

## THE EFFECTS OF AGE DIFFERENCES ON JOB SATISFACTION

THE EFFECTS OF AGE DIFFERENCES ON JOB SATISFACTION:  
A QUALITATIVE EXPLANATION OF ATTITUDE DIFFERENCES BETWEEN  
YOUNGER AND OLD WORKERS IN THE SUPERMARKET INDUSTRY.

Word Count: 14,270

Barry Lamont (9406475)

McMaster University, Hamilton ON

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements of  
Work and Society - THESIS

Thesis Advisor: Dr. Don Wells

Thesis Committee Members Dr. Wayne Lewchuk & Dr. David Goutor

October 23, 2007

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This project would not have been possible without the support of many people. Many thanks to my adviser, Dr. Don Wells, who read my numerous revisions and helped, make some sense of the confusion. Also thanks to my committee member Dr. Wayne Lewchuk who offered guidance and support. Thanks to the Labour Studies, McMaster University for providing me with the financial means to complete this project. Lastly, I would also like to thank my family for the support they provided me through my entire life and in particular, I must acknowledge my girlfriend and best friend, Jennifer Irwin, without whose love, encouragement and editing assistance, I would not have finished this thesis.

## TABLE OF CONTEXT

LIST OF TABLES .....	iv
ABSTRACT .....	1
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION .....	3
Intrinsic and extrinsic rewards .....	4
Job satisfaction .....	5
Younger and older workers .....	7
Age differences in the supermarket .....	9
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW .....	10
Age differences and intrinsic/extrinsic rewards .....	11
Background on the Upper James Barn .....	13
CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY .....	21
Research variables .....	24
Research questions .....	26
CHAPTER 4: RESULTS FOR OLDER WORKERS .....	29
What did older worker expect to receive? .....	29
What did older workers actually receive? .....	31
CHAPTER 5: RESULTS FOR YOUNGER WORKERS .....	38
What did younger worker expect to receive? .....	38
What did younger workers actually receive? .....	39
CHAPTER 6: DISCUSSION .....	44
Similarities .....	44
Differences .....	47
What can UFCW do? .....	50
CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSIONS .....	52
APPENDIX A: DEMOGRAPHIC SURVEY .....	56
APPENDIX B: JOB SATISFACTION QUESTIONNAIRE FORM .....	57
AUTHOR'S BIBLIOGRAPHY .....	58

**LIST OF TABLES**

Table 1: What did both age groups expect? .....	45
Table 2: What did workers satisfied with their jobs receive? .....	46
Table 3: What did workers dissatisfied with their jobs receive? .....	47

## **ABSTRACT**

The researcher used a case study of unionized supermarket workers to examine how older and younger workers under economic restructuring relate to intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. First, the researcher illustrated how both age groups might be motivated differently by intrinsic and extrinsic rewards and how this might lead to differences in their levels and sources of job satisfaction. Second, the researcher examined what intrinsic and extrinsic rewards both age groups expect to receive. Third, the researcher investigated what intrinsic and extrinsic rewards both age groups actually experienced. Fourth, the researcher evaluated the similarities and differences between these two age groups. In the last section, the researcher discussed the implications for the union and suggested possible solutions to increase job satisfaction for both age groups.

The results suggest economic restructuring has influenced how both age groups relate to intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. For younger workers, economic restructuring pressured unions to offer concessions to supermarket employers. These concessions limited the ability of younger workers to access hours, wage rates, and opportunities for promotion or advancement. The lack of access to these rewards created job dissatisfaction among younger workers. On the other hand, concessionary bargaining practices placed pressure on older workers to embrace the company's view that increased competition could prevent additional job loss. These older workers expressed dissatisfaction when increased competition failed to produce sufficient job security.

The researcher used Herzberg's (1959) two-factor theory to evaluate job satisfaction for both age groups. For older workers, salary and interpersonal relationships tend to contribute to job satisfaction, while the lack of supervision, benefits, conditions of work, and job security tend to contribute to job dissatisfaction. For younger workers, benefits,

interpersonal relationships, and job security tend to contribute to job satisfaction, while salary, supervision, and conditions of work contribute to job dissatisfaction.

The researcher concludes that Herzberg theory is not entirely applicable to the unionized supermarket industry. The researcher's findings failed to confirm Herzberg's conclusion that motivator and hygiene factors operate independently from each other. For example, older workers tend to associate job security with other extrinsic rewards such as benefits, supervision, and working conditions. However, the results tend to confirm Herzberg's conclusion that the absence of hygiene factors can create dissatisfaction among workers. Both age groups tend to report job dissatisfaction when they do not have access to hygiene (or extrinsic) factors. Moreover, both age groups reported a significant level of job dissatisfaction when they did not access extrinsic rewards they felt were important. In addition, the results tend to confirm Herzberg's conclusion that motivators are the primary source of satisfaction for a worker.

If unionized supermarket workers are to be motivated effectively, some factors such as salary and job security should receive greater attention from union representatives. The researcher recommends that United Food and Commercial Workers of Canada (UFCW) might consider the further development of its education strategy and greater use of committees for both age groups. In effect, UFCW could explain to its members how younger and older workers place different weights on intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. As a result, UFCW could reduce division of labour between both age groups.

## CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

Employers and unions in the supermarket industry are becoming concerned over job satisfaction in the workplace. For example, tightening labour markets, demographic changes, and high levels of industrial competition have influenced workers' job satisfaction. Low levels of worker satisfaction can have implications for employers and unions. Workers might express their dissatisfaction through various forms of direct action. This might include illegal strikes, sabotage, absenteeism, and other forms of workplace conflict. Such disruptions to production will undermine the quality of products and services the supermarket has to offer. As a result, supermarket employers will face difficulties in maintaining profits at their stores.

Kumar and Schenk (2006) suggest differences in gender, race, class, and age can all be potential sources for divisions of labour that need to be addressed by employers and unions. Such knowledge can help employers and unions design more effective compensation plans, company policies, and administrative practices. This may provide greater insight into sources of workers' dissatisfaction.

In this thesis, the researcher will examine how older and younger workers under economic restructuring relate to intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. First, the researcher will discuss the definitions used in the thesis. In addition, the researcher will illustrate how both age groups might be motivated differently by intrinsic and extrinsic rewards and how this might lead to differences in their levels and sources of job satisfaction. Second, the researcher will examine what intrinsic and extrinsic rewards both age groups expect to receive. Third, the researcher will investigate what intrinsic and extrinsic rewards both age groups actually experienced. Fourth, the researcher will evaluate the similarities and

differences between these two age groups. The last section will discuss the implications of the research findings for UFCW.

### *Intrinsic and extrinsic rewards*

Intrinsic rewards are the feelings of achievement, self-esteem, development of skills and talents experienced by the employee for the performance of work itself (Naresh, 1998). Intrinsic rewards might include job content factors such as autonomy, variety, task identity, feedback, and task significance (Schwind, Das, & Wagar, 2005). On the other hand, extrinsic rewards are external to the job. The scope of extrinsic rewards depends on job context factors such as pay, benefits, work conditions, and interpersonal relationships.

For this thesis, the researcher used Herzberg's definitions of intrinsic rewards and extrinsic rewards.<sup>1</sup> He argued intrinsic rewards for workers might include responsibility in the workplace and opportunities for promotion or advancement (Herzberg, 1959). Responsibility in the workplace suggests workers, supervisors, and union representatives need to perform their assigned duties or obligations, be accountable, reliable, and able to tell right from wrong. The possibilities for promotion or advancement suggest workers have the opportunity to apply their talents and abilities. In addition, these workers would have the opportunity to learn new skills and have access to company training.

Herzberg (1959) argued hygiene factors for workers include supervision, interpersonal relationships, working conditions, salary, fringe benefits, and job security. Supervision involves an employee's evaluation of their supervisor's leadership capabilities, technical knowledge, communication skills, ability to resolve issues, and flexibility in scheduling. Interpersonal relationships can be between a worker and his or her supervisor, subordinates, peers, or union representatives. Working conditions include

---

<sup>1</sup> See the literature review for further explanation of Herzberg's definitions of intrinsic and extrinsic rewards.

the physical conditions of work, the amount of work, health and safety, access to tools, work environment, and interactions with customers. Salary includes factors such as wage rates, wage increases, quantity of paid hours, and connection between pay and performance. Fringe benefits were included in our understanding of salary. The researcher only included benefits such as vacation pay, company discount, vision, and pension plans. Last, job security involves a worker's sense of having continuity or stability of employment resulting from the continued profitability of the company.<sup>2</sup>

Intrinsic and extrinsic factors have been a source of considerable debate. First, developing intrinsic rewards can be expensive for employers. Second, intrinsic rewards on their own are not enough to motivate workers to do their jobs. For example, workers require money for food, shelter, and clothing. Third, the distinction between intrinsic and extrinsic rewards is not always clear. Fourth, intrinsic motivation is difficult to develop and can be easily destroyed. Sixth, as Naresh (1998) suggests, if employees feel they receive too many extrinsic rewards they may reduce their productivity. Last, Evans and McKee (1970) state a worker's personality can influence his or her job satisfaction.

### ***Job Satisfaction***

Job satisfaction represents the level of divergence between what a worker expects to receive and what he or she actually experience in the workplace (McShane, 2004). In addition, job satisfaction is a collection of a worker's feelings in relation to the nature and conditions of work. Workers might be satisfied with some parts of their jobs while simultaneously dissatisfied with others (McShane, 2004). For example, a worker might not enjoy the working conditions even though he or she enjoys other aspects of the job.

---

<sup>2</sup> Herzberg's (1959) defines job security as the stability of the company in terms of profits. A company can be stable in terms of profits and yet provide low job security. In the unionized supermarket, older workers might consider skills, seniority, and knowledge of the collective agreement to play a role in their understanding of job security.

Job satisfaction is a good indicator for employers of how workers are interacting with organizational policies and procedures. For example, job satisfaction among younger workers can indicate broader problems in the workplace. Younger workers might encounter difficulties while they balance their work and education responsibilities. These workers might express job dissatisfaction with the lack of flexibility in scheduling. Other workers in the workplace might share the same concern. However, they may be unwilling to confront management about the problem. As a result, job satisfaction might provide management with greater insight into growing problems in the workplace.

Job satisfaction has been extensively researched and numerous theories of motivation exist. Content theories include Maslow's (1954) hierarchy of needs theory and Herzberg's (1959) two-factor theory. These theories tend to concentrate on what factors might motivate people. The researcher used Herzberg's (1959) two-factor theory to illustrate how intrinsic and extrinsic rewards might influence job satisfaction.

Herzberg's research examined the job attitudes of 200 American accountants and engineers. He asked these professionals to provide examples of positive and negative experiences at work and to explain the reasons why they might have these attitudes. From these interviews, he found motivator and hygiene factors operate independently from each other. Second, the absence of hygiene factors can create dissatisfaction among workers. Third, motivators are the primary source of satisfaction for an employee, while hygiene factors were a cause of job dissatisfaction (Herzberg, 1959). He concluded supervisors should focus on the continued maintenance of extrinsic rewards so that motivator factors can become more effective. Supervisors might achieve this through the redesign of jobs to reflect job enrichment (Herzberg, 1987).

### *Younger and older workers*

Research on age tends to focus on the norms, values, and social roles associated with a particular group (Novak, 1993). The study of age is frequently associated with the different phases of a person's life. Moreover, the design of various social practices and institutions reflects our understanding of age. For example, age can be a sign of tenure, right of passage, or legal status. This includes various citizen rights such as voting, military service, and jury duty.

