariat were unable to better their economic condition to match that of the other urban inhabitants. On leaving the land, the protection and rights previously due to them from their lord were no longer owing. Although the peasant's life was relatively harsh, there had always been the security of the traditional relationship to the lord; his privileges had rested on his acknowledged obligations. In the towns this was no longer the case. Gone too, perhaps, was the solidarity of kinship. No longer was the individual emmeshed in personal relationships based on marriage or blood. The urban mass was an anonymous one. But if the relative security of feudal ties was gone, the life-

style of the more prosperous urban inhabitants was not available to take its place. Although the town must have created new desires for the proletariat, just as it did for the nobles, it did not provide the means for their attainment.

It was in this setting,

> "in the densely peopled clothing cities of the County of Flanders (that) the conflict of capital and labour reached an intensity and a violence never since equalled even in the 'Hochkapitalismus' of modern Europe". (Carus-Wilson, 1952. p399)

Similarly Heer has written:

> "It was in Flanders early in the thirteenth century that an advanced form of capitalism first made its appearance in Western Europe; capital, economic power and political authority were concentrated in the hands of a tiny minority, a wealthy patriciate, who became the masters of a proletariat endowed with nothing but their ability to work...(the trader's) workmen were in his power for better or for worse. Since more and more people were flocking into the towns from the countryside--a landless proletariat, driven out by hunger and their lords' oppression--the 'entrepreneurs' could always be sure of a rich supply of human material." (1962. p88)

Furthermore the proletariat could find little solace in the official religion. To some extent the concept of 'heresy' was becoming increasingly important, although it had not yet arrived at the peak it was to reach in the fourteenth century. Previously, especially in rural areas, there had been many pagan but popularly significant elements in Christianity, elements which had survived from pre-Christian religions. Now, particularly in the towns, the hierarchy of the Church was

attempting to stamp out these 'impure' beliefs by centralizing control of Christianity around the dogmas of Rome. And also, partly as a consequence of this, the idealism of the Church was seen to be lacking. Its higher officials were becoming more visable to the masses, particularly in the towns where they tended to concentrate their efforts. Thus it was that the cry of "Luxuria et Avaritia" became more common, for the higher clergy were very much embedded in the upper class and in the upper class life-style. They,

> "the bishops, the abbots and the cathedral dignitaries, shared to the full the lives of their secular cousins..." (Heer, 1962. p59)

Not for them was a life of poverty and supplication.

The lower clergy in the urban milieu were, perhaps, also becoming more worldly and more sophisticated for money was more readily available through the penances and donations of the richer burghers. It must have seemed irreconcilable to the urban poor and unemployed that the acknowledged religious leaders were able to ignore Jesus's advocacy of poverty and live a worldly life amid plenty.

But more important, perhaps, was the idealistic and moral decline of the monasteries. The people of the period were convinced--Heer calls it "the most deeply held conviction of medieval Christianity", (1962, p62),--that it was impossible to live in the world, with its violence and depravity, and still be a complete Christian. Yet it was thought that some must

lead such a life for the spiritual salvation of the rest. There must be some whom the people could look to as holy. The monks in their secluded cloisters were called on to fulfill this role. Here they would be able to

> "achieve the complete sanctity of a perfect Christian life." (Heer, 1962 p62)

In the twelfth century a number of religious orders had been started, noticeably the Cistercians and Premonstratensians, and many noble landowners had built a monastery on their lands. By the middle of the twelfth century these monasteries, because of their original asceticism, had become rich and powerful, and, unfortunately for the populace, decadent and debauched. To many this meant that Christianity itself, particularly under Rome, was exposed as an illusion and a lie. The monasteries themselves, where alone of all places a holy existence could be achieved,

> "had become sinks of iniquity, no better than brothels, 'snares baited with whores'". (Heer, 1962. p62)

Thus it was that a contemporary was able to complain bitterly that the clergy

> "take no care at all of us, they live scandalous lives, they tread upon our heads...The common people make everything and deliver everything and still cannot live without being forever tormented and driven to ruin by the clergy...The prelates are raging wolves..." (quoted by Cohn, 1970A. p82)

In this situation of total relative deprivation, where the urban proletariat were without status or worth, and were

unable to follow the legitimate patterns of behaviour of old, (i.e. of the peasantry), and equally unable to copy the behaviour or material consumption of the urban patriciate or middle class, it only took a single unexpected and unjustified crisis to precipitate their mass acceptance of a new world view by which they could interpret and 'understand' their experience. In 1251 Flanders was afflicted by a great famine which raised the price of food and left many facing starvation. Although famine was not rare, it was certainly not the normal condition. Cohn states that between 1225 and 1309 there were only three major famines in the Flanders area, each one, incidently, precipitating a People's crusade or similar mass movement. (1970B. p34)

At such times it was the unskilled, disorganized proletariat who suffered. It has already been noticed that wages were, to some extent, correlated with the cost of living for the skilled workers, and that they were afforded some protection through their guilds which were becoming increasingly political. On the other hand,

> "worst off must have been the humbler craftsmen--beaters, carders, combers, spinners and the like, often working on the premises, who were neither organized in their own fraternities nor grouped together under separate inspectors. Less in a position to bargain, they must have been compelled to accept whatever wages the city authorities chose to fix". (Carus-Wilson, 1952. p385)

At times of famine these were unlikely to be sufficient. Thus

the urban mass would be willing to find hope in the words of one of the many wandering preachers who had not been accommodated by the now more rigid Church.

The millennial heritage of the people.

Without any political organization, knowledge, or power, the people accepted a millennial prophecy, for such a prophecy gave them hope of worldly perfection in a way no political doctrine could. Furthermore the age was one in which chiliastic hopes abounded, for although the popular heritage was not political it most certainly was millennial. In the popular mind the Crusades of the period were themselves very much concerned with Christ's second coming. If Jerusalem, the most holy of holy cities, could be re-captured for Christianity, the stage would be set for Jesus's earthly return and the formation of His Kingdom. Even when the Crusades came to be seen as lay wars engaged in for purely political ends, (as they had by the time of the Fourth Crusade (Cohn, 1970A. p89)), the popular imagination still envisaged that the millennium could be hastened if Jerusalem was captured by an army fighting solely for God. Thus it was that nearly all mass movements at this time involved the crusading spirit.

The idea of physical movements was not limited to the Crusades though. Pilgrimages had been popular for a number of years as a form of penance and absolution. Frequently they

involved travelling long distances, occasionally as far as Jerusalem itself. Furthermore great treks were taking place at the time to the area now known as Eastern Europe. With the shortage of land in Western Europe, both for the peasants and the younger sons of the nobility, efforts were being made to clear and cultivate this new area previously only inhabited by the Slavs and their like. Consequently large numbers of people made this long journey in the hope of finding a better future. Thus the idea of spending long periods travelling en mass was neither new nor confined to the Crusades.

Other factors made millennialism rife in this period. Of particular importance were the prophecies of Joachim of Fiore (1145-1202), which had received official recognition from the Church. Joachim believed, along with many others, that the Bible possessed a hidden meaning. In particular he thought that as well as giving moral injunctions it could be used as a means of understanding and foretelling history. Between 1190 and 1195, after many years of study, he came to the conclusion that he had discovered the means by which this could be done. He perceived that history was to consist of three great ages, each preceded by a period of incubation. The first age was the age of the Father or of Law; the second the age of the Son or the Gospel; and the third age was the age of the Spirit, in which the world would be characterized by love, freedom, and joy. The incubation for the first period was from Adam to

Abraham, for the second from Elijah to Christ, and the incubation for the third began with St. Benedict and was nearing its close around 1200. This timing was based on the fact that, according to St Matthew, forty-two generations lay between Abraham and Christ. Therefore, presumably, there would be forty-two between Christ and the beginning of the third age. Thus it was to occur between 1200 and 1260. (Cohn, 1970A. p108-110) Joachim's doctrine received a great deal of attention throughout Europe, and continued to be influential for a number of centuries. Cohn describes it as the most influential doctrine known to Europe until the appearance of Marxism. (Cohn, 1970A. p108)

One further undercurrent of European thought that made the thirteenth century a period of millennial expectations was the belief in the "Emperor of the Last Days". The military account of the final judgement rendered by St John in his Revelations, combined with the Greek and Roman custom of deification of military leaders and heroes, and the Sibylline tradition of prophecy, (See Cohn, 1970A. p29-36), created the common belief that the millennium would be effected by a great warrior-saviour who would defeat the Anti-Christ in battle. Throughout history the mantle of 'Grand Monarque' was thrust upon a number of kings and military leaders, some less deserving of it than others. In 1251 however there did appear to be a king who deserved it, Louis IX of France. He was, in Cohn's

words, to

> "set a new standard for kings throughout Christendom. Together with his rigorous asceticism, the genuine solicitude which he extended to the humblest of his subjects earned him an extraordinary veneration". (1970A. p94)

When this "secular saint"-- later he was canonized as St Louis-- set out on the Seventh Crusade, great confidence was placed in him. The hopes of all Europe were crushed when, in 1250, he was defeated at Mansura and imprisoned. The Crusade of the Shepherds in the following year was inspired, to some extent, by the desire of freeing him from his Saracen captors. (Cohn, 1970A. p94, 283)

The doctrine of the movement

From these elements the millennial hopes of the Shepherds merged into a doctrine and movement in 1251. The Crusade was lead by a renegade Hungarian monk named Jacob, who became known as the 'Master of Hungary'. He and two others began to proselytize the movement in Picardy at Easter 1251. Quickly word of their gospel spread to the surrounding districts of Brabant and Hainaut, lands all in the Flanders area. Jacob was a thin, pale man, tall and bearded, and able to speak with great eloquence in three languages, French, German, and Latin. (Cohn, 1970A. p94)[25] Like many other leaders of religious movements

[25] The rest of this account of the Crusade of the Shepherds relies on Cohn's analysis of it. (1970A. p95-97)

at the time, his charisma rested on his rejection of the by now disreputable monastic life in favour of a truly ascetic life of poverty. The combination of a religious training and a Christ-like existence made Jacob and his ilk the true disciples of God in the eyes of the masses. It was they, not the priests or the bishops, who were divinely ordained to carry on the work of Jesus.

Jacob claimed to have received a letter from the Virgin Mary, who appeared to him surrounded by a host of angels. He always carried this letter with him and claimed it bid all shepherds to help free King Louis and assist him in recapturing Jerusalem for Christianity. The idea of the Virgin Mary or Jesus appearing and giving a letter to God's chosen prophet was not new. It had first happened to Peter the Hermit in 1096, (Cohn, 1970A. p62), and it became common throughout Europe. (See Cohn, 1970A. p119-120, 129-131, 134, 146 and 230, for example; more recently it has proved the basis for the shrine at Fatima in Portugal.) It is not by coincidence that it proved most popular as a legitimating technique amongst people who were illiterate, for it not only suggests divine authority but also symbolizes the prophet's greater knowledge, and hence greater worth, in comparison to that of his followers.

That the letter called for all shepherds to leave their flocks is also symbolic, for the whole Flanders area was, in one way or another, dependent on sheep for its existence. (See Carus-Wilson, 1952. p372-387) Jesus, himself, had also used

the imagery of the shepherd looking after his sheep on numerous occasions, so the idea of the shepherds saving Christianity was only an extension of this. That it was symbolic is shown by the fact that the urban proletariat made up the movement's numbers, (at one stage reputed to be 60,000, although this is likely to be an exaggeration), but nevertheless wore shepherds' dress and became known as the 'Pastoureaux'. (Cohn, 1970A.p95)

Although the Pastoureaux were comparatively well armed with pitchforks and hatchets, and never failed to help themselves to provisions where necessary, they were revered as holy men by most of the lower classes. The Crusade marched first to Amiens, and then divided, some going to Rouen and others following Jacob to Paris. In all three places they were well received, even by the burghers and nobility who were impressed with their desire to liberate Louis IX. In Paris, the Queen Mother Blanche was so captivated by Jacob that she gave him many gifts. Meanwhile the mass of followers were, with the support of many of the townspeople attacking and killing all clerics and monks, especially Cistercians, Premonstratensians, Dominicans, and Franciscans. This continued in other towns the Crusade passed through, including Tours, Orleans, and Bourges. Clearly the murder of a priest was not seen as blameworthy; it could be atoned for, according to Jacob, by a drink of wine. This was a pattern that was to be repeated in other medieval millennial movements, for example in the one led by Hans Bohm,

the 'Drummer of Nikashausen', in 1476, which in other respects too was like the Crusade of the Shepherds. (Cohn, 1970A. p223-234)

Jacob had designated himself, with popular support, as God's true bishop, and started preaching in churches and sprinkling holy water. He also took upon himself authority to grant absolution for sins, and to marry and divorce his followers. Anyone who dared criticize or contradict Jacob was immediately cut down by his bodyguard. This too is a pattern familiar to other movements. The prophet is regarded as having divine authority on all subjects, and thus his teachings and doctrines are not to be questioned. Perhaps the best known example of this attitude is in the Anabaptist movement led by Jan Matthys in Munster in 1534. (Cohn, 1970A. p261-280)

At Bourges the behaviour of some of the Pastoureaux began to change. Jacob as well as preaching against the clergy also preached against the Jews, who were the traditional scapegoat of the dissatisfied proletariat. More importantly for the future of the movement, some of the Pastoureaux began to pillage all the houses they could, and to rape any women they came across. Consequently their popular support soon dissipated, and the townspeople turned against them, in the process slaughtering many. In the meantime the Queen Mother had realised what sort of movement it was and had outlawed all those taking part in it. The news of this encouraged the people of Bourges in their

attack against Jacob and his followers, and led to many of the Pastoureaux deserting. No doubt some had already left because of disapproval for the ransacking behaviour of the others.

A few of the followers eventually reached Bordeaux, Marseilles, and Aigues Mortes, but were dispersed before they could set sail for the Holy Land. Jacob had already been killed by the mounted burghers outside Bourges, and with the failure to embark, the movement's progress was arrested. However it entered into the popular heritage of millennial mythology of medieval Europe, and elements of it can be found in many later movements. This applies particularly and most obviously to the Crusade of the Shepherds in 1320 and Hans Bohm's movement in 1476. (Cohn, 1970A. p103-105 and 226-234)

Summary

The Crusade of the Shepherds arose as a consequence of a combined relative deprivation in respect to the past and the present. The people who accepted the millennial doctrine were an urban proletariat whose real cultural heritage lay with the peasantry. Because of a population growth and a 'rationalization' of feudal estates, (this latter brought about in part because of the urban phenomena and the need for a monetary economy), many peasants in the Flanders area had been made landless. They migrated into the towns where they joined the ranks of the fast swelling urban proletariat. However their hope that they would

find security in the urban milieu proved baseless. They were forced to compete with one another for work, and because of their lack of economic status were unable to protect themselves by political means. Consequently their situation was one in which the urban advantages were unobtainable while the security of traditional feudal bonds was no longer available. In such a situation it only took a single calamity to encourage these people to accept a millennial prophet. In 1251 such an event occurred for there was a famine in Flanders which raised prices and created wide-spread unemployment.