The organization of work has an impact on our understanding of age. Changes in the organization of work and employment during the period from 1945 to the 1970s suggest workers placed greater focus on standardization, education, consumption, and the balance of work and leisure (Godard, 2000). For industrialized countries, workers could expect different stages of work. For example, the 'pre-work' phase expects a younger worker to attend school and work part time. The 'work' phase suggests individuals are providing for themselves or their families. The last phase, 'post work' suggests workers now are entitled to benefit from the fruits of their labour. This period is associated with retirement and the opportunity to enjoy leisure and other social relationships. However, the economic restructuring during the 1970s reshaped our understanding of periods of education, work, and leisure (M. Riley & J. Riley, 1994).

In Canada, the social and economic impact of the 1970s reshaped our traditional understanding of age in the workplace. During this period, globalization, liberalization, and feminization of labour markets disrupted the existing organization of work (Munck, 2002). Matilda Riley's age stratification theory illustrates how these changes influenced workers. She suggests workers failed to keep pace with these demographic changes (Riley in Novak, 1993). For example, workers are living longer, more women have

entered the workforce, and employers have moved to other countries to exploit cheaper forms of labour. As a result, a structural lag developed between different age groups.

M. Riley and J. Riley (1999) argue social institutions (e.g. employers and unions) have become resistant or slow to change. Social institutions continue to enforce the policies and procedures established by previous generations to regulate patterns of behaviour even though the behaviour of later generations has changed. For example, economic restructuring in Canada created sudden demographic changes. The policies and procedures of social institutions failed to reflect the sudden increase of women in the workforce. As a result, a 'mismatch' occurs between existing social structures and desired practices.

This structural lag has serious implications for younger workers while they shift from childhood to adulthood. Social institutions play an important role in socializing these individuals. These individuals often have values, norms, and social roles that are distinctively different from their parents' generation. This requires institutions to consider a range of social, economic, and political factors that might influence the socialization of younger individuals. Barriers and tensions to this socialization are frequently associated with youth rebellion. For example, a youth rebellion might lead to the refusal of younger workers to accept managerial authority.

Younger individuals are often interested in having their interests and concerns heard by authority figures. These authority figures may include parents, government leaders, and supervisors. Youth movements and unions that share common values, beliefs, and practices may provide a platform for younger workers. However, employers might use a younger worker's concerns to meet their own self-interests. In addition, the frustrations among younger employees may help to highlight the problems associated with their

parents' generation. For example, younger workers might be frustrated with the limited job opportunities in the labour market and lack of democracy in the workplace.

### *Age differences in the supermarket*

Stuart Tannock's examination of the American unionized supermarket industry provides us with insight into how age differences might influence intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. He argues a 'stopgap' culture characterizes this industry. Stopgap culture is the combination of local investment and peer group pressures (Tannock, 2001). Local investment suggests employers are interested in accessing youth labour markets since they provide a cheap supply of unskilled labour. For example, a parent's income serves to shelter these workers from additional living expenses (e.g. food, clothing, and shelter). Employers only have to invest a small percentage of labour costs in maintaining extrinsic rewards for these workers. In addition, intrinsic rewards tend to motivate these younger workers. When these workers finish their education, they tend to resign. As a result, employers are able to maintain low labour costs.

Tannock argues peer groups pressures can, "play a central role in the organization of young workers' consent and resistance in the grocery and fast-food workplaces" (2001, p. 118). For example, peer group pressure can appeal to a younger worker's anti-career perspective.<sup>3</sup> Older workers remind younger workers that grocery work is temporary, low paying, and unskilled work. These younger workers then place greater emphasis on their irregular hours, repetitiveness of work, and infrequent raises (Tannock, 2001). These younger workers feel their compensation does not reflect the work they do. On the other hand, Krahn and Tanner argue strong peer group relations can help moderate a younger worker's dissatisfaction with low wages and repetitive work (in Tannock, 2001).

---

<sup>3</sup> This anti-career perspective suggests these workers consider such employment as only one stage of their career.

## CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

The most influential research on job satisfaction in the workplace is Herzberg's (1959) two-factor theory.<sup>4</sup> He argues workers will look for sources of growth or attempt to avoid pain in the workplace. In his examination of what people want from their jobs, he found that people reported feeling happy when they discussed factors relating to their task, performance of their job, and possibilities for personal growth (Herzberg, 1959).<sup>5</sup> When the participants reported feelings of unhappiness, they discussed factors that surround the doing of the job (Herzberg, 1959). He suggests motivators (or intrinsic rewards) and hygiene (or extrinsic rewards) factors are variables that influence a person's job satisfaction.

Herzberg (1959) argues the absence of hygiene factors can create dissatisfaction among workers. Hygiene factors can include supervision, interpersonal relations, working conditions, salary, fringe benefits, and job security (Herzberg, 1959). When hygiene factors are adequate he did not find a significant change in a worker's job satisfaction. In this situation, increased hygiene factors only lead to marginal increases in job satisfaction. According to him, these workers have not achieved job satisfaction despite their positive attitudes. This suggests the best the employer can do is use hygiene factors to avoid further employee dissatisfaction.

---

<sup>4</sup> Herzberg's (1959) research provided new sights into workplace motivators. His research has not been without criticisms. For example, Hulin and Smith (1965) maintained Herzberg's two-factor theory was method bound. Herzberg's two-factor theory used the critical incident technique. This method encouraged participants to explain exceptional events from their own work experience. Smith, Kendall, and Hulin (1969) argued that Herzberg's two-factor theory failed to illustrate differences between satisfaction and dissatisfaction. They concluded many different variables were equally as likely to influence job satisfaction. Wernimont (1966) made the case that job satisfaction can result from high satisfaction with intrinsic factors, and low satisfaction can result from low satisfaction with intrinsic factors. This suggests changes in extrinsic factors can influence job satisfaction less readily than changes in intrinsic factors.

<sup>5</sup> Herzberg (1959) refers to personal growth as an opportunity for a worker to use his or her skills and talents in the workplace.

Herzberg (1959) argues motivators were the primary source of satisfaction for an employee, while hygiene factors were a cause of job dissatisfaction. Examples of intrinsic rewards suggested by him were responsibility and opportunities for promotion or advancement in the company (Herzberg, 1987). He argues a worker will attempt to satisfy his or her need for self-actualization (Herzberg, 1959). In other words, a worker will need to satisfy his or her lower order needs such as food, shelter, and clothing before he or she access higher order needs.<sup>6</sup>

### *Age differences and intrinsic/extrinsic rewards*

Debra Hunter's (2007) study confirms existing research that older employees have higher levels of job satisfaction when compared to younger employees in a manufacturing environment. She argues older employees place a higher value on intrinsic and extrinsic rewards when compared to younger workers (Hunter, 2007). Over an older worker's career, he or she has the opportunity to interact with intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. This allows older workers to accumulate a larger amount of extrinsic and intrinsic rewards when compared to younger workers. However, this research does not identify which specific intrinsic and extrinsic rewards influence a younger and older worker's job satisfaction.

Mary Tschirhart's (1998) analysis of age differences suggests workers at AmeriCorps who were fifty and over place a higher value on service orientation and less on financial rewards and career development when compared to younger workers.<sup>7</sup> As older workers approach retirement they tend to place less importance on salary and promotions. They

---

<sup>6</sup> Herzberg's two-factor theory is consistent with Maslow's (1954) hierarchy of needs.

<sup>7</sup> The contradiction between Hunter (2007) and Tschirhart (1998) suggest older workers might place a lower value on receiving extrinsic rewards such as salary. These workers might find value in accessing intrinsic and extrinsic rewards in other areas. For example, an increased attention to detail will require workers to slow down and perform their tasks carefully. The reduction of mistakes among workers would reduce the workloads for older workers (ie. older workers would require less effort to fix the mistakes of other workers).

rather focus on the quality of their work. On the other hand, younger workers tend to link the quantity of work to the amount of compensation they receive. In addition, her research illustrates younger workers were motivated by specific intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. For example, salary and opportunities for promotion tend to motivate younger workers at AmeriCorps (Tschirhart, 1998).

Simpson, Sturges, Woods, and Altman (2005) argue age differences can influence a worker's perceptions of career outcomes. As a worker approaches retirement, he or she might not see the importance of promotion and advancement in the company. First, these workers might rather avoid the additional workloads, responsibilities, and stress associated with a promotion. Second, they might not need the additional income. Third, a promotion might interfere with existing interpersonal relationships. Rebuilding these relationships will take time and effort. Last, they might feel a younger worker is more deserving of the promotion.

Schmuck, Kasser, and Ryan (2000) argue younger workers from industrialized countries tend to place different values on intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. They stated these workers tend to face cultural pressures to aspire to extrinsic rewards such as financial success, appearance, and social recognition. Intrinsic rewards such as self-acceptance, affiliation, and community appear to receive less attention from these workers (Schmuck, Kasser, & Ryan, 2000). In addition, Huang and Vliert (2003) suggest social welfare programs have a positive influence on a worker's job satisfaction in industrialized countries.<sup>8</sup>

Other researchers on job satisfaction suggest employers can benefit from increased maintenance of extrinsic rewards. Park, Murgatroyd, Raynock, and Spillett (1998)

---

<sup>8</sup> Welfare programs in Canada might reduce the level of importance for financial rewards. For older workers, the Canadian Pension Plan could reduce the need for retirement income.

suggest education, marital status, and employment status can influence a worker's job satisfaction. Economic restructuring might have influenced an older worker's marital status.<sup>9</sup> The emotional and financial stress of a divorce could have a serious impact on an older workers job satisfaction. These older workers might place a greater emphasis on extrinsic rewards such as interpersonal relationships and salary. Kuhnert and Palmer (1991) suggest job security can influence extrinsic rewards. However, the fear of job loss influenced a worker's intrinsic rewards. They argued perceptions of job security had a significant impact on a worker's health. Lewis, Brazil, Krueger, Lohfeld, and Tjam (2001) argue pay, benefits, and supervisor style play an important role in determining a worker's job satisfaction. Altogether, various factors might influence a worker's job satisfaction.

### ***Background on the Upper James Barn***

Jan Kainer (2002) argues supermarket unions have been able to achieve moderately high rates of union coverage, even though the retail industry has a low rate of unionization. For example, union coverage in the Ontario's retail industry was 14.4% in 2001, whereas in food stores it was 43.5% (Labour Force Survey Estimates in Ontario in Kainer, 2002). The expansion of Keynesian welfare policy that fueled economic expansion in Ontario may have lead to the high rates of union coverage among food stores.<sup>10</sup> For example, employees in the supermarket industry benefited from the increased legal status of unions, Rand Formula, grievance procedure, and compulsory conciliation. During this period, employers were vulnerable to labour disruptions. Supermarkets operate on narrow profit margins and deal with a high volume of perishable

---

<sup>9</sup> For example, a spouse may have loss his or her job due to downsizing. The resulting reduction in family income could place additional stress on a marriage.

<sup>10</sup> The economic expansion also benefited non-union retail stores such as convenience stores and specialty shops.

items. Work is labour intensive and product turnaround is high. It was in the employer's interests to promote labour stability. As a result, unions during this period enjoyed a favourable environment to represent supermarket employees.

The Upper James Barn benefited from this economic expansion as it operated under the Ultra Food & Drug Mart banner. This banner was part of the Steinberg Inc. supermarket division. This location would focus on selling a wide range of health care and general merchandise items. Steinberg's supermarkets flourished in the 1970's by offering their customers high quality service and products. In order to ensure the cooperation of the employees Steinberg offered competitive wages<sup>11</sup>; benefits<sup>12</sup>, and opportunities for advancement in the company. In addition, employment in the supermarket industry offered employees with limited education and caregiving responsibilities an opportunity to earn supplementary income.