The people also experienced relative deprivation on an ideal level, and this inspired them to accept a millennial doctrine. The deprivation of ideals in the main concerned the failure of the monasteries to ensure that their members lived a truly ascetic life. It was strongly believed that only in the monasteries was it possible to live a truly Christian existence. With the development of the towns it became obvious that the monks were not living thus. To many this meant that the Roman Church was not the true Church of Christ it claimed to be. Instead the people came to believe that Christ's standards would only be enacted when He returned to earth, and they took it upon themselves to accelerate His coming.

The movement relied heavily on the millennial heritage of Europe. In particular two elements are outstanding. The desire to free the great king Louis IX was largely a consequence

of the doctrine of the Emperor of the Last Days. Traditionally this figure was to herald the millennium by slaying Christ's enemies. Because of his asceticism and solicitude St Louis, as he was to become, fitted the popular image of this role exactly. The second major element was the prophecy of Joachim of Fiore which had excited much of Europe. After years of studying the Bible Joachim had discovered that the third and final age of God was to be initiated between 1200 and 1260. It was only natural that this doctrine should be used by Jacob and his followers as the legitimation for their beliefs.

The influence of the social situation can also be seen. Firstly the symbolic use of wool and other effects connected with sheep and the woollen industry was prevalent in the movement. Even the people's dress was symbolic of the area's dependence on this industry. Secondly the emphasis in the movement was always on action within urban areas, (eg. Paris, Tours, Orleans, Bourges, etc) Thirdly there was the belief that the killing of a cleric was not a sin. This was a consequence of the clerics having apparently rejected the life of poverty and asceticism ordained by Jesus.

Because of a lack of historical data it is impossible to tell now whether all these factors were incorporated into Jacob's initial prophecy. However on the basis of the other movements analysed this seem improbable. It is far more likely

that his followers and supporters added to his initial doctrine. Either way it is clear that the social situation and the cultural traditions of millennialism were reflected in the final beliefs of the members of the Crusade.

Chapter 6

The Lazzaretti Movement

The Lazzaretti movement occurred in the most south-easterly part of the Italian province of Tuscany, particularly around Mount Amiata. This was an extremely backward, mountainous area, relying in the main on peasant farming for subsistence. It was isolated from the rest of Italy for much of the nineteenth century because of a lack of roads. What trading there was usually involved only local people. The main crops of the area were chestnuts, olives, and vines, and generally they were sold in one of the five small towns surrounding Mount Amiata, (Arcidosso, the most important one, Castel del Piano, Santa Fiora, Piancastagnaio, and Abbodia San Salvatore).

The local religion was Catholicism, although, as in all peasant areas, it contained much that was not in strict accord with the official dogmas of Rome. Just as in South America now, (and in south-western Europe still, for that matter), the Church was not able to banish all the pagan and heretical elements from the beliefs of the masses. There was, in a manner of speaking, a religious 'underground', in which all the varying schisms of the past centuries were remembered. Included in it was a popular reverence for 'holy men', men who appeared to be inspired directly by God and to be delivering His prophecies to the people. Especially in times of unrest,

the people of the area were willing to leave the churches and follow such a seer. Indeed it was not even that unusual for a priest to accept the prophet, just as some had in northern Europe in medieval times.

Between 1868 and 1878, a time of great agitation in the region, indeed throughout Italy, David Lazzaretti came to be thought of as such a prophet. At the beginning he considered himself to be true and faithful to the doctrines of the Roman Church, but gradually, as he developed his ideas, he came more and more into conflict with them, and was eventually excommunicated in 1878. Right up to this time he had considered himself a devout Catholic and was a strong supporter of the Pope. However it can clearly be seen that Lazzaretti's brand of Catholicism owed as much to the local religious tradition as to the official Church in Rome.

Conditions leading to the acceptance of the doctrine

Lazzeretti came to be revered as a 'holy man' after he had experienced a vision in 1868. That he should have had this experience then, and that he was readily accepted by the mass of the people, are certainly related to the circumstances of the period. These were dominated by the political unification of Italy, and the imposition of a liberal economic order on this extremely backward region. In Hobsbawm's words:

"The irruption of modern capitalism into peasant

> society...has always had cataclysmic effects on that society. When it comes suddenly, as the result of a revolution (and) wholesale changes of laws and policies...its effect is all the more disturbing." (1959.p67)

In 1867, after a poor harvest, the Italian government had introduced a milling tax which raised food prices, and, in general, proved highly unpopular. Throughout Italy there were riots, and in all 250 people were killed. Then in 1868 the construction of roads, linking this area to the rest of Italy, was started, financed by local taxes. In Castel del Piano and Santa Fiora the amount of these extra taxes was twice that of the central state tax, and in Arcidosso it was three times as high. As it was mainly a tax on land and cottages, it was the peasants who suffered the brunt. (Hobsbawm,1959. p67) Equally important was the simultaneous introduction of Piedmontese law as the standard law of Italy, for it included a main emphasis on economic liberalism. Because of it the customary rights of common pasture, firewood collecting and the like were abrogated, affecting most heavily the subsistence peasantry who depended on such minor concessions. This naturally increased the constant strife between the peasant share-croppers, (who formed a large portion of the population), and the larger land-owners. That this struggle has continued is shown by the high communist vote in this totally non-industrial area. (48.8% in 1953) (Hobsbawm, 1959. p68)

In 1878, when Lazzaretti's teachings became totally

millennial, these conditions remained. On top of them there had been a severe agricultural depression which led to a large-scale material deprivation as wages and revenue fell drastically. This, together with the changes of behavioural patterns enforced by the change of law, resulted in the peasants being forced to question their own status in society and the worth of their life-style. Thus relative deprivation was experienced in all four areas Aberle categorizes. However that the millennial dreams of Lazzaretti and his supporters became overt in 1878 was also a consequence of three separate incidents. Firstly both Victor Emmanuel and Pius IX died in that year; the latter especially held a position of significance in Lazzaretti's apocalyptic beliefs. Secondly Lazzaretti's Society of Christian Families was condemned by the Holy Office in 1878, officially for maladministration. And thirdly, as already mentioned, Lazzaretti himself was ex-communicated by Rome on 24th July of that year. (Seguy,1958. p74,82) Shortly afterwards, on the 18th August to be precise, Lazzaretti led his followers down Mount Amiata in the belief that the millennium was about to occur.

The prophet of the movement.

David Lazzaretti, whose father was an agricultural labourer, was born in 1834, the second of six children. He spent most of his life living in or near to the town of Arcidosso.

His childhood was similar to those of other children in the town. He learnt to read and write at the Church school, and apparently liked to light the candles and ring the bells in the town's church. Gradually he learnt the ways and customs of the area and often helped on the land, either labouring, sowing, or transporting produce. After leaving the school he became a carter, travelling throughout the region. He would have become a Capuchin monk if his father had allowed him to, partly as a result of a vision he experienced while ill at the age of fourteen. In it a Capuchin monk appeared and said to him:

> "Your life is a mystery. One day you will be given the secret of it." (quoted by Seguy,1958.p73)

This vision appeared to affect his life very little, apart from his desire to join the Capuchin order, and in subsequent years he became known as a worldly man and lived his life to the full.

> "Il jure, blaspheme, se bat, se complait dans les conversations crapuleuses." (Seguy,1958.p73)[26]

He got married at the age of twenty, shortly after his father's death, and had five children, only two of whom survived. From all accounts his family life was, up to 1868 when he experienced his second vision, a happy one, interrupted only by his serving for nine months in 1860 in the Piedmontese Army.

---

[26] "He swore, cursed, fought, and delighted in debauched conversations."

It is perhaps significant that at this stage he apparently felt few qualms about fighting against the Pope's army at the battle of Castelfidardo. Indeed the republican sentiments that were present at this time stayed with Lazzaretti throughout his life, although they were very much mitigated by his future experience. By 1870 he thought of the Republic not in terms of a secular political one, but in terms of the Republic of God.

In 1868, a year in which social conditions were altering drastically, as already noted, he received his second vision. This time St Peter appeared and re-iterated the words of the Capuchin monk. He also told Lazzaretti to go to Rome and obtain an audience with the Pope, Pius IX. Lazzaretti obeyed these instructions but could not obtain the audience. He retired for a short time to the south of Rome where he lived as a hermit in the ruins of a convent. This was to be the pattern he followed for the rest of his life. After a short while he returned to Rome but again was unsuccessful, so returned to Arcidosso. In September of the same year he made another attempt, and this time, with the help of some influential acquaintances, managed to obtain the sought after audience. He returned north immediately afterwards and soon experienced another vision in which he was ordered to become a hermit. He obeyed this instruction and spent most of the next three years in the ruins of a Franciscan monastery near Arcidosso, where he became recognised and revered as an austere, holy, and good man. (Seguy,1958.p73-74)

Thus his conversion and transformation were complete.

Lazzaretti had an increasing number of visions while he was living as a hermit, some more influential than others. News of these visions, together with rumours of his austere life, soon drew others of like mind to Lazzaretti. By 1870 he was able to organize a religious society, the 'Sacri Eremiti Penitenzieri', (Sacred Penitent Hermits), with thirty-three members. The majority of them were not recognizably theologians. In the main they too were peasants and agricultural labourers, although there was at least one priest in their number. This group devoted themselves to a life of poverty and austerity, providing for themselves by cultivating their fields. Because of their austerity they were also able to buy a number of books which they studied devoutly. They, like Lazzaretti, considered themselves to be true followers of the Catholic faith, and in many respects they were. Their devotions included saying mass and attending confession and communion daily; singing hymns and canticles; making pilgrimages to various sacred places including Rome; and constantly reciting their rosaries and repeating prayers to their patron saints who included St Francis of Assisi, St Francis of Paula, St Peter, St Paul, St Michael, and, of course, the Virgin Mary. (Seguy,1958. p77-78) Eventually they were admitted to the 3rd order of Franciscans by Rome, although in many ways they were closer to the Minimite order founded by St Francis of Paula.

In 1872 Lazzaretti also formed the Society of Christian Families, a basically communistic organization of families, in which each was dedicated to helping the others. Although they remained in their separate homes, they put their goods in common under a president and twelve elders, who were elected by the eighty families contained in the group. They acted together in order to gain the most profit from their land, and thereby raise the economic level of the group as a whole, following the pattern suggested by Fourier in fifteenth century France. A school was also started to teach the children of the families to read and write. Throughout Catholic virtue and doctrine were stressed, and indeed were taught to the group by appointed priests. However in 1878 the Church withdrew its sanction of the society as a result of maladministration. (Seguy, 1958. p82)

The formation of this communistic group of families may been seen as a symbolic consequence of the changes taking place. The idea of un-related families helping each other in times of need, and in order to maximise profits, is the direct opposite of the spirit of individualism contained in the doctrine of economic liberalism. Furthermore the return to a deep religious standpoint is again the opposite of the atheist, anti-clerical tendencies of the new government. Thus the formation of this society can be understood as the acceptance of a world view which is directly inverse to the disliked and unsatisfactory

official one.

Although neither the Sacri Eremiti Penitenzieri or the Society of Christian Families had many members in absolute terms, their importance to the millennial movement Lazzaretti was to lead lay in the sentiments they aroused amongst the general population around Mount Amiata. For his reputation as a holy and austere man rested upon his foundation of these two groups as well as upon his ascetic and visionary life. In turn this repuation was the basis of Lazzaretti being considered charismatic, and the basis for his popular support when he announced the coming of the Third and Last Kingdom.

Although neither of his organizations was under the direct control of Rome, and although certainly the Catholic hierarchy were mistrustful of Lazzaretti himself, the Church still gave the organizations its blessing, at least until Lazzaretti's heresy was too blatant to be tolerable. Seguy has suggested that this is at least in part a consequence of the political situation in Italy at the time. (1958.p75) Tuscany had, like other provinces, recently been captured by the 'ungodly' revolutionary army. Consequently the Church in an attempt to gain popular support at the expense of the new government, sanctioned almost any religious sect or movement that at least nominally gave acknowledgement to Rome. Lazzaretti, since his conversion in 1868, and his followers were, until 1878, deeply commited to the Papacy in general and Pius IX in particular,

and saw the Papacy as being the head of the new state of Christendom about to be created. It is interesting that the revolutionary secular authorities were somewhat afraid of Lazzaretti for the very reasons the Church supported him. As a consequence of this, (and also no doubt because Lazzaretti encouraged his followers not to pay taxes), he was imprisoned a number of times between 1872 and 1875. (Seguy,1958.p74)

The formation of a millennial belief.

The most influential single event in the formation of Lazzaretti's eschatological doctrine occurred in a second vision of 1868, although at the time he appears to have paid little heed to it. He experienced it while living as a hermit in Latium, (Seguy,1958.p75), presumably while waiting for an audience with the Pope. In it a warrior named Manfredo Pallavincini appeared and claimed to be a descendant of Louis IX of France (and northern Italy), who, as already seen in the chapter on the Crusade of the Shepherds, was later canonized and on whom rested the apocalyptical hopes of Europe in the Middle Ages. Pallavicini told Lazzaretti that he was also a direct ancestor of Lazzaretti himself, thus linking Lazzaretti with St Louis. He also told Lazzaretti that he, Pallavicini, had finished his life in penitence in the same place where Lazzaretti was now living as a hermit. If the latter would dig he would find Pallavicini's body. When Lazzaretti searched the

ground he did indeed find some bones, which he took to be Pallavicini's, thereby confirming the truth of the vision. (Seguy,1958.p75)

Apart from its millennial symbolism, (which Lazzaretti at first did not concern himself with), this vision is important in terms of the prevailing situation in Italy. It shows very clearly that Lazzaretti still retained some sympathy for the Republican cause for which he fought in 1860. Pallavicini was the name of one of the leaders of the Revolutionary army, and, with Garibaldi, was one of the two presidents of the National Italian Society. During the time he spent in the army Lazzaretti must have heard the name Pallavicini many times. It is not insignificant either that the visionary figure came dressed as a warrior. (Seguy,1958.p84) But furthermore "Manfredo Pallavicini" was the title of a quasi-historical novel published in 1846. It is known that this book was read by some of Lazzaretti's followers and so it is exceedingly possible that it was known to Lazzaretti himself. (Seguy,1958. p75, footnote 7) It seems that Lazzaretti's vision was based on these two factors.

Although at first Lazzaretti did not apparently realize the apocalyptic significance of his vision, others did. In particular, a priest, Jean-Baptiste Polverini, who was a member of the Sacri Eremiti Penitenzieri, and Leon-Anselme du Vachat, who supported Lazzaretti during a two year stay in France, interpreted it millennially. (Seguy,1958. p75-76)

Under the influence of Polverini, who himself was greatly influenced by the life of St Francis of Paula, and who was deeply concerned with the story of the Apocalypse, Lazzaretti began to interpret his vision in terms of 'le Grand Monarque', the 'Emperor of the Last Days', a millennial concept that had been popular throughout the Middle Ages. Lazzaretti predicted that a great king was to arise who would liberate the people who

> "(are now like) slaves under the despotism of the monster of ambition, hypocracy, heresy and pride. (He is to) descend from the mountain, followed by a thousand young men, all of Italian blood, and these are to be called the militia of the Holy Ghost". (quoted by Hobsbawm,1959. p69)

This militia was to regenerate the moral and civil order.

But it was while he was staying at Lyons, France as a guest of du Vachat between 1875 and 1877 that Lazzaretti really elaborated his millennial beliefs. He had first met du Vachat ~~in 1873 while staying with some relatives, and after his im-~~ prisonment returned to live under his patronage. Du Vachat, like Polverini, was also influenced by the European tradition of millennialism, including Jaochite prophecy. He believed a king, descended from St Louis, (who still symbolized all that a great leader should be), was to present himself in a mysterious fashion, and restore Christendom throughout Europe. The combined armies of this leader and the Pope would destroy the enemies of religion and herald the judgement of Christ.

(Seguy, 1958. p76) Du Vachat, after hearing of Lazzaretti's vision, naturally thought that Lazzaretti himself was the Emperor of the Last Days. Gradually Lazzaretti, too, saw himself in this role and became convinced that it was his mission to save Europe for Christianity. He also incorporated the Joachite tradition into his prophecies. Hitherto there had been the Kingdom of Grace, which was synonymous with the pontificate of Pius IX. This was to be followed by the Kingdom of Justice, and the third and final stage, the Reform of the Holy Ghost. (Hobsbawm, 1959. p69) The second age which was to start soon, would see Europe controlled by a sovereign pontificate and twelve bishops, symbolizing Christ and the twelve apostles.

Gradually Lazzaretti became convinced that not only was he the Emperor of the Last Days, but also that he was, in fact, the Messiah. His actions followed closer and closer those of Christ. He foresaw that before the final age was to come there would be great calamities, in which Lazzaretti, himself, would die. Thus, like Jesus, his blood would be shed for his people. He also frequently imitated Jesus's actions at the Last Supper. (Seguy, 1958. p79)[27]

---

[27]Seguy gives January 14th, 1870 as one date when this happened, but it is almost certain that this is a misprint as, according to Seguy and all other sources, Lazzaretti had not formulated his apocalyptic beliefs at this time, and, indeed, did not consider his own beliefs in any manner heretical to the doctrines of Rome. Seguy also wrote that Lazzaretti "re-united" the members of the Sacri Eremiti Penitenzieri for this purpose. Thus it seems far more feasible that the date should be 1878,as Lazzaretti was not in Tuscany between 1875 and 1877.

Lazzaretti and the original thirty-three members of the Sacri Eremiti Penitenzieri would sit around a large table. After repeating the Lord's Prayer and three glorias, Lazzaretti broke the bread, and distributed roast lamb to his disciples. He then poured wine into glasses, blessed it, and gave it to them, saying:

> "Eat and drink these blessed things; and cast all the lamb's bones in the fire with the exception of its tibia."

He then prophesized that one of the thirty-three would betray him, just as Judas had betrayed Jesus. That said he would retire from the room. (Seguy,1958. p79)

Clearly by this stage Lazzaretti realised that he was violating Catholic doctrine. Indeed he set himself above the Catholic priests, who until recently he had revered. As can be seen from the following quotation, he saw himself as being the only true messenger from God.

> "Anyone who, after hearing me speak, believes that I am a consort of priests is mistaken. I tell you in truth that I am no-one's consort. I have no-one to defend me in my work but God." (quoted by Seguy, 1958.p80)

Social influences on the doctrine

But needless to say, Lazzaretti's prophecies were not purely theological. His background and the reactions of the people around assured that his doctrine was consonant with the needs of the populace. Two elements are most important. Firstly,

he promised that land would be more equitably distributed, thus re-assuring the peasants on a matter that had always been of much concern to them, but that now, since the abrogation of customary rights, was of even greater importance. Secondly he promised them that they would no longer have to pay taxes. The following passage illustrates this, as well as the hope that the concept of the Republic still held for the masses. Although the unification of Italy was the cause of their present circumstances, they hoped that the true Republic, the Republic of God, would cure their ills. (It is interesting that Lazzaretti himself still frequently wore a red and blue uniform that symbolized his fight for the divine Republic).

> (Lazzaretti): "What do you want of me? I bring you peace and compassion. Is this what you want?"
>
> (Response by his followers): "Yes, peace and compassion."
>
> "Are you willing to pay no more taxes?"
>
> "Yes"
>
> "Are you for the Republic?"
>
> "Yes"
>
> "But don't think it will be the Republic of 1849. It will be the Republic of Christ. Therefore all cry with me: Long live the Republic of God." (quoted by Hobsbawm, 1959. p66)

That the people should accept the Republic to be the Republic of God, and that they should support a millennial prophet is a consequence of them having no political heritage.

Their way of life was based on traditional concepts of right and duty. As with most peasants, it was not thought that these rights and duties could be altered at the whim of men. They were legitimated by the whole peasant life-style. Thus when, in the 1870s, a new world view was necessary to explain and account for the total situation of relative deprivation they were experiencing, it was not likely to be a political one. Though they were aware of the revolutionary changes occurring throughout Italy, including Tuscany, at the time, the peasants would not be attracted to a secular solution to their problems, as it was this 'new fangled' political intervention that had caused their troubles. Instead they reverted to the traditional solution of peasant Europe, a world view dominated by an imminent millennial belief. Lazzaretti, who shared their heritage with them, was the man who focused this millennial hope.

1878, when the movement reached its peak, was not, in terms of the relative deprivation experienced, a particularly outstanding year. What made it the chosen time was a number of individual events, each of which had some significance in the beliefs that Lazzaretti and his followers had developed over the previous ten years. Both Victor Emmanuel, the king of Italy, and Pope Pius IX died that year. Thus according to Lazzaretti the Kingdom of Grace came to a close. Henceforth was the Kingdom of Justice when Europe would be purged of un-

Christian elements. Furthermore with the agricultural depression, revenue and wages fell drastically, suggesting the great calamities Lazzaretti had predicted were at hand. Finally Lazzaretti and his Society of Christian Families were condemned by Rome. This only served to convince the people that the Church was no longer divinely ordained, for everyone knew that Lazzaretti was a truly holy man. Like the people of medieval northern Europe, the Tuscanian peasants showed themselves willing to follow a particular spiritual leader rather than the official religious organization.

On August 14th, twenty-one days after he was ex-communicated, Lazzaretti led his followers up Mount Amiata, ready to "descend from the mountain, followed by...the militia of the Holy Ghost". Now Lazaretti was to show that he truly was the Messiah and 'le Grand Monarque'. Amongst other things Lazzaretti claimed that he was invulnerable and that a sign from his staff would annihilate his opponents. (Wallis, 1943. p61) After a delay of four days Lazzaretti and his followers descended, singing hymns. Altogether there were three thousand present, (the population of Arcidosso was approximately 6,700 at the time). At the bottom of the mountain they were met by the 'carabinieri', who apparently believed they were to make a worldly revolution instead of setting up the third and final age of God's evolutionary plan. (Hobsbawm, 1959.p70) After a confused exchange in which some stones were thrown, the 'carabinieri'

opened-fire on this group in which "women, children, and old men exceeded the number of strong men". (Seguy, 1958. p75) Lazzaretti was amongst those killed.

But his prophecy was not forgotten. It, too, went into the religious 'underground' of the people. In recent years there has been some evidence that in the minds of Tuscany's peasant farmers it has been combined with that other panacea of all wrongs, communism, to produce a new message of hope and new expectations by which the wrongs of the world--or, at least, the peasant world--will be set right.

Summary

Again the followers of the millennial movement were affected by an extreme relative deprivation that led to a questioning of the worth of their whole life-style. The unification of Italy and the implementation of Piedmontese law, with its emphasis on economic liberalism, had affected the peasant way of life severely. Many of the customary privileges of this class, for example common pasture and the right to collect firewood, had been abrogated. Although such concessions appear to be minor, they were economically important to the subsistence peasantry; and more significantly they symbolized and in effect helped to legitimate the peasant style of living. The change to economic liberalism as the standard by which things were judged meant a negation of the importance of the

peasantry. Furthermore new taxes had been introduced throughout Italy. The tax to pay for new roads especially burdened the peasants of Tuscany as many miles of new roads had to be built in this previously remote area. In 1878 the people were also in the middle of an extremely bad agricultural depression which because of the fall in prices led to great dissatisfaction with the newly implemented economic liberalism.

However the actual date when the millennium was believed to be imminent was not only a reflection of the above considerations. It was also a consequence of a number of individual occurrences, each of which had significance in Lazzaretti's apocalyptical doctrines. Firstly Pope Pius IX died in 1878, as did Victor Emmanuel. The Pope's death meant that the Kingdom of Justice was to begin. Perhaps more importantly Lazzaretti and his Society of Christian Families were condemned by Rome, Lazzaretti being ex-communicated. This in itself resulted in a spiritual deprivation that made Lazzaretti and his followers think the millennium was at hand. Lazzaretti had always considered himself a devout Catholic, as was illustrated by his prolonged attempts to gain an audience with the Pope. And to his followers, of course, his austere, ascetic life meant he must be a truly holy man. If Rome condemned him it must be Rome, not Lazzaretti, that was Godless.

As in the Crusade of the Shepherds the cultural traditions of millennialism are apparent in the movement. The

tradition of the Emperor of the Last Days is central to Lazzaretti's doctrine. Indeed in this movement as well as in the Crusade of the Shepherds Louis IX, (St.Louis), symbolizes this Emperor. Similarly Joachite prophecy, with its concept of God's plan for the world being divided into three stages is important. Lazzaretti however, like many before him, modified the content and timing of these three stages.

The social circumstances of the period can also be seen to be acting on the prophecy in a number of ways. Of particular importance were the belief that all demands for taxes would cease after Christ's return, and the influence exerted by the concept of the Republic. It has already been seen how taxation was a direct cause of the people accepting a millennial doctrine, so it is not surprising that its rejection was a core component of the millennial belief at the popular level. Similarly the concept of the Republic had been to the forefront of people's minds since Garibaldi's expedition in 1848. But in the millennial doctrine the Republic came to be perceived not as a secular concept but as a religious one. The Republic was to be the Republic of God.

Finally it is interesting that the Lazzaretti movement was still remembered seventy years later, and that it had come to be combined with communism, the new panacea of wrongs, in the minds of some of the people.

Chapter 7

The Irvingite Movement

The Irvingite Movement, which gave birth to the Catholic Apostolic Church, arose in London in the early 1830s as a result of the immense changes that were taking place in Britain at that time. Led by one of London's most renowned preachers, a Scottish Presbyterian minister named Edward Irving, the movement attracted the support of many relatively influential and well established middle and upper class members of British society. As result of this, even before Irving's early death in 1834, the movement lost much of its non-conformist character and became more recognizably a millennial movement based on catholic Anglicanism.

Conditions leading to acceptance of the millennial belief.

The nineteenth century, especially when compared with the twentieth, is popularly thought of as a period of ordered growth based on commonly held presuppositions, qualified by neither doubt nor relativism. In reality, though, this was far from the case, and was certainly not the image perceived by the middle class living in the period. They considered themselves to be living in a period of great change, "an age of transition" from the old to the new, from the past to the

future. Although sentiments of this sort are felt in many, perhaps even in most, periods, there was much to support this contention in the late 1820s and early 1830s. Their feelings were summed up by Thackeray when he wrote: "It was only yesterday; but what a gulf between now and then!" (quoted by Houghton, 1957. p3)

Analytically the changes were taking place in at least three different spheres, although needless to say the changes in all three reflected the same causes and, indeed, the changes in any one were, to a large extent, legitimated by the concurrent changes occuring in the others. Firstly there was the new and rapid process of industrialization, which resulted in both increased urbanization and a life style epitomized by speed and haste. In these respects the period was, perhaps, best symbolized by James Watt's invention of the steam engine. Almost by itself this innovation had effected a change in the industrial system of the country from a cottage orientated one to a factory based one. This latter negated the old paternalistic quasi feudal values of a social structure with fixed classes, each having its rights and duties, and replaced them with individualism and Bentham's utilitarianism. The steam engine had also changed the speed of communication by over 400% by replacing horses with steam locomotion, thus in part causing the greatly increased speed with which everything was now done. The 'nouveau riche' rising middle class of industrialists and

entrepreneurs was questioning the traditional basis of status; and, of course, the influx of prospective factory workers into towns and cities not built for such numbers resulted in a great deal of unrest and agitation. This was especially the case in London. This, combined with the apparent lack of concern for Christian morality amongst the working classes, did nothing to counteract the belief that the days of the Anti-Christ prophesised by St. John in his Revelations, (chapter 13), were at hand.

Politically the period appeared to be anything but stable. Not only were there new acts of Parliament which encouraged the feared 'democracy'--a state of affairs the established middle class thought contrary to God's divine will,--for example the Repeal of the Test and Corporation Acts in 1828, the Catholic Emancipation Act, 1829, and the Great Reform Act of 1832, but more importantly there were the revolutions in Europe, which struck fear into all 'respectable' people. The French revolution of 1789, with its declaration of the 'Rights of Man', had been the first and most prolonged but was followed by others in 1830. In England no revolution had occured but the conditions of the urban working class were thought to be such as to always make it a possibility. Thomas Paine's writings and the Cato Street Conspiracy of 1820 symbolized this fear, and increased the tension between what Disraeli later called "The Two Nations".

Philosophically the period can only be considered one of

doubt. The old 'certainties' were no longer seen in that light; apparently gone for ever were the days when a steadfast belief was possible. The old European system of dominant ideas and facts were disappearing. Thomas Carlyle, the philosopher and one of the great pillars of the Irvingite Movement and the Catholic Apostolic Church, caught his contemporaries' feelings of uncertainty when he wrote:

> "(Once) action was easy, was voluntary, for the divine worth of human beings lay acknowledged... (now) doubt storms in...enquiries of the deepest, painfulest sort must be engaged with,...(energy is wasted) in passionate 'questionings of Destiny', whereto no answer will be returned". (quoted in Houghton, 1957. p71)

If relativism was the chief cause of the doubt, the French revolution was taken as the prototype of where such thought led. Indeed the fear of revolution manifested itself as a fear of reason, which, in turn, was connected in the 'respectable' minds of the time with infidelity. Similarly the relativism implicit in historical interpretations of the Bible led to increased anxiety amongst the upper and older middle classes. This anxiety related not only to their own Puritan heritage but also to the fear of the total disruption of society if God's word was no longer steadfastly accepted. It was universally agreed by these classes that any discarding of Christian beliefs was "fraught with grievous danger to property and the State". (quoted by Houghton, 1957. p59) The Puritan way of thinking was still as prevalent amongst Anglicans as

amongst non-conformists. This naturally caused much distress about the very different ideals proliferating around then, including individualism and the regard for money and urge for success, which were part and parcel of utilitarianism. Indeed this latter created particular problems by its attack on the necessity for, and utility of, all religions, and by its replacement of Christian ethics with its own 'rational' morality.