The decline of Fordism in the 1970s and rising cost of food encouraged the supermarket industry to restructure and reorganize their organizations to become more competitive (Kainer, 2002). First, the supermarket industry diversified their operations to accommodate the growing market segmentation (ie. super-stores, discount chains, warehouse clubs, and general merchandise stores). Second, the supermarket industry introduced new technology (Kainer, 2002).<sup>13</sup> Third, the supermarket industry introduced new products and services to help accommodate the growing number of working women.<sup>14</sup> For example, the 'hot foods' department attempted to offer customers an

---

<sup>11</sup> Before the Miracle Food Mart strike in 1993, the average rate of pay was \$17.34 per hour and average number of hours was 37 per week (Human Resource Study of the Grocery Distribution Industry in Kainer, 2002).

<sup>12</sup> The older research participants reported Steinberg offered his employees a profit share program. If workers purchased company shares, he would guarantee a minimal purchase price.

<sup>13</sup> For example, new software packages allowed the supermarket industry to schedule workers during peak hours of operation.

<sup>14</sup> These products and services came with a high mark up.

opportunity to have a quick family dinner. Altogether, the restructuring of the supermarket industry attempted to position itself to compete against the growing number of retailers from the United States (ie. Costco and Wal-Mart) coming in to Canada.

The decline of the Keynesian welfare state in the 1970s had a significant impact on the unionized supermarket employee. By the 1980s, the Steinberg supermarket chain was losing customer appeal. In order to survive Steinberg sold the company to a larger organization. In August 1989, Socanav-Caisse Inc. bought Steinberg Inc. for \$1.8 billion. In July 1990, Atlantic and Pacific (A&P) purchased 58 Miracle Food Mart and 11 Miracle Ultra-Mart supermarkets from the Canadian food retailer for \$202.5 million. The merger helped to increase A&P's annual sales in Canada by 50% to \$3 billion ("Business Brief," 1990). In 2005, Metro Inc. agreed to purchase A&P Canada for an acquisition price of \$1.7 billion. Under this agreement, Metro would acquire ten locations operating under the Barn banner in the Hamilton area of Ontario, and four food-and-drug combination stores called Ultra Food and Drug.<sup>15</sup> Due to these mergers, organizational structures have integrated the Upper James Barn into a larger corporation.

The centralized organizational structure of A&P proved a challenge for UFCW. In the event of a labour dispute, A&P was able to maintain operations at their other locations. For example, in 1993-94 a province-wide strike occurred at 63 Miracle Food Mart stores in Ontario. The outcome of this strike illustrates the organizational flexibility of A&P. "Lasting over three months, from November 18, 1993 to February 21, 1994, it is considered one of the longest strikes in the history of retail in Canada. A total of 6500 workers (1700 full-time and 4800 part-time) represented by UFCW Locals 175/633 went out across the province" (Kainer, 1998, p. 194). At the end of the strike, "UFCW and

---

<sup>15</sup> As of September 23, 2006, the collective agreement with the Barn markets and UFCW Locals 175/633 has expired. In addition, as of July 31, 2007 the Barn employees have been in a legal strike position.

A&P negotiated \$1.75/hr across-the-board wage cuts for all full-time and part-time employees” (Kainer, 1998, p. 195). Despite the victory, A&P continued to press for worker concessions in the face of declining sales and profits.

In 1994, A&P eliminated 700 full-time positions at Miracle Food Mart through a volunteer buy-out program.<sup>16</sup> Workers who accepted the full buy-out could return as a new part time employee starting at minimal wage and no benefits.<sup>17</sup> Even though UFCW made limited efforts to protect existing jobs, the concessionary bargaining practices of UFCW came at a price for new hires. For example, after the Miracle Food Mart strike the collective agreement stated new part time hires would start at \$6.70 per hour, they could only work up to a maximum of 16 hours per week, and it would take 42 months to reach the top rate of \$9.60 per hour (Kainer, 1998). As a result, this wage progression scale made it difficult for workers to push their wages higher. These workers found themselves working for longer periods for smaller wage increases.

Concessionary practices extended to new areas of investment for A&P. In 1999, A&P purchased the Barn Markets from G.A. Love Foods. After the purchase, A&P announced the closure of three Barn locations in Hamilton and its Burlington warehouse (“A&P laying off,” 2002).<sup>18</sup> This downsizing resulted in 500 layoffs for the Barn workers. In 1999, UFCW Locals 175/633 began representing the Barn supermarket locations.<sup>19</sup> By March 2001, the Upper James location changed from an Ultra Food and Drug Mart to a Barn supermarket.

---

<sup>16</sup> “The volunteer buy-out programme offered \$1500 for every year of service for full-time employees, up to a maximum of \$35,000 ... part-timers could accept \$500 for every year worked, up to a maximum of \$5,000” (Kainer, 1998, p. 195).

<sup>17</sup> This depended on the availability of open positions.

<sup>18</sup> A&P converted one of the closed stores in to a Food Basics.

<sup>19</sup> These Barns were originally non-union.

In addition to concessionary bargaining practices, UFCW struggled to resolve jurisdictional issues resulting from the merger of the Amalgamated Meat Cutters and Butchers Union and the Retail Clerks International Union (Kainer, 2002).<sup>20</sup> Combined with an economic recession in the 1990s, A&P was in a position to exploit the competition between the UFCW locals. For example, A&P had multiple banners to choose from when opening new supermarkets. They could pressure the UFCW locals to compete for union revenues. These union revenues helped to finance new union membership in other sectors of the economy and provide services for the existing membership. As a result, A&P was effective in using a whipsawing technique against these locals while they fought for additional revenues.<sup>21</sup>

A&P has been effective in using collective bargaining to weaken existing collective agreements. For example, legislative changes in June 1992 allowed retailers to operate on Sundays. Concessionary bargaining practices have almost erased the original Sunday premiums of time and half. This has implications for younger employees since this new arrangement for Sundays is a condition of employment. For older workers, they were able to use 'grandfather rights' in order to protect their Sunday premium. UFCW was only effective in delaying the decline of premiums for Sunday work among older workers.<sup>22</sup> Concessionary bargaining has erased the Sunday premium for both age groups.

---

<sup>20</sup> The resulting union merger Locals 175/633 produced the largest local in UFCW Canada. Local 175 represented the food clerks, cashiers, and other services areas while Local 633 represented the meat and deli departments (Kainer, 2002). As of December 2006, UFCW Locals 175/633 represents 46,327 members. In addition, they represent employees from A&P, Dominion, Food Basics, Ultra-Mart, Miracle Food Mart, and other supermarket chains.

<sup>21</sup> When A&P opened a new store, they could determine which UFCW local would represent the workers at this location. In effect, the local who provided the company with the best collective agreement got the store.

<sup>22</sup> On July 2006, the city of Hamilton made changes to allow retailers to be open for 24 hours. See City of Hamilton by-law 06-212. The changes in hours of operation have re-emerged as a significant workplace issue for older and younger worker. Longer store hours only increased irregular hours for younger workers.

Aggressive human resource management at A&P has caused furthered divisions between workers. For example, supermarket employers used a profit-hour ratio<sup>23</sup> in order to determine the hours available to a department (Kainer, 1998). The sales volume at the store determines the amount of hours a manager would have for the week. However, managers are offered bonuses if they are successful in reducing the amount of labour hours used. This can create issues in a department where a profit margin is not easily calculated. Since service work is intangible, it is difficult to measure profit margins through traditional methods. Therefore, the hours available for cashiers could not be easily determined. Since work on cash is 'aged typed' then the restricted hours tends to impact younger female workers.<sup>24</sup>

In addition, A&P introduced video cameras, computerized scheduling, electronic cash registers, and ordering devices into the workplace. The company claimed the introduction of this advanced technology would increase the skill levels, increase security, and protect existing jobs. However, the company used advanced technology, deskilling, and worker teams to further fragment skilled positions in the supermarket industry.

A&P used collective bargaining to reduce job categories and introduce non-union positions.<sup>25</sup> Workers interested in a career in the supermarket faced few opportunities for full-time unionized positions. Competition among unionized workers increased along with workloads and responsibilities. It is clear workers in the supermarket industry were now facing job enlargement and not the company's claim for job enrichment.

---

<sup>23</sup> Profit-hour ratio is the "[t]otal number of labour hours available in a week as per dollar of sales for all departments at their supermarket. The number of labour hours that can be scheduled at a store is dependent on sales volume, specifically sales per person hour" (Kainer, 1998, p. 10).

<sup>24</sup> Tannock (2001) argues age stratification has influenced the supermarket industry. For example, we see younger workers in areas of front-end service and as clerks.

<sup>25</sup> In the collective agreement between the Barn Markets and UFCW Locals 175/633, the Letter of Understanding #5 outlines the criteria for when an assistant supervisor (non-union) can be hired. If the store projects a specific amount of sales in one year then the company is justified in hiring another assistant supervisor.

The combination of industrial competition and economic restructuring has implications for older workers at the Upper James Barn.<sup>26</sup> These workers at the Barn have witnessed a source of quality employment reduced to part time and contingent forms of work. In addition, they have witnessed the deterioration of relationships between labour and management. The need for increased competition or avoidance of job loss became important corporate objectives for A&P.<sup>27</sup>

This had a substantial impact on the conditions and nature of employment for older employees. These experiences might influence how older employees access rewards in their workplace. The work experiences for these employees might influence how they value intrinsic and extrinsic rewards over a long period. For example, these workers might embrace their employer's demand for increased competition to avoid additional job loss.

The researcher expects older employees at the Upper James Barn to include employees who took the partial buy-out and those who took the full buy-out.<sup>28</sup> The experience of the buy-outs might influence how older workers value extrinsic rewards. During this period competition between workers increased. These workers were concerned that they could be 'bumped' out of their jobs. On the other hand, the younger participants were all new

---

<sup>26</sup> Industrial competition has also weakened the bargaining power for these workers. For example, the Upper James Barn is located within a competitive area in Hamilton for food retailers. Within two and a half kilometers, there is a Wal-Mart, two Fortinos, two No Name stores (one location is directly across the street from the Upper James location), and two Metro owned Basics.

<sup>27</sup> James Rinehart (2001) argues economic restructuring is associated with the introduction of advanced technology and the need for increased competition to prevent additional job loss.

<sup>28</sup> A&P offered their employees a buy-out consisting of three options. Workers could take a full buy-out and leave the company altogether. It is important to note A&P rehired some of these employees. In addition, some of these workers were effective in arguing that their skills and experience deserved the new top rate, even though they were new hires under the collective agreement. These employees would receive three weeks pay for each year of employment with A&P. In order to determine how many hours the employee worked in a year, A&P took an average of hours over a twenty-six week period. The second option allowed employees to take a partial buy-out and maintain their current seniority. These workers had the options to remain working under the existing union contracts with A&P or they could move into the Barn locations and work under the new Barn Market collective agreement. Under the Barn contract, employees faced reduced wage rates. In addition, if their store eventually closed then these workers could not bump into other A&P locations. The last option allowed A&P employees to take no buy-out and continue to work under the A&P contract.

employees hired under the Barn Markets contract.<sup>29</sup> Since these younger employees did not face a reduction in wages, the buy-outs had a limited impact on them.

The concessionary bargaining practices of UFCW have created limitations for younger employees. The collective agreement has placed limitations on the ability of younger workers to push their incomes higher. These workers are limited by the amount of hours and wage rates they may receive. Moreover, the loss of full time positions limited opportunities for promotions. For younger workers who were in school and working at the same time these limitations might not be an issue. However, when they complete their education these barriers might create a source of stress and tension.

---

<sup>29</sup> Only two of the younger participants were present during the buy-out period.

### CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY

In order to collect qualitative data the researcher used face-to-face interviews. The researcher used a semi-structured questionnaire form. A survey assisted in collecting the demographic data of the research participants.<sup>30</sup> The researcher used Glaser and Strauss's (1967) grounded theory approach for data analysis. The researcher used a snowball sample technique to locate and select research participants.<sup>31</sup>

The research sample included two categories of workers.<sup>32</sup> The first category includes younger employees who were part time, work in low skilled positions and work irregular hours. They needed to be living at home with their parents and have less than ten years experience in this industry. In addition, younger workers need to be still in school or in the process of completing their education and under the age of twenty-five.<sup>33</sup> These workers tend to view their work in the supermarket as temporary.

The second category contains older workers who have some education or training. They had over fifteen years of experience in the unionized supermarket industry. In addition, they were over the age of forty-five and employed during the buy-out period. These workers had experience working as a part timer, full timer, or as a manager. In addition, these participants tend to consider their job in the supermarket industry as a career.

---

<sup>30</sup> See Appendix A for the demographic survey. See Appendix B for the researcher's job satisfaction questionnaire.

<sup>31</sup> As of 2007, UFCW's research department estimates they represent 830 workers at the Barn. They represent eight Barn locations. Six of these Barns are in the Hamilton area.

<sup>32</sup> Among the ten younger research participants, all were between the ages of 20 and 25. Five were female and five were male. Two were present during the buy-outs. All were currently part time. Four had less than 5 years experience, four had between 5 and 10 years, and two have more than 10 years experience in the supermarket industry (they started working at the Upper James location at 15 years old). Of the ten older research participants, seven were between 40 and 49, and three were above 50. All were present during the buy-outs. Nine female and only one was male. Four were part time, three were full time, and three were managers. Two workers had less than 15 years experience, five had 15 to 30 years, and three had over 30 years experience in the supermarket industry.

<sup>33</sup> The Canadian Labour Congress defines a young work as 25 years old and younger.

For this thesis, the researcher interviewed ten individuals from each of the two age categories. Two additional individuals supplied expert knowledge of the supermarket industry.<sup>34</sup> Their knowledge helped to provide background information into how economic restructuring and business unionism has potentially influenced younger and older employees.

The researcher needs to acknowledge differences between the two age groups.<sup>35</sup> First, there is a large gender difference between these groups. Kainer (2002) and Tannock (2001) argue the supermarket industry is highly gendered. Males tend to fill jobs that are physically demanding, involve managerial tasks, and require higher levels of skills. Males tend to fill the few full time positions as bakers, butchers, and store managers. Women tend to fill the much larger number of part time positions as meat wrappers, cashiers, and cake decorators. These female positions tend to be part time, low paying, and unskilled.

Among the older female workers, these positions were quality sources of employment. This work provided opportunities for female workers with limited access to education and with caregiving responsibilities. Isik Urla Zeytinoglu argues the workforce in food retail is composed of two main groups, “the majority being middle-aged women (34 to 55 years) with children or single mothers (24+ years of age), and the minority being female and male students (16 to 24 years of age)” (in Kainer, 2002, p. 169). This can help to account for the higher percentage of older female workers in this industry.

---

<sup>34</sup> These two research participants had over 35 years experience working with UFCW and A&P. One expert worked as a manager for over 15 years. The other expert only worked part time. Both worked as union stewards for more than 5 years. These experts only provided background information about the Upper James location and confirmed Kainer’s historical background of Ontario’s unionized supermarket industry. In addition, they illustrated how age differences influence a worker’s job satisfaction. The experts were not included in the sample of older workers.

<sup>35</sup> The researcher did not select any workers under the age of sixteen. These workers may not have enough work experience to illustrate possible age differences.

The greater need for pay equity and workplace diversity has pressured supermarket employers during the 1990s to promote high levels of gender equality. For example, Liu and O'Halloran (2007) suggest the gender of those employed in the supermarket is relatively equal at 50% male and 50% female. This can help to account for the equal representation of males and females among the younger age category.

Second, the researcher needs to recognize differences between seniority levels. Seniority is a length of time committed to an employer. The purpose of seniority is to determine the employee benefits and rights relative to other employees (Godard, 2000). Concessionary bargaining practices, buyouts, and mandatory retirements<sup>36</sup> can disrupt an employee's continuous length of service in the supermarket industry. The researcher found examples of older individuals with over 35 years experience with the same company and had only two years of seniority. On the other hand, the researcher found examples of younger workers with over 10 years experience. These workers had different interests, norms, and values when compared to the opposite age group with comparable seniority. As a result, seniority differences would not accurately describe differences between the two age groups.

Third, the researcher needs to acknowledge class differences. The sample of older workers included part time, full time, and managers.<sup>37</sup> Two of these workers had retired and returned to work for the same employer. The sample of younger workers only included part time workers. In addition, the younger workers are in the process of completing their post secondary education. These differences between the economic and educational backgrounds of younger and older workers can signify class differences

---

<sup>36</sup> In December 2006, the government extended the mandatory retirement age from 65.

<sup>37</sup> As of 2007, UFCW's research department estimates they represent 100 full time and 730 part time workers at the Barn Supermarkets.

between the two age groups. In addition, as Tannock (2001) suggests, the supermarket industry is highly stratified by age.<sup>38</sup>

Class, seniority, and gender differences can help to account for sources of stability and conflict between these two age groups. In addition, they can be effective in illustrating the division of labour in the workplace. For example, gender is effective in explaining patterns of social differences and inequality. Class and seniority are valuable in explaining what rights and benefits in the workplace workers feel they are justified in accessing. However, these differences fail to illustrate how workers encounter different phases in their life and how they interact with various institutions (Tannock, 2001). In addition, as MacDonald and Sirianni (1996) suggest when examining social relations it is important to examine age traits in addition to gender, race, and sexuality.

### ***Research variables***

The definitions of intrinsic rewards were adapted from Herzberg's (1959) job-attitude factors.<sup>39</sup> First, responsibility in the workplace is associated with authority. Responsibility in the workplace suggests workers, supervisors, and union representatives need to perform their assigned duties or obligations, be accountable, reliable, and able to tell right from wrong. The definition also included the absence of responsibility and possible barriers to a worker's responsibility. Such barriers might include union representatives, collective bargaining, management policy and procedure, family responsibilities, and education.

Second, the possibilities for promotion or advancement suggest workers have the opportunity to apply their talents and abilities. Moreover, these workers would have the

---

<sup>38</sup> As of 2007, UFCW's research department estimates they represent 177 members under the age of twenty-five and 238 members over forty-five at the Barn Supermarkets.

<sup>39</sup> Herzberg defined these factors as terms that "[s]tand for things that happened and the feelings that were expressed about what happened" (1959, p. 44).

opportunity to learn new skills and have access to company training. The absence of promotion or advancement was included. If a supervisor informed a worker that he or she only had limited opportunities in the company then the researcher coded a negative possibility of promotion or advancement. If a worker had transferred between departments without any change in status but did take on additional responsibilities, this was not advancement in the company.

The definitions of extrinsic rewards were adapted from Herzberg's (1959) job-attitude factors. First, supervision involves an employee's evaluation of their supervisor's leadership capabilities, technical knowledge, communication skills, ability to resolve issues, and flexibility in scheduling. Second, interpersonal relationships can be between a worker and his or her supervisor, subordinates, peers, or union representatives. Such interactions might occur during breaks, while working, or outside of the workplace. Third, working conditions include the physical conditions of work, the amount of work, health and safety, access to tools, work environment, and interactions with customers. Fourth, salary includes factors such as wage rates, wage increases, quantity of paid hours, and connection between pay and performance. This definition also includes the frequency and distribution of salary.

In addition, extra job factors or fringe benefits were included in our understanding of salary. The researcher only included benefits such as vacation pay, company discount, vision, and pension plans. Fifth, job security involves a worker's sense of having continuity or stability of employment resulting from the continued profitability of the company.

### *Research questions*

In order to measure an employee's job satisfaction the researcher used sections of Grace Davis's (2004) job satisfaction questionnaire. The first section focuses on the participant's feelings and level of importance in reaction to job characteristics. The following research questions attempt to address how workers value intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. In addition, these questions will evaluate how workers feel about various parts of their job.

First, the researcher asked participants if their current position matched their career expectations. This question attempts to address what a worker expects to receive from the workplace and what he or she actually experience. Second, researcher inquired about the participant's type of work. This question helps to explain which parts of the job are important to the participants. Such areas of the job can include a worker's responsibility and work conditions. Participants then described which parts of the job they enjoyed. The factors that make the job more or less enjoyable will indicate which rewards are more important to the participant.

The researcher then asked the participant about the best parts in working for this company. This question suggests which reward is the most important to the worker. In addition, this question suggests management has made adequate efforts in addressing the importance of the reward. A participant's attitudes will indicate the extent he or she receives the reward. For example, if they were very happy with relationships in the company, this suggests they do not face limitations in accessing this reward. This question also addresses the level of job security or the overall stability perceived by the worker.

Next, the researcher asked the participant about the worst parts in working for this company. This question attempts to evaluate which rewards are not present for this participant and how does their supervisor respond when confronted about the missing reward. This question also recognizes the level of job security in the workplace. The level of insecurity might suggest a worker's concerns about potential layoff, termination, or wrongful dismissal.

The following questions focused on the supervisory capabilities at the store. First, the researcher asked the participants to provide suggestions for improvements/change. This question indicated which rewards are absent or not present for the worker. Then the participants suggested how they think their supervisor would respond to their suggestion(s). This question attempts to indicate the level of communication, respect, and openness between the supervisor and worker. Third, the participants described their relationship with their supervisor. This question attempts to evaluate which interpersonal relationships are important to the research participant. The researcher then asked the participants to consider how effective their supervisor is in resolving workplace issues. This question attempts to evaluate how a supervisor uses his or her technical knowledge to resolve workplace issues.

The next section focused on interpersonal relationships. Participants provided a specific event that described the relationship between their co-workers. Such interpersonal relationships can include managers, union representatives, peers, and subordinates. A worker's attitudes will illustrate his or her feelings in relation to such relationships. This can illustrate which interpersonal relationships were not present in the workplace.

The next section focused on how supportive the company was in assisting the research participant in receiving a promotion or advancement in the company. This question examines how the participant perceives his or her chance of receiving a promotion in the company. In addition, this question attempts to indicate the barriers workers faced in accessing promotions or advancement in the company. These barriers can include limitations imposed by the collective agreement and company policy.

The next section focused on the participant's views of compensation. The researcher asked participants to explain why they deserve a raise. A large raise might indicate the participant's compensation does not reflect the quantity or quality of work he or she completes. In addition, a large raise might indicate a participant's frustration in relation to the amount of hours, benefits, and wage progression he or she receives. A small raise might indicate the participant places a lower value on compensation. Such participants might place a higher value on working conditions or interpersonal relationships. In addition, this question attempts to address the barriers participants might face while they ask for a raise.

The next section focused on the worker's job satisfaction. The participants provided examples where the company might improve a worker's job satisfaction. This question also attempts to speak to the perceived fairness of company policies and administrative practices. In addition, this question attempts to address which extrinsic rewards are not present or not adequately addressed by management.

The last section focused on the research participant's attitudes in relation to UFCW. The first question asked the participant to describe his or her relationship with UFCW. This next question measures the effectiveness of UFCW in addressing rewards that the participant was unable to access.

## CHAPTER 4: RESULTS FOR OLDER WORKERS

### *What did older worker expect to receive?*

Eight older workers were in the later stages of their career. They were not interested in promotion or advancement in the company since it would increase their workloads. In addition, they felt comfortable in their current employment. This older worker explains:

I did not want a promotion. I did my time ... I know and like my job. I want to spend more time with my family. I am not worried about my career.

These workers considered the need for promotion or advancement in the company to be important for workers with a strong work ethic and self-esteem. They felt the workers who were productive and dependable deserved the opportunity for promotion or advancement. Moreover, they felt workers who were lazy and unreliable did not deserve to move ahead in the company. In addition, they felt the opportunity for advancement was for the younger workers who were willing to invest the necessary time and effort required for promotion.