Thus it can be seen that the 1820s and 1830s were a period of great change. In Houghton's words:

> "In the 1830s the most sensitive minds became aware that England was faced by a profound crisis. The intellectual world, the Christian Church, and the social order were all in grave peril, to be averted only by the most earnest search for saving ideas and the most earnest life of moral dedication. And yet people were going about their business--their pleasure rather--as if they had nothing to do but to eat, drink, and be comfortable..." (1957. p222)

Amongst these "most sensitive minds" were those who prayed and longed for the manifestation of the Holy Spirit amongst Christians. If God would only allow the Spirit to appear as it had to the early Christians, faith--and thenceforth order in social life--could be restored. Directly from this sprung the plethora of millennial movements--or"wave of Second Adventism", (Drummond, 1937. p236)-- arising in the early 1830s.

In terms of the model being used, expectations were not being realized, and thus relative deprivation was experienced along many dimensions by the professional and upper middle classes. To begin with their material welfare was no longer

as assured as it was, as the legitimations on which it was based were being questioned and replaced by thoseof individualism and utilitarianism. Thus the dissonance traditionally experienced by (in effect) downwardly mobile classes was here felt. Furthermore, of course, their place was being taken, and their status thus reduced, by the new breed of opportunists, capitalists, and entrepreneurs, who were concerned purely with gaining wealth and apparently rejected the usual middle class religious affiliations. Clearly behaviour based on old standards was no longer of importance. With the increasing emphasis on speed, with new methods of production, (which incidently themselves produced great stress even among the rising middle class because of the fear of failure), and with new types of relationship present amongst different classes, old patterns of behaviour no longer satisfied the needs which produced them, and thus became anachronisms. For all these reasons the individual's worth was no longer assured. Doubts prevailed in the minds of the traditional middle class about their life style, and eventually resulted in doubts about the individual's actual worth. Such doubts were not discouraged by the deterministic doctrine of Calvinism, of course. No longer could Carlyle or others feel that "the divine worth of human beings lay acknowledged".

But not everyone responded to the dissonance they experienced as a result of the above processes by acceptance of Irvingism, or even of any form of millennialism. In such an

'organic' society various compe:ential alternatives were possible and available, including of course an acceptance of the changes. One frequently voiced justification for this latter was the optimism and hope for the future betterment of mankind held out by the possibilities of modernization and industrialization. Each innovation made further innovations more likely, and each innovation, it was hoped, would benefit society. Indeed it was even hoped that economic liberalism, with the inter-related dependence of one country on another, would see an end to war. But for the upper middle class who were not able so readily to accept the great change occuring around them, the Irvingite movement, and the other millennial movements of the time, provided a world view by which it (i.e. the change) could at least be understood. It also interpreted it in a manner that suggested the likelihood of a more satisfactory future, as is usual for all millennial movements.

The prophet of the movement

Edward Irving was born in the town of Annan on the Scottish border in 1792. The son of a wealthy leather merchant and tanner, Irving is reputed from his earliest days to have taken a great interest in all religious matters and to have voluntarily attended many sermons. After being educated at two local schools--one of them later attended by Thomas Carlyle--Irving went to Edinburgh University at the age of thirteen.

He graduated in 1809 determined to join the ministry. By taking a teaching position he was able to continue as a part-time student in Divinity. He continued to teach after finishing this further course until 1818, although he was licensed to preach by the Presbytery of Kirkcaldy in 1815. He went to live in Edinburgh, then the religious and philosophical capital of Britain, for a year, after which he became an assistant minister in Glasgow. His manner of speaking and affectations in preaching however did not endear him to the church's members, and in 1822 he became minister at the Caledonian Church in London. It was here that the origins of the Irvingite movement were formed, although not immediately.

His first year in London was one in which he gained great popularity, at least with the elite of society. In those days, when attending sermons was a national pastime for the upper and middle classes, word soon spread of any preacher who, like Irving, was blessed with oratorical eloquence. Generally it is accepted that George Canning helped promote Irving's popularity by referring to one of his sermons in the House of Commons. A contempory writer claims that Bentham, Coleridge, Macauley, Hazlitt, Peel, and Canning amongst others could be seen at his services in 1822. (Drummond, 1934. p15)

But fashion changed, and Irving soon lost his popularity. Long before the new church in Regent Square, which he had had built to accomodate the vast numbers who in 1822 came to hear

him preach, was finished, the crowds had dwindled. However he was already formulating his views on the Apocalypse, and on other theological matters. For example he translated and prefaced a Spanish work entitled "The Coming of the Messiah in Glory and Majesty". Of primary significance at this time was his association with others of like mind at the home of Henry Drummond at Albury Park in Surrey. Drummond, who was one of the wealthiest commoners in England at that time, invited a group of men interested in 'Prophecy' to attend a week long conference, or retreat, on the subject of 'Unfulfilled Prophecy' in 1826. It proved so successful that further conferences were held annually for the next five years, and from them the doctrine of the Catholic Apostolic Church emerged. Indeed many of the people prominent in the Catholic Apostolic Church in later years first met Irving here. One of the results of the first Albury conference was an appeal by J.Haldane Steward, an Anglican cleric, for all churches to unite in prayer each week at stated times for the manifestation of the Holy Ghost. This was not a totally new idea, but only reflected the common concern at that time for "an outpouring of the Holy Spirit". (Shaw, 1946. p25) The general uncertainty and doubt experienced at the time about all matters, including religious ones, created a great desire for any form of sign or miracle that could be used as support for a belief in the ontological reality of God. Furthermore the fear of reason and rationality

which were thought to lead automatically to infidelity and radicalism, as they were seen to be on the one hand the basis of the current vogue for atheism, and on the other the basic tenet of the French revolution and thus democracy of all forms, made divine proof the only form of proof acceptable. Thus a desire for the Holy Spirit to become manifest, as it had to the early Christians, was natural.

The anti-democratic tendencies in Irving's thought, and later in the Catholic Apostolic Church, were pronounced. This is due not only to the fear of democracy people of his class held in common at that time, but also, in no small measure, to the paternalistic qualities he came to value in his early life. Indeed a harsh paternalism accounts for his actions and attitudes both as a teacher in Annan and as a minister in Glasgow, which tended, in general, to be based on strict but benevolent individual relationships. Not for him were the grandiose plans of the social reformer.

Throughout his life, but especially in later years, he held a dislike for all things of a liberal nature. Thus he thought the Bible was not to be interpreted in a historically relative manner, but was to be accepted as the literal truth, as it generally had been until recently. In this way he was able to deny the doubt incorporated in modern living. Houghton has shown how dogmatism results from a denial of the validity of doubt and questioning, (1957. Chapter 6), and this most

certainly applies to Irving. Only a totally dogmatic belief can successfully ignore all doubts.

The formation of the millennial movement.

The desire for the manifestation of the Holy Spirit, which was common throughout Britain and, indeed, Europe, at the time, soon resulted in behaviour that was accepted as just such a manifestation. In Britain it first occurred in the West of Scotland, with a number of individuals miraculously recovering from chronic and apparently terminal illness, and others 'talking in tongues', (glossolalia). They attracted much attention throughout religious circles in Scotland, and in London as well, not least with the members of the Albury conferences. In July, 1830, the chairman of the conferences summarized the joint belief of those present:

> "...it is our duty to pray for the revival of the gifts manifested in the primitive Church; which are, wisdom, knowledge, faith, healing, miracles, prophecy, discerning of spirits, kinds of tongues, and interpretation of tongues.. (and) a responsibility lies on us to inquire into the state of those gifts said to be now present in the west of Scotland." (quoted by Shaw, 1946. p32)

These gifts, especially glossolalia, soon proved infectious, and speakers in tongues could be heard at almost any of Irving's services in Regent Square. The status given these happenings was based on their similarity to the gifts given the apostles and early Christians shortly after Jesus's trans-

cendence. They have been standardly recognized throughout Christianity as a sign of supernatural presence. Recent examples of prophets who had been prone to glossolalia were George Fox, the founder of the Quakers, and John Wesley. Often the 'talk' in Irving's services was either not understandable, or else general lamentations about the state of the world. The following, for example, illustrates the perplexities of the period:

> "Men doubt--the very worms of the dust--they dare to doubt--Oh, it is a fearful thing! O mock not!" (quoted in Drummond, 1934. p16)

Some of the more coherent utterances, however, formed the basis of the eschatology and ritual of the Irvingite movement and of the later Catholic Apostolic Church. Not surprisingly, these proved to be consistent with the expectations held by the followers prior to the manifestation of the Holy Spirit. This was partly because of a process of selection of the tongues that were important, but also largely because the same beliefs reduced the dissonance experienced at the time both before and after the Holy Spirit's manifestation. The latter, in effect, only strengthened these beliefs and made them more legitimate.

One 'speaker' of particular importance to the movement was Robert Baxter, not only because he later rescinded his glossolalia and, in all sincerity, denounced them as being inspired by the Devil, but also because he provided the basis for the singular characteristic of the movement which distin-

guishes it from others of a similar nature. Unlike Baxter, the movement as a whole did not reject his 'talk' as being demonic, rather they rejected parts of it but accepted others. No doubt in part their continued (and sincere) belief in some of his prophecy resulted from their having already made them major components of their doctrine.

In particular, Baxter's prophecy that God was to create a new order of apostles, twelve in number like the original ones, was accepted. These new apostles were to herald Christ's return and spread the blessing of the Holy Spirit. As early as 1824 Irving and his followers believed that all human societies, (particularly the Bible Society and Missionary societies), were not divinely ordained, and that they and the churches had been cast off and abandoned by God. With Baxter's prophecy it was accepted that His blessing could not be achieved through these human organizations but only through the Holy Spirit and the laying on of hands by the new apostles God was about to create. It was these apostles who would be the leaders of the new (and catholic) Church, and all this-worldly authority was given them until Christ's return. Theologically this prophecy was based on Ephesians (chapter 4, verse 11) where it is said Christ gave to the Church Apostles, Prophets, Evangelicals, Pastors, and Teachers. It is claimed that these are not to be repented of, and are therefore meant to be in the Church to this day. (Shaw, 1946, p70)

A second of Baxter's prounouncements was momentous for

the movement. On January 14th 1832, he predicted that the rapture of the saints "when the saints of the Lord should go up to meet the Lord...", (Shaw, 1946. p42), was to occur "one thousand three score and two hundred" days hence. (Compare this with Daniel's and, later, John's prophecies.) Although the Lord did not come as predicted on the 14th July, 1835, the coming was prepared for by the 'Separation of the Apostles', where each apostle set out to convert his 'tribe'. Each prophet had designated to him as his 'flock' one of the twelve tribes of Israel, referred to apocalyptically in Revelations, (chapter 7 verses 5-8), who by now were scattered around the globe. The Catholic Apostolic Church continued to celebrate a great feast on that date each year. (Shaw, 1946, p39-43)

Not all of Irving's church members approved of the glossolalia now characterizing each of his services, and efforts were made to depose him as minister. On May 3rd, 1832 the elders of the church met and found him "unfit to remain the minister of the National Scotch Church..." (quoted by Shaw, 1946. p36) and forbade him from holding any further services. Locked out of his church, he and his followers were forced to find alternative facilities. This they did in Newman Street by October 1832. It was here that Irving's movement became the Catholic Apostolic Church, and his leadership replaced by that of the new apostles.

Prayers were made at Newman Street for the apostles to

appear "and the Lord was not long in hearing and answering our prayers". (Irving, quoted by Shaw, 1946. p69) On November 7th, 1832 the first apostle, J.B. Cardale, was 'called'. Others quickly followed, including Henry Drummond, one time M.P., the founder of the Albury conferences, and one of the wealthiest men in England; Thomas Carlyle, the philosopher, and long-time friend of Irving; Spencer Percival, son of the assassinated Prime-minister; and Frank Sitwell, the "well-connected" owner of Barmour Castle in Northumberland; until by early 1835 all twelve had been 'called'. (Shaw, 1946. p72-75, 80-83)

The final ignominy for the proud Irving, never himself 'called', came immediately after he was deposed from the Ministry of the Church by the Presbytery in Scotland for his views on the human nature of Christ, (that Jesus was tempted by sin as much as other men but overcame it through the blessing of the Holy Ghost--a doctrine, incidently, that was considered orthodox in other periods, as is illustrated by Irving calling his work "The Orthodox and Catholic Doctrine of Our Lord's Human Nature".) On returning to London the apostles forbade him to baptize until he had been re-ordained by one of their number. ("What the Church of Scotland had given the Church of Scotland could withdraw"). Thus he was totally under the will of the men who had taken over the movement he had formed. Shortly afterwards he was given the title 'Angel', which was synonymous with 'Bishop', but which at that time carried little weight in

in comparison with the apostles. On December 7th, 1834 he died, with his movement becoming further and further removed from his own views.

The doctrine of the movement.

Eschatologically the belief of the movement was that the Lord was to return, but that although the process was to start imminently, the millennium itself was not to be complete for a number of years. Thus when July 14th, 1835 came and passed, the movement which was already becoming institutionalized, could readily find reasons why there had been no great change.

The justification for the belief in the millennium came, like that for so many movements, from Daniel, chapter 7 where the anti-Christ is given 1260 years to exist. One of the members of the Albury conferences, Cunynghame, had suggested that the beginning of this period was 533 A.D. when Justinian in the Pandects code had given the Bishop of Rome authority over the churches, and was declared to be the head of the Church. Thus the period was to end in 1793, which was, significantly, the beginning of the Reign of Terror in France, which, with the French Revolution as a whole, had struck fear into the hearts of the English middle classes. According to Johannine prophecy, the six vials of wrath were to be poured over the beast in the next thirty years (until 1823), while the second period of forty-five years--which was taking place then--would

herald the return of Christ, the War of Armageddon, and, then, the millennium. Other members of the Albury conferences had accepted Cunynghame's belief on this matter, Irving and J. Halley Frere, (who had a large influence upon Irving), amongst them, and it became the theological basis of the Irvingite movement.

Other evidence for the coming millennium was used, most of it stemming from Biblical prophecy, which, as already noted, was taken as being the literal truth. Even Christ's parables are given specific significance, with each element in them being analysed for meaning. Thus the Apocalypse is not a symbolic account of the end of the world, but is a narrative in strict historical order of what will occur. By accepting Barnabas's (and other's) contention that the world will last six thousand years, ("Therefore, children, in six days--that is six thousand years--shall all things be accomplished" (Epistle of Barnabas, 13)), they suggest the world will end in the year 2,000 A.D., for according to Biblical history, the world was created 4,000 years before Christ's birth. To this they add Christ's parable of the men who work in the vineyard, some of whom were called in the third hour, some in the sixth, some in the ninth, and some in the eleventh hour. If twelve hours symbolizes the period of Christian dispensation, (i.e. 2,000 years), each hour is equivalent to approximately 167 years. Thus the third hour was around 500 A.D. when Rome

nearly faced extermination from the Western empire of Odoacer; the sixth hour was 1,000 A.D., the period of the Dark Ages; the ninth hour was 1,500 A.D., the period of the Reformation, which was a protest against the corruption of the Church but in which the equally false doctrine of individual interpretation of the Bible was proclaimed. The eleventh hour of the day, which was equivalent to 1833, signified that this period of individual interpretation was to end, and be replaced by a catholic church in which God's truth would be taught. Thus the formation of the Catholic Apostolic Church in 1833 was justified as part of God's divine order. The last hour of the Christian dispensation is filled with uncertainty, and no-one knows whether it will run its full course, for the Lord will come "as a thief" (St. Matthew, chapter 25 verse 6), but to the people who recognize and receive Him He comes "as a bridegroom" (Revelations, chapter 16 verse 15) (Shaw, 1946. p185-188) Thus it can be seen that although the stages to be undergone were well recognized, no specific predictions were made about the timing, (with the exception of Baxter's 14th July' prophecy). This, of course, gave the movement a certain 'fluidity' and meant that it could not be refuted by the failure of its predicted prophecy to occur.

With the creation of the apostles in Newman Street, and Irving's death in 1834, the movement began to change its character somewhat. As in other movements, the prophet's

doctrine was changed to suit the particular needs of his followers at the time, although the basic structure remained the same. In particular the movement came to be influenced less by Calvinistic Presbyterian ideals and more by catholic Anglican ones. For example, from the simplicity of the Newman Street church as Irving first appointed it, the churches gradually became adorned with religiously symbolic trappings of one form or another. Similarly, following the Oxford movement, a liturgy was produced in 1842, with another in 1847 and a third in 1850. Since then further modifications have been made, each incorporating more ritual than previously. Gradually, too, what imminence there was in the movement disappeared, and they began to perceive of themselves as taking the same role as John the Baptist.

The authoritarian, anti-democratic tendencies which had been important in the movement from the beginning continued. (A fear of 'democracy' had been one of the initial circumstances leading to the need for the movement's formation.) In particular the divine right of traditional rulers in church, politics, and family was promoted, as can be seen from the elitist organization of the movement, with the twelve apostles having absolute authority on the basis of their being selected directly through God's intercession. The character of the apostles' mission also illustrates these anti-democratic tendencies. The Catholic Apostolic Church had the duty of informing all mankind of

Christ's return, as is suggested by its title. However this was not to be done by proselytizing and mass conversion, but by informing the world's rulers of the imminent Advent and relying upon them to make it known to their subjects. Not surprisingly this was not a particularly successful method, even though the apostles, with their many connections, did manage to present briefs of their beliefs to all the important world-leaders of the time. The only places where it proved at all popular were Germany, which was Carlyle's territory--(glossolalia occurred in Bavaria at the same time as on the west coast of Scotland)--and North America, where it was promoted under the original apostle, John Bate Cardale, by William Watson Andrews and George Ryerson amongst others. Considering the conditions prevalent in North America at the time it is not surprising that the movement proved popular; many other sects found this developing continent to be fertile ground for gaining converts. (See S.D. Clark, 1948)

The Catholic Apostolic Church ensured its own demise by its doctrine that only the apostles could ordain its ministers, (known as Angels, Priests, and Deacons, depending on their position in the hierarchy). Thus in 1901 when the last apostle, Francis Woodhouse, died, the end of the ministry was in sight. Gradually each church has had to be disbandoned, as no more ministers were available. Information on the Church since 1901 is difficult to obtain as members have had a period of silence

imposed on them since then. Undoubtedly some second and third generation members still exist, hopeful that the prophecy of Irving and his followers will soon be realised.

Summary

The Irvingite movement is important for three reasons. Firstly it illustrates well how, in times of uncertainty and doubt, a new world view is desired and formulated, how in effect its occurrence is a 'self-fulfilling prophecy'. Secondly, it illustrates how in modern 'organic' society only a few of the affected will necessarily accept a common belief, others either producing alternative responses ('competential alternatives'), or not feeling the effects to the same extent and thus being able to accommodate them. It also illustrates how people affected by different circumstances can embrace the same response, for the conditions in North America between 1830 and 1850 were very different from those found in Britain. And thirdly it illustrates how, even in modern movements, the prophecy of the acknowledged prophet and leader is altered and mediated by the needs and cultural heritage of the followers, who in this case were basically Anglican and upper-middle class.

The relative deprivation experienced by these followers was again of a total nature; that is, of a kind that led to a questioning of their whole worth. Of interest, however, is the fact that in this movement, unlike the others analysed, little

relative deprivation was experienced on a material level. Of far greater importance was the deprivation caused by the political and philosophical changes occurring in English and European society at the time. These were, needless to say, a reflection of the material changes taking place in north-western Europe, but these material changes did not themselves directly lead to an extensive relative deprivation being experienced. Instead the major deprivation was a consequence of the relativism being advocated in all matters, and of the fear felt by many of the middle class of political revolution and the destruction of the social order as they knew it. Relativism and revolution were not unconnected. They were both a consequence, in part at least, of the new importance given to 'reason'. Most noticeably both were connected in the philosophical writings that ensued from, and in effect justified, the French Revolution.

As a consequence of the relativism prevalent in the philosophical and popular thought of the time, the first half of the nineteenth century can best be characterized as a period of great doubt. No longer could things be taken for granted; no longer were they necessarily as they were. Of great importance in the formation of the movement was the doubt thrown on the existential status of God. It was this doubt in particular that led to the movement taking the form it did. For clearly God's existence could not be proved by reason, as reason was largely the cause of the initial doubt. It could only be proved

by divine and miraculous acts. Behaviour was soon to occur which was interpreted in this light. In particular a number of individuals were cured of chronic diseases, and even more began to talk in tongues. Such acts were taken as proof of God's existence, and of the fact that the world as it then was would soon end.

Both the cultural traditions of the people and the social situation at the time were reflected in the doctrine itself. For example, as would be expected in a period when literacy was a valued ideal and was in any case comparatively common, at least for the middle class, (the class to which the majority of Irving's followers belonged), the legitimation for the movement's eschatological doctrines came from the accepted religious text, the Bible. Because the movement was a reaction to the doubt existing in the period, Biblical writings were interpreted as being the literal truth. The movement's dogmatism in this matter, as in others, served to deny the doubt afflicting all its members. The effects of the follower's social and cultural heritage can also be seen in the way they chose to proselytize the movement, and in the manner in which the movement evolved after Irving was forced to leave the Regent Square church. Gradually standard Anglican middle class ways replaced Irving's Presbyterian ones. Indeed Irving's contribution to the movement was itself eventually ignored.

Chapter 8

The Black Muslim Movement

Although the Black Muslims are now thought of as, primarily, a black power separatist political organization, their doctrine and rituals still incorporate the millennial idealism from which the movement first developed. For it was as a purely millennial cult that it first arose, following the appearance of a mysterious pedlar of Eastern descent who taught a new religion while selling his wares to the slum-dwelling blacks of Detroit in 1930. Since then the Muslims have become more economically and politically conscious, but their millennial heritage can still be clearly seen.

Although there is only one early source about the movement, (Beynon, 1938), their earlier beliefs can be assumed to be similar to their present eschatological doctrine, (though still recognising that changes have occurred in it through the interaction of the prophet--since 1934, Elijah Muhammad--and his followers in changing social circumstances). It should be noted that the movement did not win the support of even a sizable minority of the black population of Detroit, only having approximately 5,000 members by 1934. This is because in modern Western society there are numerous alternative responses available to alleviate the dissonance produced by unsatisfactory

conditions. Each individual has a potential choice of commitment, a choice not available to members of more mechanistic societies. Not only will the individual's prior focus of commitment result in the choice of different types of 'solution' when dissonance is experienced, but there will also be a wider variety of this type of 'solution' available during the experience. Thus one individual's prior commitment may lead him to seek a political answer, while another individual may respond to a religious one. In either case there will be numerous organizations (in a very unstructured meaning of the word) and doctrines from which each may choose. This is not to suggest that the choice is made on consciously rational or logical grounds. Indeed the opposite is suggested. An individual will be attracted to an organization or movement in times of stress because, of all the other doctrines that he has knowledge of, this one suits his own individual heritage best, and thus intuitively appeals to him as the one which can 'explain' his situation most satisfactorily. In mechanistic and less differentiated society there will be fewer alternative doctrines available and every individual's heritage, both personal and cultural, will be more alike, thus potentially leading to a more uniform response to feelings of dissonance.

The Prophet of the Movement

The Black Muslim movement started in Detroit in 1930 when

a man of unknown origin, although undoubtedly of Near East extraction, began peddling silk and satins from door to door in the ghetto areas. This man generally called himself W.D. Fard, but was also known as Mr. Farrad Mohammad, Mr. F.M.Ali, Professor Ford, and Mr. Wali Farrad. (Lomax, 1963. p47) Like most pedlars in the ghetto areas he found entrance into the people's homes easy. Once accepted he began gradually teaching his gospel.

> "He came first to our homes selling raincoats, and then afterwards silks. In this way he could get into the people's houses, for every woman was eager to see the nice things the pedlars had for sale. He told us that the silks he carried were the same kind that our people used in their home country and that he had come from there. So we all asked him to tell us about our own country. If we asked him to eat with us, he would eat whatever we had on the table, but after the meal he began to talk: "Now don't eat this food. It is poison for you. The people in your own country do not eat it. Since they eat the right kind of food they have the best health all the time. If you would live just like the people in your home country, you would never be sick anymore." So we all wanted him to tell us more about ourselves and about our home country and about how we could be free from rheumatism, aches and pains." (quoted by Beynon, 1938. p895)

To begin with he confined his teachings to narratives of his native land, and proscriptions against certain types of food, but gradually he started preaching about religion, always in terms of what the people from the homeland did. At first he used the Bible to teach them about this religion, but then he began to criticize it, and the Caucasians whose holy book it really was. The Black Nation, he claimed, had their own

holy text, the Holy Qur-an, which, unlike the Bible, was all truth.[28] He started holding meetings in people's homes, just as the Christian sects often did, but eventually, as neighbourhood interest grew, the number of interested people required the hiring of a hall, which was named the Temple of Islam.

Once the Temple was secured, and the loyalty of the believers guaranteed, the loose-knit, informal contact between Fard and his followers ceased. He formed a solid organization and introduced many ritual requirements. An organizational hierarchy was established, and all new recruits were examined and registered before admission. Amongst other things, for example, each member had revealed to him by Fard his 'true' name, as distinct from his slave name, the name the slave owners had given his family. Within three years Fard's organization was so effective that he was able to withdraw from active leadership almost entirely. (Lincoln, 1961. p14) As well as founding the Temple of Islam, he had by then started the University of Islam, (really a combined elementary and secondary school), and the Muslim Girls Training Class, which taught home economics and the correct way Muslim wives and mothers should act. In 1934 Fard disappeared as mysteriously as he had arrived, leaving Elijah Muhammad, (slave name Elijah Poole), in control of the movement, as he still is at present.

---

[28] Throughout this chapter the Islamic Holy Book will be spelt 'Qur-an' as this is the spelling used by the Black Muslims. That it differs from the usual Western spelling, 'Koran' is not, of course, without significance.

The gradual manner by which Fard introduced his potential followers to his new religion, the subtlety of his initial approaches, in itself set Fard apart from other demagogues. Together with his mysterious background, (kept mysterious purposively by Fard), and his seemingly wide knowledge--as well as the Qur-an and Bible, he often referred to the literature of Freemasonry, and the writings of Joseph Rutherford, the Jehovah's Witnesses' leader, (Lincoln, 1961,p13)-- this ensured Fard's charismatic recognition. Many rumours and legends were spread about Fard during this period. He was supposed, for example, to be the son of a Middle East sheik, and to have attended university at London and California. After his disappearance Fard was deified by his followers, largely at the instigation of Elijah Muhammad, who was also responsible almost single-handedly for the perpetuation of Fard's doctrine after the movement began to lose members after 1934. To facilitate this, Muhammad had the organization move to Chicago in that year, ostensibly because of police hostility and harassment.

The doctrine of the movement

The doctrine and eschatology of the Black Muslims is a mixture of Christian and Islamic teachings. The Bible is given some recognition although it is thought to have been distorted by the attempts of the white people to hide the truth from the blacks. In the period of interest here, (1930-1934), the Qur-an itself was of minor importance as a religious text. Never-

theless "from the earliest days of the Movement, the Black Muslims have considered themselves devout adherents of the Moslem faith". (Lincoln, 1961. p219) The lack of knowledge of the Qur-an is not surprising, both in view of the high level of illiteracy prevalent amongst the black ghetto community at the time, and in terms of the cultural heritage of the people, who had been raised almost exclusively as non-conformist Christians. And nor, for this latter reason, is the utilization of Christian imagery and Biblical history in the movement surprising.

The eschatological doctrine of the Black Muslims implies a reversal of the black man's traditional position in American society. In reality it is the black people who are superior, intellectually, morally and physically. Six thousand years ago the black nation were the only people on the earth, living in the fertile Nile valley, a veritable Garden of Eden. But then a mad scientist named Yacub discovered that the black man had two parts, a dominant black element and a recessive brown one. By carefully controlled breeding he was able to produce the devilish white race. He bred into his white race a hatred for all blacks. (In recent years this model of the creation of the white race has become genetically more sophisticated, but its basis was, by all accounts, present in the early years of the movement) Because the black man was the original man, all colours are seen as shades of black. Thus white is the

absence of colour, and hence the white man is incomplete and imperfect. (Lincoln, 1961. p73) The concept of the white man being created six thousand years ago in a Garden of Eden refers to Old Testament teachings, as according to most estimates the time period between Adam and the present, calculated from the Bible, is six thousand years.