The two other workers stated individuals that are committed to the organization deserve promotion over those less committed. Such individuals tend to be interested in pursuing a career in the supermarket industry.

Seven older workers expect all workers to take on some responsibility in the workplace. It was important for these workers to look out for the next worker. In return, they expected their co-workers to look out for them. The other three older workers added they expected workers to take some pride in the work they do.<sup>40</sup> The goal was to make everyone's job at the Barn less stressful. This older worker illustrates this situation:

My department has a friendly atmosphere and people get along. People help and look out for each other. You need to work properly so the next person that follows has their work prepared for them. We do this so the next person does

---

<sup>40</sup> This included the opinions of all three older workers who were managers

not have to come in and say oh my god what happened. We are always looking for the next person.

Eight older workers expected their pay and benefits to reflect the profitability of the company. These raises were expected periodically and to be fair for every worker. In addition, these workers knew their guaranteed amount of hours. They expected to have easy access to their benefits. In addition, they expected co-workers not to take advantage of the benefits provided by the company. Two other older workers added they expected pay levels and benefits to decline if the profitability of the company suffered. For example, these workers were willing to give up the company discount plan if it helped the company remain profitable.

Nine older workers expected working conditions to be safe. These workers were aware supermarket work could be repetitive and boring. Moreover, they expected the work to be physically demanding. One older worker added they expected supermarket work not to be mentally demanding.

Eight older workers expected their supervisor to defend and address their concerns in a reasonable period. They expected their supervisor to achieve the organizational goals of the company, reward hard work and commitment, and demonstrate leadership. Two other workers added their supervisors needed to discourage theft and punish disobedience.

Five older workers stated their continued employment was dependent on the profitability of the store. Two older workers added that their skills, seniority, and knowledge of the collective agreement might influence their job security. Three older workers added they felt their store needed to be competitive in order to survive.<sup>41</sup> This required workers to have a closer relationship with their supervisors. For these workers job security was an important reward.

---

<sup>41</sup> This included the opinions of all three older workers who were managers.

Six older workers expected relationships in the workplace to be antagonistic. Their previous work experience suggested labour and management have competing interests. The four remaining older workers expected to have good relationships with co-workers, managers, and union representatives.<sup>42</sup> They expected everyone to work together and respect each other.

*What did older workers actually receive?*

Six older workers expressed disappointment that the most productive and dedicated workers were the least likely to receive promotion. These workers argued the collective agreement restricted a worker's ability to receive a promotion. For example, management would consider a worker's skills, abilities, and seniority to determine if a worker should receive promotion. If the company wanted to promote a worker with limited seniority, it could schedule this worker 40 hours a week for 12 weeks. According to the collective agreement, this worker then would automatically receive full time status.<sup>43</sup> In addition, concessionary bargaining practices reduced the number of full time opportunities. As competition increased for these few positions, the role of seniority became more important. In effect, it required workers to invest a major part of their working lives in the hope for promotion or advancement.

Four other older workers stated they have been encouraged to take on managerial tasks. Such tasks include directing co-workers, ordering, and training new workers. However, these older workers were frustrated at younger workers who did not share the same work ethic or commitment to the department. This older worker explains:

We bend over backwards to help out this younger employee ... we have trained her and we are very nice to her even though she has entered into our department and taken our hours and cost us money in the long run.

---

<sup>42</sup> This included the opinions of all three older workers who were managers.

<sup>43</sup> This only worked for employers if no employee filed a grievance.

In addition, the combination of reduced job categories and teamwork schemes pressure these older workers to participate more in the labour process.

Five older workers expressed their frustrations that many younger workers were not taking responsibility for their own actions. Such younger workers would leave a mess, fail to clean up, ignore customers, or intentionally damage products. Three other older workers thought supervisors in the store failed to address worker concerns. The store has been a frequent target for robberies and employee theft. These older workers argued management failed to protect and provide leadership for workers.

The other two older workers felt their union has struggled to defend its members. These older workers expect the union and management to do more to protect workers. Supervisors, union leaders, and workers are struggling to come to the defense of workers facing marginalization or exploitation. These older workers are taking on additional risks. Moreover, they are willing to surrender other rewards (e.g. company discount and working conditions) if it helped the profitability of the company. As this older worker explains when discussing the recent robbery:

When it first happens, you think about it and then over time, it moves to the back of your mind and you do not think about it again ... because you hope that it never happens again. I never thought that my safety in the store a collective bargaining issue ... workers have become more interested in the money.

Six older workers stated their pay levels do not reflect their performance. In addition, these workers were at top rate and guaranteed the maximum amount of hours. Despite working without a collective agreement, these workers are aware of the possibility of retroactive pay. They would rather avoid the pain and frustration associated with pushing their wages higher. They have seen what a strike has done to their friendships in the

workplace. At this stage in their working career, they would rather continue working at the same pay level.

The other four older workers acknowledged they were willing to take a reduced raise to remain working.<sup>44</sup> These workers felt their wages were adequate, even though it did not reflect their overall performance. Moreover, these workers suggest other workers at the Barn are living pay cheque to pay cheque. They expected support for a strike to be weak.

Eight older workers were concerned over the union's administration of their pension plan. These workers were worried over the struggling benefit plans in the manufacturing sector. These workers at the Barn have invested a major part of their working lives into their pension plan. In addition, these workers heard conflicting stories about the security of their pension plan.<sup>45</sup> Not to have access to this plan would have a significant impact on their ability to retire. This older worker explains:

I am very concerned about my pension. You are putting a lot of trust in them to look after your money. It is scary when you hear stories that they have been lying to you. Whom do you trust?

Two older workers stated they were willing to give up some benefits in order to remain employed. As this older worker reflects back on the value of their company discount:

It is far too expensive to shop here [Barn]. I will not shop in this store if I lose the discount card. I might buy the meat though. I will go to the store closest to my home. You can go to the No-Frills store and get a large head of lettuce for \$.99 or you go to the Barn and pay a \$1.69.

Six older workers found their supervisor not consistent when enforcing company policies and procedures. These workers maintained their supervisor would defend lazy workers while punishing the worker who works the hardest. Supervisors would not

---

<sup>44</sup> These older workers were willing to take less financial rewards if they could avoid a strike.

<sup>45</sup> For more on the UFCW's legal problems associated with the Canadian Commercial Workers Industry Pension Plan (CCWIPP) see Menzies (2005).

address workplace issues quickly; rather they would hope the problem would resolve itself. These workers were frustrated that their union was not effective in challenging the lack of consistency among the supervisors. They felt the union protected the lazy workers from managerial discipline.

Four older workers were concerned that the supervisor was leaving younger workers in charge of the store at night. These older workers were concerned that these younger workers left in charge of the store lacked the necessary skills and qualifications. This older worker explains:

They put certain people in charge at night for the part-time people. You end up with some kid in the produce department and his friend in the grocery department goofing off all night. You have this other young kid that is in charge trying to tell these two kids to smarten up and get back to their work ... they end up laughing at this poor kid in charge of the store.

These older workers complained to the supervisor about younger workers closing the store. The supervisor reminds the older workers that they are unwilling to take on the responsibility. These older workers explained they were willing to close the store. However, they expect extra compensation. This old worker explains:

If I step up to the plate and complain to the store manager why are you letting the part-timers run the store they don't know what they're doing why are you allowing this to happen? He will say to me do you want to come in and lock up the store everyday. They only pay me \$14.60 so why should I work every evening. Now pay me \$18 and of course, I will take on a couple of evenings.

These older workers expect additional wages to compensate them for their knowledge and experience in the supermarket industry.

Seven older workers expressed concerns over the working conditions at the Barn.<sup>46</sup> These workers reported their supervisor encouraged them to compete among each other to see who worked the fastest. This older worker explains:

---

<sup>46</sup> This included the opinions of all three older workers who were managers.

Since I worked on a production line at the meat processing plant I found I could outwork anybody at the store level ... I was nicknamed the machine.

These workers faced difficulties in maintaining the same amount of work they achieved in previous years. Moreover, these workers were less likely to ask for help in completing physical tasks or complain about their workload. These workers had a strong commitment to department goals.<sup>47</sup> The other three older workers were frustrated at younger workers who frequently complained about the amount and physical nature of work they were required to complete.<sup>48</sup>

Seven older workers were becoming anxious over the employer's ability to continue to make money. These workers were annoyed over the continued loss of quality service at the Barn. They argued that the Barn promotes a business model based on offering quality products and services. However, these workers suggest otherwise. An older worker recalls when commenting on the decline of quality service:

It is because in the morning they are pulling off the leaves and we are thinking of lettuce comes in like this [larger size] and you are pulling off the leaves and you are making it smaller and smaller and the price remains the same. Can you blame them? No one is there to tell them to stop.

Three other older workers argued the introduction of new technology has increased managerial control over workers.<sup>49</sup> Video cameras monitor employees and computers determine schedules and place orders. In addition, these workers argue tasks that traditionally require some skill and experience are quickly disappearing. For example,

---

<sup>47</sup> This can be attributed the fact these workers have worked together for numerous years. They experienced strikes, layoffs, and buyouts. Even in the later stages of their working career, they were still not willing to let their friends and co-workers down. However, they did express concerns their supervisors did take advantage of their commitment to the department and their co-workers.

<sup>48</sup> Two out of three managers agreed with this point.

<sup>49</sup> Supervisors claimed new technology and deskilling intends to free up managers for other tasks. Older workers report these supervisors are performing tasks reserved for unionized workers. Collective bargaining attempts to reduce the amount of supervisor work completed on the floor. However, it is impossible for the union to enforce. In addition, the collective agreement can allow for additional hiring of assistant managers if the store makes more money.

pre-pack has reduced the need for skilled butchers. An older worker recalls the state of skilled work in the supermarket:

It is just a matter of time. Today in the retail business you take No-Frills and Fortinos, the sales are outrageous. Today all the meat we get is pre-packed. The worker takes it out of the box and puts it on the shelf ... the meat department is just like the automobile industry. Today, it is one big production line ... mass production in the supermarket.

Four older workers suggested interpersonal relationships are fragile at the Barn. These workers were dissatisfied that their co-workers spread negative views throughout the workplace on a regular basis. They found working in this environment was demoralizing and upsetting. This older worker explains:

I do not want to hear people talk negatively about their work everyday. If there is a problem let us deal with it ... but these people go on wave their hands and say, this place is so stupid. Then they go for coffee break to talk about the problem they faced. Now everybody is negative ... I hate it.

In addition, these workers suggest interpersonal relationships with union representatives were weak. These workers would support their union and their co-workers if they ever went on strike. However, these workers were concerned with the union's ability to defend their interests.<sup>50</sup>

Two older workers commented on the good relationships they had with their supervisor. This was the result of working with the same people for years. These relationships helped to create a friendly work environment. This older worker explains:

The meat manager is going hunting and I can see it now. He will have the turkey in his line of sight and he will get a phone call from me telling him to come in to work because someone called in sick ... and for the rest of my working experience he will remind me of this story. So far, he has only gotten one turkey ... his poor wife will have to buy him a frozen turkey [laughter].

---

<sup>50</sup> These older workers had strong relationships with the union. During the Miracle Food Mart strike, these workers were disappointed over how the union handled the situation. After the strike, these workers felt their union 'was in bed' with the company.

The other four older workers discussed the good relationships they had with younger workers. These workers discussed issues surrounding leisure, family, school, and career ambitions. These older workers would remind younger workers that employment in the supermarket is only temporary. They wanted these younger workers to take advantage of the better opportunities that exist for workers today. This old worker explains:

There are so many different opportunities for young men and women in many parts of the country ... there is no reason in the world why some 19 or 20 year old should settle for a grocery job.