Yacub's white tribe caused so much trouble for the black nation that they were banished from the Nile valley into infertile Europe, where for many years they lived as primitives, dwelling in caves and only eating wild berries. However Allah, in His divine wisdom, gave the white tribe six thousand years to rule and sent them two great prophets in an attempt to teach them His will. After two thousand years He sent Moses, and then after a further two thousand years, Jesus. However both these great prophets were ignored by the whites, who altered and changed their teachings to suit their own evil purposes.

In the course of the white man's rule, many black people were transported to America where they were forced into slavery. Once there, the slaves were taught Christianity, a religion largely invented by the white devils in an attempt to maintain their power, for they knew their time was running out. (Raymond Sharrieff, Elijah Muhammad's son-in-law, and leader of the Fruit of Islam, the Black Muslim's security force, integrated the importance of sovereign black nationality and the imminent millennium for the movement when he said in a Temple meeting:

> "Black people are not a race but a nation. Only the Caucasians are a race, because the white race is racing with time and they are racing themselves just about off the planet earth."
> (Essien-Udom, 1962. p148))

Christianity, with its concept of reward after death in an other-worldly heaven, is blamed, in part, for the present condition of the black people in America. According to Elijah Muhammad, it is

> "one of the most perfect black-slave-making religions on our planet. It has completely killed the so-called Negroes mentally".
> (Elijah Muhammad, 1965. p70)

Heaven and hell are not ontological realities, but are "two conditions on earth which reflect one's state of mind, his moral condition and actions". (quoted by Essien-Udom, 1962. p22) Knowledge of one's self, one's nation, and one's religion is the true meaning of the Resurrection, while ignorance of it is the meaning of hell. The Christian heaven is proved false by the tenacity with which Christian leaders hang on to life, and by the white man's continued amassing of wealth, despite the Bible's injunction against it. The Resurrection does not mean that man will arise from his grave, but that the dispriviledged blacks will achieve justice and a knowledge of their history and their true God, Allah.

The alloted six thousand years of white rule were up in 1914, and Allah has implemented the first stage in the coming of the millennium, "the spiritual sounding of the trumpet" (Essien-Udom, 1962. p155). This consists of making the 'so-

called American Negro' aware of Allah's divinity. It is the task of Elijah Muhammad, (the messenger of Allah), to do this, and make them aware of their history and destiny.

> "This is the first time that (Allah's divine plan) has ever been revealed and we, the poor rejected and despised people, are blessed to be the first of all the people of earth to receive this secret knowledge of God." (Elijah Muhammad,1965. p9)

The second stage of the millennium will be the judgement of Allah when the white race and all non-believers will be destroyed. The exact date of it is known only to Allah, although 1970, 1975, and 1980 have been suggested recently. However it seems highly likely that far earlier dates were supposed when the movement started. Their concept of this second stage is similar in many respects to the Revelations of St. John, and includes the Battle of Armageddon and the Day of the Apocalypse. (Essien-Udom, 1962. p155) Only 144,000 'so-called Negroes' will escape the destruction of Armageddon--a number shared with the Jehovah's Witnesses, whose doctrine was known to Fard through the writings of Joseph Rutherford, and based like theirs on St. John's prophecy. Recent writings suggest the destruction of the white race will be achieved by a nuclear holocaust, but earlier believers certainly envisaged the use of poisonous gases and conventional aerial bombs. These, of course, reflect the most destructive methods of military genocide known in each period, for in 1930 the techniques utilized in the Great War would still be to the forefront of people's minds.

It is in life-style and morality that the Black Muslims most closely approach traditional Islamic religion, although there are still, needless to say, important differences. The Black Muslims demand that formal prayers are recited at least five times a day, as all Moslems do; and there is no single Sabbath or holy day of the week. Each and every day must be devoted and dedicated to Allah. Prior to prayer each believer is expected to wash all exposed parts of the body thoroughly, in a pre-ordained and ritualistic manner. The right side must be washed before the left, and the hands after the rest of the body, for example. Muslims are expected not to waste their money on luxurious or unnecessary items. Instead enough money should be spent on keeping the home at the required standard, with the rest either saved or given to the Black Muslim organization. Between 10% and 33% of all income is expected to be donated in any case. Unncessary expenditure is discouraged by the relatively severe prohibitions which are a part of the Black Muslim moral injunctions. For example the use of alcohol, tobacco and narcotics is prohibited, as are gambling, dancing, sports, and all other entertainments except ones taking place within the auspices of the Temple. (Essien-Udom, 1962. p28)

Lying, stealing, discourtesy, and insubordination to civil authority (except on the ground of religious obligation) are similarly sanctioned against, and there are prohibitions against eating or sleeping more than is necessary and extra-maritial

sexual relations. Maintaining personal habits of cleanliness and keeping fastidious homes are also moral duties. (Essien-Udom, 1962. p28) Various types of food are proscribed particularly pork and collard greens. The prohibition of certain foods was, as already seen, one of Fard's first teachings to his followers at the beginning of the movement.

Conditions leading to acceptance of the doctrine.

As with many other sects, this strict morality, with its emphasis on economic frugality, has resulted in the effective upward social mobility of the members. (For a fuller analysis of this aspect of the movement see Essien-Udom, 1962. Chapter 4). Apart from a new self-respect and a new confidence from the new world view, members accumulate enough capital to join the ranks of the middle classes. This certainly tends to set Muslim believers apart from other blacks and makes them stand out from other ghetto dwellers. For example, believers always dress well and keep their homes immaculately clean. Consequently in recent years a number of writers, including Lincoln, (1961), and Essien-Udom, (1962) have suggested that novitiates are attracted by the possibility of upward social and economic mobility. It seems very unlikely, however, that these same motives played any part in the initial attraction of the movement to the negro masses in Detroit in the early 1930s, primarily, of course, because the pattern of upward mobility would

still have been latent in the movement at the time. The economic mobility of the members has also resulted in an increased emphasis within the movement on economic matters, a concern which by all accounts did not interest Fard.

But if economic or social mobility was not the primary goal of the initial accepters of Fard's doctrine, what were the reasons for its comparatively large success (between 5,000--the official police estimate of the Black Muslim membership--and 8,000--the movement's claimed membership)--in 1934? Why were so many blacks willing to accept this millennial eschatology? Again, as with the Ngunzi movement of the same period in the Congo, its acceptance can best be explained by the model suggested in J. Davies's article 'Towards a Theory of Revolution' (1962). A seemingly stable period of degradation had been followed by a period of increased hope and rising expectations. But these expectations had not been fulfilled. The dissonance deriving from the relative deprivation experienced--and as I shall show it was a deprivation concerning the very basis of the individual's 'self'--resulted in many strange new organizations and cults being formed in an attempt to provide new panaceas and new, more meaningful world views for the black masses. That the Black Muslims survived, while others gradually died, is indicative more of Elijah Muhammad's tenacity and organizational ability than of any inherent quality of the doctrine itself. As suggested above, the emphasis within the

movement has changed, whilst keeping the same overall structure, as the social conditions and needs of the believers altered.

The abominations and loathful conditions of the four hundred years of slavery and degradation experienced by the blacks are too well known to need portraying here. Suffice to know that throughout this period each black had been effectively denied the psychological satisfaction of ever being able to consider himself a whole, complete, and total personality capable of mastering his own destiny. However, by the late 1920s conditions had altered sufficiently to give the black masses--not for the first time--hope for a better future. When these new and cognitively legitimated expectations were not fulfilled, a situation resulted which was conducive for the formation of millennial beliefs, as the unfulfilled hopes were concerned at their very core with the status, worth, and economic position (and consequently of anticipated patterns of behaviour) of those affected. On the other hand the situation was not totally conducive to other types of mass movement because of a lack of apparent opportunity and knowledge of how to attack the prevailing system by secular economic, social, or political means. The only significant non-religious black mass movement prior to 1930--Marcus Garvey's 'Back to Africa' campaign--had been largely escapist, and had in any case resulted in failure. The necessary experience of differentiated political structure and of the underlying theory did not exist on any popular level. (And as Franklin Frazier, (1957), has shown, the few blacks who

did have the necessary knowledge were, for a number of reasons all of which basically concerned the low status of the negro in America, alienated from the black masses.) Until very recently the blacks had relied on the religious morality of Christianity for change, a reliance that had always been unrewarding in practical effect.

The major unfulfilled expectation for the ghetto blacks in this period had been the failure of their life-style to change significantly after the move from rural to urban areas. The great exodus to the city occurred, principally, during the previous fifteen years. The young rural blacks had seen the hopes their freed slave fathers held after the civil war destroyed, and thought the answer to their condition lay in the apparently prosperous industrial cities. Beynon, in his study of the Black Muslims, (1938), (the fieldwork for which took place in 1934), claims that of the two hundred Muslim families interviewed all but five were recent migrants from the south; ('recent' apparently being within five years). (In terms of the theoretical approach here developed, it is significant that Beynon also writes that a majority of his interviewees had made a return trip to the south and therefore had become even more aware of the outright discrimination practised there against all blacks.)

The young blacks moved north full of hope to find this hope as unfulfilled as their fathers' before them. The dis-

crimination, if not, in general, as blatant, had the same effect. Even in times of employment their relative economic condition was no better than before. Apart from economic exploitation, they were forced to live in greatly overcrowded ghetto areas where the conditions frequently resulted in a marked increase in physical suffering. (Beynon,1938. p899) For this reason perhaps, one of Fard's earliest teachings suggested the disappearance of all sickness and pain if only the correct food was eaten.

In 1929 came the great crash and the longlasting economic depression of the thirties. The first to suffer were, of course, the unskilled black labourers who made up the majority of the ghetto labour force. In Lomax's terms,

> "the subtle discrimination of the North--the very thing that had caused (the blacks) to leave the south--(became) bold and overt". (1963. p47)

Beynon wrote

> "At the time of their first contact with the prophet, practically all of the members of the cult were recipients of public welfare, unemployed, and living in the most deteriorated areas of Negro settlement in Detroit" (1938. p905)

But the failure of the blacks' expectations to materialize in their migration north was only one of the causes, albeit the major one, of the acceptance of a millennial doctrine. Earlier the blacks' hopes of social justice following their fighting in the American forces during the Great War of 1914-

1918 had been unfulfilled. Instead of returning home to a heroes' welcome and a land 'fit for victorious soldiers', they returned to the "customary bigotry" (Lincoln, 1961. p56); the whites, at least in the south, seemed more concerned with continuing to 'keep them in their place'. In 1919 alone, seventy blacks were lynched, many still in uniform, and fourteen were publically burned, eleven of them alive. In the same year, during the 'Red Summer', there were twenty-five race riots across the country, protesting the lack of change in social conditions. (Lincoln, 1961. p56)

Furthermore the already noted failure of Marcus Garvey's movement itself added to the unfulfilled expectations in the late nineteen twenties and early thirties. Many blacks had placed their hopes in this movement once the urban situation became apparent. (Garvey claimed to have two million members in 1919.) (Lincoln, 1961. p58) With Garvey's failure to obtain ships on the scale promised, and his imprisonment and consequent deportation, their expectations and hopes were once more destroyed.

The popular heritage of the believers.

Thus in the Black Muslim movement there is a reversal of beliefs about the inferior position of the blacks. The discrepancy between the individual's psychological needs and social reality is overcome by the reversal of traditional beliefs, by

a doctrine which glorifies the black race, castigates the white one, and explains the present position of the blacks in terms of a divine plan. The teaching of the Muslims in one way, though, reflects social reality, or, at least, the black ghetto dwellers perception of it.

> "(I had been told) that white people were the devils and that I believed because of the way the white people act and the way they treat our people. Everything that (we were told) was the truth just by what I know."
> (quoted by Essien-Udom, 1962. p97)

It has already been noted that the Negro Christian Churches were the only significant black mass institutions in the period, particularly since the failure of Garvey's movement. Consequently it is not surprising that the Muslim's new world view was a religious one. What needs explaining, however, is why the Black Muslims rejected Chritianity and replaced it with a variety of Islamic religion, and why this replacement was acceptable to a large number of blacks. A number of factors were involved. Firstly Chritianity had shown itself to be incapable of effectively enforcing its code of morality, and furthermore applied no sanctions to those guilty of breaking it. With the failure of the newly aroused expectations to occur, some of the black people must have started to question Christianity's worth. Increasingly, although still only to a small extent, it was viewed as a white man's religion with a main function of keeping the black people in poverty by the promise

of a reward in the ephemeral heaven. Concomitant with this, and perhaps more important, was the increased interest shown in the history and origins of the black people. This trend had been started by a few black intellectuals, (noticeably W.E.B. DuBois), at the end of the nineteenth century, but had been popularized by the movements led by Garvey and Noble Drew Ali. These two movements had created a concern with the past that resulted in the ghetto areas being replete with questions about the black man's origin. These movements were of major importance in creating a popular knowledge conducive to acceptance of the Muslim ideology, and almost certainly in the formation of their doctrine itself.

Marcus Garvey's movement, the Universal Negro Improvement Association, (U.N.I.A.), was established in 1917, with the object of redeeming Africa for "Africans abroad and at home". (Essien-Udom, 1962. p50) Garvey, a Jamaican, had travelled in Europe, South America, and all over the United States, and had come to the conclusion that the only solution for the black people's condition was self government and isolation in Africa. He sought to organize American blacks into a vanguard with which to liberate Africa from colonialism, and hoped eventually to lead all American blacks back to Africa, and there form a pan-Negro African state and government. Garvey advocated racial purity, integrity, and hegemony in direct contrast to the more 'established' black leaders who, representing the small black

middle class, desired integration. At its height Garvey's movement was reputed to have over two million members, and published a newspaper, 'The Negro World', with a claimed circulation of 200,000 in English, French, and Spanish editions. (Lincoln, 1961. p58) The movement came to a close when Garvey failed to obtain the required number of ships that he had promised would return the American blacks to Africa. Altogether only four passages to Liberia were organized before Garvey was imprisoned and deported back to the West Indies. His wife's later contention that

> "...after Marcus Garvey had returned millions to Africa spiritually, he had done his work. It was finished in the real sense...People misunderstood him...There was no back-to-Africa movement except in a spiritual sense", (quoted by Essien-Udom,1962.p73)

seems to be a post-hoc rationalization on her part. Nevertheless, apart from being "the first and, as yet, the only real mass movement of Negroes", (Gunnar Myrdal, 1944.p746), the U.N.I.A. was significant primarily because it did achieve, to a large measure, this spiritual return to Africa. No longer were the African people thought of as purely savages, as generally suggested by the white controlled mass media; instead they were recognised as being of the same stock as the American black.