These older participants wanted younger workers to have a realistic view of what the supermarket industry can do for them. They argued the current opportunities, pay, and benefits in this industry cannot provide for a family. This older worker explains:

In their minds, they are happy with 24 hours and they feel that they can support a family on this. This is not realistic ... and I want to bash them over the head. I am thinking this person is not going to have a wife and kids on this salary of 9 dollars at 24 hours a week ... I pray none of my kids get involved with them.

For these older workers employment in the supermarket industry provided them with new opportunities for employment. These workers had limited access to education and had family responsibilities. Initially, employment in the supermarket provided these workers with opportunities for promotions, reasonable wages, and a pension. However, due to economic restructuring this source of quality employment is now routine, boring, and undervalued work.

## CHAPTER 5: RESULTS FOR YOUNGER WORKERS

### *What did younger worker expect to receive?*

Seven younger workers stated promotion or advancement in the company was important to them. They expect to receive some training and education from the supermarket industry. However, they did not consider this sector as a possible career opportunity. This younger worker explains:

When I first started, I expected to get my diploma and then resign when I found better work. I like the people I work with but this type of work is not for me. I only expect to do this job for two or three years.

The other three younger workers considered the possibility of a career in the supermarket. They expected their supervisor and union representatives to assist in their career development.

Seven younger workers felt they were only responsible for their assigned work. In addition, they expect other workers to take responsibility for their own work. Their supervisor would be responsible for determining the quantity and quality of their work. The three other younger workers added they expected their union representatives to provide some protection from supervisors that abuse their authority.

Six younger workers expected their pay and raises to reflect their work performance and availability. The other four younger workers added they expected to receive raises in equal intervals. These workers expected supervisors to schedule their work around their education. All ten younger workers expected to receive benefits. However, they did not expect to use them.

Eight younger workers expected work in the supermarket to be fun and safe. The other two younger workers expected the working conditions to be better than their previous employment in the fast food industry.

Six younger workers expected their supervisor to protect and address a worker's concerns as quickly as possible.<sup>51</sup> They expected their supervisor to train them or assist them when needed. Four other younger workers stated they expected their supervisor to punish disobedient workers and confront customers that are stealing from the company.

When asked about job security, seven younger workers only consider their employment temporary while they finished their education. These younger workers argued they would only encounter job loss if their supervisor caught stealing from the company or fighting in the store.<sup>52</sup> The other three younger workers stated they could easily find comparable work. Among the younger workers, job security was not an important workplace reward.

Eight younger workers expected a friendly environment. They expect people to get along with their co-workers, supervisors, and union representatives. The other two younger workers added they expected to be close with workers of the same age group.

***What did younger workers actually receive?***

Three younger worker expressed dissatisfaction that their collective agreement restricted their ability to receive promotion or advancement in the company. They would require a large number of years of part time seniority before they could advance in the company. These workers felt the worker who completed the most work should be promoted and not the individual who has been there the longest. The other seven younger workers only considered their employment as temporary. They felt the skills and experience they learned at the supermarket would help them move on to other forms of employment. These workers were eager to take on additional responsibilities and learn

---

<sup>51</sup> Five younger female participants agreed with this point.

<sup>52</sup> These younger workers added they were not concerned with job loss if their supervisor caught them during horseplay. They were confident the union would protect them.

new skills. As this younger worker explains when reflecting on her work in the cash office:

I have worked in the cash office for about five to six years. When you are in the cash office, you are the front-end manager. You control the breaks, scheduling, and ensure everyone is completing their duties. I have many responsibilities. I am responsible for handling tens of thousands of dollars every night.

Six younger workers were satisfied with their responsibilities in the supermarket. These workers did not face difficulties in completing their required work.<sup>53</sup> In addition, they were encouraged by the store supervisor to close the store.<sup>54</sup> They reported their supervisors focused on the quantity of their work and not the quality. These workers were able to rush through their required tasks and spend time socializing with co-workers.

In addition, these younger workers stated they were not concerned with managerial discipline if they did not complete or perform their required tasks properly. These workers only performed to their manager's expectations. As this younger worker remembers when approached by other workers about his poor work performance:

I tell them FU you are not my boss ... you are just a glorified key holder. I am not going to kill myself working in this store. If you want to work hard, go ahead and blow yourself up. I know people are frustrated at the work I do, but you are not going to get ahead so why bother. My manager only expects the best I can do ... and that is all I am willing to give.

The other four younger workers added they were not concerned with older workers complaining about their work performance. These younger workers knew they would eventually move on from the Barn. In addition, these younger workers were concerned that other workers were not taking responsibility for their actions. They frequently encountered younger and older workers stealing from the company, calling in sick, or

---

<sup>53</sup> Four out of five younger male participants agreed with this point.

<sup>54</sup> For the younger workers who took on managerial responsibilities this suggests a possible entry point for promotion into management. This is an opportunity for employers to evaluate the skills and abilities of these employees. However, the majority of research participants reported this industry has limited opportunities for advancement. This suggests only a few employees will continue in this industry and invest the required time and effort into receiving a promotion.

yelling at department supervisors. They expect the union to play a larger role in addressing such workplace issues. However, they found the union came to the defense of these disobedient workers, rather than encourage discipline against such behaviour.

Six younger workers were dissatisfied that their work was repetitive and boring. They found work in the supermarket industry as unfulfilling. The other four younger workers expressed dissatisfaction over the security at night in the store. The workers suggest the lack of managerial authority at the Barn has made the location a target for robberies. Even after the robbery, these workers were frustrated that the store supervisor did little to improve security in the store. Moreover, these workers were frustrated that the union was not effective in pressuring the store supervisor to improve security.

Eight younger workers expressed satisfaction with the good interpersonal relationships they had in the supermarket. These workers tend to connect or establish friendships with other workers with similar interests, values, and ideals. In addition, they tend to associate with workers of the same age group. They shared similar friends, leisure activities, and education levels. However, they distanced themselves from other younger workers who were stealing from the company. In addition, they did not have strong relationships with their supervisor.

Two other workers added they did have strong relationships with older workers. They would talk to older workers about career ambitions and family. All of the younger workers suggested the interpersonal relationships they had made it difficult for them to leave the supermarket.

Seven younger workers consider work in the supermarket industry as temporary. They were not concerned about finding comparable work. The other three workers added they were not concerned over the profitability of the company. In addition, these workers only

feared job loss if they were caught stealing or fighting in the store. They were confident that the union would protect them if they faced discipline from their supervisor.

Six younger workers were frustrated that supervisors were not consistent in disciplining or rewarding workers. These supervisors continuously failed to come to the defense of younger workers or enforce their own company policies and procedures. In addition, some supervisors exploited a younger worker's lack of work experience. This younger worker explains:

Management likes to muscle around younger people with less seniority. They believe younger people do not understand the contract and their rights within the store ... it is common to hear from a young worker complaining that they have been written up for calling in sick. It is complete favoritism in that sense. If they like you then they will leave you alone and you can call in sick if you like. If they have a bone to pick, you will be the first one on the radar. There is no consistency in how this handled by supervisors.

The remaining four younger workers added they were becoming increasingly concerned over the lack of leadership and communication with the store supervisor.<sup>55</sup> As this younger worker explains when looking back on the last robbery:

The supervisor did not even know to lock the door after a robbery. He compromised the crime scene because he did not want to upset the customers. The police told him what to do and he ignores it. What can I do if he will not even listen to the police?

Six younger workers were dissatisfied on the grounds that their pay levels did not reflect their overall work performance. They felt the collective agreement restricted their ability to push wages higher. These workers argued wage progressions in the collective agreement made it difficult for younger workers to access the top pay scale.<sup>56</sup> In addition, the pay levels for younger workers did not reflect the work they did. As this younger worker stated:

---

<sup>55</sup> Four female participants agreed with this point.

<sup>56</sup> Younger participants approximated it would take them seven years to achieve the highest pay level.

I do not agree with the pay levels and wage progressions at this store. You start at minimum wage and it takes forever to reach top rate. What's more frustrating you think working at the desk would get more money. Not even \$.25 more for the additional work we do. You have to deal with customers more often and you need to be hands on and in dealing with returns. I rather go back, work on the cash registers, and do less work for the same rate of pay.

The four other younger workers added they understood the employer's need for a wage progression when younger workers are attending school. A student's availability can restrict an employer's ability to schedule workers during peak business hours. However, when a student was out of school for the holidays and summer vacation he or she found the collective agreement to restrict the amount of hours he or she could receive. In addition, these younger workers expected their increased availability to justify a higher access to financial rewards.

Eight younger workers struggled to see the importance of their pension plan.<sup>57</sup> These workers would rather have the money to spend on leisure, transportation, and education. This younger worker explains:

Now it is true that we have a pension plan ... to some point this is good. When I finally retire in say 40 years, I can use this pension money for lotto tickets.

The other two younger workers added they were frustrated at the limitations of their benefit plan. These workers argued they could receive better benefits from their parent's plan.

---

<sup>57</sup> The majority of younger participants reported that they were surprised that they even had a benefit plan.

## CHAPTER 6: DISCUSSION

### *Similarities*

Job dissatisfaction occurred for both age groups when they did not have access to extrinsic and intrinsic rewards they considered important (See Table 1). For example, younger workers placed a high importance on promotion or advancement in the company. When the workers failed to receive this intrinsic reward, they became frustrated with the absence of extrinsic rewards such as supervision, salary, and working conditions (See Table 3). On the other hand, older workers placed a high importance on responsibility in the store. When older workers failed to receive this intrinsic reward, they became frustrated at the absence of extrinsic rewards such as supervision, benefits, working conditions, and job security (See Table 3). As a result, the absence of extrinsic and intrinsic rewards had a significant impact on the job satisfaction for both age groups. In addition, the absence of extrinsic rewards that had a low importance for both age groups did not have a significant impact on a worker's job satisfaction.

Intrinsic rewards tend to motivate both age groups. These motivated workers tend to experience job satisfaction. However, intrinsic rewards tend to motivate younger workers more easily when compared to older workers (See Table 2). Younger workers tend to be willing to take on additional responsibilities and learn new skills and abilities. These workers tend to place a lower value on extrinsic rewards such as supervision, benefits, and job security. In addition, younger workers tend to access such extrinsic rewards through their parents.

The younger workers who were motivated stated they were satisfied with their access to extrinsic rewards such as job security, benefits, and interpersonal relationships.<sup>58</sup> These

---

<sup>58</sup> Younger workers tend to place a low value on extrinsic rewards such as job security and benefits.

younger workers tend to find supermarket work to be interesting and challenging, even though their salaries and working conditions were disappointing. In addition, these workers were aware of how the collective agreement influenced their access to hours, wage rates, and promotions. These younger workers understood a worker's seniority, skills, and qualifications rather than the amount of work they performed would determine their compensation.