Noble Drew Ali, previously known as Timothy Drew, was the prophet of the Moorish Science Temple of America, a basically Islamic cult founded around 1913. The similarity of parts of his doctrine and ritual to that expounded by Fard makes it ex-

ceedingly likely that knowledge of this earlier movement encouraged the acceptance of Fard's teachings. Considering that one of Drew's earliest Temples was established in Detroit, and that his most successful Temple was in Chicago, where Elijah Muhammad moved the Black Muslim organization to in 1934, this is even more likely to be the case. (Of course, to some extent, the two doctrines may have been confounded by their joint reliance on Islam.) Drew's teachings were based on the 'Holy Koran',

> "a slim pamphlet consisting of a curious mixture of the Mohammedan holy book of the same name, the Christian Bible, the words of Marcus Garvey, and anecdotes of the life of Jesus...bound together with (Drew's) own pronouncement and interpretations." (Bontemps and Conroy, 1945. p175 quoted by Essien-Udom, 1962. p384)

Noble Drew Ali was "obsessed with the idea that salvation for the Negro people lay in the discovery by them of their national origin". (Faucet, 1957. p498) This formed the basis of his doctrine, and, principally, he taught his followers to consider themselves as Asiatics. (The Black Muslims also encourage the use of this term). Thus, despite eulogising Garvey at all his meetings, (Bontemps and Conroy, 1945. p175), the Moorish Science Temple followers were still unwilling to recognise themselves as being originally purely African.

It is in the ritual to be observed by believers that the Black Muslims most approach the Moorish Scientists. For example, sports, movies, and dancing were forbidden, as were

cosmetics, all intoxicants, and tobacco. Similarly wives must obey their husbands, and husbands provide for and support their families. The religious services are not held in churches, but in Temples, and always started and finished punctually. (Fauset, 1957) In all these respects the Black Muslims morality is similar to Drew's; and these shared traits, although clearly related to Islamic law, suggest that the Muslim doctrine was based on the heritage of the earlier movement.

Apart from ritual observances, the belief system of the Black Muslims relies heavily on the hagiography of Christianity, i.e. on the cultural tradition of religion, thus following the pattern of the other movements already analysed. Jesus himself is not rejected totally; he is believed to be a prophet, but the whites, in a futile attempt to hide the black man's destiny, and thereby continue to rule, have twisted his teachings and made him appear to claim to be the Son of God. Similarly the Bible is held to contain much truth, albeit hidden under the lies and perversions added by the whites. Biblical prophets accepted by the Muslims, for example, include Noah, Abraham, Job, David, Solomon, and Jonah. (Elijah Muhammad, 1965. p69) And it has already been seen how the predicted coming of the millennium relies heavily on the prophecies in the Book of Daniel and on the Revelations of St. John. Without a specific content analysis, it is also evident that Elijah Muhammad's book "Message to the Blackman in America", (1965), contains

many more quotes and references from the Bible than from the Holy Qur-an. (In the first chapter, for example, there are twenty-five direct references to the Old and New Testaments, and only ten to the Qur-an).

It is now impossible to discover whether these beliefs were present in Fard's initial prophecy, or whether they were added by his followers in the course of time. However considering the subtlety of Fard's proselytizing, it seems likely that he included them himself so as to make his doctrine more easily acceptable to the black masses of the ghetto. (With the lack of knowledge of his origins it is impossible to say whether their inclusion by Fard was a conscious attempt to make his message consonant and, therefore more meaningful for his potential followers, or not). In either case it is suggested that without this quasi Christian content, the movement would not have been as attractive to the ghetto dwellers, with their religious heritage of Christianity, as it proved to be.

Summary.

The Black Muslim movement, like all the others analysed in this thesis, arose during a situation in which a mass of people were experiencing relative deprivation of a total nature. The relative deprivation in the case of the Black Muslims, like that of the Kimbangu-Matswa movement, resulted from increased expectations following the slight alleviation of extremely harsh

conditions, (at least in comparison to a more favoured group). The black population of the United States had for centuries endured hardship and discrimination. In the 1920s the young blacks thought the answer to their problems lay in the expanding northern urban areas. Here discrimination was rumoured to be less extreme, and, furthermore, the northern cities were supposed to provide economic security. However the migrant blacks found this to be only partially true. They were still discriminated against, both economically and socially, and were forced to live in overcrowded ghetto areas. However the slight alleviation there was had the effect of raising their expectations further, and made them desire further change. When this was not forthcoming, extensive relative deprivation was experienced. This reached its zenith with the economic collapse of 1929. Needless to say, the blacks were the first to be laid off, and the ones to suffer the most. Instead of the cities being the utopia they imagined, the harsh realities of being black pertained here very much as they did in the south. When the relative deprivation that the black ghetto population were experiencing led them to reject their old world view, they embraced a millennial one in its place. Considering that religious organizations were the only ones with which the black people had had any experience, this is not surprising. The millennial ideology enabled them to interpret their present, as well as giving them hope for the future.

The influence of the cultural traditions of the black people can be clearly recognised in the movement, as can that of the social conditions. Of particular importance was the concern the blacks were manifesting about their racial origins. Gradually they were recognising that their original heritage lay in Africa, and that that continent was not inhabited by primitive savages as the white mass media implied. It was this concern that had legitimated two earlier movements that influenced the Muslims strongly. Marcus Garvey's "Back to Africa" campaign had aroused very extensive interest amongst the blacks throughout America. Indeed its failure served to increase the deprivation the blacks were experiencing, and also, at least immediately after its failure, led them to regard political movements as inadequate solutions to their problems. The second movement, the Moorish Science Temple movement led by Noble Drew Ali, is important mainly because its specific doctrine was so similar to that expounded by the Muslims.

Although they tend to deny it, the eschatological belief of the Muslims draws almost exclusively from Christianity, which was, and perhaps still is, the single most influential component of the blacks' cultural heritage. In fact the Black Muslims recognise that parts of the Bible are true, although they claim that it has been corrupted by the whites in an attempt to keep the blacks enslaved. The social situation influenced their doctrine most noticeably in the reversal of roles they proclaim.

No longer is the black to be thought of as inherently inferior. He is, in fact, superior in all matters, although Allah as part of His divine plan has granted the whites six thousand years to dominate.

Finally this movement is interesting because it has evolved with changing circumstances into a political and economic organization. Rather than indirectly leading the way towards the formation of a more realistically orientated movement, as for example the Kimbangu-Matswa movement did, the Black Muslims have become institutionalized and have developed their doctrine so as to include political and economic components. However its religious, and more specifically millennial, origins have not totally disappeared, as is illustrated by the fact that it still classifies itself as a religion.

Chapter 9

Conclusion

The purpose of this thesis was to propose and test a theoretical model that would be helpful for understanding the causes and development of millennial movements. The model devised consisted basically of two parts: the first dealing with the social conditions under which a millennial movement is likely to arise, and the second with the reasons why the specific characteristics of each movement's ritual and doctrine are as they are.

It was suggested that millennial movements only occur when a mass of people experience extensive and total relative deprivation. That is, in general, a relative deprivation that affects the legitimations on which they base their perceptions of the value of their life-style and of their own social worth. All six movements examined supported this hypothesis, for in all six the life-styles of the believers had recently been subject to great change, and/or the legitimations and assumptions on which their life-styles were implicitly based had been open to severe questioning and doubt.

Following this it was suggested that the doctrines, rituals, and eschatological beliefs of each movement were a consequence of the interaction between three conceptually distinct factors:

1) the cultural, and particularly the millennial, heritage of the people affected by the relative deprivation;

2) the social situation giving rise to the relative deprivation;

and 3) the individual hopes and desires of each movement's prophet, (and in some cases those of his closest disciples).

Again this hypothesis was supported in all six of the movements examined. In each one culturally significant components were incorporated into the prophet's formulation of the doctrine, as were many elements pertaining to the social situation his followers were experiencing.

The remainder of the conclusion will summarize the findings of this thesis and will illustrate how the various facets of the theoretical model developed in chapter 2 apply to the six movements analysed. Because this model applies to these six so well it is hoped that it will apply to virtually all millennial movements.

Summary of the findings of this thesis.

It was clear that none of the six millennial movements examined developed by chance; they were not the consequence of

primitive minds, nor for that matter of mentally deficient ones. Rather they were responses to situations that were not justified by the assumptions and expectations of the people experiencing them; responses which included a way of interpreting the existing situation in a manner which at least made it understandable. That is, millennial movements develop when the assumed natural and social orderings of the world no longer suffice, no longer account for 'reality'. In their place a new world view, consisting of new assumptions and presuppositions, is embraced which, as far as the people accepting it are concerned, does explain the situation, and thus does give (subjective) meaning to their existence.

It has been suggested in this thesis that a new world view will be needed when a people are experiencing relative deprivation of a total nature. That is, a relative deprivation that involves material possessions, behavioural patterns, status, and consequently, and most importantly, worth. In other words a deprivation at the core of the internalized and, thus, subjectively legitimated expectations held by the people. In all six movements it is clear that the people affected were alienated from their actual life-style. They could not value this life-style as it was not the one that their experience and/or expectations led them to desire.

Consequently great relative deprivation was experienced in each case. In the Ghost Dance the Indian way of life was no

longer possible in its full sense, particularly after the disappearance of the buffalo, (the factor which precipitated the outbreak of millennial hope), but also because the whites had colonized their tribal lands and had forced white customs and laws upon them. In the Kimbangu-Matswa Ngunzi movement, the natives given hope of greater freedom, raised their expectations and hopes only to find the newly desired life-style not available to them. However because of the rise of expectations the old life-style was no longer satisfactory, (if it ever had been). The Crusade of the Shepherds resulted from the physical migration from rural to urban areas of such large numbers of people that the hoped for security of employment in the towns was not available. Consequently neither the peasant way of life nor that of the more prosperous urban inhabitants was possible. The Lazzaretti movement arose after the introduction of economic liberalism in Italy. No longer was the desired and legitimated traditional peasant life-style possible. The Black Muslim movement was a consequence of a total dissatisfaction with the present life-style by a group which had recently raised its hopes for the future after a long period in which they had been discriminated against and rejected by the dominant white society. And finally the Irvingite movement resulted from middle class dissatisfaction with the changes occuring in English (and European) society. In the early nineteenth century the old assumptions legitimating the middle class

life-style could no longer be taken for granted. Doubt was common everywhere, and resulted in the questioning of the worth of the beliefs and life-style of the people affected.

Relative deprivation is, by definition, dependent on awareness of alternative situations. Aberle suggested three reference situations in which relative deprivation can be experienced.

(1) the past situation

(2) a perceived future situation

(3) someone else's present situation

It would seem from the six movements analysed in this thesis that situation (2) is generally combined with situation (3). That is, hope for the future is based on somebody else's present. In the Ghost Dance, Lazzaretti's, and the Irvingite movements reference situation (1) was the primary one. The traditional patterns of the past were being eroded and the legitimated life-style disappearing. In the Kimbangu-Matswa Ngunzi and the Black Muslim movements situations (2) and (3) were combined in a manner similar to that suggested by Davies. (1962) Expectations that the imminent future would result in a life-style similar to that of the dominant group were shown unfounded, leaving in both cases great dissatisfaction, and an even greater rejection of the way of life forced upon them. Finally the Crusade of the Shepherds was a consequence of both situation (1) and a combination of situations (2) and (3). The tradi-

tional peasant, feudal way of life, with its close-knit network of relationships, was not possible in the towns; but the new expectations created in the urban milieu by knowledge of the life-style of the skilled craftsmen and entrepreneurs were not able to be fulfilled either. Thus the traditional ways were gone but the new patterns were not possible.

In five of the examples analysed, the millennial movement developed immediately after a material adversity. In the Ghost Dance there was within a very few years the total loss of the buffalo; the Crusade of the Shepherds started after a severe famine; the Lazzaretti movement occurred during an agricultural depression; and both the Black Muslims and Ngunzism developed as millennial movements in the early 1930s, partly as a consequence of the world-wide economic depression. Only the Irvingite movement was not preceeded by an extensive material deprivation. Nevertheless even here it seemsprobable that the process of industrialization produced great wealth that some of the established middle class were unable to share, and that this was a factor in the movement's popularity. But despite their apparent dependence on material contingencies, millennial movements are heavily invested with idealistic elements. This is a consequence of a number of factors of which two are paramount.

Firstly, if relative deprivation is to be experienced, the reality of the situation, as perceived by those affected

by the deprivation, must be discrepant from the patterns they consider to be legitimate, i.e. from the ideals they hold. These ideals are in turn legitimated by their position within the idealist content of the culture or sub-culture, which in general serves to reify traditional patterns. Thus if it is correct to infer that millennial movements only arise in cases of extreme and total relative deprivation, the formation of millennial movements will be, at least indirectly, dependent on the idealistic legitimations of the society.

Secondly, because the millennium itself is always to be instigated by divine power, the rationale for accepting a belief in an imminent millennium must always be idealistic; it must always be based on the cultural heritage of belief within the society. In other words, although the social situation creates a need for one form or other of "competential alternative", the acceptance of a millennial belief as that alternative is a consequence of its legitimation by idealistic components of the society's culture. In all six cases the belief was legitimated thus: in the Ghost Dance and Ngunzi movement by the contents of what were considered sacred visions; in the Crusade of the Shepherds and the Lazzaretti movement by the European heritage of millennial idealism; and in the Black Muslims and the Irvingite movement by an interpretation of sacred texts.

In all the movements examined the relative deprivation

affected a group or class of people, not just a few individuals. This is in part a consequence of the macro or total nature of the deprivation. Because it concerns the whole life-style, and because, in general, life-styles are based on traditional shared assumptions, the relative deprivation will be experienced on a mass level. Although it may be possible for an occasional individual to create a life-style totally distinct from those of other people, this is by no means usual. In general life-styles, although not completely similar, are justified by the commonly held presuppositions and legitimations of the people of a particular area and social setting. Thus when deprivation occurs which affects a particular life-style, it will in all probability affect a large number of people. Consequently the dissatisfaction caused is likely to find expression in the development of a mass social movement.

A millennial movement is only one of a number of social movements that may develop in such situations. It was stressed in chapter 2 that millennialism is only one of the functional or "competential" alternatives. Other movements, particularly of a secular, political kind, may also arise. However two factors act against this. Firstly, if a political alternative was feasible, it seems likely that political action would have been engaged in before the relative deprivation became total; that is, before it affected the whole life-style and worth of the people experiencing it. Secondly, when relative deprivation

has resulted in a total questioning of worth, political solutions may not seem adequate. To some extent only the omnipotent God will be able to show to the world that there is indeed worth and value in the affected life-style.

Furthermore, as has been repeatedly stressed, if a millennial alternative is to be accepted, there must be a millennial tradition within the culture. The people must have a millennial heritage and, thus, a millennial consciousness. Where there is no such heritage and no such consciousness no millennial movement can develop. It was clear that in all the six movements analysed millennialism was a part of the traditional heritage of the people. The Crusade of the Shepherds, Laazretti's and Irving's movements were all Christian, as was the Ngunzi movement. This latter also developed in an area where the aboriginal religion had both messianic and millennial elements. The Black Muslim movement, despite its denials to the contrary, was also based on the heritage of Christianity. The Ghost Dance, on the other hand, owed only a little to Christianity. Rather, it was ultimately legitimated by native Indian religion with its concept of the dead living in a land of plenty and behaving just as they had on earth. Christianity, in a manner of speaking, only made the millennial seeds blossom forth.

Three of the movements illustrate how millennial movements sometimes form the basis of a solidarity that leads to the formation of more effective movements. (Effective, that

is, in changing the social situation of the followers.) In south-east Tuscany, a totally non-industrial area, the Lazzaretti movement in part laid the foundation on which the Communist Party was to build. As late as 1948 there are recorded cases of people uniting Lazzaretti's doctrine with that of the communists. (See Hobsbawm, 1959. p71) The Ngunzi movement in the Congo was a direct forerunner of the popular support needed by the urban political leaders to rid the country of the Europeans, and create an independent sovereign state. And the Black Muslims, of course, have themselves developed into a political and economic organization, while still retaining their millennial beliefs.

The role the prophet played in each of the movements varied; some were purely symbolic leaders, (eg. Wovoka, and, to some extent, Kimbangu); others were of far greater significance, (eg. Fard, and after his disappearance, Elijah Muhammad, and Lazzaretti). Jacob's and Irving's positions appear to have been in between these two. They both made many important innovations, but also, to some extent, acted as "symbolic focuses of attention".

However in all six cases the prophets' styles of life and the basis of their prophecies' legitimation were as expected. Wovoka and Kimbangu were both recognized as charismatic because of the dreams and visions they experienced, for in both their cultures dreams and visions were the standardly

accepted method of communication between God and man. Neither prophet was a religious specialist before his visionary experience, yet both were recognized as such immediately afterwards. What occasioned this swift recognition was, of course, the social situation the followers were experiencing. In the cases of Jacob and Lazzaretti, each was recognized as a religious expert before the movement arose, although each remained autonomous from the central Church. Jacob, as one of the wandering preachers of the time, was differentiated from his followers by his religious knowledge, his religious background and, of course, his literacy. Lazzaretti similarly built up his religious recognition by leading an austere and ascetic life and by studying religion within the pseudo-monastery he formed. Irving was a religious specialist by the nature of his training. To a large extent his charisma was a consequence of his learning and eloquence. Fard based his charisma on a greater learning and knowledge, both of religious matters and of the social and cultural conditions in Africa, the negroes' homeland. Thus both Irving and Fard were revered in their own way as specialists. Both also depended far more than any of the other four prophets on a rational, scientific analysis. Irving based his prophecy on an analysis of the Bible, (although it must be noted he rejected science as such), while Fard used the folk-lore 'science' of the period as well as analyses of the Bible and Koran.

Finally each of the six movements illustrates well how millennial doctrines, rituals, and eschatologies are formulated as a consequence of the dialectical interaction between the people's culture, the existing social situation, and the personality of the prophet. These three interact with one another until a prophecy consonant with each develops. Indeed far from being the case that the believers, in a mad rush of exaltation, follow whatever message a charismatic prophet choses to proselytize, as would sometimes appear to be suggested, the initial prophecy proselytized by the prophet seems to be the least significant of all. Of far greater importance in the formulation of the accepted message are the cultural traditions and the social situation of the people involved.

In the Ghost Dance, Wovoka's message was clearly based on the cultural traditions of prophecy and religion in Indian society, and also equally clearly contained much that referred to the social situation that the Plains Indians found themselves in. The belief of the Ghost Dance was that the future would be a return to the past, almost a direct opposite of the present, and that the change would be initiated by practices which were similar to ones central to Indian culture. The specifics of the doctrine were a consequence of Wovoka's father having been a leading disciple of the 1870 Ghost Dance.

Similarly Kimbangu-Matswa Ngunzism sought to bring about the obverse of the present. However because Christianity had

a more solid basis in Congo society than in Indian society, (having been known to the Congolese since the fifteenth century), the means to be used to hasten the change were a fusion of Christian and traditional methods. That traditional ones were used at all suggests that the cultural heritage is of greater importance to the movement's development than the prophet, for Kimbangu's original prophecy had been almost totally Christian. Matswa's influence on the movement was less than Kimbangu's,and in many respects his main importance to it was as a "precipitating factor". The manner in which this movement evolved with time in the hands of the many minor prophets is undoubtedly most significant to this study as it shows very clearly how the 'shell' of a prophecy is altered in the hands of a people so as to fit their particular needs and heritage.

The lack of information on the Crusade of the Shepherds makes it difficult to illustrate clearly how, (or even whether), the original prophecy was altered as the movement progressed. Nevertheless it is possible to show that it relied heavily on the millennial heritage of medieval northern Europe, and that the social situation of the people affected its doctrine. In particular Joachite prophecy and the belief in the Emperor of the Last Days were important, as were the movement's symbolic use of shepherd's clothing, and its emphasis on action within urban areas. The Lazzaretti movement similarly relied on the European tradition of millennial eschatology; and again the

movement's promise for the future included the correction of the wrongs in Tuscanian (and Italian) society. This movement also illustrated well how the prophet's leading disciples can influence his prophecy.

The movement led by Edward Irving again depended on the millennial heritage of Western Europe. It was caused by a social situation in which doubt proliferated, and was, in effect, a dogmatic rejection of this doubt. As already mentioned, it depended for its legitimacy on a logical and rational analysis of supposedly historical truths. As much as any other movement, it illustrates that the prophet is not necessarily considered sacred, nor his words totally inspired. Irving after originally moulding the movement was rejected by the movement's other leaders, and in fact eventually came to be rejected as the founder of the Catholic Apostolic Church by the mass of its members. Finally the Black Muslim movement relied heavily for its eschatology on Christianity and the Bible, as well as on the cultural themes running through the negro areas at the time, (specifically a concern with the black man's past). It too believed that the specific conditions of the present were soon to be altered. However the most noticeable effect of the changing social situation on Black Muslim beliefs has been the movement's change since 1934 from a purely religious movement to one largely dominated by economic and political considerations. It is not by coincidence that this has occurred concurrently with the same

process in third world countries. The same social and cultural forces have been acting on both.

In conclusion it is felt that the movements that have been analysed in this thesis do support the model of the formation of millennial movements outlined in chapter 2. Despite their being in many respects highly selected, their support for this model suggests it will fit other millennial movements. That is, it is felt that nearly all millennial movements have, in all probability, occurred during situations in which a group of people were experiencing relative deprivation of a total nature; of a sort that affected their whole life-style and consequently led to a questioning of its worth. Similarly it is thought that their doctrines, rituals, and eschatological beliefs will, as in the above movements, be formed from the continuing interaction of (i) the cultural, and particularly millennial, heritage of the people affected; (ii) the social situation giving rise to the relative deprivation; and (iii) the individual hopes and desires of the prophet.

Bibliography

Aberle, David. 1970: "A note on Relative Deprivation Theory as applied to Millenarian and other Cult Movements", in Thrupp, Millennial Dreams in Action, 1970.

Andersson, Efraim, 1958: Messianic Popular Movements in the Lower Congo. Uppsala: Studia Ethnographic Upsaliensia.

Balandier, Georges. 1970: The Sociology of Black Africa. Translated by Douglas Jarman. New York: Praeger. (Originally appeared as Sociologie Actuelle de l'Afrique Noire. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France).

Barber, Bernard. 1941: "Acculturation and Messianic Movements". American Sociological Review, Volume 6, p663-669.

Bell, Colin. 1968: "Mobility and the Middle Class Extended Family." Sociology, Volume 2, p173-184.

Belshaw, Cyril S. 1950: "The Significance of Modern Cults in Melanesian Development". Australian Outlook ,Volume IV, p 116-125.

Bendix, Reinhard, 1969: Max Weber: An Intellectual Portrait. London: Methuen.

Berger, Peter L. and Tomas Luckman, 1967: The Social Construction of Reality. Garden City, New York: Doubleday Anchor.

Berger, Peter L. 1969: The Sacred Canopy. Garden City, New York: Doubleday Anchor.

Beynon, Erdmann, 1938: "The Voodoo Cult among Negro Migrants in Detroit". American Journal of Sociology,Volume 43, p894-907.

Bontemps, Arna and Jack Conroy, 1945: They Seek a City. Garden City, New York: Doubleday.

Burridge, Kenelm, 1960: Mambu: A Melanesian Millennium. London: Methuen.

1969: New Heaven, New Earth. New York: Schocken.

Chinoy, Eli. 1961: Society: An Introduction to Sociology. New York: Random House.

Clark, S.D. 1948: Church and Sect in Canada. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Cohn, Norman, 1970A: The Pursuit of the Millennium. London: Paladin.

1970B: "Medieval Millenarism: Its Bearing on the Comparative Study of Millenarian Movements", in Thrupp, Millennial Dreams in Action, 1970.

Coser, Lewis, 1956: The Functions of Social Conflict. Glencoe, Illinois: Free Press.

Davidson, Basil, 1955: The African Awakening. London:Cape

Davies, James C., 1962: "Towards a Theory of Revolution". American Sociological Review, Volume 27, p5-19.

DuBois, Cora, 1939: "The 1870 Ghost Dance". University of California Anthropological Records, Volume 3, No. 1.

Drummond, A.L. 1934: "Edward Irving". The Times, London. 7th December No. 46,931 p 15-16.

1937: Edward Irving and His Circle. London: James Clark.

Eliade, Mircea, 1970: "'Cargo Cults' and Cosmic Regeneration". in Thrupp, Millennial Dreams in Action, 1970.

Elkin, A.P. 1953: Social Anthropology in Melanesia. London: Oxford University Press.

Emmet, Dorothy, 1956: "Prophets and their Societies". The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain and Ireland. Volume 86, p13-23.

Essien-Udom, E.U., 1962: Black Nationalism. Chicago: Laurel.

Fauset, Arthur H., 1957: "Moorish Science Temple of America". in J. Milton Yinger: Religion, Society and the Individual. New York: Macmillan, 1957.

Festinger, Leon, Henry Riecken and Stanley Schachter, 1956: When Prophecy Fails. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Festinger, Leon, 1957: A Theory of Cognitive Dissonance. Evanston, Illinois: Row,Peterson.

Frank, Jerome D. 1963: Persuasion and Healing. New York: Schocken.

Frazier, E. Franklin, 1957: Black Bourgeoisie. Glencoe, Illinois: Free Press.

Friedland, William H., 1964: "For a Sociological Concept of Charisma". Social Forces, Volume 43, p18-26.

Gluckman, Max, 1954: "The Magic of Despair". The Listener Volume LI No. 1313 (29/4/54) p724-725, 737.
1961: "Ethnographic Data in British Social Anthropology". Sociological Review (New Series) Volume 9, p5-18.

Heer, Frederich, 1962: The Medieval World. Translated by Janet Sondheimer, New York: Mentor.

Hobsbawm, E.J., 1959: Primitive Rebels. New York: Norton.

Houghton, Walter E., 1957: The Victorian Frame of Mind. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Jarvie, I.C., 1963: "Theories of Cargo Cults: A Critical Analysis". Oceania Volume 34, p1-31 and 108-136.

Lanternari, Vittorio, 1963: The Religions of the Oppressed. New York: Mentor.

Lawrence, Peter, 1964: Road Belong Cargo. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Lesser, Alexander, 1933: "Cultural Significance of the Ghost Dance". American Anthropologist, Volume 35, p108-115.

Lincoln, C. Eric, 1961: The Black Muslims of America. Boston: Beacon Press.

Linton, Ralph, 1943: "Nativistic Movements". American Anthropologist, Volume 45, p230-240

Lofland, John, 1966: Doomsday Cult. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall.

Lomax, Louis E., 1963: When the Word is Given. Cleveland: World Publishing Co.

Lowie, Robert, 1963: Indians of the Plains. New York: Natural History Press.

Mooney, James, 1965: The Ghost Dance Religion. Edited and abridged by A.F.C. Wallace, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Muhammad, Elijah, 1965: Message to the Blackman in America. Chicago: Muhammad Mosque of Islam No. 2.

Muhlmann, W.E., et. al., 1961: Chiliasmus und Nativismus: Studien zur Psychologie, Soziologie und historischen Kasuistic der Unsturzbewegurgen. Berlin.

Myrdal, Gunnar, 1944: An American Dilemma: The Negro Problem and Modern Democracy. 2 Volumes. New York: Harper.

Nadel, S.F., 1954: Nupe Religion. London: Routledge and Paul.

Popper, Karl, 1963: Conjectures and Refutations London: Routledge and Paul.

Roszak, Theodore, 1969: The Making of a Counter Culture. Garden City, New York: Doubleday.

Seguy, Jean, 1958: "David Lazzaretti et la secte apocalyptique des Giurisdavidici". Archives de Sociologie des Religions Volume 5, p71-87.

Selsam, Howard and Henry Martel, 1963: Reader in Marxist Philosophy. New York: International Publishers.

Shaw, P.E. 1946: The Catholic Apostolic Church. New York: King's Crown Press.

Simmel, Georg, 1955: Conflict and The Web of Group-Affiliations. Translated by Kurt H. Wolff and Reinhard Bendix. New York: The Free Press.

Spier, Leslie, 1935: "The Prophet Dance of the Northwest and Its Derivatives: The Source of the Ghost Dance". American Anthropological Association General Series in Anthropology No. 1.

Talmon, Yonina Talmon, 1962: "Pursuit of the Millennium: the Relation between Religious and Social Change". Archives Europeennes de Sociologie Volume 3, p125-148.
1966: "Millenarian Movements". Archives Europeennes de Sociologie Volume 7, p159-200.

Taylor, Gordon R., 1958: The Angel Makers: A Study in the Psychological Origins of Historical Change, 1750-1850. London: Heinemann.

Thrupp, Sylvia, 1970: Millennial Dreams in Action. New York: Schocken.

Toch, Hans, 1965: The Social Psychology of Social Movements. Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill.

Wallace, Anthony F.C., 1956: "Revitalization Movements". American Anthropologist, Volume 58, p264-281.
1966: Religion: An Anthropological View. New York: Random House.

Wallis, W.D., 1943: Messiahs: Their Role in Civilization. Washington: American Council of Public Affairs.

Weber, Max, 1947: The Theory of Social and Economic Organization. Translated by A. Henderson and T. Parsons, New York: Oxford University Press.
1963: The Sociology of Religion. Translated by Ephraim Fischoff, Boston: Beacon Press.

Wilson, Bryan, 1961: Sects and Society. London: Heinemann.
1963: "Millennialism in Comparative Perspective". Comparative Studies in Society and History, Volume 6,p93-114.

Worsley, Peter, 1968: The Trumpet Shall Sound. New York: Schocken.