**Table 1: What did both age groups expect?**

Rewards	Younger Workers	Older Workers
Intrinsic		
Responsibility	Only responsible for the work they do. Expect supervisors, union representatives, and co-workers not to interfere with their responsibility. Younger workers were not concerned if they did not receive this reward.	Expect every worker to look out for each other and take on some responsibility in the workplace. If everyone works together then everyone can benefit. This is an important reward for older workers.
Promotion or Advancement	Felt workers who were productive, loyal, and committed to a career in this industry deserve the opportunity for promotion. Consider this reward important if you want to get ahead in life. Expect to receive some training.	Felt a worker's seniority, skills, and qualifications determine a promotion. Reward is not important for older workers. While they approach retirement, they did not want the additional workload.
Extrinsic		
Supervision	Expect supervisors to remove policies and procedures to make jobs easier. Supervisor's would provide leadership and enforce company policies and procedures. This is not an important reward for younger workers.	Expect supervisors to use their knowledge to ensure all workers complete the job correctly the first time. Expect supervisors to make intelligent business decisions and promote open communication.
Salary	Expect pay levels to reflect the amount of work completed. This is an important reward for younger workers.	Expect pay levels to reflect the quality of one's work. Salary levels reflect the profitability of the store. This is not an important reward for older workers.
Benefits	Rather receive compensation immediately. Younger workers did not expect to access benefits. This is not an important reward for younger workers.	Expect benefits to provide a source of income and financial security when they retire. Benefits would be easy to access and be available when needed.
Working conditions	Both age groups expect the working conditions to be safe. Expect the work environment to be clean, well ventilated, and the amount of workload to be manageable. This is an important reward for both age groups.	
Interpersonal Relationships	Both age groups tend to expect good interpersonal relationships. Younger workers expect good relationships with peers. Older workers expect good relationships with peers and supervisors. It was important for both age groups to work in a friendly environment. Both did expect to encounter some tensions between workers at the store.	
Job security	Have no concerns with the continued profitability of the store. These workers were confident about finding comparable work in the event of job loss. Work is temporary. Only encounter job loss if they are caught stealing from the company or fighting in the store.	See competition necessary to prevent job loss. Expect to give up some financial rewards if they could remain working. Skills, seniority, and knowledge of the collective agreement can influence a worker's job security.

Older workers who reported job satisfaction tend to place a higher value on extrinsic rewards (See Table 1). Even though older workers place a lower value on salary they expected more out of other extrinsic rewards such as supervision, benefits, interpersonal

relationships, and job security. They expected their supervisors, union leaders, and co-workers to work together and make sacrifices to ensure the continued profitability of the store. These older workers encountered job satisfaction since they had good interpersonal relationships and they were satisfied with the salary they received.

**Table 2: What did workers satisfied with their jobs receive?**

Rewards	Younger Workers	Older Workers
Intrinsic		
Responsibility	Both age groups reported job satisfaction when offered the opportunity to close the store.	
Promotion or Advancement	Both age groups reported job satisfaction when offered the opportunity to learn news skills or train sub-ordinates.	
Extrinsic		
Salary		Satisfied since they were at top rate and received their maximum hours. Older workers were willing to give up some financial rewards to remain working.
Benefits	Younger workers were satisfied with their benefits. These workers have limited knowledge of their benefit plans	
Interpersonal Relationships	Both age groups experience job satisfaction when they experience good interpersonal relationships. Younger workers experienced good relationships with their peers, while older workers experienced good relationships with their supervisors and peers.	
Job security	Younger workers were satisfied with their job security. They were not concerned with losing their job. Confident they could find comparable work	

The responses from younger and older workers suggest job security represents more than stability of the company in terms of profits (See Table 1). Older workers tend to associate job security with the company's ability to remain profitable. In addition, older workers tend to associate job security with a worker's skills, seniority, and knowledge of the collective agreement. However, younger workers tend to place less emphasis on the company's ability to remain profitable. Younger workers tend to define job security as a worker's ability to produce a large amount of goods, avoidance of unwanted behaviour (e.g. stealing from the company and fighting in the store), and ability to use the collective agreement to avoid managerial discipline. The responses from both age groups suggest Herzberg's (1959) definition of job security is incomplete for unionized supermarket workers.

**Table 3: What did workers dissatisfied with their jobs receive?**

Rewards	Younger Workers	Older Workers
Intrinsic		
Responsibility	Both age groups were dissatisfied with the lack of responsibility in the store. They were disappointed with their co-workers who were stealing from the company. They were frustrated with the lack of accountability and consistency among their supervisors and union representatives. In addition, they were frustrated that the union defended workers who ignored their responsibilities.	
Promotion or Advancement	Both age groups were dissatisfied with the company's approach to promotion or advancement. Younger workers were dissatisfied other workers deserving of a promotion were over looked. Older workers were dissatisfied at the decline of opportunities at the store. Both age groups were dissatisfied that hard work, skills, and seniority are no longer indicators for promotion.	
Extrinsic		
Supervision	Both age groups were dissatisfied that their supervisors used their technical knowledge to undermine workers. They were concerned with the lack of leadership and enforcement of company policy is not consistent. Supervisors and union representatives were protecting lazy workers.	
Salary	Younger workers were dissatisfied with their pay levels since the collective agreement restricted their ability to receive financial rewards.	
Benefits		Older workers were dissatisfied with the maintenance of their benefits. They were concerned with the union's ability to manage the pension fund.
Working Conditions	Both age groups agree the working conditions in the store have significantly declined. This has created dissatisfaction for both age groups. They were not happy with the constant increase in their workloads. Both age groups did not feel safe in the store.	
Job security		Older workers were dissatisfied with the company's ability to remain profitable in the future. Deskilling and advanced technology have undermined skilled positions in the supermarket.

### *Differences*

Older and younger workers place different weights on intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. The norms, values, and social roles associated with both age groups tend to influence the value of intrinsic and extrinsic rewards for these workers (See Table 1). Older workers tend to value intrinsic and extrinsic rewards that reflect career oriented goals. These older workers place a high importance on responsibility, supervision, benefits, and job security. On the other hand, younger workers tend to value intrinsic and extrinsic rewards that reflect characteristics of temporary employment. These younger workers place a high importance on promotion or advancement and salary.

Older workers tend to place a higher value on extrinsic rewards when compared to younger workers (See Table 1). These older workers tend to place a higher value on the collection of extrinsic rewards throughout their career in the supermarket industry. The

accumulation of extrinsic rewards by older workers can make the later stages of their working career less stressful. These workers achieve this by placing a higher value on the quality of their work and through increased cooperation with supervisors.

It was important for older workers to continue working rather than face potential job loss. They expect their co-workers to place a higher value on the quality and not the quantity of work. In addition, older workers are approaching the end of their working careers. They tend to place a lower value on rewards such as promotion and salary. These workers experienced layoffs, buyouts, and strikes while they attempted to protect the financial gains they made in the past. At this point in their working careers, they rather continue working until they retire.

Younger workers tend to view their employment at the Barn as temporary. These younger workers tend to place a higher value on receiving financial rewards immediately and completing their workload as quickly as possible (See Table 1). As a result, younger workers tend to place a lower value on long-term rewards such as benefits and job security. These younger workers rather receive financial rewards immediately so they can exchange money for leisure, education, and transportation.

Younger workers approved of their salary and working conditions while they lived at home and attended school. However, as these younger workers got closer to finishing their education, they expressed dissatisfaction that their salary and benefits did not adequately reflect their work performance and their level of responsibility in the workplace. Younger workers were frustrated that the collective agreement restricted their ability to receive higher wage rates, additional hours, and advancement in the company. In addition, they struggled to understand why older workers received the highest amount of hours, top rate of pay, and opportunities for promotion.

Economic restructuring of the supermarket has influenced how both age groups access intrinsic and extrinsic rewards and hence job satisfaction. For example, business unionism and concessionary bargaining practices have reduced a younger worker's access to hours and wage rates. In addition, the introduction of advanced technology and deskilling has reduced the number of full time union positions. This has reduced the opportunities for promotion or advancement for these younger workers. As younger workers faced limitations in receiving promotion or advancement, they encountered further job dissatisfaction (See Table 3).

Older workers tend to embrace the company's view that increased competition in the market place would prevent additional job loss. Older workers argued increased competition would create additional profits for the store. Increased profits would mean additional hours, improved working conditions, higher rates of pay, and job security for all workers in the store. In addition, older workers tend to be prepared to give up extrinsic rewards (e.g. company discount and working conditions) if it ensured the continued profitability of the company.

However, older workers who encountered job dissatisfaction stated that increased competition did not improve job security in the store (See Table 3). These workers expressed frustration at the lack of supervision, declining conditions of work, and poor administration of their pension plan. These older workers argued increased competition only created divisions between workers at the Barn. Even though these older workers have not encountered direct job loss, their work in the supermarket industry has become more precarious while they approach retirement.

Both age groups have different opinions on the effectiveness of the union's ability to challenge their employer. Younger workers had limited knowledge of the collective

agreement and grievance procedure. This made it difficult for them to determine when they were justified in challenging their supervisor's abuse of the collective agreement. Older workers were aware of their rights established in the collective agreement. However, they felt their union representatives were 'in bed' with the company. These workers were aware how they could use the union to resolve violations in the collective agreement.

### ***What can UFCW do?***

UFCW has an important role in the maintenance of intrinsic and extrinsic rewards for both age groups. After several years of limited opportunities for promotion and poor pay levels, younger workers tend to be dissatisfied with their jobs. Younger workers are frustrated that the collective agreement and union representatives have restricted their ability to access additional hours, wage rates, and promotions. On the other hand, older workers have become dissatisfied with the lack of responsibility and decline of job security in the store. Older workers feel the lack of discipline and accountability has undermined the ability of the store to remain profitable.

Years of concessionary bargaining, industrial competition, and liberal views of the market place have reduced a worker's ability to access financial rewards and job security. As a result, a 'mismatch' occurs between what intrinsic and extrinsic rewards workers expect to receive and what they actually experience. Thus, union representatives should integrate personal development plans that reflect the career ambitions of younger workers. UFCW can achieve this by offering younger workers opportunities for post secondary scholarships. In addition, UFCW might consider the further development of youth conferences, local union youth committees, and youth internship programs. This might provide a platform for younger workers to express their dissatisfaction with low wages,

poor conditions of work, and boring and repetitive work. This might help to satisfy a younger worker's growth needs and contribute to job satisfaction.

For older workers, union representatives should focus on reducing the level of insecurity in the store. UFCW can achieve this by holding the company accountable for the terms and conditions outlined in the collective agreement.<sup>59</sup> This includes providing safe working conditions for all the workers in the supermarket chain. This might pressure the company to reevaluate its policy and procedure for closing the store at night. As a result, the company would be required to address the salary and skill levels of workers who take on the responsibility of closing the store at night.

Continued development of UFCW's education strategy might provide both age groups with a platform to express their interests and concerns. This might provide UFCW the opportunity to explain to both age groups what the collective agreement and grievance procedure can and cannot do. This might help younger workers to link rewards to specific achievements and level of performance. For example, a younger worker would need to complete the wage progression before he or she receives a raise. UFCW needs to make it clear the additional work performed by the younger worker only benefits the company and not the individual worker. For older workers, UFCW might consider integrating its education strategy with a retirees association. This might provide older workers an opportunity to explain to younger workers the importance of pension plans and job security. Moreover, it might help to clarify a younger workers misunderstanding of the collective agreement and company policy.

---

<sup>59</sup> Older workers need to become 'watchdogs'. In other words, they need to hold supervisors accountable for the decisions they make.

## CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSION

Economic restructuring can influence how younger and older workers relate to intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. For younger workers, economic restructuring pressured unions to offer concessions to supermarket employers. These concessions limited the ability of younger workers to access hours, wage rates, and opportunities for promotion or advancement. The lack of access to these rewards created job dissatisfaction among younger workers. On the other hand, concessionary bargaining practices placed pressure on older workers to embrace the company's view that increased competition could prevent additional job loss. These older workers expressed dissatisfaction when increased competition failed to produce job security.

Both age groups placed different weights on intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. Older workers tend to focus on rewards such as supervision, benefits, and job security. In addition, these workers tend to link responsibility in the workplace with the continued profitability of the store. This is consistent with Hunter's (2007) analysis that older workers are active in protecting the extrinsic rewards (e.g. benefits and working conditions) they have accumulated over the length of their career. Younger workers tend to focus more on salary. In addition, younger workers tend to link opportunities for promotion or advancement with their ability to receive financial rewards. Both age groups have common expectations in the areas of working conditions and interpersonal relationships.

The weight a worker places on intrinsic and extrinsic rewards will have a direct effect on his or her job satisfaction. Older workers reported low level of satisfaction due to the absence of job security, benefits, supervision, and responsibility in the workplace. Younger workers reported that low levels of satisfaction are due to the limited

opportunities for promotion or advancement with the company, low wages, limited hours, and absence of responsibility in the workplace. This suggests supervisors struggle in their maintenance of hygiene and motivational factors for both age groups.

Herzberg's (1959) two-factor theory is not entirely applicable to the unionized supermarket industry. First, the researcher's findings failed to confirm Herzberg's conclusion that motivator and hygiene factors operate independently from each other. For example, older workers tend to associate job security with other extrinsic rewards such as benefits, supervision, and working conditions. Second, the responses from younger and older workers suggest job security represents more than stability of the company in terms of profits. The researcher concludes the participants' interpretation of job security enhances Herzberg's (1959) definition of job security.

The results tend to confirm Herzberg's conclusion that the absence of hygiene factors can create dissatisfaction among workers. Both age groups tend to report job dissatisfaction when they do not have access to hygiene (or extrinsic) factors. Moreover, both age groups reported a significant level of job dissatisfaction when they did not access extrinsic rewards they felt were important. In addition, the results tend to confirm Herzberg's conclusion that motivators are the primary source of satisfaction for a worker. Both age groups reported job satisfaction when they receive adequate access to extrinsic rewards.

Gender, class, and seniority differences might have influenced the job satisfaction for both age groups.<sup>60</sup> The sample of older workers did contain three managers. The attitudes and opinions of these managers tend to reflect the organizational goals of the company.

---

<sup>60</sup> We should also caution that our sample was unique. The research participants interviewed only represent a small percentage of the working population in the supermarket industry. We might expect different results in other UFCW represented stores where managers are non-union. This could influence how workers in another workplace might place different values on intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. However, this research might apply to other forms of service work that are characterized by routine and repetitive work.

However, the competitive views of these managers tend to be consistent with the views of older workers in the sample.

In addition, the older workers sample contained a large percentage of female workers. Economic restructuring might have further sexual divisions influenced by patterns of social difference and inequality (Kainer, 2002). For example, when A&P reduced full time positions, it eliminated full time positions traditionally held by female workers in the bakery, meat, and customer service departments (Kainer, 2002).<sup>61</sup> The female workers who were previously full time received buy-outs. In addition, these female workers could return to work as part timers under the new wage progression and keep their current level of seniority. However, these female workers found themselves performing the same amount of work at minimum wage (Kainer, 2002). These female workers expressed frustration that they faced limitations in their access to financial rewards such as hours, wage rates, and opportunities for promotion. As a result, gender inequalities might have influenced how female workers received intrinsic and extrinsic rewards.

Seniority differences influence a younger worker's access to a promotion. The collective agreement requires the company to consider a worker's seniority when determining a promotion. The majority of older workers invested their career in the supermarket industry. These older workers tend to have a significant amount of seniority when compared to younger workers.

If unionized supermarket workers are to be motivated effectively, some factors should receive greater attention. UFCW needs to place greater focus on the development of extrinsic rewards associated with financial rewards and job security. UFCW can achieve this through training and education programs. For younger workers, UFCW might

---

<sup>61</sup> Male workers tend to fill the remaining full time positions as meat cutters, bakers, and produce trimmers. This might account for the lower proportion of older males in the supermarket industry.

consider further development of local committees, conferences, and internship programs. This might provide a platform for younger workers to express their dissatisfaction with low wages, poor conditions of work, and boring and repetitive work.

For older workers, UFCW might consider providing additional information about the union controlled pension plan and other workplace issues (e.g. flexible schedules and health & safety). In addition, UFCW might encourage older workers to place greater pressure on supervisors to enforce the terms and conditions stated in the collective agreement. The collective agreement could ensure both age groups receive equal access to intrinsic and extrinsic rewards in the workplace. Through the greater understanding of how economic restructuring can influence how younger and older workers relate to intrinsic and extrinsic rewards, UFCW should be able to improve its representation of supermarket workers.

**APPENDIX A****Demographic Survey**

---

You are currently working on a \_\_\_ part-time or \_\_\_ full-time basis

Are you a department manager?

\_\_\_ Yes, \_\_\_ No

Are you a member of UFCW Locals 175/633?

\_\_\_ Yes, \_\_\_ No

Your age: \_\_\_ <20, \_\_\_ 21-30, \_\_\_ 31-40, \_\_\_ 41-50, \_\_\_ over 50

Gender: \_\_\_ Male, \_\_\_ Female

Please select your department:

\_\_\_ Front end / Service desk, \_\_\_ Grocery / Health and Beauty / General Merchandise /  
Back room Receiving, \_\_\_ Dairy, \_\_\_ Produce / Salad Bar, \_\_\_ Meat / Deli / Hot Foods,  
\_\_\_ Sea food, \_\_\_ Office / Cash room

Does your current job position match your career ambitions?

\_\_\_ Yes, \_\_\_ No

How long have you worked for the Upper James Barn?

\_\_\_ Less than 3 months, \_\_\_ 3 months - 1 year, \_\_\_ 1 - 3+ years, \_\_\_ 4 - 6+ years, \_\_\_ 7 -  
10+ years, \_\_\_ 10+ years

Are you seriously considering leaving the company?

\_\_\_ Yes, \_\_\_ No

**APPENDIX B****Job Satisfaction Questionnaire Form**

---

*Satisfaction with Job*

---

- 1) How does the current position match with your career expectations?
- 2) How do you describe your job (What did you do)?
- 3) Do you enjoy the work you do (Why is this the case)?
- 4) What is the best point working in this company?
- 5) What is the worst point in this company?
- 6) What will be your suggest(s) for improvements/change of the above?
- 7) What do you think your supervisor will say about your suggestion(s)?
- 8) How do you describe your relationship with your supervisor?
- 9) How well does your supervisor resolve workplace issues?
- 10) How do you describe your relationship with your union?
- 11) How well does your union resolve workplace issues?
- 12) Could you give me one specific event to describe your relationship with your co-workers?
- 13) How supportive your company is in assisting you to receive a promotion?
- 14) If there were a chance for a raise, what amount would you ask for? Why would you ask for this amount?
- 15) In your opinion, what can make this company more successful in terms of growth?
- 16) In your opinion, what can the company do to increase employees' job satisfaction?

---

Note: Questions 1-10, 13-15 are from Grace Davis's job satisfaction survey (2004, p. 503).

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- A&P laying off 500 in Hamilton area as it closes three Barn stores, warehouse. (2002, January 10). *Canadian Press Newswire*, PAGE A18.
- Business Brief -- Great Atlantic & Pacific Tea Co.: A&P Buys 69 Supermarkets in Ontario from Steinberg. (1990, October 23). *Wall Street Journal* (Eastern Edition), PAGE B12.
- Davis, G. (2004). Job Satisfaction Survey among Employees in Small Businesses. *Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development*, 11(4), 495-503.
- Evans, M., and McKee, D. (1970). Some effects of internal versus external orientations upon the relationship between various aspects of job satisfaction. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 2(1), 17-24.
- Glaser, B., and Strauss, A. (1967). *The Discovery of Ground Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research*. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company.
- Godard, J. (2000). *Industrial Relations, the Economy, and Society*. North York: Captus Press Inc.
- Herzberg, F. (1987). One more time: How do you motivate employees? *Harvard Business Review*, 65(5), 109-120. (originally published in 1968).
- Herzberg, F., Mausner, B., and Snyderman, B. (1959). *The Motivation to Work*. New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- Huang, X. and Vliert, E. (2003). Where intrinsic job satisfaction fails to work: National moderators of intrinsic motivation. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 24(2), 159-179.
- Hulin, C., and Smith, P. (1965). A linear model of job satisfaction. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 49(2), 209-216.
- Hunter, D. (2007). Nonlinear Patterns of Job Satisfaction and Age Cohorts in an Industrial Environment. *Journal of American Academy of Business*, 11(2), 231-238.
- Kainer, J. (2002). *Cashing in on Pay Equity? Supermarket Restructuring and Gender Equality*. Toronto: Sumach Press.
- Kainer, J. (1998). Gender, Corporate Restructuring, and Concession Bargaining in Ontario Food Retail Sector. *Industrial Relations*, 53(1), 183-206.
- Kuhnert, K., and Palmer, D. (1991). Job Security, Health, and the Intrinsic and Extrinsic Characteristics of Work. *Group & Organization Studies (1986-1998)*, 16(2), 178-192.

- Kumar, P. and Schenk, C. Union renewal and Organizational Change: A Review of the Literature; Lui, A. and O'Halloran, C. Mobilizing Young People: A Case Study of UFCW Canada Youth Program Programs and Initiatives. In Kumar, P. and Schenk, C. (Ed.). (2006). *Paths to Union Renewal: Canadian Experience*. Peterborough: Broadview Press.
- Lewis, D., Brazil, K., Krueger, P., Lohfeld, L., and Tjam, E. (2001). Extrinsic and Intrinsic Determinants of Quality of Work Life. *International Journal of Health Care Quality Assurance*, 14(3), 9-15.
- MacDonald, C., and Sirianni, S. The service society and the changing experience of Work. In MacDonald, C. and Sirianni, S. (Ed.). (1996). *Working in the Service Society*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Maslow, A.H. (1954). *Motivation and Personality*. New York: Harper.
- McShane, S. (2004). *Canadian Organizational Behaviour* (5<sup>th</sup> ed.). Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson.
- Menzies, D. (2005, November). Pension Fund Debacle. *Canadian Grocer*, 119(9), 18-22.
- Munck, R. (2002). *Globalisation and Labour: The New 'Great Transformation'*. London: Zed Books Ltd.
- Naresh C. (1998). Reward systems: emerging trends and issues. *Canadian Psychology*, 39(1/2), 60-61.
- Novak, M. (1993). *Ageing & Society: A Canadian Perspective* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Scarborough: Nelson.
- Park, H., Murgatroyd, W., Raynock, D., and Spillett, M. (1998). Relationship between intrinsic-extrinsic religious orientation and depressive symptoms in Korean Americans. *Counseling Psychology Quarterly*, 11(3), 315-324.
- Riley, M., and Riley, J. (1994). Age integration and the lives of older people. *The Gerontologist*, 34(1), 110-115.
- Riley, M., and Riley, J. (1999). Sociological research on age: legacy and challenge. *Ageing and Society*, 19, 123-132.
- Rinehart, J. Transcending Taylorism and Fordism? Three Decades of Work Restructuring. In Baldoz, R. et al. (2001). *The Critical Study of Work: Labor, Technology, and Labor Production*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Schmuck, P., Kasser, T., and Ryan, R. (2000). Intrinsic and Extrinsic Goals: Their structure and relationship to well-being in German and U S college students. *Social Indicators Research*, 50(2), 225-241.

- Schwind, H., Das, D., and Wagar, T. (2005). *Canadian Human Resource Management: A Strategic Approach* (7<sup>th</sup> ed.). Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson.
- Simpson, R., Sturges, J., Woods, A., and Altman, Y. (2005). Gender, Age, and the MBA: An Analysis of Extrinsic and Intrinsic Career Benefits. *Journal of Management Education*, 29(2), 218-247.
- Smith, P., Kendall, L., and Hulin, C. (1969). *The measurement of satisfaction in work and retirement*. Chicago: Rand McNally.
- Tannock, S. (2001). *Youth at Work: The unionized fast-food and grocery workplace*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Tschirhart, M. (1998). Understanding the older stipended volunteer: Age-related differences among AmeriCorps members. *Public Productivity & Management Review*, 22(1), 35-48.
- Wernimont, P. (1966). Intrinsic and extrinsic factors in job satisfaction. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 50, 41-51.